Andrews University

Digital Commons @ Andrews University

Dissertations

Graduate Research

2016

The Afterlife Views and the Use of the TaNaKh in Support of the Resurrection Concept in the Literature of Second Temple Period Judaism: The Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha

Jan A. Sigvartsen

Andrews University, MI, jsigvart@andrews.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations>

Part of the [Biblical Studies Commons](#), [Christianity Commons](#), [Jewish Studies Commons](#), and the [Religious Thought, Theology and Philosophy of Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Sigvartsen, Jan A., "The Afterlife Views and the Use of the TaNaKh in Support of the Resurrection Concept in the Literature of Second Temple Period Judaism: The Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha" (2016). *Dissertations*. 1592.

<https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations/1592>

<https://dx.doi.org/10.32597/dissertations/1592>

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Research at Digital Commons @ Andrews University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Andrews University. For more information, please contact repository@andrews.edu.

Andrews University

Digital Commons @ Andrews University

Dissertations

Graduate Research

2016

The Afterlife Views and the Use of the TaNaKh in Support of the Resurrection Concept in the Literature of Second Temple Period Judaism: The Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha

Jan A. Sigvartsen

Andrews University, MI, jsigvart@andrews.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations>

Part of the [Biblical Studies Commons](#), [Christianity Commons](#), [Jewish Studies Commons](#), and the [Religious Thought, Theology and Philosophy of Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Sigvartsen, Jan A., "The Afterlife Views and the Use of the TaNaKh in Support of the Resurrection Concept in the Literature of Second Temple Period Judaism: The Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha" (2016). *Dissertations*. 1592.

<https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations/1592>

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Research at Digital Commons @ Andrews University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Andrews University. For more information, please contact repository@andrews.edu.

ABSTRACT

THE AFTERLIFE VIEWS AND THE USE OF THE TANAKH IN SUPPORT OF
THE RESURRECTION CONCEPT IN THE LITERATURE OF SECOND
TEMPLE PERIOD JUDAISM: THE APOCRYPHA AND
THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHA

by

Jan Åge Sigvartsen

Adviser: Jacques B. Doukhan

ABSTRACT OF GRADUATE STUDENT RESEARCH

Dissertation

Andrews University

Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary

Title: THE AFTERLIFE VIEWS AND THE USE OF THE TANAKH IN THE
DEVELOPMENT OF THE RESURRECTION CONCEPT IN THE
LITERATURE OF SECOND TEMPLE PERIOD: THE APOCRYPHA AND
THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHIA

Name of researcher: Jan Åge Sigvartsen

Name and degree of faculty adviser: Jaques B. Doukhan, D.H.L., Th.D.

Date completed: Spring 2016

The literature of Second Temple Period Judaism indicates there was an increased interest in and speculation about the fate of the righteous and the wicked following their physical death. This period saw the birth of multiple Jewish sects and also multiple views of the afterlife. This study will outline the numerous afterlife views and will analyse the resurrection passages appearing in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha to gain a comprehensive overview of the texts used from the TaNaKh in support of these various resurrection beliefs. This study also provides a better understanding of how the TaNaKh was read by differing communities during this important period and the role the TaNaKh

played in the development of the resurrection belief – a central article of faith in both Christianity and Rabbinic Judaism.

Appendix A of this study provides a comprehensive list of resurrection passages from Second Temple period literature, compiled from the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha which are categorized and analyzed. Anthologies of the listed passages are also provided to show the larger context of each resurrection statement. Appendix B lists resurrection passages also found in the Dead Sea Scrolls, New Testament, and Early Rabbinic material.

In addition to outlining the numerous afterlife views, this study provides comprehensive examinations of the resurrection passages that either refer or allude to texts from the TaNaKh in support of a resurrection belief. This gives a better understanding of the role the TaNaKh played in the development of the resurrection belief and reveals which TaNaKh passages were considered a resurrection passage by authors and/or communities who produced these Second Temple period compositions. Primary findings, their implications and some general observations are also discussed.

This study identifies eighteen distinct views regarding “life-after-death” with varying degrees of complexity, suggesting great diversity in resurrection beliefs during this period. There is also no progress from a basic to a more complex death and resurrection view, as differing levels of complexity are represented throughout the period. Thus, there is no linear development of the resurrection belief, but rather, multiple views co-existed, although an eschatological bodily resurrection belief became the central tenet for both Rabbinic Judaism and the Early Christian Church. There seems to be no evidence in this literature in support of a shift in focus from a bodily resurrection towards

the immortality of the soul, as the fate of both the body and soul seem to be of great interest to the authors and the communities to which they belonged. Several influencing factors are identified as causing the many resurrection perspectives, such as, human anthropology, the nature of the soul, scope of the resurrection, number and function of the Judgments, and the final destination of the righteous and the wicked.

A careful reading of these resurrection passages in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha reveals that most of the distinct views on “life-after-death,” regardless of their complexity, are often supported by several key passages from the TaNaKh or shared motifs with the TaNaKh. It is suggested that future analysis of these key passages from the TaNaKh may shed further light on how literary works from this period interpreted, understood, used, and reused the TaNaKh. It may even determine if the resurrection belief is indeed present in these texts (based on good exegesis) or if this belief was read into these texts by Second Temple Period authors (an example of eisegesis). Based on preliminary observations, some of these resurrection concepts seem to derive naturally from the TaNaKh, while others seem to be based on an interpretation or a more elaborate exegesis. Yet, other usages seems a bit more forced, and in those cases the TaNaKh appears to be considered a source of proof-texts, seemingly often disregarding the larger context of the text quoted or alluded to. Early Second Temple period resurrection texts seem to be supported by a creative use of the TaNaKh while late Second Temple Period, early Christian, and Rabbinic texts seems to utilize more proof-texting – some of which were used by several literary works in support of their unique perspective on the afterlife.

An awareness of Second Temple period literature is helpful for gaining a better understanding of the death and afterlife views presented in the New Testament and in

Early Rabbinic literature, as it shows they are a part of the larger discussion taking place during this critical period. Table 45 provides a list of the TaNaKh passages which were either referred or alluded to in the context of the resurrection statements surveyed from the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. Table 46 centers on the 18 distinct afterlife views and indicates which views are supported by the TaNaKh. These two tables give an indication of the number of TaNaKh texts which were perceived as resurrection texts and the texts which were most often referred or alluded to.

Andrews University
Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary

THE AFTERLIFE VIEWS AND THE USE OF THE TANAKH IN SUPPORT OF
THE RESURRECTION CONCEPT IN THE LITERATURE OF SECOND
TEMPLE PERIOD JUDAISM: THE APOCRYPHA AND
THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHA

A Dissertation
Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by
Jan Åge Sigvartsen

Spring 2016

© Copyright by Jan Åge Sigvartsen 2016
All Rights Reserved

THE AFTERLIFE VIEWS AND THE USE OF THE TANAKH IN SUPPORT OF THE
RESURRECTION CONCEPT IN THE LITERATURE OF SECOND TEMPLE PERIOD
JUDAISM: THE APOCRYPHA AND THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHA

A dissertation
presented in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by

Jan Åge Sigvartsen

APPROVAL BY THE COMMITTEE:

Faculty Adviser
Jacques Doukhan
Professor of Old Testament

Director, Ph.D./Th.D. Programs
Thomas Shepherd

Richard Davidson
Professor of Old Testament

Dean, SDA Theological Seminary
Jiří Moskala

Robert Johnston
Professor of New Testament, Emeritus

P. Richard Choi
Chair and Professor of New Testament

Casey Elledge, Associate Professor
Gustavus Adolphus College

Date approved

Dedication

During the writing of this dissertation our family has moved continents twice, had four miscarriages, adopted one son from foster care, gave birth to another son less than 11 months later, developed celiac disease, and beat kidney cancer. We have survived surgeries, complications from surgeries, sleepless nights, “Irish” twins, eight months of colic, adoption/foster care court hearings, but met some amazing social workers, physicians, lawyers, and friends who all helped make our family possible.

I want to dedicate this work to my beautiful wife Leanne and my awesome sons Leif and Thor. You are my miracle family, and even though the challenging road we had to travel to be a family and stay a family added years to the writing of this work, I would do it all again to have you in my life.

“All Israelites have a share in the world to come . . . And these are the ones who have no portion in the world to come: (1) He who says, the resurrection of the dead is a teaching which does not derive from the Torah, (2) and the Torah does not come from Heaven; and (3) an Epicurean” (*m. Sanh.* 10:1).

“Rabbi Yaakov said: ‘This world is like a lobby before the world-to-come. Prepare yourself in the lobby so that you may enter the banquet hall’” (*m. Avot* 4:21).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS	xvi
LIST OF TABLES	xviii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxii
Chapter	
1. INTRODUCTION	1
Background to the Problem	1
Statement of the Problem	11
Purpose of the Study	11
Justification of the Study	12
Methodology	13
Scope and Delimitation of the Study	16
2. OLD TESTAMENT APOCRYPHAL WRITINGS	18
Sirach (Ecclesiasticus)	26
Sirach 48:10-11	29
Concluding Remarks	34
2 Maccabees	35
2 Maccabees 7	38
Concluding Remarks	48
Wisdom of Solomon	51
Literary Structure	53
Wisdom of Solomon 3:1-13a	58
Concluding Remarks	67
2 Esdras	69
2 Esdras 7 (4 Ezra 7)	81
Conclusion	88

3. OLD TESTAMENT PSEUDEPIGRAPHICAL WRITINGS	91
Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works	92
1 Enoch	102
The Book of Watchers (1-36)	103
1 Enoch 20:8	104
1 Enoch 22	105
The Souls are Conscious	111
Abel's Suit unto Heaven	113
Bodily or Spiritual Resurrection?	117
The Book of Parables (37-71)	119
1 Enoch 51	120
1 Enoch 61:1-5 and 62:12-16	124
Concluding Remarks	127
The Book of Astronomical Writings (72-82)	128
The Book of Dream Visions (83-90)	128
The Book of the Epistle of Enoch (91-105)	131
1 Enoch 91:8-17	131
1 Enoch 92:2-5	132
1 Enoch 102:4-104:8	133
The First Section	133
The Second Section	134
The Third Section	135
The Fourth Section	136
Concluding Remarks	136
1 Enoch 108	139
Concluding Remarks	140
2 Enoch	141
2 Enoch J32	142
Concluding Remarks	144
3 Enoch	146
3 Enoch 28:7-10	147
3 Enoch 44:7a	151
Concluding Remarks	152
Sibylline Oracles	154
Book 1	156
Book 2	157
Sibylline Oracles 2.221-251	158
Concluding Remarks	162
Book 3	162
Book 4	163
Book 6	165
Book 7	165

Book 8	166
Fragment 3	171
Apocryphon of Ezekiel	171
Fragment 1	172
Concluding Remarks	176
Apocalypse of Zephaniah	178
Other Ezra Texts	181
Apocalypse of Sedrach	185
2 Baruch	186
2 Baruch 14:10-14	190
2 Baruch 30:1-5	192
2 Baruch 42:7-8	193
2 Baruch 49-51	195
Concluding Remarks	201
Apocalypse of Elijah	203
Apocalypse of Elijah (C)	204
Apocalypse of Elijah (H)	207
Concluding Remarks	209
Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections)	210
Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs	214
Sleep as a Metaphor for Death	219
Clear Resurrection Hope	222
Limited Resurrection	223
Testament of Simeon 6:7	223
Testament of Levi 18:14	224
Testament of Judah 25	225
Testament of Zebulon 10:1-3	226
Testament of Dan 5:7-13	227
Universal Resurrection	228
Testament of Benjamin 10:4-10	228
Concluding Remarks	231
Testament of Job	232
Testament of Job 4:4-11	236
Allusions to the Resurrection	239
Concluding Remarks	241
Testament of Abraham	243
Testament of Moses	249
Testament of Adam	253
Expansions of Stories and Legends	259
Jubilees	263
Jubilees 23:29b-31	267
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	268
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 1:3-5	272

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 3:15b-20	272
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 4:14-22	273
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 9:6-11	278
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 9:16-18	279
Concluding Remarks	279
Joseph and Aseneth	281
Books of the Life of Adam and Eve	285
Apocalypse of Moses 10:2	289
Apocalypse of Moses 13:3-5 Vita 42:1-5	290
Apocalypse of Moses 28:4	292
Apocalypse of Moses 37:5 Vita 47:3	293
Apocalypse of Moses 39:2-3	294
Apocalypse of Moses 41:1-3	295
Apocalypse of Moses 43:2-3 Vita 51:2	297
Concluding Remarks	300
Pseudo-Philo	301
Pseudo-Philo 3:10	304
Pseudo-Philo 19:12-13	306
Pseudo-Philo 25:7	306
Pseudo-Philo 33:1-5	307
Pseudo-Philo 64:6-9	309
Concluding Remarks	312
Lives of the Prophets	313
Lives of the Prophets 2:15	315
Lives of the Prophets 3:12	316
Concluding Remarks	316
Ladder of Jacob	317
4 Baruch	318
4 Baruch 6:6-10	321
4 Baruch 7:18	323
4 Baruch 9:12-14	323
Concluding Remarks	324
History of Rechabites	325
History of the Rechabites 14:1a-16:8g	326
Concluding Remarks	327
Wisdom and Philosophical Literature	328
4 Maccabees	329
4 Maccabees 7:18-19 4 Maccabees 13:17	331
4 Maccabees 8-18	335
Mother's Speech to Her Sons	357
Concluding Remarks	366
Pseudo-Phocylides	368
Death and Afterlife (Ps.-Phoc. 97-115)	369

Prayers, Psalms, and Odes	380
The Psalms of Solomon	382
Psalms of Solomon 2:31	382
Psalms of Solomon 3:11-12	384
Psalms of Solomon 14:9-10	385
Psalms of Solomon 15:10-13	387
Concluding Remarks	388
Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers	389
Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers 3:24-27	391
Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers 7:11	392
Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers 12:46-50	393
Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers 16:7-9	395
Concluding Remarks	397
Odes of Solomon	398
Resurrection in the Odes of Solomon	400
Concluding Remarks	401
 4. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION	 402
Human Anthropology	403
Nature of the Soul	408
Scope of the Resurrection	410
Number and Function of the Judgments	411
Final Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked	414
Use of the TaNaKh in Support of the Resurrection Belief	419
 Appendix	
A. RESURRECTION PASSAGES IN THE APOCRYPHA AND THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHA: CLASSIFICATION AND ANTHOLOGY	425
B. RESURRECTION PASSAGES IN DEAD SEA SCROLLS, JOSEPHUS, NEW TESTAMENT AND EARLY RABBINIC JUDAISM: CLASSIFICATION	536
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	568
 VITA	609

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

1. Two Jewish Diasporas	19
2. Death and Resurrection in 2 Maccabees	50
3. Death and Resurrection in Wisdom of Solomon	68
4. Three-Stage Worldview Presented in 4 Ezra	77
5. Death and Resurrection in 4 Ezra (2 Esd 3-14)	78
6. Death and Resurrection in the Book of Watchers	118
7. Death and Resurrection in the Book of the Epistle of Enoch	138
8. Death and Resurrection in 2 Enoch	146
9. Death and Resurrection in 3 Enoch	153
10. Death and Resurrection in the Apocalypse of Zephaniah	180
11. Death and Resurrection in the Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	182
12. Death and “Resurrection” in the Vision of Ezra	183
13. Death and “Resurrection” in the Questions of Ezra	184
14. Two-Stage Worldview Presented in 2 Baruch	189
15. Death and Resurrection in 2 Baruch	202
16. Death and Resurrection in the Testament of Abraham	248
17. Death and Resurrection in Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	280
18. Death and Resurrection in Pseudo-Philo	313

19. Death and Afterlife in 4 Maccabees	367
20. Death and Resurrection in Pseudo-Phocylides	380
21. Death and Resurrection in Psalms of Solomon	389
22. Human Anthropology – The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha	405
23. Human Anthropology – The Souls of the Wicked	409
24. Number of Judgments Presented in the Eighteen Unique Resurrection Views of the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha	412
25. A Harmonized Resurrection View	418

LIST OF TABLES

1. Order of Books in the Hebrew Bible and the Septuagint	20
2. Classifications of the Apocryphal Writings	23
3. Literary Genre of the Apocrypha	24
4. Resurrection Texts in the Apocrypha	25
5. Literary Structure of Ben Sira's List of Heroes	30
6. Links between Malachi 3:19-23 and Sirach 48:1-11	32
7. The Speeches in 2 Maccabees 7	41
8. Literary Structure of Wisdom of Solomon	54
9. The Chiastic Structure of the Book of Eschatology	56
10. Two Phases of Life After Death	61
11. Parallels between Isaiah 52-53 and Wisdom 2-4	66
12. Titles Given to Books Associated with Ezra	70
13. Literary Structure of 2 Esdras	73
14. The State of the Dead (2 Esd 7:81-87, 92-98)	76
15. Parallels between the Resurrection Passages in 4 Ezra 7 and Daniel/Isaiah	82
16. Judgment Scenes in Apocalyptic Literature	87
17. Literary Genre of the Pseudepigrapha	93
18. Jewish Apocalypses	96

19. Resurrection Texts in Apocalypses Category of the Pseudepigrapha	98
20. Literary Structure of 1 Enoch 22	106
21. The Four Holding Compartments for the Souls in 1 Enoch 22	109
22. Links between Genesis 4:9-10 and Genesis 9:4-6	115
23. Literary Structure of 1 Enoch 51	122
24. Literary Structure of 1 Enoch 61:1-5	125
25. Literary Structure of 1 Enoch 102:4-104:8	133
26. The Judgment Scene in 3 Enoch 28 and Daniel 7	148
27. The Bodily Forms of the Soul	151
28. The Provenance of the Sibylline Oracles	154
29. Resurrection Texts in the Testaments	213
30. Structural Overview of the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs	218
31. Literary Structure of the Testament of Job	234
32. Resurrection Texts in Expansions on Stories and Legends	261
33. Outline of the Book of Jubilees	265
34. Outline of the Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	271
35. The Eden Narrative and the Books of the Life of Adam and Eve	288
36. Death and Resurrection View Derived from the Apocalypse of Moses	301
37. Resurrection Statement and Allusions in Pseudo-Philo	304
38. Resurrection Texts in Wisdom and Philosophical Literature	329
39. Outline of 2 Maccabees 7 and 4 Maccabees 8-18	336

40. The Final Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked in 2 Maccabees 7 and 4 Maccabees 8-18	352
41. Helpful Examples to Remember (4 Maccabees 18:11-13)	358
42. Resurrection Texts in Prayers, Psalms, and Odes	381
43. The Disembodied Souls	407
44. Final Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked	416
45. List of the TaNaKh Passages Referred or Alluded to in the Context of the Resurrection Statements Surveyed from the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha	422
46. The Eighteen Distinct Afterlife Views and the TaNaKh	424
47. List of Categories Used in the Resurrection Texts Tables in Appendix A	427
48. The Different Coding Utilized in the Anthology in Appendix A	428
49. List of Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Apocrypha	431
50. List of Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works	451
51. List of Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections)	487
52. List of Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha Expansions of the “Old Testament” and Legends	499
53. List of Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha Wisdom and Philosophical Literature	516
54. List of Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha Prayers, Psalms, and Odes	522
55. List of Categories Used in the Seven Resurrection Texts Tables	537
56. List of Resurrection Texts in the Dead Sea Scrolls	540
57. List of Resurrection Texts in Josephus	542

58. List of Resurrection Texts in the New Testament	544
59. List of Resurrection Texts in Jewish Liturgy	556
60. List of Resurrection Texts in Rabbinic Literature	558

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AB	Anchor Bible
ABD	Anchor Bible Dictionary
ABRL	Anchor Bible Reference Library
AnBib	Analecta biblica
ANEM	Ancient Near East Monographs/Monografias sobre el Antiquo Cercano
ANF	Ante-Nicene Fathers
AUSDDS	Andrews University Seminary Doctoral Dissertation Series
<i>AUSS</i>	<i>Andrews University Seminary Studies</i>
<i>BAR</i>	<i>Biblical Archaeology Review</i>
BCE	Before the Common Era = BC
BETL	Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologiarum lovaniensium
CANE	Civilizations of the Ancient Near East
<i>CBQ</i>	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CBQMS	Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series
COQG	Christian Origins and the Question of God
CE	Common Era = A.D.
CEJL	Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature

ConBNT	Coniectanea neotestamentica or Coniectanea biblica: New Testament Series
CSB	Holman Christian Standard Bible
DCLS	Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Studies
DEJ	Dictionary of Early Judaism
DNTB	Dictionary of New Testament Background
DSS	Dead Sea Scrolls
Ebib	Etudes bibliques
EncJud	Encyclopaedia Judaica
EncJud ²	Encyclopaedia Judaica 2 nd Edition
ET	English Text
FB	Forschung zur Bibel
Hen	Henoch: Studies on Judaism and Christianity from Second Temple to Late Antiquity
HSS	Harvard Semitic Studies
HTR	Harvard Theological Review
<i>HUCA</i>	<i>Hebrew Union College Annual</i>
IDB	The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible
<i>JATS</i>	<i>Journal of the Adventist Theological Society</i>
<i>JBQ</i>	<i>Jewish Bible Quarterly</i>
<i>JE</i>	<i>Jewish Encyclopedia</i>
<i>JETS</i>	<i>Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society</i>
<i>JNES</i>	<i>Journal of Near Eastern Studies</i>

JSJS	Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism
<i>JSOT</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the Old Testament</i>
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament: Supplement Series
<i>JSP</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha</i>
<i>JTS</i>	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
JWSTP	Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus
KJA	King James Version Apocrypha
LXT/LXX	Septuagint – Ancient Greek translation of the Hebrew Bible
MGWJ	Die Seele als Vogel: Ein Beitrag zu den Anschauungen der Agada
MJT	Melanesian Journal of Theology
MT	Massoretic Text
NRSV	New Revised Standard Version
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NIDNTT	New International Dictionary of New Testament Theology
NIDOTTE	New International Dictionary of Old Testament Theology and Exegesis
NovTSup	Novum Testamentum: Supplements
OTL	Old Testament Library
OTP	Old Testament Pseudepigrapha
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBT	Studies in Biblical Theology
Sem	Semitica

SVTP	Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha
TaNaKh	Hebrew based acronym = Torah – Prophet – Writings = Jewish Bible
TBM	Themes in Biblical Narrative: Jewish and Christian Traditions
Tg. Onq.	Targum Onqelos
Tg. Ps.-J.	Targum Pseudo-Jonathan
TMP	The Minor Prophets – An Exegetical & Expository Commentary
TNTC	Tyndale New Testament Commentary
TRENT	Traditions of the Rabbis from the Era of the New Testament
TWOT	Theological Wordbook of the Old Testament
VC	Vigiliae Christianae
<i>VT</i>	<i>Vetus Testamentum</i>
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WGRW	Writings from the Greco-Roman World
<i>WUNT</i>	<i>Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament</i>
<i>ZAW</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft</i>
<i>ZPE</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik</i>

Second Temple Period Literature

Apocrypha/Pseudepigrapha

Apoc. El. (C)	Coptic Apocalypse of Elijah
Apoc. El. (H)	Hebrew Apocalypse of Elijah
Apoc. Ezek.	Apocryphon of Ezekiel
Apoc. Mos.	Apocalypse of Moses
2 Bar.	2 Baruch

4 Bar.	4 Baruch
1 En.	1 Enoch (Ethiopic Apocalypse)
2 En.	2 Enoch (Slavonic Apocalypse)
3 En.	3 Enoch (Hebrew Apocalypse)
2 Esd	2 Esdras
Gk. Apoc. Ezra	Greek Apocalypse of Ezra
Hel. Syn. Pr.	Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers
Hist. Rech.	History of the Rechabites
Jos. Asen.	Joseph and Aseneth
Jub.	Jubilees
L.A.B.	Liber antiquitatum biblicarum
Lad. Jac.	Ladder of Jacob
L.A.E.	Life of Adam and Eve
Liv. Pro.	Lives of the Prophets
2 Macc	2 Maccabees
4 Macc.	4 Maccabees
Mart. Ascen. Isa.	Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah
Odes Sol.	Odes of Solomon
Ps.-Philo	Pseudo-Philo
Ps.-Phoc.	Pseudo-Phocylides
Pss. Sol.	Psalms of Solomon
Ques. Ezra	Questions of Ezra
Sib. Or.	Sibylline Oracles
Sir	Sirach/Ecclesiasticus
T. Ab.	Testament of Abraham
T. Adam	Testament of Adam
T. Ash.	Testament of Asher
T. Benj.	Testament of Benjamin
T. Dan	Testament of Dan
T. Gad	Testament of Gad
T. Iss.	Testament of Issachar
T. Job	Testament of Job
T. Jos.	Testament of Joseph
T. Jud.	Testament of Judah
T. Levi	Testament of Levi
T. Mos.	Testament (Assumption) of Moses
T. 12 Patr.	Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs
T. Sim.	Testament of Simeon
T. Zeb.	Testament of Zebulon
Vita	Vita Adae et Evae
Wis	Wisdom of Solomon

Dead Sea Scrolls

4Q386	4QPseudo-Ezekiel ^b
4Q388	4QPseudo-Ezekiel ^d
4Q416	4QInstruction ^b
4Q418	4QInstruction ^d
4Q504	4QWords of the Luminaries ^a
4Q521	4QMessianic Apocalypse
4Q548	4QVisions of Amram ^{f?} ar

Josephus

Ant.	Jewish Antiquities
J.W.	Jewish War

New Testament

Mat	Matthew
Rom	Romans
1 Cor	1 Corinthians
2 Cor	2 Corinthians
Gal	Galatians
Eph	Ephesians
Phil	Philippians
Col	Colossians
1 Thess	1 Thessalonians
2 Thess	2 Thessalonians
1 Tim	1 Timothy
2 Tim	2 Timothy
Heb	Hebrews
Jas	James
1 Pet	1 Peter
2 Pet	2 Peter
Rev	Revelation

Rabbinic Works

‘Abod. Zar.	Avodah Zarah
b.	Babylonian Talmud
B. Bat.	Baba Bathra

Ber.	Berakhot
Chul.	Chullin
Chag.	Chagigah
Deut. Rab.	Rabbah Deuteronomy
Eccl. Rab.	Rabbah Ecclesiastes
Esth. Rab.	Rabbah Esther
Exod. Rab.	Rabbah Exodus
Gen. Rab.	Rabbah Genesis
Ketub	Ketubbot
Lam. Rab.	Rabbah Lamentation
Lev. Rab.	Rabbah Leviticus
m.	Mishnah
Meg.	Megillah
Nid.	Niddah
Num. Rab.	Rabbah Numbers
Pesach	Pesachim
Qidd.	Kiddushin
Rab.	Rabbah
Roš Haš.	Rosh HaShana
Šabb.	Shabat
San.	Sanhedrin
Song. Rab.	Rabbah Song of Songs
Sot	Sotah
t.	Tosefta
Ta'an.	Ta'anith
y.	Jerusalem Talmud

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank my parents Torbjørn and Grethe Lill Sigvartsen for all of their support throughout my life. You are the best gift I have ever been given.

Also, Jack and Nancy Krogstad, my “American parents,” for the support and encouragement they have given me during my academic career. I have greatly valued the years you have been in my life.

I would like to thank Nina Elmendorf-Steele for proofreading this work and also the support and friendship she has given to me and my family through the years. We love you “Nini.”

Also, my wife Leanne for encouraging me, looking after me, and helping me through the process of completing this work. Without you life would not have been the same and this work would never have come to fruition. I love you.

I would also like to thank my two little boys, Leif and Thor. Your giggles, milestones, and love provided a welcome break from the writing of this work and helped me keep my life in perspective.

Thank you to my committee for their encouragement and their enthusiasm for this research topic. Thank you especially to my Doktorvater, Jacques Doukhan, for all our discussions, your mentoring, and you and your wife’s hospitality to Leanne and myself.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background to the Problem

Compared to ancient Near Eastern literature and archaeological remains, the Hebrew Scriptures do not seem to convey a great deal regarding death and afterlife.¹ However, it is apparent from scripture that there was certainly an interest in and concern about the topic (see e.g. Gen 5:24; Num 16:33; 1 Sam 2:6; 28:8-19; 2 Kgs 2:11; Isa 26:19; Ezek 37:1-14; Prov 12:28).² The overall impression from a study of the TaNaKh passages relating to the afterlife is that death was not considered the start of the next life,

¹For a short overview of the Egyptian, Canaanite, Hittite, and Mesopotamian thoughts regarding death and the afterlife, see e.g.: Volkert Haas, "Death and the Afterlife in Hittite Thought," in *Civilization of the Ancient Near East*, ed. Jack M. Sasson (New York, 1995; repr. in 2 vols., Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2006), 3:2021-2030; Leonard H. Lesko, "Death and the Afterlife in Ancient Egyptian Thought," in *Civilization of the Ancient Near East*, ed. Jack M. Sasson (New York, 1995; repr. in 2 vols., Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2006), 3:1763-1774; Jo Ann Scurlock, "Death and the Afterlife in Ancient Mesopotamian Thought," in *Civilization of the Ancient Near East*, ed. Jack M. Sasson (New York, 1995; repr. in 2 vols., Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2006), 3:1883-1893; Alan F. Segal, *Life after Death: A History of the Afterlife in the Religions of the West* (New York: Doubleday, 2004), 27-119; Paolo Xella, "Death and the Afterlife in Canaanite and Hebrew Thought," in *Civilization of the Ancient Near East*, ed. Jack M. Sasson (New York, 1995; repr. in 2 vols., Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2006), 3:2059-2070.

²Editorial Staff, Encyclopaedia Judaica, "Afterlife," *EncJud* 2:337.

but the end of the present.³ שְׁאוֹל [*Sheol*]⁴ is the destiny that awaits both the righteous and the wicked (Eccl 9:1-10), a place where everyone will be equal (Job 3:13-19; Ezek 32:18-32).⁵ The lack of obvious religious burial rites in the Hebrew Bible may further suggest a lack of interest in the afterlife among religious leaders.⁶ The biblical writers focused on

³See e.g., Philip S. Johnston, *Shades of Sheol: Death and Afterlife in the Old Testament* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2002), 65 and N. T. Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, COQG 3 (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2003), 97.

⁴The Hebrew word שְׁאוֹל (*sheol*) is most often translated as ᾠδης (*hades*), the underworld, in the Septuagint, as *infernus*, hell, in the Vulgate, and as grave, pit, hell, death, or *Sheol* in the English translations (see Table 1 in Eriks Galenieks, “The Nature, Function, and Purpose of the Term שְׁאוֹל in the Torah, Prophets, and Writings” [PhD diss., Andrews University, 2005], 4-6).

⁵Laurentino Jose Afonso observes that Isa 14:14-19 and Ezek 38:18ff. indicate that there are several levels of *Sheol*, and Deut 26:12, 14 alludes to the practice of feeding the dead (even giving a tacit approval for such a practice as long as consecrated food was not used), suggesting that there may be some form of existence in the afterworld. However, he notes that the TaNaKh speaks strongly against the practice of necromancy (Deut 18:11; Isa 18:19; 1 Chr 10:13) and sacrificing to the dead (Num 25:2-3; Ps 106:28). Apart from these passages, Afonso argues that “the numerous biblical references to the netherworld are vague and inspired by Ancient Near Eastern folklore” (Laurentino Jose Afonso, “Netherworld,” *EncJud* 12:996). Johnston, in *Shades of Sheol*, makes several observations regarding death and afterlife in the Hebrew Scripture. He suggests that there seems to be no great concern with the ongoing fate of the dead (85), no suggestion in either textual or archaeological data indicating a continued interest in the remains of the dead (65), no evidence of a highly developed demonology (166), and no preoccupation with necromancy (*ibid.*). He notes further, “the Hebrew Bible does not substantiate the scholarly view that veneration of the ancestors was widespread in Israel and that evidence of it was later suppressed. On the contrary, it suggests that, while it may have occurred, it was of marginal importance” (195). Johnston concludes that although there are a few texts which “seems to affirm a continued communion with God after death” (217), or suggests a hope in an eschatological resurrection (218-239), the Israelites were firmly anchored in the present life, serving the God of the living.

Galenieks, however, categorically denies any conscious existence in *Sheol*. His exegetical examination of all the sixty-six references to the term “*sheol*” in the TaNaKh, focusing on its nature, function, and purpose, show that it is consistently “a poetic synonym of the grave” (Galenieks, “The Nature, Function, and Purpose of the Term שְׁאוֹל,” 582), and as such, never used as a term for a literal netherworld (*passim*). He observes: “*Sheol* means no more than the place of the dead or simply the grave in general, where the dead bodies or corpses return to become the dust of the earth (Gen 2:7; 3:19). On the other hand, the fact that not even one of the sixty-six references to the term *Sheol* contains any indication that Yahweh would somehow try to communicate with the dead is strikingly clear and does not need to be commented on” (598). The finality of *Sheol* is further supported by the fact that only two of the sixty-six *Sheol* passages (1 Sam 2:6; Job 14:13) indicate that it is merely a temporary place for its habitants (see Table 19, page 600).

⁶Elizabeth Bloch-Smith remarks that the “biblical references to burial are descriptive rather than prescriptive” and “it is impossible to distinguish Israelite from Canaanite burials” during the MB II (“Burials,” *ABD* 1:785). The archaeological evidence from the First Temple period shows that also the Israelites provided their dead with gifts and provisions (*Ibid.*, 785-789, see also her book: *Judahite Burial*

the present life and centered on the covenant relationship between man and God. The Hebrew Scriptures do not present a fully developed, or rather, a complete, comprehensive, and detailed description of the afterlife. N. T. Wright notes that “the Bible mostly denies or at least ignores the possibility of a future life, with only a few texts coming out strongly for a different view.”⁷ However, there is little doubt that the Hebrew Scripture speaks of a resurrection belief, Daniel 12:2-3, 13 being the most explicit

Practices and Beliefs about the Dead, JSOTSup 123 [Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1992]). The only detailed description of a funeral in the Hebrew Bible, according to Xella, is that of Abner in 2 Samuel 3:31-36 (“Death and Afterlife,” 3:2068). However, the TaNaKh regards proper burial with great importance (the patriarchs and matriarchs, with the exception of Rachel, were all buried in the family tomb at Machpelah [Gen 23; 49:29-33; 50:25-26], while inappropriate or lack of burial was considered a curse [e.g. Deut 28:26; Jer 22:19]). Delbert Roy Hillers notes that there was a great desire by the Israelites “to maintain some contact with the community even after death, through burial in one’s native land, and if possible with one’s ancestors (“Burial,” *EncJud*² 4:291). This desire is perhaps voiced the strongest by Jacob (Gen 49:29) and Joseph (50:24-25) who both requested that their bodies should be brought back to the promised land (Gen 50:1-14 describes the fulfillment of Jacob’s request while the fulfillment of Joseph’s request envelops the Exodus narrative which refers to Joseph’s bones in Exod 13:19 and Josh 24:32). The practice of family burial gave rise to Hebrew expressions such as: “to sleep with one’s fathers,” “buried with his fathers,” and “to be gathered to one’s kin” (e.g., Gen 25:8; 1 Kgs 11:43; 2 Kgs 8:24). Some maximalist scholars may view these Hebrew expressions and the importance placed on a burial in one’s native land with one’s ancestors as early evidence of resurrection beliefs, but be that as it may, the Second Temple period burial practices differed radically and reflect the strong resurrection hope held during this period (see e.g., Rachel Hachlili, “Burials: Ancient Jewish,” *ABD* 1:789-794 and *Jewish Funerary Customs, Practices and Rites in the Second Temple Period*, JSJS 94 [Leiden; Bosten: Brill, 2005]).

However, Richard C. Steiner, in his monograph (*Disembodied Souls: The Nefesh in Israel and Kindred Spirits in the Ancient Near East, with an Appendix on the Katumuwa Inscription*, ANEM 11 [Atlanta: SBL Press, 2015]), notes the pentateuchal idiom וַיֵּאָסֶף אֶל-עַמְּיוֹ, and is gathered unto his people (Gen 25:8-9, 17; 35:29; 49:29, 33 [cf. 50:13]; Num 20:24; 27:13; 31:2; Deut 32:50), “refer to something that occurs after death but before burial – either right before burial (Isaac) or long before burial (Jacob)” (94), implying “the existence of the soul or spirit that leaves the body at death, before interment, and continues to exist in disembodied form” (97). Steiner finds Jacob Milgrom’s suggestion that the punishment בָּרַח, as in the formula וְנִכְרְתוּ הַנְּפֹשֹׁת הָעֹשִׂים מִקֶּרֶב עַמָּם, and the souls who are doing [so] shall be cut off from the midst of the people (Lev 18:29), is the idiom’s antonym (Jacob Milgrom, *Leviticus 1-16: A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary*, AB 3 [New York: Doubleday, 1991], 459-460) “attractive and potentially very important” (99) as these two archaic expressions provide evidence “that ideas about disembodied souls and their punishment in the afterlife were current among the Israelites far earlier than generally assumed” (100). Saliently, Steiner notes that the disembodied soul could still possess a bodily form or shape, adding the Hebrews may have had a hard time conceiving “souls in the shape of anything but a body – a body resembling their own” (123).

⁷Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 129.

statement.⁸ Collins comments that “even if one takes a maximalist view of the evidence for resurrection in the Hebrew Bible,⁹ the hope expressed in Dan 12 was

⁸John J. Collins states that “the resurrection language is certainly used metaphorically in the Hebrew Bible (e.g., Ezekiel 37; Hos 6:2), but there is virtually unanimous agreement among modern scholars that Daniel is referring to the actual resurrection of individuals from the dead, because of the explicit language of everlasting life. This is, in fact, the only generally accepted reference to resurrection in the Hebrew Bible” (*Daniel: A Commentary on the Book of Daniel*, Hermeneia [Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993], 391-392). Claudia Setzer makes an important observation regarding the use of metaphor: “metaphors cannot communicate if they have nothing to do with the way people think and live. These images in Ezekiel and Isaiah likely are metaphorical, and not literal, but would be meaningless in a context where afterlife is seen as an absurdity” (*Resurrection of the Body in Early Judaism and Early Christianity: Doctrine, Community, and Self-Definition* [Boston: Brill, 2004], 8). Bertrand C. Pryce reached a similar conclusion in his exegetical study on Hosea 5:8-6:6. His multi-faceted approach (including issues of limitation, translation, form, genre, historical context, structural analysis, and lexical survey) which presumes the reliability of the MT, suggests that the resurrection motif should be understood both metaphorically and physically (“The Resurrection Motif in Hos 5:8-6:6: An Exegetical Study” [PhD diss., Andrews University, 1989]).

Artur A. Stele’s theological study of Daniel 12 reveals that this resurrection text is structurally, linguistically, and thematically related to other passages of the book of Daniel. Furthermore, “the presence of the motifs of death, resurrection, retribution, eternal life and judgment,” in addition to the “contribution to such major theological themes as the power and absolute sovereignty of God, the Kingdom of God, judgment, creation, and theology of history – all seem to support the suggestion that resurrection is indeed the theological climax of the book” (“Resurrection in Daniel 12 and Its Contribution to the Theology of the Book of Daniel” [PhD diss., Andrews University, 1996], 257-259).

⁹It could be argued that some maximalist interpreters are continuing the Rabbinical exercise of searching for biblical proof-texts to support an already accepted belief, in the process reading more into the Hebrew text than is warranted. However, most interpreters try to stay true to the text. For maximalist interpretations, see e.g., Andrew Chester, “Resurrection and Transformation,” in *Auferstehung-Resurrection: The Fourth Durham-Tübingen Research Symposium, Resurrection, Transfiguration and Exaltation in Old Testament, Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity* (Tübingen, September 1999), ed. F. Avemarie and H. Lichtenberger, WUNT 2/135 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001), 65-67; Mitchell Dahood, *Psalms*, 3 vols, AB 16-17A (Garden City: Doubleday, 1965-1970); Galenicks, “The Nature, Function, and Purpose of the Term מָשַׁח”; Leonard J. Greenspoon, “The Origin of the Idea of Resurrection,” in *Traditions in Transformation: Turning Points in Biblical Faith*, ed. B. Halpern and J. Levenson (Winona Lake, IL: Eisenbrauns, 1981), 189-240; Gerhard F. Hasel, “Resurrection in the Theology of Old Testament Apocalyptic,” *ZAW* 92 (1980): 267-84; Robert Martin-Achard, *From Death to Life: A Study of the Development of the Doctrine of the Resurrection in the Old Testament* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1960); John A. Sawyer, “Hebrew Words for the Resurrection of the Dead,” *VT* 23 (1973): 18-34.

At this point it is important to make a few comments regarding Job 19:25-27 which most Christian maximalist interpreters view as a solid resurrection text, see e.g. Gordon E. Christo, “The Eschatological Judgment in Job 19:21-29: An Exegetical Study” (PhD diss., Andrews University, 1992) and Jacques Doukhan, “Radioscopy of a Resurrection: The Meaning of *niqqēpū sōt* in Job 19:26,” *AUSS* 34, no. 2 (Autumn 1996): 187-193 who makes a compelling case that the book of Job expresses a clear resurrection doctrine (Doukhan bases his interpretation of the key words מְשַׁח, *is destroyed, this...*, on the poetic dynamics of Job 19:25-27 and on Job 10:8-12 which is structural, linguistically, and theologically related). However, most commentaries find this passage perplexing, and as such, disagree on its interpretation (164-165), the critical scholars denying any hint of a resurrection hope in it. Interestingly, the LXX gives this text a clear resurrection meaning. (It should be note that the LXX tends to give potential resurrection passages in

exceptional.”¹⁰ This explicit resurrection passage draws on and alludes to several older biblical passages suggesting that the author must have understood them eschatologically and saw in them a resurrection hope.¹¹ The most fertile source for ideas and images was the book of Isaiah¹² and, importantly, some of the language was taken directly from Isaiah 26:19¹³ which describes the dead who will come back to life and the corpses that will rise

the Hebrew Scripture a more clear and distinctive resurrection message. Moreover, metaphorical resurrection texts in the MT become individualized in the LXX. For further study, see e.g., Joachim Schaper, *Eschatology in the Greek Psalter*, WUNT 2/76 [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1995]; Wright, *Resurrection of the Son of God*, 145-150). It translates 19:26a נֶאֱחַד עֲרֵי נִפְחָאֵה וְאֶחָד, *And after my skin has been destroyed*, with ἀναστήσαι τὸ δέρμα μου, *God will resurrect my skin*. It is obvious that the translator of Job believed in a bodily resurrection since Job 14:14 and the postscript, 42:17 contain a resurrection hope. There is one complicating factor, however, there are no references to Job 19:26 in any of the Second Temple period literature, nor in early Rabbinic literature, during the time when the Rabbis examined the TaNaKh for resurrection passages. Interestingly, Christo notes that “Clement of Rome was the first of the early church fathers on record to quote Job 19:25-27 in the context of resurrection [1 Clem 26.3],” Origen was the first to give this passage a Christological reading (viewing the redeemer of Job 19:26 as a reference to Jesus) [*Commentary on Matthew*, 17.29], Augustine used it as a resurrection proof-text [*City of God*, 22.29], while Jerome gave the Vulg. the following reading: et rursum circumdabor pelle mea et in carne mea videbo Deum, *And I shall be clothed again with my skin, and in my flesh I shall see my God* (Christo, “The Eschatological Judgment in Job 19:21-29,” 11-12).

¹⁰Collins, *Daniel*, 395.

¹¹The “book” mentioned in Dan 12:1 is most likely the same book described in Exod 32:32, “the Book of Life”, and contains the name of the righteous, those who will survive God’s judgment and become citizens of His kingdom (see also, Isa 4:2-6; Mal 3:16-18; Ps 69:28 and Angel Manuel Rodriguez, “The Heavenly Books of Life and of Human Deeds,” *JATS* 13, no. 1 [Spring 2002]: 10-26). This resurrection passage is also using the metaphor of “sleep” for death and “dust” for the destination of the dead, both terms are used widely in the Hebrew Scripture (for sleep=death, see e.g.: 2 Kgs 4:31; 13:21; Jer 51:39, 57; Nah 3:18; Ps 13:3; Job 3:13; 14:12; and for dust=final destination, see e.g.: Gen 3:19; Isa 26:19; Ps 104:29; Eccl 3:20; 12:7; Job 10:9), and it would be natural to assume that Dan 12:2 followed this metaphor when using the word “awake” when describing the resurrection. For further reading, see Segal, *Life after Death*, 262-266; Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 109-119.

¹²The word, לִרְאֹן, *abhorrence*, is only used twice in the Hebrew Scripture, Dan 12:2 and Isa 66:24 linking these two passages, indicating that the author of Daniel read Isa 66 eschatologically and viewed the punishment described in Isa 66 as the final destiny measured out to the wicked. The word, הַחֲכָמִים, *the wise*, of Dan 12:3 is closely linked with Isa 52:13 and 53:11, and the entire theme, the vindication of the persecuted righteous, follows “the scenario with which Isaiah 40-55 reaches its great climax” (Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 115).

¹³Isa 26:19 is a part of the larger apocalyptic unit, Isa 24-27, which describes the cosmic judgment which will rescue the righteous and resurrect the dead. Although critical scholars may disagree on the nature of this prophesied resurrection, preferring to view this passage as a reference to the promised restoration of

up and are commanded to “wake up and shout joyfully, you who live in the ground!”¹⁴

Segal concludes that “it looks like the resurrection prophecy of Daniel 12:1-2 is based on a visionary understanding of Isaiah 66:14 . . . with the imagery of Ezekiel 37.”¹⁵

The close of the First Temple Period and the return of the Jews from Babylonian exile heralded much more exploration of the issues of the afterlife among the Jews during the Second Temple Period.

The Persian (538–331 BCE), and later the Greco-Roman Empire (331 BCE–5th/6th century CE), made a significant impact on Second Temple Judaism. Not only did these powers influence the culture but also the belief system. Scholars argue that increased interest in angels, the battle between good and evil, and the interest in a future bodily resurrection and judgment as seen in these Jewish writings, were due to the influence of the Zoroastrian religion of the Persians.¹⁶ The belief in an immortal soul,

the nation of Israel, it is apparent that the author of Daniel understood it as a literal bodily resurrection. Moreover, John Day makes a strong case that Isa 26:19 is dependent on Hos 13:14 and Hos 6 (“A Case of Inner Scriptural Interpretation: The Dependency of Isaiah xxvi.13 – xxvii.10 [Eng. 9] and Its Relevance to Some Theories of the Redaction of the ‘Isaiah Apocalypse’,” *JTS* 31 [1980]: 309-319).

¹⁴For further reading about allusions in Dan 12:1-3, see Collins, *Daniel*, 391-398; George W. E. Nickelsburg, Jr., *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism and Early Christianity* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006), 23-42; Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 109-119.

¹⁵Segal, *Life after Death*, 264.

¹⁶Johnston notes there are also several differences between the Zoroastrian eschatology and the eschatological view appearing in Second Temple period Jewish literature (see, *Shades of Sheol*, 235-236). There is also a question of dating, most details of Zoroastrian eschatology come from late material (the *Bundahishn*, a ninth-century CE text) which makes it difficult to determine the extent of the influence it had on Judaism. Furthermore, if the date given by the author of the book of Daniel is reliable, and the book is a reliable historical document, a case could be made that Daniel could have influenced the Persians since “the earliest reference to resurrection [in Zoroastrian writings] comes from the fourth century BCE” (ibid., 236). It should not be ruled out that the Jewish resurrection belief could have evolved from the rich fertile ground of the TaNaKh, which presents God as an almighty and just God, who will reward His covenant people and show mercy towards the repentant sinners. Johnston concludes “there was no simple line of development from Persian to Israelite belief” (ibid.). This scepticism to a Zoroastrian background for the resurrection

which exists separately from the physical body after the moment of death, could be due to the Hellenization of Judaism.¹⁷

The question of theodicy is a central theme in the Hebrew Scriptures (e.g. Gen 18:17-32; Lev 16; the Book of Job),¹⁸ but it was during this period that the problem of

belief is also shared by e.g. Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 124-125 and by Edwin Yamauchi, “Life, Death, and Afterlife in the Ancient Near East,” in *Life in the Face of Death: The Resurrection Message of the New Testament*, ed. Richard Longenecker (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998), 47-49.

¹⁷Wright warns against equating the Greek immortality of the soul concept with the Jewish Second Temple Period idea that the soul is stored somewhere in wait for the eschatological resurrection when it will once more rest in a physical body (Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 194-195). The Greek idea that death is something good, since the soul will finally be liberated from its physical prison (body), contradicts the high value Jews place on God’s physical creations which permeates Jewish thought (e.g. Genesis 1 states that God was well pleased with all that He had created. This appreciation for the “physical” is also seen in the many blessings, *berakhot*, which are said by observant Jews throughout the day. Interestingly, the first tractate of the Mishnah is titled “*Berakhot*,” Blessings).

Steiner makes a compelling case that the ancient Israelites would most likely have been able to conceive of “a disembodied נֶפֶשׁ” long before their interaction with Greek culture, as they would otherwise “have been a rather sheltered soul, oblivious to the beliefs and practices found all over the ancient Near East” (Steiner, *Disembodied Souls*, 9). He adds that “a belief that humans have a soul that survives death is not the same as a belief in disembodied souls. Nevertheless, it seems clear that the two beliefs often go together” (Ibid., 22). Steiner considers Ezekiel 13:17-21 as the clearest passage from the TaNaKh presenting the נֶפֶשׁ, soul, as something separate from the body. In this passage, Ezekiel condemns the women sorceresses who trap dream-souls with pillow casings (Ezek 13:17-21), turning them into bird-souls who await the “imminent demise of their owners, unless the latter agree to ransom them” (Ibid., 66). Steiner notes although he “clearly condemns the *behavior* of the women” there is no indication that Ezekiel rejected the underlying belief (Ibid., 66-67). Based on this key passage, Steiner argues that several additional passages may also reflect a belief in a disembodied נֶפֶשׁ, soul (e.g., Gen 35:18; 1 Sam 25:29; Ps 116:7; and Song 5:6 – see his discussion, Ibid., 68-100). He concludes, “in the light of all this evidence, it is no longer possible to insist that the Hebrew was unable to conceive of a disembodied נֶפֶשׁ. If anything, the opposite now appears to be true. The evidence suggests that a belief in the existence of disembodied souls was a part of the common religious heritage of the people of the ancient Near East” (Ibid., 127).

Daniel I. Block makes a similar observation based on his study on Ezekiel’s vision of death and afterlife, finding it noteworthy that many scholars still maintain the notion the ancient Israelites did not believe in a life after death. Block writes, “many believe that the Pharisaic acceptance of the doctrine (see Acts 23:6-9) derives from a limited number of late texts which reflect Persian influence, and that the Sadduceans, who rejected the notion, were the true heirs of Old Testament belief. It is encouraging to see that some have reversed the roles of these two parties and are now insisting that the Sadducean position represented a conscious departure from both Hebrew and common Semitic beliefs” (Daniel I. Block, *By the River Chebar: Historical, Literary, and Theological Studies in the Book of Ezekiel* [Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2013], 198).

¹⁸The question of theodicy did not only occupy the mind of the biblical writers but it is also found in ancient Near Eastern texts as early as the second millennium BCE. For further reading into the question of theodicy in ancient Near Eastern text, Hebrew Scripture, New Testament, Second Temple period literature (including Qumran, Philo), and Rabbinic literature, see Antti Laato and Johannes C. de Moor,

theodicy became more apparent for the Jews. The traditional belief that God would reward the righteous, Torah observant Jews with a long and prosperous life while cutting short the life of the wicked needed adjustment. This was a period of foreign occupation and oppression; oppression of the righteous poor, religious persecution, and martyrdom. For the Torah observant Jews, justice had been perverted: the righteous were receiving the curses of the wicked, while the wicked enjoyed the blessings promised the righteous. Only a belief in an afterlife could solve this acute problem. If there was an afterlife, it was argued, God could set things straight and give the righteous and the wicked their proper due.¹⁹

The Jews of the Second Temple period borrowed religious and philosophical concepts from Persia and Greece and synthesized and amalgamated these views into their own religious framework. Thus, multiple afterlife beliefs developed and appeared in their literature, in an attempt to solve the problem of theodicy. By the end of this period, a belief in a bodily resurrection had become the mainstream belief in both surviving strands of Second Temple Judaism: Rabbinic Judaism and the early Christian Church. It was a central tenet for both communities. For the Christians, questioning this doctrine was equated with questioning the historicity of Jesus' resurrection, which was the guarantor for the Christians' salvation hope (e.g. Rom 6:3-6; 1 Cor 15; 1 Pet 1:3-4). For Rabbinic Judaism, questioning this faith would disqualify the person from any share in the world to

eds., *Theodicy in the World of the Bible: The Goodness of God and the Problem of Evil* (Leiden: Brill, 2003). For a penetrating study on the Day of Atonement and theodicy, see Roy Gane, *Cult and Character: Purification Offerings, Day of Atonement, and Theodicy* (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 2005).

¹⁹Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*.

come: “All Israelites have a share in the world to come . . . And these are the ones who have no portion in the world to come: (1) He who says, the resurrection of the dead is a teaching which does not derive from the Torah, (2) and the Torah does not come from Heaven; and (3) an Epicurean” (*m. Sanh.* 10:1).

As already mentioned, the literature of the Second Temple Period indicates there was an increased interest in and speculation about the fate of the righteous and the wicked after the time of death.²⁰ This period saw the birth of multiple Jewish sects and also multiple views of the afterlife. These views fall into two main categories based on the opinion held regarding the nature of the soul. If the soul was believed to be mortal, the literature describes views ranging from: 1) rejection of an afterlife;²¹ 2) a future limited resurrection of all the righteous;²² 3) a future limited resurrection of the most righteous and the most wicked;²³ to 4) a future universal resurrection.²⁴ If, on the other hand, the

²⁰J. Julius Scott, Jr., *Jewish Backgrounds of the New Testament* (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 1995), 278-281. See also Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*.

²¹ This view was held by the Sadducees who belonged to the aristocracy and the priestly class (see Josephus in *Ant.* 13.5.9; 18.1.4 and *J.W.* 2.8.15 and the New Testament writings [Matt 22:23-33; Mark 12:18-37; Luke 20:27-40; Acts 23:6-9]). They saw no need for a resurrection to solve the problem of theodicy since they strongly believed in the two way theology/covenant theology appearing in the Pentateuch which hold that God rewards or punishes people for their behavior in the present life. Josephus writes regarding their view on fate: “they suppose that all our actions are in our own power, so that we are ourselves the causes of what is good, and receive what is evil from our own folly” (*Ant.* 13.5.9). Interestingly, this view closely resembles the Greek philosophy of the Epicureans. Alan F. Segal notes although there are no texts which can be identified as penned by the Sadducean sect, there are several biblical and Second Temple period texts (e.g. Job, Ecclesiastes, Wisdom of Jesus Ben Sira) which harmonize well with the Sadducean philosophy. Segal concludes: “The Sadducees knew that when the Bible is interpreted literally there is scant evidence for any afterlife worth having” (*Life After Death*, 377).

²²Several New Testament passages seems to suggest that only believers in Jesus Christ will be resurrected and receive eternal life (e.g. Rom 14:10-12; 1 Cor 15:12-57; 1 Thess 4:13-18).

