

certain (confident), definite (detailed), and dynamic (interactive). Further study is needed to explore whether this view of biblical foreknowledge is a helpful response to the suggestion by Rice that open theists should avoid using limit-language to refer to God.

Andrews University

MARTIN F. HANNA

Rubenstein, Jay. *Nebuchadnezzar's Dream: The Crusades, Apocalyptic Prophecy, and the End of History*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019. xxi + 280 pp, 16 color plates, 3 maps, and 10 tables. USD 31.95.

Jay Rubenstein is a professor of history at the University of Southern California and a prolific historian specializing in the High Middle Ages, the crusades, and biblical exegesis. He previously published two works covering roughly the same period: *Armies of Heaven: The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse* (Basic Books, 2011) and *The First Crusade: A Brief History with Documents* (Bedford/St. Martin's, 2015). The present tome, however, as the culmination of fifteen years of research and reflection, is narrower in scope, but far denser.

What lies at the end of Rubenstein's long pilgrimage—escorted by fabled warriors, jongleurs, artists, and monks—is a remarkable tale of court intrigue, political monkeyshines, and ecclesiastical politics. The book begins with sixteen color plates showcasing medieval religious art, opening a window into the apocalypse as seen through the eyes of medieval Christians. The collection was carefully curated from the Apocalypse cycle contained in the still extant autograph of the *Liber Floridus* (1120 CE, lit. “Book of Flowers”)—a general encyclopedia written by Lambert, canon of Saint-Omer (ca. 1061–1150), as well as drawings by Otto of Freising, Hildegard of Bingen, and Joachim of Fiore.

The book is divided into four parts comprising twelve chapters, and covering sequential historical periods. Each period highlights specific players and how they interact, overlap, or overshadow each other. Rubenstein begins with the admission that his original premise that “the Apocalypse and the crusades had nothing to do with one another” (xvii), did not hold water in light of the complex web of apocalyptic eschatology that dominated the eleventh and twelve centuries. To this end, he surveys the “building blocks of the apocalypse” as present in the Tyconian-Augustinian tradition of biblical interpretation influential at the time (ch 3). The book then zeroes in on the apocalyptic “illusion” that sparked the First Crusade and the “disillusionment” that followed it. This task dominates Part 1.

One of Rubenstein's greatest achievements is to demonstrate how medieval exegetes such as Guibert of Nogent (ca. 1060–1125) reshaped the biblical text to make it fit contemporary perceptions of how the apocalypse would unfold. Beginning with the first apocalyptic text, the book of Daniel

and the vision of Nebuchadnezzar's statue with its sequence of earthly kingdoms—a prediction that continues to defy a definitive interpretation (Rubenstein proposes a final bifurcation of Greek kingdoms [5])—theologians adapted the dream around temporally relevant readings. It seemed clear that ancient Rome, now but a memory, had failed to trigger the Last Days as long thought. An example of this is self-proclaimed First-Crusade hero Bohemond of Antioch (ca. 1054–1111), who departed from the biblical text and read the dream's metals as iron, clay, silver, bronze, and gold as symbolizing the Persians, Egyptians, Chaldeans and Arabs, who had been simultaneously defeated by the Franks. Conveniently, Bohemond himself was the rock that shattered the statue, even though he quit the First Crusade before it even reached Jerusalem.

If Bohemond of Antioch saw in Nebuchadnezzar's dream a sketch for his own dreams of the end, the apocalypse of John of Patmos provided a scaffold which others used to paint a frieze of the Last Days, soaked in blood and terrorized by outlandish creatures. In his *Liber Floridus*, Lambert of Saint-Omer sought to organize Bohemond's history of the world under the prism of the First Crusade, driving his message home with dramatic pictures and diagrams conflating biblical historiography, apocalyptic fervor, and local fables about the arrival of a mythological Antichrist.

