

deficiency is not necessarily fatal to the author's conclusions—his quest, is after all, a historian's endeavor—a deeper interdisciplinary rendezvous could have enriched the research.

Shoemaker's book has intermediate-to-advanced readers in mind who are fully abreast of the hermeneutical tools at the disposal of historians. I would only point out a few minor issues: there is a tendency towards repetitiveness—the same concept is often reworded in close proximity—and at times, arguments that have been satisfied are revisited when they could have been combined into one flow of reasoning. I also thought that placing the Acknowledgements section at the back end of the book was unexpected. Only one significant typo in the entire work was found—"allusion" should replace "illusion" (20). Overall, the book makes for an engaging read, with elegant design and intuitive sections.

In sum, *The Apocalypse of Empire* is a responsible effort in the quest for a deeper understanding of early Islam within the continuum of the history of religions. Students of Jewish, Christian, and Islamic history will appreciate how this remarkable study illuminates the complex religious-political-social phenomenon that is apocalypticism as it percolates through time, symbiotically assimilating and tinging the times in which the apocalypticists live.

Orlando, Florida

ANDRÉ REIS

Siqueira, Reinaldo, and Alberto R. Timm, eds., *Pneumatologia: Pessoa e Obra do Espírito Santo*. Engenheiro Coelho, SP: UNASPRESS, 2017. 741 pp. Hardcover. BRL 140.00.

The title of this book already suggests its goal: to explore the person and work of the Holy Spirit. Although this topic is not a new one within Christianity, and most articles within the book do not bring anything substantially new to the discussion (since Christians have been debating it for centuries), it is surely a contribution to Seventh-day Adventist pneumatology. The reason for this being that, as far as I know, this is the largest compendium on the topic produced by Adventist scholars. Additionally, it adds a Seventh-day Adventist perspective to the broader Christian reflection on the Holy Spirit. There are three chapters, specifically, that contribute fresh reflections on current issues, namely Alberto R. Timm's chapter on the history of Seventh-day Adventist pneumatology, Angél Manuel Rodríguez's text on contemporary issues in Adventist pneumatology, and Marcos de Benedicto's chapter on healing.

Although the title suggests that the book is all about the personhood and works of the Holy Spirit, not every article deals with both of these aspects. If the goal was to have most, or all, of the chapters discuss both aspects of this doctrine, they could have been more consistent on matching the titles of the chapters to the content. In fact, only one chapter has the title of "The

Person and Work of the Holy Spirit in . . . (e.g., The General Epistles and Hebrews).” Most chapters are simply titled “The Holy Spirit in the . . . (e.g., New Testament, Old Testament, Reformation, *etc.*)” while others are called “The Actions of the Holy Spirit in the . . . (e.g., Historical Books [of the Hebrew Bible], Church).”

This book tries to comprehensively address both the identity of the Holy Spirit’s personality and His work, from biblical (Hebrew Bible and New Testament), historical (Christian and specifically Seventh-day Adventist), theological and missiological perspectives. Although many chapters indeed deal directly with the question of personhood or identity of the Holy Spirit, this is not the main thrust of the book, considering the content of each chapter. This book avoids the question of Trinitarianism, yet assumes the personal divine nature of the Holy Spirit, focusing on the works of the third person of the “heavenly trio.” This emphasis on the works of the Spirit is in line with one trend in Adventist pneumatology, pointed out by Rodríguez and Timm (more on this below). The book seems most concerned with the soteriological and ecclesiological role of the Holy Spirit. This is perceptible in the treatment of the subject throughout the book. In this review, I will highlight some trajectories of ideas in the collection of articles as well as offer several suggestions of where I think it could’ve been improved.

The book starts by discussing the Holy Spirit as revealed throughout the biblical texts. This section mirrors the sections of the Protestant canonical division (e.g., Torah, Prophets, Gospels, Pauline Epistles, Revelation of John). The biblical section is quite thorough and covers the entire Bible. Although, I felt that the introductory essays by Jiří Moskala (Hebrew Bible) and John McVay (New Testament) actually provided such good syntheses of their respective fields that they almost seemed to be sufficient in covering the topic on their own. The other chapters simply added color and further detail to Moskala’s and McVay’s summaries. This does not take away from the merit of the other chapters on each subsection of the Hebrew Bible or the New Testament, but just highlights how good of a summary Moskala’s and McVay’s chapters are.

In regard to the other chapters, I would give mixed reviews. Several of the chapters in the biblical sections were disappointing in that they did not interact with other scholars or touch on current issues. One example would be the chapter on Acts by Mario Veloso. Meanwhile, other chapters were very provocative and informative, like Clinton Wahlen’s chapter on the Synoptic Gospels, as it contextualized the works of the Holy Spirit with the Hebrew Bible and Second Temple Jewish literature in light of the current scholarly discussion.