²³Nickelsburg observes that religious persecutions during the Second Temple period caused a problem of theodicy. The righteous, Torah observant Jews, were martyred without receiving the promised rewards for their pious lives. In fact, it was their adherence to the Torah which caused their deaths (2 Macc 7). However, the Hasidic Jews noticed that Hellenizing Jews, who disobeyed the Torah, prospered. The

soul was believed to be immortal (a separate entity from the body, which could live independently from the body) the literature describes views ranging from: 1) some form of existence in *Sheol*;²⁵ 2) a belief that the soul left the body to have an independent existence until the day of a universal judgment when it would return to its resurrected body;²⁶ to 3) a belief that the soul left the body at the time of death and would live independently with no need for a future resurrection, since the good or the bad soul would

resurrection belief became the solution to this problem since God could reward the martyred righteous in the world to come (*Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 32). It is important to note that the clearest resurrection text in the TaNaKh, Daniel 12:1-3, describes a double resurrection, one for the righteous and one for the wicked. However, this passage does not support a universal resurrection, but only a resurrection for some righteous and some wicked (Dan 12:2). Importantly, the most righteous and the most wicked are resurrected to receive God's justice, the blessing or the curse, suggesting that everyone else has received their just reward. Jacques Doukhan, on the other hand, in his article "From Dust to Stars: The Vision of Resurrection(s) in Daniel 12,1-3 and Its Resonance in the Book of Daniel," (in *Resurrection of the Dead: Biblical Traditions in Dialogue*, ed. Geert Van Oyen and Tom Shepherd, BETL 249 [Leuven; Walpole, MA: Peeters, 2012], 85-98), argues for a universal resurrection of the righteous, but only a limited resurrection of the wicked.

²⁴E.g. 2 Bar. 49-52; T. Benj. 10:2-11; Ascen. Isa. 4:14-22; Apoc. Mos. 13; Ps.-Philo 3:10; Matt 25:31-46; Acts 24:15, 21; Rev 20:4-6, 12-15.

²⁵The Hebrew word *Sheol* is used 66 times in the TaNaKh and describes the final resting place for the dead (for a definitive study on *Sheol* in the TaNaKh, see Galenicks, "The Nature, Function, and Purpose of the Term Sheol"). The Septuagint translates this word with the Greek term *Hades* which is also the term used in the Pseudepigrapha (2 Esdras 4:7-8; 8:53; Sib. Or. 3:393, 458; 5:178; T. Reu. 4:5; T. Levi 4:1; T. Benj. 9:5; 3 Bar. 4:4-6; 5:3) and the New Testament writings (e.g. Luke 16:23; Acts 2:27, 31; Rev 1:18; 20:13-14). Segal notes that "like the Greek Hades, it was neither a place of reward nor of punishment inherently, merely the final destination where the dead go" (*Life after death*, 136). Interestingly, Deut 26:14 suggest that some Israelites must have believed in some form of existence in *Sheol* and felt a need to provide food for the dead. This notion is further supported by Saul's use of a medium to request a prophetic message from the dead prophet Samuel (1 Sam 28:7-19) and ancient Jewish tomb inscriptions (Joseph S. Park, *Conceptions of Afterlife in Jewish Inscriptions: With Special Reference to Pauline Literature*, WUNT 2/121 [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2000]).

²⁶According to Josephus and the New Testament writings, the Pharisees were the dominant religious force of the late Second Temple period which then evolved into Rabbinic Judaism after the destruction of the Jewish temple. They were strong believers in a bodily resurrection (Josephus, *Ant.* 18.1.3; *J. W.* 2.8.14; Acts 23:6-9; Hippolytus, *Haer.* 28) but they were also influenced by the Greek Platonic notion that the soul was immortal. They believed that the soul would leave the body at the time of death and exist independently from the body. However, they held that the soul would return to the body at the time of resurrection in order to be judged as one unified entity at the great judgment. This synthesized view appears in e.g. 2 Esdras 7:32-38; *Apocr Ezek*, frag. 1.

receive its just reward. This last view is similar to the Platonic immortality of the soul concept that strongly influenced Philo's writings.²⁷ Each of these views sought support in the Hebrew Scriptures, but the different sects connected and interpreted the scriptural passages differently.

Statement of the Problem

There is no definitive study that systematically outlines the numerous afterlife views and analyses the biblical arguments used in support of the resurrection beliefs within the literature of the Second Temple Period, the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha.

Purpose of Study

The purpose of this dissertation is to systematically outline the numerous afterlife views and find and analyze the texts used from the TaNaKh²⁸ that support a resurrection

²⁷According to Josephus (*Ant.* 18.1.5; *J. W.* 2.8.11), the Essenes believed in the immortality of the soul and was the Jewish religious group which was most closely related to the Platonic afterlife belief. This is also supported by Philo in his description on the Alexandrian therapeutic sect, a branch of the Essenes (J. T. Milik, *Ten Years of Discovery in the Wilderness of Judea*, SBT 26 [London: SCM, 1959]; and Pierre Geoltrain, *Le traité de la Vie Contemplative de Philon d'Alexandrie*, Sem 10 [Paris: Adrien-Maisonneuve, 1960], 11-29), who "thinking that their mortal life has already come to one end," thus believing that they were already partaking in the eschatological life, gave all their possessions away (Philo, *Contempl. Life* 11-13). However, the Dead Sea Scrolls and Hippolytus of Rome (*Elenchus* 27.1) suggest that the Essenes did believe in a bodily resurrection. Josephus also notes that Eleazar ben Yair, the rebel leader at Masada, appealed to the belief in the immortality of the soul when promoting mass suicide instead of capture by the Romans (*J. W.* 7.8.7). It could be argued that Philo Judaeus was one of the strongest advocates of the immortality of the soul doctrine without mentioning a bodily resurrection. Segal observes that Philo attempted to synthesize Greek and Hebrew thought by giving the TaNaKh an allegorical reading, believing that "the Hebrew Bible not only illustrates Greek philosophical views through allegory (as do the *Iliad* and *Odyssey*, according to the Greek commentators) but morally surpasses them. For Philo, Greek philosophers and the Hebrew Bible told the same philosophical truth" (*Life after death*, 368).

²⁸The reader should be aware that the acronym TaNaKh is used anachronistically as it is difficult to know what constituted "scripture" or which literary composition was considered authoritative or canonical by differing religious communities during the Second Temple period. Even in the case of the Qumran

belief within Jewish extra-biblical passages, from the Second Temple Period, the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha, which imply or state a belief in resurrection.

Justification of the Study

There are several studies on the beliefs in the resurrection, immortality, and eternal life in Second Temple Period Judaism,²⁹ but all of them deal with aspects such as the following: Why these views arose; how these views developed; what the different sects believed about the afterlife; the ancient Near Eastern influence on Jewish beliefs; the archeological findings in ancient Palestine regarding the notions of afterlife; the formation and development of resurrection faith in early Judaism; or the Jewish background for Paul's statements on the resurrection in the New Testament. However, there is no definitive study that systematically outlines the numerous afterlife views and that analyzes the texts used from the TaNaKh in support of a resurrection belief within Jewish extra-biblical passages from the Second Temple Period, which imply or state a

community and the Dead Sea Scrolls, it is difficult to know if the community considered all these scrolls sacred and authoritative, or if the number of copies of specific scrolls reveals something regarding their authoritative standing. The Dead Sea Scrolls could even have been a part of a library collection and, as such, a certain scroll may not necessarily reflect the ethos of the community nor provide reliable insight into its authoritative nature within that community. It was only when sacred texts were collected into a codex that the canon became rigid as it became necessary to decide which texts should be included and which texts should be left out.

The canon was rather fluid during this period, at least in the earlier part thereof. Therefore, this study uses the acronym TaNaKh out of convenience as it is the most neutral term for the body of literature recognized as sacred by both present day Jewish and Christian communities.

²⁹See, e.g. Hans Clements Caesarius Cavallin, *Life After Death: Paul's Argument for the Resurrection of the Dead in 1 Cor 15 - Part 1: An Enquiry into the Jewish Background*, ConBNT 7:1 (Lund, Sweden: CWK Gleerup, 1974); Ohyun Kwon, "The Formation and Development of Resurrection Faith in Early Judaism" (PhD diss., New York University, 1984); Senzo Nagakubo, "Investigation into Jewish Concepts of Afterlife in the Beth She'arim Greek Inscriptions" (PhD diss., Duke University, 1974); Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism*; Park, *Conceptions of Afterlife in Jewish Inscriptions*; Daniel Patte, *Early Jewish Hermeneutic in Palestine*, SBLDS 22 (Missoula, MT: Society of Biblical Literature and Scholars Press, 1975); Segal, *Life After Death*.

belief in resurrection. Neither is this topic addressed within the framework of early Jewish hermeneutics. John Levenson suggests “the language and symbolism of resurrection were present and available, perhaps even abundant, long before the literal expectation.” This study will demonstrate beliefs in resurrection were indeed abundant and, in turn, address Levenson’s *desideratum* regarding their abundance, ensuring scholars do not “underestimate the verbal particularity and the textual character of its appearance – points of great significance to the ancient Jewish culture itself.”³⁰ This study also attempts to provide a better understanding of how the TaNaKh was read by Jewish sects during this important period and the role the TaNaKh played in the overall development of the resurrection belief that became a central article of faith in both Christianity and Rabbinic Judaism.

Methodology

Appendix A forms the foundation of this study as it provides a comprehensive list of resurrection passages from Second Temple Period Jewish literature, compiled from the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. These passages are divided into appropriate tables in which they are categorized and analyzed, noting when a specific resurrection text is referring or alluding to the TaNaKh.³¹ Additionally, each table is followed by an

³⁰Jon Douglas Levenson, *Resurrection and the Restoration of Israel: The Ultimate Victory of the God of Life* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 185.

³¹The “Reference-to-the-TaNaKh” category includes both “citation” (the author quotes the TaNaKh passage verbatim and includes the textual reference) and “quotation” (the author quotes a TaNaKh passage verbatim without including the textual reference) and is the most objective category. The “Allusion-to-the-TaNaKh” category is rather broad and more subjective as the original author does not quote the TaNaKh passage verbatim, but similarly rephrases, reshapes, or re-purposes the passage. It is apparent, and therefore assumed, that both the original author and the original target audience were aware of the primary

anthology of the listed passages to show the larger context of each resurrection statement and provide the reader easy access to these resurrection texts. These anthologies are highlighted and annotated.³² This study bears in mind James H. Charlesworth's resurrection categories.³³

source of the allusion. For a helpful discussion on terminology and literary influence, see Reimar Vetne, "The Influence and Use of Daniel in the Synoptic Gospels" (PhD diss., Andrews University, 2011), 10-24. See also, Kenneth Bergland, "A Methodology for Inner-Biblical Legal Reuse and Application in the Prophets" (Term paper for OTST695 – Directed Reading in Inner-Biblical Legal Exegesis in the Prophets, Andrews University, 3 May 2013) and John Paulien, *Decoding Revelation's Trumpets: Literary Allusions and the Interpretation of Revelation 8:7-12*, AUSDDS 2 (Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University Press), 165-194.

³²Appendix B provides similar tables for the resurrection passages found in the Dead Sea Scrolls, Josephus, New Testament, Jewish Liturgy, and Rabbinic Literature. However, these passages will not be considered in this study (see *Scope and Delimitation of the Study*), although references to them will be made throughout this work, when deemed relevant.

³³Charlesworth notes there are several dimensions of resurrection and found it useful to categorize resurrection passages into the following sixteen categories, even if some of these are overlapping: 1) Resurrection of the nation (Isa 26:19; Ezek 37:1-12; *T. Jud.* 23:3-5; *T. Mos.* 10:7-10); 2) Raising of a group from disenfranchisement (1QH^a 16.5-6); 3) Raising of the individual from social disenfranchisement (1QH^a 16 [= olim 8]); 4) Raising of the individual from personal embarrassment (1QH^a 10 [= olim 2] cf. 1QpHab 7.4-5); 5) Raising of the individual from the sickbed to health (Ps 132:3; 1QH^a 17 [= olim 9].4-12; Mark 5:21-43); 6) Raising of the individual from inactivity to do God's will (1QH^a 14 [= olim 6].29-30, 34; cf. 1 Sam 2:8; Ps 44:25); 7) Raising of the individual from despondency due to consciousness of sin (11QPsa 19.10-11); 8) Raising of the individual from ignorance to divinely revealed knowledge (1QH^a 19 [= olim 11].12-14); 9) Raising of the individual from meaninglessness in this world to a realizing eschatology [=Experiencing the end time in the present] (1QH^a 11 [= olim 3].19-21; 1QS^b 5.23); 10) Both-And: The author may intentionally collapse any distinction between the present age and the future age (1QS 4.6-8); 11) Raising of Christ from *Sheol* [*descensus ad inferos*] (*Ode* 42:10-14); 12) raising an apocalypticist into heaven (2 En. 1:8 [cf. 2 En. 8]; 2 Cor 12:1-3; Rev 4:1); 13) A spiritual raising up or awakening of an individual (Eph 5:1, 7-8, 14); 14) Raising of the individual from death to mortal life (1 Kgs 17:17-24; 2 Kgs 4:31-37; 13:20-21; John 11:1-45); 15) Raising of the individual from death to eternal life (Dan 12:1-3; 2 Macc 14; 1 En. 22-27; 92-105; *T. Jud.* 25.1, 4; 4Q521; *Amidah* (Eighteen Benedictions) 2; Acts 2:22-24; 1 Cor 15; 1 Thess 4:15-17; *m. Sanh.* 10; *m. Sotah.* 15); 16) Intentional ambiguity (for more details, see James H. Charlesworth, "Where Does the Concept of Resurrection Appear and How Do We Know That?" in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*, eds. James H. Charlesworth [London; New York: T&T Clark, 2006], 2-17).

Chapters two and three are titled: Apocryphal Writings and Pseudepigraphical Writings.³⁴ The third chapter is divided into the same five categories utilized by James H. Charlesworth's two volume collection, *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, they are: 1) Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works; 2) Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections); 3) Expansions of the "Old Testament" and Legends, in this study labeled *Expansions of Stories and Legends*;³⁵ 4) Wisdom and Philosophical Literature; and 5) Prayers, Psalms, and Odes. These two chapters systematically outline the numerous afterlife views held and examine the passages listed in the tables of Appendix A which are either referring or alluding to texts from the TaNaKh in support of a resurrection belief. All of these passages are a part of the anthology provided in Appendix A. This will provide a better understanding of the numerous afterlife views held during this period, the role the TaNaKh played in the development of these beliefs, and reveal which TaNaKh passages were viewed as resurrection passages by the groups of believers who produced these texts.

The final chapter summarizes the main findings, considers their implications, and concludes with some general observations.

³⁴Even though the classification of the writings as Apocryphal/Deutero-canonical or Pseudepigraphal may be regarded as artificial and anachronistic, this classification will still be utilized in order to acknowledge the Apocryphal/Deutero-canonical writings are a part of the *Septuagint* and to show sensitivity towards the faith communities who still regard these writings as a part of their sacred Scriptures (see Table 9 and Table 10).

³⁵It was decided to amend this category label for sensitivity reasons.

Scope and Delimitations of the Study

There are many passages in the extra-biblical literature of the Second Temple Period which address the topic of an afterlife; however, this study only examine resurrection passages appearing in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha³⁶ which refer or allude to the TaNaKh in support of the resurrection belief.

Even though it would be interesting to compare the different textual variations appearing in the original language (e.g. Hebrew, Aramaic and Greek) with textual traditions witnessed in the various translations (e.g. Greek, Latin, Syriac, Coptic, Armenian, Slavonic, Georgian, Ethiopian, Arabic), this would go far beyond the scope of this study. In most cases, the English translation does suffice when determining if a resurrection passage refers or alludes to the TaNaKh and when identifying the TaNaKh text. Thus, this dissertation only examines the English translations of the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha, keeping the original language in mind, and consider the resurrection

³⁶Only the literary works included in James H. Charlesworth's two-volume collection of pseudepigrapha (James H. Charlesworth, ed., *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, 2 vols. ABRL [New York: Doubleday, 1983-1985]) are considered in this dissertation. However, these two volumes are by no means a complete collection. Thus, the pseudepigraphical writings which were not included will be a part of the two-volume collection, *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha: More Noncanonical Scriptures*, edited by Richard Bauckham, James R. Davila, and Alexander Panayotov. The first volume was published by Eerdmans in 2013 while the second volume is still forthcoming. Most of the texts included in the first volume are relatively late and do not include eschatological material relevant for this study, as such, they have not been included. *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, is a three-volume collection of Jewish writings composed in the period between 538 BCE and 200 CE, edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman, and was published by the Jewish Publication Society of America in 2013. This work goes beyond Charlesworth's two-volume collection as it includes texts also from the *Septuagint*, *Philo*, *Josephus*, and *Sectarian Texts*. It should be noted that the author had initially intended to include the writings from *Philo*, *Josephus*, *Qumran community*, New Testament and early Rabbinic Judaism in this dissertation. Ultimately, it was the decision of the dissertation committee to limit the material to be considered to the Apocrypha and Charlesworth's two-volume collection of pseudepigrapha. Otherwise, this study would require an "additional volume" and would go far beyond the maximum page limitation. Expansion to include these additional texts in a second dissertation is a consideration of the author.

passage in its original language, or in textual tradition, if it adds value to the analysis or the English translation is unclear.

References to any relevant passages both in the New Testament³⁷ and early Rabbinic Literature are made if salient.³⁸ Appendix B includes tables of all the resurrection passages from the Dead Sea Scrolls, New Testament, Josephus, and early Rabbinic Literature.

³⁷Given that Jesus, his disciples, and first followers were Palestinian Jews, and given the Jewish educational background of Paul of Tarsus (Acts 22:3-5), who held great influence in the formative years of the early Christian Church (According to tradition, Paul authored thirteen of the epistles of the New Testament, and was one of Gamaliel the Elder's [grandson of Hillel the Elder] disciples. This suggests that Paul was educated as a Pharisee and belonged to the more liberal House of Hillel.), it should be expected, therefore, that Paul's writings are influenced by Rabbinical teaching and the New Testament in general would serve as an important witness to late Second Temple period Jewish thought.

³⁸Although early rabbinical writings post-date the Second Temple Period, they are still relevant since they often reflect a much earlier theological debate, or contain a record of oral traditions attributed to rabbis living during the Second Temple Period. Craig Evans gives the following cautionary note: "Rabbinic literature is notoriously difficult to date. Part of the problem is that a given work, which may have been edited in the Middle Age, may contain a great deal of Tannaic tradition." As a further complication, he adds that: "there is also the problem of pseudonymity. Sayings may be credited to a famous Tanna (such as Aqiba or Ishmael), but in reality they derive from a much later Amora" (Craig A. Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies: A Guide to the Background Literature* [Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2005], 220.

CHAPTER 2

OLD TESTAMENT APOCRYPHAL WRITINGS

The Old Testament *Apocrypha*¹ is the Protestant label for the additional texts included in the Septuagint,² the Roman Catholic, Coptic and Eastern Orthodox canon, but

¹The term *Apocrypha* comes from the Greek word ἀπόκρυφα (neutral plural of ἀπόκρυφος), “hidden things,” deriving from the verb ἀποκρύπτω, “to keep secret.” It was originally a positive term describing the high value placed on these texts “which were withheld from public knowledge because they were vehicles of mysterious or esoteric wisdom which was too sacred or profound to be disclosed to any save the initiated” (R. H. Charles, ed., *The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament in English*, 2 vols. [Oxford: Clarendon, 1913], 1:viii).

²Sara J. Tanzer argues that although the Apocrypha are Jewish, these books were “never formed into one collection by Jews” but should be viewed as a Christian innovation since there is no evidence that they were ever a part of any Jewish translation of the Hebrew Bible into Greek. Moreover, all “the codices which attest a collection of Apocrypha are late (4th and 5th centuries C.E.) . . . do not include all the Apocrypha, and they are Christian” (Sarah J. Tanzer, “A View from History: The Place of the Apocrypha in the Jewish Community,” in *The Parallel Apocrypha*, ed. John R. Kohlenberger III [New York: Oxford University Press, 1997], xxi). This view is also shared by Paul D. Wegner who concludes, based on the following observations, that there was no Alexandrian canon represented by the expanded Septuagint canon: 1) Hellenistic and Palestinian Judaism were more integrated than first assumed; 2) The apocrypha has a more diverse background than first assumed and were not all written in Greek; 3) The prologue of Sirach only mentions the tripartite divisions of the Hebrew Scripture with no reference to the apocryphical books; 4) There is no evidence that Jewish writers during the Second Temple Period considered the apocryphical books as inspired (*The Journey from Texts to Translation: The Origin and Development of the Bible* [Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 1999], 116). It is also important to note that the criteria outlined by Josephus (*Contra Apion* 1.7-8 §§37-42) and early Rabbinic texts (e.g. *m. Yad*. 4.5) would exclude the apocryphical texts from the Hebrew canon.

Regardless of the canonical status of the Apocrypha, Arye Edrei and Doron Mendels argue that the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha became a part of the literary collection of the Greek speaking Jews living in the western diaspora. In contrast, these books were rejected by the Sages of the Land of Israel and the eastern diaspora, who instead developed and adhered to the oral tradition (Mishnah, Midrash, and Talmud). The oral tradition spread eastward from the Land of Israel and the Sages of the “Babylonian community became full partners in its development,” however, it did not reach the western diaspora until the ninth century, since they “were unable to decode it.” Edrei and Mendels make a strong case that this growing rift between the Greek speaking western and the Hebrew/Aramaic speaking eastern Diaspora caused by the destruction of the Temple in Jerusalem (the unifying center of Judaism), was due to the language divide (Greek vs. Hebrew/Aramaic) and the system of communication (written vs. oral collection of literature).

It is important to note that these two diasporas (East and West) had the Bible in common and

not in the Jewish or Protestant canon (see the highlighted books in Table 1). These books are known as *deuterocanonical* by the Roman Catholic, Coptic and Eastern Orthodox churches or the *outside books* (חצונים ספרים) in Jewish traditions.³ George W. E.

maintained access to it in their own language, a Greek translation (LXX) in the western Diaspora and the Hebrew and an Aramaic translation (Targum) in the eastern. Yet, the two Diasporas developed separate literature, written in the west and an oral in the east, which also caused a separate theological and cultural identity (“A Split Jewish Diaspora: Its Dramatic Consequences,” *JSP* 16, no. 2 [2007]: 95). This rift was only healed when the oral tradition was written down and brought to the western diaspora which had by then adopted Hebrew as their “official” language of study (for further study, see: *ibid.*, 91-137 and “A Split Jewish Diaspora: Its Dramatic Consequences II,” *JSP* 17, no. 3 [2008]: 163-187). Figure 1 shows the two Jewish Diaspora (Doran Mendels, “Why Paul Went West: The Difference Between the Jewish Diasporas,” *BAR* 37, no.1 [Jan/Feb 2011]: 50-51):

Fig. 1. Two Jewish Diasporas

³For the various definitions of the term Apocrypha by various faith communities and their attitudes towards these writings, see e.g.: Mary Chilton Callaway, “The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: An Anglican/Episcopal View,” in *The Parallel Apocrypha*, ed. John R. Kohlenberger III (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), xxxv-xxxix; D. A. Carson, “The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: An Evangelical View,” in *The Parallel Apocrypha*, ed. John R. Kohlenberger III (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), xlv-xlvii; John J. Collins, “The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: A Catholic View,” in *The Parallel Apocrypha*, ed. John R. Kohlenberger III (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), xxxi-xxxiv; Demetrios J. Constantelos, “The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: An Orthodox View,” in *The Parallel Apocrypha*, ed. John R. Kohlenberger III (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), xxvii-xxx; Walter J. Harrelson, “The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: A Protestant View,” in *The Parallel Apocrypha*, ed. John R. Kohlenberger III (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), xl-xliii; Tanzer, “A View from History,” xxi-xxvi.

Table 1. Order of books in the Hebrew Bible and the Septuagint

The Hebrew Bible	The Septuagint
<p>Torah [Law]</p> <p>Genesis Exodus Leviticus Numbers Deuteronomy</p> <p>Nevi'im [Prophets]</p> <p>Former Prophets Joshua Judges Samuel Kings</p> <p>Latter Prophets Isaiah Jeremiah Ezekiel The Twelve: Hosea Joel Amos Obadiah Jonah Micah Nahum Habakkuk Zephaniah Haggai Zechariah Malachi</p> <p>Ketuvim [Writings]</p> <p>Psalms Job Proverbs Ruth Song of Solomon Ecclesiastes Lamentations Esther Daniel Ezra-Nehemiah Chronicles</p>	<p>Pentateuch</p> <p>Genesis Exodus Leviticus Numbers Deuteronomy</p> <p>Historical Books</p> <p>Joshua Judges Ruth 1 Reigns [1 Samuel] 2 Reigns [2 Samuel] 3 Reigns [1 Kings] 4 Regins [2 Kings] 1 Paralipomenon [1 Chronicles] 2 Paralipomenon [2 Chronicles] <i>1 Esdras</i> 2 Esdras [Ezra-Nehemiah] <i>Esther (with additions)</i> <i>Judith</i> <i>Tobit</i> <i>1 Maccabees</i> <i>2 Maccabees</i> <i>3 Maccabees</i> <i>4 Maccabees</i></p> <p>Poetic Books</p> <p>Pslams <i>Odes</i> Proverbs Ecclesiastes Song of Solomon Job <i>Wisdom [of Solomon]</i> <i>[Wisdom of] Sirach [Ecclesiasticus]</i> <i>Psalms of Solomon</i></p> <p>Prophets</p> <p>The Twelve: Hosea Amos Micah Joel Obadiah Jonah Nahum Habakkuk Zephaniah Haggai Zechariah Malachi</p> <p>Isaiah Jeremiah Baruch Lamentations <i>Epistle of Jeremiah</i> Ezekiel <i>Susanna</i> Daniel <i>Bel and the Dragon</i></p>

Nickelsburg adds that this canon-related term is irrelevant since the texts belonging to the apocrypha were written, used, and achieved great influence on the community of faith long before the decision of canon was made.⁴

Table 2 shows the classification, canonical/deuterocanonical, or non-canonical/apocryphal, of these books by Jewish sources and the Canon of the Roman Catholic, Protestant, and the Eastern Churches. It should be noted that books classified as canonical in Table 2 are considered as inspired or canonical by the religious community as the books of the Hebrew Scriptures.⁵

The Old Testament Apocrypha represent several literary genres (see Table 3) and were mostly written in Hebrew and Aramaic (with the exception of Wisdom of Solomon and 2 Maccabees) and later translated into Greek and included in the Septuagint. Some of these books are additions to the canonical books of Jeremiah (Baruch and the Letter of Jeremiah), Psalms (Psalm 151), Esther (addition A-F), and Daniel (The Prayer of Azariah, the Song of the Three Jews, Susanna and Bel and the Dragon) while the others

⁴George W. E. Nickelsburg, *Jewish Literature Between the Bible and the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981), 6; deSilva, "Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha," 60. It is important to note that these texts were first written on scrolls and were not a part of a codex. As such, it becomes difficult to know how these texts were viewed by the various faith communities of the Second Temple Period. The Dead Sea Scrolls serve as good example, since biblical scrolls were stored together with non-biblical scrolls in the caves. The question of canonicity became crucial at the moment the faith community decided to make a codex containing all the books considered inspired and authoritative.

⁵Craig A. Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies: A Guide to the Background Literature* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2005), 9. It was due to the Protestant Reformation that the Catholic church declared these books as fully canonical at the Council of Trent in 1546. Leading up to the Reformation, Catholic scholars were divided; Jerome and Origen recognized the difference between the Hebrew canon and the collection of Old Testament texts used by the Church, referring to the former as the "canonical" texts and the latter as "ecclesiastical" texts, viewing the latter as useful and edifying but not canonical. Clement of Alexandria and Augustine, on the other hand, considered them a part of an enlarged canonical collection and embraced "the larger collection as of uniform inspiration and value" (deSilva, "Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha," 59).

are separate compositions. They are all Jewish (with the exception of the Christian prologue and epilogue of 2 Esdras), written by Jews of the land of Israel and Jews of the Hebrew/Aramaic speaking eastern diaspora (see fig.1) – Israel, Antioch in Syria and Persia (e.g. Prayer of Manasseh and Psalm 151) or Jews living in the Greek speaking western diaspora (see fig. 1) – Alexandria in Egypt (e.g. Wisdom of Solomon and 3 Maccabees) and were composed in the period between the third century BCE and the first century CE (see Table 3).⁶ Table 3 shows the literary genre of the apocrypha, the date of composition, and the books containing a resurrection belief (bolded and highlighted in red) based on the analysis of Appendix A. This will help the reader see the extent of this belief in the Apocryphical books.

There are only four passages from the Apocrypha that imply or state a resurrection belief which also refer or allude to the TaNaKh for its foundation of this belief, these are according to the Table 4 below: Sirach 48:11; 2 Maccabees 7; Wisdom of Solomon 3:1-13a; and 2 Esdras 7:32-38.

⁶David A. deSilva, *Introduction to Apocrypha: Message, Context, and Significance* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2002), 16.

Table 2. Classifications of the Apocryphal writings

Book	Jewish Sources	LXX Mss. A.B.	Council of Trent (1546)	Luther	Eastern Church 17 th Cent.
Tobit	O U T S I D E B O O K S	C A N O N I C A L B O O K S	C A N O N I C A L B O O K S	A P O C R Y P H A	C A N O N I C A L
Judith					
Ben-Sira					
Wisdom of Solomon					
1 Maccabees					A P O C R Y P H A
2 Maccabees					
Additions to Esther Addition A-F					
Book of Baruch					
Epistle of Jeremiah					
Additions to Daniel Bel and the Dragon Susanna The Prayer of Azariah The Song of the Three Jews					
3 Maccabees		N O N C A N O N I C L			
1 Esdras (3 Esdras) ^a					
Prayer of Manasseh					
Psalms 151					
4 Maccabees ^b					
2 Esdras ^c	NON- CANONICAL				

^a Rejected by the Council of Trent but is included in the Latin Vulgate Appendix (3 Esdras).

^b In the Appendix to the Greek Bible.

^c In the Slavonic Bible (3 Esdras) and in the Latin Vulgate Appendix (4 Esdras).

Table 3. Literary genre of the Apocrypha

Literary Genre	Apocryphical Texts	Date ^a
Historical Works	1 Maccabees <i>2 Maccabees</i> 1 Esdras (= 2 Esdras in Slavonic = 3 Esdras in Appendix to Vulgate)	125 – 100 BCE 124 – 50 BCE 2 nd Cent. BCE – 1 st Cent CE
Tales	Tobit Judith 3 Maccabees (see Old Testament Pseudepigrapha) Additions to Esther (addition A-F) Additions to Daniel Bel and the Dragon (LXX Dan 14) Susanna (LXX Dan 13)	250 – 175 BCE mid. 2 nd Cent. BCE 1 st Cent. BCE 114 – 77 BCE ^b 2 nd Cent. BCE 6 th – late 2 nd Cent. BCE
Wisdom Literature	<i>Wisdom of Sirach (Ecclesiasticus)</i> ^c <i>Wisdom of Solomon</i>	196 – 175 BCE 220 BCE – 100 CE
Pseudepigraphical Prophetic Literature	Baruch (addition to Jeremiah) Letter of Jeremiah (= Baruch chapter 6)	mid. 2 nd Cent. BCE. 317 – 306 BCE ^d
Liturgical Texts	Prayer of Manasseh Psalm 151 (addition to Psalms; see Old Testament Pseudepigrapha) Prayer of Azariah (addition to Daniel, between 3:23 and 3:24) Song of the Tree Young Men (addition to Daniel, between 3:23 and 3:24)	200 BCE – 50 CE 6 th cent. BCE – 68 CE 175-164 BCE > 100 BCE ^e
Apocalypse	<i>2 Esdras</i> (= 3 Esdras in Slavonic = 4 Esdras in Vulgate Appendix)	c. 100 – 3 rd cent. CE
Philosophical Encomium	<i>4 Maccabees</i> (see Old Testament Pseudepigrapha)	19 – 54 CE
^a These dates provided are mainly based on deSilva, <i>Introducing the Apocrypha</i> and to a lesser degree on Evans, <i>Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies</i> . ^b This date is based on the identification and dating of the “fourth year of the reign of Ptolemy and Cleopatra” (Add Esth 11:1). If this verse refer to Ptolemy VIII Soter II and Cleopatra II/III, the additions would be dated to 114 – 113 BCE while the additions would be dated to 78 – 77 BCE if identified with Ptolemy XII Auletes and Cleopatra V. ^c In the Greek recension of the book, see discussion on Sirach below. ^d This date is based on Ep Jer 6:3 which states that they will remain in captivity for “up to seven generations.” To make this an “accurate” statement, this addition would be dated to no later than 280 (7x40) years after the first (597 BCE) or second (586 BCE) deportation to Babylon. ^e The approximate time of the completion of the Septuagint version of Daniel which contains the apocryphal additions.		

Table 4. Resurrection texts in the Apocrypha

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
Ecclesiasticus (Sirach)	2:9c; (7:17b) 16:22c 19:19	These passages in the longer GII recension hints to a resurrection hope.	x					x
	46:19-20	Sleep = Death	x					x
	48:11b	Ben Sira's grandson may have added this resurrection hope	x					x
2 Maccabees	6:26	No one will escape the hands of God	x					x
	7	The Martyrdom of the seven brothers		x	x	x	x	
	12:43-45	Made atonement for the dead. Paul uses this argument in 1 Cor 15:29		x			x	x
	14:37-46	Death of Razis		x				x
Wisdom of Solomon	3:1-13a	Body/Soul They will shine forth	x		x			x
	4:16-5:16	The triumph of the righteous and the final judgment	x			x		x
2 Esdras/5 Ezra	2:10-47	Exhortation to good work; Proper burial practice; Replacement theology; Resurrection/Reward of the Kingdom; Sleep Death		x				x
2 Esdras/ 4 Ezra	4:7-11	Exits of Hades – Entrances of Paradise	x					
	4:33-43	Predestined time; Hades womb; Souls in the chambers of Hades are impatient; The number needs to be filled	x				x	x
	5:38-40	Only God knows his judgment and the goal of his love	x					x
	7:10-16	Two worlds, this world is the test	x					x

Table 4 – Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
2 Esdras/ 4 Ezra	7:26-51	Body+Soul=Resurrection; Universal resurrection (Individuals/nations); Detailed eschatology		X		X		X
	7:66-105	The state of the departed before the judgment		X		X		X
	7:112-115	Universal judgment	X					
	7:117-131	Future promises given to the righteous	X					
	8:1-3	Two worlds. “Many have been created, but only a few shall be saved”	X					X
	8:12-19	Ezra questions God’s judgment/justice	X					
	8:37-40	The final destiny of the two ways	X					X
	8:46-54	The final destiny of the righteous	X					
	9:7-13	The wicked will acknowledge God’s justice	X					X
	10:10, 15- 17	“If you acknowledge the decree of God to be just, you will receive your son back”	X					
	14:34-35	Resurrection/Judgment	X					X

Sirach (Ecclesiasticus)

The original Hebrew composition of Sirach probably did not contain a doctrine of retribution and reward beyond death (e.g. Sir 14:16-19; 17:27-28; 38:19-23; 41:3-4).⁷

Instead, Ben Sira adheres to the traditional Deuteronomic view of theodicy, claiming that

⁷John Collins notes that Sirach 41:3-4 provides the “most definitive statement on the finality of death, and leaves no room for resurrection or a blessed afterlife” (*Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, OTL [Louisville, KY.: Westminster John Knox, 1997], 92).

God gives a person his/her just reward based on the person's adherence to the Law and the Prophets (see e.g. the Prologue of Sirach; Sir 1:11-2:17) during his/her life time (e.g. Sir 11:14-25; 16:12-14), through the way of his/her death (e.g. Sir 11:26-28), and through his/her legacy (e.g. Sir 41:5-13; 44-50:21). However, there are several passages in the longer Greek recension (GII) of the book which hints at a retribution beyond death (see Table 4)⁸ and may have originated with the Greek translation of Ben Sira's grandson or in a later copy.⁹ John Collins writes: "It is well known that the Greek translator of Sirach introduced a belief in resurrection at several points in the text . . . and that the redactor of the Greek text (GII) added further allusions to the afterlife."¹⁰ The most interesting of these are Sirach 7:17b and 48:11b which alludes and quotes the TaNaKh, although only the latter text states an eschatological resurrection hope.

⁸The Greek recension (GII) contains the following additions: "Because his reward is an everlasting gift, with joy" (Sir 2:9c); "and he keeps them for their day of vengeance" (Sir 12:6c); "and a scrutiny for all [will come] in the end/at death" (Sir 16:22c); and "knowledge of the Lord's commandments is life-giving instruction those who do what pleases him will harvest the fruit of the tree of immortality" (Sir 19:19).

It is interesting to note that the Greek translation of Sirach 46:19-20 interprets death (Hebrew original) as sleep, stating that "after he [Samuel] had fallen asleep, he prophesied" (μετὰ τὸ ὑπινῶσαι αὐτὸν προεφήτευσεν). This choice of words alludes to a resurrection hope since "sleep" suggests that death is not permanent – if you are sleeping you will also wake up from the sleep at one point in the future. This analogy became popular in later Second Temple period Judaism and was used most famously by Jesus in the New Testament (e.g. Matt 9:24; 27:52; Mark 5:39; Luke 8:52; John 11:11-14). In the case of Samuel and Elisha (Sir 48:13-14), Ben Sira's focus is on their powers, even after death, than a lasting resurrection or an eschatological resurrection hope. Still, these texts suggest that death was not necessarily final, since there are cases when people came back to life, or, according to the longer Greek recension, will be judged or rewarded after death.

⁹Alexander A. Di Lella, "Conservative and Progressive Theology: Sirach and Wisdom," *CBQ* 28 (1966): 145-146; Patrick W. Skehan and Alexander A. Di Lella, *The Wisdom of Ben Sira*, AB 39 (New York: Doubleday, 1987), 201-202.

¹⁰Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 95. Conleth Kearns, *The Expanded Text of Ecclesiasticus: Its Teaching on the Future Life As a Clue to Its Origin*, DCLS 11' (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2011).

Sirach 7:17b notes that the punishment of the ungodly is “fire and worms” (ταπείνωσον σφόδρα τὴν ψυχὴν σου ὅτι ἐκδίκησις ἀσεβοῦς **πῦρ καὶ σκώληξ** [LXT]), possibly drawing on the eschatological imagery of Isaiah 66:22-24 (ὁ γὰρ **σκώληξ** αὐτῶν οὐ τελευτήσει καὶ **τὸ πῦρ** αὐτῶν οὐ σβεσθήσεται [v. 24, LXT]), alluding to some kind of postmortal punishment for the ungodly. If this is the case, it would follow that there would also be some kind of resurrection for the righteous, although the fate of this group is not mentioned in the text. It would be hard to understand how the “fire and worms” could be viewed as a punishment for the ungodly, if their destiny is no different from that of the righteous. Only if the righteous were to receive a different fate, a reward beyond death as suggested by Isaiah, would the warning of Ben Sira make sense and be viewed as an allusion to the resurrection hope.¹¹ Howard Clark Kee remarks that “the hellenistic translator has interpreted the reference in the Hebrew text to *fire and worms* as meaning not simply death but the inescapable divine judgment that is soon to come,”¹² an eschatological punishment which, according to Isaiah, will take place on the newly created heaven and earth (Isa 66:22).

¹¹It should be noted that Isaiah does not suggest that the wicked are in any way conscious and tormented for all eternity like the image of Hell developed later (e.g. Dante’s inferno). Rather, Isaiah clearly states that these wicked people are “corpses” (עֲצָמוֹת/τὰ κῶλα τῶν ἀνθρώπων τῶν παραβεβηκότων), dead bodies. The noun עֲצָמוֹת appears 24 times in the Hebrew Scripture, and in the majority of these cases it refers to dead corpses (Gen 15:11 refers to a carcass while Lev 26:30 and perhaps Ezek 43:7, 9 refer to idols or “stele,” see T. Alexander, “עֲצָמוֹת,” *NIDOTTE* 3:577). This is the meaning in all the occurrence in the book of Isaiah, including Isaiah 66:24 (Isa 14:19; 34:3; 37:36; 66:24). The only two exceptions are found in 1 Samuel 30:10, 21 where the noun describes the near to death condition of David’s men.

¹²Howard Clark Kee, ed. *Cambridge Annotated Study Apocrypha: New Revised Standard Version* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 64, notes on v. 17; see also, John J. Collins, “Ecclesiasticus, or The Wisdom of Jesus Son of Sirach,” in *The Oxford Bible Commentary* (ed. John Barton and John Muddiman; New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), 674.

Sirach 48:10-11

In light of the before mentioned passages, Sirach 48:11b expresses a clear resurrection hope. This verse concludes the hymn in praise of prophet Elijah (Sir 48:1-11) which is a part of a historical survey (Sir 44:1-49:16) listing the great Israelite ancestors of the past (see Table 5) towards the end of the book.¹³ In his praise of Elijah, Ben Sira gives the highlights of the prophet's life¹⁴ bracketed by an allusion (v. 1)¹⁵ and a direct quotation (v. 10) from the eschatological conclusion of the book of Malachi (Mal 4:1 [MT 3:19] and 4:5-6 [MT 3:23-24] respectively). The link with Malachi 4 is further strengthened by Sira's reference to Horeb, where Elijah heard God's judgments of vengeance (Sir 48:7b || Mal 4:4 [MT 3:22]). Table 6 highlights the links between Malachi 4:1-6 [MT 3:19-23] and Sirach 48:1-11.

¹³Sirach can be outlined as following, the relevant section has been highlighted:

Greek Prologue	
I. Wisdom sayings	(Sir 1:1-43:33)
II. The Praise of the Fathers	(Sir 44:1-49:16)
Introduction	(Sir 44:1-15)
Past Heroes	(Sir 44:16-49:16)
Present Heroes	(Sir 50:1-24)
III. Conclusion	(Sir 50:25-51:30)
Epilogue	(Sir 50:25-29)
Song of Praise	(Sir 51:1-12)
Alphabetic Prayer	(Sir 51:13-30)

¹⁴According to Sirach 48:1-11, these miraculous exploits are: bringing famine by shutting up the heavens (vv. 2-3a || 1 Kings 17:1); bringing down fire from heaven (v. 3b || 1 Kings 18:38; 2 Kings 1:10, 12); raising a corpse from death, Hades (v. 5a || 1 Kings 17:17-22); sending kings down to destruction (v. 6a || 1 Kings 21:19-24) and famous men from their sickbeds (v. 6b || 2 Kings 1:2-4, 6, 16-17); visiting with God at His mountain (v. 7 || 1 Kings 19:8-18); anointing his successor (v. 8 || 1 Kings 19:16); and taken to heaven in a chariot with horses of fire (v. 9 || 2 Kings 2:1-11).

¹⁵בתנור, "like a furnace," describes both the eschatological day of judgment in Malachi 4:1 (MT 3:19) and Elias' prophetic message in the hymn praising prophet Elijah in Sirach 48:1 (in original Hebrew). It is important to note that Malachi gives Elijah a key role in his end-time vision, predicting his "second coming" to herald the day of the Lord. This part of the prophecy is commented on by Sira at the end of the hymn (48:10-11).

Table 5. Literary structure of Ben Sira's list of heroes (Sir 44:1-49:16)

INTRODUCTION – Twelve Categories of Heroes		44:1-15	
T O R A H	Enoch	44:16	
	Noah	44:17-18	
	Abraham	44:19-21	Genesis
	Isaac and Jacob	5x 44:22-23e	
	Moses	44:23f-45:5	
	Aaron	45:6-22	Exodus-Deuteronomy
	Phinehas	45:23-26	
	Joshua and Caleb	5x 46:1-10	
	The Judges	46:11-20	Time of Judges
	Samuel	46:13-20	
P R O P H E T S	Nathan	47:1	
	David	47:2-11	United Kingdom
	Solomon	47:12-22	
	Rehoboam and Jeroboam	5x 47:23-25	
	Elijah	48:1-11	The Northern Kingdom
	Elisha	48:12-16	
	FALL OF ISRAEL – Evaluation of History (48:15-16)		
	Hezekiah	48:17-22	The Southern Kingdom
	Isaiah	48:23-25	
	Josiah and Other Worthies	49:1-16	
W R I T I N G S	Josiah	49:1-3	
	FALL OF JUDAH – Evaluation of History (49:4-7)		
	Jeremiah	49:6b-7	Warning of Coming
	Ezekiel	49:8	Destruction
	Job	3x 49:9	
	Twelve Prophets	49:10	Message of Hope for Israel
	Zerubbabel	49:11	The Post-Exilic Generation
	Jeshua son of Jozadak	49:12	and National Builders
	Nehemiah	3x 49:13	

Table 5 – Continued

CONCLUSION – Retrospective	49:14-16	
Enoch	49:14	
Joseph	49:15	
Shem – Seth – Enosh	49:16a	
ADAM	49:16b	MOST HONORED OF ALL

Reading Sirach 48:1-11, it becomes clear that Sirach summarizes all the miraculous exploits of Elijah as recorded in 1 Kings 17 – 2 Kings 2, and adds the only other reference to Elijah recorded in the TaNaKh, Malachi 4:5, which describes his role at the end of time, at Elijah’s “second coming.” According to this eschatological prophecy, Elijah will once more help reconcile the people with God, like his famous deed at Mt. Carmel (1 Kings 18 || Sir 48:3b), when the hearts of God’s people were turned back to YHWH (1 Kings 18:37, 39). In the typological story, this was to bring true conversion and save the people from the coming judgment of the Baal prophets (1 Kings 18:40). In the anti-typical story, Elijah will once more bring a message of salvation before the LORD’s day of Judgment, to give all people an opportunity to repent and be counted among God’s righteous (Mal 4:2-4 [MT 3:20-22]) and not share in the destiny of the wicked (Mal 4:1, 3, 6b [MT 3:19, 21, 24b]).¹⁶

¹⁶Douglas Stuart, “Malachi,” in *Zephaniah, Haggai, Zechariah, and Malachi*, ed. Thomas Edward McComiskey, vol. 3 of *The Minor Prophets: An Exegetical and Expository Commentary*, ed. Thomas Edward McComiskey; Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 1998), 1395-1396.

Table 6. Links between Malachi 3:19-23 and Sirach 48:1-11

Malachi 3:19-23 [ET 4:1-6]	Sirach 48:1-11 ^a
<p>כִּי־הִנֵּה הַיּוֹם בָּא בְּעֵר כְּתָנוֹר וְהָיוּ כָל־זָדִים וְכָל־עֹשֶׂה רָשָׁע קֶשׁ וְלִהְיוּ אִתָּם הַיּוֹם הַזֶּה אָמַר יְהוָה צְבָאוֹת אֲשֶׁר לֹא־יַעֲזֹב לָהֶם שָׂרֵשׁ וְעֵנָף:</p> <p>²⁰ וְזָרְחָה לָכֶם יְרֵאִי שָׁמַי שֹׁמֵשׁ צִדְקָה וּמִרְפָּא בְּכִנְפֶיהָ וַיִּצְאֲתֶם וּפְשָׁתֶם כְּעִנְלֵי מִרְבֵּק:</p> <p>²¹ וְעִסּוֹתֶם רָשָׁעִים כִּי־יִהְיוּ אַחֲרֵי תַחַת כַּפּוֹת רִגְלֵיכֶם בַּיּוֹם אֲשֶׁר אֲנִי עֹשֶׂה אָמַר יְהוָה צְבָאוֹת:</p> <p>²² זָכְרוּ תּוֹרַת מֹשֶׁה עַבְדִּי אֲשֶׁר צִוִּיתִי אוֹתוֹ בְּחָרֵב בְּחָרֵב עַל־כָּל־יִשְׂרָאֵל חֲקִים וּמִשְׁפָּטִים:</p> <p>²³ הִנֵּה אֲנִכִּי שֹׁלַח לָכֶם אֶת אֱלִיָּה הַנָּבִיא לִפְנֵי בּוֹא יוֹם יְהוָה הַגָּדוֹל וְהַנּוֹרָא: ²⁴ וְהָשִׁיב לִב־אֲבוֹת עַל־בָּנִים וְלִב בָּנִים עַל־אֲבוֹתָם פֶּן־אֲבּוּא וְהִפִּיתִי אֶת־הָאָרֶץ חֲרָם:</p>	<p>¹ עד אשר קם נביא כאש ודבריו כתנור בוער:</p> <p>⁷ והשמיע בסיני תוכחות ובחורב משפטי נק[ם]:</p> <p>¹⁰ הכתוב נכון לעת להשבית אף לפני[י] . . . לב אבות על בנים ולהבין ש[בטי ישראל]^b: ראך ומת . . . ך׃ . . . י׃ להשיב ¹¹ אשר</p>
<p>^a Hebrew and translation of Sirach is taken from A. E. Cowley, and Ad. Neubauer. <i>The Original Hebrew of a Portion of Ecclesiasticus (XXXIX. 15 to XLIX. 11) together with the Early Versions and an English Translation, Followed by the Quotations from Ben Sira in Rabbinical Literature</i> (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1897), 36-37.</p> <p>^bThe Greek and Syriac version have “tribes of Jacob.”</p> <p>^cOnly the tail of the letter remains.</p>	

Table 6 – Continued

<p>¹ "For indeed, the day is coming, burning like a furnace, when all the arrogant and everyone who commits wickedness will become stubble. The coming day will consume them," says the LORD of Hosts, "not leaving them root or branches.</p> <p>² But for you who fear My name, the sun of righteousness will rise with healing in its wings, and you will go out and playfully jump like calves from the stall.</p> <p>³ You will trample the wicked, for they will be ashes under the soles of your feet on the day I am preparing," says the LORD of Hosts.</p> <p>⁴ "Remember the instruction of Moses My servant, the statutes and ordinances I commanded him at Horeb for all Israel.</p> <p>⁵ Look, I am going to send you Elijah the prophet before the great and awesome Day of the LORD comes.</p> <p>⁶ And he will turn the hearts of fathers to their children and the hearts of children to their fathers. Otherwise, I will come and strike the land with a curse." (CSB)</p>	<p>¹ Till there arose a prophet like fire, whose words were like a burning furnace.</p> <p>⁷ Who heardest reproofs in Sinai, and judgments of vengeance in Horeb;</p> <p>¹⁰ Who art written down as ready for a season, to make anger to cease before To turn the heart of the fathers to the children, and to give understanding to the tr[ibes of Isra]el</p> <p>¹¹ Happy he that saw thee and died (?)</p>
--	--

Di Lella suggests an additional allusion in Sirach 48:10c, noting that the phrase *וְלִהְיוּ לְבָנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל*, *and to give understanding to the tribes of Israel*, derives from the phrase *אֶת-שְׁבִטֵי יַעֲקֹב וְנִצְוֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל לְהָשִׁיב*, *the tribes of Jacob and restoring the protected ones of Israel*, appearing in the highly charged Messianic passage of Isaiah 49:6.¹⁷ Sira connects Isaiah 49:6 with the eschatological work of Elijah in Malachi 4:6 (MT 3:24), making Elijah's work universal: "It is not enough for you to be My servant raising up the tribes of Jacob and restoring the protected ones of Israel. I will also make you a light for the nations, to be My salvation to the ends of the earth" (CSB).

¹⁷Skehan and Di Lella, *The Wisdom of Ben Sira*, 534. This allusion is made even stronger in the Greek and Syriac translation, see Table 6, note b.

The Hebrew of the last two lines of Sira's hymn is unfortunately fragmentary, but Émile Puech suggests the following restoration: ". . . for you give life, and he will live."¹⁸ As noted earlier, the Greek translation of this verse has a clear resurrection hope and reads: "μακάριοι οἱ ἰδόντες σε καὶ οἱ ἐν ἀγαπῇσει κεκοιμημένοι καὶ γὰρ ἡμεῖς ζωῇ ζησόμεθα" (LXT), *Blessed are those who saw you and slept/died in love; for we shall surely live*.¹⁹ Patrick Skehan notes that the corresponding Syriac reads: "Blest is he who shall have seen you and died; but he shall not die, but shall certainly live."²⁰ Although it is unlikely that the resurrection belief was a part of the original Hebrew hymn, the Greek and Syriac translations show that Elijah's eschatological work contains a resurrection hope. It is significant that this association became a part of Rabbinic tradition (*m. Soṭah* 9:15; *Pesiq. Rab. Kah.* 76a).²¹

Concluding Remarks

Allusions and references to the resurrection appears in the Greek version of Sirach (Sir 2:9c; 7:17b; 12:6c; 16:22c; 19:19; 46:19-20; 48:11b, 13-14) and most of them were probably not a part of the original Hebrew composition. Not much is revealed regarding the nature of the resurrection, only that it will happen in the eschatological age. Two texts

¹⁸Émile Puech, "Ben Sira 48:11 et la Résurrection," in *Of Scribes and Scrolls: Studies on the Hebrew Bible, Intertestamental Judaism, and Christian Origins, Presented to John Strugnell on the Occasion of His Sixtieth Birthday*, eds. Harold W. Attridge, John J. Collins, and Thomas H. Tobin (Lanham, MD: University of America, 1990), 81-90.

¹⁹"Fortunate are those who live to see you come, as well as those who have already died in love, for we too shall live" (TEV).

²⁰Skehan and Di Lella, *The Wisdom of Ben Sira*, 531.

²¹Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 96.

were considered when looking at the resurrection belief in the book of Sirach. The first text, Sirach 7:17b, reveals the destiny of the wicked, alluding to Isaiah 66:22-24. The second text, Sirach 48:1-11, summarizes the life of Elijah (1 King 17-2 King 2) and places the resurrection of the righteous as a part of Elijah's eschatological work which will introduce the Messianic age, supported by quoting Malachi 4:1-6 (MT 3:19-24) and alluding to the Servant Songs of Isaiah (Isaiah 49:6).

2 Maccabees

2 Maccabees, originally written in Greek, covers a period of about 25 years, beginning with the reign of Seleucus IV Pilopator (187-175 BCE) and ending with the defeat of Nicanor, the Seleucid general, by Judas Maccabeus in the spring of 162 BCE (2 Macc 3:3; 15:20-37). The book easily fits the genre of apologetic historiography due to its pro-Maccabean sentiments and its theological interpretation of the historical events mixed with the use of Greek rhetoric in its defense and exaltation of Jewish values and traditions. deSilva notes that 2 Maccabees also seeks "to demonstrate the ongoing legitimacy of Deuteronomy's philosophy of history as can be traced out in recent events, as well as the legitimacy of the Jerusalem temple as the focal point of God's protective care and concern."²²

²²deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 266. Robert Doran argues that 2 Maccabees could also be understood as Temple propaganda, showing God's favor towards the Temple in Jerusalem (*Temple Propaganda: The Purpose and Character of 2 Maccabees*, CBQMS 12 [Washington, DC: Catholic Biblical Association, 1981]). It is important to note that according to Josephus, there was also a Jewish Temple in Leontopolis (located in the nome of Heliopolis) during this time-period (*J.W.* 1.1.1; 7.10.2-4), which had been founded by Onias IV who fled to Egypt after his father, high-priest Onias III (for further reading about the high-priests of this crucial period described in 2 Maccabees, see James C. VanderKam, *From Joshua to Caiaphas: High Priests after the Exile* [Minneapolis: Fortress, 2004], 188-226), had been murdered in Jerusalem (Josephus, *Ant.* 12.9.7 §387). However, Doran and Arenhoevel refute that 2

The two prefixed letters of 2 Maccabees (1:1-2:18), the first dated to 124/123 BCE and the second dated to 164/163 BCE²³ are addressed to the Jewish Diaspora of Egypt, commanding them to celebrate the festival of Chanukah and make it a part of their calendar. The second part of the book²⁴ chronicles the events preceding the Maccabean revolt followed by the exploits of Judas Maccabeus who, with God's help, overthrew the foreign oppressor, then purified and rededicated the Temple of Jerusalem, the key event being celebrated.²⁵ This conclusion is further supported by the narrative's "universal

Maccabees contains a polemic against the Egyptian Temple: D. Arenhoevel, *Die Theokratie nach dem 1. und 2. Makkabäerbuch* (Mainz: Matthias-Grünwald, 1967), 100-102 and Doran, *Temple Propaganda*, 11-12.

