traditions, but it would have been helpful to have a full analysis of the sources of this text, especially since the text is an excellent example of the tendency to combine earlier sources and to create a fuller account. Just as Matthew and Luke expanded Mark, so the author of the Infancy Gospel expanded earlier infancy narratives by combining them.

We are in Terian's debt for working through the basic manuscript tradition and providing us with an English translation of one of the fullest examples of an infancy gospel from the early centuries of Christianity. Just as a Western visitor is often surprised to discover that one of the four quarters of the Old City of Jerusalem is Armenian, so students will be surprised to discover the rich literary tradition of early Armenian Christians.

University of Notre Dame GREGORY E. STERLING

Tickle, Phyllis. *The Great Emergence: How Christianity Is Changing and Why*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 2008. 172 pp. Hardcover, $17.99.

For readers interested in the current and future configuration of Western Christianity, Phyllis Tickle, founding editor of the Religion Department of *Publishers Weekly* and a lay eucharistic minister in the Episcopal Church, offers a fascinating portrait of the emergent Christian movement. Tickle seeks to answer three important questions: "The Great Emergence: What Is It?" (Part 1); "The Great Emergence: How Did It Come to Be?" (Part 2); and "The Great Emergence: Where Is It Going?" (Part 3).

Tickle begins Part 1 by asserting that "about every five hundred years the empowered structures of institutionalized Christianity . . . become an intolerable carapace that must be shattered in order that renewal and new growth may occur" (16). These times of upheaval are rummage sales in which the church cleans out its attic. Once these hinge points in history occur, three results follow: first, a new and vibrant expression of Christianity emerges; second, the dominant institutionalized expression of Christianity is reconfigured into a purer form; and third, the Christian faith is spread into new territories and demographic areas.

The first rummage sale occurred under Pope Gregory the Great in the sixth century. Pope Gregory led a turbulent continent into an "ecclesio-political coherence," guiding Christianity into monasticism, protecting and preserving the faith for the next five centuries. The Great Schism between Greek Orthodoxy and Roman Catholicism, the second rummage sale of the eleventh century, concerned the nature of the Holy Spirit, the appropriate language for worship, and whether or not yeast ought to be used in the Eucharistic bread. During each of these hinge points of history, a process of "re-traditioning" occurs—a dynamic progression from upheaval to renewed stability.

Rummage sales involve an interaction between religion, culture, and society. Religion, as a "generic phenomenon" interacting with culture and society, can be understood as a "cable of meaning that keeps the human social unit connected to some purpose and/or power greater than itself. Like a little dinghy tethered to a distant dock, the human grouping is secured by that cable" (34). The cable's waterproof covering is the community's story—the shared history of the social unit. The cable's mesh sleeve is the community's common imagination—the group's understanding of how the world operates. The three interior strands of the mesh sleeve are spirituality—"those experiences and values that are internal" to the persons who comprise a society; morality—the outward performance of the values and experiences by persons who comprise a society; and corporeality—the "embodied" indications of the reality of religion. During the rummage sales, the waterproof covering and mesh sleeve receive a blow, opening up a hole to the braid. A mending process ensues in which the three braids are carefully examined. Once the community is satisfied with its new understanding of each strand, "religious duct tape" is applied to the waterproof casing; resealing the break with religious duct tape is a process that takes about one hundred years; there is relative calm afterward for about one hundred and fifty years; then comes a process of "peri-reformation," in which the cycle begins all over again.