Part 2 is dedicated to the aftermath of the celebrated First Crusade and the “monumental disaster” that was the Second. Throughout the twelfth century, crusading Christians were displaying the same impatience, a fatigued *stenuitas patrum* with the end-times that their ancestors felt. By now, the sword had replaced love and charity in establishing God's earthly kingdom; the First Crusade had shattered Nebuchadnezzar's statue, giving birth to the Latin church bound to cover the whole earth. Rubenstein clearly articulates how the success of imperial eschatology became a presuppositional lens through which theologians of the period viewed the apocalypse and the end of history. The gory expeditions, however, took a toll on the faithful. As the apocalypse slowly receded into the horizon with the fall of Jerusalem to Saladin in 1187 and the failed Second Crusade, there were signs of the equivalent of a medieval “clickbait”; after all, trying to consolidate God's earthly kingdom through violence, plundering and bloodshed never got the crusaders a sense of redemption as promised by Urban II's indulgences.

Central to the book's central premise of shifting apocalyptic sentiment is the discussion of *translatio imperii* (ch. 9), which explores how Jerusalem ceased to be essential to Christendom's imperial aspirations, replaced by Rome. Rubenstein explores how the same apocalyptic impetus that inspired the successful First Crusade also underpinned the Second, especially in the way its supporters sought to justify it. Foremost among the justifications for holy war was the concession of indulgences to all who fought. The way the most repulsive characters could find redemption in heaven for past and future

sins was by helping God destroy his enemies on earth, led as they were by Antichrist, a mutating creature with effeminate, grotesque features. “[T]o win is victory on earth; to die, victory in Christ,” they argued (77). The atrocities of that Christian war—an oxymoron, if ever there was one—gave rise to the more principled Templars and new justifications for fighting God’s battles. The rationale for turning pilgrimage into holy war became more convoluted and suspect, with the usual promises of redemption giving room to the “angelic replacement” theory (originated in Augustine’s *De Civitate Dei*), and repurposed by Abbot John, who in vision saw Paul and John explain that those who died in the Second Crusade were now replacing the fallen angels in heaven (120).

An intriguing character in the book is Cistercian monk Bernard of Clairvaux—canonized in the Catholic tradition—who played a central role in spurring the Second Crusade. Bernard provided not only the theological framework and the political savoir-faire for the doomed enterprise, but he also spiced it up with miracles—“fakes” avers Rubenstein—which rubberstamped calls that “God wills it.” His campaign was briefly joined by Otto of Freising, who after the crusade’s defeat, removed Jerusalem from his end-times charts and doubted prophetic certainty, bemoaning that “even the spirit of prophecy does not always reside with the prophets” (126). Part 3 explores the players tasked with rethinking the apocalyptic underpinnings of the crusades and envisioning a new, “homegrown” apocalypse. Enter Gerhoh of Reichersberg (1093–1169) who recanted Last World Emperor eschatology partly because the crusades to liberate Jerusalem were based on shoddy intelligence: the city had never been in real danger. Worse, there was evidence of an elaborate Ponzi scheme: Holy Land Christians had used the Western church to enrich its coffers at the expense of life and limb. With Christianity’s focus now shifting to internal problems such as heresy and corruption by prelates, Jerusalem was doomed to become a storehouse of memory and relics (161).

To negotiate the shift, Gerhoh developed a system of prophetic interpretation based on “types”, i.e., specific prophetic fulfillments, and “tropes,” i.e., ambiguous meanings based on the multivalence of divine language which needed to be interpreted allegorically. Applying this to the view of a Jewish Antichrist, Gerhoh invalidated the millenarian tradition, stating that Jacob’s son Dan was never the Antichrist’s ancestor, he only needed to retain Dan’s “snakelike” features, not necessarily be a Jew. Gerhoh did the same with the Antichrist’s birthplace, Babylon: it could well be Rome. Likewise, he saw recurring fulfillments of Daniel’s “abomination of the desolation,” starting with Antiochus IV Epiphanes in 167 BCE, then Herod Agrippa in 44 CE, and Caligula in 70 CE. Gerhoh’s ideas opened the way to contemporary mystic Hildegard of Bingen, whose visions further galvanized the view that, from the looks of things, the Antichrist could well rise from within the

church itself. In one of her visionary experiences, Hildegard saw Antichrist as a monster being birthed by a woman, symbolizing the church (fig. 13).