²³Since this letter is undated, some scholars argue that it should be regarded as a much later composition, dated to c. 60 BCE. See discussion in John J. Collins, *Between Athens and Jerusalem: Jewish Identity in the Hellenistic Diaspora*, 2nd ed., The Biblical Resource Series (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000), 80.

²⁴Maccabees 2:23 states that the second half of the book is an abridged version of Jason of Cyrene's five volume work on the Maccabean revolt, which was possibly completed before the death of Judah in 160 BCE since the author of 2 Maccabees ends his epitome with the death of Nicanor, two years earlier. The abridger of the book may have completed his work no earlier than the first letter of the book, dated to 124 BCE (see Table 4).

²⁵Following is an outline of 2 Maccabees. The bolded text specifies the location of the most explicit resurrection passage, which also serves as the turning point of the book:

- I. Prefix: Two letters inviting the Jews of the Egyptian Diaspora to celebrate Hanukkah (1:1-2:18)
 - 1st Letter (1:1-9)
 - 2nd Letter (1:10-2:18)
- II. An epitome of the five volume work of Jason of Cyrene
 - The Preface (2:19-32)
 - Pre-Maccabean Revolt (3-7)
 - Pre-Maccabean Episodes (3:1-40)
 - The Hellenistic Reforms – Apostasy (4:1-50)
 - Jewish Worship suppressed by Antiochus IV (5:1-6:11)
 - Martyrs of the Persecution (6:12-7:42)
 - Theological Significance of the Persecution (6:12-17)
 - Martyrdom of Eleazar (6:18-31)
 - Martyrdom of Seven Brothers (7:1-42)**
 - Maccabean Revolt – Exploits of Judas Maccabeus (8:1-15:37)
 - Epilogue (15:38-39)

nature.” God and the Martyrs are the heroes of the salvation story as noted by deSilva: “The book’s emphasis falls on God’s deliverance through any and all agents God chooses, rather than on the contribution of a particular family to the well-being of Israel”²⁶ as is the case of 1 Maccabeus. As such, this book serves the same purpose for Chanukah as the book of Esther serves for Purim (alluded to in the concluding remark of 2 Macc 15:36, which refers to the day of Mordecai), in that they both present the background story for their respective “salvation festival.”²⁷

2 Maccabees struggles with harmonizing the Deuteronomistic principle of just reward based on observance of the Torah and the martyrdom of the righteous Jews, by presenting an ingenious theological structure which combines the universal aspect of the covenant with a personal eschatology. According to this book, it is the apostasy of the people led by Jason and Menelaus (2 Macc 4-6) which brought collective punishment on the people, while the martyrdom of the righteous played a pivotal role in “bringing to an end the wrath of the Almighty (2 Macc 7:38) thereby reconciling the people with God (2 Macc 6:12-17; 7:6, 32-33, 37-38; 8:5). 2 Maccabees 8-15 recounts God’s miraculous work through his Torah observant people. DeSilva writes: “They [the martyrs] suffered as part of the nation: but at the same time, their voluntary surrender of their bodies for the sake of God and God’s law becomes an efficacious death on behalf of the nation . . . just

²⁶deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 274. See also Collins, *Between Athens and Jerusalem*, 82-83.

²⁷R. Doran, “1 and 2 Maccabees,” DNTB, 660.

as the sin of individuals brought collective punishment, so the covenant loyalty of individuals can effect reversal.”²⁸

It is important to note that 2 Maccabees introduces a faith in a bodily resurrection (see Table 4) to deal with the question of theodicy on a personal level. Although the death of the “righteous Torah observant Jews” atones for the sins of the nation, the heroes of faith do not seem to receive their just reward in this world. Only a future reward, after their resurrection, would solve this problem, and as such, the resurrection belief becomes key in upholding Deuteronomy’s philosophy and solves the problem of theodicy.

2 Maccabees 7

2 Maccabees 7 is the only passage that refers/alludes to the TaNaKh when describing the resurrection belief²⁹ and serves as the central chapter and turning point of

²⁸deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 275.

²⁹Although other passages in 2 Maccabees allude (2 Macc 6:26) or state a resurrection belief (2 Macc 12:43-45; 14:37-46), they do not attempt to base this belief on Scripture. In the case of the martyrdom of Eleazar, he argues that he will not try to save his life by pretenses, since this act may lead astray the righteous (v. 25) and his less than honest behavior will be judged by God either in this life or after his death (v. 26). Although Eleazar does not mention a bodily resurrection, it is clear that he believes that he would be held accountable for his action, even after he has died.

2 Maccabees 12:43-45 is especially interesting since it supports the resurrection belief based on the actions taken by Judas’ act and his troops upon realizing that their brothers in arms had fallen in the battle due to “the sacred tokens of the idols of Jamnia” worn under their tunics (v. 40). Jonathan Goldstien noted that Jason engages “in a complicated piece of logical gymnastics to prove that Judas believed in the resurrection of the dead” (Jonathan A. Goldstein, *2 Maccabees*, AB 41A [Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1983], 449). Jason argues that Judas’ act of collecting two thousand drachmas of silver to provide for a sin offering and prayers on behalf of the dead soldiers would have been foolish and superfluous unless he was expecting that this deed would somehow be helpful and bring atonement for the sin they had committed. From this, Jason concludes, Judas’ intent was to expiate for their grievous acts of idolatry so they would be able to partake in the resurrection of the righteous and receive the splendid reward awaiting them (vv. 44-45). It should be noted that Paul uses the same “logical gymnastics” when arguing for a resurrection belief in 1 Corinthians 15:29 based on the practice of baptizing a person on behalf of (ὕπὲρ) the dead. (For a detailed discussion on this text, see Gordon D. Fee, *The First Epistle to the Corinthians*, NICNT [Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1987], 762-767).

The last resurrection passage of 2 Maccabees recounts the suicide attempt and death of Jewish revolutionary Razis (14:37-46), and his great belief in a future bodily resurrection. In graphic language

the book (see outline in note 25). In this chapter, all but two (vv. 20c and 40b which are the words of the narrator) of the resurrection allusions/references have been placed in the speeches given by the heroes, the mother and her seven children. Table 7 contains all the speeches of 2 Maccabees 7, Appendix A provides their full context.

Three interconnected themes emerge from these speeches. The first theme, underlined in Table 7, is introduced by the first son, probably the oldest, who speaks on behalf of his brothers. This is the core issue facing God's people during any time of religious persecution and what in the end caused the Maccabean revolt: which command do you follow? The one given by God or the one given by the persecutor? The first brother makes his decision clear, he would rather die as a martyr than transgress the laws of God (v. 2b). This sentiment is echoed by the second brother (v. 9b), the mother (vv. 23c and 29a), and in the concluding remarks of the seventh brother (vv. 30b, 36b and 37a).

The second theme, highlighted in italics and blue in Table 7, provides the lense through which this chapter and the entire book should be understood. According to the Deuteronomistic principle (Deut 28-32), God blesses or curses his people based on their adherence to his covenant. The mother and her six sons (the seventh son has been so mutilated that he is not able to speak) encourage each other by remembering the Song of Moses (v.6 || Deut 32), which promises that God "will vindicate His people and have compassion on His servants when He sees that [their] strength is gone" (Deut 32:36,

Razis "tore out his entrails, took them in both hands and hurled them at the crowd, calling upon the Lord of life and spirit to give them back to him again" (v. 46, NRSV).

CSB). This is the situation in which they find themselves. They have run out of options, but they have not given up on God, so they cling to his Covenant, in a hope that God will show them compassion. This sentiment is restated by the sixth (v. 18) and the seventh son (vv. 32-33 and vv. 37-38), who adds that their suffering is deserved since God gives the Covenant curses to the whole nation because of their lack of obedience. However, the seventh son hopes that his and his brothers' great loyalty towards God's Covenant will bring to an end God's wrath and cause him to once more show compassion on his nation (v.38).³⁰

The first and the second theme creates a theological dilemma. According to the second theme, the covenant people are being punished for not adhering to the covenant stipulations, hence the punishment befalling the community by the pagan king is deserved. The first theme, however, does not seem to apply the Deuteronomistic principle to a personal level since the brothers are suffering and dying even when they uphold the secretness of the covenant. The conundrum is that God's covenant is in stark conflict with the king's demands and the brothers are not able to adhere to them both. If they adhere to the king's demands, they break God's covenant and will be punished. On the other hand, if they adhere to God's covenant, they will still suffer punishment and

³⁰Deuteronomy notes that when God vindicates his people, "He will avenge the blood of his servants . . . take vengeance on his adversaries . . . [and] will purify His land and His people" (Deut 32:43, CSB). This aspect of the Deuteronomistic principle is also found in the speeches of the brothers, highlighted in green in Table 7. The king is warned by the fourth (v. 14b), fifth (v. 17), sixth (v. 19) and thrice by the seventh brother (vv. 31, 34-35, 36b) that God would hold him accountable for his heinous deeds against the righteous.

Table 7. The speeches in 2 Maccabees 7

	Verse	LXT/LXX	NRSV
1 st S O N	2b	τί μέλλεις ἐρωτᾶν καὶ μαρτάνειν ἡμῶν ἔτοιμοι γὰρ ἀποθνήσκειν ἐσμέν ἢ <u>παραβαίνειν τοὺς πατέρας νόμους</u>	^{2b} What do you intend to ask and learn from us? <u>For we are ready to die rather than</u> <u>transgress the laws of our ancestors.</u>
H E R O D E S	6	ὁ κύριος ὁ θεὸς ἐφορᾷ [cf. LXX Zech 9:1; Job 34:23] καὶ ταῖς ἀληθείαις ἐφ’ ἡμῖν [Deut 33:36] παρακαλεῖται καθάπερ διὰ τῆς κατὰ πρόσωπον ἀντιμαρτυρούσης φύδης διεσάφησεν Μωυσῆς [Deut 31:21] λέγων καὶ ἐπὶ τοῖς δούλοις αὐτοῦ παρακληθήσεται [Deut 32:36]	⁶ The Lord God is watching over us [cf. LXX Zech 9:1; Job 34:23] <i>and in truth has</i> <i>compassion on us</i> [Deut 32:36], <i>as Moses</i> <i>declared in his song that bore witness</i> <i>against the people to their faces</i> [Deut 31:21], <i>when he said, “And he will have</i> <i>compassion on his servants”</i> [Deut 32:36].
2 nd S O N	9b	σὺ μὲν ἀλάστωρ ἐκ τοῦ παρόντος ἡμᾶς ζῆν ἀπολύεις ὁ δὲ τοῦ κόσμου βασιλεὺς [Ps 10:16; 145:13] ἀποθανόντας ἡμᾶς ὑπὲρ τῶν αὐτοῦ νόμων εἰς αἰώνιον ἀναβίωσιν ζωῆς ἡμᾶς ἀναστήσει [LXX, Dan 12:2]	^{9b} You accursed wretch, you dismiss us from this present life, but the King of the universe [Ps 10:16; 145:13] will raise us up to an everlasting renewal of life [LXX, Dan 12:2], because we have died for his law.
3 rd S O N	11b	ἐξ οὐρανοῦ ταῦτα κέκτημαι καὶ διὰ τοὺς αὐτοῦ νόμους ὑπερορῶ ταῦτα καὶ παρ’ αὐτοῦ ταῦτα πάλιν ἐλπίζω κομίσασθαι	^{11b} I got these [his hands] from Heaven, and because of his laws I disdain them, and from him I hope to get them back again.
4 th S O N	14b	αἰρετὸν μεταλλάσσειντας ὑπ’ ἀνθρώπων τὰς ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ προσδοκᾶν ἐλπίδας πάλιν ἀναστήσεσθαι ὑπ’ αὐτοῦ σοὶ μὲν γὰρ ἀνάστασις εἰς ζωὴν οὐκ ἔσται [Dan 12:2; cf. Isa 14:20-21; 26:14, 19; 66:24]	^{14b} One cannot but choose to die at the hands of mortals and to cherish the hope God gives of being raised again by him. But for you there will be no resurrection to life! [Dan 12:2; cf. Isa 14:20-21; 26:14, 19; 66:24]
5 th S O N	16b-17	ἐξουσίαν ἐν ἀνθρώποις ἔχων φθαρτὸς ὢν ὃ θέλεις ποιεῖς μὴ δόκει δὲ τὸ γένος ἡμῶν ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ καταλελειφθαι ¹⁷ σὺ δὲ καρτέρει καὶ θεώρει τὸ μεγαλεῖον αὐτοῦ κράτος ὡς σὲ καὶ τὸ σπέρμα σου βασανιεῖ [Dan 8:4, 24-25; 11:36]	^{16b} Because you have authority among mortals, though you also are mortal, you do what you please. But do not think that God has forsaken our people. ¹⁷ Keep on, and see how his mighty power will torture you and your descendants! [Dan 8:4, 24-25; 11:36]

Table 7 – Continued

6 th S O N	18c-19	<p>μὴ πλανῶ μάτην ἡμεῖς <i>γὰρ δι' ἑαυτοὺς ταῦτα πάσχομεν ἁμαρτόντες εἰς τὸν ἑαυτῶν θεόν</i> ἄξια θαυμασμοῦ γέγονεν ¹⁹οὐ δὲ μὴ νομίσης ἁθῶος ἔσσεσθαι <i>θεομαχεῖν ἐπιχειρήσας</i> [Deut 28:59; Dan 8:24-25]</p>	<p>^{18c}Do not deceive yourself in vain. <i>For we are suffering these things on our own account, because of our sins against our own God.</i> Therefore astounding things have happened. ¹⁹<i>But do not think that you will go unpunished for having tried to fight against God!</i> [Deut 28:59; Dan 8:24-25]</p>
M O T H E R	22-23	<p>οὐκ οἶδ' ὅπως εἰς τὴν ἐμὴν ἐφάνητε κοιλίαν [Ecc1 8:17; 11:5] οὐδὲ ἐγὼ τὸ πνεῦμα καὶ τὴν ζωὴν [Gen 2:7 (cf. Gen 6:17; 7:15, 22); cf. Ecc1 12:7; 2 Macc 7:23; 14:46] ὑμῖν ἐχαρισάμην καὶ τὴν ἐκάστου στοιχείωσιν οὐκ ἐγὼ διερρύθμισα ²³τοιγαροῦν ὁ τοῦ κόσμου κτίστης ὁ πλάσας ἀνθρώπου γένεσιν [Gen 2:7, 8, 15; LXX, Gen 5:1] καὶ πάντων ἐξευρὼν γένεσιν [Ecc1 8:17; 11:5] <i>καὶ τὸ πνεῦμα καὶ τὴν ζωὴν</i> [see v. 22] <i>ὑμῖν πάλιν ἀποδίδωσιν</i> [LXX, Isa 26:12] <i>μετ' ἐλέους</i> [cf. LXX, Isa 26:20; 54:7] <i>ὥς νῦν ὑπερορᾶτε ἑαυτοὺς διὰ τοὺς αὐτοῦ νόμους</i></p>	<p>²²I do not know how you came into being in my womb [Ecc1 8:17; 11:5]. It was not I who gave you life and breath [Gen 2:7 (cf. Gen 6:17; 7:15, 22); cf. Ecc1 12:7], nor I who set in order the elements within each of you. ²³Therefore the Creator of the world , who shaped the beginning of humankind [Gen 2:7, 8, 15; LXX, Gen 5:1] and devised the origin of all things [Ecc1 8:17; 11:5], <i>will in his mercy</i> [cf. LXX, Isa 26:20; 54:7] <i>give life and breath</i> [see v. 22] <i>back to you again</i> [LXX, Isa 26:12], <i>since you now forget yourselves for the sake of the laws.</i></p>
	27b-29	<p>υἱέ ἐλέησόν με τὴν ἐν γαστρὶ περιενέγκασάν σε μήνας ἐννέα καὶ θηλάσασάν σε ἔτη τρία καὶ ἐκθρέψασάν σε καὶ ἀγαγούσαν εἰς τὴν ἡλικίαν ταύτην καὶ τροφοφορήσασαν [LXX, Deut 1:31; Lam 2:22] ²⁸ἄξιῶ σε τέκνον ἀναβλέψαντα εἰς τὸν οὐρανὸν καὶ τὴν γῆν καὶ τὰ ἐν αὐτοῖς πάντα ἰδόντα [cf. Exod 40:11; Isa 40:26] γινῶναι ὅτι οὐκ ἐξ ὄντων ἐποίησεν αὐτὰ ὁ θεός καὶ τὸ τῶν ἀνθρώπων γένος οὕτω γίνεται ²⁹μὴ φοβηθῆς τὸν δῆμιον τοῦτον [cf. Isa 51:13] <i>ἀλλὰ τῶν ἀδελφῶν ἄξιός γε γινόμενος ἐπίδεξαι τὸν θάνατον ἵνα ἐν τῷ ἐλέει</i> [Isa 54:8, 10; 56:1; 64:4-11] <i>σὺν τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς σου κομίσωμαί σε</i></p>	<p>^{27b}My son, have pity on me, I carried you nine months in my womb, and nursed you for three years, and have reared you and brought you up to this point in your life, and have taken care of you [LXX, Deut 1:31; Lam 2:22]. ²⁸I beg you , my child, to look at the heaven and the earth and see everything that is in them [cf. Exod 40:11; Isa 40:26], and recognize that God did not make them out of things that existed. And in the same way the human race came into being. ²⁹Do not fear this butcher [cf. Isa 51:13], <i>but prove worthy of your brothers. Accept death, so that in God's mercy</i> [Isa 54:8, 10; 56:1; 64:4-11] <i>I may get you back again along with your brothers.</i></p>

Table 7 – Continued

7 th SON	<p>30b-38</p> <p>τίνα μένετε οὐχ ὑπακούω τοῦ προστάγματος τοῦ βασιλέως τοῦ δὲ προστάγματος ἀκούω τοῦ νόμου τοῦ δοθέντος τοῖς πατράσιν ἡμῶν διὰ Μωυσέως ³¹σὺ δὲ πάσης κακίας εὐρετῆς γενόμενος εἰς τοὺς Εβραίους οὐ μὴ διαφύγῃς τὰς χεῖρας τοῦ θεοῦ ³²ἡμεῖς γὰρ διὰ τὰς ἑαυτῶν ἀμαρτίας πάσχομεν ³³εἰ δὲ χάριν ἐπιπλήξεως καὶ παιδείας ὁ ζῶν κύριος [cf. 1 Sam 17:26, 36; Jer 10:10] ἡμῶν βραχέως ἐπώργισται καὶ πάλιν καταλλαγήσεται τοῖς ἑαυτοῦ δούλοις [cf. 1 Kings 8:34, 36] ³⁴σὺ δὲ ὦ ἀνόσιε καὶ πάντων ἀνθρώπων μιαιώτατε μὴ μάτην μετεωρίζου φρυαττόμενος [cf. Ps 2:1] ἀδύλοις ἐλπίσιν [cf. Isa 14:12-14] ἐπὶ τοὺς οὐρανίους παῖδας ἐπαίρόμενος χεῖρα ³⁵οὐπω γὰρ τὴν τοῦ παντοκράτορος ἐπόπτου θεοῦ κρίσιν ἐκπέφευγας ³⁶οἱ μὲν γὰρ νῦν ἡμέτεροι ἀδελφοὶ βραχὺν ὑπενέγκαντες πόνον ἀενάου ζωῆς ὑπὸ διαθήκην θεοῦ [Isa 55:2-3] πεπτώκασιν σὺ δὲ τῇ τοῦ θεοῦ κρίσει δίκαια τὰ πρόστιμα τῆς ὑπερηφανίας ἀποίση ³⁷ἐγὼ δὲ καθάπερ οἱ ἀδελφοί καὶ σῶμα καὶ ψυχὴν προδίδωμι περὶ τῶν πατρίων νόμων ἐπικαλούμενος τὸν θεὸν ἵλεως [cf. Deut 32:36] ταχὺ τῷ ἔθνει γενέσθαι καὶ σὲ μετὰ ἐτασμῶν καὶ μαστιγῶν ἐξομολογήσασθαι διότι μόνος αὐτὸς θεός ἐστιν [cf. Deut 32:39] ³⁸ἐν ἐμοὶ δὲ καὶ τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς μου στήσαι τὴν τοῦ παντοκράτορος ὀργὴν [cf. LXX, Isa 26:21; 42:25] τὴν ἐπὶ τὸ σὺμπαν ἡμῶν γένος δικαίως ἐπηγγένην</p>	<p>^{30b}What are you waiting for? I will not obey the king's command, but <u>I obey the command of the law that was given to our ancestors through Moses.</u> ³¹But you, who have contrived all sorts of evil against the Hebrews, will certainly not escape the hands of God. ³²For we are suffering because of our own sins. ³³And if our living Lord [cf. 1 Sam 17:26, 36; Jer 10:10] is angry for a little while, to rebuke and discipline us, he will again be reconciled with his own servants [cf. 1 Kings 8:34, 36]. ³⁴But you. Unholy wretch, you most defiled of all mortals, do not be elated in vain and puffed up [cf. Ps 2:1] by uncertain hopes [cf. Isa 14:12-14], when you raise your hand against the children of heaven. ³⁵You have not yet escaped the judgment of the almighty, all seeing God. ³⁶For our brothers after enduring a brief suffering have drunk of ever-flowing life, under God's covenant [Isa 55:2-3]; but you, by the judgment of God, will receive just punishment for your arrogance. ³⁷I, like my brothers, give up body and life for the laws of our ancestors, appealing to God to show mercy [cf. Deut 32:36] soon to our nation and by trails and plagues to make you confess that he alone is God [cf. Deut 32:39], ³⁸and through me and my brothers to bring to an end the wrath [cf. LXX, Isa 26:21; 42:25] of the Almighty that has justly fallen on our whole nation.</p>
------------------------	---	--

death by the hand of the king.³¹ The third theme, the theme of bodily resurrection bolded in red in Table 7, solves the predicament. It is introduced in the speech of the second brother (v. 9b) and is reiterated and expanded upon by the third (v. 11b), fourth (v. 14b), and the seventh (v. 36) brother. The most extensive resurrection statements are given by

³¹Both the universal and individualistic aspects of the Deuteronomistic principle are considered in 2 Maccabees 7. The speeches in Table 7 moves from an individualistic view towards a universal view – from a focus on the vindication of the brothers (v. 9b) to the vindication of the whole nation of Israel (v. 38).

the mother in her two encouraging speeches to her youngest son (vv. 22-23 and vv. 27b-29).

It should not come as a surprise that these speeches contain a strong resurrection hope. It is the first and the second theme which gives a voice to the strong resurrection belief spoken by the heroes. When the second son declares that he would rather be punished limb by limb than break God's law by eating unlawful swine flesh (v. 7), he also claims that this great show of faithfulness will be rewarded by God, who will resurrect the martyrs to an everlasting renewal of life (v. 9). As such, Nickelsburg observes, the resurrection not only "functions as the means by which God will deliver the brothers from the destruction that Antiochus inflict on them"³² but also a way for God to vindicate his servants. He adds that the brothers will have their bodies restored at the resurrection "as a remedy for their bodily tortures. [Since] God will heal what Antiochus has hurt; he will bring to life those whom Antiochus has killed. What God created, he will recreate – in spite of the king's attempt to destroy it (7:22-23, 28-29)."³³

A case could be made that this strong conviction, voiced by the second brother, derives from a literal reading of Deuteronomy 32:39 ("I bring death and I give life; I wound and I heal") since verse 6 has already drawn the readers' attention to the Song of Moses.³⁴ Goldstein notes: "The poem there [Deut 32] teaches that God is always mindful of Israel: Israel's disasters are divine punishment for sin, not signs that God has deserted

³²Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 121.

³³*Ibid.*

³⁴This literal reading of Duet 32:39 is also attested in Rabbinic writings (e.g. *b. Pesah.* 68a; *b. Sanh.* 91b; *Deut. Rab.* 3:15)

His people (Deut 32:15-30); God will take vengeance on the enemy (Deut 32:35, 41-43), for whom there is no escape (Deut 32:39), and He will resurrect and restore the maimed martyrs (ibid).”³⁵

In addition to Deuteronomy 32:39, there is a clear reference to Daniel 12:2 in the first resurrection speech given by the second brother (v. 9b). Goldstein remarks that the Greek text, εἰς αἰώνιον ἀναβίωσιν ζωῆς ἡμᾶς ἀναστήσει, is redundant and the literal translation is inelegant: “*which resurrect us to an eternal revivification of life.*” However, this redundancy reflects the language of the Greek version of Daniel 12:2 and its content which states that the righteous “*will be resurrected to eternal life*”:

Dan12:2 ἀναστήσονται οἱ μὲν εἰς ζωὴν αἰώνιον
2 Macc 7:9 εἰς αἰώνιον ἀναβίωσιν ζωῆς ἡμᾶς ἀναστήσει

In this speech, the second brother refers to the first of the two resurrections mentioned in Daniel 12:2, adding his interpretation of this text. He may view “the time of distress such as never has occurred since nations came into being until that time” (Dan 12:1) as a reference to the persecution experienced in his day, and considers the “wise” who “lead many to righteousness” (Dan 12:3) as a description of the martyrs suffering during this persecution, which would include his brothers and himself. If this is the case, the second brother may understand the “wise” as those who, according to wisdom literature, “fear God and keeps His commandments” (Eccl 12:13), those who would rather die than breaking the law of God. It is the people who would fall within this category that the second brother believes will be rewarded by the “eternal revivification of life” (v. 9b).

³⁵Goldstein, *2 Maccabees*, 303.

The fourth brother may be expanding on this interpretation of Daniel 12:2 when noting that his persecutor, Antiochus IV Epiphanes, the Seleucid king, will not partake in “the resurrection to life” (v.14b). Although the fourth brother does not state that the king will be resurrected “to shame and eternal contempt” (Dan 12:2), he does exclude him from the reward held in store for the righteous. Importantly, the fifth, sixth, and the seventh brother declare that the king’s deeds will not go unpunished (vv. 17, 19, 31, 34-35, 36b), warning him that the all-seeing God will judge him (v. 35), torture him and his descendants (v. 17), and punish him for his arrogance (v. 36b) – all pointing forward to a future punishment, although these speeches do not state clearly whether or not it will happen in present life or at the resurrection of the wicked.³⁶

The two resurrection speeches given by the mother of the seven brothers are especially interesting since they both combine Greek philosophical argument with a reference to both the Creation story and Hebrew Wisdom literature (see textual references in Table 7), to derive an “extreme form” of the resurrection belief. She supports the belief voiced by her third son, that even if the whole body is destroyed by fire they will recover all the members at the time of the resurrection (2 Macc 7:11b, also voiced by Razis in

³⁶Regardless of how the brothers interpreted Daniel 12:2, Jason of Cyrene seems to believe that God judged and punished Antiochus in this life. Jason reports that God inflicted the king with worms which caused severe pain and anguish. Moreover, his flesh rotted away before he died a dishonorable death in a foreign land (2 Macc 9:1-12). He concludes: “So the murderer and blasphemer, having endured the more intense suffering, such as he had inflicted on others, came to the end of his life by a most pitiable fate, among the mountains in a strange land” (2 Macc 9:28, NRSV). Jason’s remark that Antiochus “had thought that he could touch the stars of heaven [τῶν οὐρανίων ἀστρων]” (2 Macc 9:10, NRSV) may allude to Daniel 12:3, ὥσεὶ τὰ ἀστρα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ, “like the stars of heaven,” referring to God’s righteous, who will awake to eternal life (Dan 12:2). If this is the case, Jason’s remark should be understood as a reference to Antiochus persecution of the righteous. However, Goldstein (2 *Maccabees*, 355) and Kee (*Cambridge Annotated Study Apocrypha*, 168) believe this verse alludes to the prophecy of Isaiah 14:12-19, as such, the phrase would refer to Antiochus’ great arrogance towards God.

14:46). In her comforting words, she seems to support the doctrine of creation *ex nihilo*, that God created the world out of nothing (v. 28),³⁷ and combines this belief with her experience as a mother, when the embryo grew in her womb (v. 22), noting that in both cases God was able to create something, the material world or a child, out of nothing. If this is the case, she argues, would not God be able to recreate them again on the day of resurrection and give them once more life and breath. Goldstein summarizes her argument:

The universe came into being after previously not existing, and so does every member of the human race. A dead human being has, indeed, ceased to exist, but he existed previously. Surely it is more conceivable that existence can be restored to what previously existed than that existence should be conferred on what did not exist! Therefore resurrection is *more conceivable* than the creation and than human reproduction!³⁸

The mother attempts to persuade her youngest son to uphold God's law and accept temporary nonexistence in faith since this would guarantee his resurrection. This is the only way, she argues, she may get him back together with her other six sons (v. 29).

The speeches also contain other possible sources for the resurrection language (see scriptural references and allusions in Table 7). References and allusions to Isaiah are especially interesting. Goldstein suggests that the mother is echoing Isaiah 26 in 2 Maccabees 7:23. This is a text which reveals that God will vindicate his people by punishing their adversaries (Isa 26:11, 21) and resurrect the righteous at a future time (Isa

³⁷For a discussion of the key phrase, οὐκ ἐξ ὄντων, "out of things that existed," in the statement that "God did not make them out of things that existed" (v. 28), see Goldstein, *2 Maccabees*, 307-311; Jonathan Goldstein's two articles: "The Origins of the Doctrine of Creation Ex Nihilo," *JJS* 35 (1984): 127-135 and "Creation Ex Nihilo: Recantations and Restatements," *JJS* 38 (1987): 187-194; and David Winston, "Creation Ex Nihilo Revisited: A Reply to Jonathan Goldstein," *JJS* 37 (1986): 88-91.

³⁸*Ibid.*, 311.

26:19-20), a fitting passage of hope for the mother who witnessed the suffering of her sons. Nickelsburg notices several additional details in the two central martyr passages of 2 Maccabees, the Eleazar story and the Martyrdom of Seven Brothers, which parallels the Servant Songs of Isaiah, especially chapters 52-53.³⁹ This is also an eschatologically pregnant text, alluding to the resurrection of the suffering servant – his future deeds (Isa 53:10-12), after he had been cut off from the land of the living (Isa 53:8).

Concluding Remarks

2 Maccabees presents a belief in a bodily resurrection in which every limb of the body, even if completely destroyed by fire, will be restored (2 Macc 7:11b; 14:46). The book also suggests that it is possible to provide a sin offering and prayers on behalf of the

³⁹The following list of parallels between 2 Maccabees 6:18-7:42 and the Servant Songs of Isaiah are quoted from Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 130-131.

2 Maccabees 6:18-7:42	The Servant Songs of Isaiah
The Scribe [Eleazar] refuses to be a hypocrite by pretending to eat swine's flesh, while in reality he is eating his own food (6:21-25)	Of the servant, it is said, "... there was no deceit in his mouth" (53:9).
Eleazar's tormenters think that he is out of his mind because he is willing to suffer (6:29).	In Wis 5:4, in a speech corresponding to Isaiah 53, the ungodly retract their former wrong opinions, among them the idea that the righteous man's life was madness.
The brothers are beaten with scourges (μάστιγες) (7:1), and the king's men tear off the skin of the second brother's head "with the hair" (7:7)	The servant gives his back to the smiters (μάστιγες) and his cheek to those who pluck out (the hair) (Isa 50:6 MT)
The brothers are disfigured (7:4, 7)	The servant is disfigured (Isa 52:14; 53:2)
The second brother puts out his tongue, saying that he got it from heaven (7:10-11)	The servant says, "The Lord has given me a tongue . . ." (Isa 50:4).
The king is astonished at their capacity to suffer (7:12)	Many were astonished at the servant because of his suffering (52:14).

dead to expiate for their sins so they will be able to partake in the resurrection of the righteous and receive the splendid reward awaiting them (2 Macc 12:44-45). It is important to note that the book does not present the dualistic view of body and soul. The book is silent on the condition of humans in the period between their death and their resurrection. It focuses only on the hope of a future resurrection of the righteous.

The resurrection belief in this book derives from an individualistic interpretation of the Deuteronomistic principle (Deut 28-32) and a literal reading of Deuteronomy 32:39, in which God will reward martyrs who have died to uphold God's law (2 Macc 7:6, 9, 11, 23, 29, 36) by giving them eternal life (2 Macc 7:36). This view is also derived from the brothers' interpretation of Daniel 12:1-3, applying this prophecy to their own experience, considering themselves among the "wise" who will be resurrected to eternal life (Dan 12:2), a language clearly reflected in the speech of the second brother (2 Macc 7:9). However, it is not clear if 2 Maccabees also presents a belief in a second resurrection for the wicked, who will awake to shame and eternal contempt, although there are some allusions to this belief. Additionally, the resurrection belief is supported by the doctrine of creation *ex nihilo* (2 Macc 7:28), arguing that God will once more be able to recreate the brothers out of nothing on the day of the resurrection. Lastly, it was noted that there were several references and allusions to the book of Isaiah which also presented a resurrection hope (Isa 26; 52-53). Figure 2 illustrates the death and resurrection concept presented in the book.

Fig. 2. Death and Resurrection in 2 Maccabees

Wisdom of Solomon

Wisdom of Solomon is a pseudepigraphical work⁴⁰ originally written in Greek,⁴¹ most likely by a pious Alexandrian Jew.⁴² Due to lack of historical references in this book, scholars have not reached a consensus regarding its dating. David Winston believes the book could have been written anywhere between 220 BCE and 100 CE.⁴³ However, deSilva observes that “the *terminus a quo* is set by the author’s use of the Greek translation of Isaiah, Job, and Proverbs, the first of which was probably available by 220 BCE. The *terminus ad quem* is set by the evident use of the work by several New Testament authors.”⁴⁴ The many thematic parallels between *Wisdom* and Paul’s letter to the Romans, which was written no later than 58 CE,⁴⁵ have led scholars to argue that Paul

⁴⁰Although King Solomon is not mentioned by name in this book, the anonymous author used Solomon’s voice when expanding on the great value of wisdom (Wis 6-9) and in his personification of wisdom (Wis 7), by referring to King Solomon’s prayer in 1 Kings 3:3-9 (Wis 7:7-12; 8:2, 10-11, 21; 9:4-5) and his description of Lady Wisdom in Proverbs 8. Solomonic authorship is ruled out due to the book’s Greek nature and there is no evidence that there existed a proto-Hebrew version of the book.

⁴¹David Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, AB 43 (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1979), 14-18.

⁴²The following factors support this assumption: use of Greek; use of Greek philosophical rhetoric; similar thoughts to Philo of Alexandria; central role of the Exodus narrative in the third section of the book (Wis 11-19); anti-Egyptian polemic against their cult practices (Wis 11:15-16; 15:18-16:4); general anti-Egyptian sentiments (e.g., Wis 19:13-17); and the special regard given to the Wisdom of Solomon by the Alexandrian Christians (Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 178; deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 132; Daniel J. Harrington, *Invitation to the Apocrypha* [Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999], 55; Moyna McGlynn, *Divine Judgement and Divine Benevolence in the Book of Wisdom*, WUNT 2/139 [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001], 10).

There is also strong evidence for a single authorship due to the literary unity of the book (Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 179-182; Winston, *Wisdom of Solomon*, 9-18).

⁴³Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 20-25.

⁴⁴deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 132.

⁴⁵Frederick F. Bruce, *The Letter of Paul to the Romans: An Introduction and Commentary*, 2nd ed., TNTC (Leicester, England: Inter-Varsity; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1985), 13-15; James D. G. Dunn, *Romans 1-8*, WBC 38A (Nashville: Nelson, 1988), xliii.

was familiar with this book, thus, arguing that *Wisdom* was written no later than the letter to the Romans.⁴⁶ Be that as it may, deSilva believes that the most likely period for this literary composition would be during the early phases of the Roman Empire, when they started to dominate Egypt.⁴⁷

Wisdom of Solomon is a rhetorical work⁴⁸ which was most likely addressed to the faithful Jews of Alexandria⁴⁹ who were struggling against the pressure of assimilating into the dominant pagan culture. It uses Greek philosophical rhetoric in an attempt to show the superiority of the Jewish wisdom, ethics, and philosophy – the Jewish way of life. The book makes a strong case that Jewish wisdom is superior to Greco-Roman philosophy (Wis 6-19) in that the righteous Jews, who are persecuted by the wicked, will be vindicated and rewarded by God (Wis 3:1-9; 5:15-16) and will, in turn, condemn the

⁴⁶For a survey of the various views held regarding the relation between *Wisdom* and Romans, see Jonathan A. Linebaugh, *God, Grace, and Righteousness in Wisdom of Solomon and Paul's Letter to the Romans: Texts in Conversation*, NovTSup 152 (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 13-20.

⁴⁷deSilva gives the following support from the text for this dating: 1) the description in Wisdom 14:16-20 fits better “the spontaneous, decentralized development of the imperial cult under Augustus” than “the cult of the Ptolemaic kings of Egypt”; 2) thirty-five of the terms and phrases used in Wisdom do not appear in secular Greek texts until the first century CE. (For a list of these words and phrases, see Winston, *Wisdom of Solomon*, 22-23, n.33); 3) Wisdom 6:1-2 seems to fit a Roman Imperial setting and 14:22 may be a critique of the *pax Romana* (deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 132-133). Collins concludes: “The account of the persecution of the righteous has the character of a quasi-philosophical argument about the profitability of justice, rather than of a veiled historical commentary, and the apocalyptic scene that it evokes was traditional by the Roman period” (Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 179).

⁴⁸Scholars have had difficulties in determining the literary genre used for the whole book. Some have classified it as a *logos protreptikos*, a didactic exhortation (J. M. Reese, *Hellenistic Influence on the Book of Wisdom and Its Consequences*, AnBib 41 [Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1971], 119-121; Winston, *Wisdom of Solomon*, 18-20) while others as an encomium, a genre of epideictic rhetoric and demonstrative in nature (Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 181-182). The main problem, as pointed out by Collins, is that various genres have been used in the book. He writes: “He [the author] utilizes apocalyptic traditions in the Book of Eschatology [Wis 1-6:21], draws heavily on philosophical terminology in the praise of Wisdom [Wis 6:22-10:21], and develops a homiletical exposition of biblical history in chapters 10-19” (Ibid., 182).

⁴⁹For a discussion on the intended audience, see deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 135-137.

wicked (Wis 4:16). In the final judgment at the end of days, the unrighteous will have to acknowledge that they were wrong in their ways (Wis 3:10-13a; 4:18-5:14).

This composition is heavily influenced by words and concepts from the TaNaKh, assuming that the reader is well versed in the Jewish Scriptures. It draws on passages like the Suffering Servant of Isaiah 52-53; Lady Wisdom of Proverbs 8; Salomon's prayer in 1 Kings 3:3-9; the anti-idolatry passage of Isaiah 40-55; Psalms – especially the Messianic psalm of Psalm 2; and relevant passages from Genesis, the Exodus/Wilderness narrative, Numbers, and Daniel.⁵⁰

Literary Structure

The following section will take a closer look at the textual references and allusions found at the chiastic center of the eschatological segment of the book, especially Wisdom 3:1-13a which deals with the question of theodicy and reveals the ultimate destiny of the righteous and the ungodly. Table 8 gives a suggested outline of the Wisdom of Solomon showing a three part structure. It should be noted that Wisdom 6 functions as a bridge between the first section (Wis 1-5) and the second section (Wis 7-10), summarizing and concluding the former and introducing the themes of the latter.⁵¹ The key text for this study (Wis 3:1-13a) has been highlighted in red. Wisdom 10 also

⁵⁰Ibid., 137-140; Harrington, *Invitation to the Apocrypha*, 56. For further study into potential sources for Wisdom, see C. Larcher, *Études sur le livre de la Sagesse* (Paris: Gabalda, 1969), 85-178; P. W. Skehan, *Studies in Israelite Poetry and Wisdom*, CBQMS 1 (Washington, DC: Catholic Biblical Association, 1971); and cross-references in Kee, *Cambridge Annotated Study Apocrypha*, 38-58.

⁵¹deSilva observes that Wisdom 6:1-11 forms an inclusio with 1:1-11 by addressing the rulers (see chiastic structure in Table 8), while 6:12-25 introduces the themes of the second section. Moreover, 6:9-11 prepares for the speech of King Solomon in the second section, while 6:21 is a deliberate echo of 1:1 and 6:1 and points back to the first section (*Introducing the Apocrypha*, 130).

Table 8. Literary structure of Wisdom of Solomon

<p>I. Book of Eschatology (1:1-6:21)^a</p> <p>A Addressed to rulers, enjoining pursuit of wisdom (1:1-15)</p> <p>B Speech of the ungodly (1:16-2:24)</p> <p>a. Introduction to the speech of the wicked (1:16-2:1a)</p> <p>b. Speech of the wicked: an analysis (2:1b-20)</p> <p>c. Conclusion to the speech of the wicked (2:21-24)</p> <p><i>C Contrasts between the just and the impious (3:1-4:20)</i></p> <p><i>First diptych: The just/the wicked (3:1-12)</i></p> <p>Second diptych: Sterile woman/the eunuch vs. generation of the wicked (3:13-19)</p> <p>Third diptych: Praise of virtue vs. useless fruit of the wicked (4:1-6)</p> <p>Fourth diptych: Premature death of the just youth vs. the wicked (4:7-20)</p> <p>B' Speech of the ungodly (5:1-23)</p> <p>a. Introduction of the scene of judgment (5:1-3)</p> <p>b. Speech of the impious – confesses guilt (5:4-13 [14])</p> <p>c. Conclusion of the scene of judgment (5:[14]15-23)</p> <p>A' Addressed to rulers, enjoining pursuit of wisdom (6:1-21)</p> <p>Kings are exhorted to understand and to learn (6:1-8)</p> <p>The positive motives for learning wisdom (6:9-21)</p>	<p>II. Praise of Wisdom (6:1-10:21)^b</p> <p>A. Kings should seek wisdom (6:1-11)</p> <p>B. Description of wisdom (6:12-25)</p> <p>C. How to obtain wisdom (7:1-22a)</p> <p>D. The nature of wisdom (7:22b-8:1)</p> <p>E. The search for wisdom with her benefits (8:2-16)</p> <p>F. The prayer for wisdom (8:17-9:18)</p>	<p>^aThis chiastic structure of the first section is suggested by Michael Kolarcik, <i>The Ambiguity of Death in the Book of Wisdom 1-6: A Study of Literary Structure and Interpretation</i>, AnBib 127 (Roma: Pontificio Istituto Biblico, 1991), 62 and is combined with the outline in deSilva, <i>Introducing the Apocrypha</i>, 130.</p> <p>^bThe second and third sections are taken from Harrington, <i>Invitation to the Apocrypha</i>, 63-75, with a few modifications.</p>
---	---	---

Table 8 – Continued

III. Homiletic Exposition of Biblical History (10:1-19:22)	
A. Role of wisdom in Israel's early history (10:1-21)	
B1. <u>Seven</u> antitheses associated with the Exodus (11:1-14; 16:1-19:22) ^c	
First: Water/thirst (11:1-14)	
C. Theological reflection on God's justice and mercy (11:15-12:27)	
a. Punishment of the wicked (11:15-20)	
b. God is powerful and merciful (11:21-12:2)	
c. Sins of the Canaanites (12:3-11)	
d. Sovereignty and mercy of God (12:12-18)	
e. God's lessons for Israel (12:19-22)	
f. Punishment of the Egyptians (12:23-27)	
D. Excursus on idolatry (13:1-15:19)	
a. Nature worship (13:1-9)	
b. Foolishness of idolatry (13:10-4:11)	
c. Origin and Evils of idolatry (14:12-31)	
d. Worship of God vs. idolatry (15:1-19)	
B2. Second: Animals/suffering (16:1-4)	
Third: Plagues – God has power over life and death (16:5-14)	
Fourth: Curse/blessing from heaven (16:15-29)	
Fifth: Darkness/light (17:1-18:4)	
Sixth: Death (18:5-25)	
Seventh: Red Sea (19:1-22)	
E. Concluding observation (19:22)	
^c These seven antitheses are based on the principle stated in Wisdom 11:5, "For through the very things by which their enemies were punished, they themselves received benefit in their need" (this principle reiterated in 11:16).	

functions as a bridge chapter, but between the second section (Wis 6-9) and the third section (Wis 11-19) of the structure. It begins by expanding on Wisdom 9:18, giving examples of people who were saved by wisdom. By the beginning of Wisdom 11, the composition has moved naturally "from speaking about Wisdom's acts in the third person to adopting the form of a confession of God's work in the second person."⁵²

⁵²Ibid.

To gain a proper understanding of this crucial passage, it is important to view it in its literary context. As has already be noted, it is located in the middle of the chiastic structure (C) of the first section of the book (Table 8 and Table 9), enveloped by two speeches of the ungodly (B - B'), which parallel each other in a chiastic way. Both speeches have an introduction (B-a/B'-a') and a conclusion reflecting upon the reasoning of the speech (B-c/B'-c'). The first speech reveals the “perception on life” held by the wicked (Wis 2, B-b) while in the second speech they recognize their flawed thinking and admit that the righteous were indeed right in their ways (Wis 5, B'-b') and are truly the children of God (Wis 2:13, 17-18 vs. 5:5). The core assumption affecting their “perception on life” is the fatalistic view that death is the ultimate end for everyone: “For our allotted time is the passing of a shadow, and there is no return from our death because it is sealed up and no one turns back” (Wis 2:5, NRSV).

Table 9. The chiastic structure of the Book of Eschatology

A Exhortation to righteousness (1:1-15)				A' Seek Wisdom (6:1-21)			
B-a Introduction (1:16-2:1a)				B'-a' Introduction (5:1-3)			
B-b1	2:1b-5					5:9-13	B'-b1'
		B-b2	2:6-11			5:6-8	B'-b2'
			B-b3	2:12-20	5:4-5	B'-b3'	
B-c Concluding remark (2:21-24)				B'-c' Concluding remark (5:14-23)			

It is the central message of the chiastic structure (C) which makes the change in the wickeds' attitude towards the righteous and changes their perception. It reveals that death is not the end of life. As such, the reasoning of the wicked was based merely on present appearance while the reasoning of the righteous was shown to be correct since theirs was based on the hope of a future reality. However, in the composition, this revelation comes a little too late since it happens during the final judgment at the end of days. At that point it is too late for the wicked to change their ways to avoid the judgment and to gain the reward given to the righteous. Nevertheless, it is not too late for the reader of the book to change her/her ways or to continue on the way of righteousness.

This is the framing message of the opening and concluding units (A-A') of the chiastic structure addressed to kings and rulers (Wis 1:1-15 and 6:1-21). The reader is encouraged to seek God and love righteousness (Wis 1:1-2; 6:1) so that His wisdom will dwell in them (Wis 1:4-5; 6:16). It also reveals that righteousness is immortality (Wis 1:15) and that every human being will be held accountable for their deeds (Wis 1:6-11; 6:1-11). The relationship between wisdom, God, good deeds, and immortality is nicely united in the concluding summary (Wis 6:18-20):

The beginning of **wisdom** is the most sincere desire for instruction,
 and concern for instruction is **love of her**,
 and love for her is the keeping of her laws,
 and giving heed to her laws is **assurance of immortality**,
 and immortality brings one near to God;
 so the desire for wisdom **leads to a kingdom** (my emphasis added).

Death, on the other hand, was not a part of God's original creative work (Wis 1:13-14) but entered God's creation due to the deeds of the wicked (Wis 1:12) and the envy of the

devil (Wis 2:24). Accordingly, life and death is based on God's evaluation of a person's character and by which power one is associated (Wis 2:24 vs. 3:1). The reward for a righteous life is immortality while death is given to the wicked.⁵³

The first six chapters of Wisdom of Solomon describes an interesting journey for the righteous: the righteous' world-view is questioned by the wicked => they are persecuted and martyred by the wicked => they are vindicated by God => they will judge the wicked => the wicked will have to admit that their world-view was wrong. With this background in mind, this study will turn to the key passage of Wisdom 3:1-13a, the turning point of the chiasmic structure.

Wisdom of Solomon 3:1-13a

The turning point of the chiasmic structure reveals that the wicked were wrong in their assumption that death is the ultimate end for everyone and counters: "But the souls of the righteous [δικαίων δὲ ψυχὰι] are in the hand of God, and no torment will ever touch them" (Wis 3:1). The contrast could not be made clearer. The wicked did not have any hope for a future (Wis 2:1-5) while the righteous considered themselves a child of God (Wis 2:13) and hoped for immortality (Wis 2:16; 3:4). The wicked believed that since the God of the righteous did not protect "His children" from their torturous hands and let them die (Wis 2:17-20), it proved that the righteous were wrong in their claim and hope in immortality. However, the wicked "did not know the secret purpose of God, nor . . . the wages of holiness, nor . . . the prize for blameless souls" (Wis 2:22). They thought

⁵³For further study into the literary structure of the first section of the Wisdom of Solomon, see: Kolarick, *The Ambiguity of Death in the Book of Wisdom 1-6*, 29-62.

the righteous were dead and that they were right in not believing in life after death.

However, the author reveals that the righteous were only seemingly dead. In reality, they were protected by God and would still receive the hoped for immortality (Wis 3:1-4).

Nickelsburg notes that “it is commonly observed that the Wisdom of Solomon teaches immortality of the soul rather than resurrection of the body” and, as such, no bodily resurrection is required for the posthumous judgment since the soul continues to live separately from the body and can be judged by itself.⁵⁴ In contrast, Wright argues that ‘immortality’ and ‘resurrection’ beliefs are not necessarily mutually exclusive since it all depends on how ‘immortality’ is understood.⁵⁵ The word ‘immortality’ by itself “simply means ‘a state in which death is not possible’. . . [resurrection being] one form or type of ‘immortality.’” He reasons that a resurrection belief also needs to take into consideration the period between “physical death” and “the physical re-embodiment of resurrection,” adding that it would be natural to believe “in an intermediate state in which some kind of

⁵⁴Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 113. See e.g. Marie-Emile Boismard, *Our Victory Over Death: Resurrection?* (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1999), 77; Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*, 182-187; N. Gillman, *The Death of Death: Resurrection and Immortality in Jewish Thought* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights, 1997), 108-112; Lester L. Grabbe, *Wisdom of Solomon* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1997), 52; William Horbury, “The Wisdom of Solomon,” in *The Oxford Bible Commentary*, eds. J. Barton and J. Muddiman (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 650-656; C. Larcher, *Études sur le livre de la Sagesse*, Ebib (Paris: Gabalda, 1969), 237-327; Robert H. Pfeiffer, *History of New Testament Times with an Introduction to the Apochrypha* (New York: Harper, 1949), 336-340; James M. Reese, *Hellenistic Influence on the Book of Wisdom and Its Consequences*, AnBib 41 (Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1970), 62-71, 109f.; James C. VanderKam, *An Introduction to Early Judaism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001), 125.

⁵⁵Wright suggests four senses of immortality. First, immortality could refer to a continuous physical life which is uninterrupted by any form of death. Second, immortality could refer to an immortal “soul,” which will go on living autonomously after bodily death. Third, immortality could refer to the gift of ongoing life bestowed by God upon a righteous person, something which is “not itself innate in the human make-up, which could then provide the human continuity, across an interim period, between the present bodily life and the future resurrection.” Forth, immortality could be used to describe resurrection itself (Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 92).

personal identity was guaranteed.”⁵⁶ This is the sense of immortality presented in Wisdom 3:1-10.

Wright makes a strong case that “Wisdom 3.1-10 offers a two-stage description of what happens after the death of the ‘righteous’: a story in which the present existence ‘in the hand of God’ [Wis 3:1-4] is merely the prelude to what is about to happen [in Wis 3:7-10]” . . . “a further event which follows upon the state described in verses 1-4” (see Table 10).⁵⁷ His case is based on the key phrase, ἡ ἐλπίς αὐτῶν ἀθανασίας πλήρης, their hope is full of immortality (Wis 3:4b), which suggests that they have not yet received the hoped for immortality. As mentioned earlier, although “God created us for incorruption, and made us in the image of his own eternity” (Wis 2:22-23), immortality is no longer a given and as such is not inherent in a person, but is the reward given to a person by God (Wis 1:15; 6:17-20) whom he has tested and deemed just (Wis 3:5-6).

Wisdom 3:5-6 is introduced by an aorist passive participle (παυθευθέντες), reflecting on the hardship the righteous suffered by the hand of the wicked (Wis 2:12-20) while still living in their earthly bodies. The great secret which the wicked did not know (Wis 2:22; 4:17) was that their persecution of the righteous functioned as God’s testing tool, and that the martyrdom of the righteous was accepted like an atoning sacrifice (Wis

⁵⁶Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 164. He notes that there are also other scholars who see the resurrection belief in the Wisdom of Solomon, e.g. Maurice Gilbert, “Immortalité? Résurrection? Faut-il choisir?” In *Le Judaïsme à l’aube de l’ère chrétienne: XVIII^e congrès de l’association catholique française pour l’étude de la bible* (Lyon, Septembre 1999) (Paris: Cerf., 1999), 282-287; É. Puech, *La croyance des Esséniens en la vie future: immortalité, résurrection, vie éternelle? Histoire d’une croyance dans le Judaïsme ancien. 2 vols.* Paris: Cerf., 1993), 92-98, 306. See also the bibliography of Pfeiffer, *History of New Testament Times*, 339, n. 15; Larcher, *Études sur le livre de la Sagesse*, 321-327.

⁵⁷Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*, 167.

Table 10. Two phases of life after death

	Verses	LXT/LXX	NRSV
R I G H T E O U S	P H A S E	1-4 ¹ δικαίων δὲ ψυχὰι ἐν χειρὶ θεοῦ καὶ οὐ μὴ ἄψηται αὐτῶν βάσανος ² ἔδοξαν ἐν ὀφθαλμοῖς ἀφρόνων τεθνάναι καὶ ἐλογίσθη κάκωσις ἡ ἔξοδος αὐτῶν ³ καὶ ἡ ἀφ' ἡμῶν πορεία σύντριμμα οἱ δὲ εἰσιν ἐν εἰρήνῃ 1 ⁴ καὶ γὰρ ἐν ὅψει ἀνθρώπων ἐὰν κολασθῶσιν ἡ ἐλπίς αὐτῶν ἀθανασίας πλήρης	¹ But the souls of the righteous are in the hand of God, and no torment will ever touch them. ² In the eyes of the foolish they seemed to have died, and their departure was thought to be a disaster [Wis 4:17; 5:4; Luke 9:31], ³ and their going from us to be their destruction; but they are at peace. ⁴ For though in the sight of others they were punished, their hope is full of immortality [Rom 8:24; 2 Cor 5:1].
	E X P L E N A T I O N	5-6 ⁵ καὶ ὀλίγα παιδευθέντες μεγάλα εὐεργετηθήσονται ὅτι ὁ θεὸς ἐπείρασεν αὐτοὺς καὶ εὗρεν αὐτοὺς ἀξίους ἑαυτοῦ ⁶ ὥς χρυσὸν ἐν χωνευτηρίῳ ἐδοκίμασεν αὐτοὺς καὶ ὥς ὀλοκάρπωμα θυσίας προσεδέξατο αὐτοὺς	⁵ Having been disciplined a little, they will receive great good, because God tested them and found them worthy of himself [Exod 15:25; Heb 12:11]; ⁶ like gold in the furnace he tried them, and like a sacrificial burnt offering he accepted them [Prov 17:3; 2 Esd 16:73; Rom 12:1; 1 Pet 1:7].
	P H A S E 2	7-9 ⁷ καὶ ἐν καιρῷ ἐπισκοπῆς αὐτῶν ἀναλάμψουσιν καὶ ὥς σπινθήρες ἐν καλάμῃ διαδραμοῦνται ⁸ κρινοῦσιν ἔθνη καὶ κρατήσουσιν λαῶν καὶ βασιλεύσει αὐτῶν κύριος εἰς τοὺς αἰῶνας ⁹ οἱ πεποιθότες ἐπ' αὐτῷ συνήσουσιν ἀλήθειαν καὶ οἱ πιστοὶ ἐν ἀγάπῃ προσμενοῦσιν αὐτῷ ὅτι χάρις καὶ ἔλεος τοῖς ἐκλεκτοῖς αὐτοῦ	⁷ In the time of their visitation they will shine forth [Dan 12:3; Matt 13:43], and will run like sparks through the stubble [Isa 5:24; Obad 18]. ⁸ They will govern nations and rule over peoples, and the Lord will reign over them forever [Dan 7:18, 22; Sir 4:15; 1QpHab 5,4; 1 Cor 6:2-3]. ⁹ Those who trust in him will understand truth, and the faithful will abide with him in love, because grace and mercy are upon his holy ones, and he watches over his elect [Wis 2:20; 4:15; John 15:10].

