

commentaries would be much better served by Aune and Beale. But I believe Kistemaker's work will find its place in the libraries of many pastors and serious lay students of the book of Revelation.

Andrews University

JON PAULIEN

Longenecker, Richard N., ed. *Community Formation: In the Early Church and in the Church Today*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002. 237 pp. Paper, \$19.95.

This reasonably sized volume, made up of essays by leading biblical scholars, theologians, and historians, provides a fascinating and readable introduction to the church's understanding and organization of its structure, both in earliest times and in recent years—a subject often more prosaically known as “church order.” Using a loosely diachronic approach, the book begins with an overview of some of the forms of community prevalent in the NT world, followed by a major section devoted to exploring community formation in the various NT documents, two detailed chapters on some of its manifestations in the early church, and, finally, several aspects of its diversity in the church today.

Aimed at “the earnest reader and the Christian church at large” (xviii), the book's usefulness for the scholar and specialist is limited to some degree by its lack of footnotes. (Each essay does end with a generous bibliography, however, to which many authors make reference during the course of their essays.) For the novice, Longenecker provides in his introduction a brief overview of some of the struggles concerning church order over the past 150 years, paying particular attention to the divisive debates over whether God has actually originated and ordained any particular church structure.

Section 1 (“The Social Context”) opens with an overview, written by Richard Ascough, of some of the more common Greco-Roman philosophic, religious, and (other) voluntary associations that were available as models for the newly forming Christian groups of the first and second centuries. Alan Segal then explores the community experiences of the Judaism(s) out of which Christianity developed, giving particular attention to the structures of temple worship, synagogue, and family observance, and the ways in which these structures adapted in response to the consecutive threats of Hellenism and Jerusalem's destruction. Standing a little apart from the other articles in this section, Peter Richardson's “Building ‘an Association’ (*Synodos*) . . . and a Place of Their Own” directs one's attention to the relevant architectural practices during this time period. Richardson notes significant similarities among buildings used by the various Christian, Jewish, and Greco-Roman voluntary associations, postulating that Christian churches at first modeled themselves on the pattern of the synagogue, later on the Greco-Roman voluntary associations (on which the synagogues themselves had earlier patterned themselves), and later after Constantine, on the basilica model of established power.

In the NT section, Craig Evans's opening essay on the Gospels focuses upon the major features of Jesus' ministry which later formed the model for the

ministry of the Christian church. Longenecker follows with a brief exploration of Paul's understanding of the church and its organization (divinely controlled and carefully ordered, yet contextualized to its time and place) in the ten letters associated with Paul that do not directly address church order. "Divine Power, Community Formation, and Leadership in Acts" are addressed by Scott Bartchy, who argues that Luke's account seeks to hold up before the Gentiles a uniquely "community-forming and community-sustaining [Divine] power" (91), who calls Christian believers from the domination and honor values of society-at-large to the mutual caring and loyalty of a surrogate kinship group created within the Christian community. I. Howard Marshall's "Congregation and Ministry in the Pastoral Epistles" ends the section, discussing the images of church found in these letters and the instructions given to Timothy and Titus regarding the choosing of lay leaders who would share the governance and instruction of these increasingly autonomous communities of the Spirit.

There are two chapters in the book that deal with the early postbiblical historical evidence for the shape and function of the Christian ministry. Both point out the danger of seeing in the historical evidence that which the reader wants to be the norm. Alan Hayes begins his chapter, "Christian Ministry in Three Cities of the Western Empire (160-258 C.E.)," with the earliest historical evidence for Christian ministry in Lyons, Carthage, and Rome, reminding one that most studies on early ministry and liturgy have been for "programmatic purposes." Frances Young states this position even more strongly in "Ministerial Forms and Functions in the Church Communities of the Greek Fathers," where she addresses the evidence from the Greek writers. She warns that most studies on early Christian ministry discover "a reflection of the investigator's own denominational face at the bottom of a deep well" (157). Other than to deconstruct much of the partisan interpretation of the twentieth-century liturgical movements, both authors present the historical data succinctly. Another important caveat adhered to by both authors is the comment of Paul Bradshaw from his book *Search for Origins* that "most liturgists are 'lumpers' while most historians are 'splitters'" (129). It is not surprising, then, to discover that Hayes finds the early evidence for Christian ministry in Lyons, Carthage, and Rome is sparse. For Lyons, there is, Irenaeus; for Carthage, Tertullian and Cyprian; and for Rome there are Paul, Clement, Justin Martyr, Hippolytus, and the quotations and remarks of Eusebius, quite after the fact. Whereas the early twentieth-century liturgists made much of these sources, the evidence that emerges for the "splitters," the minimalist historians, is indeed minimal, especially before Cyprian in the mid-third century. Hayes points out the lack of clear distinctions between presbyters and bishops and the near total lack of any sacerdotalism or hierarchy between bishops and presbyters prior to Cyprian. In this process, he discusses the growing scholarly consensus that the *Apostolic Traditions*, generally attributed to Hippolytus, a schismatic bishop of Rome in the early third century, are inherently problematic as representations of Roman liturgy of his time. This is especially true since the available MSS change dramatically according to time and place of production, thus matching the fluidity of other early church manuals. Hayes takes the strong and

reasonable position that chapters 2 and 3, which have been pointed to as the earliest clear distinction between bishops and presbyters, “were not in the original of *Apostolic Traditions* and that chapter 7, with its ‘us’ language, was originally a prayer for both bishops and presbyters, who were not yet clearly distinguished” (148).