Part 4 explores the final shift in the apocalyptic ethos surrounding the crusades. This was a time of shifting prophetic centers; victories in wars were fickle and short-lived, Constantinople had once replaced Jerusalem as the ecclesiastical holy grail, the First Crusade restored the Holy Land to its rightful place, only to have prophetic interest move west to Rome. An entire chapter is dedicated to Joachim of Fiore (ca. 1135–1202), whose ideas remain influential. The failure of the Second Crusade proved to Joachim and others that these expeditions belonged in the dustbin of history—written records were revised and the voyages barely made into book margins. That is, until Jerusalem fell to Saladin in 1187, causing Joachim to incorporate the growing threat posed by Islam into his prophetic charts (table 10). Islam, in his view symbolized by the iron legs of Nebuchadnezzar’s statue, was the church’s archenemy to be fought in perpetuity.

As Rubenstein puts it, “[a]fter a thousand years of apocalyptic algebra, Joachim of Fiore invented calculus” (182–183). Living under the shockwaves of the eschatological hysteria surrounding the First Crusade, Joachim built his “spiritual arithmetic” on Augustine’s division of history in six ages, but augmented it with his system of prophetic interpretation around a “law of doubles” (*concordia duorum testamentorum*) in which every character and event in the Hebrew Bible had its *Doppelgänger* in the New. This led to the development of his “trinitarian” schematics that divided history into three *status* (*concordia trium operum*) about the manifestation of each person of the Trinity in specific, but overlapping periods of history—the Old Testament was God’s playground, the New Testament birthed Jesus, and the church age belonged to the Holy Spirit. Joachim replaced the old Augustinian tradition that located the end after 6,000 years of human history with his rule of “ages” or “generations” lasting 30 years each (based on Jesus’s age at baptism). Thus, for example, the 1260 days of Rev 12 symbolize 42 “ages” of 30 years each, beginning with the birth of Christ. Incidentally, then, the approaching year 1260 CE would usher in the third *tempus* of his trinitarian model, a time of peace dominated by the Holy Spirit and led by “Spiritual Men.”

Joachim’s mathematical approach to prophecy seemed plausible to explain past fulfillments, and had even yielded a few predictions, albeit, it seems, by mere chance. Joachim saw the persecution of Christians under Mohammad in the fourth seal of Revelation being mirrored in that of Saladin, which fulfilled the sixth seal. “All of this,” Joachim would write, “we see happening in the world today” (193). However, as Rubenstein warns, “[t] here can be a fine line between being a prophet and simply keeping up with the news” (189). Saladin was also the “one is,” the sixth king of Rev 17:10, a passage that Joachim used to “prophesy” that Richard Lionheart would

defeat Saladin. But when Joachim's prophecy failed to materialize, his focus shifted to Rome, where a future papal Antichrist was just a lad (202).

Despite Joachim's penchant for discontinuity with old ideas, his historiography was a confirmation of the tradition that "a great, anti-Christian enemy would be defeated in the East" (200). As Rubenstein observes, somewhat tongue-in-cheek, when it comes to the interpretation of biblical prophecy, the proof is *not* in the pudding, because "prophecies are easier to interpret after the fact" (218). When confronted with past failures exposed by later revisions, "prophetic hope springs eternal" (214). Indeed, the Protestant Reformation would see a renewed interest in the Antichrist, and the Papacy would move straight to the center of the target board.