Table 10 – Continued

W I C K E D	D E S T I N Y	10-13a	<p>¹⁰οἱ δὲ ἀσεβεῖς καθὰ ἐλογίσαντο ἔξουσιν ἐπιτιμίαν οἱ ἀμελήσαντες τοῦ δικαίου καὶ τοῦ κυρίου ἀποστάντες</p> <p>¹¹σοφίαν γὰρ καὶ παιδείαν ὁ ἐξουθενῶν ταλαίπωρος καὶ κενὴ ἡ ἐλπίς αὐτῶν καὶ οἱ κόποι ἀνόνητοι καὶ ἄχρηστα τὰ ἔργα αὐτῶν</p> <p>¹²αἱ γυναῖκες αὐτῶν ἄφρονες καὶ πονηρὰ τὰ τέκνα αὐτῶν ἐπικατάρατος ἡ γένεσις αὐτῶν</p>	<p>¹⁰But the ungodly will be punished as their reasoning deserves, those who disregarded the righteous and rebelled against the Lord [Prov 1:24-31];</p> <p>¹¹for those who despise wisdom and instruction are miserable. Their hope is vain, their labors are unprofitable, and their works are useless.</p> <p>¹²Their wives are foolish, and their children evil [Sir 41:5];</p> <p>¹³their offspring are accursed [Isa 54:1; Wis 12:11].</p>

3:6).⁵⁸ The wicked thought that they had proven the righteous wrong when the righteous died and viewed the destruction as a punishment (Wis 3:1-4a), but they had been blinded by their wickedness (Wis 2:21). In reality, it was the willingness of the righteous to suffer and die for God's law which made them into children of the Lord, παῖδα κυρίου/υἱὸς θεοῦ/υἱοῖς θεοῦ (Wis 2:13, 17-18; 5:5). This is why they are currently resting in their hope for immortality (Wis 3:4b).

Wisdom 3:7 introduces the second phase by the phrase, ἐν καιρῷ ἐπισκοπῆς, *in the time of visitation*. The noun ἐπισκοπή, *visitation*, appears several times throughout the book (Wis 2:2; 3:13; 4:15; 14:11; 19:15) all of which refer to the day of judgment when God will set things right by condemning the wicked and rewarding the righteous.⁵⁹ Wright remarks that it becomes apparent that this second phase introduces new aspects,

⁵⁸This understanding was also voiced by the seven brothers in Maccabees 7.

⁵⁹This noun has the same word range in the LXX (e.g. Jer 6:15; 10:15) and NT (e.g. Luke 19:44; 1 Pet 2:12).

something different than what has been described in the first phase (Wis 3:1-4). From resting in the hope of immortality (v. 4b) they will now shine forth (ἀναλάμψουσιν, future tense)⁶⁰ – alluding to Daniel 12:3 which describes the wise who will shine at the time of the resurrection (ἐκλάμψουσιν) – and will run like sparks through the stubble, a possible reference to the judgment scene in Isa 5:24 and Obad 18. This, according to Wright, prepares the reader for the judgment scene in the remaining part of the passage (Wis 3:9-13a).

Wisdom 3:7-13a describes the new reality, that the righteous will govern nations and rule over peoples (v. 7a), alluding to the role given to the holy ones of the Most High in Daniel’s eschatological vision (Dan 7:18, 22). The Wisdom of Solomon expands on this reversal of events by noting that “the righteous who have died will condemn the ungodly who are living” (Wis 4:16), “the righteous will stand with great confidence in the presence of those who have oppressed them” (Wis 5:1) and “will receive a glorious crown and a beautiful diadem from the hand of the Lord” (Wis 5:15).

The wicked, on the other hand, will acknowledge their mistake (Wis 5), be judged by God and the righteous (Wis 3:10-3; 4:16), and are “punished as their reasoning deserves” (Wis 3:10), suggesting that they, like the righteous, are also going to be proven right in their assumption. However, instead of allaying themselves with life-giving righteousness, they made a covenant with death, assuming that:

⁶⁰Wright points out that ἀναλάμπω, is a rare word which means “shine forth” (like shining of the sun) but can also have a metaphorical meaning of “‘flame up’, as of envy, or ‘blaze up’ with enthusiasm.” Interestingly, in classical Greek, “Plutarch uses it of Brutus’ ‘reviving,’ ‘coming to himself’” (*Resurrection of the Son of God*, 169-170). The classical Greek case seems to be most fitting in our context, functioning as a synonym for resurrection at the time of judgment when they, like the “wise” of Daniel, will be vindicated and receive their immortality and kingdom (Wis 3:8 || Dan 7:18, 22).

there is no remedy when a life comes to its end . . . [and that the hereafter] shall be as though we had never been, for the breath in our nostrils is smoke, and reason is a spark kindled by the beating of our hearts; when it is extinguished, the body will turn to ashes, and the spirit will dissolve like empty air. Our name will be forgotten in time, and no one will remember our works; our life will pass away like the traces of a cloud, and be scattered like mist that is chased by the rays of the sun and overcome by its heat. For our allotted time is the passing of a shadow, and there is no return from our death, because it is sealed up and no one turns back (Wis 2:1-5).

Nickelsburg remarks that the chronology of C-B' is not quite clear and it is therefore difficult to determine if the wicked will experience a single judgment or a double judgment (like the righteous), the first by God (to determine which category they would fall into – wicked or righteous – suggested by Wis 3:13, 18; 4:6) and a second by the righteous in the eschatological judgment (suggested by Wis 5:17-23).⁶¹ This would also require a resurrection of the wicked, but this resurrection is for judgment and damnation. Regardless, after the wicked have been condemned by the righteous at the close of the judgment, “they will become dishonored corpses, and a outrage among the dead forever” (Wis 4:18).

The author of Wisdom of Solomon seems to have based his eschatological understanding of life after death on a close reading and interpretation of Daniel 7 and 12. Daniel 12:1 refer to a time of great tribulations “such has never has occurred since nations came into being” (CSB), paralleling the great persecution of the righteous suffered by the hand of the wicked (Wis 2). However, God will protect his people who are written in the book (Dan 12:1) in the same way as he will protect his children (Wis 3:1). Daniel 12:2 refers to the resurrection to eternal life (for the righteous) and to shame and eternal

⁶¹Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 114-115.

contempt (for the wicked), paralleling the resurrection of the righteous (Wis 3:7; 4:16; 5:1) and a possible resurrection of the wicked at the second judgment (Wis 5:17-23) to become “dishonored corpses and an outrage among the dead forever” (Wis 4:18). The reference in Daniel 12:3 to the wise who will shine finds its parallel in Wisdom 3:7, when the righteous will shine forth – resurrect. At this point, the author of Wisdom interpolates the eschatological judgment scene from Daniel 7 into his composition (Wis 3:8) to reveal that the righteous will receive God’s kingdom (Dan 7:18, 22 || Wis 3:) and expands that as rulers they will also judge the wicked (4:16; 5:15-16). The author concludes the passage by focusing on the destiny of the wicked (Wis 3:10-13a). It should be noted that Wisdom 3:5-6, the intermediate period between the righteous death and later bodily resurrection, could have been extrapolated from the concluding words of the book of Daniel which states: “But as for you [Daniel], go on your way to the end; you will rest [die], then rise [resurrect] to your destiny [of the righteous, the wise] at the end of the day” (Dan 12:13, CSB) referring to the event of Daniel 12:2-3.

Although Daniel 12:1-3 may not be clear on whether it describes an universal resurrection or a limited resurrection for only some (the wise and the most wicked), it leaves little doubt that all the people who are written in the book will partake in the resurrection of the righteous. The same is the case in the book of Wisdom. An argument could be made that the righteous described in Wisdom 3 are those who suffered martyrdom in Wisdom 2 and that their persecutors are the wicked. However, the message of the book is clear - that whoever loves righteousness (Wis 1:1-2), pursues wisdom, and observes God’s law would gain immortality (Wis 1:15; 6:17-20). Death, on the other

hand, only entered the world due to the devil's envy (Wis 2:24) and wicked deeds (Wis 2 and 5). As such, it would be reasonable to conclude that the resurrection described in Wisdom 3 would at least include all the righteous, whether or not they died as a martyr.

It is interesting to note the strong links observed by deSilva between the Servant Song of Isaiah 52-53 and the eschatological section of Wisdom 2-4 (Table 11),⁶² since the previous discussion on the resurrection in 2 Maccabees 7, also contained parallels to the Servant Song (see discussion above). However, deSilva remarks the lack of the sacrificial death of the righteous on behalf of the people⁶³ which was so crucial to understand also the universalistic and individualistic function of martyrdom in 2 Maccabees 7:37-38, which profited both the people of Israel and the individual martyr. In Wisdom, the martyrdom only carries an individualistic function, only profiting the martyr (Wis 3:5-6), guaranteeing their eternal life.

Table 11. Parallels between Isaiah 52-53 and Wisdom 2-4

Isaiah 52-53	Wisdom 2-4	Theme
53:2	2:12, 16, 18	The righteous is described as a child of God
53:7-9	2:19-20	The righteous suffers heroically
53:4, 11-12 52:13-15	2:2-3 5:1-2	The wicked perceived the death of the righteous as dishonorable
53:6	5:4-6	The wicked confess that they were wrong
54:1	3:13	Undefined barren woman
56:4-5	3:14-4:15	The righteous eunuch

⁶²deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 138.

⁶³Ibid.

Concluding Remarks

Wisdom of Solomon presents a belief in a bodily resurrection which also addresses the intermediate period between the death of the righteous and his/her resurrection (Wis 3:1-4, 7-9). In the book, immortality is attained through wisdom and righteousness (6:17-20) and is therefore not innate in a preexistent soul as it is in Platonic immortality. As such, a wicked person will not experience immortality in which he/she will be tormented in Hell, instead his/her destiny will be as he/she had already assumed – non-existence (Wis 2; 5). Wisdom of Solomon, however, does not reveal the nature of existence while the soul is in God's hands (Wis 3:1), if the soul is conscious or unconscious – merely being stored for safekeeping until the day of resurrection (Wis 3:7). The text is not very clear either when it comes to chronology, i.e. if the wicked will also experience a dual-judgment which would entitle them to a resurrection, but one resulting in damnation. The references and allusions to the eschatological passages of Daniel 7 and 12 seems to support the latter. Additionally, it also lends scriptural support for the concept of an intermediate period between death and resurrection (Wis 3:1-4 || Dan 12:2-3, 13), judgment of the wicked and righteous (Wis 3:5-6, 13, 18; 4:6; 5:17-23 || Dan 7:18, 22), and the reward of taking possession of the kingdom (Wis 5:15-16 || Dan 7:18, 22). Finally, Wisdom of Solomon adds that the righteous will judge the wicked (Wis 4:16). Figure 3 illustrates the death and resurrection concept presented in the book.

Fig. 3. Death and Resurrection in Wisdom of Solomon

2 Esdras

2 Esdras, the title used in the English Apocrypha, is an apocalyptic book⁶⁴ consisting of three separate compositions which has added to the confusion surrounding the terminology of the books associated with Ezra (see Table 12).⁶⁵ The longest section of 2 Esdras (chapters 3-14), also known as 4 Ezra, is the oldest and was probably composed in Hebrew/Aramaic in the late first century by a Palestinian Jew.⁶⁶ Written about three

⁶⁴John Collins, representing the Apocalypse group of the Society of Biblical Literature, gives the following definition of the apocalyptic genre: “‘Apocalypse’ is a genre of revelatory literature with a narrative framework, in which a revelation is mediated by an otherworldly being to a human recipient, disclosing a transcendent reality which is both temporal, insofar as it envisages eschatological salvation, and spatial, insofar as it involves another, supernatural world” (John J. Collins, “Introduction: The Morphology of a Genre,” *Semeia* 14 [1979]: 9). This genre can be further divided into historical and mystical apocalypse, “between apocalypse which do not have an otherworldly journey and those that do” (13), 2 Esdras would fall into the first category which includes “less than half of the corpus of Jewish apocalypses” (John J. Collins, “The Jewish Apocalypses,” *Semeia* 14 [1979]: 23). For a categorization of the Jewish apocalypses, see Table 18. In this table, Collins makes a crucial observation, noting that apocalyptic literature is “clearly envisaging retribution beyond death” (Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination*, 6). This is also the case in 4 Ezra, in which the judgment follows the bodily resurrection.

⁶⁵Ezra is often counted among the most important characters in the TaNaKh, second only to Moses, due to the central role he played in rebuilding the Jewish nation after the Babylonian captivity. He has also been given a major role in the final compilation of the TaNaKh (e.g. David Weiss Halivni, *Revelation Restored: Divine Writ and Critical Responses*, Radical Tradition [Boulder, CO:Westview Press, 1997]). 2 Esdras goes as far as claiming that Ezra restored all the Scriptures which had been lost due to the Babylonian exile: “Make public the twenty-four books that you wrote first [TaNaKh], and let the worthy and the unworthy read them; but keep the seventy that were written last [Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha], in order to give them to the wise among your people. For in them is the spring of understanding, the fountain of wisdom, and the river of knowledge” (2 Esd 14:45-47). Several pseudepigraphical works have been attributed to him and many of them are dependent on 4 Ezra (2 Esd 3-14): *1 Esdras* and *2 Esdras* (see Table 12), *Greek Apocalypse of Ezra*, *Vision of the Blessed Ezra*, *Apocalypse of Sedrach*, *Questions of Ezra*, and *Revelation of Ezra*. Some of these books will be considered when looking at resurrection passages in the Pseudepigraphical books (see Table 49, Appendix A).

⁶⁶It is generally accepted that the book was originally composed in Hebrew/Aramaic before it was translated into Greek and later Latin and Syriac (there are also an Arabic, Ethiopic, and Armenian version of the book and fragments of a Georgian and Coptic version), although both the Hebrew and the Greek works are now lost (John J. Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination: An Introduction to Jewish Apocalyptic Literature*, 2nd ed., The Biblical Resource Series [Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998], 195-196; deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 329-330; B. M. Metzger, “The Fourth Book of Ezra,” in *OTP*, 1:519-520; Jacob M. Myers, *1 and 2 Esdras*, AB 42 [Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1974], 115-119; Michael E. Stone, *Fourth Ezra: A Commentary on the Book of Fourth Ezra*, Hermeneia [Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990], 1-9).

decades⁶⁷ after the failed Jewish revolt which resulted in the destruction of the Second Temple, the writer addresses the problem of theodicy. He notes that the observable world does not fit with the Jewish world view which adheres to the deuteronomistic principle, God's justice, and Israel's election. Only by viewing the devastating events of his days through apocalyptic eyes, was he able to "reaffirm the observance of the Torah as the path to life and salvation."⁶⁸

Table 12. Titles given to books associated with Ezra

Date	Hebrew Bible	Septuagint	Vulgate	English w/Apocrypha
c. 400 BCE	Ezra-Nehemiah	2 Esdras	1 Esdras 2 Esdras	Book of Ezra Book of Nehemiah
2 nd Cent. BCE 1 st -3 rd Cent. CE		1 Esdras —	3 Esdras 4 Esdras	1 Esdras 2 Esdras
1 Ezra Ezra-Nehemiah of the Hebrew Bible 2 Ezra/5 Ezra 4 Esdras (Vulgate) = 2 Esdras (English Apocrypha) chaps. 1-2 3 Ezra 1 Esdras (Septuagint) = 3 Esdras (Vulgate) = 1 Esdras (English Apocrypha) 4 Ezra 4 Esdras (Vulgate) = 2 Esdras (English Apocrypha) chaps. 3-14 5 Ezra/6 Ezra 4 Esdras (Vulgate) = 2 Esdras (English Apocrypha) chaps. 15-16				
^a This table is based on Harold W. Attridge, "Historiography," in <i>JWSTP</i> , 158, n.1.				

The prologue and epilogue of 2 Esdras, chapters 1-2 and 15-16, also known as 2 Ezra/5Ezra and 5 Ezra/6 Ezra (see Table 12), are two Christian texts, originally written in Greek, which were probably added to the Jewish composition in the mid-second century

⁶⁷Based on the date given in 2 Esdras 3:1, assuming that the author addressed the theological issues deriving from the destruction of the Second Temple by referring to the destruction of the first Temple, centuries earlier by the Babylonians. If this assumption is correct, "the thirtieth year after the destruction of the city" would place the book at the turn of the second century CE. Meyer believes that this date also seems to be supported by the "Eagle Vision" (2 Esdras 11-12), which addresses the events of the Vespasian-Domitianic period, 69-96 CE (deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 330-332; Metzger, "The Fourth Book of Ezra," 520; Bruce W. Longenecker, *2 Esdras* [Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1995], 13-16; Myers, *1 and 2 Esdras*, 129; Stone, *Fourth Ezra*, 9-10).

⁶⁸deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 323-324.

and the mid-third century respectively.⁶⁹ The prologue provides a Jewish-Christian response to the cataclysmic events of the second Jewish revolt (the Bar Kochba revolt) in 135 CE – the persecutions of the Jews and the destruction of Jerusalem – by promoting a replacement theology. The Christian writer proposes that God has rejected the Jewish people and replaced them with a new people who are willing to adhere to the covenant (2 Esd 1:24-27, 33-40; 2:10-14). The epilogue provides a renewed conclusion to the Jewish apocalypse, to update and make the whole composition more relevant for the Christian community.⁷⁰ According to deSilva, the appendix was to “encourage the Christians to persevere in their loyalty to God . . . [making it clear that although] renunciation of God and the Messiah could lead to relief in this life,” it would not be an advisable course of action since only the faithful will be delivered on the day of tribulations.⁷¹

Table 13 gives a suggested outline of 2 Esdras, showing the Christian prologue (chapters 1-2), epilogue (chapters 15-16), and the Jewish Ezra apocalypse (chapters 3-14).⁷² The Jewish composition consist of seven parts: the first three (parts 1-3) record the dialogue between Ezra and Uriel, the second set of three (parts 4-6) contain three prophetic visions with interpretations, and the final section (part 7) contains a record of God’s commission of Ezra and a description of his work as a restorer of Scriptures – a

⁶⁹Ibid., 347-351; Harrington, *Invitation to the Apocrypha*, 185.

⁷⁰Longenecker, *2 Esdras*, 110-120.

⁷¹deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 350-351.

⁷²For a more detailed structure of the book, see Stone, *Fourth Ezra*, 50-51.

new Moses.⁷³ The first half of the composition is spurred by Ezra's grave doubts regarding the question of theodicy (similar to the book of Job), since he has lost confidence in God's justice and the value or even the possibility of upholding the law/covenant. In this sense, Ezra focuses on present and observable reality while Uriel and God, although not addressing Ezra's questions and concerns directly, expose him to a much larger perspective by introducing the eschatological future and help him see the issues from God's perspective.

The fourth part of the composition (2 Esd 9:26-10:59), the Mourning Woman vision (the first vision), reveals that Ezra has internalized God's perspective when he tries to comfort the weeping woman which turns out to be a symbolic representation of Zion (2 Esd 10:41-50). The key element of Ezra's words of comfort is his strong belief in the resurrection: "For if you acknowledge the decree of God to be just, you will receive your son back in due time, and will be praised among women" (2 Esd 10:16). This summarizes the divine argument and the greater perspective presented in the book, that God is just and His covenant is still relevant since there will be a resurrection when all the wrongs will be put right. With this new perspective, Ezra is ready to receive the vision of the second half of the book.

⁷³This seven-part structural pattern is, according to Collins, also found in 2 Baruch and the book of Revelation in the New Testament, both contemporary apocalyptic books (Collins, "Jewish Apocalypse," 33).

Table 13. Literary structure of 2 Esdras

<p>I. Christian Introduction (1-2)</p> <p>Introduction (1:1-11)</p> <p>God's mercies to Israel (1:12-23)</p> <p>Israel's disobedience and rejection (1:24-40)</p> <p>God's judgment of Israel (2:1-14)</p> <p>Exhortation to good work (2:15-32)</p> <p>Ezra on Mount Horeb (2:33-41)</p> <p>Ezra sees the Son of God (2:42-48)</p>
<p>II. The Ezra Apocalypse (3-14)</p> <p>1. First Dialogue (3:1-5:19)</p> <p>a. Introduction (3:1-3)</p> <p>b. Before Ezra's address (3:4-36)</p> <p>c. Dialogue between Uriel and Ezra (4:1-25)</p> <p>d. Ezra's questions about the future (4:26-52)</p> <p>e. The signs (5:1-20)</p> <p>2. Second Dialogue (5:21-6:34)</p> <p>a. Introduction (5:21-22)</p> <p>b. Before Ezra's address (5:23-30)</p> <p>c. Dialogue between Uriel and Ezra (5:31-40)</p> <p>d. Ezra's question about the future (5:41-6:10)</p> <p>e. The signs (6:11-34)</p> <p>3. Third Dialogue (6:35-9:25)</p> <p>a. Introduction (6:35-37)</p> <p>b. Ezra's address (6:38-59)</p> <p>c1. Dialogue between Uriel and Ezra (7:1-25)</p> <div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 2px;"> <p>God's prediction (7:26-44)</p> <p>Dialogue between God and Ezra (7:45-74)</p> <p>Prediction (7:75-115)</p> </div> <p>c2. Dialogue between Ezra and Uriel (7:116-8:3)</p> <div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 2px;"> <p>Ezra's prayers (8:4-36)</p> </div> <p>d. Ezra's questions about the future (8:37-62a)</p> <p>e. The signs (8:62b-9:25)</p> <p>4. Mourning Woman Vision (9:26-10:59)</p> <p>1. Ezra's address (9:26-37)</p> <p>2. Ezra's vision of the mourning woman (9:38-10:28)</p> <p>3. Interpretation (10:29-59)</p> <p>5. Eagle and Lion Vision (10:60-12:51)</p> <p>1.</p> <p>2. Ezra's dream (11:1-12:3a)</p> <p>3. Interpretation (12:3b-51)</p> <p>6. Man from the Sea Vision (13:1-58)</p> <p>1.</p> <p>2. Ezra's dream (13:1-13a)</p> <p>3. Interpretation (13:13b-58)</p> <p>7. Ezra the Scribe (14:1-51)</p> <p>God's final instruction to Ezra Moses (14:1-18)</p> <p>Ezra's work as a Scribe (14:19-48)</p>

Table 13 – Continued

III. Christian Conclusion (15-16)
Vengeance on the wicked (15:1-27)
God's judgment of the nations (15:28-16:17)
Horror of the Last Days (16:18-34)
God's people must prepare for the end (16:35-50)
Power and wisdom of God (16:51-67)
Impending persecution of God's people (16:68-73)
Promise of Divine deliverance (16:74-78)

Michael Stone observes that the three symbolic visions (parts 4-6) provide the answers to the questions raised by Ezra in the dialogues of the first half of the book. The visions, he adds, function in a similar way as the short revelations at the end of each dialogue in that they open “the path to the resolution of the issues raised in” them. He concludes: “It follows from this, and it is notable, that the questions asked, apparently in the form of learned dialogue, are answered by the revelatory symbolic visions.”⁷⁴

The highlighted sections of the literary structure of 2 Esdras illustrate how prevalent and integrated the resurrection belief (implied and stated) is in the book (see Table 13). Table 48 in Appendix A, gives a list of the individual resurrection passages and their classifications while the anthology following this list provides their full context. Based on Table 48, it becomes apparent that most of the resurrection statements are clustered in Ezra's third dialogue. Comparing the Christian resurrection passages found in the prologue with those found in the older Jewish composition, it also becomes apparent that the resurrection belief carries a different function in the Christian composition.

As already noted, the Christian prologue presents a supersessionistic interpretation of the cataclysmic events provoked by the failed Bar Kochba revolt. The author considers

⁷⁴Michael Stone, “Apocalyptic Literature,” in *JWSTP* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 413.

the crushing and humiliating defeat suffered by the Jews as proof that they were no longer God's special people due to their disobedience (2 Esd 1:24-2:14, 33). Instead, he argues, the special status (2 Esd 1:24), glory, and all the promises previously given have now been transferred to the Christians (2 Esd 1:24; 2:10-13), a new people who will follow God's shepherd (the Messiah; 2 Esd 2:34, 43, 46-47) and fulfill the law of the Lord (2 Esd 2:40). In this theological exposition, bodily resurrection is a part of the rewards transferred to the new people of God who will receive glorious garments, be crowned, and receive everlasting habitation in His kingdom, enjoying all the benefits from the Tree of Life (2 Esd 2:11-12, 18-19, 34-35, 39, 43, 45). As such, this prologue provides a rather basic resurrection concept, showing no interest in the intermediate phase between death and resurrection nor an awareness of a soul which can exist separately from the body. It only reveals that the righteous will not see hell/Gehenna (2 Esd 2:29) but will, instead, be brought out from their tombs (2 Esd 2:16) – the hiding places of the earth (2 Esd 2:31).

In contrast, the Jewish apocalypse gives a detailed description of the state of the dead (Table 14) and a detailed eschatology time-line (figure 4), revealing that the bodily resurrection introduces the third era.⁷⁵ Segal remarks that 4 Ezra resembles “nothing so much as a primer about life after death.”⁷⁶ Figure 5 illustrates the death and resurrection concept presented in 4 Ezra.

⁷⁵The first era is the present world and the second era is the period of “primeval silence.”

⁷⁶Segal, *Life After Death*, 491.

Table 14. The state of the dead (2 Esd 7:81-87, 92-98)

	Wicked	Righteous
1	They have scorned the law of the Most High (81).	They have striven with great effort to overcome the evil thought that was formed with them (92).
2	They cannot now make a good repentance (82).	They see the perplexity in which the souls of the ungodly wander and the punishment that awaits them (93).
3	They shall see the reward laid up for those who have trusted the covenants of the Most High (83).	They see the witness that he who formed them bears concerning them, that throughout their life they kept the law with which they were entrusted (94).
4	They shall consider the torment laid up for themselves in the last days (84).	They understand the rest that they now enjoy, being gathered into their chambers and guarded by angels in profound quiet, and the glory waiting for them in the last days (95).
5	They shall see how the habitations of the others are guarded by angels in profound quiet (85).	They rejoice that they have now escaped what is corruptible and shall inherit what is to come; and besides they see the straits and toil from which they have been delivered, and the spacious liberty that they are to receive and enjoy in immortality (96).
6	They shall see how some of them will cross over into torments (86).	It is shown them how their faces is to shine like the sun, and how they are to be made like the light of the stars, being incorruptible from then on (97).
7	They shall utterly waste away in confusion and be consumed with shame, and shall wither with fear at seeing the glory of the Most High in whose presence they sinned while they were alive, and in whose presence they are to be judged in the last times (87).	They shall rejoice with boldness, and shall be confident without confusion, and shall be glad without fear, for they press forward to see the face of him whom they served in life and from whom they are to receive their reward when glorified (98).

Fig. 4. Three-Stage Worldview Presented in 4 Ezra.

Fig. 5. Death and Resurrection in 4 Ezra (2 Esd 3-14)

4 Ezra presents a rather detailed description of death and the future resurrection (see figure 4 and 5). It makes clear that it is only a person's attitude towards God and His law/covenant which determines that person's destiny in the eschatological judgment (2 Esd 7:102-115). The text also notes that this bodily resurrection is God's first act in the renewed world (2 Esd 7:32-42; 14:34-35), which will follow the temporary Messianic

kingdom (2 Esd 7:28-29 – 400 years) and the seven-day-long primeval silence (2 Esd 7:30-31), when all life, including that of the Messiah, has passed away (see figure 4). The three-stage worldview as outlined by Ezra requires two judgments of the dead – a limited (2 Esd 7:75-101) and a universal judgment (2 Esd 5:40; 7:32-44).⁷⁷ The limited judgment takes place upon a person's death when God determines whether his/her soul should be numbered among the righteous or the wicked. The second and universal judgment, which will last "a week of years," takes place after the resurrection of the renewed world where both the righteous and wicked will receive their destiny, eternal life or eternal destruction (2 Esd 7:87, 95-98, 113; 8:1-3, 39, 51-54).

4 Ezra also presents a dualistic view where, upon death, both the righteous and the wicked soul leaves the body, goes back to God, and enters the first phase which will last seven days. During this phase, the righteous and the wicked souls will be made aware of the destiny awaiting them in the day of resurrection and judgment (2 Esd 7:75-101, see Table 14). At the beginning of the second phase, the soul enters a holding chamber where it will remain until the day of resurrection (2 Esd 4:35-37, 41; 7:32, 95, 101). Importantly, the text suggests that the soul will be conscious during both phases (2 Esd 4:35-37; 7:75-101).⁷⁸ At the time of the bodily resurrection, the soul will re-enter the body and resurrect

⁷⁷Ezra also seems to suggest a third judgment – a judgment of the living. This judgment takes place at the end of the tribulations and precedes the temporary Messianic kingdom (2 Esd 6:18-20) during which the Messiah will rule together with the surviving righteous (2 Esd 7:28). If this is the case, this would parallel the apocalypse of Daniel which also presents a judgment scene prior to the Messianic kingdom (Dan 7:9-10, 26-27).

⁷⁸Note the parallel between 2 Esdras 4:35-37 and Revelation 6:10-11. In both texts, the righteous dead are impatiently asking a question. In 2 Esdras, they are asking when the New Age will come, when they will receive the harvest of their reward. In Revelation, they are crying out for justice, asking when God will avenge their blood by judging the wicked. In both texts, the righteous are told to wait until their number has been filled. It is also important to point out the differences between these two accounts. The righteous in

to the judgment of the righteous and the wicked (see figure 5). It should be noted that the renewed earth will be a different world order where there will be no more death or corruption (2 Esd 8:53-54). When considering the implicit and explicit resurrection passages in 4 Ezra (see their classification in Table 48 and in the subsequent anthology, in Appendix A, which places these resurrection statements in their larger context), it should not be surprising that both resurrection and judgment are intimately connected in the eschatological expectations of the book. It is only through the retribution of the wicked and the reward of the righteous that gives a satisfying answer to the problem of theodicy and safeguards God's justice. This is one of the characteristics of apocalyptic literature (see Table 16 and 18), and according to Ezra, resurrection is what makes this universal judgment possible.⁷⁹

DeSilva observes the formative role the Jewish Scriptures played for the new apocalyptic revelation presented in 4 Ezra. The most important of these are Genesis (11:11; 15-17, especially in the 1st and 3rd complaint-prayer), Job (focuses on the problem of theodicy), and, according to Ezra himself, the book of Daniel (4 Ezra 12:11-12).⁸⁰ The

2 Esdras refers to all the righteous dead (universal) and not just the martyred (limited), as is the case in Revelation. The souls of the righteous in 2 Esdras are calling out from their "chambers" while in Revelation they are calling out from "under the altar." If these contemporary apocalyptic passages are understood literally (which would be the natural reading of 2 Esdras based on the context), they both suggest that the souls of the righteous are conscious while waiting for their justice and reward.

⁷⁹Michael E. Stone, *Features of the Eschatology of IV Ezra*, HSS 35 (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1989), 141-143.

⁸⁰deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha*, 334-335. The three visions of the second half of 4 Ezra 11-13 draws and reinterprets Daniel 7-12. deSilva demonstrates Daniel's influence on the vision of the man from the sea (4 Ezra 13), noting the following phrases and images: "I looked, and behold" (2 Esd 13:3, 5, 6, 8 || Dan 7:2, 6, 7, 13); the parallel between the man from the sea and the "Son of Man" image of Daniel 7 (2 Esd 13:3 || Dan 7:14); "everything under his gaze trembled" (2 Esd 13:3 || Ps 104:32); "melted like wax" (2 Esd 13:4 || Ps 97:5; Mic 1:3-4); "stone broke off without a hand touching it" (2 Esd 13:5-7 || Dan 2:34-35,

two explicit resurrection statements alluding to the TaNaKh in 4 Ezra (see Table 4) allude to Daniel 12:2-3 (4 Esd 7:32; 7:97) and Isa 26:19 (4 Esd 7:32).

2 Esdras 7 (4 Ezra 7)

4 Ezra 7:26-44 gives a detailed eschatological chronology revealing that the “two major groupings of associated eschatological ideas”⁸¹ are subsequent eras held together by the “primeval silence.” The first major grouping, according to Stone, “centers around the last generation and the increase of evil until its consummation, which is to be followed by the messianic kingdom . . . [while] the chief elements of the other are resurrection, judgment, reward, and punishment”⁸² (see Fig. 4). In this important eschatological passage, Segal sees evidence of exegesis in which Daniel 7 functions as one of the controlling texts and the resurrection language of 4 Ezra 7:32, 97, 125 resembles the language of Daniel 12:2-3 and Isaiah 26:19 (see the highlighted sections and comments in Table 15).⁸³

4 Ezra 7:32 shares several elements with Daniel 12:2 (underlined and highlighted red in Table 15). Both texts refer to the dead as sleeping. Both texts locate the dead in the

44-45); and destruction of the ungodly by fire (2 Esd 13:10-11 || Ps 18:8; 97:3; Is 11:4; 66:15-16). Harrington could not state it stronger: “the chief biblical source and model is the book of Daniel” (Harrington, *Invitation to the Apocrypha*, 190).

⁸¹Stone, *Fourth Ezra*, 206.

⁸²Ibid. Note that almost all the eschatological elements appearing in 4 Ezra 7 are also mentioned in parallel texts throughout the book (e.g., 4 Ezra 4:26-31; 5:41-56; 6:25-28; 9:6-12; 11:46; 12:34).

⁸³Segal, *Life after Death*, 492-493.

Table 15. Parallels between the resurrection passages in 4 Ezra 7 and Daniel/Isaiah

4 Ezra 7:32-35, 97, 125	Daniel/Isaiah
<p>²⁹After those years [400 years]^a <u>my son the Messiah shall die</u>, and all who draw human breath.</p> <p>³⁰Then the world shall be turned back to primeval silence for seven days, as it was at the first beginnings,^b so that no one shall be left. ³¹After seven days the world that is not yet awake shall be roused, and that which is corruptible shall perish.</p> <p>³²<u>The earth shall give up those who are asleep in it, and the dust those who rest there in silence; and the chambers shall give up the souls that have been committed to them.</u></p>	<p>Dan 9:26 After those 62 weeks^c <u>the Messiah will be cut off^d and will have nothing</u>. The people of the coming prince will destroy the city and the sanctuary. The end will come with a flood, and until the end there will be war; desolations are decreed.</p> <p>Dan 12:2 <u>Many of those who sleep in the dust of the earth will awake</u>, some to <u>eternal life</u>, and some to shame and <u>eternal contempt</u>.</p>
<p>^aThe 400 year period may be an allusion to the 400 years of oppression in Egypt (Gen 15:13). In <i>b. Sanh.</i> 99a, Rabbi Dosa argues for a Messianic kingdom, lasting 400 years, based on reading Gen 15:13 in light of Ps 90:15, noting that the time of rejoicing would equal the time of afflictions. Since the 400 year period is also similar in length to the time of the Judges (1 Kings 6:1) and the time of the First Temple (mid 10th century – early 6th century BCE), it may be understood as an era. It may not be a coincidence that the 400 year long Messianic Kingdom matches the time the “House of David” ruled over the people of Israel (1003 [David]-598 [Jeconiah] BCE = 405 years, although its autonomy came to an end in 605 BCE [Dan 1:1-2]).</p> <p>^bThe earth is brought back to its pre-creation phase (Gen 1:2) and readied for a renewed creation similar to the process which took place at the Flood (Gen 7:21-8:1). Although the eschatological chronology is different in the book of Revelation, the renewed creation is presided by a state of “emptiness” (cf. Gen 1:2 [τῆς ἀβύσσου] and Rev 20:1 [τῆς ἀβύσσου]). The seven days of “primeval silence” may be an additional allusion to the creation account, the seven days of the first creation. It is interesting to note that the first recorded act of God on this newly recreated earth is the resurrection, when the earth and the dust will give up those who sleep in it. This seems to be an allusion to the Eden narrative’s account of the creation of humans out of dust (Gen 2:7) and the curse that they would, upon death, return to dust (Gen 3:19). It is from this dust that humans were once created, to which they will return upon death, and from which they will once more resurrect.</p> <p>^c7 weeks + 62 weeks (Dan 9:25) = 69 weeks out of 70 weeks (Dan 9:24). The author of 4 Ezra may understand the remaining week to be the “week of years” (4 Ezra 7:43) of the final universal judgment.</p> <p>^dThe LXX (TH) translates the more ambiguous Hebrew word, כָּרַח (to cut off) with ἐξολεθρευθήσεται which specifically states that the Messiah will be completely destroyed or be put to death.</p>	

Table 15 – Continued

<p>³³<u>The Most High shall be revealed on the seat of judgment</u>, and compassion shall pass away, and patience shall be withdrawn. ³⁴Only judgment shall remain, truth shall stand,^e and faithfulness shall grow strong. ³⁵Recompense shall follow, and the reward shall be manifested; <u>righteous deeds</u> shall awake, and <u>unrighteous deeds</u> shall not sleep.^e</p> <p>⁹⁷The sixth order, when it is shown them [the righteous] <u>how their face is to shine like the sun, and how they are to be made like the light of the stars, being incorruptible from then on.</u></p> <p>¹²⁵Or that <u>the faces of those who practiced self-control shall shine more than the stars</u>, but our faces shall be blacker than darkness?</p>	<p>Isa 26:14, ¹⁹The dead do not live; departed spirits do not rise up. Indeed, You have visited and destroyed them; You have wiped out all memory of them [the wicked]. ¹⁹Your dead will live [the righteous]; their bodies will rise. Awake and sing, you who dwell in the dust! For you will be covered with the morning dew, and the earth will bring out the departed spirits [וְאֶרֶץ רְפָאִים תִּפְלִי].</p> <p>Dan 7:9 As I kept watching, thrones were set in place, and <u>the Ancient of Days took His seat</u>. His clothing was white like snow, and the hair of His head like whitest wool. His throne was flaming fire; its wheels were blazing fire. ¹⁰ A river of fire was flowing, coming out from His presence. Thousands upon thousands served Him; ten thousand times ten thousand stood before Him. <u>The court was convened, and the books were opened.</u></p> <p>Dan12:3⁷ <u>Those who are wise will shine like the bright expanse of the heavens, and those who lead many to righteousness, like the stars forever and ever.</u></p>
<p>^eNickelsburg notes that it is Michael who arises as a witness in the judgment scene in Daniel 12:1. As such, he speculates that “truth” may have been personified as an angelic figure similarly to the case of Daniel 8:12. He also notes that the righteous and the unrighteous deeds functions as witnesses in the trail, either for or against the person being judged.</p>	

same location – in the earth and the dust. However, Daniel 12:2 does not present the dualistic view of 4 Ezra by referring to the souls which are stored in the chambers and will rejoin the body at the moment of resurrection. Interestingly, Isaiah 26:19 may allude to this dualistic position.⁸⁴ It shares with 4 Ezra 7:32 and Daniel 12:2 the view that the

⁸⁴It should be noted this dualistic notion does not appear in the LXX as the spirits (רְפָאִים) are not mentioned in the Greek translation. Instead, the strong resurrection hope is solely concerned with the bodily

dead are sleeping by noting that they will awake. It also have in common the location of the dead, they dwell in the earth and the dust. Isaiah adds an agricultural imagery, reference to the morning dew which covers the earth and causes the plants to sprout as a simile of the resurrection.⁸⁵ He concludes his statement on the resurrection of the righteous by adding an interesting detail, **וְאֶרֶץ רְפָאִים תִּפְּלֵל**, *and the earth will bring out/give birth to the dead spirits/ghosts of the dead/shades*.⁸⁶ The noun **רְפָאִים** carries the meaning, “shades”, in eight poetic contexts in the TaNaKh (Isa 14:9; 26:14, 19; Ps 88:10 [10]; Prov 2:18; 9:18; 21:16; Job 26:5), while the ethnic Rephaim only appear in historical narrative sections (Gen 14:5; Deut 2:11; 2:20[x2]; 3:13; Josh 15:8; 18:16; 2 Sam 5:18, 22; 23:13; Isa 17:5; 1 Chron 11:15; 14:9). In these eight cases, the noun parallels or is associated with “the dead” (**מֵתִים**), “death” (**מָוֶת**), “*Sheol*” (**שְׁאוֹל**), and “destruction/Abaddon” (**אֲבְדוֹן**).⁸⁷ It is interesting to note that Isaiah 26:19 mentions both the resurrection of the corpses/dead bodies (**נִבְלֹתַי יִקְוִמוּן**)⁸⁸ and the bringing forth of the dead spirits (**וְאֶרֶץ רְפָאִים תִּפְּלֵל**), which may have influenced the author of 4 Ezra to

aspect of the resurrection: “The dead shall rise, and they that are in the tombs shall be raised, and they that are in the earth shall rejoice: for the dew from thee is healing to them: but the land of the ungodly shall perish” (Isa 26:19, LXE).

⁸⁵This simile became important in Early Rabbinic resurrection passages (*y. Ber* 5:2; *y. Ta’an.* 1:1; *b. Ber* 33a; *b. Hag.* 12b; *Gen. Rab.* 13:3-6).

⁸⁶M. Brown, “רְפָאִים,” NIDOTTE 3:1173-1180; W. White, “רְפָאִים,” TWOT 2:858-859.

⁸⁷Brown, NIDOTTE 3:1176.

⁸⁸Desmond Alexander notes that this noun is the most common term used for describing a human corpse or animal carcass (D. Alexander, “נִבְלָה,” NIDOTTE 3:14).

promote his dualistic view in which both the body and soul will be resurrected and joined once more to become a living being.⁸⁹

It should also be noted that the judgment follows the resurrection in both 4 Ezra 7:32 (explicit) and Daniel 12:2 (implicit), although only 4 Ezra clearly states that this judgment will be universal.⁹⁰ Both 4 Ezra and Daniel divides the resurrected into two groups, people with righteous deeds and people with unrighteous deeds (4 Ezra 7:33). The first group will awake to eternal life while the other to eternal contempt (Dan 12:2). The judgment language of 4 Ezra is reminiscent of Daniel 7:9-10 (underlined and highlighted blue in Table 15). 4 Ezra refers to the Most High on the seat of judgment, while Daniel, refers to the Ancient of Days who takes his seat and opens the books (cf. 4 Ezra 6:20 mentions the books will be opened in the firmament as a warning of the coming judgment⁹¹) in order to convene the judgment.⁹²

The punishment and reward given to the wicked and the righteous as a result of the judgment are expanded upon in 4 Ezra 7:79ff. (see Table 14). The sixth reward foretold to the righteous is directly based on Daniel 12:3 (underlined and highlighted green in Table 15) which promises that they will shine like the sun, and be made like the

⁸⁹It should be noted that the Septuagint understands the phrase “וְאֶרֶץ רָשָׁאִים תִּפְּסִיל” as a reference to the wicked (ἀσεβῶν) as supposed to the spirits (רוּחַ) of the righteous, translating the phrase as: “ἡ δὲ γῆ τῶν ἀσεβῶν πεισεῖται,” *but the land of the wicked shall come to an end.*

⁹⁰It is interesting that Isaiah 26 also moves to the judgment theme (vv. 20-21) after the resurrection statement (v. 19).

⁹¹Stone, *Fourth Ezra*, 169-170.

⁹²This adaptation of judgment language, may suggest that the author of 4 Ezra perceived the judgment scene of Daniel 7 to be the final universal judgment which would preside the eternal reward kept in store for the righteous (4 Ezra 7:95-98).

light of the stars (4 Ezra 7:97). 4 Ezra 7:125 takes it even a step further by noting that the faces of the righteous shall shine more than the stars.⁹³ This may suggest that the righteous will become like angels (cf. Job 38:7)⁹⁴ or that the glorified bodies will radiate light as a result of seeing God face to face (4 Ezra 7:98). The latter understanding would be similar to the case of Moses when he had to cover his face since it was radiant after he had spoken to the Lord on Mt. Sinai (MT/LXX Exod 34:29-35). Both understandings are expressed in the New Testament (be like the angels in heaven [Matt 22:30; Mark 12:25; Luke 20:36] and radiate light [Matt 13:43; 1 Cor 15:35-42]), Pseudepigrapha (e.g. Sir 16:14-16; 1 En. 51:4-5; 104:2; 2 En. 1:5; 2 Bar. 51:3, 10; Ps.-Philo 12:1; L.A.E. Slov. 18-20.11), and early Rabbinic material (e.g. *b. Ber.* 17a; *Sipre Deut.* 10 [67a]; *Gen. Rab.* 20:12; 23:6).⁹⁵ In Table 16, Nickelsburg lists the main elements appearing in the judgment scene of Daniel 12 (the witnesses, the book, the resurrection, and the consequences of the judgment) and shows how these elements also appears in 4 Ezra.

It becomes apparent that Ezra's use of Daniel is more than just exegesis. He is also performing interpretative work, trying to answer the question of theodicy in the aftermath of the destruction of the Temple, the center of Jewish faith.⁹⁶ In this attempt, he combined the biblical hope of national restoration, which would introduce the Messianic

⁹³This promise is a part of a longer list of rewards promised to the righteous. They include: 1) Immortal time; 2) Everlasting hope; 3) Safe and healthful habitation; 4) The glory of the Most High will defend those who have led a pure life; 5) Paradise shall be revealed; and 6) The face of those who practiced self-control shall shine more than the stars (4 Ezra 7:119-125).

⁹⁴It may even suggest that the righteous will become greater than the angels, similar to the view presented in 2 Baruch 49-51, see discussion in chapter 3.

⁹⁵For further study, see Stone, *Fourth Ezra*, 244-245.

⁹⁶Segal, *Life after Death*, 494.

age, with the apocalyptic hope of an eschatological judgment that would vindicate the righteous by giving them their just reward and punish the wicked for their deeds.⁹⁷

Table 16. Judgment scenes in apocalyptic literature

Judgment Scene		Daniel 12	T. Mos 10	Jubilees 23	T. Judah 20, 25	1 Enoch 104	4 Ezra 7	Revelation 12, 20-22
1. Witness	Good Angel	1	2		20:1-5	1a	34-35	12:7
	Evil Angel	(10:20)	1	29b	20:2			12:7
	His defeat	(11:45)	1	29b	25:3			12:8-9; 20:2-3
2. Book	of Life	1				1b		20:12b
	of Deeds				20:3	7	(6:20)	20:12ac
3. Post-Mortem Judgment	The Good	2	?	31ab	25:4	(103:3-4)	32	20:12-13
	The Evil	2	?			(103:7-8)	32	20:12-13
4. Consequences of Judgment	Vindication	2	9	30ab	25:4-5	2-6	36ac	21:1-7
	Condemnation	2	10	30-31	25:5 (? txt.)		36bd	20:15; 21:8
	Gehenna/See	2	10	30-31			36bd?	
	Exaltation/	3?						20:4-6
	Ascension		9		25:5?	2, 4		
	Light Language	3				2	39-42	21:22-25; 22:5
	Stars Angels	3?	9				97, 125	

Source: Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 54.

Uriel finally responds to Ezra's grave concern regarding the corrupt nature of humans which was caused by Adam (4 Ezra 7:116-118) and which would prevent most people from adhering to God's covenant, thereby, preventing them from being saved and receiving the rewards promised the righteous (see Ezra's questions in 4 Ezra 7:17, 45-48, 62-69, 102-103, 106-111, 116-126). Uriel quotes Moses' words in Deuteronomy 30:19 (4

⁹⁷Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination*, 203-204.

Ezra 7:129) in support of his response. By this he upholds the validity of the Deuteronomistic principle and the two-way theology (Deut 28-32) by making it clear that each person is able to choose whether he/she would adhere to God's covenant and "love the LORD your God, obey Him, and remain faithful to Him" (Deut 30:20), thereby choosing life (Deut 30:11-20). It is important to note that "Uriel" reinterprets Moses' words from promising a prolonged "life in the land the LORD swore to your fathers Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob [i.e. the Land of Canaan/Palestine]" (Deut 30:20) to an eternal life in the world to come. As such, the future-universal-bodily-resurrection becomes an integral part of the promise that "you and your descendants may live" (Deut 30:19), and the answer to the question of theodicy discoursed in 4 Ezra. Bodily resurrection becomes the guarantor and the foundation of God's justice.

Conclusion

4 Ezra presents a more detailed death and resurrection view than what is seen in Wisdom of Solomon, 2 Maccabees (compare figure 2, 3 and 5), and Sirach which only reveals that it will happen in the eschatological age. All four books make it clear that a person's attitude towards God and His law/covenant determines his/her destiny, but only 4 Ezra and Wisdom of Solomon reveal that there will be an eschatological judgment (4 Ezra 7:102-115 vs. Wis 3:5-6). In contrast to Sirach and 2 Maccabees, both 4 Ezra and Wisdom of Solomon present a dualistic view where, upon death, the soul leaves the body and goes back to God, although in 4 Ezra the soul seems to be conscious (2 Esd 4:35-37; 7:75-101 vs. Wis 3:1-4). In 4 Ezra, however, both the wicked and the righteous soul goes

back to God as opposed to only the righteous in Wisdom of Solomon. Additionally, 4 Ezra describes two phases of the state of the dead while Wisdom of Solomon only describes one. The first phase, according to Ezra, will only last seven days (2 Esd 7:101) in which the righteous and the wicked soul will be made aware of the destiny awaiting them in the day of resurrection and judgment (see Table 16). In the second phase, the soul enters a holding chamber where it will remain until the day of resurrection. It should be noted that both 4 Ezra and Wisdom of Solomon imply a limited judgment of each individual person upon death, to determine whether they should be numbered among the righteous or the wicked. A second and universal judgment takes place after the resurrection. The resurrection belief presented in both texts is a bodily resurrection in which the soul will re-enter the body and resurrect to the judgment of the righteous and the wicked (2 Esd 7:31-44; 14:35 vs. Wis 2:21-22; 3:7-13, 18; 4:16, 20-5:14). In contrast, Sirach and 2 Maccabees do not show any interest in the intermediate period between death and resurrection. The destiny for each category of humans is the same, eternal life or eternal destruction (2 Esd 7:87, 95-98, 113; 8:1-3, 39, 51-54 vs. Wis 2:16-20; 3:7-13; 5:15-16). It is also interesting to note that 4 Ezra, Wisdom of Solomon, and 2 Maccabees are all indebted to Daniel 12 for their resurrection and eschatological expectations. It was also noted that both 4 Ezra and Wisdom of Solomon made references and allusion to Daniel 7. In addition to Daniel, 4 Ezra and 2 Maccabees also refer and allude to Isaiah 26 (2 Macc 7:23; 4 Ezra 7:32) and to the Deuteronomistic principle of Deuteronomy 28-32 (2 Macc 7:6, 9, 11, 23, 29, 36; 4 Ezra 7:129). Resurrection functions as the answer to the question of theodicy in 2 Maccabees, Wisdom of Solomon, and 4 Ezra.

Looking at the resurrection passages found in the Apocrypha, it becomes apparent that the earlier books do not show much interest in the minute details regarding this belief, what happens to a person in the period between his/her death and resurrection, and what reward and punishment will befall both the righteous and the wicked (Sirach and 2 Maccabees). Wisdom of Solomon and 4 Ezra, on the other hand, becomes much more detail-oriented in their description of the resurrection hope, where 4 Ezra resembles a primer on the subject. Chapter 3 will look at the resurrection texts found in the Pseudepigrapha to determine if there is a similar pattern and to determine what texts from the TaNaKh were used, or alluded to, when insinuating or referring to the resurrection belief. Due to the similar nature of the Old Testament Apocryphical and Pseudepigraphical writings, the Chapter 4 will provide a combined list of the TaNaKh passages used by these writings.

CHAPTER 3

OLD TESTAMENT PSEUDEPIGRAPHICAL WRITINGS

The Pseudepigrapha¹ is a “catch-all” category which includes all the books of the Second Temple Period apart from the Apocrypha, Dead Sea Scrolls, Philo, Josephus, New Testament, and Rabbinic material. This dissertation follows the broad definition or rather description suggested by James H. Charlesworth:

Those writing 1) that, with the exception of Ahiqar, are Jewish or Christian; 2) that are often attributed to ideal figures in Israel’s past; 3) that customarily claim to contain God’s word or message; 4) that frequently build upon ideas and narratives present in the Old Testament; 5) and that almost always were composed either during the period 200 B.C. to A.D. 200 or, though late, apparently preserve, albeit in an edited form, Jewish traditions that date from that period.²

¹The term *Pseudepigrapha* comes from the Greek words ψευδής, “false,” and ἐπιγραφή, “inscription,” referring to books bearing a false inscription. David A. deSilva notes that this term “highlights primarily a literary characteristic of many writings from the Hellenistic and Greco-Roman periods, that is, writings under the assumed name of a great figure from the distant past,” however, he adds that Roman Catholic and Orthodox writers use the term Apocrypha when referring to this body of literature while many scholars and Jewish writers often use the term “outside books” (deSilva, “Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha,” DNTB, 58-59).

Like the term *Apocrypha* in the previous chapter, this term also has its limitations – the first term “derives from canonical debates and usage; the other from a peculiar literary characteristic” (ibid., 60). Nickelsburg notes that this term “ignores the pseudonymous nature of some of the Apocrypha (e.g., Tobit and the Wisdom of Solomon) and some canonical (e.g., Job and Ruth) writings” (Nickelsburg, *Jewish Literature*, 6) and C. T. Fritsch observes that some of the Pseudopigraphical books are better described as anonymous than pseudonymous. Fritsch also notes that these books were never included into the Greek and Latin manuscripts of the Bible, so their canonicity was never an issue in mainstream Christianity. However, “many of these works were preserved in the various branches of the oriental churches, and so they came down to us in such languages as Syriac, Ethiopic, Coptic, Georgian, Armenian, Slavonic, etc” (C. T. Fritsch, “Pseudepigrapha,” IDB 3:963).

²James H. Charlesworth, “Introduction for the General Reader,” in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha: Volume 1 - Apocalyptic Literature and Testament*, ed. J. H. Charlesworth, ABRL (New York: Doubleday, 1983), xxv.