In Part 2, Tickle examines the general characteristics that occasioned the Great Emergence. The prequel to emergence was the Great Reformation. The conflict between three popes in the early fifteenth century broke the community's story and common imagination and raised the important and perennial question of five-hundred-year hinge times: "Where now is the authority?" The Reformation's response was twofold: *sola Scriptura* is to be the sole unimpeachable authority of the church and the Scriptures can now be interpreted by every believer—the priesthood of all believers. Significant changes in sixteenth-century Europe also contributed to the overthrowing of fifteenth-century's institutionalized Christianity and to the rethinking of church authority: the invention of the printing press by Gutenberg in 1440 made Scripture available to everyone, ushering in Scripture's authority in human affairs; Copernican astronomy challenged the church's cosmology and theology, which had understood the earth as flat, the universe as tiered, and earth as the center of creation. The Catholic Reformation revealed "the tension toward changing things externally into new forms, as opposed to reworking them internally into what should be" (58); this tension was evidenced by Luther and others moving out of the church, while others sought to renew the church from within. Ominously, there is a pattern of bloodiness that has exemplified "the separation of innovators and re-traditioners from one another" (58), seen in the Italian and Spanish Inquisition and the Thirty Years' War, a competition for hegemony between Catholicism and Protestantism.

This past century's North American Christianity has been deeply impacted—particularly its communal story and common imagination—by science. Darwin's publication of the *Origin of Species* and Michael Faraday's discoveries in electromagnetic rotations and electromagnetic induction led the world "into new cultural, social, political, and theological territory" (64). Sigmund Freud opened up a whole new landscape of the unconscious; Carl Jung further extended the exploration of the unconscious; Joseph Campbell challenged the particularity and exclusivity of Christian doctrine through books and the PBS series, *The Power of Myth*. Cognitive scientists began to question the old definitions of the "self," casting aside René Descartes's notion, "I think, therefore I am," as an inadequate definition of our humanity. The resulting existential angst has brought about endless discussions of the self. Thus, in addition to the central question of authority, the Great Emergence raises two complementary questions: "What is human consciousness and/or the humanness of the human?" and "What is the relation of all religions to one another?" (73). Postemergent stability cannot be obtained until both questions have been answered.

The scientific discoveries of Albert E. Einstein and Werner Heisenberg along with the invention of the automobile also impacted North American Christianity. Einstein's theory of relativity led to Heisenberg's "Uncertainty Principle," a principle that undermined "the basis for any 'fact' in life" (79). With uncertainty being "the only fact that could be accepted as fact," the ramifications for culture and religion were profound. The scientists' work strengthened the scholarly arguments of previous biblical scholars such as Herman Reimarus and Albert Schweitzer, who argued that the Jesus of history is not the same as the Christ of faith portrayed in Western Christianity. The automobile gave Americans the freedom to roam at will, leaving grandma's influential ways of inculcating the faith "in the rearview mirror." The birth of Pentecostalism in the early 1900s, with its emphasis on participatory worship and, most importantly, its stress of the believer's direct engagement with the Holy Spirit as instructor, counselor, commander, and comforter, made the case "that ultimate authority is experiential rather than canonical" (85). Karl Marx's theories of economies and political structure challenged traditional Reformation concepts about authority, "human responsibility, individual worth, and existential purpose" (89); the implementation of Franklin D. Roosevelt's New Deal and Lyndon B. Johnson's Great Society indicates that twentieth-century Christianity found some elements of Marx's ideas attractive.

The founding of Alcoholics Anonymous was a watershed sociocultural event for it encouraged its participants to seek a "higher power" and to meet in small groups with empathetic nonprofessionals; the AA experience dealt a serious blow to the authority of clergy as well as organized religion. The mantra "I'm spiritual but not religious" was born. The Immigration and Nationality Services Act of 1965 gave full freedom of immigration and access to citizenship. Many Asians now immigrated to America, bringing a nontheistic Buddhism with them, which gave opportunity for those American

Christians subjectively starved for a richer inner life to feast upon "the Asian spiritual expertise and experience" (96). The drug age also contributed to the growth of nondoctrinal spirituality for it proffered new understandings of reality as well as fresh perceptions of internal subjectivity. The principle of *sola Scriptura* was further eroded by the Civil War (differing theological notions of slavery led to questions about Scripture's authority), the Great War (the role of women in society and in the church changed), the widespread acceptance of divorce, the ordination of women, and the "gay issue."

