January 1992

Book Review of The Promise of Trinitarian Theology, by Colin E. Gunton

Fernando L. Canale
Andrews University, canale@andrews.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/theology-christian-philosophy-pubs

Part of the Biblical Studies Commons

Recommended Citation
http://digitakcommons.andrews.edu/theology-christian-philosophy-pubs/33

This Other is brought to you for free and open access by the Theology & Christian Philosophy at Digital Commons @ Andrews University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Andrews University. For more information, please contact repository@andrews.edu.
mental restoration, Sabbath observance should be reinstituted with reference to both its theology and its praxis. The first part of this conclusion is generally accepted in the remaining papers by both Christians and Jews, e.g., W. S. Wurzburger, J. Doukhan, M. J. Dawn. However, the proposed seventh-day Sabbath observance meets with no general support, as expressed in the response by Kenneth Hein and particularly in the papers dealing with liturgical matters (J. F. Baldwin and Lawrence A. Hoffman).

The collection includes a discussion of legal problems facing seventh-day Sabbath observers (M. A. Tyner and S. F. Rosenthal) and concludes with a question regarding the impact of Sabbath observance on Jewish-Christian relations (M. E. Lodahl). The question is this, how do Christians, who accept both a covenant and creation theology of the Sabbath, and who observe it on the seventh day or on the first day, view the non-Christian (Jewish) Sabbath observers vis-a-vis their membership in the covenant? There are indications elsewhere in the book that the question could also be turned around to ask with what attitude Jews share the extraordinary legacy of the Sabbath with Christians, both those who observe it on the seventh day and those who are convinced that they are free to do so on the first.

It can only be hoped that the original purpose of the symposium, namely to foster better understanding between Jews and Christians, will be achieved in some measure as a result of this effort, and that the Sabbath and its benefits, concerning which there is general agreement, may be shared by many more people in our contemporary society.

Walla Walla College
College Place, WA 99324

Niels-Erik Andreasen


"The Promise of Trinitarian Theology" is neither a set of essays thinly disguised as a unified book nor a fully unified book, but a set of essays" (vii), most of which have been previously presented either as papers, articles, or lectures (viii-ix). However, Gunton claims "a unity of theme, direction and development" (vii) which centers the set of essays around a "programme of ontological exploration" (viii) on the way in which the Christian doctrine of the Trinity affects the ontology of God and, through it, the ontologies of the church, man, and the world. The emphasis of the book is on the latter rather than the former. In other words, Gunton does not attempt a full study on the doctrine of the Trinity but rather an exploration of some of its systematic consequences.
After two introductory chapters in which the current status of trinitarian theology (chap. 1) and its possibilities (chap. 2) are brought into focus, Gunton politely but firmly criticizes Augustine's classical interpretation, which he considers to be the real source of difficulties in dealing with the doctrine of the Trinity (chap. 3). Gunton correctly points out that Augustine overemphasizes the Deo uno to the detriment and even practical exclusion of the Deo trino. Moreover, we are told that Augustine seems unable to understand the "Cappadocian conceptual revolution" (40) regarding the trinitarian being of God to the point of being "unable to conceive true otherness in the Trinity" (51). The Cappadocian view, on the other hand, is considered to allow for the real otherness of persons in the one being of God (54). This brings Gunton to the discussion of the "concept of person" (chap. 5). After reviewing and rejecting both individualistic (Descartes) and collectivistic interpretations of the concept of person, Gunton settles for a relational conception taken from John Macmurray (Persons in Relation [London: Faber and Faber, 1961], 213, 69, 157). Macmurray's relational approach to the concept of person maintains that "... the self exists only in dynamic relation with the Other ... (t)he self is constituted by its relation to the Other, ... it has its being in its relationship" (Macmurray, 17, quoted by Gunton, 90, 91). In Gunton's view, however, we owe the relational concept of person to the Cappadocians, who, "by giving priority to the concept of person in their doctrine of God, ... transform at once the meaning of both concepts" (96). On this basis Gunton conceives the Trinity as "ontological communion." "God is no more than what Father, Son and Spirit give to and receive from each other in the inseparable communion that is the outcome of their love. ... There is no 'being' of God other than this dynamic of persons in relation" (10). The rest of the book explores the systematic consequences of such a view for the being of the church (chap. 4), the being of man (chaps. 6 and 7), and for the being of the world (chap. 8).

Following the same general line of thought explored eleven years earlier by Jürgen Moltmann in his The Trinity and the Kingdom (London: SCM Press, 1981), Gunton's criticism of Augustine (chap. 3) and the ensuing "single person deity of the Western tradition" (137) is well taken and to the point. Likewise, the suggestion of replacing the neo-Platonic-Augustinian ontology of man as soul-reason (106) with a personal relational one (116-120) that integrates not only man's spirituality but also his "bodiliness" (117) is to be taken seriously and pursued to its ultimate systematic consequences. The plea for going beyond Luther's and Calvin's concept of human freedom should be taken seriously by those belonging to the Protestant tradition.

Gunton's program, however, has two basic weaknesses. First, the lack of clarification about the proper way to conceive the relationship between the economic and immanent levels of the Trinity keeps Gunton's
proposal within the classical parameters of Augustinian theology. His metaphorical utilization of "personal space" (137) as the sole presupposition for the interpretation of God's being as relational does not eliminate the broader and deeper issue of the proper relationship between the immanent and economic levels, that is, between timelessness and temporality in God. Gunton seems unable to live up to his own expectation of avoiding "connotations of timelessness" (ibid.). On the contrary, his suggestion that the traditional concept of perichoresis should be understood as "a metaphor of spacial motion" is not only inadequate for avoiding timelessness but seems to include it by default.

Briefly, Gunton is able to successfully make a convincing case against the traditional interpretation of God's being as "simple." It is difficult to see, however, how the new relational concept of the being of God proposed by Gunton is able to ground the temporal historical ontology of the cross. Second, the "echo analogy" (79, 174) seems a rather weak methodological procedure for interpreting the ontologies of church, man, and world, on the basis of God's trinitarian being. Overall, however, Gunton's proposals regarding the ontologies of God and programmatic relation to the ontologies of church, man, and world move in the right direction. His emphasis on the systematic role of ontology in the constitution of theology is well taken. The criticism of Augustine's position should be commended. The Promise of Trinitarian Theology does show the systematic role and relevance of a trinitarian understanding of the Being of God for the entire enterprise of Christian Theology. Gunton's suggestions appear to be only the "tip of the iceberg." His movement away from a traditional understanding of the Trinity should be carefully explored and followed to its ultimate consequences. It may very well be that in this way Christian theology could realize both the possibility and the need for grounding its ontological principles on the Bible rather than on tradition.

Andrews University

FERNANDO CANALE


A scholarly, yet practical book on the Holy Spirit is not easy to find, making The Presence and the Power very welcome. The author describes himself as an incarnationalist holding to a high view of Scripture. He brings to his work the richness of twenty years of experience at Wheaton College as professor of Greek and New Testament exegesis.

Hawthorne's book focuses specifically on the significance of the Holy Spirit in the life and ministry of Jesus. The specialization permits Hawthorne to devote a separate chapter to each of the following aspects