The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha, like the Apocrypha discussed in the previous chapter (see Table 3), also represent several literary genres which fall into the following six categories: (1) Apocalypses; (2) Testaments; (3) Expansion of TaNaKh narratives; (4) Wisdom and philosophical literature; (5) Prayers, psalms and odes; and (6) Fragments of now lost Judeo-Hellenistic works. Table 17 shows the literary genre of the Pseudepigrapha, the date of composition,³ and the books containing a resurrection belief, either stated or implied (bolded and highlighted in red) based on the analysis in Appendix A. This will help the reader see the extent of this belief in the Pseudepigraphical books. This chapter will consider the passages listed in Table 49-53 that imply or state a resurrection belief which also refer or allude to the TaNaKh for its foundation of this belief. The resurrection passages will be considered according to these six genre categories, starting with the Apocalyptic literature (see Appendix A, Table 49).

Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works

The first genre category, Apocalyptic work, is “revelatory literature with a narrative framework” which reveals a transcendent reality (see John Collins’ definition, n. 64, page 69). Collins notes that “the main means of revelation are visions and

³The suggested dates are mostly based on Charlesworth’s two-volume work, *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* and to a lesser degree on Craig A. Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*.

Table 17. Literary genre of the Pseudepigrapha

[illegible]

Table 17 – Continued

Literary Genre	Pseudepigraphical Texts	Date
Expansions of the “Old Testament” and Legends	Letter of Aristeas Jubilees Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah [3:13-4:22 = Testament of Hezekiah] Joseph and Aseneth Life of Adam and Eve Pseudo-Philo [= Biblical Antiquities] Lives of the Prophets Ladder of Jacob 4 Baruch [= Omissions of Jeremiah] Jannes and Jambres History of the Rechabites Eldad and Modad History of Joseph	130 – 70 BCE 135 – 105 BCE 2 nd Cent. BCE 1 st Cent. BCE – 2 nd Cent. CE 1 st Cent. BCE – 1 st Cent. CE 2 nd Cent. BCE – late 1 st Cent. CE 1 st Cent. CE 1 st Cent. CE Late 1 st – Early 2 nd Cent. CE 1 st – 2 nd Cent. CE 1 st – 4 th Cent. CE > 2 nd Cent. CE > 400 CE
Wisdom and Philosophical Literature	Ahiqar 3 Maccabees 4 Maccabees Pseudo-Phocylides The Sentences of the Syriac Menander	6 th – 7 th Cent. CE 1 st Cent. CE 1 st Cent. CE 1 st Cent. BCE 3 rd Cent. CE
Prayers, Psalms, and Odes	More Psalms of David Psalm 151 (see OT Apocrypha) Psalm 152 Psalm 153 Psalm 154 Psalm 155 Prayer of Manasseh (see OT Apocrypha) Psalms of Solomon Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers Prayer of Joseph Prayer of Jacob Odes of Solomon	3 rd Cent. BCE – 1 st Cent. CE 2 nd – 1 st Cent. BCE c. 50 BCE 2 nd – 3 rd Cent. CE 1 st Cent. CE 1 st – 4 th Cent. CE Late 1 st – early 2 nd Cent. CE
Fragments of Lost Judeo-Hellenistic Work	Philo the Epic Poet Theodotus Orphica Ezekiel the Tragedian Fragments of Pseudo-Greek Poets Pseudo-Hesiod Pseudo-Pythagoras Pseudo-Aeschylus Pseudo-Sophocles Pseudo-Euripides Pseudo-Philemon Pseudo-Diphilus Pseudo-Menander	3 rd – 2 nd Cent. BCE 2 nd – 1 st Cent. BCE 1 st Cent. BCE/CE 2 nd Cent. BCE 3 rd – 2 nd Cent. BCE

Table 17 – Continued

Literary Genre	Pseudepigraphical Texts	Date
Fragments of Lost Judeo- Hellenistic Work	Aristobulus Demetrius the Chronographer Aristeas the Exegete Eupolemus Pseudo-Eupolemus Cleodemus Malchus Artapanus Pseudo-Hecataeus	2 nd Cent. BCE 3 rd Cent. BCE Late 2 nd – early 1 st Cent. BCE Late 2 nd /early 1 st Cent. BCE > 1 st Cent. BCE > 1 st Cent. BCE 3 rd – 2 nd Cent. BCE c. 300 BCE

otherworldly journeys, supplemented by discourse or dialogue and occasionally by a heavenly book. The constant element is the presence of an angel who interprets the vision or serves as a guide on the otherworldly journey.”⁴ Table 18 shows a categorization of some of the Jewish apocalypses listed in Table 17 and divides the literature into two distinctive strands, *Otherworldly Journeys* and “*Historical*” *Apocalypse*. It should be noted that these two strands are interwoven in the *Apocalypse of Abraham* [15-32]⁵ and *1 Enoch* (the *Apocalypse of Weeks* [93:1-10; 91:11-17] and *Animal Apocalypse* [83-90] are “historical” apocalypses while the *Book of the Watchers* [1-36] and the *Similitudes of Enoch* [37-71] describes “otherworldly” journeys). Regardless, all fifteen Jewish apocalypses listed in Table 18 “fall within the compass of the definition of the genre”⁶ despite the variations between the texts.

⁴Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination*, 5.

⁵Collins, “Jewish Apocalypses,” 36-37.

⁶Ibid., 24.

Table 18. Jewish apocalypses

JEWISH APOCALYPSES	Otherworldly Journeys										“Historical” Apocalypse					
	Apoc Zephaniah	Test Abraham 10-15	3 Baruch	Test Levi 2-5	2 Enoch	Similitudes of Enoch	Heavenly Lumin.	1 Enoch 1-36	Apoc Abraham	2 Baruch	4 Ezra	Jubilees 23	Apoc of Weeks	Animal Apocalypse	Daniel 7-12	
Manner of Revelation																
Vision	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	
Epiphanies																x
Discourse					x		x					x	x			x
Dialogue	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x					x
Writing							x					x	x			x
Otherworldly mediator	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Pseudonymity	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Disposition of recipient		x	x	x	x				x	x	x					x
Reaction of recipient			x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			x		x
Temporal Axis																
Cosmology					x					x	x					
Primordial events			x			x		x	x	x	x					
Recollection of past									x	x	x					x
Ex eventu prophecy									x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Persecution						x			x		x	x		x		x
Other eschatological upheavals				x		x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Judgment/destruction of wicked	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Judgment/ destruction of world	?				x		?	x		?	x		x			
Judgment/ destruction of otherworldly beings					x	x	?	x				x	x	x	x	x
Cosmic transformation				x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	?	x	x	x	x
Resurrection						x				x	x		?	x		x
Other forms of afterlife	x	x	?	x	x	x	x	x	x			x	?	?		

Table 18 – Continued

JEWISH APOCALYPSES	Otherworldly Journeys								“Historical” Apocalypse							
	Apoc Zephaniah	Test Abraham 10-15	3 Baruch	Test Levi 2-5	2 Enoch	Similitudes of Enoch	Heavenly Lumin.	1 Enoch 1-36	Apoc Abraham	2 Baruch	4 Ezra	Jubilees 23	Apoc of Weeks	Animal Apocalypse	Daniel 7-12	
Spatial Axis																
Otherworldly regions	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			x	x	
Otherworldly beings	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	
Paraenesis by Revealer											x					
Concluding Elements																
Instructions to recipient				x	x		x			x	x	x			x	
Narrative Conclusion		x	x	x	x		x			x	x			x	x	

Source: John J. Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination*, 7 and “The Jewish Apocalypses,” *Semeia* 14 (1979): 28.

It is important to note that all these apocalyptic texts include a judgment scene in which the wicked are destroyed and reveal that the righteous will be rewarded with some form of afterlife. In some texts, this afterlife reward is introduced by a bodily resurrection (see the highlighted sections in Table 18).

The most elaborate and detailed descriptions of the events that will take place following a person’s death appear in the apocalyptic literature of the Second Temple Period Literature, in the books which fall within the first category of Pseudepigraphical books which will be considered in this chapter. The following table, Table 19, provides a list of all the relevant resurrection passages. Special emphasis will be placed on the resurrection passages which either refer or allude to the TaNaKh.

Table 19. Resurrection texts in the apocalypses category of the Pseudepigrapha

Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
1 Enoch	Book I (1-36) The Parable of Enoch	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) 1:3-9 5:5-9 9:2-3 10:4-6, 11-13, 16-17, 20 13:6 14:2-6 15:7-10 16:1 27:2-3		X				X	X
		20:8	Archangel Remiel		X				X
		22	Resurrection of the Soul?		X				X
		25:4-6	The Fragrant tree	X					X
	Book II (37-71) The Book of the Similitudes	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) 38 41:1, 8-9 45:2-6 47 48:7 50:1 54:6 56:8 58:1-4 60:6, 24 61:5, 8 ----- 70:4 – Vision of earliest human ancestors 70:16 – all the righteous will follow the path of Enoch.		X				X	X
		40:9	Archangel Phanuel	X					X
		46:3	Son of Man	X					X
		49:3	Sleep Death	X					X
		51			X				X
		62:13-6	Son of Man		X				X

Table 19 – Continued

Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
1 Enoch	Book III (72-82) The Book of Heavenly Luminaries	81:1-4	Judgment	x					x
	Book IV (83-90) The Dream Visions	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) 84:4							
		89:36-37	Sleep = Death	x					x
		90:20-36	Judgment New Jerusalem	x			x		x
	Book V (91-107) The Two Ways of the Righteous and the Sinner: Including the Apocalypse of Weeks	91:8-17	Arise from sleep		x				x
		92:2-5	Arise from sleep		x		x		x
		The Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked (94-104): Judgment (Implied Resurrection) 94:9, 11 95:5-6 96:2-3, 8 97:6 98:6-8, 14 100:4-5, 10 102:4-8 103:1-4 104:1-7		x				x	x
		108:2-3	Book of Life	x			x		x
		108:8-15	Recompensed Resplended	x			x	x	x
	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) J 7:1 J/A 18:7 J/A 19:5 J 39:5/A 39:2 J 42:3, 5, 7 J/A 44:3-5 J/A 48:8-9 J/A 49:2 J/A 50:2, 4-5 J/A 51:3 J/A 52:15 J/A 58:4-6 J 60:4 J 66:6-7			x				x	x
	J 32	Dust to dust			x	x			x
	J/A 65:6-11	Judgment	x						x
	J 70:1	Eternal inheritance	x						x
	J/A 70:3	Rest Death	x						x
2 Enoch	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) J 7:1 J/A 18:7 J/A 19:5 J 39:5/A 39:2 J 42:3, 5, 7 J/A 44:3-5 J/A 48:8-9 J/A 49:2 J/A 50:2, 4-5 J/A 51:3 J/A 52:15 J/A 58:4-6 J 60:4 J 66:6-7			x				x	x
	J 32	Dust to dust			x	x			x
	J/A 65:6-11	Judgment	x						x
	J 70:1	Eternal inheritance	x						x
	J/A 70:3	Rest Death	x						x

Table 19 – Continued

Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
3 Enoch	(18:24)		Books of the Dead Books of the Living		x				x
	(28:7; 30:2; 31:2; 33:1)		Every Day is a Judgment	x				x	x
	28:7-10		Third day he will raise us up		x				
	44:7-8		Rest of the Righteous		x				x
Sibylline Oracles	Book 1	355	Lazarus' resurrection		x				x
		378	Announcing the resurrection to the dead		x				x
	Book 2	221-51	Resurreciton/ Judgment		x	x			
		313-5	Rewards of the Righteous		x				x
	Book 3	66	Satan's work		x				x
		769	Messianic kingdom		x				x
	Book 4	179-92	Resurrection/ Judgment		x	x			x
	Book 6	14	Lazarus' resurrection		x				x
	Book 7	144-5	Restoration of the world	x					x
	Book 8	82-3	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x
		170	Eschatological upheaveal		x				x
		205-8	Messianic Age		x				x
		226-8	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x
		255	Faith => Eternal life	x					x
		286	Jesus' mission		x				x

Table 19 – Continued

Passage		Notes		Resurrection		Classification			
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
Sibylline Oracles	Book 8	293	Jesus' mission		X				X
		310-4	Jesus' mission		X				X
		413-6	Resurrection/ Judgment		X				X
	Frag. 3	41-49	Inheritance of the Righteous	X					X
Apocryphon of Ezekiel	Fragment 1	Body = Blind Soul = Lame Judgment parable			X	X			
Fourth Book of Ezra	2:16	Exhortation to good work			X				X
	2:22-24	Burial			X				X
	2:31	Sleep Death			X				X
	4:35-37	Predestined time			X		X		X
	4:42-43	Hades womb		X					X
	7:31-[44]	Resurrection/ Judgment			X		X		X
	7:75-101	The state of the departed before the judgment			X		X		X
	14:36	Resurrection/ Judgment		X				X	X
Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	2:1; 5:22	The righteous/ Patriarchs		X					X
	4:36	Trumpet/ Resurrection			X				X
	7:2	Jesus' work			X				X
Questions of Ezra	A. 5	The fate of the righteous and the sinners			X				X
	A. 10	The prophet's question		X					X
	B. 1-14	Resurrection/ Judgment			X				X
2 Baruch	11:4	Sleep Death		X					X
	14:12-13	Possesses hope in the future Resurrection		X					X
	15:7-8	The Righteous		X					X

Table 19 – Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
2 Baruch	21:23-24	Sleep Death	x					x
	23:5	Appointed number	x					x
	24:1-2	Judgment/ Resurrection	x			x		
	30:1-3	The end of time		x				x
	42:7-8	Dust => Resurrection		x		x		x
	49-52	The nature of the resurrection body: The final destiny of the Righteous and the wicked		x	x			x
	57:2	Planned from the beginning		x				x
	66:3	Make sure that they are really dead	x					x
	85:3	Sleep Death	x					x
	85:9	Sleep Death	x					x
	85:15	Resurrect the righteous	x					x
Apocalypse of Elijah	3:13	Satan cannot resurrect the dead		x				x
	4:24-29	Persecution of the Saints		x		x		x
	4:31	Satan cannot resurrect the dead		x				x
	5:25-39	End-time	x					x

1 Enoch

1 Enoch is the oldest pseudepigraphical book attributed to Enoch of Genesis 5:24 fame and several fragments of this composition were found among the Dead Sea Scrolls. It is a composite book composed by several anonymous writers between the third century BCE and 50 CE.⁷ It was originally written in Hebrew or Aramaic, but the most complete

⁷See, Miryam T. Brand, “1 Enoch,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, ed. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 2:1361-1362; James H. Charlesworth, “A Rare Consensus Among

form of the book is the Ethiopian version. 1 Enoch contains the following five distinct compositions or books:⁸

1. The book of Watchers (1-36)
2. The book of Parables (37-71)
3. The book of Astronomical Writings (72-82)
4. The book of Dream Visions (83-90)
5. The book of the Epistle of Enoch (91-105)

The second book is the only part of 1 Enoch not found among the Dead Sea Scrolls suggesting a late date, possibly toward the end of the Second Temple period.

Due to the composite nature of 1 Enoch and its various anonymous authors and dating, this study will consider each distinctive composition by itself without attempting to harmonize the eschatological view presented in the book. Neither will it attempt to outline a development of the resurrection belief found in the various books of 1 Enoch.

The Book of Watchers (1-36)

A universal eschatological judgment in which all will be judged (1:7, 9), both angels and humans, both righteous and wicked, is an important theme in the Book of

Enoch Specialists: The Date of the Earliest Enoch Books,” in *The Origins of Enochic Judaism: Proceedings of the First Enoch Seminar, University of Michigan, Sesto Fiorentino, Italy, June 19-23, 2001*, ed. Gabriele Boccaccini (Turin: Zamorani, 2002), 225-234; J. Collins, “Enoch, Book of,” *DNTB*, 314; and George Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch 1*, Hermeneia (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2001), 7. For a detailed introduction to 1 Enoch, see Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch 1*, 1-125.

⁸Note that several of these books are themselves composites, with possibly different authorship and dating. It is also suggested that fragments of a Book of Noah are scattered throughout 1 Enoch (6-11; 54:7-55:2; 60:7-10, 24; 65-69:25; 106-107).

Watchers.⁹ This theme is introduced in the first vision of Enoch (Chapters 1-5) and is a theme that recurs throughout the book (e.g. 9:2-3,10; 10:4-6, 11-13, 16-17, 20; 13:6; 15:7-10; 16:1; 19:1; 27:2-3). From the first vision Enoch learns that in the end of time (1:2) God will come down from his dwelling (1:3) to measure out his judgment, destroy of the wicked (1:9; 5:4-6, 7b), and reward the righteous (1:8; 5:7a, 8-10) with light, joy, peace, wisdom, and inheritance of the earth (5:7a, 8).

It is clear that the main concern of these judgment texts is the theodicy, noting that everyone will be held responsible for how they lived according to God's commandments (5:4). It should also be noted that although a resurrection belief (not necessarily a bodily resurrection) is not explicitly stated, these texts presume such a belief since there must be some form of resurrection for a person to be held accountable for his/her deeds at the time of the great judgment. As such, there are some important resurrection references in this book which will be considered below.

1 Enoch 20:8

1 Enoch 20 gives the name and functions of Gods seven¹⁰ archangels who act as angelic guides during Enoch's journey to the outer extremities of the earth as recorded in chapters 21-23. The seventh archangel, Ramiel, is in charge of those who will be

⁹The universal nature of the judgment is emphasized by the repetition of the word "all" which appears 11 times in the opening vision recorded in 1 Enoch 1-5 (5x in 1:7-9 and 6x in 5:6-8).

¹⁰The more complete Ethiopian version of the book only gives the name of the first six archangels. However, it could be assumed that the seventh angel, Ramiel, was lost at one point in the translation history, since no other tradition attests to a list of only six archangels. Moreover, he appears in the Greek translation of the text. The seven angels also appear in other passages of 1 Enoch (81:5; 87:2; 90:21) and in other ancient traditions (e.g. 3 Enoch 17-18; Tob 12:15; T.Lev 8:2; Rev 1:4,20). However, none of these passages refer to these seven angels as archangels.

resurrected (v.8). This angel does not appear again by name in the rest of this book nor in the entire 1 Enoch. However, Nickelsburg makes a case that the unnamed angel speaking to Enoch in 1 Enoch 81:1 could be identified as Ramiel.¹¹ This text will be considered under the subheading “The Book of Heavenly Luminaries.”

1 Enoch 22

The second resurrection passage in the Book of Watchers is 1 Enoch 22. In this chapter, Raphael, the archangel in charge of the spirits of man (20:3) shows Enoch the place where all the spirits are stored in wait for the great eschatological judgment (22:4). This passage follows the same literary structure as the other visions recorded in chapters 20-36 with the exception of vv. 5-7 (see Table 20), which breaks the pattern.¹²

The reader needs to keep in mind that 1 Enoch 17-36 describes Enoch’s cosmic journey, and as such, the main purpose of chapter 22 is not to give a detailed description of the eschatological events, resurrection, and judgment, but rather a geographical description, showing where the souls are being stored.¹³ Be that as it may, 1 Enoch 22 is still a pregnant text regarding these eschatological issues.

¹¹This identification is based on the following two reasons. Firstly, he does not appear in the remaining part of the book (21-26) together with the other six archangels. Secondly, the context of chapter 81 fits well with the function and responsibility of Ramiel. Based on the thematic parallels between 1 Enoch 1-36 and 81-82, it might have functioned as a narrative bridge between the first and the last book of 1 Enoch (see discussion in Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch*, 334-338).

¹²Marie-Theres Wacker, *Weltordnung und Gericht: Studien zu 1 Henoch 22*, FB 45 (Würzburg: Echter, 1982), 101-103.

¹³Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 169.

Table 20. Literary structure of 1 Enoch 22

Section	Verse		
1	1a	¹ From there I traveled to another place.	
2	1b 2a	And he showed me to the west a great and high mountain of hard rock ² And there were four hollow places in it, deep and very smooth. Three of them were dark and one , illuminated; and a fountain of water was in the midst of it.	
3a	2b	And I Said, “How smooth are these hollows and altogether deep and dark to view.”	
3b	3 4	³ Them Raphael answered , one of the holy angels who was with me, and said to me, “These hollow places (are intended) that the spirits [πνεύματα] of the souls [ψυχαι] the dead might be gathered into them. For this very (purpose) they were created, (that) here the souls of all the sons of men should be gathered. ⁴ And behold, these are the pits for the places of their confinement, Thus they were made <u>until the day (on) which they will be judged, and until the time of the day of the end of the great judgment, which will be exacted from them.</u> ”	
	1	5a	⁵ There I saw
		5b	the spirit [πνεύματα] of a dead man making suit, and his lamentation went up to heaven and cried and made suit
	3a	6	⁶ Then I asked Raphael, the watcher and holy one who was with me, and said to him, “This spirit [πνεύματα] that makes suit – who is it – that thus his lamentation goes up and makes suit unto heaven?”
	3b	7	⁷ And he [Raphael] answered me and said, “This is the spirit [πνεύματα] that went forth from Abel , whom Cain his brother murdered. And Abel makes accusation against him until his seed perishes from the face of the earth, and his seed is obliterated from the seed of men.”
3a	8	⁸ Then I asked about the hollow places, why they were separated one from the other.	
3b	9 13	⁹ And he [Raphael] answered me and said, “These three were made that the spirits [πνεύματα] of the dead might be separated. And this has been separated for the spirit [πνεύματα] of the righteous, where the bright fountain of water is. ¹⁰ And this has been created for <the spirit of the> sinners, when they die and are buried in the earth, and judgment has not been executed on them in their life. ¹¹ Here [ὁδε] their spirits [πνεύματα] are separated for this great torment, until the great day of judgment, of scourges and tortures of the cursed forever, that there might be a recompense for their spirits. There [ἐκεῖ] will bind them forever. ¹² And this has been separated for the spirits [πνεύματα] of them that make suit , who make disclosure about the destruction, when they were murdered in the days of the sinners. ¹³ And this was created for the spirits [πνεύματα] of the men who will not be pious, but sinners, who were godless, and they were companions with the lawless. And their spirits will not be punished on the day of judgment, nor will they be raised from there.	
4	14	¹⁴ Then I blessed the Lord of glory and said, “Blessed is the judgment of righteousness and blessed are you, O Lord of majesty and righteousness, who are Lord of eternity.”	

This chapter starts with an introductory statement (section 1 in the literary structure) followed by a description of the vision (section 2). This is followed by a dialogue between the guiding angel and Enoch in which Enoch asks for an interpretation of what he just saw (section 3a) and the angel's explanation (section 3b). This chapter concludes with Enoch praising God for his righteous justice (section 4). From this literary structure it becomes clear that sections 3a and 3b in the third part of the structure (vv.8-13) is a continuation of section 3a and 3b of the first part of the structure (vv.2b-4).

From Enoch's vision, one learns that a person's soul lives on, separately from the body, at the time of death. While the body is buried in the ground (v.10), the soul of the dead is contained in one of the four "deep and very smooth" (v.2a) chambers God has made for the souls in "a great and high mountain of hard rock" (v.2a). The souls' placement is based on the person's behavior during his/her life. The first chamber is made for the righteous souls while the remaining three chambers were made for the souls of the wicked (see Table 21).

Thus, the vision presents three categories of wicked souls. The second compartment contains the souls of those who did not receive just punishment for all the wickedness they did in their life. The third compartment is more difficult to classify but it seems to contain the souls of the wicked who suffered an unjust death. Although they were wicked, they did not deserve this type of death. The last compartment contains a third category of wicked souls. These souls do not seem to experience any suffering following death nor will they be a part of the eschatological judgment or resurrection (v.13). Nickelsberg suggests the simplest explanation for why these souls are different

from the previously mentioned categories of wicked souls is that “these sinners were judged during their lifetime, and for that reason they need not be recompensed either immediately after death or at the great day of judgment.”¹⁴ In other words, they received their just punishment prior to their death (see Table 21).

It is only the righteous souls and the souls of the most wicked, the ones who still need to receive more punishment, that will be resurrected at the time of the eschatological resurrection. The souls in the third and the fourth chamber do not seem to need any more punishment than what they have already received, hence, no need for resurrection for these souls (v.13b). This view seems very similar to the view presented in Daniel 12:2-3, which suggests that there will not be a universal resurrection but only a resurrection for the most righteous and the most wicked. Although, 1 Enoch 22 implies all righteous souls will be resurrected on the day of judgment.

However, the view that only the souls of the first two chambers will experience resurrection seems to contradict the judgment scene described in the introduction of the book (chapters 1-5), which has a strong emphasis on the universal nature of the eschatological judgment (see above).

¹⁴Ibid., 308. Wacker, on the other hand, attempts to limit this category of souls to the wicked generation of Noah’s days (Gen 6:3, 5-7, 11-13, 17) who were destroyed by the Deluge (see discussion, Wacker, *Weltordnung und Gericht*, 193-195). However, there is insufficient evidence for this limited reading in the vision itself.

Table 21. The four holding compartments for the souls in 1 Enoch 22

1 st Compartment v. 9b	2 nd Compartment vv. 10-11	3 rd Compartment v. 12	4 th Compartment v. 13
Righteous	Wicked		
	Not received just punishment in their life (v. 10)	Suffered an unjust death (v. 12)	Already received their just punishment in their life
Light/Fountain of water (v. 2b, 9b)	Dark (v. 2b)	Dark (v. 2b)	Dark (v. 2b)
Conscious: Can request justice (e.g. vv. 5-7)	Conscious: Suffers great torment until the day of judgment (v. 11)	Conscious: Seeking vengeance for their murder (v. 12)	Unconscious? Do not seem to suffer any torment
Resurrection	Resurrection	No resurrection mentioned ¹⁵	No need for Resurrection
Receive their reward (1 Enoch 24:2-25:6)	Judgment which will give them their deserved punishment	No judgment mentioned	No judgment needed
	Suffer eternal punishment for their evil deeds (v. 11)		

There could be several reasons for this apparent contradiction. First, the composite nature of this book. 1 Enoch 1-5 may have been written by a different author who may have held a different theological emphasis than the author of 1 Enoch 22. As has already been pointed out, 1 Enoch 22 is a part of Enoch's cosmic journey where he is shown the geographical location of the souls of the dead while 1 Enoch 1-5 has an emphasis on God's theodicy, that everyone will be judged according to their deeds. Second, it could be argued that both 1 Enoch 1-5 and 22 are in agreement in the sense that all souls/humans receive the reward they deserve. The souls in the third and fourth

¹⁵Maybe there will be no need for resurrection since through the judgment, the grievance of the person is met since his/her murderer receives the just punishment for that deed.

chambers have already received their deserved justice/punishment, and as such, have no further need for punishment. The “all” in chapter 1-5 would then be referring to the souls who still need to be rewarded (righteous souls in chamber one) or punished (wicked souls in chamber two). Third, the inconsistency of the number of chambers in chapter 22 (see Table 20, vv.2a, 9-13).¹⁶ Verse 2a mentions that there are four chambers while verse 9 only mentions three. However, verses 9b-13 describe the souls in all four chambers. This has led Wacker to see evidence for a literary development of chapter 22 in which the first stage of the development had a mountain, with unspecified numbers of dark caves, where the souls of the dead were kept. The second stage of the development would have introduced the elements of the current text, the four different chambers for the four different categories of souls,¹⁷ and the preliminary judgment of the souls upon the person’s death, to determine the appropriate holding chamber. The first stage of this tradition would require a universal resurrection of the souls in order to judge them and give them their appropriate reward or punishment. The second stage of this development would only need the resurrection of the souls held in the first and second chambers since there has already been a preliminary sorting of the souls.¹⁸ Regardless of the explanation of this apparent contradiction, the text does emphasize the justice of God’s judgment of the souls of the dead (v.14).

¹⁶The Ethiopian version is missing the differentiation between the light and the dark chambers in verse 26.

¹⁷Wacker, *Weltordnung*, 122-131, 178-190; see also, Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch 1*, 302-303.

¹⁸Segal notes that this sorting is similar to how ancient empires dealt with their war captives in which the captives were divided into groups based on their final destiny (*Life After Death*, 278).

The Souls are Conscious. Reading 1 Enoch 22 it becomes apparent that the souls in the first three chambers are conscious and the souls' condition in the chamber is a part of their reward or punishment. The only souls who seem to be unconscious are the ones kept in the fourth chamber since these wicked souls have already received all the punishment they deserved (see Table 21). The souls of the righteous in the first chamber are blessed with light and a fountain of water (vv. 2b, 9b). This may be an allusion to the benevolence, described in Psalm 36:9, that God shows to those who seek refuge under his wings: "For with you is the fountain of life; in your light we see light."¹⁹ Both these images are associated with the righteous, water with life giving force (e.g. Jer 2:13; 17:12), alluding to God's life-giving force itself.²⁰ Light is often associated with God's presence and life itself (e.g. Pss 27:1; 49:19; 56:13).²¹ Thus, there are two very powerful symbols, life and God's presence, associated with the souls of the righteous who are with God. In a more literal sense, the souls of the righteous are provided water so they will not thirst as was the case of the rich man in Jesus' parable (Luke 16:24).

The souls of the wicked in the second chamber have a very different experience than the righteous in the first. Instead of dwelling in light, in God's presence, they are in darkness (v. 2b). This already hints at the punishment that is in store for them, where

¹⁹This image is similar to the New Jerusalem described in Revelation 22:1-5. However, this describes the final reward for the righteous and not the temporary reward in store for the righteous souls awaiting the resurrection, judgment, and the eternal reward, as is the case in 1 Enoch 22.

²⁰Jesus plays on this theme in John 4:10, 14 by stating that he offers living water and whomever drinks it will have eternal life.

²¹Jesus is also referring to himself as the light of the world and claims that whomever follows him will not be in darkness but will have light of life (John 8:12). The association of light, God's presence, and the act of salvation is also the emphasis of John 1:4-9.

they will not be protected by God's presence.²² Moreover, these souls have already started their suffering by experiencing great torment (v. 11a) while they are awaiting the great judgment which will bring them the full measure of God's wrath in the abyss, where they will be bound forever (v. 11). Nickelsburg notes: "The transferral [of the wicked souls at the time of judgment] and the distinction between now and then [in verse 13] also indicates that the sinners present suffering is not to be understood as final and full judgment."²³ He adds: "The contrast between 'here' (ὧδε, *baze*) [v. 11a] and 'there' (ἐκεῖ, *baheya*) suggests that at the judgment they will be transferred to another place of torment, presumably Gehenna."²⁴

The souls in the third chamber do not seem to suffer physical pain *per se*, but rather, suffer a restless existence while they wait for justice due to their unjustified violent death (v. 12). In some ways, their situation is similar to that suffered by Abel (vv. 5-7) who was murdered by his brother Cain and who also suffered an unjustified violent death (see discussion below) – although Abel's soul is righteous, while the souls of the third chamber are wicked. Importantly, the text does not specify whether or not these wicked souls will resurrect. The lack of resurrection may be due to the "rest" they will receive when their murderer is judged at the time of the eschatological judgment, at which time they will have no further grievance.

²²This is also a strong image used by Jesus in his parables (e.g. Matt 8:12; 22:13; 25:30). It is interesting that darkness came over the land when Jesus was dying on the cross, which Jesus understood as an indication that God, his father, had forsaken him (Matt 27:45-46; Mark 15:33-34).

²³Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch 1*, 308.

²⁴Idem., *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 169.

The souls of the last chamber seem to be unconscious since they have already suffered enough in their life. As such, no further punishment is necessary, hence, no resurrection occurs.

Abel's Suit unto Heaven. The middle section of the literary structure (see Table 20, vv. 5-7) interprets and elaborates on God's comment to Cain after he had murdered his brother Abel: "What have you done? Listen! Your brother's blood cries out to me from the ground" (Gen 4:10). John Byron notes that the next narrative, in which the word $\alpha\delta\epsilon\lambda\phi\acute{o}\varsigma$, *brother* appears, is at the end of the flood narrative (Gen 9:4-6),²⁵ in a passage that also contains the word $\alpha\dot{\iota}\mu\alpha$, *blood*, and the same subject matter, the killing of a human being (see the highlighted sections of Table 22). It seems like the author of Gen 9:5 points back to the Cain and Abel narrative as if to say, "Whoever takes human life is like Cain."²⁶ Wenham also notes a close link between Gen 9:1-7 and Gen 1:28-29 and considers this link as more than a simple reassertion of the pre-flood food law, but rather, a modification and a reassertion of "the sanctity of human life in light of chap. 4."²⁷

In Genesis 4:10, Abel's blood has been personified and cries out to God for justice. A case could be made that the author of 1 Enoch 22 understood this

²⁵John Byron, *Cain and Abel in Text and Tradition: Jewish and Christian Interpretation of the First Sibling Rivalry*, TBN 14 (Leiden: Brill, 2011), 188.

²⁶Cassuto, *From Noah to Abraham*, 127.

²⁷Wenham, *Genesis 1-15*, 192.

personification literally, especially in light of Gen 9:4 which sees a connection between $\text{דָּם}/\alpha\iota\mu\alpha$, *blood*, and $\text{נֶפֶשׁ}/\psi\chi\eta$,²⁸ *life*. Given these two closely connected texts, the ancient interpreter may have understood these texts to suggest that “something” survives a person’s death and that “something” is conscious and, in the case of Abel, demands justice from God due to the great injustice committed against him. Moreover, the interpreter may have identified the $\text{נֶפֶשׁ}/\psi\chi\eta$, *life* of Gen 9:4 with $\text{נִשְׁמָה}/\pi\nu\sigma\eta$ or $\text{רוּחַ}/\pi\nu\epsilon\upsilon\mu\alpha$,²⁹ *breath*, which is the word used in the creation story when God “formed man of the dust of the ground $[\text{עֹפָרָה מִן־הָאֲדָמָה}]$ and breathed into his nostrils the breath of life $[\text{נִשְׁמַת חַיִּים}]$ and man became a living being $[\text{לְנֶפֶשׁ חַיָּה}]$ ” (Gen 2:7). In Ecclesiastes 12:7, the writer describes death as the reversal of the creation act and uses $\text{רוּחַ}/\pi\nu\epsilon\upsilon\mu\alpha$, *breath*, for spirit instead: “Then the dust will return to the Earth as it was, and the spirit $[\text{רוּחַ}/\pi\nu\epsilon\upsilon\mu\alpha]$ will return to God.” Thus, the “something” is the spirit/soul that God placed in the body to make a living person and this “something” leaves the body

²⁸Later Greek thinking, $\psi\chi\eta$, held “three areas of meaning; (a) *psychē* in the sense of the impersonal basis of life, life itself; (b) the inward part of man; (c) and independent soul, in contrast to the body” (C. Brown, “ $\psi\chi\eta$ ”, NIDNTT, 3:677). The third meaning is the one used in 1 Enoch 22.

²⁹E. Kamlah notes that $\pi\nu\epsilon\upsilon\mu\alpha$, due to Hellenistic influence, was understood in Judaism as “a vital force divinely breathed into man and forming a distinct part of his being; it was not distinguished from the ‘soul’ as far as terminology was concerned, but was contrasted rather with the body: the body is of the earth, the spirit stems from heaven” (E. Kamlah, “ $\pi\nu\epsilon\upsilon\mu\alpha$,” NIDNTT, 3:692).

Table 22. Links between Genesis 4:9-10 and Genesis 9:4-6

Genesis 4:9-10	Genesis 9:4-6
<p>⁹ וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֶל-קַיִן אֵי הֶבֶל אָחִיךָ וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא יָדַעְתִּי הֲשֹׁמֵר אָחִי אֲנִי: ¹⁰ וַיֹּאמֶר מֶה עָשִׂיתָ קוֹל דְּמִי אָחִיךָ צֹעֲקִים אֵלַי מִן-הָאֲדָמָה:</p>	<p>⁴ אֶדְ-בֶּשֶׂר בְּנִפְשׁוֹ דָּמוֹ לֹא תֹאכְלוּ: ⁵ וְאֵד אֶת-דַּמְכֶם לְנַפְשֵׁיכֶם אֲדַרְשׁ מִיָּד כָּל-חַיָּה אֲדַרְשֶׁנּוּ וּמִיָּד הָאָדָם מִיָּד אִישׁ אָחִיו אֲדַרְשׁ אֶת-נַפְשׁ הָאָדָם: ⁶ שִׁפְךָ דָּם הָאָדָם בָּאָדָם דָּמוֹ יִשְׁפֹךְ כִּי בְצַלְם אֱלֹהִים עָשָׂה אֶת-הָאָדָם:</p>
<p>⁹ καὶ εἶπεν ὁ θεὸς πρὸς Καὶν ποῦ ἐστὶν Ἀβὲλ ὁ ἀδελφός σου ὃ δὲ εἶπεν οὐ γινώσκω μὴ φύλαξ τοῦ ἀδελφοῦ μου εἰμι ἐγώ ¹⁰ καὶ εἶπεν ὁ θεός τί ἐποίησας φωνὴ αἵματος τοῦ ἀδελφοῦ σου βοᾷ πρός με ἐκ τῆς γῆς</p>	<p>⁴ πλὴν κρέας ἐν αἵματι ψυχῆς οὐ φάγεσθε ⁵ καὶ γὰρ τὸ ὑμέτερον αἶμα τῶν ψυχῶν ὑμῶν ἐκζητήσω ἐκ χειρὸς πάντων τῶν θηρίων ἐκζητήσω αὐτὸ καὶ ἐκ χειρὸς ἀνθρώπου ἀδελφοῦ ἐκζητήσω τὴν ψυχὴν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου ⁶ ὃ ἐκχέων αἶμα ἀνθρώπου ἀντὶ τοῦ αἵματος αὐτοῦ ἐκχυθήσεται ὅτι ἐν εἰκόνι θεοῦ ἐποίησα τὸν ἄνθρωπον</p>
<p>⁹ Then the LORD said to Cain, "Where is your brother Abel?" "I don't know," he replied. "Am I my brother's guardian?" ¹⁰ Then He said, "What have you done? Your brother's blood cries out to Me from the ground!"</p>	<p>⁴ However, you must not eat meat with its lifeblood in it. ⁵ I will require the life of every animal and every man for your life and your blood. I will require the life of each man's brother for a man's life. ⁶ Whoever sheds man's blood, his blood will be shed by man, for God made man in His image.</p>

at the point of death. This is how 1 Enoch 22 can add that Abel's voice/soul will be heard until the final judgment when Cain and his seed will receive all the punishment they are due. Byron adds that this notion could also be supported by the present tense of

the verbs describing Abel's blood crying, suggesting that the blood would never go silent.³⁰ Thus, Abel's cry for vengeance would be ongoing.

Byron also observes that Abel's blood in Gen 4:9 is in the plural form דָּמָיו, *bloods*. This indicates that the blood is not only the blood of Abel but would also include the blood of all his descendants who were never born.³¹ This would explain Abel's demand that Cain's descendants need to be erased too, based on the *lex talionis* principle. Thus, Cain became the arch-type of the wicked while Abel serves as an arch-type of any innocent person who has been murdered.³²

It is easy to see how this interpretation of Gen 4:9-10 fits nicely into the context of 1 Enoch 22 where it almost functions as the exegetical foundation of the chapter. If the "essence" of the person survives death, where is it going? 1 Enoch 22 reveals that there are holding chambers for these "souls." If Abel's soul is demanding justice, it must be conscious in the period it is in the chamber, as is expanded upon in 1 Enoch 22. Since Cain did not suffer the deserved punishment for his murderous act at the time of this heinous deed due to God's "protection" (Gen 4:15), Abel still has an "open case" against Cain, hence, why his voice is still heard and Cain still has a punishment in store for him in the last judgment (1 Enoch 22:7). Since Cain functions as a type of all murderers and

³⁰Byron, *Cain and Abel*, 190.

³¹Ibid. This is also the interpretation given to Gen 4:10 in rabbinic traditions: "Whoever destroys a soul, it is considered as if he destroyed an entire world. And whoever saves a life, it is considered as if he saved an entire world" (y. *Sanh.* 4:1 [22a]; cf. b. *Sanh.* 37a).

³²For further reading, see the chapter, "The Blood of Righteous Abel," in Byron, *Cain and Abel*, 167-205.

is the father of the “evil seed,” (v. 7), 1 Enoch 22 finds support for the destiny of the souls in the second chamber (the wicked souls who did not receive all their punishment in this life). If Abel’s “soul” can demand justice for his unjust death, it would be reasonable to assume that even the wicked souls could have such a demand (souls in the third chamber) if they suffered a similar fate. This is supported by the law in Gen 9:5-6 which does not differentiate between righteous and wicked but presents a universal law protecting everyone.

Bodily or Spiritual Resurrection?

The *Book of Watchers* does not explicitly address the nature of the eschatological resurrection, if it will be a bodily or just a resurrection of the soul. In 1 Enoch 22:11b and 13b, Raphael seems to indicate that it will only be a resurrection of the spirit for the wicked, rather than body and soul, and it is the soul which will receive the punishment. Chapter 22 does not reveal what will happen to the righteous souls on the day of judgment, however, 1 Enoch 20:8 reveals that the archangel Ramiel is in charge of those who resurrect. Nickelsburg suggests that Ramiel may be identified with the angel Jeremiel in 4 Ezra 4:35-37, who is associated with the souls of the righteous who await the resurrection.³³ In 1 Enoch 5:7-10 and 25:1-7, the texts reveal the destiny intended for the righteous, after the resurrection and the great judgment. The righteous will be rewarded with “light, joy, and peace, and they shall inherit the earth” (5:7). The righteous will also be able to touch the fragrant fruit tree and eat of its fruit for life (25:4-5).

³³Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 170.

Moreover, the fragrance from this place of reward shall penetrate their bones (25:6). All of this suggests that the resurrection in store for the righteous will be a bodily one. Figure 6 illustrates the death and resurrection concept in the *Book of Watchers*.

Fig. 6. Death and Resurrection in the Book of Watchers.

The Book of Parables (37-71)

The Book of Parables is the second and the longest section of 1 Enoch. Most scholars consider these parables to be the latest addition to the 1 Enoch collection. Nickelsburg and VanderKam date them “between the latter part of Herod’s reign and the early decades of the first century C.E., with some preference for the earlier part of this time span.”³⁴ The introduction, chapter 37, introduces Enoch by providing his genealogy (v. 1) and notes that there are three “things” that he would like to reveal “to those who dwell upon the earth” (v. 5). These three “things” are revealed through the three parables, which is the main content of this book. The first, regards the coming judgment of the wicked (chapters 38-44). The second, the lot of the sinners (chapters 45-57). The third, the destiny of the righteous and the elect ones (chapters 58-69).

The eschatological judgment is the dominant theme³⁵ and, as such, permeates the book.³⁶ Nickelsburg and VanderKam note that each parable “begins with an oracular introduction and then features scenes that take place in heaven,” these heavenly scenes “focus on the developing drama of the judgment over which the chosen one [Son of Man] will preside”³⁷ Since the book seems to call for an eschatological judgment of both the righteous and the wicked, the judgment would require a resurrection of all who have

³⁴George W. E. Nickelsburg and James C. VanderKam, *1 Enoch 2: A Commentary on the Book of 1 Enoch, Chapters 37-82*, Hermeneia (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2012), 63. For further discussion on the dating of the book, see *ibid.*, 58-63.

³⁵*Ibid.*, 49.

³⁶The judgment is mentioned throughout the book, see Table 49 in Appendix A for a list of some of these texts.

³⁷Nickelsburg and VanderKam, *1 Enoch 2*, 19.

lived. As such, the judgment texts of this book implies a resurrection belief. Although there are many hints of a resurrection belief,³⁸ there are only two clear resurrection texts in this book, 1 Enoch 51 and 61.

1 Enoch 51

The first resurrection passage can be divided into three subsections, introduced by the phrase “in those days” (highlighted in red), a term associated with the judgment³⁹ (see Table 23). Based on this structure, resurrection is considered a part of the eschatological judgment, which is presided over by the Chosen One (v. 2) who is “the second-most-dominating figure in the Parable.”⁴⁰ It is he who functions as God’s agent, who has been given the authority to sit upon God’s throne, and who reveals the God-given secrets of wisdom (v. 3). At the conclusion of this judgment, all the righteous, whom the Son of Man has found among the resurrected, will dwell on the transformed earth (vv. 4-5) while the wicked will receive their punishment (50:4-5; 52-54).

Although the main focus is on the role and function of God’s Chosen One (highlighted in blue), the text still reveals some interesting details regarding the

³⁸1 Enoch 40:9 gives the name of four archangels, the fourth being Phanuel, who is “set over all actions or repentance unto the hope of those who would inherit eternal life.” Although resurrection is not mentioned in this text, it is certainly implied by the “hope” held by the righteous who will “inherit eternal life.”

1 Enoch 49:3 also hints at a future resurrection by referring to the dead righteous as “those who have fallen asleep.” Referring to death as sleep suggests that death is a temporary condition, just like sleep. If you are sleeping, it is expected that you will awake at some point. This figurative language is also used in Daniel 12:2 when describing death and resurrection and is well attested in the New Testament (Matt 27:52; John 11:11; Acts 7:60; 13:36; 1 Cor 7:39; 11:30; 15:6, 18, 20, 51; 1 Thess 4:13–15; 2 Pet 3:4).

³⁹Nickelsburg and VanderKam, *1 Enoch* 2, 13.

⁴⁰*Ibid.*, 42.

resurrection of the dead. From the second subsection (vv.5a-3), it becomes apparent that both the righteous and the wicked will partake in this resurrection, since the Chosen One will “choose the righteous and holy from among them” (v. 2a). The “them” is a reference to all those who were resurrected, meaning that he chooses the righteous from this group, the un-chosen members assumably are the wicked. Thus, it seems like the author of this parable expects a double resurrection if not a universal resurrection and judgment. This fits nicely with the introduction to the Book of Watchers, which states unequivocally that “there will be judgment on all” (1 Enoch 1:7), see discussion above.

The first subsection regards the nature of the resurrection and makes it clear to the reader that it will be a bodily resurrection. Nickelsburg and VanderKam note that “the three lines of the tristich stand in complementary and almost synonymous parallelism to one another” (see the boxed words in Table 23) and adds that the three words, entrusted-received-owes, for the dead who will be resurrected “derives from the world of finance”⁴¹ (see the underlined words in Table 23). This vocabulary emphasizes the temporalness of death and God’s ownership of all the people. The text considers the dead bodies (and souls?) as great treasures which were only placed in the earth or in *Sheol* (v. 1a-b) for safekeeping in-wait of the eschatological judgment (“in those day”), or as a great debt which needs to be repaid in full by the destruction (v. 1c) whenever God decides to collect what belongs to him.

How the tristich relates to each other is a matter of interpretation. If earth-*Sheol*-destruction are considered as synonyms, they would all refer to the earth where the body

⁴¹Ibid., 183-184.

Table 23. Literary structure of 1 Enoch 51

Resurrection	^{51:1} In those days , the earth will give back what has been entrusted to it, the Sheol will give back what it has received, and destruction will give back what it owes.
Judgment (presided over by the Son of Man)	^{5a} For in those days , my Chosen One [Son of Man] will arise, ² and choose the righteous and holy from among them, for the day on which they will be saved has drawn near. ³ And the Chosen One [Son of Man] , in those days , will sit upon my throne, and all the secretes of wisdom will go forth from the counsel of his mouth, for the Lord of Spirits [God] has given (them) to him and glorified him .
The Earth to Come (The Righteous will live on a transformed earth)	⁴ In those days the mountain will leap like rams, and the hills will skip like lambs satisfied with milk; and the faces of all the angels in heaven will be radiant with joy, ^{5b} and the earth will rejoice, and the righteous will dwell on it, and the chosen will walk about on it.

was buried, with no reference to the soul/spirit of the person which was the main concern of 1 Enoch 22, in the first book of 1 Enoch. However, if Earth, *Sheol* and Destruction are viewed as complementing each other by referring to two different places, earth and *Sheol*, it would imply that the body would be returned from the earth and the Spirit from *Sheol* (e.g., 1 Enoch 102:5) on the day of resurrection. Thus, the soul/spirit would reunite with the body before the judgment takes place. “Destruction” could either be read as a synonym of *Sheol*, where the soul/spirit dwells, or as literal destruction or decaying which takes place after a person has died. In either case, the earth, *Sheol*, and destruction all have to give back what belongs to God. These three phrases parallel 4 Ezra 7:32 (see section on 4 Ezra in the previous chapter) and Pseudo-Philo 3:16 which will be discussed later.

The last subsection of the text reveals the reward which will be experienced by the chosen on the transformed earth,⁴² those who the Son of Man found righteous (v. 4-5b), using the words from Psalm 114:4. This Psalm describes God's deliverance of his people from the land of Egypt, a fitting analogy to the ultimate salvation (v. 2) God's people will experience when the kings, the mighty, and the sinners will be made powerless as a result of the eschatological judgment. Thus, the righteous will be liberated from their suffering and abuse and be rewarded, much like the slaves were liberated from their slave masters in Egypt and were made into the people of God with whom he dwelt.

Nickelsburg and VanderKam observe several shared elements between 1 Enoch 51 and Daniel 12:1-3 but present them in a different order:⁴³

Daniel 12	1 Enoch 51
Michael arises (v. 1a)	Chosen One arises (v. 5a)
Time of trouble (v. 1b)	Presumed from previous context
Your people will be saved (v. 1c α)	Righteous and holy will be saved (v. 2)
The book (v. 1c β)	- (but see 47:5)
resurrection (v. 2a)	Resurrection (v. 1)
Long life in Jerusalem (v. 2 β)	Life on renewed earth (v. 5b-d)
Condemnation of wicked (v. 2 γ)	Condemnation of sinners (v. 3b)
Everlasting life in Jerusalem	Righteous will dwell on the earth
Righteous will shine like the stars (v. 3)	Angels are radiant (v. 4c)

It is the activity of Michael (he will raise up) which introduces the judgment scene (Dan 12:1) in which the resurrection is a key element (Dan 12:2), while in 1 Enoch 51 the judgment follows the resurrection event in which the Chosen One will arise. This

⁴²Ibid., 40.

⁴³Ibid., 186.

reordering of the author of 1 Enoch 51 may be to emphasize that it is not the Chosen One who will resurrect the dead, but rather, God has only placed him in charge of the judgment.

1 Enoch 61:1-5 and 62:12-16

The second resurrection passage, 1 Enoch 61:1-5, begins with the same phrase, “in those days” as the first passage (1 Enoch 51), thus appearing in the same context, the eschatological judgment. This resurrection statement is also mentioned before God “seated the Chosen One up on the throne of glory and he will judge all the works of the holy ones” (v. 8). It follows a similar literary pattern as 1 Enoch 22 by giving the new setting (v. 1a - “in those days”), followed by a vision shown (v. 1), Enoch’s question to the guiding angel (v. 2a), and the angels’ explanation of the vision (v. 2b-5), see Table 24.

The vision shows angels bringing measuring cords with them (vv. 1, 2b) in order to measure the place which has been prepared for the righteous in the North (v. 1; cf. 1 Enoch 32:1-3; 70:3; 77:3; Zech 2). It is only after their return that they reveal these measurements to the righteous. This revelation, according to the angel, gives great hope and strengthens the faith of the righteous (v. 4).⁴⁴ Nickelsburg and VanderKam note “the point here seems to be that, by bringing to the righteous the measurements of the

⁴⁴This would be similar to the encouraging words given by Jesus to his followers in John 14:1-4 to calm their troubled hearts. He is assuring them that God is already preparing a place for them in his house and that they can rest assured that there will be more than enough space.

Table 24. Literary structure of 1 Enoch 61:1-5

Setting	^{1a} And I saw in those days ,
Vision	^{1b} Long ropes were given to those angels, and they took themselves wings and flew and went towards North
Question	^{2a} And I asked the angel, “Why did these take the cords and go?”
Explanation	^{2b} And he said me, “They went so that they may measure.” ³ And the angel who went with me said to me, “These will bring the measures of the righteous, and the ropes of the righteous to the righteous; so that they may rely on the name of the Lord of Spirits forever and ever. ⁴ And the chosen will begin to dwell with the chosen; and these are the measures that will be given to faith, and they will strengthen righteousness. ⁵ And these measures will reveal all the secrets of the depths of the earth, and those who were destroyed by the desert, and those who were devoured by beasts, and those who were devoured by the fish of the sea; so that they may return and rely on the day of the Chosen One, for no one will be destroyed in the presence of the Lord of Spirits, and no one can be destroyed.”

place of their future habitation, the angels provide the righteous with the ‘ropes’ or the moorings that stabilize them, or enables them to rely (lit. “to lean”), through faith, on the name of the Lord of Spirits.”⁴⁵ This will ensure their steadfastness and give them the strength to remain righteous so that they can receive their reward at the resurrection.

Since this is the backdrop of the resurrection passage, it should not be too surprising that it only concerns itself with the resurrection of the righteous (v. 5).⁴⁶ According to the angel, the measurement, the great promise regarding the future dwelling place of the righteous, is also given to the righteous dead (v. 5a), to those who have been destroyed by the desert (v. 5b), devoured by beasts (v. 5c), or devoured by the fish of the

⁴⁵Nickelsburg and VanderKam, *1 Enoch* 2, 244.

⁴⁶It is implied in the following chapters that the wicked are also resurrected and reveals the judgment and punishment given to them (chapter 62-63).

sea (v. 5d). Nickelsburg and VanderKam state that these modes of death, by focusing on those who died outside “the limits of human habitation,” the desert and the sea (5b, d) or by the beasts or fish (5c, d) inhabiting those areas are still included in the resurrection hope.⁴⁷ In other words, regardless of how and where you died, if you are righteous, you will be resurrected in order to receive your reward.⁴⁸ This is the good news which the angels would share with those who are currently dwelling in the depths of the earth, perhaps referring to the souls of the righteous residing in *Sheol* (v. 5a).

The second half of the resurrection promise (v. 5e-g) reinforces the all-inclusive nature of the resurrection of the righteous, noting that “no one will be destroyed in the presence” of God (v. 5f) and “no one is able to be destroyed” (v. 5g). Thus, death is not the final destination but a temporary condition while waiting for the eschatological judgment presided over by the Chosen One (61:6ff). The righteous will then be rewarded with a bodily existence that will never end (62:13-15). The resurrection language of 1 Enoch 62:15a, referring to the garment of glory (eschatological bodies), sounds similar to Paul’s depiction of the resurrection in 1 Cor 15:40-45. Nickelsburg and VanderKam observe that the language used in v. 15a is traditional and parallels Isa 52:1-2 “with its double reference to rising from the dust and putting on new garments of strength” adding that “the language of 62:15 may refer to the assumption of new bodies both by the living,

⁴⁷Nickelsburg and VanderKam, *1 Enoch* 2, 245. This hope sounds familiar to the faith demonstrated by the widow in 2 Macc 7, who encouraged her seven sons to hold onto the resurrection hope even if their bodies would be completely destroyed, since the creator God would still be able to recreate them on the day of judgment (see discussion in section “2 Maccabees 7” above).

⁴⁸This issue is also addressed by Rabbi Eleazar and Rabbi Abba ben Memel in *b. Ketub.* 111a, and by Rabbi Simai in *Gen. Rab.* 94.

whose degradation could be described as laying in the dust (cf. Isa 52:2), and by the dead, whose bodies have been committed to the earth.”⁴⁹ The last verse refers to the garments of glory as the garments of life (v. 16a) which will never wear out (v. 16b), since they will dwell with God forever (v. 16c).

Concluding Remarks

The main difference between these two resurrection passages is the function held by the resurrection. In 1 Enoch 51, the resurrection takes place in order for the judgment to take place. However, in 1 Enoch 61, the resurrection is a part of the judgment, since the righteous will receive their reward. This is probably the reason for why the resurrection of the wicked is specifically mentioned in the second passage.