This book devotes almost the same number of pages to the Hebrew Bible (168 pages) as it does to the New Testament (166 pages). This is rare because, in many scholarly treatments of pneumatology, most of the biblical infor-

mation on the Holy Spirit comes from the latter, not the former. However, Moskala's statistical comparison convincingly demonstrates that there are more references to the Spirit of God in the Hebrew Bible than in the New Testament.

Despite this information provided by Moskala, the chapters from the doctrinal and missiological sections use the New Testament almost exclusively to articulate their ideas about the Holy Spirit. With the exception of Carlos Steger's and Marcos de Benedicto's articles, the remaining articles barely mention the Hebrew Bible in their pneumatological construction. This evaluation might be in contrast to Moskala's claim that the foundation for biblical discussion on the Holy Spirit must begin in the Hebrew Bible. I hasten to say that the New Testament scholars in this book broadly acknowledge the Hebrew Bible in their discussion, however, the systematic theologians do not. There are four chapters in the doctrinal section that try to logically explain: the works of the Spirit (Frank Hasel), the nature of the Spirit (Jo Ann Davidson), the work of the Spirit in the believer (Steger), and the work of the Spirit in the church (Márcio Costa). These authors rely almost solely on the writings of Paul and John. It could be that, as Moskala also points out, one finds a clear picture of the personality of the Holy Spirit only in the New Testament.

Besides the chapters on biblical and theological reflection on the Holy Spirit, the book includes four chapters on Christian history, three on Seventh-day Adventism, and four on the missiological implications of this doctrine. The chapters on Christianity provide a bird's-eye view on the issue and are selective about the works they use in order to sketch how Christians articulated the Holy Spirit in history. These chapters provide an introduction to major figures who wrote about the Holy Spirit. In the Adventist section, Merlin Burt's chapter adds nothing new on Adventist pneumatology, at least to an English audience who has followed the discussion on Ellen White and the Trinity in articles already published in *Journal of the Adventist Theological Society* and *AUSS* (see articles by Jerry Moon, Denis Kaiser, and Tim Poirier). However, for a Portuguese-speaking audience, most of whom lack the up-to-date material, the chapter is a welcome summary of the key issues regarding Adventist pneumatology. The historical section of the book concludes with two original contributions, by Alberto Timm and Ángel Rodríguez. They bring fresh perspectives to the current debate in Adventist pneumatology for they highlight from history the trends and issues raised by Adventists on the topic, giving a clear focus on what is going on currently.

The book concludes with five chapters on the practical and missiological aspect of this Christian teaching. Three chapters deal separately with specific gifts in their current manifestations worldwide: the gift of tongues (Wagner Kuhn), the gift of healing (Marcos de Benedicto), and yet another on the gift of prophecy (George Knight). The other two chapters are more pastoral and talk about the role of the Spirit in the unity and mission of the church

(Kwabena Donkor) and personal salvation (Jiří Moskala). In these last two chapters, there is unfortunately nothing substantially new, compared to what has already been stated in the previous pages.

In evaluating how this collection contributes to Adventist Pneumatology, I first realized that authors had different opinions on the amount of material produced by Adventists on the topic, along with opinions of how relevant they are. Timm's opinion is that there is substantial material on the topic written by Adventists (441), while Wahlen (209) and Rodríguez (507) are not so convinced. Ironically, Timm is one of the editors of the largest book produced by Seventh-day Adventists on pneumatology, the one under review. From my research about the Holy Spirit at the Center of Adventist Research in Berrien Springs, MI, I concur with Timm's evaluation that there is substantial Adventist literature about the Holy Spirit. This is not to say that there is no room for producing more material on the topic. But it is also a fact that before this volume there was no work on the Holy Spirit with this breadth of content.

In his overview on Adventist Pneumatology from 1844 to 2013, Timm was able to demonstrate that, similar to other Christians, Adventists mostly refer to the Holy Spirit in the context of the Trinity, when addressing the question of the personality of the divine spirit. In its early history, most Adventists were antitrinitarians and the arguments were on the topic of the personality of God's Spirit. According to Timm, the major argument they raised against the personality of the Holy Spirit, still used by antitrinitarians today, is the idea that omnipresence cannot be conciliated with personhood. This is why the Bible describes the Spirit metaphorically as oil, water, and fire. On the other hand, Trinitarians support claims that the Scriptures use the language of action when talking about the Spirit of God. The most commonly referred to verbs are: creates, reveals, intercedes, is grieved. Besides, they argue, the Spirit receives worship.

Timm continues his historical overview showing that after the 1950s, many Adventists accepted the Trinity thus, causing the literature on the Holy Spirit to emphasize its soteriological role. Following this trajectory, most articles in the book under review here, have, intentionally or not, highlighted the role of the Holy Spirit first, as an agent of revelation, and second, as an agent of salvation. As a revealer, the authors agree on the idea that Scriptures mainly present the Spirit as the voice of God instructing humanity through prophecy. This can be manifested in visions, dreams, an inspiration to write wisely, as well as the ability to articulate truths and understand reality. Therefore, in this perspective, the Spirit is portrayed primarily as a divine teacher, for example: giving wisdom to Bezalel when he manufactures the tabernacle, and to Peter when he teaches the gentiles about Jesus.