World War II introduced us to "Rosie the Riveter." While America's men were off at war, Rosie built the needed military equipment. This new experience of "being female" gave women a new degree of independence and power, forever changing gender relationships. The Rosies continued to work after the war; two-income families became the norm, which led to the loss of the traditional mother and the reconfiguration of the traditional nuclear family. With the Rosies no longer able to play the role of "principal storyteller and domestic rabbi," young Protestants and Catholics grew up ignorant of the content of Scripture.

In Part 3, the heart of the book, Tickle delineates the present shape of the Emergent church as well as its future configuration. In the late 1960s, North American Christianity could be divided into four groups: Liturgicals (Catholics, Anglicans, Orthodox), Social Justice Christians (Mainline Christians), Renewalists (Charismatic and Pentecostal Christians), and Conservatives (Fundamentalists and Evangelicals). Believers locate themselves in one of these groups on the basis of what is most important to them; "what one *does* religiously" (orthopraxy) is central to Liturgicals and Social Justice Christians; "what one *believes* doctrinally" (orthodoxy) is crucial to Renewalists and Conservatives. The boundaries between the four groups are not absolute, but semipermeable, with members of each group drawing certain features from the other groups. Toward the end of the twentieth century a "watercooler theology" arose. Instead of theology coming from a minister, Scripture, or family tradition, it came from the popular opinion of diverse conversationalists engaged in discussions about God-matters; the media age enhanced this trend, making theological discussion ubiquitous.

Protestant Christianity in America, with its characteristic feature of divisiveness, never had a center; what now was emerging was no longer Protestantism, but a combination of things taken from each group. The new Emergent Christianity "ran upward . . . picking up ideas and people from each [group], sweeping them into the center, mixing them there, and then spewing them forth into a new way of being Christian, into a new way of being Church" (135). Emergents became "post-modern, post-denominational, post-rational, post-Enlightenment, post-literate . . . post-Christendom" (136), and placed the *inherited church* (emphasis Tickle's) on the rummage sale table. Such radical change generated a backlash within each group; purists or reactionists sought to halt the changes that had occurred; these reactionists are the "ballast" of the Great Emergence, playing a necessary role in the success of the upheaval. There are four additional groups that are neither reactors nor emergers: Traditionalists who provide stability to a changing Christianity; Re-traditioning Christians who want to refurbish the inherited church, making it "more fully what it originally was" (141); Progressive Christians who want to remodel the inherited church, adapting the faith to the realities of post-modernity; Hyphenateds who live simultaneously within the gathering center of the Emergent movement as well as within one of the four groups, "the Presby-mergents, the Metho-mergents, and the Angli-mergents" (142).

Tickle sketches the future shape of the Great Emergence in the final chapter. She once again raises the all-important question, "Where now is our authority?" Social Justice Christians and Conservatives look to Scripture as the foundational source of authority; Renewalists maintain that the Holy Spirit is the principal source of direction; and Liturgicals insist that Scripture and the direct inspiration of the Holy Spirit must be filtered through church tradition. Emergent Christians, however, are currently engaged in a vigorous discussion about the basis of authority; Liturgical and Renewalist emergents want to allow an "aesthetic response and/or emotionally or spirituality moving experience to become bases for authority"(150); Social Justice and Conservative emergents aver that "only God can be the source of perfection in action and thought" (150). This vigorous conversation among emergents is revealing a networked authority, in which the church—"a self-organizing system of relations . . . between innumerable member-parts that themselves form subsets of relations within their smaller networks . . . in interlacing levels of complexity" (152)—is finding a system of communal authority that is based on the Spirit and the interconnectedness of Scripture-listening and Scripture-honoring believers. The Emergent church will thus be radically "relational, non-hierarchal, a-democratized form of Christianity" (153).