The difference in emphasis between the resurrection passages in the *Book of Watchers* and the *Book of Parables* should also be noted. In 1 Enoch 22, the main focus is where the souls will be stored while waiting for the eschatological judgment, while the actual resurrection itself is only implied as a part of the judgment scene. In 1 Enoch 51 and 61, the resurrection is the key event for the commencement of the judgment (Chapter 51) or is a part of the judgment (chapter 61). The details of the phase between death and resurrection seems less important. The resurrection passage in the first book has more of a geographical function while the passage in the second book has more of a theological function.

⁴⁹Nickelsburg and VanderKam, *1 Enoch* 2, 267-268.

The Book of Astronomical Writings (72-82)

The third book contained in 1 Enoch is mainly concerned with astronomical data. It was originally written in Aramaic, attested by the copies found among the Dead Sea Scrolls (4Q208-211), and was later translated into Greek. Based on the Aramaic script of the oldest fragments, this composition is dated to about 200 BCE.⁵⁰ Due to the content of this book, it only contains one possible allusion to the resurrection as a part of a reference to a future judgment. In 1 Enoch 81:1-4, the angel Uriel shows Enoch all the heavenly tablets (v. 1), one of which contains the actions of all people who will be living on earth for all the generations of the world (v. 2). At the end of Enoch's study of these books, he states "blessed is the one who dies righteous and good; regarding him no book of wickedness has been written and no day of judgment will be found" (v. 4). This alludes to a future resurrection due to the expected judgment where everyone will be kept responsible for their deeds written in the book. Apart from revealing a possible resurrection view, this text provides little information regarding that possible resurrection belief.

The Book of Dream Visions (83-90)

The fourth book of 1 Enoch dates to the time of the Maccabees, this dating being based on the content of the two dream visions contained in the book. However, some of the material in these dreams may be dated earlier.⁵¹ These visions were originally written

⁵⁰VanderKam, *An Introduction to Early Judaism*, 89.

⁵¹Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch I*, 8. Nickelsburg adds that most of the content of the first dream vision is reworked material and "modified to fit the present context" (346, 361).

in Aramaic, which is attested by the fragments found among the Dead Sea Scrolls (4QEnc-f). The first vision (83-84) reveals the coming judgment of the flood while the much larger second vision, the animal apocalypse (85-90), gives an allegorical description of the world's history starting with Adam and ending with the eschatological judgment. Nickelsburg notes that Noah's flood functions as a type in these two dream visions for the eschatological judgment.⁵²

There are three passages which may allude to a future resurrection. The first, 1 Enoch 84:4-6 mentions the great day of judgment which is paralleled with the judgment of the flood story. Enoch's request and supplication (vv. 5-6) asks God to differentiate between the sinful humanity and the righteous humanity, by keeping a remnant, much like Noah and his family, who survived the judgment and became like "seed bearing plants forever" (v. 6).

The second allusion to a resurrection belief is the use of the word "sleep" as an allegory for "death" (89:36-38). In the dream vision, regarding the Exodus to the death of Moses, the vision refers to the death of Moses as the sheep who had become a man falling asleep (v. 38). As has already been noted (n. 38, page 120), the term sleep emphasizes the temporary nature of death, that a person will once more awake in the great day of judgment.

The last text of interest is 1 Enoch 90:20-37 which describes the eschatological judgment and the new age. In this passage, God summons certain wicked individuals who will be judged and "thrown into that fiery abyss" to be burned (vv. 26-27). These

⁵²Ibid., 347.

individuals belong to three separate groups of people: the first group to be judged are the first fallen stars/angels (vv. 21, 23); the second group refers to the seventy shepherds who God had placed in charge of his sheep but who had killed more than he had permitted (vv. 22, 25); and the last group refers to the blinded sheep (vv. 26-27). The identity of these blinded sheep is not clear. They may refer to the wicked who have survived until the day of judgment or they could be referring to all the wicked who have lived since the time of the golden calf, the later alternative requiring a resurrection.

The description of the new age includes a new temple which will be greater than the old and will be able to house all God's righteous sheep (v. 28). Verse 33 draws the attention to 1 Enoch 89:75 stating that all "those who had been destroyed and dispersed" have returned to the new "house." Nickelsburg suggests that this pairing points to Ezek 34 and 37, the latter using "the metaphor of death and resurrection" when describing the dispersion and the future return. Thus, "the return of those who have been 'destroyed' suggests a literal resurrection of the dead, which is sometimes described as a return of the dispersion."⁵³ The dream vision concludes by noting that the new age will be filled with peace (v. 34) and all the sheep, the wild beasts, and all the birds of heaven (v. 37) were changed and became white cattle (v. 38). In other words, the new age will include both Jews and Gentiles, indicating a return to "created unity" and transforming them "into primordial righteousness and perfection."⁵⁴

⁵³Ibid., 405-406.

⁵⁴Ibid., 407.

The Book of the Epistle of Enoch and other Writings (91-105)

The last book of 1 Enoch is a collection of many small literary units which have been skillfully combined into “a unified work with direction and generic shape.”⁵⁵ Chapter 91, in which Enoch gives his final instruction to his son and the rest of his family (91:1) functions as a bridge chapter. It follows Enoch’s instructions to his son Methuselah by recounting the *Dream Visions* (83-90) and the *Apocalypse of Weeks* which focuses on the judgment theme (92-93), followed by six lengthy discourses (94:6-104:8), all dealing with the two-way theology and the problem of theodicy. The last chapters of the book contain a narrative regarding the *Birth of Noah* (106-107) and some additional Enoch material (108). John Collins considers the dating of this collection of works to be “the same as the other early Enoch books, [dated to] the early second century B.C.”⁵⁶

Due to the judgment theme and the great interest shown the question of theodicy, it is not surprising that there are several references to the resurrection hope in this book.

1 Enoch 91:8-17

The first passage of interest opens with the phrase “in those days,” and describes the total destruction of evil in the judgment of fire where they (the wicked) will be destroyed in fierce eternal judgment (vv. 8-9). At the end of this judgment scene, the text turns its attention towards the righteous, who “will arise from his sleep” (v. 10a).

Nickelsburg and VanderKam note that vv. 10-17 are textually problematic in its current

⁵⁵Ibid., 420.

⁵⁶J. Collins, “Enoch, Book of,” DNTB, 316.

location and were probably “displaced from their original location after 93:10.”⁵⁷ They suggest the resurrection reference in v. 10 was added to create a transition between v. 9 and the misplaced section (vv.11-17).⁵⁸ Regardless of its role, v. 9 does contain evidence of a resurrection hope for the righteous, who will be given wisdom upon their resurrection. This verse uses the same metaphor, sleep for death, as other texts of 1 Enoch, emphasizing the temporary nature of death suffered by the righteous. The last statement of this narrative bridge ends with the warning that those who “walk in the path of violence” will “perish for ever” (v. 19), suggesting that those who walk in the path of the righteous will experience a different outcome.⁵⁹

1 Enoch 92:2-5

It is not clear if this text uses the terminology “arise from sleep” (v. 3a) as a metaphor for the resurrection or as a metaphor for awakening in a spiritual sense. The latter interpretation seems more likely since the comment that the righteous will arise in order to walk in the path of righteousness would seem strange if this passage was referring to the righteous in the world to come.

⁵⁷George W. E. Nickelsburg and James C. VanderKam, *1 Enoch: A New Translation* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2004), 138.

⁵⁸See discussion on “The Original Order of Chapter 91-93” in Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch 1*, 414-415.

⁵⁹This observation is also made in 1 Enoch 98:13-14, which notes that the wicked lack any hope of life (v. 14b), and thus, implying the righteous will.

1 Enoch 102:4 -104:8

In Enoch's sixth and last discourse, "the announcement of the coming judgment reaches its climax."⁶⁰ In this section, the author contrasts the views held by the wicked and the righteous, both dead and alive, regarding the judgment and the resurrection. The author quotes and summarizes the views held by these groups before addressing and refuting them (see Table 25 for the literary structure of the sixth discourse, based on Nickelsburg's structure⁶¹).

Table 25. Literary structure of 1 Enoch 102:4-104:8

I	Addressed to the righteous dead a. Exhortation to the righteous b. Quotes the speech of the sinners c. Author's answer to this	102:4-103:4 102:4-5 102:6-11 103:1-4
II	Addressed to the dead sinners a. Address b. Quotes the speech of sinners c. Author's answer to this	103:5-8 103:5ab 103:5c-6 103:7-8
III	Addressed to the living righteous a. Address b. Quotes the righteous c. Author's answer to this	103:9-104:6 103:9a 103:9b-15 104:1-6
IV	Addressed to the living sinners a. Address b. Quotes the sinners c. Author's answer to this	104:7-8 104:7a 104:7b 104:7c-8

The First Section. The first section of this literary structure is addressed to the righteous dead (102:4-103:4) the author tells the righteous souls to be hopeful since they have died in righteousness ensuring (that although they were not rewarded for their piety

⁶⁰Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality and Eternal Life*, 143.

⁶¹Ibid., 144.

during their bodily life) their death is not the end of the matter (102:4-5). They will receive justice although the sinners may claim that everyone will receive the same destiny, *Sheol*, regardless of behavior in the bodily life,⁶² and that there is no reward for a righteous life (102:6b-11b).⁶³

The author, however, refutes this sentiment (103:1-4) by noting that God has indeed prepared “Good things and joy and honor for them” and “much good will be given you [them] on the place of your [their] labors” (103:3). In fact, their future reward will surpass the pleasure experienced in this life by the sinners (103:3c). All this, according to the author, will be possible due to the eschatological resurrection of “the souls of the pious” who will never perish but spend eternity with God (103:4). Because of this, the souls of the righteous dead should not fear (102:4; 103:4).

The great news for the righteous souls is that their reward is still in store for them, God has not forgotten them (103:3a mentions that everything has been written down). It is important to remember that the first section only addresses resurrection of the soul, excluding the body (103:3a [ψυχαι], 4a [πνεύματα]).

The Second Section. The second section addresses the dead sinners (103:5-8) who took great pleasure in the fact that they got away with their sinful lives without

⁶²This is reminiscent to the observation made in Ecclesiastes 7:15 that everything is vanity, since the just are perishing while the wicked prosper.

⁶³This observation brings to light two unsettling possibilities. Either God does not care how people live their lives and, thus, does not reward or punish people, or the righteous are really the wicked and the wicked are really the righteous. These are the troubling questions contemplated by the righteous souls.

suffering any consequences (see the repetition of the phrase, “in their life,” in v. 6b and v. 6d). They view only the present world as the place for reward or punishment.

However, the author makes it clear that there will be a day of reckoning. The souls/spirits of the wicked will be brought to *Sheol*, like the souls/spirits of the righteous, but their experience of *Sheol* will be quite different. The souls of the righteous are experiencing grief while the souls of the wicked will experience great anguish (103:7b). Their existence will be “in darkness and in a trap and in a burning flame” (103:8a). Moreover, their spirit/souls will participate in the eschatological judgment (103:8b). Thus, they will have no peace while in *Sheol* (103:8c). This section continues its focus on the soul/spirit, referring to their existence in *Sheol* and to their future judgment (vv. 7-8 using ψυχᾶί in both cases).

The Third Section. The third section addresses the living righteous (103:9-104:6), who are experiencing the curses rather than the promised covenant blessings of Deut 28. The righteous seem to agree with the observation held by the wicked, that the theology of the two ways is flawed or non-factual (103:9-15). The author refutes this sentiment since the angels of heaven remember them and their names are written down (104:1). Moreover, their oppressors will be held responsible (104:3d), so they do not have to fear the great judgment which will hold the sinners accountable for their actions (104:5). Thus, the sinners will be dealt with in the future so “do not be companions with them” (104:6b). Instead, the righteous will shine like “the lights of heaven” (104:2b) and

“the portals of heaven will be open” for them (104:2c). They “will have great joy like the angels of heaven” (104:4b). Rather than being companions with the sinners, the righteous will dwell with the hosts of heaven (104:6d). Although this section does not address the topic of resurrection, it does reveal that the living will be brought to heaven and become like lights (stars) or angels, alluding to Dan 12:3.

The Fourth Section. The last section addresses the living sinners, warning them that all of their sins are written down (104:7c). They may think there are no consequences for their sinful behavior, but at the day of judgment they will receive their full eternal punishment (104:5d).

Concluding Remarks. These four sections share many similarities with Dan 12:1-3: both texts address the day of judgment (Dan 12:1; 1 Enoch 103:8; 104:5); both texts refer to books with names which will be used to measure out the judgment (Dan 12:1; 1 Enoch 104:7-8); both texts mention the resurrection (Dan 12:2; 1 Enoch 103:4a) and the permanence of the rewards and punishments (Dan 12:2-3; 1 Enoch 103:4c, 8b); and finally, both texts mention the righteous, or wise, will shine like stars (Dan 12:3; 1 Enoch 104:2b) suggesting the righteous will become like angels.

There are also some significant differences between these two texts. First, in Daniel the dead sleep in the dust of the earth (אֲדָמַת עָפָר) while in 1 Enoch 102:4-103:8 the souls of the dead dwell in *Sheol*. Second, Dan 12:2a describes a limited resurrection of some of the righteous and some of the wicked (Dan 12:2a) while 1 Enoch 102:4-103:8 seems to suggest that only the righteous will be resurrected from *Sheol* while the wicked

souls will remain in what has now become “Hell,” but the text really is unclear. Third, Dan 12:2 describes a bodily resurrection while 1 Enoch 103:3-4 describes only the resurrection of the soul. Fourth, in Dan 12:1-3, there is no indication that a soul/spirit can live independently from the body, while in 1 Enoch 102:4-104:8, the soul/spirit lives on after death and is what will be judged and will receive the reward or punishment. Fifth, Dan 12:1-3 suggests that there will be a limited judgment for only those who have been resurrected while 1 Enoch 102:4-104:8 claims that everyone will be judged. Sixth, in Dan 12:1-3, there is no indication that the dead are conscious while in 1 Enoch 102:4-104:8, the souls/spirits seems to have an awareness while in *Sheol*. Figure 7 illustrates the death and resurrection concept in the sixth discourse of the *Book of the Epistle of Enoch* (102:4-104:8).

Fig. 7. Death and Resurrection in the Book of the Epistle of Enoch.

The last resurrection passage of 1 Enoch appears in an addendum to the book. Although it is a later edition to the larger work and may have been written during the first century CE, elements of this addendum reflect much older material.⁶⁴ Nickelsburg observes that this chapter “is actually a summarizing and interpretive conclusion to the corpus.”⁶⁵ It reveals what will happen to the sinners (vv. 2-6) and the righteous (vv. 10-12) as the result of the eschatological judgment, which ruling is based on what has been written in the heavenly records (vv. 7-10a, 15b). The author concludes that it will be a transparent judgment since both the righteous and the wicked will see what happened to the other group (vv. 14-15), thus, the righteous are vindicated and the wicked are punished in “Hell.”

In this chapter, the author makes clear that the current life determines whose name will be written in the book of life (vv. 1b, 7-10), and only those who have their name written in that book will have their spirit resurrected (v. 11), transformed (into shining lights, v. 12a), manifested (shining like stars, v. 12), and exalted (heavenly enthronement, v. 12b) by this vindication.

As in 1 Enoch 102-104, no mention is made of a resurrection of the souls of the wicked. The text only states that they will suffer in *Sheol*, describing it almost as if it is “Hell” (108:5-6). Thus, the wicked souls may be in no need for a resurrection since they are already experiencing “Hellfire.” Regarding the living sinners, they will be punished

⁶⁴Nickelsburg, *1 Enoch 1*, 554.

⁶⁵Ibid., 552.

on the day of judgment and will join the wicked souls in “Hell” (v. 2). From this it seems like the judgment will be universal – everyone will receive judgment according to what is written in the book, but only the righteous dead will be resurrected and will join the righteous living in heaven.⁶⁶

Regarding the nature of this resurrection, at first glance it appears like a resurrection of only the spirit, but a careful reading of the text seems to suggest a physical reality of the righteous in heaven, more like a bodily experience. The saved will sit on the throne of their honor (v. 12b) and they will shine like the righteous in Dan 12:3. This may suggest that they will receive “new” bodies which radiate light in contrast to the old ones who were buried in the earth.⁶⁷

Concluding Remarks

The five books of 1 Enoch present various views on the resurrection belief. All the books view the eschatological judgment as the solution to the problem of theodicy, and the resurrection belief is what makes the judgment possible. Without it, a person could not be held responsible for his/her behavior and God would not be able to hand out His blessings and curses. Several of these resurrection passages share similar language

⁶⁶Verse 11c may suggest that there are some righteous who were properly compensated for their piety in this world (in their body), and would therefore not require any further reward. This would be in line with Dan 12:2. However, the many categories of righteous listed in the Book of Life and Books of Records (v.7) seems to suggest an universal reward for the righteous, including the righteous dead.

⁶⁷This would be similar to the idea presented in the discussion on the nature of the resurrected body by Paul in 1 Cor 15:35-57. The resurrected bodies are here described as glorified, incorruptible, radiant, and spiritual.

and concepts with the book of Daniel, especially with the resurrection statement in Daniel 12. Genesis 4:9-10 functions as the foundation of the resurrection concept in 1 Enoch 22.

Considering the resurrection views illustrated in figures 6 and 7, it becomes clear that each book has a different emphasis. The first book shows a greater emphasis or interest in the “extra-terrestrial” geography, exploring the place where all the souls will be held in wait for the eschatological judgment. The fifth book, on the other hand, focuses on the theological problem of the two-way theology. It also becomes clear that the place prepared for the righteous influences the nature of the resurrection belief. If the righteous will dwell on a renewed earth, a bodily resurrection becomes necessary. If a heavenly dwelling is proposed, a “spiritual” body, like that of the angels, seems to be the answer. Regardless of where the righteous go upon their resurrection, the wicked will spend their eternity in the fiery abyss or “Hell.”

2 Enoch

2 Enoch has only survived in two Old Slavonic recensions (one short [A] and one longer [J]), both translated from Greek, but may have had a Semitic origin.⁶⁸ Craig Evans suggests a late first century CE date for the composition, possibly authored by an Egyptian Jew.⁶⁹ The composition expands on Gen 5:21-32, from Enoch to the flood, and adds a great amount of apocalyptic material. It has three major sections: Enoch’s heavenly journey (1-34), his revelation and instructions to his children (35-68), and ends

⁶⁸F. I. Andersen, “2 (Slavonic Apocalypse of) Enoch,” *OTP* 1:94; Michael E. Stone, “Apocalypse Literature,” in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period*, ed. Michael E. Stone, *CRINT* 2 (Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 406-407.

⁶⁹Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 30.

with the antediluvian priesthood (69-73).⁷⁰ Andersen notes the eschatological predictions in the book which, in addition to the flood, reveal the fate of humans after their death, both the good and the bad. This revelation was, according to the author, shown to Enoch on his guided tour of the seven heavens,⁷¹ which included Paradise and the place of punishment (second [7-10], third [8-10] and fifth heaven [18]).⁷²

The many judgment texts in 2 Enoch also allude to an eschatological resurrection (see Table 49 in Appendix A for a list of these texts). 2 Enoch 65:6-11 serves as a great example, noting that “each person will go to the Lord’s great judgment” (v. 6), implying also the dead will also be judged. All the righteous who survive this judgment will then be gathered in the “great age” to spend all eternity in Paradise, where they will have great light (v. 9) and shine forth like the sun (v. 11). The resurrection hope is also alluded to in 2 Enoch J70:1, which reveals Methusalem’s hope “in an eternal inheritance,” and 70:3 compares his death to rest, the same metaphor used in 1 Enoch. However, there is only one clear resurrection text in 2 Enoch and it will be explored in the following section.

2 Enoch J32

2 Enoch J32 is found at the end of the author’s interpretation and expansion on the creation story which began in 2 Enoch J24:2b. As a consequence of Adam and Eve’s transgression in Paradise, just hours after their creation, God cursed “mankind’s evil fruit-

⁷⁰There is also an appendix to the book, *2 Enoch in Merilo Pravednoe* which is a 13th Century composition containing material taken from 2 Enoch.

⁷¹The longer recension (J) list an additional three heavens, bringing the total to ten.

⁷²Andersen, “2 (SlavonicApocalypse of) Enoch,” 91.

bearing “ so the “fruit of doing good is sweet and exertion” (J31:7-9),⁷³ and adds an interesting exegetical, or rather a midrashic, reading of Gen 3:19b, the last phrase of the “curse” spoken to Adam.⁷⁴

2 Enoch J32:1

You are earth,
and into the earth once again you will return
out of which I took you.
And I will not destroy you,
but I will send you away to what I took you from.
Then I can take you once again
at my second coming.

Gen 3:19 (CSB)

You will eat bread by the sweat of your brow
until you return to the ground,
since you were taken from it.
For you are dust, and you will return to dust."

The author perceives a resurrection hope in the biblical texts, noting that death will not ultimately destroy a person. Although a body will return to earth at the point of death, the person will once more be recreated from this earth at the second coming. The connection between a bodily resurrection belief and the creation account was already observed in the mother’s encouraging words to her seven sons in 2 Macc 7:23 (see discussion on 2 Macc 7 in chapter 2). This thought is also expressed in *Targum Pseudo-Jonathan*, one of the Aramaic translations of the Hebrew Scripture,⁷⁵ presenting the

⁷³The author attempts to lessen the impact of the curses in Gen 3:14-19 by limiting them to human actions rather than a curse on the humans in general, the earth, or any other creature (2 Enoch J31:7).

⁷⁴This interpretation is also attested in *Gen. Rab.* 20:10.

⁷⁵*Targum Pseudo-Jonathan* has a tendency to paraphrase the biblical text and adding midrashim which is not found in other Targumim (Matrin McNamara, *Targum and Testament Revisited: Aramaic Paraphrases of the Hebrew Bible*, 2nd ed. [Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010], 264). The earlier *Targum of Onqelos* gives a literal translation of the Hebrew text and therefore does not share the interpretative expansion of Gen 3:19b given by *Pseudo-Jonathan* and 2 Enoch.

resurrection as a part of the eschatological judgment in which everyone will be judged, as opposed to the more general reference to the second coming in 2 Enoch J32:1.⁷⁶

Genesis 3:19

בליעות כף ירך תיכול מזונא PJT
 עד דתיהדור לעפרא
 דמינא איתבראת
 ארום עפרא אנת ולעפרא תתוב
 ומן עפרא אנת עתיד למיקום
 למיתן דינא וחושבנא על כל מה דעברת
 ביום דינא רבא:

בזעת אפיד תאכל לחם WTT
 עד שובך אל-האדמה
 כי ממנה לקחת
 כי-עפר אתה ואל-עפר תשוב:

By the labor of your hands you shall eat food
 until you turn again to the dust
 from which you was created:
 for dust you are, and unto dust you shall return;
**for from the dust it is to be that you are to arise,
 to render judgment and reckoning for all that you
 have done, in the day of the great judgment.**

You will eat bread by the sweat of your brow
 until you return to the ground,
 since you were taken from it.
 For you are dust, and you will return to dust."

Comparing the Pseudo-Jonathan with 2 Enoch J32:1 expansion, J32:1 places special emphasis on the belief that death will not be able to destroy the person, perhaps an attempt to neutralize the great certainty of death God warned Adam he would suffer as a consequence of eating of the forbidden fruit: “ביום אכלך ממנו מות תמות,” *on the day you eat of it [the fruit] you will certainly die* (Gen 2:17).

Concluding Remarks

2 Enoch does not address what happens to the soul in the intermediate period, between physical death and the physical re-embodiment at the time of resurrection based

⁷⁶Andersen argues that the phrase “second coming” does not necessarily suggest the expansion to be a Christian interpolation. He observes “the idea is [already] present in Jub 1:26, where God descends at the end of the world, and lives with his purified children for eternity” (“2 [Slavonic Apocalypse] Enoch,” 155, n. 32c).

on the interpretation of Gen 3:19. 2 Enoch J23:5 implies not only the pre-existence of the souls⁷⁷ but also their predestination (cf. J49:2; J53:2), noting: “All the souls of men, whatever of them are not yet born, and their places, prepared for eternity. For all the souls are prepared for eternity, before the composition of the earth.”

The author of 2 Enoch also states that the spirits will not perish (58:6). However, it is not revealed where the souls will be stored or whether or not they are conscious.⁷⁸ At the time of the resurrection, everyone will be judged according to deeds while alive (2 Enoch 62:3 makes clear that there is no repentance after death). The righteous will receive their eternal inheritance in Paradise, located in the third Heaven (8:1-9:1; 42:3-14; 44),⁷⁹ receiving glorious bodies (22:8) and becoming like the angels (22:10; 66:7). This is the same image presented in Daniel 12:3 where the righteous will become like stars. The wicked, on the other hand, will receive their eternal reward in “Hell” (10:1-6; 40:12-13; 41:2; 42:1), located in the fifth heaven. There they will experience all kinds of torture and torment, in cruel darkness and lightless gloom with black fire blazing up perpetually with a river of fire (10:1-2). Figure 8 illustrates the death and resurrection concept in 2 Enoch.

⁷⁷This belief seems to be more clearly stated in Wis 8:19-20 and is also present in the writings of Philo, Josephus, and among the Rabbis of the Amoraic Period (see Winston, *Wisdom of Solomon*, 25-32,198).

⁷⁸The condemned angels, those who joined the rebellion against God (7:3), who are imprisoned in the Second Heaven, and are tormented unceasingly while waiting for the eschatological judgment (v. 1), belong to a different category than the humans.

⁷⁹2 Enoch 8:5 reveals that the third Heaven, the location of Paradise, is located between the corruptible and incorruptible. Thus, Paradise is not located on the present earth (corruptible) nor in God’s abode (incorruptible), which according to 2 Enoch is located the seventh through the tenth heaven (20-22). Paul also gives an explicit reference to the third heaven as the place where he was taught by God in Paradise (2 Cor 12:2-4).

Fig. 8. Death and Resurrection in 2 Enoch.

3 Enoch

3 Enoch, according to the introduction, was written by Rabbi Ishmael, the High Priest (3 En 1:1; 2:3) who died in 132 C.E, the year the Bar Kokhba revolt started.

Although 3 Enoch as been attributed to Ishmael, most scholars believe it was written over a longer time-period, the oldest section reflecting traditions from the time of the Maccabees, while the final redaction would be dated to the fifth or sixth century CE.⁸⁰ It

⁸⁰P. Alexander, “3 (Hebrew Apocalypse of) Enoch,” OTP 1:299.

was originally written in Hebrew and is a part of Jewish mystical tradition, *Hekhalot* literature.⁸¹ Collins notes that “while this book is considerably later than *1 Enoch* and *2 Enoch*, it may in a sense be considered the culmination of the tradition about Enoch’s ascent to heaven.”⁸² The book records Ishmael’s Heavenly journey (chs. 1-2), where he meets the exalted Enoch who is called Metatron (chs. 3-16),⁸³ and is shown the heavenly household (chs. 17-40), and the wonders of Heaven (chs. 41-48).⁸⁴

The universal judgment and resurrection theme is also important in 3 Enoch, however, unlike 1 and 2 Enoch, this book shows no interest in the eschatological judgment, nor sees any need for an eschatological resurrection. Instead, it presents an individual judgment at the point of death which includes a resurrection of the soul in order for it to be judged before God’s throne. The two resurrection passages in 3 Enoch will be considered in the following sections.

3 Enoch 28:7-10

The first resurrection passage appears at the end of the judgment scene found in 3 Enoch 28. In this passage, God sits on his throne of judgment every day (v. 7) to reward or punish the souls of those who have just died (cf. 3 En 28:10; 31:2; 44:3). The language used to describe this judgment (3 En 28:7) seems to be taken from Dan 7:9-10 (see the

⁸¹Collins, “Enoch, Books of,” 317.

⁸²Ibid.

⁸³In 3 Enoch, Metatron is the lesser YHWH (3 En 12:5; 48C:7; 48D:1 [90]), God’s vice-regent (3 En 10:3-6), and sits on a throne next to God’s presiding over the court (3 En 16:1). This angel shares many similarities with the archangel Michael and with Jesus Christ of the New Testament.

⁸⁴Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament*, 31.

highlighted section in Table 26). Both texts mention “the throne of judgment,” the books needed for the judgment to take place, the heavenly host and the judge.

Table 26. The judgment scene in 3 Enoch 28 and Daniel 7

Daniel 7:9-10	3 Enoch 28:7 ⁸⁵
<p>⁹ חָזָה הָיִיתָ עַד דִּי כְרִסְוֹן רְמִיז וְעִתִּיק יוֹמִין יִתָּב לְבוּשָׁה פְּתֻחִים לִפְנֵי כְרִסְוִיהָ שְׂבִיבִין דִּי־נֹר גְּלִגְלוּהִי נֹר דִּלְק: ¹⁰ נִתְר דִּי־נֹר נִגְד וְנִפְק מִן־קְדָמוּהִי אֶלְף אֲלָפִים יִשְׁמְשֻׁנָּה וְרָבֹ רַבֹּן קְדָמוּהִי יְקִימוּן דִּינָא יִתָּב וְסִפְרִין פְּתִיחוּ:</p>	<p>⁷ ובכל יום ויום כשה[ק]ב"ה יושב על כסא הדין ודין את העולם כולו וספרי חיים וספרי מתים פתוחים לפניו. כל בני עליונים עומדים לפניו באימה וביראה ובפחד וברעדה. באותה שעה ה[ק]ב"ה יושב על כסא הדין בדין. לבושו לבן כמו שלג ושער ראשו כמו צמר נקי ומעולה כולו כאור נגה וכולו מלא צדקה בשריון</p>
<p>⁹ "As I kept watching, thrones were set in place, and the Ancient of Days took His seat. His clothing was white like snow, and the hair of His head like whitest wool. His throne was flaming fire; its wheels were blazing fire. ¹⁰ A river of fire was flowing, coming out from His presence. Thousands upon thousands served Him; ten thousand times ten thousand stood before Him. The court was convened, and the books were opened.</p>	<p>⁷ And every day, as the Holy One, blessed be He, is sitting upon the Throne of Judgment and judges the whole world, and the Books of the Living and the Books of the Dead are opened before Him, then all the children of heaven are standing before him in fear, dread, awe and trembling. At that time, (when) the Holy One, blessed is He, is sitting upon the Throne of Judgment to execute judgment, his garment is white as snow, the hair on his head as pure wool and the whole of his cloak is like the shining light. And he is covered with righteousness all over as with a coat of mail.</p>

Moreover, the concept of the court officers, עירין, “watchers” and קדישין, “holy ones” in 3 En 28:8-9 is probably taken from Daniel 4 which refers to celestial beings descending from heaven to carry out God’s judgment on king Nebuchadnezzar (Dan 4:13, 17, 23). This is the only passage in the TaNaKh where these two words appear together, also in the context of divine judgment.

⁸⁵Unless otherwise stated, the Hebrew text and the English translation of 3 Enoch is taken from Hugo Odeberg, *3 Enoch or the Hebrew Book of Enoch: Edited and Translated for the First Time with Introduction, Commentary & Critical Notes* (New York: Ktav, 1973).

The main difference between these two passages is when the judgment will take place. While the judgment scene in Dan 7:9-10 is a unique eschatological event, taking place after the “time and times and half a time” period (Dan 7:25) and introduces the Messianic era (Dan 7:13-14, 27), the judgment scene in 3 En 28 suggests that the author understood this judgment as a daily occurrence (ובכל יום ויום, “and every day”). Regardless of this difference, the outcome of both judgment scenes are in the favor of the saints (Dan 7:27), and the righteous (3 En 28:10).

It is in the author’s concluding remark on the judgment scene (v. 10) where he explains the meaning of the names of the court officers (עירין, “watchers” and קדישין, “holy ones”) that the resurrection is mentioned.

Why are they called *Irin* and *Qaddishin*?

By reason that they sanctify the body and the spirit with lashes of fire on the third day of the judgment, as it is written (Hos. vi. 2):

“After two days will he revive us: on the third he will raise us up, and we shall live before him.”

ולמה נקרא שמן עירין וקדישין.
על שם שמקדישין את הגוף ואת הנשמה
בפלסאות של אש ביום הג' של דין
שנאמ' ((הושע ו' ב'))

יחיינו מיומים הג' יקמנו ונחיה לפניו:

Their names reflect their function as being in charge of the sanctifying process of both the body (הגוף) and the soul (הנשמה) with the help of purifying fire, during the three-day-long judgment process everyone will experience upon death. The author quotes Hosea 6:2 in support of this “judgment of the grave” phase which will culminate in the resurrection, the reviving (חיה) and raising up (קום) of the person to life (חיה) before God. The only

difference between Hos 6:2 and the quote in 3 Enoch 28 is the abbreviation of “the third day,” הַשְּׁלִישִׁי בַיּוֹם in Hosea and הַגִּי in 3 Enoch.⁸⁶

This resurrection text does not disclose much regarding the nature of the resurrection apart from revealing that it will take place after a three-day purification process and involves both the dead person’s body and soul. It also seems to suggest the resurrection to be universal and the said purification process will enable everyone to come before God, whether the person was righteous or wicked during his/her life. This understanding is supported by the judgment scene in 3 Enoch 44 which reveals that the wicked and the intermediate souls will be brought down from the presence (מַלְפָּנֵי) of God and the *Šekinah* in Heaven, as they are receiving their sentences (v. 3), eternal fire in Gehinnom,⁸⁷ or a limited purification process in *Sheol* before they will join the righteous souls for all eternity in Heaven. This passage also supports the body and soul aspect of the resurrection suggested in 3 En 28:10. According to 3 En 43:2 and 44:5-6, the resurrected souls will have bodies, however, these bodies seem to be different than the

⁸⁶*Gen. Rab.* 56:1-2 is also commenting on the three day period in Hosea 6:2 in light of the resurrection belief.

⁸⁷The text does not clearly state how long the wicked will be tortured in the fire of Gehinnom, but it would be reasonable to assume it will last for all eternity. Like 2 Enoch, 3 Enoch also implies that the soul (נִשְׁמָה) pre-exists (cf. 2 En J49:2; 3 En 43:1, 3), but 3 Enoch adds a few more details and places a strong emphasis on the immortal nature of the soul. Thus, all souls will survive death, the righteous with God and the wicked in Gehinnom (3 En 43-44). The “intermediate souls,” those who are neither righteous enough for Heaven or wicked enough for Gehinnom, will be purified in *Sheol* until they are fit to join the righteous souls in Heaven (3 En 44:2-3a, 5b).

earthly ones (see Table 27). 3 Enoch 15:1 lends further support to this belief since Enoch's earthly body was transformed when he was taken to heaven.⁸⁸

Table 27. The bodily forms of the soul

15:1	Righteous	Forthwith my flesh was changed into flames, my sinews into flaming fire, my bones into coals of burning juniper, the light of my eye-lids into splendor of lightnings, my eye-balls into fire-brands, the hair of my head into hot flames, all my limbs into wings of burning fire and the whole of my body into glowing fire.
43:2		And he lifted me up to his side, took me by his hand lifted me up near the Throne of Glory by the place of the <i>Shekina</i> ; and he revealed the Throne of Glory to me, and he showed me the spirits that have been created and had returned: and they were flying above to Throne of Glory before the Holy One, blessed be He.
44:5	Intermediate	And behold the appearance of their faces (and, lo, it was) as the appearance of children of men, and their bodies like eagles. And not only that but (furthermore) the color of the countenance of the intermediate was like pale grey on account of their deeds, for there are stains upon them until they have become cleaned from their iniquity in the fire.
44:6	Wicked	And the color of the wicked was like the bottom of a pot on account of the wickedness of their doings.

3 Enoch 44:7a

In the second clear resurrection reference, Rabbi Ishmael is shown the souls of the patriarchs and the righteous (3 En 44:7a) who brings petitions before God on behalf of God's people, to intervene and redeem His people and reveal His kingdom on earth (v. 7b):

And I saw the spirits of the Patriarchs **Abraham** **Isaac** and **Jacob** and the rest of **the righteous** **whom they have brought up out of their graves and who have ascended to the Heaven**. And they were praying before the Holy One, blessed be He, saying in their prayer: "Lord of the Universe!

וראיתי נשמתן של אבות העולם **אברהם** **יצחק** **ויעקב** **ושאר הצדיקים** **שמעמידים אותם מקבריהם ועולים לרקיע** ומתפללין לפני ה[ק] "בה ואומר' בתפלה רש"ע.

⁸⁸The theme of a celestial body is also hinted at in the fragment 15B:5 when Moses was taken to heaven to receive God's law, expanding on Exod 34, noting that "light shines from the skin of your [Moses'] face from one end of the world to the other" (OTP 1:304).

This passage does not add any new details regarding the resurrection but it does support the reading given to the first resurrection text (3 En 28:10) and the judgment scene in 3 En 43-44, that the righteous will spend eternity in Heaven upon the completion of the three-day-judgment of the grave.

Concluding Remarks

3 Enoch presents a rather developed picture of the events that will take place upon the death of a person. The person will undergo a three-day cleansing process which will enable him/her to stand before God's throne, before he/she is resurrected and brought to Heaven in order to receive their eternal sentence based on his/her behavior before the point of death, which is supported by the author's interpretation of Daniel 7. Based on this outcome, he/she will either remain in Heaven, spend eternity in Gehinnom, or be purified in *Sheol* before he/she will be able to join the righteous in Heaven. Thus, 3 Enoch lacks both an eschatological judgment and resurrection due to the individual purification process, resurrection, and judgment experienced by each person upon death. The person receives his/her punishment and reward immediately following their sentencing. Hosea 6:2 served as an important resurrection text. Figure 9 illustrates the death and resurrection concept in 3 Enoch.

Fig. 9. Death and Resurrection in 3 Enoch.

Sibylline Oracles

The Sibylline Oracles is a collection of Jewish and Christian *vaticinium ex eventu* oracles ranging in date from the second century BCE to the seventh century CE (see Table 28 for their provenance). It is important to keep in mind that these oracles were collected over a 700 year time-period and although some of these oracles had originally a Jewish origin, they were later incorporated into a Christian composition or received a Christian redaction.

Table 28. The provenance of the Sibylline Oracles

Oracle	Date of Composition	Religious Affiliation	Place of Origin
Prologue	< 6 th cent. CE	Most likely Christian	Unknown
1-2	Turn of the era	Jewish	Asia Minor
	2 nd cent. CE	Christian redaction	
3	mid. 2 nd cent. BCE < X > 70 CE	Jewish	Egypt
4	Alexander < X > 80 CE	Jewish	Syria
5	70 CE < X > 132 CE	Jewish	Egypt
6	> c. 300 CE	Christian	Syria
7	2 nd cent. CE	Christian	Syria
8	> 180 CE	Jewish	Most likely Near East
	> 240-320 CE	Christian redaction	
11-14	Turn of the era < X > 7 th cent. CE	Jewish/Pagan?	Egypt

These oracles are pseudepigraphical texts attributed to the legendary Sibyls of the antiquity,⁸⁹ depicted as an aged pagan woman who gave ecstatic prophecies. The earliest references to Sibyl are from the fifth and fourth century BCE, but numerous Sibylls

⁸⁹Evans, *Ancient Texts for the New Testament Studies*, 31.

appeared in the following centuries.⁹⁰ Collins notes: “the most famous collection of Sibylline oracles in antiquity was the official one at Rome” which was lost in 83 BCE, when the temple of Jupiter burned down.⁹¹

The prologue of the composition explains the importance of the oracles and why he, the author, decided to collect them. He explains that *Sibyl* is a Latin word meaning “prophetess” and states Sibyls “have lived in various times and places, and are ten in number” (line 30). He adds: “In manifold ways they tell of certain past history, and equally, foretell future events, and, to speak simply, they can profit those who read them in no small way” (line 27).

The content of these oracles are saturated with eschatological material with the exception of Oracles 11-13. John Collins observes that “the eschatology of the Jewish oracles is political in nature” focusing on the future messianic kingdom, while the Christian oracles show “extensive interest in the fate of the individual after death.”⁹² He notes:

Belief in a resurrection is attested in the Jewish Sibylline Oracles 4 but only very tersely. There is some doubt as to how much of the judgment scene in Sibylline Oracles 2 is Jewish or Christian. However, the developed interest in the suffering of the condemned is most prominently displayed in Sibylline Oracles 2, which is largely Christian, the Christian Sibylline Oracles 7, and the Christian parts of Sibylline 8. Sibylline Oracles 2 is especially characterized by its detailed interest in the fiery sufferings of the damned. Even in the Christian books, however, the

⁹⁰J. J. Collins, “The Sibylline Oracles,” in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period*, ed. Michael E. Stone, CRINT 2 (Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 358.

⁹¹Ibid.

⁹²J. J. Collins, “Sibylline Oracles,” in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* (ed. James H. Charlesworth; New York: Doubleday, 1983), 1:323.

paradise of the resurrected saints is an earthly one, depicted in terms of a transformation of the earth.⁹³

This work will not try to harmonize all the resurrection texts appearing in this collection, but will consider them within the context of each book. It will also pay close attention to the religious background of the various resurrection texts, whether they are Jewish or Christian. Moreover, this work will only focus on the passages that refer or allude to the TaNaKh.

Book 1

As noted in Table 23, the first book of Sibyl is a Jewish oracle with a large Christian redaction. It gives an overview of the world history (1.1-4) and was probably divided into ten periods. However, the last three periods are now lost due to the large Christian addition. The first five periods of the book bring the reader from the Creation (1.5-64) down to the destruction of the earth at the Flood Narrative (1.282), the primeval history of Genesis 1-11. The last five periods of the world history start with the golden period after the Flood (1.283) down to the second destruction of the world, this time by fire, which is expanded upon in *Book 2* (the eight and ninth period is missing in the current composition). Both sets of five periods seem to follow the same pattern as Daniel 2, four declining ages followed by judgment/destruction. The resurrection passage appears in the large Christian addition at the end of the book (1.324-400), see the highlighted section of the text in Appendix A (1.349, 355, 378). Reading this addition, it becomes apparent that the author has integrated key events from Jesus' life and included

⁹³Ibid.

references from the TaNaKh, to create an oracle which would find its fulfillment in the New Testament Jesus, who even carries the numerical value of 888 (1.326-329)⁹⁴ as the promised Messiah (see the textual references added to the text in Appendix A). The Christian author has not attempted to find any support from the TaNaKh regarding this belief, only stating it was a part of Jesus' gospel message to the righteous when warning about the eschatological judgment (1.349), adding that Jesus, upon his death, even went down to the house of Hades to announce the resurrection hope to the already dead (1.377-378).⁹⁵ This passage also alludes to Jesus' resurrection miracles during his ministry (1.355) and to the resurrection of Jesus himself after three days in Hades (1.379). All these resurrection references take the belief for granted.

Book 2

The second book of the Sibylline Oracles focuses on the events taking place during the last period of world history (2.15) and the eschatological crises leading up to the last judgment (2.32-347). Collins notes the many Christian redactions to the original Jewish composition, considering numerous passages as certainly Christian (2.45-55, 177-183, 190-192, 238-251, 254, 311-312).⁹⁶

⁹⁴This is an example of Gematria by which a numerical value is given to a word based on the letters of that word, in this case, the number 888. This number most likely refers to Jesus since that is the value of the Greek letters of Ἰησοῦ, and it also fits the other two criteria given in the text: "bearing four vowels, and the consonants in him are two" (1.326). This is similar to the book of Revelation which gives the numerical value of 666 to the beast/power/person who opposes God and His people (Rev 13:18).

⁹⁵This is referring to Peter's statement that Jesus, upon his death, "went and made a proclamation to the spirits (πνεύμασιν) in prison," who had died in their disobedience "in the days of Noah" (1 Pet 3:19-20).

⁹⁶Collins, "Sibylline Oracles," OTP 1:330.

Before the eschatological judgment takes place, Sibyl reveals the signs of the end (2.154-173), the eschatological role of the Hebrews (2.174-186), and the coming of the Elijah (2.187-195) followed by the complete destruction of the whole creation by fire (2.196-213). This eschatological destruction will even include the “implacable Hades and the Heavenly vault” (2.199-200) so that “all will melt into one and separate into clear air” (2.212-213). After this total destruction, the universal judgment will take place (2.217-219) which will decide whether a person “acted lawlessly or righteously” during their lifetime (2.93-94). This universal judgment would demand a universal resurrection.

Sibylline Oracles 2.221-251

The resurrection passage begins by noting the central role God holds in the resurrection process since He will give “souls and breath and voice to the dead” (2.221-222) which, according to Gen 2:7, are the crucial divine elements required to create life. The opening statement is followed by a detailed description of the resurrection process itself, taken from Ezek 37:1-10 (see the highlighted sections), concluding that the universal resurrection will happen in a single day (2.226).

Ezekiel 37:1-10 (CSB)

Sibylline Oracles 2.221-226

¹ The hand of the LORD was on me, and He brought me out by His Spirit and set me down in the middle of the valley; it was **full of bones**. ² He led me all around **them**. There were a **great many of them** on the surface of the valley, and **they were very dry**. ³ Then He said to me, "Son of man, **can these bones live?**" I replied, "Lord GOD, only You know." ⁴ He said to me, "Prophesy concerning these **bones** and say to them: **Dry bones**, hear the word of the LORD!

⁵ This is what **the Lord GOD** says to **these bones**: **I will** cause breath to enter you, and you will live.

⁶ **I will** put tendons on you, make flesh grow on you, and cover you with skin. **I will** put breath in you so that you come to life. **Then you will know that I am the LORD.**" ⁷ So I prophesied as I had been commanded.

While I was prophesying, there was a noise, a rattling sound, and the **bones** came together, **bone to bone**. ⁸ As I looked, **tendons** appeared on them, **flesh grew**, and **skin covered them**, but there was no breath in them.

⁹ He said to me, "Prophesy to the breath, prophesy, son of man. Say to it: This is what **the Lord GOD** says: Breath, come from the four winds and breathe into these slain so that they may live!" ¹⁰ So I prophesied as He commanded me; the breath entered them, and they came to life and stood on their feet, a vast army.

Then **the heavenly one** will give souls and breath and voice to **the dead**

and **bones** fastened with all kinds of joinings . . . **flesh** and **sinews** and veins and **skin about the flesh**, and the former hairs.

Bodies of humans, made solid in heavenly manner, breathing and set in motion, will be raised on a single day.

Comparing these two texts, it become clear Sibyl had Ezek 37:1-10 in mind when describing the resurrection. Both texts view God as the source of life and the instigator of the resurrection process. The subject of both texts are death (loss of breath) and resurrection (regaining breath), illustrated by the dry bones which will once more come alive. The resurrection process, described in both texts, is a reversal of the decaying process which starts at the time of death,⁹⁷ although Sibyl has added a few more steps to the process. There is, however, a major difference between these two accounts. The Ezekiel prophecy was given to the people of Israel, who found themselves in exile after the destruction of their nation, to give them hope of a future resurrection of that nation. Sibyl interpreted this prophecy universally, as a reference to the eschatological

⁹⁷The dying process: At the moment God's breath departs the body, the person is dead. Not long after a person dies, the body starts decaying, first the skin, then the flesh, followed by the tendons which holds the bones together. In the end, the body has turned into a pile of bones. The resurrection process described in the two resurrection texts follows the dying process in reverse order.

resurrection – a necessary element of the eschatological judgment. Elledge argues, regarding the same interpretation of Ezek 37 found in 4Q385 frg.2, “if our author is reading Ezek 37 as a prophecy about the resurrection, then he [she] likely understood the resurrection as a physical reconstitution of the same body that had been lost in death.”⁹⁸

It may be of some importance that the text describes souls and breath in a more general sense (2.221) and that Book 2 does not show any interest in the fate of the soul upon the death of a person, specifying that the soul is an integral part of a person which lives on separately from the body upon death in wait for the resurrection, when it once more can join its recreated body. However, it could be argued that the mournful forms in Hades (2.230), the souls of men from the murky dark (2.217), and the heavenly vault (2.200) are the places of the wicked and the righteous souls who are awaiting the resurrection. Regardless, the main emphasis of the resurrection statement is the universal nature of the resurrection. In the Christian addition to this Oracle (2.238-250), Moses will be present at the eschatological judgment, after he has put on flesh (2.245-246), perhaps suggesting that he had a non-bodily existence before the time of judgment. The Oracle also mentions the presence of the patriarchs (Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob), some of the great prophets (Joshua, Daniel, Elijah, Habbakuk, and Jonah), and the martyrs killed by

⁹⁸Elledge, “Resurrection of the Dead,” 35. This text was also considered as a “proof-text” in the Rabbinical discussion on the resurrection belief (*b. Sanh.* 92b; see also *Song. Rab.* 7:15), although Rabbi Judah considered it a parable. Rabbi Eliezer understood it literally and speculated with Rab, Samuel, and Jeremiah ben Abba regarding who these people Ezekiel resurrected were and what they did upon their resurrection. The Rabbinic discussion on what bone(s) is/are needed to be resurrected may also be influenced by *the valley of the bone* narrative in Ezekiel. They concluded that a person will be resurrected from the nut of the spinal column (e.g., *Gen. Rab.* 28:3; *Lev. Rab.* 18:1; *Eccl. Rab.* 12:5).

the Hebrews (2.246-248), insinuating that they went to Heaven upon their death and came down with Christ and His angels to be present at the judgment.

The universal nature of the resurrection is made clear in the verses following the opening resurrection statement (2.227-237). Sibyl reveals that Uriel, the great angel, will lead all the mournful forms he has broken out of Hades to judgment. These forms would include “those of ancient phantoms, Titans and the Giants and such as the Flood destroyed” (2.231-232), “those whom the wave of the sea destroyed in the oceans” (2.233), “those whom wild beasts and serpents and birds devoured” (2.234), and “those whom the flesh-devouring fire destroyed by flame” (2.236). In other words, none will escape God’s judgment. The Oracle goes on to describe the judgment by the blazing river of fire which all have to pass through, the righteous will be saved while the wicked will be destroyed for all ages (2.252-255). The text describes the punishment the wicked will experience in the burning fire (283-310) through which they are repaying “threefold what evil deed they committed burning in much fire. They will all gnash their teeth, wasting away with thirst and raging violence” (2.303-306). Sybil also describes the reward given to the righteous (2.313-338) who will live on a recreated earth.

Curiously, Sibyl notes that the righteous will be able to ask God to save the wicked “from the raging fire and deathless gnashing” (2.332). God will grant the righteous’ wishes by releasing the wicked “from the undying fire” (2.334) and give them eternal life “with the immortals in the Elysian plain” (2.337). This limit to the punishment of the wicked is refuted by the manuscripts belonging to the ψ sources, which makes a

point of refuting it by remarking that the fire “which tortures the condemned will never cease.”⁹⁹

Concluding Remarks

In contrast to the resurrection reference found in the Jewish Oracles of Book 2, which was supported by Ezek 37:1-10, the Christian resurrection reference (2.239) does not show any attempt to support it. Instead, the Oracle takes it for granted as an integral part of the eschatological judgment. The last Christian addition to the Book 2 (2.311-312) seems to be aware of the seven-day period in which the souls are shown their eschatological destiny, Phase 1 of the state of the dead, in 2 Esd 7:101 (see Fig. 5), but unlike 4 Ezra 7:102-115 which makes clear that there will be no intercession for the ungodly in the day of judgment, 2.311-312 states that this seven-day period is given to the souls “for repentance through the intercession of the holy virgin.”

Book 3

There are only two brief resurrection references in Book 3 of the Sibylline Oracles. The first reference appears in a section (3.1-96) most scholars would dissociate from the rest of the book.¹⁰⁰ Sib.Or. 3.63-74 reveals that one of the deceiving powers of

⁹⁹Collins, “Sibylline Oracles,” OTP 1:353, n. c3.

¹⁰⁰Ibid., 359.

Beliar is his ability to raise up the dead.¹⁰¹ This resurrection should not be confused with the eschatological resurrection which is linked with the eschatological judgment.

The second resurrection passage (3.767-776) does address the eschatological resurrection, however, the text does not reveal any details except that God had promised the pious “to open the earth and the world and the gates of the blessed and all joys and immortal intellect and eternal cheer” (3.769-771).

Book 4

Book 4 contains oracles pertaining to the Hellenistic era, and was probably updated towards the end of the first century CE since the Oracle about the rise of Rome (4.102-51) seems out of place and must have been added to an earlier version of the Oracle. The Oracle divides the history into ten generations and adds that these generations will be ruled by four different kingdoms (Assyrians will rule for six generations [4.49-53], the Medes for two generations [4.54-64], the Persians for one generation [4.65-87], and the last generation by the fourth kingdom, the Macedonians [4.88-101]).¹⁰² The Roman kingdom, which is a fifth kingdom, breaks this pattern, supporting the notion that the section is a later addition to the Oracle. The resurrection passage appears in the

¹⁰¹The *Apocalypse of Elijah* 3:12-13 and 4:31 argues that resurrection is the very act the son of lawlessness can not perform: “He [the son of lawlessness] will do the works which the Christ did, except for raising the dead alone. In this you will know that he is the son of lawlessness, because he is unable to give life.”

¹⁰²This twofold division of history also appears in the book of Daniel, although it is not intertwined like in this Oracle. In two of the visions, the world history is divided into four kingdoms by a vision of a statue made of four metals: Gold-Silver-Bronze-iron (Dan 2) and four animals, Lion-Bear-Leopard-Beast (Dan 7). In contrast to this four kingdom pattern, the vision in Daniel 9 divides the history into 70 prophetic weeks of years (7x70=490 years), which could also be presented as ten jubilee cycles.

conclusion of the expanded composition (4.179-192) at the end of the tenth generation, as a part of the eschatological judgment (4.40-47, 183-192). However, Collins believes this conclusion was probably the conclusion of the original Oracle too,¹⁰³ thus dating this resurrection passage to the Macedonian period.

As in 2.196-213, the resurrection and judgment will take place after God has destroyed the whole earth by fire. He “will destroy the whole race of men and all cities and rivers at once, and the sea. He will destroy everything by fire, and it will be smoking dust” (4.176-178). When everything has turned into “dusty ashes” (4.179), God will quench the fire and resurrect all the people just as they were before (4.182). Like 2.221-226, also 4.181 uses the imagery of Ezek 37:1-10 with the same emphasis on God as the initiator, although this is a much more abbreviated reference: “God himself will again fashion the bones and ashes of men and he will raise them up mortals again as they were before” (4.181-182).

While there is a strong emphasis on the bodily resurrection in this text, it remains silent regarding the spirit/soul of the person.¹⁰⁴ Those whom God deems pious in the eschatological judgment will be rewarded with a pleasant life on a fertile earth (4.45-46, 187) while the impious will be punished in the fire of Gehenna (4.43-44, 184-186).

¹⁰³Collins, “Sibylline Oracles,” OTP 1:381.

¹⁰⁴The only reference found in the book regarding the soul/spirit of the person gives no information except that God will give the pious “spirit and life and favor at once” (4.46, 189-190).

Book 6

The sixth book of the Sibylline Oracle is a short hymn to Christ, thus, there is no reference to the eschatological resurrection nor the judgment. However, this Christian hymn does state that Jesus will resurrect from the dead.

Book 7

The seventh book of the Sibylline Oracle, although Christian in origin, has a similar eschatology to that of the Jewish Oracles of Book 2 and 4, however, it lacks the organizational structure featured so prominently in Book 2 and 4 (the ten generations of world history of Book 1-2 and the four-kingdoms-ten-generations structure of Book 4). The large eschatological section of the book does not seem to follow a chronological order either (7.118-151); like Book 2 and 4, it reveals that the earth will be completely consumed by fire (7.119-123). At this point, Book 7 shifts to the destiny of the wicked who will “burn in spirit by their perishing flesh for the years of ages forever” learning through dire torture “that it is not possible to deceive the law of God” (7.126-129). The resurrection passage (7.144-145) does not add any new elements to the belief compared with Book 2 and 4, it will happen after the fire has been quenched and a recreated world appears (7.140-144), in which the resurrected righteous can live (7.144-151) and be provided for by God, like He did for the Israelites when He gave them manna in the wilderness (7.148-149; cf. Exod 16). Curiously, the eschatological judgment element is lacking in this Book although it is implied since the two categories of people, the wretched and the pure minded people (7.124-129 and 144-145), who are punished and

blessed, would require a judgment procedure by God to determine the category to which a person belonged. Moreover, this book does not state clearly that the wicked are a part of the eschatological resurrection, although this could be assumed, since the wicked would need to be resurrected after the all-consuming fire (7.120-121) if they are to receive their eternal punishment (7.126-131).