The conclusion titled "The Ongoing Madness of Antichrist" provides a synoptic view between the apocalyptic outlook of the turn of the first millennium CE and those currently at work in Christendom. Rubenstein ponders "just how closely allied twelfth- and twenty-first-century passions are" (217), and the parallels he draws illuminate both periods. In a discussion of how Judeo-Christian values continue to shape American policy abroad, he quotes American Lieutenant General Boykin, who framed America's War on Terror as a war between Satan and "us a Christian army" (217). As it was for medieval warriors, the blood of Christ offering penitence and redemption continues to be mingled with the blood of holy war. As of old, the Last Days continue to be tinged blood red. Are America's holy wars also a quest for redemption? The answer may have to wait for the advent of a modern-day Joachim of Fiore.

In a volume of incisive and insightful analysis, readers will hardly find a flaw. The plot can at times get as thick as hand-to-hand combat, laden with unrelenting, often salacious details, and readers should be prepared to thumb back through sections to reconnect the wandering threads. Still, the presentation is impeccable and effortless, at times reading like a mystery novel, at others, like a horror movie script. Persnickety grammarians will find little in terms of proofreading in a myriad of words and characters. Rubenstein shows command and passion for the subject; a better chronicler could scarcely accompany the reader. One of the author's endearing qualities is that, for a work about epochal events encompassing vast geographical swaths, Rubenstein shows sensibility for personal tragedy and misery, such as the harrowing tale of lady Corba of Thorigné—abused, abandoned, and ultimately gone missing, or the demons harassing Thomas of Marle, for whose savagery no redemption could be procured.

Perhaps Rubenstein could have thrown his net farther out as it pertains to the sixth-century Byzantine origins of imperial eschatology still at work in the twelfth century (see, for example, Stephen Shoemaker, *The Apocalypse of Empire: Imperial Eschatology in Late Antiquity and Early Islam* [University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018]). Readers would have benefited from a survey of similar ideas churning in the interlocking religious cultures of Byzantium,

which provided a blueprint for subsequent imperial eschatologies, including the apocalyptic imperialism dominating Islam in the twelfth century.

Rubenstein's latest work is fascinating and commendable. As a historian, he has shown the tenacity of a first crusader; as hermeneut, the restraint of a Templar. His parting wish is that readers leave "with a deeper respect for the sophistication, the attractiveness, and the sheer staying power of apocalyptic ideas" (217). In this pilgrimage, Rubenstein has been resoundingly successful.

Orlando, Florida

ANDRÉ REIS

Scholtus, Silvia C. *Women in Leadership in the Beginnings of the Seventh-day Adventist Church in South America*. Libertador San Martín, Entre Ríos: Editorial UAP, 2019. 108 pp. eBook. USD 7.99.

The history of the Seventh-day Adventist Church in South America has been widely explored in books published in Spanish and Portuguese. It has been recounted by some works in English also, including Floyd Greenleaf's book *A Land of Hope: The Growth of the Seventh-day Adventist Church in South America* (Casa Publicadora Brasileira, 2011) and Juan Carlos Viera's doctoral thesis: "Seventh-day Adventists in Latin America: Their Beginnings, Their Growth, Their Challenges" (PhD Dissertation, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1993). Nonetheless, the lives and work of female workers and leaders have been mostly overlooked. Silvia C. Scholtus, emeritus professor at the Universidad Adventista del Plata in Argentina, and former Director of the Centro Histórico Adventista (Adventist Heritage Center), has produced the first biographic account of female Seventh-day Adventist pioneers in South America. Scholtus fills a gap in Adventist historiography in documenting the lives and deeds of eight courageous women who were at the battlefield of missionary activity in the continent.

To explain the objective of the book, the first chapter is devoted to highlighting the importance of recounting stories and preserving them for the future. A general outline of the book is presented in the second chapter, which is titled "Introduction," while the next chapter provides a concise historical framework for the work of the pioneers in South America, describing the societal norms and traditions concerning women in that period. Chapters four to eleven are devoted each to the life of a woman pioneer. Every chapter is structured in four sections. First, the author provides a general background of the selected woman for that chapter, including family history. Later she describes the missionary activities accomplished by each pioneer. The last two sections of these chapters are usually called "Her last days," narrating their retirement years, and "Her legacy," which summarizes the achievements of each woman with an inspirational tone.