For most authors, this pedagogical character of the Holy Spirit is closely related to the salvation of humanity, which means that salvation is basically

a transformation of the mind. From this way of reasoning, the salvific role of the Holy Spirit is worked out by the promptings of the human mind to recognize its sinful condition, convincing the individual of the need for transformation from a state of disobedience to one of allegiance to God's word. Little is said in this collection of articles about what roles emotion and ritual seem to play in this transformation. It seems that salvation is understood primarily as enlightenment resulting in acceptance of Jesus as Savior. Thus, Adventists have struggled to articulate the salvific role of the Holy Spirit pre- and post-crucifixion.

Authors like Froom are of the opinion that the Holy Spirit was only effective in the plan of salvation after the cross, simply convincing sinners to look back to Jesus's sacrifice (459–460, 470, 564–565). It seems, however, that before the death of Jesus, the Spirit was working *with* and not *within* humanity to transform them. Steger and Jo Ann Davidson explicitly respond to this claim by affirming that the Holy Spirit played a role in saving humanity from the very beginning. In their understanding, the salvific merits of the death of Jesus, although foundational, needed to be applied by the grace given through the Holy Spirit who also transformed the life of the convert. Despite the different articulations on this particular issue, they still seem to restrict the salvific role of the Spirit through the gift of revelation before and after the cross.

The emphasis on, or limitation of, the role of the Spirit as a dispenser of knowledge, to me, seems too rational. It is necessary to acknowledge that the Scriptures also portray the Spirit of God acting in ways that are not understood by humanity or through other cognitive processes such as emotion and physical experiences. As some biblical examples demonstrate, the Spirit sometimes possesses the individual ecstatically (27 and 29). I fear that this book in Adventist pneumatology might create an impression that the works of the Spirit are limited to an intellectual Biblicism, which is not what the Seventh-day Adventist fundamental beliefs indicate.

Being more open to spiritual manifestations that are not merely intellectual in nature, Marcos de Benedicto argues that Adventists need to be more open to the ministry of healing that God offers through His Spirit, despite human advancement in medicine. If the Gospels emphasize healing as a major venue of establishing the kingdom of God, Adventists who talk about the manifestation of the Spirit should not be skeptical about healings among them. However, his perspective is only one chapter in the book. The rest of this work gives the impression that the manifestation of the Spirit is almost limited today to the gift of prophecy as manifested in the writings of Ellen G. White.

To conclude, I would like to indicate some areas I found lacking in the book that could be improved in a new edition or eventual translation. Technically there are some shortcomings. The book lacks chapter numbers and an

index of authors, topics, and primary sources. Considering the size of the book, the index would be a great aid to researchers. It also needs a list of abbreviated works and a revision of footnotes and bibliographic format. They are not uniform.

First, I expected one chapter, or at least a larger treatment throughout the different chapters, on demonology and evil or counterfeit spirits. This was a major topic around which the Dead Sea Scrolls and Early Christianity articulated their views on the Spirit of God. In the Middle Ages, demonology was also closely connected to the reflections on healings, miracles, and relics. The quest was for the indwelling of God in nature. Demonology also problematized the immanence of God in a very tangible way. The current book skipped these issues. In line with this topic, I also think it would've been helpful to include one chapter on the role of the Holy Spirit in liturgy and prayer.

Another topic I would've loved to have read about in this collection is the Holy Spirit in Adventist eschatology. Rodríguez has two pages on the soteriological underpinnings of eschatological spiritual manifestations in Adventism, but it does not seem to me to be sufficient. There are some gaps in his evaluation of the current situation and the generalizations he makes cannot be verified in any bibliography, except the one on Jack Siqueira he provided. Fortunately, many books on Adventist eschatology have been recently published which helps fill the gap in Rodríguez's analysis.

This being said, I understand that the book is already large—more than 700 pages—and that the addition of extra chapters would probably be cumbersome. But in case this book is ever translated from Portuguese, and I think it deserves to be, the recommendations I give here could be considered. Overall, the book is beautiful in its physical presentation. It is a pleasure to hold and read. Besides, it is a major Adventist academic accomplishment, resulting from a collaborative work of scholars from different parts of the planet. The work is the major Seventh-day Adventist contribution to pneumatology and therefore deserves attention.

Berrien Springs, Michigan

RODRIGO GALIZA

Stuhlmacher, Peter. *Biblical Theology of the New Testament*. Translated by Daniel P. Bailey. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2018. xxxiv + 935. Hardcover. USD 95.00.

Peter Stuhlmacher is professor emeritus of New Testament Studies at the University of Tübingen in Germany. He has written numerous books in German, including some titles translated into English: *Historical Criticism and Theological Interpretation of Scripture: Toward a Hermeneutics of Consent*; *How to Do Biblical Theology* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2003); and *Revisiting*