Book 8

The resurrection passages in the eighth book of the Sibylline Oracles (see Table 49, Appendix A) appear both in the first (8.1-126) and the second (8.217-500) half of the book. The first half is considered by most scholars to be of Jewish origin,¹⁰⁵ while the second half is clearly a Christian composition.¹⁰⁶ In the first resurrection passage (8.81-99), Rome's oracle of woes are compared with that of the wicked who will be judged by "the universal ruler himself" (8.82). Describing the ultimate destiny of the Roman Empire (8.96-99),¹⁰⁷ the oracle alludes to Job 1:21a and Gen 3:19b, possibly following the resurrection reading seen in *Targum Pseudo-Jonathan*:¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁵This is due to the lack of the Christological theme which is so prominently featured in the second half of the book, the strong anti-Roman sentiment, and great animosity shown towards Hadrian.

¹⁰⁶Collins, "Sibylline Oracles," OTP 1:415-417.

¹⁰⁷Collins notes the Oracle's emphasis on the equalizing function of Hades (8.107-121) is an allusion to the description of *Sheol* in Job 3:17-19 (ibid., 417).

¹⁰⁸Applying the judgment and resurrection language normally used when describing the eschatological judgment of the wicked, to the Roman Empire, seems, at first, surprising. However, Daniel 7 does not only describe the eschatological judgment and the vindication of the righteous, but also the downfall of the little horn, the political/religious entity which "was making war against the saints" (Dan 7:21). Due to this judgment, this power or beast will be slain, its body destroyed, and given to the burning fire (Dan 7:11), as alluded to in Sib.Or. 8.104-106, where everyone will be able to "hear a mournful great bellowing from Hades and gnashing of teeth as you [Rome] strike your breast with your hand." It becomes clear that the Oracle understood the persecuting power of Daniel 7 to be the Roman Empire.

Gen 3:19 (MT)	Gen 3:19 (PJT)	Job 1:21	Sib.Or. 8.96-99
You will eat bread by the sweat of your brow until you return to the ground, since you were taken from it. For you are dust, and you will return to dust.	By the labor of your hands you shall eat food until you turn again to the dust from which you was created: for dust you are, and unto dust you shall return; for from the dust it is to be that you are to arise, to render judgment and reckoning for all that you have done, in the day of the great judgment.	Naked I came from my mother's womb, and naked I will leave this life. The LORD gives, and the LORD takes away. Praise the name of Yahweh.	You did not perceive whence you came, naked and unworthy to the light of the sun, so that you might go again naked to the same place and later come to judgment because you judged unjustly . . .

This resurrection passage does not reveal much about the resurrection itself, only that it will be a bodily one which will take place as a part of the eschatological and universal judgment.¹⁰⁹

The second and the third resurrection texts appear at the beginning (8.169-170) and towards the end (8.205-208) of the eschatological upheavals section concluding the first half of the book (8.169-216). While the second reference only associates the eschatological resurrection with the reign of the “holy prince” who will “gain control of the scepters of the whole world for all ages” (8.169-170),¹¹⁰ the third reference reveals

¹⁰⁹It should also be noted that the Oracle alludes to the woes pronounced by Micah when describing the moral condition of Judah in his own days, prior to the Assyrian captivity (722 BCE). Craig L. Blomberg proposes that this text was later understood eschatologically by the *Targum*, as a description of the larger society at the time of the eschatological judgment (using the future tense): “For *in that time* son shall spurn father, a daughter shall quarrel with her mother, a daughter-in-law *shall treat* her mother-in-law *with contempt*; a man’s own household shall be his enemies” (cf. Mic 7:6; Sib.Or. 8.84). He adds that applying this text to the day of the Messiah also appears in later rabbinic literature (e.g., *b.Sanh.* 97a; cf. *m.Sotah* 9:15; *b.Sotah* 49b; *Midr.Song* 2:13), see Craig L. Blomberg, “Matthew,” in *Commentary on the New Testament Use of the Old Testament*, eds., G. K. Beale and D. A. Carson (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2007), 36.

¹¹⁰This description may be alluding to the Son of Man in Daniel 7, who will be given “the dominion and glory and a kingdom, that all people, nations, and languages should serve Him” (v. 13). In Sib.Or. 8.169-170, however, the context seems to suggest the holy prince to be a reference to God himself, the Most High (8.171).

some additional details.¹¹¹ Describing the eschatological resurrection event, it alludes to Isaiah 35:4-7 which concerns the future judgment and salvation of God. Although this text does not address the resurrection hope directly, it could be argued that it is implied in the eschatological judgment. The Oracle may also have been alluding to Isaiah 29:18-19, which pertains to the future world renewal, individually and spiritually, when describing the eschatological changes that will take place following the eschatological resurrection and judgment.¹¹²

¹¹¹Collins observes that some scholars consider this eschatological section Christian. This conclusion is based on the parallels between the eschatological reign of the woman in vv. 194-216 and Revelation 17-18, 21, and the assumed dependency of vv. 205-208 on Matt 11:5 or on the Christian oracle in 1.353-355. However, the eschatological woman could “well be modeled on the oracle about Cleopatra” (3.75-92) while the details in vv. 205-208 could have derived directly from the book of Isaiah, see discussion below (Collins, “Sibylline Oracles,” OTP 1:415-416). Thus, it is not clear if this section had a Jewish (with a possibly Christian interpolation in v. 196-197) or a Christian origin.

¹¹²This is also the same language used by Jesus in Matt 11:5, when John the Baptist asked his disciples to inquire from Jesus whether or not Jesus was the promised Messiah. He told John’s disciples to report what they had seen using the eschatological language of Isaiah, describing the coming judgment and Messianic age. Interestingly, Jesus’ answer also includes the resurrection aspect, though not the eschatological kind referred to in Sib.Or. 8. 205, but rather to his many miracles which resurrected the dead to a mortal life (category 14; n. 33, page 14). It seems Jesus did understand his mission in light of the eschatological act of salvation and judgment associated with the year-of-jubilee in Isaiah 61:1.

Sibylline Oracles 8.205-212

There will be a resurrection of the dead and most swift racing of the lame, and the deaf will hear, and the blind will see, those who cannot speak will speak, and life and wealth will be common to all. The earth will equally belong to all, not divided by the walls or fences, and will then bear more abundant fruits. It will give fountains of sweet wine and white milk and honey . . .

Matthew 11:4-5

⁴Jesus replied to them, "Go and report to John what you hear and see: ⁵ **the blind see, the lame walk**, those with skin diseases are healed, **the deaf hear, the dead are raised**, and the poor are told the good news [Is 61:1].

Sibylline Oracles 8.205-212

There will be a resurrection of the dead and **most swift racing of the lame**, and **the deaf will hear**, and **the blind will see**, **those who cannot speak will speak**, and life and wealth will be common to all. The earth will equally belong to all, not divided by the walls or fences, and **will then bear more abundant fruits. It will give fountains of sweet wine and white milk and honey . . .**

Isaiah 29:18-19

^{29:18}On that day **the deaf will hear** the words of a document, and out of a deep darkness the eyes of **the blind will see**. ¹⁹ The humble will have joy after joy in the LORD, and the poor people will rejoice in the Holy One of Israel.

Isaiah 35:4-7

^{35:4}Be strong; do not fear! Here is your God; **vengeance is coming. God's retribution is coming**; He will save you." ⁵ Then **the eyes of the blind will be opened**, and **the ears of the deaf unstopped**. ⁶ Then **the lame will leap like a deer**, and **the tongue of the mute will sing for joy**, for water will gush in the wilderness, and streams in the desert; ⁷ the parched ground will become a pool of water, and the thirsty land springs of water. In the haunt of jackals, in their lairs, there will be grass, reeds, and papyrus.

The eschatological resurrection texts in the first half of the book do not show much interest in the afterlife, but they do present a physical resurrection to judgment which will result in a life for the righteous on a newly created world and a punishment in Hades for the wicked.

The second half of the book (8.217-500) begins with an acrostic poem on the judgment with several resurrection references (8.217-250). The poem summarizes Jesus' role as the eschatological judge, savior and king, noting that he will judge all flesh, both the faithful and the faithless (8.218-223, 242), who will resurrect the dead by breaking the gates of Hades (8.226-228) and by the trumpet blast (8.239-242), who will punish the wicked by a torturous fire forever (8.228-231), and he will rule as king with his iron shepherd's rod (8.218, 248).

The second poem (8.251-336) focuses on Jesus' earthly aspect by summarizing the key aspects of the gospel story (first coming) rather than the eschatological aspect of his Messianic mission (second coming), and states that resurrection hope and the eternal life is pending on believing in Jesus (8.255). The poem highlights Jesus' miracles of resurrecting the dead and curing the sick (8.286), noting that he willingly died so he could speak to the dead in Hades (8.293, 310-311), and resurrected on the third day as the "first of the resurrection" (8.313-314).

The last resurrection reference appears in God's speech against idolatry towards the end of the book (8.359-428). In this speech God makes clear that there are only two paths (8.399-400), one that leads to life (the way of the righteous) and one that leads to death and eternal fire (the way of the wicked). At the end of time, God will raise the dead, both the righteous and the wicked (8.413-416), and judge each person by fire. Those who behaved ethically toward people in need (those who were hungry, thirsty and naked) will receive "immortal fruits," eternal light, and unfading life (8.404-411), while the lawless souls will suffer in the eternal fire (8.401) since, according to 8.350-358, they did not repent from their sins when they had the chance during the "seven days of ages for repentance."

Fragment 3¹¹³

Fragment 3 of the Sibylline corpus reveals an implied resurrection text in its speech against idolatry. The Oracle emphasizes God as the creator and the only one deserving worship. In fact, according to the text, only by becoming sober and “come to a prudent mind and know God the king” (41-42) and honor Him (46) will a person “inherit life, dwelling in the luxuriant garden of Paradise for the time of eternity, feasting on sweet bread from starry heave” (47-49), otherwise, he/she will be “burned with torches all day, throughout eternity” (44).

Apocryphon of Ezekiel

Josephus notes that Ezekiel wrote “and left behind him in writing two books” (*Ant* 10.5.1 [79]), the second of which may have been *Apocryphon of Ezekiel*. Evans notes that “the Apocalypse of Ezekiel was probably written in either Hebrew or Greek between 50 BCE and 50 CE”¹¹⁴ Only five fragments of this composition have survived, *Fragment 1* being the longest and is of most interest for this study since it addresses the eschatological resurrection and judgment with the aid of the parable of *the Lame and the Blind Keepers*. Unlike the other fragments, it has been preserved both in Greek and Hebrew versions. The Greek version attributes the parable to the *apocryphon of Ezekiel* (see introduction of fragment, τοῦ Ἰεζεκιήλ τοῦ προφήτου ἐν τῷ ἰδίῳ ἀποκρύφῳ) and is preserved in *Against*

¹¹³Collins notes that *fragment 3* was “probably part of the lost book 2 and belongs with Sibylline Oracles 3.1-45” (“Sibylline Oracles,” OTP 1:469).

¹¹⁴Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Study*, 32. For further study into the background of these fragments, see J. R. Mueller and S. E. Robinson, “Apocryphon of Ezekiel,” OTP 1:487-490.

Heresis (64.70, 5-17) written by Epiphanius,¹¹⁵ bishop of Salamis (Cyprus), thus in a Christian composition. The Hebrew versions of the parable, however, appear in several Rabbinical texts and are attributed to either Rabbi Judah haNasi (c.200 CE)¹¹⁶ or Rabbi Ishmael (c. 130 CE),¹¹⁷ although one version is without attribution.¹¹⁸ By comparing the various Hebrew versions of the parable, James R. Mueller concludes that *Lev. Rab.* 4:5 probably “preserves the more original form of the story” although it is difficult to determine if the *Apocryphon* had a Jewish or Christian origin.¹¹⁹

Fragment 1

The parable about the lame and the blind men who together caused a mischief in the garden of the king and later were judged together as one person, serves the same purpose in both the Christian and the Jewish texts. The parable illustrates why it is necessary for an eschatological bodily resurrection, and why the reward or punishment can not only be given to the soul. Since both the body (σωμα/גוף) and soul (ψυχή/נשמה) were together when a person behaved wickedly, it is necessary for both the body and soul

¹¹⁵He was born in Judea c.310-320 CE and died in 403 CE, and is best known for his collection of the many heresies leading up to his time period.

¹¹⁶See *b.Sanh.* 91ab and *Mekilta of Rabbi Simeon ben Yochai* on Exod 15:1.

¹¹⁷See *Lev. Rab.* 4:5 and *Mekilta of Rabbi Ishmael* on Exod 15:1.

¹¹⁸See *Midr. Tanhuma* on Lev 4:1.

¹¹⁹James R. Mueller, *The Five Fragments of the Apocryphon of Ezekiel: A Critical Study*, JSPSupp 5 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1994), 99. Appendix A (see pages 474-476) shows the parallel Greek and Hebrew (*Lev. Rab.* 4:5) versions of the parable in English. Comparing the two versions, it becomes apparent that while there are many similarities between the versions, there are also some significant differences. See Mueller’s discussion of the many similarities, differences, and additions to this parable (Mueller, *The Five Fragments of the Apocryphon of Ezekiel*, 78-100).

to be once more together when the same person will be judged for his/her wicked deeds. However, the Christian and the Jewish version of the parable is used to explain two different perceived resurrection texts from the TaNaKh.

Epiphanius, in his attack on Origen's position regarding a resurrection of a spiritual body as supposed to a physical body,¹²⁰ quotes Isaiah 26:19 from the Septuagint and said parable from prophet Ezekiel to refute what he considered to be Origen's heresy, and prove it has to be a resurrection of a physical body.

The Apocryphon of Ezekiel

Ἀναστήσονται γὰρ **οἱ νεκροὶ καὶ ἐγερθήσονται οἱ ἐν τοῖς μνημείοις** φησὶν ὁ προφήτης.

“For **the dead will be raised and those in the tombs will be lifted up**,” speaks the prophet.

Isaiah 26:19-21 (BGT and LXE)

¹⁹ **ἀναστήσονται οἱ νεκροὶ καὶ ἐγερθήσονται οἱ ἐν τοῖς μνημείοις** καὶ εὐφρανθήσονται οἱ ἐν τῇ γῇ ἢ γὰρ ὁρόσος ἡ παρὰ σοῦ ἱάμα αὐτοῖς ἐστὶν ἢ δὲ γῇ τῶν ἀσεβῶν πεσεῖται ²⁰ βάδιζε λαός μου εἰσελθε εἰς τὰ ταμίειά σου ἀπόκλεισον τὴν θύραν σου ἀποκρύβηθι μικρὸν ὅσον ὅσον ἕως ἂν παρέλθῃ ἡ ὀργὴ κυρίου ²¹ ἰδοὺ γὰρ κύριος ἀπὸ τοῦ ἁγίου ἐπάγει τὴν ὀργὴν ἐπὶ τοὺς ἐνοικοῦντας ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς καὶ ἀνακαλύψει ἡ γῇ τὸ αἷμα αὐτῆς καὶ οὐ κατακαλύψει τοὺς ἀνηρημένους

¹⁹ **The dead shall rise, and they that are in the tombs shall be raised**, and they that are in the earth shall rejoice: for the dew from thee is healing to them: but the land of the ungodly shall perish. ²⁰ Go, my people, enter into thy closets, shut thy door, hide thyself for a little season, until the anger of the Lord have passed away. ²¹ For, behold, the Lord is bringing wrath from *his* holy place upon the dwellers on the earth: the earth also shall disclose her blood, and shall not cover her slain.

It is reasonable to assume Isaiah 26:19-21 was not quoted or even referred to in conjunction with the parable in its original setting of the Apocryphon of Ezekiel, since the reference appears in the introduction written by Epiphanius, and the Rabbinic versions of

¹²⁰Mueller, *The Five Fragments of the Apocryphon of Ezekiel*, 80-81.

the parable refer to Psalm 50:4 as the proof-text.¹²¹ Regardless, Epiphanius understood Isaiah 26:19 to speak of a physical bodily resurrection and may also have viewed vv. 20-21 as a reference to the eschatological judgment which would punish the wicked, much like the broader context of the parable in which both the lame and the blind men were held responsible for the wickedness they committed together at the King's judgment.

In all but one of the Rabbinic versions of the parable (Mashal),¹²² Psalms 50:4 appears in the explanation of the parable (Nimshal). This judgment psalm is used as a proof-text showing that in the same way the blind and the lame men had to be judged together, since they committed the wicked deed together as one person, so must the spirit and the body be reunited before they can be judged together and receive their sentence, punishment or reward.

¹²¹Although the rabbinic version of the parable does not refer to Is 26:19, this biblical text was still considered by some rabbis as a resurrection text, as is evident by the discussion regarding what biblical texts support the resurrection belief in *b.Sanh.* 90b.

¹²²The exception is the greatly abbreviated version of the parable found in *Mekilta of Rabbi Ishmael* on Exodus 15:1, which assumes the audience is already familiar with the unabridged version of the parable which concludes with an interpretation of Psalm 50:4.

¹ מִזְמוֹר לְאַסָּף אֱלֹהִים יְהוָה דִּבֶּר וַיִּקְרָא אֶרֶץ
מִמִּזְרַח-שֶׁמֶשׁ עַד-מָבְאוֹ:
² מִצִּיּוֹן מְכַלְל־יָפִי אֱלֹהִים הוֹפִיעַ:
³ יָבֹא אֱלֹהֵינוּ וְאֵל-יִחְרָשׁ אֵשׁ-לִפְנֵינוּ תֹאכֵל
וְסָבִיבוּ נִשְׁעָרָה מֵאֵד:
⁴ יִקְרָא אֶל-הַשָּׁמַיִם מֵעַל
וְאֶל-הָאָרֶץ לִדְיִן עַמּוֹ:
⁵ אִסְפוּ-לִי חֲסִידֵי
כִּרְתִּי בְרִיתִי עַל-יִזְבַּח:
⁶ וַיִּגִּידוּ שָׁמַיִם צְדָקָתְךָ
כִּי-אֱלֹהִים שֹׁפֵט הוּא סֵלָה:

אף הקדוש ברוך הוא מביא נשמה
וזורקה בגוף ודן אותם כאחד
שנאמר יקרא אל השמים מעל
ואל הארץ לדין עמו
יקרא אל השמים מעל זו נשמה
ואל הארץ לדין עמי זה הגוף

¹ A psalm of Asaph. Yahweh, the god of gods speaks; He summons the earth from east to west.

² From Zion, the perfection of beauty, God appears in radiance. ³ Our God is coming; He will not be silent! Devouring fire precedes Him, and a storm rages around Him. ⁴ On high, **He summons heaven and earth in order to judge His people.**

⁵ "Gather My faithful ones to Me, those who made a covenant with Me by sacrifice." ⁶ The heavens proclaim His righteousness, for God is the Judge. *Selah*

So the Holy One, blessed be he, brings the spirit and placing (it) in the body, he also judges them as one. For it is said, '**He will call to the heavens from above and the earth to judge his people.**' '**He will call to the heaven from above**' – this is the spirit. '**And the earth to judge his people**' – this is the body.

The Rabbis interpreted the reference to “heaven” (v. 4a) as a reference to the place where the soul went upon death¹²³ while considering the “earth” (v.4b) as the final resting place of the body at the time of burial. Thus, on the day of judgment, God would call both to heaven and to the earth, so the soul and the body of the desisted can once more be unified in order for the unified person to be judged in the eschatological judgment.

¹²³According to *b. Sanh.* 91a, following death, the soul flies in the air like a bird. This metaphoric image of a “bird-soul” appears in several rabbinical sources as noted by V. Aptowitzer (“Die Seele als Vogel: Ein Beitrag zu den Anschauungen der Agada,” *MGWJ* 69 [May/June 1925]: 150-168), and was a well known image in the ancient Near East. For a detailed discussion, see Steiner’s chapter, “From Dream-Souls to Bird-Souls,” in *Disembodied Souls*, 55-67.

Concluding Remarks

The parable of the lame and the blind men appearing in fragment 1 of the *Apocryphon of Ezekiel* serves the same general purpose both in the Christian and the Rabbinic texts. It was used to illustrate the need for the body and spirit to once more reunite at the time of the resurrection in order to be judged as one unit. Thus, the parable speaks against the Platonic or Gnostic notion (cosmological dualism) that the soul, “the spiritual”, is pure while the body, “the physical or material”, should be viewed as impure, the source of evil which had imprisoned the soul.¹²⁴ They can not be evaluated separately since they both act together. Moreover, the parable also makes it clear that everyone will be held responsible for their deeds. It was also noted that each of the religious traditions explained this parable by quoting the TaNaKh to prove the view presented by the parable, the Christian version used Is 26:19 while the Rabbinic versions used Ps 50:4. Both the Christian and the Rabbinic use of the parable seems to suggest a bodily and earthly existence following the resurrection. However, fragment 1 does not expand on the final destiny of the righteous and the wicked.

Furthermore, the parable does not reveal much regarding the period between death and resurrection except, according to the Rabbinic versions, the souls of the people of God (עַמִּי) will dwell in heaven until they will be reunited with their earthly bodies at the

¹²⁴The body without the spirit is, in the Rabbinic versions, like “a silent stone in the grave” (argued by Antoninus, the Emperor of the Roman Empire, or the body itself in *b.Sanh.* 91a and *Mek. of R. Simeon ben Yochai* on Exodus 15.1) or like “a piece of pottery thrown upon a dung-heap” (*Lev. Rab.* 4.5). The evaluation of the soul and body as pure and impure respectively is noted by Rabbi in *Mek. of R. Ishmael* on Exodus 15.1. Both the simile and the ethical evaluation of the soul and body are missing in the Christian version.

time of the eschatological judgment,¹²⁵ the whereabouts of the wicked souls are of no interest. The Christian text, on the other hand, does not show any interest in the location of the souls. Instead, it seems to focus on the resurrection and judgment of the wicked, those who were not invited to the king's feast, a possible allusion to the "great feast" of Matt 22:2,¹²⁶ or those who were drafted into the king's service.

It is unclear if this parable in its original context of the *Apocryphon of Ezekiel* presented an universal resurrection and judgment view. Be that as it may, the two faith traditions used this parable to focus on different aspects of the eschatological resurrection and judgment. This becomes clear when considering the context of the biblical texts used by each faith group when explaining the parable, Is 26:19-21, quoted in the Christian version, focuses on the judgment of the wicked, while Ps 50:1–6, quoted in the Rabbinic versions, focuses on the resurrection of the righteous.¹²⁷

¹²⁵The Rabbinic texts using this parable, however, are not clear whether or not the souls are conscious when separated from the body.

¹²⁶Mueller notes the words used by Epiphanius are almost the exact words used in Matt 22:2, but they appear in a different order (Mueller, *The Five Fragments of the Apocryphon of Ezekiel*, 84).

¹²⁷A case could be made that some of the differences between the Christian and the Rabbinic versions of the parable may be due to the proof-text used by each faith community to support a bodily resurrection belief. Unfortunately, there is no way of knowing if the original context of the parable in *Apocryphon of Ezekiel*, associated the parable with a biblical proof-text.

Apocalypse of Zephaniah

The *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* was most likely composed “in Greek sometime between 100 BCE and 70 CE,”¹²⁸ by a Jewish author living in the Greek-speaking diaspora, possibly in Egypt. Carl Schmidt suggests the present text, which was partly preserved in two manuscripts by the Coptic Christians, only account for a quarter of the original composition.¹²⁹ Although fragmentary in its current form, the text consists of several self-contained scenes and episodes which suggests some type of overall structure. The longest surviving manuscript, the eight page long Akhmimic manuscript, gives a travelogue of Zephaniah’s guided journey through the heavenly spheres which included the place of the righteous and the wicked souls, contains seven episodes (chs. 1-8) and concludes with four trumpet scenes (chs. 9-12).¹³⁰

In its current form, there are two basic themes appearing in the manuscript. The first, the importance and the call for repentance (*Apoc. Zeph.* B6; 7:8) which will bring God’s compassion upon the tormented souls (*Apoc. Zeph.* 2:8-9; 10:10-14; 112, :6). The second and most important, the universal nature of God’s judgment in the form of the trail of Hades (*Apoc. Zeph.* 7-8) and a future (eschatological?) judgment of the unrepented souls who are being punished in Hades until that time (*Apoc. Zeph.* 10:11).

The trail of Hades takes place after the soul has been brought down to Hades, at the point of death, and is based on the records kept by the accuser (bad deeds) and God

¹²⁸Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 33.

¹²⁹Carl Schmidt, cited by O. S. Wintermute, “Apocalypse of Zephaniah: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP 1:497. For question of introduction, see Ibid., 1:497-506.

¹³⁰Ibid., 1:498-499.

(the good deeds). The lack of reference to an eschatological resurrection in this apocalypse may be due to the trail of Hades and final destiny of the righteous, the heavenly city (*Apoc. Zeph. 2:7; 5:1-6; 9:4-5*), thus ruling out the necessity of a future judgment of the righteous and the need for an earthly body. However, the righteous souls will be clothed in angelic garments (*Apoc. Zeph. 8:3*), while even the wicked souls will have a physical form (*Apoc. Zeph. 10:4-9, 12-14*). Although resurrection is not specifically mentioned, it is implied when the soul passes the trail and is able to escape Hades and “cross over the crossing place” (*Apoc. Zeph. 7:9; 8:1*) in order to enter the heavenly realm possessing a celestial body (*Apoc. Zeph. 8:3*). The resurrection is also hinted at as a possibility for unrighteous souls if they are repenting from their sins (*Apoc. Zeph. 10:10-11*). The text is also clear that the Patriarchs (Abraham, Isaac and Jacob) but also Enoch, Elijah, and David¹³¹ are already in Heaven (*Apoc. Zeph. 9:4*), suggesting that at least the patriarchs and king David must have resurrected.

This apocalypse does not attempt to prove the afterlife belief which includes a resurrection of the righteous or repentant, by referring or alluding to the TaNaKh – it is only assumed. Figure 10 illustrates the death and resurrection concept in the *Apocalypse of Zeephaniah*.

¹³¹The TaNaKh states that Enoch (Gen 5:24) and Elijah (2 Kings 2:11-12) did not die like everyone else but instead ascended to Heaven refers to the “heavenly ascent.” This explains the great body of tradition regarding these two characters developed during the Second Temple Period. The author of this apocalypse may also have included David in the list since Psalm 16:10 (LXX 15:10) notes that David’s soul will not be abandoned in Hades (ὅτι οὐκ ἐγκαταλείψεις τὴν ψυχὴν μου εἰς ᾗδην).

Fig. 10. Death and Resurrection in the Apocalypse of Zephaniah.

Other Ezra Texts

In addition to 2 Esdras which was considered in Chapter 2 (pages 69-88), there are four other texts that are pseudepigraphically attributed to Ezra of the TaNaKh. They are the *Greek Apocalypse of Ezra* (150-850 CE), *Vision of Ezra* (350-600 CE), *Questions of Ezra* (date unknown) and *Revelation of Ezra* (X > 9th cent. CE), all of which have a Christian provenance.¹³²

Apart from the strictly astrological book of Revelation of Ezra, they all deal with God's justice and what will happen to the righteous and the wicked upon death. According to these books, the soul of righteous will be rewarded in heaven (Gk. Apoc. Ezra 1:12; 5:20-22; Vis. Ezra 63-66; Ques. Ezra A3, 6, 10, 14-15, 20; B2, 6) while the wicked will be punished in Tartarus (Gk. Apoc. Ezra 4:5-24; 5:2-6, 23-28; Vis. Ezra 1-2, 8-55) or in the eternal fire (Ques. Ezra A3, 10, 14-15; B2, 6-14). The Greek Apocalypse of Ezra and Questions of Ezra both alludes (Gk. Apoc. Ezra 2:1; 5:22; Ques. Ezra A10) or mentions (Gk. Apoc. Ezra 4:36; 7:2; Ques. Ezra A5; B3, 11-14) the resurrection belief (see highlighted passages in the Appendix) although they do not quote or allude to the TaNaKh in support of this belief. Figure 11-13 illustrates the death and resurrection concept in these books.

¹³²For dating and providence of these books, see: Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 34-35; D. Fiensy, "Revelation of Ezra," OTP 1:601-602; J. Mueller and G. Robbins, "Vision of Ezra," OTP 1:583; M. Stone, "Greek Apocalypse of Ezra," OTP 1:563; Idem., "Questions of Ezra," OTP 1:592; J. Wright, "Esdras, Books of," DNTB, 339-340.

Fig. 11. Death and Resurrection in the Greek Apocalypse of Ezra.

Fig. 12. Death and “Resurrection” in the Vision of Ezra.

Fig. 13. Death and “Resurrection” in Questions of Ezra.

Apocalypse of Sedrach

The *Apocalypse of Sedrach*¹³³ (2nd – 5th cent. CE) is probably of Jewish origin (the apocalyptic section) but was later adopted by a Christian community who added the sermon of love (ch. 1) and may have replaced references to Michael with that of Jesus.¹³⁴ In this book, Sedrach questions God’s justice in punishing humans and argues that He should show mercy towards those who repent. This book presents a sharp distinction between soul (10:1-4) and body (11:1-9, 12-13). The soul enters a person while still in the womb (9:1), it spreads out to all the parts of the body (9:2), and is removed through the mouth at the time of death with great difficulty (9:3). Upon death, a person’s soul “ascends where the Lord calls” it, while the “wretched body goes away for judgment” (11:11). The righteous soul, like Sedrach, is brought to Paradise/3rd Heaven (2:5; 9:1; 16:6), God’s Kingdom (15:5), or the “bosom of Abraham” (14:5); to “be with the just ones in a place of refreshment and rest” (16:3). The soul of the wicked, however, will “see the place of punishment” (4:1; 14:9; 16:3). Thus, there would be no need for an eschatological and universal judgment. However, there is one clear resurrection statement in the Christian sermon on love which states that the “Son of God” came down, thus “death was trampled down, Hades was made captive, Adam was recalled (from death), and through love one flock was made thereafter of angels and men” (1:21). Christ also tells Sedrach “Paradise has been opened to you, and after dying you will live” (12:1),

¹³³Some scholars would also associate this book with Ezra, arguing that the name Sedrach is a corruption of the name Ezra, adding that the Sedrach of this apocalypse does not resemble the Sedrach of the book of Daniel. There also seems to be similarities between Ezra’s debate with God in the Ezra books and the debate recorded in *Apocalypse of Sedrach* (Wright, “Esdras, Books of,” *DNTB*, 339-340).

¹³⁴S. Agourides, “Apocalypse of Sedrach,” *OTP* 1:606-607.

implying that death is not the end but the beginning. The parting of the soul from the body at the point of death is described as a kind of resurrection of the soul. Be that as it may, there are no references or allusions to the TaNaKh regarding the resurrection belief.

2 Baruch

Second Baruch, also known as the *Syriac Apocalypse of Baruch*, was originally “composed in Hebrew or Aramaic, translated in to Greek and ultimately translated from Greek into Syriac,”¹³⁵ as noted in the heading of the book. This book was written sometime after the cataclysmic events of the Roman destruction of the Second Temple in 70 CE¹³⁶ although the narrative setting is the Babylonian destruction of the First Temple in 587/6 BCE. In both cases, there was a need for encouraging messages to the people. In the same way as Jeremiah and Baruch gave encouraging words to the Jewish people who experienced this catastrophe, both in the land of Israel but also to those already living in the Babylonian and Assyrian diaspora, encouraging messages were given once more by the words of “Baruch” to the Jews experiencing the second destruction of the Temple.¹³⁷

¹³⁵J. E. Wright, “Baruch, Books of,” *DNTB*, 149. See also A. Klijn, “2 (Syriac Apocalypse of) Baruch,” *OTP* 1:616.

¹³⁶Based on the internal evidence in the book (e.g. 2 Bar 32:2-4; 61:7; 68:5), Klijn notes (“2 [Syriac Apocalypse of] Baruch,” 616-617) most scholars date the book to the beginning of the second century CE, since 2 Bar 61:7 is quoted in *Gos. Barn.* 11:9 (*Barnabas* may have been written in 117 or 132 CE) and 2 Baruch may be dependent on 4 Ezra (late first century CE), although it should not be ruled out that both 4 Ezra and 2 Baruch may be relying on a common source or tradition. If the latter, scholars still assume that 2 Baruch is later since the theology seems to be more developed than that of 4 Ezra. Regardless, the author probably made use of earlier sources, predating the destruction of the Second Temple. Be that as it may, 2 Baruch would have been written during the same time-period as the *Book of Revelation*.

¹³⁷J. Edward Wright, “The Social Setting of the Syriac Apocalypse of Baruch,” *JSP* 16 (1997): 81-96.

The universal eschatological resurrection hope, judgment and reward/punishment of the righteous and the wicked, and references to the “World to come” proliferates the book. According to 2 Baruch, the eschatological resurrection will take place after “a period of national exaltation” by the Messiah and it introduces a second phase of the salvation process (2 Bar 29; 44:8-12; 73-74).¹³⁸ The “Apocalypse of the Clouds” (2 Bar 53-74) divides the present history into twelve alternating good and evil time-periods¹³⁹ which culminates with the Messianic era (2 Bar 28-29).¹⁴⁰ Collins observes that this Messianic period will be limited (2 Bar 40:3) and thus only provides “a temporal fulfillment of national eschatology before the resurrection and final judgment,” introducing the “world to come,” which will be the second and final stage of the salvation process (2 Bar 30).¹⁴¹ The eschatological time-line of 2 Baruch (figure 14) is similar to that of 4 Ezra (figure 4) in the sense that the Messianic era will take place before the universal resurrection/judgment and the eternal reward for the righteous. However, there

¹³⁸Collins, “Jewish Apocalypse,” 35.

¹³⁹These alternate periods describe the history from the beginning of God’s creation until the end, “(the times) which are known by deceit and by truth” (2 Bar 56:2), they are: (1) **Black** - begins at the Fall [56:5-16]; (2) **Bright** - starts with Abraham and his generation [57:1-3]; (3) **Black** - describes the slavery in Egypt [58:1-2]; (4) **Bright** - introduced by Moses who received revelations from God [59:1-12]; (5) **Black** - the time of the judges [60:1-2]; (6) **Bright** - the united kingdom of David and Solomon and the building of the Temple [61:1-8]; (7) **Black** - introduced by Jeroboam which rebelled and led to the exile of the northern tribes [62:1-8]; (8) **Bright** - the reforms of King Hezekiah [63:1-11]; (9) **Black** - the wicked reign of Manasseh [64:1-65:2]; (10) **Bright** - the reforms of King Josiah [66:1-8]; (11) **Black** - destruction of Jerusalem by the Babylonians [67:1-9]; and (12) **Bright** - the rebuilding of Jerusalem [68:1-8].

¹⁴⁰The Messiah appears at the end of the twelve calamities described in 2 Bar 26-27. These tribulations take place during the additional and final **Dark-Bright** cycle of apocalyptic vision. The final dark period [69:1-71:2] will be more evil than all the previous periods but it will be followed by the final bright period [72:1-74:4] which is the time of the Messiah, God’s servant, who will bring national exaltation to the nation of Israel (2 Bar 28-29).

¹⁴¹Collins, “Jewish Apocalypses,” 35.

are also some important differences, unlike the three-stage-world-view of 4 Ezra, with its 7 day long period of “primeval silence,” 2 Baruch presents a two-stage-world-view which transitions from the present world to the world to come through the transformation of the righteous following the resurrection. In both eschatological time-lines, the resurrection and judgment functions as the beginning of the new age, which is also the case in the *Book of Revelation* (Rev 20:4-6).¹⁴²

Unlike 4 Ezra, which reveals that the Messianic Kingdom will last for 400 years, no such information is given in 2 Baruch. It only notes that the Messianic period is the final “bright” period leading up to the “world to come.” 2 Baruch does not reveal the final destiny of the Messiah either at the end of his period of reign, which is death in the case of 4 Ezra 7:28-29. The book of Revelation does not present a Messianic Kingdom before the eschatological resurrection/judgment.

2 Baruch does not state clearly the location of the “world to come” or Paradise (e.g. 2 Bar 48:50), whether it will be otherworldly (2 Bar 51:3, 11) or on a renewed earth (2 Bar 32:6; 44:13; 57:2) as is the case in 4 Ezra. The book of Revelation, however, presents a two stage view, in which the righteous will spend a millennium with God in heaven (Rev 20:4-6) before God and the righteous will return to a renewed earth (Rev 21:1, 4), bringing the New Jerusalem with them (Rev 21:2, 9-27; 22:1-5), and dwell there for all eternity (Rev 22:5).

¹⁴²The resurrection view presented in Revelation is unique in the sense the eschatological resurrection and judgment takes place in two phases, separated by a millennium (Rev 20:6). The first resurrection involves the righteous and their reward, while the second resurrection at the end of the millennium only regards the wicked and their eternal punishment. According to Revelation 21-22, the righteous will return to a newly re-created world at the end of the millennium in order to live the rest of the eternity there, together with God in the New Jerusalem.

Fig. 14. Two-Stage Worldview Presented in 2 Baruch.

Apart from the many allusions to the eschatological resurrection appearing in 2 Baruch,¹⁴³ the following three references are explicit: 2 Bar 30:2; 42:8; 49-50, the last of which gives the most detailed description. However, this dissertation will also consider 2 Baruch 14:10-14 since it strongly implies the universal resurrection and appears in a context with strong links to biblical wisdom literature.

¹⁴³Describing death as sleep suggests a belief in a resurrection. Thus, like the resurrection, a person sleeping will wake up from their sleep and become conscious once more (2 Bar 11:4; 21:24; 30:1; 85:3, 9). 2 Baruch contains several references to the hope the righteous have regarding a future after their death (2 Bar 14:12-13; 30:1; 57:2; 78:6), the reward that is in store for them (2 Bar 14:13; 15:7-8; 21:12-13; 30:1-2; 44:11-13; 48:6, 50; 51:8-9, 11; 52:6-7; 57:2; 59:2; 76:2; 84:6; 85:15), and the punishment kept in store for the wicked (2 Bar 14:14; 21:12-13; 30:3-5; 36:11; 44:15; 51:6, 16; 52:1-5; 54:14, 21-22; 59:2; 85:15). There are also several statements regarding an universal eschatological judgment in which everyone will be judged, both the living and the dead (2 Bar 5:2-3; 21:8; 24:1-2; 48:2, 27, 39; 51:1; 57:2; 82:2; 83:2, 7; 85:9). Lastly, 2 Baruch makes it clear that the world to come is created for the righteous: “And with regard to the righteous ones, those whom you said the world has come on their account, yes, also that which is coming is on their account. For this world is to them a struggle and an effort with much trouble. And that accordingly which will come, a crown with great glory” (2 Bar 15:7-8). See highlighted passages from 2 Baruch in Appendix A (pages 478-483).

2 Baruch 14:10-14

Daewoong Kim observes “2 *Baruch* deliberately uses the biblical sapiential tradition and closely connects it with the apocalyptic tradition in the book of Daniel.”¹⁴⁴ In 2 Baruch 14, Kim sees “Job’s theological skepticism” expressed in “Baruch’s five-fold rhetorical questions that contain a polyphonic voice (2 *Bar.* 14:8-9).”¹⁴⁵ Both the book of Job and 2 Baruch 14 addresses the question of theodicy and questions the orthodox view presented in Deuteronomy (Deut 28-30) and emphasized in Proverbs (e.g. 9:9-10, 27; 14:27; 19:23), that the righteous will receive blessings while the wicked will be punished. Like Job, the righteous who experienced the destruction and were massacred by the hand of the Babylonians (i.e. Romans), suffered unjustly (Job 1-2; 32:1-2; 2 Bar 14:3-7). Both books recognize the limitations of human wisdom, and 2 Baruch contrasts this limitation with God’s ultimate wisdom by the use of the five-fold rhetorical questions which echoes the book of Job:

Who can understand your judgment? (14:8a)	Would you really challenge My justice? (Job 40:8a)
Who can explore the depth of your way? (14:8b)	But God understands the way to wisdom, and He knows its location. (Job 28:23)
Who can discern the majesty of your path? (14:9a)	
Who can discern your incomprehensible counsel? (14:9b)	Who is this who obscures My counsel with ignorant words? (Job 38:2)
Who of those who are born has ever discovered the beginning and the end of your wisdom? (14:9c)	

¹⁴⁴Daewoong Kim, “Wisdom and Apocalyptic in 2 Baruch,” *Henoch* 33 (2011): 250.

¹⁴⁵*Ibid.*, 254.

The author of 2 Baruch acknowledges God's wisdom cannot be challenged and would seem to agree with God's answer when He finally speaks to Job (Job 38:1-42:6). It should be noted God never answers Job's questions (Job 7:11-21). Instead, God makes it clear that only He is truly wise, thus, Job should place his trust in Him, because only the wise knows the best course of action in every situation. Interestingly, Job's comment: "My days are swifter than a weaver's shuttle, And are spent without hope. Oh, remember that my life is a breath (הֶבֶל, *hevel*)!" (Job 7:6-7a) is also expressed by Baruch, who states: "For we all have been made like breath. For as breath ascends without human control and vanishes, so it is with the nature of men, who do not know what will happen to them in the end" (2 Bar 14:10-11).

These sentiments are shared by Qohelet, who also observes the limitations of wisdom and concludes that everything is *hevel*, nothingness.¹⁴⁶ He writes that both humans and animals will die and return to dust from where they came, adding "Who knows if the spirit [רוּחַ] of people rises upward and the spirit [רוּחַ] of animals goes downward to the earth?" (Eccl 3:19-21). Moreover, Qohelet also laments the perversion of justice in which the righteous perish while the wicked prosper (Eccl 7:15; 8:12-14). Like Job, Qohelet does not reach a satisfactory solution to the problem of theodicy but concludes that a person should remember God (Eccl 12:1, 6), adding, although everything is *hevel*, one should still fear God and keep his commandments since every work will be

¹⁴⁶The word *hevel* appears throughout the book (Eccl 1:2, 14; 2:1, 11, 15, 17, 19, 21, 23, 26; 3:19; 4:4, 7-8, 16; 5:7, 9; 6:2, 9, 11; 7:6; 8:10, 14; 11:8, 10; 12:8) and is a major theme of the book, emphasizing the limitation of all human endeavor, noting that only God's gifts have true value.

brought into judgment (Eccl 12:13-14). This last statement could be an allusion to a future resurrection.

In contrast to Job and Qohelet, 2 Baruch solves the problem of theodicy by introducing the resurrection hope. He states:

For the righteous justly have good hope for the end and go away from this habitation without fear because they possess with you a store of good works which is preserved in treasuries. Therefore, they leave this world without fear and are confident of the world which you have promised to them with an expectation full of joy (2 Bar 14:12-13).

The righteous have nothing to fear since God remembers their righteous deeds which are stored in the heavenly treasuries, a concept which is well attested in both the New Testament and in Early Rabbinic Judaism.¹⁴⁷

Regardless of the destiny of the righteous and the wicked in this world, God reveals to Baruch that the wicked will receive their just punishment since he/she broke the Law and was thus aware of his/her transgressions (2 Bar 15:1-7) and emphasizes the world to come is made for the righteous who will be crowned with great glory (2 Bar 15:7-8).

2 Baruch 30:1-5

The first explicit resurrection text appears in 2 Baruch 30:1-5 which reveals this resurrection to be universal, involving both the righteous and the wicked, and it will take

¹⁴⁷On several occasions, Jesus encourages the people to consider the big perspective and plan for the world to come by collecting treasures in Heaven instead of on Earth (Matt 6:19-21; Luke 11:33-34). During the Second Temple period, almsgiving became the mean for collecting heavenly treasures (e.g. Sir 29:9-13; Tob 4:8-11; Matt 19:21; Mark 10:21, 30; Joseph, *Ant.* 20:17-96; *t. Pe'ah.* 4:18. For further reading, see Joseph Frankovic, "Treasures in Heaven," released 18 February 2008, <http://www.jerusalemerspective.com/4661>.

place at the end of the Messianic age (v. 1a).¹⁴⁸ At that time, the treasures will be opened and the souls will be released, the souls of the righteous will enjoy themselves and not be sad (v. 2) since “they know that the time has come of which it is said that it is the end of times” (v. 3). However, the souls of the wicked will see the joy of the righteous and “waste away” since they “know that their torment has come and that their perditions have arrived” (vv. 4-5). There are no allusions nor references to the TaNaKh in this resurrection text.

2 Baruch 42:7-8

The second explicit resurrection statement appears in 2 Baruch 42:8, following the *Apocalypse of the forest, the vine, the fountain, and the cedar* (2 Bar 36-40), in God’s expansion on the apostates and the believers (2 Bar 41-43:3). Like 2 Baruch 30, this second resurrection statement also appears at the end of the Messianic age (2 Bar 40:3), however, this passage is closely related to the apocalyptic vision of Daniel 2:31-45 and Dan 7:2-28.

Similarly to Daniel 2, the apocalyptic vision in 2 Baruch 36-37, is also divided into four kingdoms followed by the Messianic age. The first kingdom in both visions are the Babylonian kingdom, the power which destroyed Zion (Dan 2:37-38; 7:4-5; 2 Bar 39:2), which will be followed by two other kingdoms (Persia and Greece). The fourth kingdom (Dan 2:40; 7:7-8, 11, 19-26; 2 Bar 39:5-6) is presented as “harsher and more

¹⁴⁸ Although the main emphasis of this resurrection text is the soul of the righteous, only referring to “all who sleep in the hope of him will rise,” it could be assumed that also the wicked souls were kept in treasures and will therefore also resurrect. This is supported by the concluding verses of this text which reveal the reaction and the ultimate destiny of the souls of the wicked. Thus, since both the righteous and the wicked souls are included in this resurrection text, this eschatological resurrection is universal.

evil than those which were before it” (2 Bar 39:5; cf. Dan 2:40; 7:7, 19, 23), and this kingdom “will reign a multitude of times” (a possible reference to the ‘time, times, half a time’ period of the little horn) and “it will rule the times and exalt itself” (2 Bar 39:5-6; cf. Dan 7:25). Although neither Daniel nor 2 Baruch names this fourth kingdom, it could be assumed that the author of 2 Baruch considered this fourth kingdom to represent the Roman Empire which destroyed Zion in year 70 CE.

In both Daniel and 2 Baruch, this fourth kingdom will be destroyed by the Messiah who will establish his kingdom (2 Bar 39:7; Dan 2:44; 7:14, 27) and will convict the last evil ruler (2 Bar 40:1-2), a possible allusion to the little horn of Daniel 7:8, 11, 24-25, thus protecting the “rest of my [God’s] people who will be found in the place that I have chosen” (2 Bar 40:2; cf. Dan 7:27). Both Daniel and 2 Baruch note that the dominion of God’s Anointed will “last forever” (2 Bar 40:3; Dan 2:44-45; 7:14, 27). Unlike Daniel’s version, the Messianic kingdom in 2 Baruch seems to be of limited time: “and his [God’s Anointed] dominion will last forever until the world of corruption has ended and until the times which have been mentioned before have been fulfilled” (2 Bar 40:3).

Both Daniel and Baruch ask for more details regarding certain parts of the visions, Daniel regarding the reign of the little horn (Dan 7:19-20), and Baruch regarding the time of the corruption (41:1-6). In both expansions, the vision presents two groups of people, God’s Saints, who keeps His Law and who will receive all the good promises (2 Bar 42:2; Dan 7:22) and the wicked, those who have rejected the Law and “mingled themselves with the seed of the mingled nations” (2 Bar 42:4) or have associated themselves with the

“little horn” (Dan 7:21). Unlike Daniel 2 and 7, 2 Baruch 42:7-8 concludes the Messianic age with an universal resurrection, stating: “For corruption will take away those who belong to it, and life those who belong to it. And dust will be called, and told, ‘Give back that which does not belong to you and rise up all that you have kept until its own time.’” The two stage salvation process in 2 Baruch may be an interpretation of the Son of Man passage in Daniel 7:9-14 and the Michael text in Daniel 12:1, which could be read as a reference to a limited Messianic reign before the eschatological resurrection described in Daniel 12:2-3, 13. Be that as it may, the third explicit and most extensive resurrection text in 2 Baruch is also the text most closely connected with the resurrection text in Daniel 12.

2 Baruch 49-51

The third explicit resurrection text follows a section revealing what will happen to the wicked (2 Bar 48:26-47) and it is introduced by the transitional statement:

But now, let us cease talking about the wicked and inquire about the righteous. And I will tell about their blessedness and I shall not be silent about their glory which is kept for them. For surely, as you endured much labor in the short time in which you live in this passing world, so you will receive great light in that world which has no end (2 Bar 48:48-50).

The context of the third resurrection passage presents two groups of people: the wicked, who “knew when he [she] acted unrighteously, and they did not know my Law because of their pride” (2 Bar 48:40); and the righteous, who adhere to God’s Law and keeps His statutes (2 Bar 48:22). From this, the ultimate destiny of a person is based on which group s/he belongs to since God’s “judgment asks for its own, and my [God’s] Law demands its

right” and “there is nothing that will be destroyed unless it acted wickedly” (2 Bar 48:27-29).

Baruch’s main concern regarding this universal eschatological resurrection is the nature of the resurrected body, particularly if the resurrected dead will be able to be recognized. He asks God:

In what shape will the living live in your day? Or how will remain their splendor which will be after that? Will they, perhaps, take again this present form, and will they put on the chained members which are in evil and by which evils are accomplished? Or will you perhaps change these things which have been in the world, as also the world itself? (2 Bar 49:2-3).

This question is not only raised in the New Testament,¹⁴⁹ but was also of interest in Early Rabbinic Judaism as attested by the interpretation made by Resh Lakish (*b. Sanh.* 91b; *Gen. Rab.* 95:1), Rava (*b. Sanh.* 91b; *Gen. Rab.* 102:2, also known as Abba ben Joseph bar Hama), and Hanina bar Hama (*Eccl. Rab.* 1:6-7), who all made a case that the dead would resurrect with the same body and condition they were in when they died before God “heals” them. Resh Lakish derived at his opinion by interpreting Jer 31:8 and Isa 35:6 in light of each other, while Raba and R. Hanina argued their case from Deut 32:39.

¹⁴⁹In 1 Corinthians 15:35, Paul is asked: How are the dead raised? What kind of Body will they have when they come? Using the analogy of a seed which only grows or “resurrects” after it has been buried or “died” in the ground, Paul makes the case that the resurrected body (seedling) is different than the buried body (seed), although the seedling comes from the seed. The resurrect body of the righteous is incorruptible, glorious, powerful, and spiritual and is ready for an eternal life, while the current body is corruptible and will therefore die (1 Cor 15:42-44). Paul also makes it clear that the righteous who are not dead when God returns will also be changed and transformed so also they can partake in the heavenly Paradise (1 Cor 15:51-54). It should be noted that unlike 2 Bar 50:2-4, Paul is only concerned with the future of the righteous.

God provides a similar answer to Baruch's question, but in contrast to the Rabbis, He also provides the reason for why He would not change anything in the form of the resurrected body:

For the earth will surely give back the dead at that time; it receives them now in order to keep them, not changing anything in the form. But as it has received them so it will give them back. And as I have delivered them to it so it will raise them. For then it will be necessary to show those who live that the dead are living again, and that those who went away have come back. And it will be that when they have recognized each other, those who know each other at this moment, **then my judgment will be strong**, and those things which have been spoken of before will come (2 Bar 50:2-4, my emphasis added).

The lack of an initial bodily transformation upon resurrection plays an important function in the eschatological judgment. It is crucial for both the righteous and the wicked living to recognize the resurrected to assumably solve the question of theodicy, since everyone will witness the righteous and the wicked dead receive their just reward or deserved punishment. Both the living and the resurrected dead will see with their own eyes that God's judgment is universal – that the wicked dead did not get away with their wickedness, and the righteous dead will still receive their reward for adhering to God's Law.

It is only after this initial recognition and realization by the righteous and the wicked that the first bodily transformation will take place as a part of the universal judgment process. Both the righteous and the wicked will be transformed to expose their true character for everyone to see. The righteous will be glorified and the shape of their face will be changed into "the light of their beauty" (2 Bar 51:3), "into the splendor of angels" (2 Bar 51:5) and they will be "like the angels and be equal to the stars" (2 Bar

51:10a).¹⁵⁰ They will even be able to “change into any shape which they wished, from beauty to loveliness, and from light to the splendor of glory” (2 Bar 51:10b) The wicked, upon seeing the transformation of the righteous, will also be transformed, however, their “shape will be made more evil” (2 Bar 51:2), and made “into startling vision and horrible shapes; and they will waste away even more” (2 Bar 51:5). At the conclusion of the judgment, the righteous will enter Paradise, the world to come (2 Bar 51:3, 8-14; 52:7), while the wicked will be sent to the place of Torment (2 Bar 51:6, 16; 52:1-5).¹⁵¹

Liv Ingeborg Lied notes the importance of the recognition motif as a part of the great reversal. It is only through the transformation process of the righteous and the wicked that the wicked will be able to identify the righteous and realize their true position. Their roles have been reversed. The wicked were exalted over the righteous in the corruptible world, but in the incorruptible world, it is the righteous who are exalted and will transform from earthly bodies to take on angelic bodies so they can possess Paradise while the wicked will diminish and receive the consequences of their decisions

¹⁵⁰This idea may derive from the description given of Moses when coming down from the mountain, after spending 40 days with God and receiving the two tablets of the covenant from him. According to Exod 35:29-30, “the skin of his face shone” or was radiating light.

¹⁵¹Answering the question regarding the nature of the resurrected body, Paul uses the analogy of a seed which only grows or “resurrects” after it has been buried or “died” in the ground. This analogy is also used in early rabbinic Judaism to support and illustrate a resurrection belief (*b. Ketub.* 111b; *b. Sanh.* 90b; *Eccl. Rab.* 1:6-7; 3:11; cf. *Gen. Rab.* 28:3; *Lev. Rab.* 18:1; *Eccl. Rab.* 12:5). Paul makes the case that the resurrected body (seedling) is different than the buried body (seed), although the seedling comes from the seed. The resurrected body of the righteous is incorruptible, glorious, powerful, spiritual, and is ready for an eternal life, while the current body is corruptible and will therefore die (1 Cor 15:42-44). However, Paul also makes it clear that the righteous who are not dead when God returns will also be changed and transformed so also they can partake in the heavenly Paradise (1 Cor 15:51-54). It should be noted that unlike 2 Bar 50:2-4, Paul is only concerned with the future of the righteous. Interestingly, Jesus also uses this analogy referring to his own death and the result of his sacrifice which will bring life to all who believes in him (John 12:23-26). For further reading regarding Paul’s discussion on the nature of the resurrected body, see David Hodgins, “Our Resurrection Body: An Exegesis of 1 Corinthians 15:42-49,” *MJT* 17, no. 2 (2001): 65-91.

in the place of torment. Thus, it becomes clear to the wicked that it is the righteous who finally triumphed.¹⁵² Ingeborg Lied considers this as a second punishment for the wicked, remarking: “It is not enough that the wicked are made aware of their transgressions and punished by the Judge in 48:40, it is just as crucial that they see their opponents excel” (51:5-6).¹⁵³

While in Paradise, the righteous seem to experience a second transformation. From being like or equal to the angels (2 Bar 51:10), they will become greater than the angels (2 Bar 51:12).¹⁵⁴ This double transformation theme seems to go beyond the

¹⁵²Liv Ingeborg Lied, “Recognizing the Righteous Remnant? Resurrection, Recognition and Eschatological Reversals in 2 Baruch 47-52,” in *Metamorphoses: Resurrection, Body and Transformative Practices in Early Christianity*, eds. Turid Karlsen Seim and Jorunn Økland (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009), 328.