The Calvary Chapels and Vineyard Association of Churches, led by leaders such as John Wimber, illustrate aspects of the Emergent church. Wimber advocates a center-set triad, belong-behave-believe, which underscores the importance of a shared humanity, a salient quality of Emergent Christianity, rather than the bounded-set triad, believe-behave-belong, which emphasizes rules and doctrines as expectations for membership, the approach of Roman Catholicism and historic Protestantism. Emergents revel in mystery and paradox and are distrustful of logic and metanarratives. Narrative, however, "is the song of the vibrating network . . . narrative circumvents logic . . . [it] speaks to the heart in order that the heart, so tutored, may direct and inform the mind" (160). The Great Emergence is undoing the dualism of Hellenized Christianity, which accelerated when Constantine became emperor, by recovering the holistic theology of Judaism. The Emergent movement will "rewrite Christian theology . . . into something far more Jewish, more paradoxical, more narrative, and more mystical than anything the Church has had for the last seventeen or eighteen hundred years" (162).

Tickle's *The Great Emergence* is a sweeping sketch of twenty centuries of Christianity. Her identification of the social/cultural changes that led to the hinge points of Western Christianity is intriguing and thought-provoking. She clearly recognizes contemporary North American (Protestant) Christianity is undergoing significant changes, which is causing unease among the leadership of the institutionalized church. She rightly notes that many believers across all age groups are finding the beliefs and practices of the "inherited church" to be out of step with what they perceive to be authentic faith; and this dissatisfaction with the inherited church is surely of a different nature than the typical frustrations of previous generations.

Tickle's depiction of an emerging North American Christianity, however, raises a number of important questions. First, there is the question about the role of the institutionalized church. Tickle argues that the church's authority will be grounded in a Spirit-led networked/communal authority and that the expression of the faith will be radically "relational, non-hierarchal, a-democratized form of Christianity" (153). Such a construal of authority and church structure gives the reader the impression that the inherited church's institutionalized structures will play a minimal (if any) role in the Emergent church. Have not sociological studies shown that communities do not survive for decades without some form of organization for decision making? Cannot established structures coexist with the direct inspiration and guidance of the Spirit? The depiction of Spirit-led churches, organized around elders and deacons and overseen by the apostolic leaders of the Jerusalem or Antioch church as portrayed in the book of Acts, is surely a model the Emergent church ought to engage and give serious consideration.

Second, there is the question about the church's relationship to culture. Tickle does not adequately appreciate the expression of Christianity, seen throughout its history, wherein the church defines itself over against culture. She argues that "the Church has always been sucked along in the same ideational currents as has the culture in general" (151). Such a perspective overlooks the fact that many believers have endeavored to realize the biblically informed vision of the church, aptly stated by Barth, "[The Church] exists . . . to set up in the world a new sign which is radically dissimilar to [the world's] own manner and which contradicts it in a way which is full of promise" (*Church Dogmatics*, 4.3.2). Surely there is an ongoing vigorous conversation *within* the Emergent church between those emergents who desire to accommodate the church to our postmodern culture (Tickle) and those who embrace a Barthian perspective seeking to establish the church in a manner that is "radically dissimilar" to culture. Surely the emergent movement is richer, more variegated, and more complex than Tickle's somewhat reductionist portrait.

Third, there is the question concerning the relation of belief and practice (belonging). Tickle's contrast between those who value a center-set triad—belong-behave-believe (emergents), and those who embrace the bounded-set triad—believe-behave-belong (nonemergents), unfortunately continues to advocate a false dichotomy, characteristic of many believers, between belief and praxis. The NT literature, particularly the letters of Paul, makes abundantly clear that there is an *organic* relationship between belief and praxis. The redemptive work of God in Christ (belief) is foundational for *all* individual and communal expressions of the faith (practice). Christian community is rooted, grounded, and flows from God's reconciling work. Tickle's sketch of how belief and practice are related not only obscures the importance of their interconnectedness, but also suggests they are contrasting options in tension with one another.

Notwithstanding the foregoing shortcomings, Tickle's book is a must-read for those seeking to understand this particular hinge point of Christian history, in which, hopefully, a new, more vibrant, and purer expression of the Christian faith truly emerges.

Pacific Union College LEO RANZOLIN, JR.
Angwin, California