Frances Young gives an overview of the development of church manuals from the *Didache* in the second century to the *Apostolic Constitutions* in the fourth century. This development traces the emerging dominance of the bishop in Christian ministry and the strength of the deacons relative to the diminishing role of the presbyters. She suggests that the paramount shift that saved the presbyters from obscurity was the shift away from the model of the church as a household, where the bishop as a single *pater familias* rendered multiple heads unnecessary except in an advisory capacity. The model of the church as “God’s household” was replaced by the church as “God’s people” (171), where the bishop is more of a *pater poleos* administering a number of congregations and where the presbyters function as the heads. Inherent to both these models is the increasing use of the OT priesthood typology applied to Christian ministry—with the bishop as the high priest—and its inevitable cultic implications for the Eucharist. Young persuasively shows that the OT typologies of “king” and “priest” were the dominant points of contact in interpretation of NT passages on ministry throughout the early centuries of the church; and Cyprian, she points out, was an innovator in the area of typology for the ministry as well as the clerical function.

Cyprian has often been applauded for and accused of being the central figure in the early church who effectively used the threefold ministry of bishop, presbyter, and deacon during his exile from Carthage at the time of the Decian persecution. His use of the presbyter as officer of the Eucharist during the absence of the bishop included statements which invested the bishop and the presbyter—only by extension from the bishop—with the priesthood. Cyprian’s sacerdotal language pushed the understanding of the priesthood and Eucharist towards the mystagogy that became the norm for later generations. Young also brings to the fore an innovation by Cyprian that is often missed. Cyprian’s typology of the Eucharist is a reenactment of Christ’s passion, which, in turn, fuels his sacerdotal language. Cyprian builds this christological imagery and rationale on the already accepted OT priesthood typology for ministry.

Young shows that generations later this christological imagery and priesthood typology bore fruit in the mystagogy of the Christian priesthood and Eucharist, although he warns that Cyprian is often given too much credit for developing this typology. In spite of the early Christian rejection of animal sacrifice (as Jewish and pagan in nature) in favor of “bloodless sacrifices” of praise and thanksgiving, and in spite of the insistence that the Eucharist was a memorial of a once-for-all sacrifice rather than a repeated sacrifice, the force of the priestly typology brought the generation of John Chrysostom to an understanding of the many Eucharists as having a mystagogical connection

with the sacrifice of Christ. "Christian worship," Young concludes, "was increasingly assimilating the religious features of a dying paganism" (173).

These two chapters can be read as an excellent summary of the status of the academy's understanding of the development of the Christian ministry in the second through fifth centuries. The greatest critique, in our opinion, lies in the brevity of the chapters. The strength of Hayes's sharp focus on his three cities is his demonstration of the diversity of ministry from place to place, but the weakness of such a focus is the lacunae of times and places not covered. For instance, the later development of mystagogy in the West, such as the homilies of Ambrose, is not mentioned; and the early strength of the presbyters as church leaders in at least some parts of the East, as represented in the writings of Polycarp and Ignatius of Antioch, is also omitted. Thankfully, Young crosses over from the Greek writers to discuss Cyprian in her presentation of the development of the ministry into the priesthood.

The final section of the book focuses on the shape of the Christian community and ministry "in the Church today." Each of the three chapters focuses on one of the three major forms of contemporary Christian ministry: episcopal, presbyterian, and congregational. Each of the authors is well suited to talk from the inside of each of these forms. John Webster writes on "The 'Self-Organizing' Power of the Gospel: Episcopacy and Community Formation." David C. Hester presents "The Sanctified Life in the Body of Christ: A Presbyterian Form of Christian Community." Miroslav Volf shows "Community Formation as an Image of the Triune God: A Congregational Model of Church Order and Life." Each of these chapters emphasizes the community of believers in the church as found in its various forms, but the shape of each community pictured is quite distinct. Of course there are numerous current church communities that do not exactly fit any of these three models or that have elements of all three. This is not surprising in view of the suggestion in the earlier chapters of this book, correct in our opinion, that the early Christian communities had a variety of shapes, none of which exactly prefigured the current shapes of Christian communities.

Andrews University

TERESA L. REEVE AND JOHN W. REEVE

Moskala, Jifí. *The Laws of Clean and Unclean Animals in Leviticus 11*. Berrien Springs: Adventist Theological Society, 2002. 484 pp. Paper, \$19.95.

Jifí Moskala's Ph.D. dissertation, "The Laws of Clean and Unclean Animals in Leviticus 11" (Andrews University, 1998) is probably the most comprehensive on the subject. He begins with a lengthy review of everything written (1.1-111), followed by an analysis of the approaches taken in this literature (2.112-159), before applying his own analysis of the structure of these laws (3.160-280), their theology (4.281-344), and his conclusions (344-381). His work contains 10 tables and an overwhelming bibliography of about 1,330 items (382-484).