¹⁵³*Ibid.*, 329.

¹⁵⁴This theme of the hierarchical structure of the heavenly world and the ranking of humans within this structure also appears in the books of *The Life of Adam and Eve*, which ranks humans above the angels before the fall and below the angels as the result of sin, after the fall. Several traditions developed concerning the ranking of the angels and speculation of how humans would fit into this structure. According to some traditions, a person who follows his good inclination (יצר הטוב) is considered to be ranked higher than the angels while, if following the evil (יצר הרע), he is likened to an animal (*Gen. Rab.* 14.3-4; 48.11). Other traditions consider the angels to always be ranked above humans. For further study, see Gary A. Anderson, “The Exaltation of Adam and the Fall of Satan,” in *Literature on Adam and Eve*, eds. Gary A. Anderson and Michael E. Stone [Leiden: Brill, 2000], 83-110, David Flusser, *Judaism and the Origins of Christianity* [Jerusalem: Magnes Press, 1988], 246-279, Michael E. Stone, “The Fall of Satan and Adam’s Penitence” in *Literature on Adam and Eve*, eds. Gary A. Anderson and Michael E. Stone [Leiden: Brill, 2000], 43-56, and Efraim E. Urbach, *The Sages: Their Concepts and Beliefs*, 2nd ed. [Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1979], 150-159).

The elevated creation ranking of humans is based on an interpretation of the statement that human beings were created in God’s image and likeness (Gen 1:26-27), hence why the angels were to worship Adam, and the MT version of Psalm 8:5-6 (ET, 4-5) which states that humans were created a little lower than God and were crowned with glory and honor: וְהָרַר תַּעֲשֶׂהוּ וְהָבִיר מֵאֱלֹהִים וְכָבוֹד וְהָדָר תַּעֲשֶׂהוּ (Jan Åge Sigvartsen, “The Hierarchical Structures Found in the Books *The Life of Adam and Eve*,” forthcoming).

This theme is also alluded to in Jesus’ response regarding resurrection of the spouse and the longevity of the marriage vow, noting that since humans will be like the angels, there will be no marriage in Heaven (Matt 22:24-30; Luke 20:34-36). Paul alludes to this ranking in 1 Corinthians 6:1-3, noting that the righteous will judge the angels, suggesting their heightened positions. Hebrews 2:7-9, presents Jesus as accepting a rank lower than the angels temporary, in order to die a substitutionary death on behalf of humankind, implying Jesus returned to his original ranking upon completing His mission. Thus, it could be argued, righteous humans who have accepted Jesus’ sacrifice and have been reborn into a life in Him will,

transformation scene of the righteous/wise described in Daniel 12:3 – “Those who are wise will shine like the bright expanse of the heavens [רָקִיעַ], and those who lead many to righteousness, like the stars forever and ever.” It could be argued that 2 Baruch understood רָקִיעַ, *God’s heavenly expand*, named שָׁמַיִם, *heaven/sky*, in Genesis 1:8, as a reference to Paradise, thus implying that there is a need for a transformation before entering the realm of Paradise. Thus, if there is a need for a transformation, it implies that the righteous must have resurrected in an untransformed shape, perhaps resurrecting with the same shape they had before they died. However, 2 Baruch takes this interpretation a step further and argues that if the righteous were to experience a transformation this would also hold true for the wicked, not to prepare them for entry into Paradise (2 Bar 51:3), but for their place of torment (2 Bar 51:6). In contrast to a more limited resurrection event in Daniel 12:2, which seems to only concern the most wise and the most wicked,¹⁵⁵ 2 Baruch seems to present a universal resurrection which concerns all the righteous and all the wicked, both dead and alive. A judgment scene is only assumed in these two passages to determine who will be resurrected and who should be rewarded or punished. However, the judgment scenes appearing in 2 Baruch and Daniel are closely related:

like Jesus, upon resurrection, be exalted above the angels.

¹⁵⁵Daniel 12:2 uses limiting and not a universal vocabulary, describing the resurrected as many (רַבִּים), instead of all, and the number belonging to each category of resurrected as some (אֵלֶּה, these), again giving the impression that not every single person who has lived will be resurrected.

For behold, the days are coming, and **the books will be opened** in which are written the sins of all those who have sinned, and moreover, also the treasures in which are brought together the righteousness of all those who have proven themselves to be righteous. (2 Bar 24:1-2)

A river of fire was flowing, coming out from His presence. Thousands upon thousands served Him; ten thousand times ten thousand stood before Him. The court was convened, and the **books were opened** . . . until the Ancient of Days arrived and a judgment was given in favor of the holy ones of the Most High, for the time had come, and the holy ones took possession of the kingdom. (Dan 7:10, 22)

The purpose of both judgment scenes is to vindicate the righteous and punish the wicked, based on the detailed records, both sins and good deeds, which are kept in the books to guarantee God's theodicy.

Concluding Remarks

2 Baruch uses the language from the wisdom tradition and presents the resurrection belief as the solution to the problem of theodicy stated in Job and Qohelet. The wisdom element was combined with Daniel's apocalyptic perspective in the second and third explicit resurrection statements (2 Bar 47:7-8; 49-51), dividing humans into two groups, the righteous who follow God's Law and are thus wise, and the wicked who lack God's wisdom thus acting unrighteously due to their pride (2 Bar 48:40). The resurrection belief in this book is mainly based on an interpretation, reworking, and expansion on Daniel 2, 7 and 12. 2 Baruch shows the necessity of the recognition element as a part of the judgment which is followed by a double transformation for the righteous and a single transformation for the wicked. The righteous will become equal to the angels in the first transformation and greater than the angels in the second. This transformation is crucial since it will prepare the righteous for an eternal life in the world to come. Figure 15 illustrates the resurrection concept in 2 Baruch.

Fig. 15. Death and Resurrection in 2 Baruch.

Apocalypse of Elijah

The *Apocalypse of Elijah* is an eschatological work written sometime between the first and fourth century CE. There are two versions of this apocalypse, a Coptic (C) and a Hebrew (H), both presenting a resurrection view. Most scholars consider the Coptic version to be of Christian origin, originally written in Greek towards the end of the third century CE Alexandria and probably developed in three stages.¹⁵⁶ However, this version is most likely a composite text, in which the Jewish stratum “seems to predate the destruction of the Jewish quarter in Alexandria in A.D. 117.”¹⁵⁷ The Hebrew version also shows “evidence of a complex reediting of earlier material.”¹⁵⁸ Buttenwieser believes the author lived in Palestine during the Perso-Roman wars (540-562/604-628 CE), but derived most of his material from an older and larger apocalypse written about 261 CE.¹⁵⁹ The relationship between the Coptic and the Hebrew versions of the apocalypse is not clear, although they share certain details that are significantly different. Wintermute suggests that the section regarding the Antichrist in these two versions may indicate a common ancestor. He suggests this ancestor “would have been an episode within a *Jewish Apocalypse of Elijah* composed before 100 C.E.”¹⁶⁰ and may also have included

¹⁵⁶Orval S. Wintermute, “Elijah, Apocalypse of,” *ABD* 2:467-468.

¹⁵⁷Orval S. Wintermute, “Apocalypse of Elijah,” *OTP* 1:730.

¹⁵⁸Wintermute, “Elijah, Apocalypse of,” 2:467.

¹⁵⁹Moses Buttenwieser, *Die Hebraische Elias-Apokalypse, Part I: Und Ihre Stellung In Der Apokalyptischen Litteratur Des Rabbinischen Schrifttums Und Der Kirche* (1897; repr., Whitefish, Mont.: Kessinger Publishing, 2010), 68-79; and idem, “Apocalyptic Literature, Neo-Hebraic,” *Jewish Encyclopedia*, <http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/1643-apocalyptic-literature-neo-hebraic>; and Wintermute, “Elijah, Apocalypse of,” 2:467.

¹⁶⁰Wintermute, “Elijah, Apocalypse of,” 2:468.

details regarding the punishment of the wicked. The following section will consider these two traditions separately.

Apocalypse of Elijah (C)

This apocalypse reveals details “concerning the kings of Assyria and the dissolution of the heaven and the earth and the things beneath the earth” (2:1). The coming of Antichrist and his reign (3:1-18) takes place in the fourth year of the righteous king who sided with the Persians (2:47-3:1) and ruled in a Messianic-like way for three and a half years (2:52).¹⁶¹ During the reign of Antichrist, in which the righteous will suffer and die as martyrs (4:1-5:1) then be resurrected (4:5, 15, 27),¹⁶² the righteous will be removed from this earth (5:2-6), natural disasters will take place due to the removal of the righteous and the Antichrist will pursue the righteous (5:7-21), and the earth will be destroyed (5:22-24). These events will be followed by God’s universal judgment in the

¹⁶¹Influenced by the *Oracle of the Potter* (C. C. McCown, “Egyptian Apocalyptic Literature,” *HTR* 8 [1925]: 397-400 and L. Koenen, “Die Prophezeiungen des Töpfers,” *ZPE* 2 [1968]: 178-209), a third century BCE Egyptian text concerning the future of Egypt, reveals the future rulership of a righteous king who will overthrow the Greek dominion (see Wintermute, “Apocalypse of Elijah,” 723-724). Based on this tradition combined with motifs from Jewish and Christian apocalyptic texts, the *Apocalypse of Elijah* presents a native Egyptian from Heliopolis who will ally himself with the Persians and kill the Assyrian kings. He will cleanse the land of the wicked and rebuild the temple of the saints, so that even the righteous will say “The Lord sent us a righteous king so that the land will not become a desert” (2:51).

His three and a half year rule of peace (2:52) may either be an allusion to Daniel 7:25 (although this passage refers to the rulership of the little horn) or to Daniel 9:27. The latter passage seems to suggest that following the three and a half prophetic day period (or three and a half literal years) of Messianic rulership, “And the abomination of desolation will be on a wing of the temple until the decreed destruction is poured out on the desolator” (Dan 9:27b). Interestingly, the author of the *Apocalypse of Elijah* introduces the son of lawlessness, the Antichrist, following the righteous king, and notes that this evil power will rule until the eschatological judgment, when he will be executed by Elijah and Enoch (5:32).

¹⁶²In the martyrdom text regarding Elijah and Enoch, the composition describes their “spiritual body of Heavenly realms” and their earthly bodies which they will possess while on earth (4:16-19; 5:32). Upon their resurrection, after the Antichrist killed them, they will once more shine, a possible allusion to Daniel 12:3. This description may serve as an example for what will happen to all the righteous – in order for them to take possession of God’s kingdom, they will also have to take on a shining spiritual body.

favor of the righteous, punishment for the wicked, and execution of the Antichrist (5:25-35), concluding with the millennial kingdom (5:36-39).

The works of the Antichrist closely parallels that of Christ since he will be able to walk on water, cause the lame to walk, the deaf to hear, the dumb to speak, and the blind to see, he will even cleanse the lepers, heal the sick, and cast out demons (3:8-10; cf. Mark 6:48; Matt 11:5). According to the *Apocalypse of Elijah*, the *son of lawlessness* will be able to do every work which the Christ did, “except for raising the dead” since he will have “no power to give life” (3:12-13; 4:31). This is how the righteous will be able to know that he is not the true Christ.

The *Apocalypse of Elijah* reveals that the righteous, those who are sealed with God’s name on their forehead and his seal on their right hand (1:9), will receive thrones and crowns in heaven (1:8) and walk with the angels up to the city of God (1:10), while the sinners will be shamed and the thrones of death will seize them and rule over them (1:11). When the righteous die, their spirit and their soul will return to God while their body will turn into rock to protect it from being eaten by wild animals (4:25-26). On the last day of the great judgment, the righteous will be resurrected and receive their reward. There will be one reward for those who died as martyrs and a different reward for those who fled into the wilderness to escape martyrdom. The first group of righteous will be “in the kingdom of the Christ as those who have endured because the Lord said, ‘I will grant to them that they sit on my right hand.’ They will receive favor over others, and they will triumph over the son of lawlessness. And they will witness the dissolution of heaven and earth. They will receive the thrones of glory and the crowns” (4:27-29). The second group

of righteous will also receive their reward, but “they will be raised up and receive a place of rest” (4:27a).

The final chapter of the apocalypse reveals the removal of the righteous before the natural disasters, destruction of the earth, and the eschatological judgment. During the persecution of the righteous by the hand of the Antichrist, God will pity the righteous and send his angels to gather them into his kingdom, where they will be given full access to the tree of life, and will be given white garments to wear (5:6). In the eschatological judgment, the righteous dead will be resurrected (the text does not mention a resurrection of the wicked) and they “will see the sinners and those who persecuted them and those who handed them over to death in their torments” while the wicked “will see the place of the righteous” (5:28-29).¹⁶³ Upon the final destruction of the Antichrist, the righteous will dwell on a newly created earth with Christ for a thousand years.¹⁶⁴

¹⁶³This is similar to the recognition and transformation theme in 2 Baruch 51, which was a part of the punishment and reward of the wicked and the righteous during the eschatological judgment. There also seems to be a contradiction between 1:10 and 4:24-26. In the first account, the righteous seem to be led to the heavenly city upon death while in the second they will “sleep” in wait for the judgment, their spirits and souls returning to God until they will once more unite with their bodies. If 1:10 is understood as a reference to the journey of the righteous soul upon death to its holding place, the heavenly city, where it will rest until the day of judgment and resurrection, the discrepancy disappears. Regardless, the apocalypse does not seem interested in what happens to the souls of the wicked.

¹⁶⁴This view is similar to Revelation in the sense that the premillennium resurrection only concerns the righteous (Rev 20:6). It differs in a major way in that the millennium will take place on a newly created earth (5:37) as opposed to in heaven (Rev 20:21). The scenario in Revelation also differs in the sense that the recreation takes place at the end of the millennium instead of the beginning, as is the case in *Apocalypse of Elijah*.

Apocalypse of Elijah (H)

In the Hebrew version of the *Apocalypse of Elijah*, Michael, the great prince of Israel (Dan 12:1), reveals “the eschaton and what was scheduled to transpire and the End of Days at the end of the four empires (and) the things which would take place during the reign of the fourth ruler,” placing the apocalypse within the eschatological framework of Daniel 2 and 7. The Antichrist is identified with the “little horn” of Daniel and the text describes his physical features and evil acts and adds that he “shall encroach upon ‘the holy beautiful mountain’ (Dan 11:45) and burn it,” showing his intent of destroying God’s people. Following a list of important eschatological events, which includes the war of Gog and Magog against Jerusalem which will bring in “the final day”,¹⁶⁵ the apocalypse ends with five visions of Elijah (see full text in Appendix A, pages 483-485):

1. Description of the resurrection
2. Description of the punishment of the wicked and the reward for the righteous
3. Description of the three patriarchs together with all the righteous ones in the Garden
4. Description of the New Jerusalem descending from Heaven
5. Description of the dwelling quarters of the righteous

It is not clear from this apocalypse if both the righteous and the wicked will take part in the eschatological resurrection since the current text only mentions the resurrected will “render praise to God” as He is the sole deity.¹⁶⁶ However, the text does mention that

¹⁶⁵ All the wicked will go to war and surround Jerusalem, but God and his Messiah will wage war on them and defeat them. The righteous of Israel will “spend seven years burning their weaponry” and seven months burying their corpses (Ezek 39:9, 12). This vision shares some similarities with Rev 20:8-9, which describes the war effort of the wicked against the New Jerusalem at the end of the millennium.

¹⁶⁶ A case could be made that both the righteous and the wicked are included in this resurrection since both groups will have to acknowledge God’s power. It is given that the righteous will offer God praise, but the wicked, who did not recognize God, would have to accept His uniqueness after they have been resurrected to receive their punishment.

in the Western region of the world, the souls undergoes a painful judgment, each one in accordance with its deeds. Again, it is not clear if this torment only regards the wicked souls, or if it also functions as a purifying process for the righteous souls, preparing them for the resurrection. Be that as it may, the apocalypse depicts the resurrection process as the reversal of death, in which the dust of the dead is reshaped and “made like (the forms they had) when they were formerly alive.”¹⁶⁷ This resurrection act is supported in the apocalypse by quoting Deut 32:39 – “See now that I alone am He; there is no God but Me. I bring death and I give life; I wound and I heal. No one can rescue anyone from My hand” – a text also used by the Rabbis to support said view (*b. Pesah.* 68a; *b. Sanh.* 91b; *Deut. Rab.* 3:15; *Eccl. Rab.* 1:6), and by quoting Ezek 37:8 which concerns the resurrection scene of the Valley of the bones. In Elijah’s resurrection vision, God’s angels play an active role. They are the ones who open the tombs, inject the dead righteous “with their ‘animating breaths’” so they will revive, and help the newly resurrected with standing on their feet. After their role in the resurrection, the angels turn their attention to the wicked, who merit punishment, in order to place them into a large hollow place, all the while being observed by the righteous, who will see their downfall as promised by the prophet Isaiah (Isa 66:24).

The second vision of Elijah reveals the punishment of the wicked who will suffer in the fire and brimstone which God sends from heaven according to Ps 11:6. In this vision, God finds it necessary to ensure the righteous do not hear the suffering of the

¹⁶⁷That the righteous will resume their appearance from before they died, sounds similar to *Apoc. El.* [C] 5:28-29 and 2 Bar 51.

wicked so the righteous will not beg for mercy on their behalf. Thus, the wicked will be forgotten and it “will be as if they never were.”

In the third vision, Elijah is shown the patriarchs and the righteous dwelling in the Garden with the great tree which was prepared for them standing in its midst, a possible allusion to the Tree of Life (Gen 2:9; Rev 22:2, 14, 19) which will once more be made available for God’s people. The final two visions in the Hebrew version describe the New Jerusalem and the houses which have been prepared for the righteous.

Concluding Remarks

The resurrection belief appears in both the Coptic and the Hebrew version of the *Apocalypse of Elijah* and follows the appearance of the Antichrist. Neither text states clearly if this resurrection will be universal and would include both the righteous and the wicked, although the Hebrew version seems to suggest this. In both versions the punishment of the wicked functions as a part of the vindication of the righteous. The New Earth motif follows the resurrection and judgment in both versions. The Coptic version, however, insinuates that there will be two groups of righteous who will receive different rewards. Those who suffered a martyr’s death will be a part of the kingdom of Christ, sit on His right hand, receive the thrones of glory, and crowns. Those who did not die for their faith will just be given a place of rest. The Hebrew version has no such differentiation between the righteous. Although the Coptic version used the Daniel material, it did not attempt to provide “proof texts” for the resurrection belief as in the case of the Hebrew version. The Hebrew version seems to be more in line with Early

Rabbinic texts which also show interest in providing biblical “proof texts” in support of the various aspects of their resurrection beliefs.

Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections)

The second genre category of Pseudepigraphical books, Testaments, follows the pattern of last words or blessings of Jacob to his sons in Genesis 49, and Moses final words to the people of Israel in Deuteronomy 32-33. In these two passages, Jacob and Moses use poetic language, reflecting on key events in the past which are relevant to each of the sons/tribes before turning their attention to the future. Both of these “proto-testaments” are introduced by the technical term, **בְּאַחֲרֵית הַיָּמִים**, “*in the last days*” (Gen 49:1; Deut 31:29), suggesting that these two poetic texts will also reveal something about the distant future, thus also including apocalyptic material.¹⁶⁸ This understanding of the term becomes apparent from Targum Pseudo-Jonathan expansion upon the introductory words of Jacob’s blessings of his sons:

¹⁶⁸This technical term is also used in Numbers 24:14, in Balaam’s blessing of the people of Israel, revealing aspects of their distant future, hinting at the Messianic age (Num 24:17-19), and the future destruction of Israel’s enemies. However, George Buchanan cautions the reader to not automatically assume that this expression should be understood eschatologically. He writes: “Modern Bible students should not be misled by the word ἔσχατος [the LXX translation for **אַחֲרֵית**] in this expression and should not read eschatological meanings into contexts which do not anticipate any kind of an end, but only future time” (George Wesley Buchanan, “Eschatology and the ‘End of Days,’” *JNES* 20 [July 1961], 191).

וַיִּקְרָא יַעֲקֹב אֶל-בָּנָיו וַיֹּאמֶר

וַקְרָא יַעֲקֹב לְבָנָיו וַאֲמַר לְהוֹם

אִידְכוּ מִסּוּאֲבוּחָא

וַאֲיַחוּי לְכוֹן רוֹיִיא סְתִימִיא קִיצִיא גְנוּזִיא

וּמִתֵּן אַנְרַהוֹן דְּצַדִּיקִיא

וּפּוֹרְעֻנוּתְהוֹן דְּרִשְׁעִיא

וְשְׁלוּיָתָא דְּעֶדֶן מַה הוּא

כַּחֲדָא מִתְכַּנְשִׁין תְּרִיסָר שְׁבִטֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל מִקְפִּין

דְּרַנְשָׁא דְּרַהֲבָא דְּרַבִּיעַ עַלָּה

וּמִן דְּאִיתְנָלִי אִיקְרָ שְׁכִינָתָא דִּי

קִיצָא דְּעִתִּיד מַלְכָּא מְשִׁיחָא לְמִיתִי אִיתְכַּסִּי מִינֵיהּ

וּבִכִּין אִמַּר אִיתוּ

וַאֲתִנִּי לְכוֹן מַה דִּיאֲרַע יִתְכוֹן בְּסוֹף יוֹמִיא:

הָאֶסְפוּ וְאֶגִּידָה לָכֶם

אֵת אֲשֶׁר-יִקְרָא אֲתֶכֶם בְּאַחֲרֵית הַיָּמִים:

^{49:1} Then Jacob called his sons and said,

^{49:1} And Jakob called his sons and said to them, Purify yourselves from uncleanness, and **I will show you the hidden mysteries, the ends concealed, the recompense of reward for the righteous, the retribution of the wicked, and the bower of Eden, what it is.** And the twelve tribes of Israel gathered themselves together around the golden bed whereon he reclined, and where was revealed to him the Shekina of the Lord, **(though) the end for which the king Meshiha is to come had been concealed from him.** Then said he, Come, and **I will declare to you what shall befall you at the end of the days.** (PJE)

"Gather around, and I will tell you what will happen to you **in the days to come.**" (CSB)

In the expansion found in the Targum, several new elements are introduced regarding

"the days to come." This apocalyptic time will include the reward of the righteous and the retribution of the wicked, and the bower of Eden, a possible allusion to the eschatological universal resurrection followed by the judgment of all. This future time will also see the arrival of the king Meshiha, and, it could be assumed, the Messianic age.¹⁶⁹

¹⁶⁹The Messianic aspect of Jacob's blessings is most clearly seen in the blessing given to his son Judah (Gen 49:8-12), a theme greatly expanded upon by Targum Pseudo-Jonathan. However, this ancient poem also uses Messianic language in the blessing given to Jacob's favorite son, Joseph. The Joseph oracle is the earliest biblical hint of the suffering Messiah, later referred to as Messiah ben Joseph/Ephraim (eg, *b. Sanh.* 98b; *b. Sukkah* 52a, b; *y. Sukkah* 5.2; *Tg. Yer. I Zech* 12.1; *Tg. Onq.* Exod 40.9-11), which becomes a key element of Isaiah's Suffering Servant songs and comes to a climax in Isaiah 52:13-53:12. For an analysis of the Messianic aspect of the Joseph oracle (Gen 49:22-26), see Jan A. Sigvartsen, "Messiah Son of Joseph: Genesis 49:22-26" (MA thesis, Andrews University, 1998). The Priestly Messiah, Messiah ben Levi, which appears in the Dead Sea scrolls (eg, 4Q175; 4QD^a 7.18-21; 12.23-13.1; 14.18-19; 19.9-11; 1QS), who will rule together (1Q28a 2.11-21) with the Royal Messiah, Messiah ben David, derives from an interpretation of Balaam's blessing in Num 24:14. Jewish tradition also mentions the Messiah to be a

John Sailhamer notes regarding the Pentateuch's use of this technical term:

The author shows throughout his work an interest in past events. His repeated and strategic return to the notion of “the last days” in giving his work its final shape reveals that his interest is in the future as well Because of the terminology he uses (viz., “the end of days”), we could call it an eschatological reading of his historical narratives. The narrative texts of past events are presented as pointers to future events. Past events foreshadow the future.¹⁷⁰

Thus, these “proto-testaments” include material from the preceding narratives, give ethical evaluations of these key events, may add new elements from the past which has not been revealed in the preceding narratives, and concludes with remarks pertaining to the near and distant future. It is little wonder then that Charlesworth states the Pseudepigraphical Testament genre is not well defined as it includes material which falls into several different genre categories like “apocalyptic, ethical, and Midrashic types of literature.”¹⁷¹ During Second Temple Period Judaism, several literary pieces were written containing the “last words” or testament of an important Patriarch or character from the TaNaKh, the apocalyptic section of these testaments often contain the resurrection hope.

Table 29 provides a list of resurrection passages appearing in the Testaments:

Prophet (1QS 9.9b-11) or have prophetic attributes, possibly an interpretation of Deut 18:15-18 and Deut 34:10 which mentions that there will come a future prophet who will be greater than Moses. Interestingly, it seems that the New Testament writers try to make a case that Jesus is the fulfillment of this prophecy – that Jesus is the new Moses or the new Lawgiver.

¹⁷⁰John H. Sailhamer, *The Pentateuch as Narrative: A Biblical-Theological Commentary*, Library of Biblical Interpretation (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1992), 37.

¹⁷¹Charlesworth, *OTP* 1:773. He also notes these texts seem to have the following loose format in common: “The ideal figure faces death and causes his relatives and intimate friends to circle around his bed. He occasionally informs them of his fatal flaw and exhorts them to avoid certain temptations; he typically instructs them regarding the way of righteousness and utters blessings and curses. Often he illustrates his words – as the apocalyptic seer in the apocalypses – with descriptions of the future as it has been revealed to him in a dream or vision” (ibid.).

Table 29. Resurrection texts in the Testaments

Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assum.
Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs	Simeon	6	Arise in joy		x		x		x
		8:1	Sleep Death	x					
	Levi	18:14	Patriarchs share in the eschatological blessings	x					
	Judah	25	Resurrection of Patriarchs		x		x		
		26:4	Sleep = Death	x					x
	Issachar	7:9	Sleep Death	x					x
	Zebulon	10:1-7	Righteous/ Wicked		x				x
	Dan	5:7-13	The work of the dual Messiah		x				x
		7:1	Sleep Death	x					x
	Gad	8:1	Sleep Death	x					x
	Asher	8:1	Sleep Death	x					x
	Joseph	20:4	Sleep Death	x					x
	Benjamin	10:4-10	Resurrection of patriarchs/ transformation/ Judgment		x	x			x
Testament of Job	4:9		Regarding the impending calamities		x	x			x
	33; 41:4		Job's throne in Heaven	x					x
	39:12		The children have been taken up to heaven	x					x
	43		The two ways	x					x
	47:11; 52; 53		Coming for the immortal Soul Death Sleep	x					x

Table 29 – Continued

Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assum.
Testament of the Three Patriarchs	Testament of Abraham	B7:16	Resurrection after 7000 ages are fulfilled		X				X
Testament of Moses	1:15		Death = Sleep	X					X
	10:9		The End-time	X			X		X
	10:14		Death = Sleep	X					X
Testament of Adam	3:2		Created in God's image	X				X	X
	3:4		Resurrection/ 2 nd Adam		X		X		X

Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs

The Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs records the deathbed exhortation of each of the twelve patriarchs to their descendants inspired and modeled after Jacob's last words to his sons in Genesis 49 and Moses' words to the tribes of Israel in Deuteronomy 31-32. James L. Kugel states "the *Testaments* have a complicated, and much disputed, history of composition" and notes that its "history probably begins in the Hasmonean period, sometimes in the last half of the 2nd century BCE."¹⁷² Kugel argues that the exalted position given to Levi and the importance of showing obedience towards him in these Testaments would seem unwarranted following "the Roman conquest of Judah by

¹⁷²James L. Kugel, "Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs" in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 2:1697. Robert A. Kugler provides an extensive survey of the various scholarly views held regarding the composition history in *The Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 2001), 31-38.

Pompey (63 BCE).”¹⁷³ Evans believes this composition was “written between 109 and 106 BCE by a Pharisee who greatly admired John Hyrcanus at the zenith of the Maccabean (or Hasmonean) dynasty.”¹⁷⁴

In contrast, Harm W. Hollander and Marinus De Jonge argue that the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*, in its present form, is a Christian composition which was completed late in the second century CE. Although they would acknowledge that parts of this composition probably developed in pre-Christian Jewish circles, in light of the Dead Sea Scrolls (1QapGen; 4QPBless; 11QMelch; 4QPRNab ar.; 4QFlor; 4QTLevi ar^a; TNap), they believe that it would be impossible to reconstruct the Jewish version of this Testament.¹⁷⁵ They conclude: “A fortiori, it is practically impossible to answer the question whether there ever existed Jewish Testaments in some form. If they existed, we shall never be able to reconstruct them with any degree of certainty.”¹⁷⁶ Robert Kugler notes in his survey of the various scholarly views held on the compositional history of the Testaments, that this latter view is the view he finds the most judicious but notes that “converts to de Jonge’s view are remarkably slow in coming.” Kugler still believes that Jonge’s “insistence that we cannot achieve sufficient consensus on a pre-Christian form of the Testaments to make the pursuit of one worthwhile seems destined to win the

¹⁷³Kugel, “The Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs,” 1699.

¹⁷⁴Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 40.

¹⁷⁵Harm W. Hollander and Marinus De Jonge, *The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs: A Commentary*, SVTP 8 (Leiden: Brill, 1985), 82-85.

¹⁷⁶Hollander and De Jonge, *Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs*, 85.

day.”¹⁷⁷ Be that as it may, the majority view is that the *Testaments of the Twelve*

Patriarchs is a Jewish composition with Christian interpolations.¹⁷⁸ Kugel notes:

The most reasonable conclusion appears to be that the *Testaments*: 1) started off as a Jewish text in Hasmonean times; a text that 2) was later slightly revised while still in Hebrew, with specific insertions critical of the priesthood (as well as perhaps other material); 3) was still later freely translated into Greek with a number of a [*sic*] new passages added; and then finally 4) was supplemented by a relatively small and easily identifiable set of Christian interpolations.

Howard C. Kee notes that each of the twelve testaments contains six key elements, which have been utilized when creating Table 30. They are: 1) introduction to the testament, the setting; 2) narrative of the life of the patriarch;¹⁷⁹ 3) ethical

¹⁷⁷Kugler, *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*, 38. See also, Robert A. Kugler, “Testaments,” DEJ, 1296-1297.

¹⁷⁸The following sections from the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* have been suggested as Christian interpolations and have been compiled from Kugel commentary on the “Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs” in Feldman, Kugel, and Schiffman, *Outside the Bible*, 2:1697-1855 and Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 40. They are: T. Reu. 6:8; T. Sim. 6:5, 7; 7:1, 2; T. Levi 2:11; 4:1, 4, 5; 5:2; 8:5, 12-15; 10:2, 3; 14:1, 2; 16:3, 5; 17:2; 18:3, 7, 9-12, 14; T. Jud. 22:2; 24:2, 4; T. Iss. 7:7; T. Zeb. 9:8-9; T. Dan 5:10, 12-13; 6:6-7, 9; T. Naph. 4:5; 8:2, 3; T. Gad 8:2; T. Ash. 7:3-5; T. Jos. 19:3-6, 7, 8, 11; T. Benj. 3:8; 9:2-3, 3-5; 10:6-10; 11:2-5. It should be noted the process of determining what sections in a piece of literature is a Christian interpolation is not completely objective, thus some scholars have a more extensive list of interpolations than others. It is important to keep in mind that just because a statement sounds “Christian” does not necessarily mean that it could not be pre-Christian and have been written by a Jewish writer. Many Jewish concepts, theological positions, ethical standards, eschatological expectations, and apocalyptic elements were adopted by the early Christian Church, given the first Christians were all “Messianic Jews.”

¹⁷⁹The narrative element is missing in the *Testament of Asher*. Several of the narrative sections in these Testaments allude, comment, and expand upon the Genesis narrative in addition to the Jacob’s blessing itself: the *Testament of Reuben* expands on his affair with his father’s concubine Bilhah (T. Rub. 3:11-15 || Gen 35:32); *Testament of Simeon* uses the account in Genesis 42:18-25 (T. Sim. 4:1-3) which have the brothers choose Simon to remain behind in Egypt as a springboard for the ethical discussion on anger and jealousy (T. Sim. 2:5-13, also a reference to Gen 37:25-28), this testament also expands on the extent of Joseph’s forgiveness (T. Sim. 4:4, 6 || Gen 47:11); *Testament of Levi* justifies Levi’s slaughter of the people of Shechem in Genesis 34:25-31 (T. Levi 2:2; 6:3-7:4); *Testament of Judah* expands on the Tamar narrative in Genesis 38 and places Judah’s actions in a better light (T. Jud. 8-12); *Testament of Issachar* comments on the mandrakes incident in Genesis 30:1-24 (T. Iss. 1:2-2:5); *Testament of Zebulon* provides more details regarding the brother’s conspiracy against Joseph (T. Zeb. 1:5-4:13 || Gen 37); *Testament of Dan* also provides additional details to the brother’s conspiracy (T. Dan 1:4-9 || Gen 37); *Testament of Naphtali* expands on Naphtali’s birth narrative and Bilhah’s background (T. Naph. 1:6-12 || Gen 30:8); *Testament of Gad* expands on the report Joseph gave to his father regarding his brother’s bad

exhortation;¹⁸⁰ 4) prediction regarding the future, an apocalyptic section; followed by 5) a second exhortation; and is concluded by 6) the death and burial of said patriarch.¹⁸¹

The resurrection statements and allusions in the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* have been highlighted in red and shows that all but one of these statements appear in the apocalyptic section of the Testaments (T. Sim. 6:7; T. Levi 18:14; T. Jud. 25:4; T. Zeb. 10:1-3; T. Dan 5:7-13). The remaining resurrection statements appear in the second exhortation of the *Testament of Benjamin* (T. Benj. 10:6-10).

The use of “sleep” as an analogy, metaphor, or euphemism for death, implying a resurrection, will be discussed below and has not been highlighted in this Table. The following Table also shows that most of the Christian interpolations and textual references, given in parentheses,¹⁸² appear in the apocalyptic sections of the Testaments with the exception of the Testaments of Ruben, Isaachar, and Naphtali. It should also be

deeds (T. Gad 1:3–9 || Gen 37:2); *Testament of Joseph* expands on the brothers’ plot against Joseph in Genesis 37 (T. Jos. 10-16) and Joseph’s sexual temptation in Genesis 39 (T. Jos. 2-9); and the *Testament of Benjamin* adds some additional details to Benjamin’s birth (T. Benj. 1:3-6 || Gen 35:16-20) and to the brother’s conspiracy (T. Benj. 2:1-5 || Gen 37).

¹⁸⁰Each of the *Testaments* seems to address a main ethical concern, the *Testament of Ruben* deals with the theme of lust; the *Testament of Simeon* with envy; the *Testament of Levi* with pride and arrogance; the *Testament of Judah* with courage, greed, and fornication; the *Testament of Issachar* with asceticism; the *Testament of Zebulun* with piety and compassion; the *Testament of Dan* with anger and falsehood; the *Testament of Naphtali* with sexual relations and natural goodness; the *Testament of Gad* with hatred, hate versus love; the *Testament of Asher* with vice and virtue; the *Testament of Joseph* with chastity; and finally in the *Testament of Benjamin* with the importance of having a pure heart.

¹⁸¹Howard C. Kee, “Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs,” DNTB, 1201.

¹⁸²These texts are compiled from Robert H. Charles, *The Greek Versions of the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1960), xlviii-li; March Philonenko and Howard Kee, *Les interpolations chrétiennes des Testaments des douze patriarches et les manuscrits de Qumrân*, CRHPR 35 (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1960).

noted that the narrative of the life of Levi section in the *Testament of Levi*, alternates between events from his life and visions from God:

Narrative section regarding Levi's life (2:1-2) => 1st Vision (2:3-5:7)

Narrative section regarding Levi's life (6:1-7:4) => 2nd Vision (8:1-19)

Narrative section regarding Levi's life (9:1-14) => 3rd Vision (10:1-5)

Narrative section regarding Levi's life (11:1-12:5)

Table 30. Structural overview of the Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs

SON	Introduction	Narrative of the Life	Ethical Exhortation	Prediction Regarding Future	Second Exhortation	Death and Burial
Ruben	1:1-5	1:6-3:15	4:1-6:4	6:5-7	6:8-12	7:1-2
Simeon	1:1-2	2:1-13	3:1-5:3	5:4-6:7 (6:5, 7)	7:1-3	7:4-9:2
Levi	1:1-2	2:1-12:5 (2:11; 4:1, 4; 10:2-3)	13:1-9	14:1-18:14 (14:1, 2; 16:3; 17:2; 18:7, 9)	19:1-4a	19:4b-5
Judah	1:1-6	2:1-12:12	13:1-20:5	21:1-25:5 (24:4)	26:1	26:2-4
Issachar	0.042361	1:2-3:8	4:1-5:8	6:1-4	7:1-7 (7:7)	7:8-9
Zebulun	1:1-2	1:3-4:13	5:1-8:1	8:2-10:4 (9:8)	0.4201389	0.4208333
Dan	1:1-2	1:3-9	2:1-5:5	5:6-13 (5:10, 13)	6:1-11 (6:7, 9)	7:1-3
Naphtali	1:1-4	1:5-2:8	2:9-3:5	4:1-8:1	8:2-10 (8:2, 3)	9:1-2
Gad	1:1-2	1:3-2:5	3:1-7:7	8:1-2 (8:2)	0.3354167	8:3b-4
Asher	1:1-2	—	1:3-6:5	7:1-3 (7:3)	7:4-7	8:1-2
Joseph	0.042361	1:2-16:5	17:1-18:4	19:1-10 (19:8)	19:11-12 (19:11)	20:1-6
Benjamin	1:1-6	2:1-5	3:1-8:3 (3:8)	9:1-3 (9:3-5)	10:1-11:5 (10:7, 8, 9)	12:1-4

Sleep as a Metaphor for Death

In the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs, most of the “death and burial” elements of the individual Testaments use “sleep” as a metaphor for death (T. Sim. 8:1; T. Jud. 26:4; T. Iss. 7:9; T. Zeb. 10:6; T. Dan 7:1; T. Gad 8:1; T. Ash. 8:1; T. Jos. 20:4). Two Greek terms for sleep appear in these passages, which are listed below: κοιμάω (highlighted in orange) and ύπνώω/ύπνος (highlighted in blue). Based on the context, these two terms could be understood literally as a reference to natural sleep – or metaphorically as a reference to death. In the cases below, they have all been used metaphorically.

Reference	Death and Burial using sleep as an metaphor for death
T. Sim. 8:1-2	He fell asleep (κοιμωμένην) with his fathers at the age of one hundred and twenty years. They placed him in a wooden coffin in order to carry his bones up to Hebron.
T. Jud. 26:4	Judah fell asleep (έκοιμήθη Ιούδας) and his sons did everything as he had instructed them, and they buried him in Hebron with his fathers.
T. Iss. 7:9	And he stretched his legs and died at a good old age – the fifth son, with all his members sound and still strong; he slept the eternal sleep (ύπνωσεν ύπνον αιώνιον).
T. Zeb. 10:6	When he had said this, he fell into a beautiful sleep (έκοιμήθη ύπνω καλῳ), and his sons placed him in a coffin. Later they carried him up to Hebron and buried him with his fathers.
T. Dan 7:1	When he had said this, he kissed them and slept an eternal sleep (ύπνωσεν ύπνον αιώνιον). And his sons buried him and later they carried his bones to be near Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob.
T. Gad 8:1	He drew up his feet and fell asleep in peace (έκοιμήθη έν ειρήνη). And after five years they took him up and buried him in Hebron with his fathers.

T. Ash. 8:1 After he had said these things he gave instructions, saying, “Bury me in Hebron.” And he died, **heaving fallen into a beautiful sleep** (ὕπνω καλῶ **κοιμηθείς**).

T. Jos. 20:4 And after he had said this he stretched out his feet and **fell into a beautiful sleep** (**ἐκοιμήθη ὕπνον** αἰώνιον). And all Israel and all Egypt mourned with great lamentation.

It should be noted that the term κοιμάω appears only in one other passage in the Testaments, and in that context it is used twice in its literal meaning, referring to Bilhah’s drunken sleep which prevented her from waking up when Reuben raped her (T. Rub. 3:12, 13). The second term, ὕπνώω/ὕπνος, is defined by the author of *Testament of Reuben* as: “In addition to all these is an eighth spirit, [that] of sleep, through which is created the trance-like state [that occurs in] nature, as well as a likeness of death” (T. Rub. 3:1), and is “joined to deceit and imagination.”¹⁸³ This is also the term used for Reuben’s inability to sleep until he had performed the act of raping Bilhah (T. Rub. 3:12). Apart from these three passages in the *Testament of Reuben*, it is used in five additional passages in its literal sense (T. Sim. 4:9 x2; T. Levi 2:5 [trance-like state?]; T. Jud. 18:4; T. Iss. 3:5). It could be argued that based on the usage of these two terms in the rape narrative, ὕπνώω/ὕπνος seems to also carry an “unconscious” aspect to this literal sleep, since Bilhah was unaware of what Reuben did to her, perhaps alluding to the unconscious state of death.

These two words allude to a resurrection hope since “sleep” suggests that death is not permanent – if a person sleeps it is assumed that he/she will wake up from said sleep at one point in the future. This figurative language is also used in Daniel 12:2 when

¹⁸³Kugel, “Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs,” 1709.

describing death (καθεύδω)¹⁸⁴ and resurrection (ἀνίστημι), and is well attested in the New Testament, where the word κοιμάω is mostly used in its metaphorical sense for death.¹⁸⁵ It is interesting that the term ὑπνόω/ὑπνος is never used when referring to death in the New Testament¹⁸⁶ and only carries this meaning in three out of 21 passages in the LXX (Pss 13:4; 76:5; Jer 28:39). The allusion to the resurrection hope when using the metaphor of sleep becomes clear in the resurrection passage found in Testament of Judah 25:4 which describes resurrection as waking up to life: “And those who died in sorrow shall be raised in joy; and those who died in poverty for the Lord’s sake shall be made rich; those who died on account of the Lord **shall be wakened to life**” (καὶ οἱ διὰ Κύριον ἀποθανόντες **ἐξυπνισθήσονται ἐν ζωῇ**).¹⁸⁷

¹⁸⁴The New Testament also uses the word “sleep” literally (as a reference to regular sleep), or metaphorically (as a reference to death). It is used literally in: Matt 8:24; 13:25; 25:5; 26:40, 43, 45; Mark 4:27, 38; 13:36; 14:37x2, 40, 41; Luke 22:46; 1 Thess 5:6, 7x2; and as a reference to death in Matt 9:24; Mark 5:39; Luke 8:52; Eph 5:14; 1 Thess 5:10.

¹⁸⁵It is used for describing death in Matt 27:52; John 11:11; Acts 7:60; 13:36; 1 Cor 7:39; 11:30; 15:6, 18, 20, 51; 1 Thess 4:13, 14, 15; 2 Pet 3:4. The word has only been used in its literal sense in Matt 28:13; Luke 22:45; John 11:12; Acts 12:6.

¹⁸⁶It is used in four passages to describe natural sleep (Matt 1:24; Luke 9:32; John 11:13; Acts 20:9. A fifth passage uses the word metaphorically as waking up from “sleep” so they can be prepared for the Second coming (Rom 13:11).

¹⁸⁷The Greek text of the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* is from Ken Penner and Michael S. Heiser, “Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology” (Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2008). The word ἐξυπνίζω, to cause to wake up, as the counterpoint to a natural sleep, or a vision, is used in T. Levi 8:18 and T. Naph 1:3; and ἔξυπνος, awaken, in T. Lev 5:7, again in the context of a vision.

Clear Resurrection Hope

There are six clear resurrection passages in the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs (T. Sim. 6:7; T. Levi 18:14; T. Jud. 25; T. Zeb. 10:1-3; T. Dan 5:7-13; T. Benj. 10:4-10). However, unlike the apocalyptic books discussed in a previous section of this dissertation, they do not reveal a lot with regard to what happens upon death or give a lot of details surrounding the eschatological resurrection.¹⁸⁸ These clear resurrection passages all appear in Testaments referring to the writings of Enoch as a source of eschatological knowledge (T. Sim. 5:4; T. Levi 10:5; 14:1; T. Jud 18:1; T. Zeb. 3:4; T. Dan 3:4; T. Benj. 9:1), and all but two (T. Levi 18:14 and T. Dan 5:7-13) use the Greek word ἀνίστημι, *cause to stand up*, in the context of this resurrection hope (T. Sim 6:7; T. Jud 25:1; T. Zeb. 10:2; T. Benj. 10:6). As mentioned previously, all but one (T. Benj. 10:6-8, 11) of these resurrection passages appear in the apocalyptic section of the book (see Table 25). Only two of these resurrection passages do not contain any Christian interpolation (T. Jud 25 and T. Zeb. 10:1-7), although the extent of the Christian interpolations in the other passages (T. Sim. 6:7; T. Levi 10:14; T. Dan 5:11; T. Benj. 10:6-8, 11) are up for scholarly discussion. It should also be noted that all but one (T. Dan 5:7-13) of these resurrection passages emphasizes the resurrection of the patriarch (T. Sim. 6:7; T. Zeb. 10:2) or the patriarchs in general (T. Levi 18:13-14; T. Jud. 25; T. Benj. 10:6). These six

¹⁸⁸The *Testament of Levi* reveals some details regarding the eschatological judgment, noting that when Levi was shown the three (or the seven in some textual traditions) heavens, he saw the lowest (or second) heaven which contains “the fire, snow, and ice, ready for the day determined by God’s righteous judgment. In it are all the spirits of those dispatched to achieve the punishment of mankind” (T. Levi 3:1-2), implying an eschatological resurrection of the wicked souls who will be punished. The *Testament of Dan* reveals that Beliar keeps the souls of the saints captive, but during the messianic age, they will be liberated, thus implying a resurrection of these righteous souls (T. Dan 5:11).

resurrection passages can also be divided into two groups, the first describing a limited resurrection of only the patriarch and the righteous (T. Sim. 6:7; T. Levi 18:14; T. Jud. 25; T. Zeb. 10:1-3; T. Dan 5:7-13) while the second describes a universal resurrection of both the righteous and the wicked (T. Benj. 10:5-10).

Limited Resurrection

The “limited resurrection” passages focus on the eschatological resurrection of the patriarch and the saints, while the destiny of the wicked is mostly ignored.

Testament of Simeon 6:7. In *Testament of Simeon*, the resurrection hope concludes the apocalyptic section (T. Sim. 5:4-6:7) which is based on what Simeon has “seen in a copy of the book of Enoch (T. Sim. 5:4). The resurrection follows a period of sexual promiscuity which will destroy the tribe (T. Sim. 6:7), a rebellion against the leadership of the tribe of Levi and Judah which will not succeed (T. Sim. 5:4-6), the glorification of Shem, the manifestation of God upon the earth [as a man]¹⁸⁹ who will save Adam (T. Sim. 6:5), and final destruction of the evil spirits (T. Sim. 6:6). Simeon concludes his apocalyptic statement by affirming his strong conviction that he will resurrect in gladness after these tumultuous events and bless God for his marvelous work. A second Christian interpolation expands on this work by adding “because God has taken a body, eats with human beings, and saves human beings” (T. Sim. 6:7c). It should be noted that the resurrection statement in the *Testament of Simeon* is limited to him

¹⁸⁹This is most likely a Christian interpolation referring to Jesus’ incarnation and death which would bring salvation and undo the curse which entered this world through Adam’s rebellion.

personally and, as such, does not reveal the extent of it – if it will include other righteous dead or if it would also include the wicked dead.

Testament of Levi 18:14. In the *Testament of Levi*, Levi reveals to his sons what he has learned from the writings of Enoch regarding the end-time (T. Levi 14:1), more specifically what will take place during the seventy weeks (T. Levi 17:1), and the priesthood belonging to each of the jubilees during this time period.¹⁹⁰ He concludes his apocalyptic statement revealing the events which will take place during the messianic age, when “the Lord will raise up a new priest” (T. Levi 18:1) who will rule “from generation to generation forever (T. Levi 18:8). During the reign of the Priestly Messiah, there will be peace on earth (T. Levi 18:4); “the knowledge of the Lord will be poured out on the earth like the water of the seas” (T. Levi 18:5); sin will cease (T. Levi 18:9); Messiah ben Levi will open the gates of Paradise and provide the people full access to the tree of life (T. Levi 18:10); Beliar will be bound (T. Levi 18:12a), while the wicked spirits will loose their powers (T. Levi 18:12b); and there will be an eschatological resurrection of the saints. Levi declares: “Then Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob will rejoice, and I shall be glad, and all the saints shall be clothed in righteousness” (T. Levi 18:14).

¹⁹⁰This might be an interpretation of the 70 week prophecy in Daniel 9:24-27. Based on the interpretation of this time-period provided to Daniel by the angel, it becomes apparent that these 70 weeks describes a much longer time-period than a mere 1260 days or 3½ years, and that this 490 days period should rather be understood as a 490 year period (1 week = 7 years => 70 weeks x 7 years = 490 years). It is interesting that the *Testament of Levi* combines this 70 week period with the jubilee cycle, a different way of calculating time (one jubilee cycle is 49 years long). Thus, if understanding the 70 week period as 70 weeks of years (490 years), this time period would contain exactly ten jubilee cycles (10 cycles x 49 years = 490 years). The 70 weeks could also be a parallel to the 70 generations of 1 Enoch 10:11-15 which also ends with the eschatological judgment and resurrection.

Compared with the resurrection statement in the *Testament of Simeon* 6:8, this passage includes Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, together with all the saints, in the eschatological resurrection. This passage, however, does not discuss the final destiny of the wicked dead, suggesting a limited resurrection which would only include the righteous dead. If this passage is read in conjunction with *Testament of Levi* 3:1-2, this eschatological resurrection could also include the wicked souls who will be punished, thus describing a more universal resurrection.

Testament of Judah 25. In the apocalyptic section of *Testament of Judah* (T. Jud. 21-25), Judah reveals to his children that the kingship has been given to him but would be subjugated to the priesthood which was given to Levi (T. Jud. 21:2-5). Judah also notes that in the book of Enoch, there will be a great apostasy which will bring an end to his rulership (T. Jud. 18:1; 22:2). However, his descendants will repent and turn back to God, who will bring them back from captivity (T. Jud. 23:5). Only after this will the eschatological king, the “Star from Jacob,” the “Sun of Righteousness,” the sinless king, “the Shoot of God,” be established from Judah’s posterity (T. Jud. 24:1-2). This messianic king will “judge and save all that call on the Lord” (T. Jud. 24:6). It is after this eschatological king as been firmly established by God that the resurrection will take place (T. Jud. 25:1).

The resurrection described in this passage is also limited in its scope, since it does not reveal the destiny of the wicked dead. In addition to Abraham, Isaac, Jacob, and the twelve patriarchs who will once more be chiefs among the people (T. Jud. 25:1), the

resurrection will also include all those who died in sorrow, poverty, and “who died on account of the Lord shall be wakened to life,” with joy and riches (T. Jud. 25:4). The righteous will once more be one people and speak one language (T. Jud. 25:3), a reversal of what took place at the Tower of Babel (Gen 11:6-9) and a restoration of the pre-fallen condition of humanity. Beliar will be thrown into eternal fire (T. Jud. 25:3), which will put an end to the spirit of error and “the impious shall mourn and sinners shall weep” (T. Jud. 25:5). This eschatological resurrection brings in the great reversal: curses are undone, sorrow is turned into joy, poverty into riches, death into life, while the impious shall mourn and sinners shall weep.

Testament of Zebulon 10:1-3. The *Testament of Zebulon* also expresses a strong personal resurrection hope. He concludes his apocalyptic statement (T. Zeb. 8:2-10:3) by alluding to the Messianic hope in Malachi 4:2 [MT 3:20]; that the son of righteousness will rise with healing in his wings (T. Zeb. 9:8); following their repentance (T. Zeb. 9:7) after their great apostasy (T. Zeb. 9:5-6). However, Zebulon predicts a second apostasy which will last until “the time of the end” (T. Zeb. 9:9), when the eschatological resurrection will take place (T. Zeb. 10:2-3). He tells his children not to view his death as the end, since he will resurrect and once more be a leader of his tribe - of those who “keep the Law of the Lord and the commandments of Zebulon” (T. Zeb. 10:2). The ungodly, according to Zebulon, will be destroyed by eternal fire for all generations (πῦρ αἰώνιον, καὶ ἀπολέσει αὐτοὺς ἕως γενεῶν, T. Zeb. 10:3).

It is not clear from this passage if this eschatological resurrection will be universal. Zebulon believes strongly that he will resurrect, but does this resurrection include all the righteous dead? He also mentions the punishment of the wicked, but will this punishment include the wicked dead?

Testament of Dan 5:7-13. The apocalyptic section of the *Testament of Dan* also describes the future apostasy, captivity, and return to the Lord (T. Dan 5:5-9), which preceded the arrival of the Lord's salvation from the tribe of Judah and the tribe of Levi (T. Dan 5:10), who "will make war against Beliar" and win, thus liberating the souls of the saints which Beliar had held captive (T. Dan 5:11a), implying their resurrection. This messianic figure will also turn the hearts of the disobedient people towards the Lord (T. Dan 5:11b) and "grant eternal peace to those who call upon the Lord (T. Dan 5:11c). During this messianic era, the righteous will "refresh themselves in Eden" and "rejoice in the New Jerusalem" for all eternity (T. Dan 5:12), and the Lord will protect them by living among them (T. Dan 5:13c). This promised savior "will rule over them in humility and poverty" (T. Dan 5:13d), while those who trust him "shall reign in truth in heaven" (T. Dan 5:13e).

The eschatological resurrection mentioned in this text seems to only concern itself with the destiny of the righteous souls, mentioning that they will be liberated from Beliar's captivity. The destiny of the wicked dead, on the other hand, seems to be of no interest to the writer. Thus, the eschatological resurrection described in this passage

seems to be limited to the righteous who will receive their everlasting reward, to dwell in the presence of the Lord.

A Universal Resurrection

The only universal resurrection passage appearing in the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* is *Testament of Benjamin* 10:5-10. This passage is also unique as it does not appear in the apocalyptic section of the Testament, but rather in the second exhortation (T. Benj. 10:1-11:5).

Testament of Benjamin 10:4-10. The apocalyptic section of the *Testament of Benjamin* (T. Benj. 9) also reveals, based on the words of Enoch (T. Benj. 9:1), that there will be a great period of apostasy (T. Benj. 9:1-2), but God will bring the twelve tribes back from their exile to the rebuilt temple of God, where they will remain until God “sends forth his salvation through the ministration of the unique prophet” (T. Benj. 9:2).¹⁹¹

In Benjamin’s second exhortation to his children, he urges them to “keep God’s commandments until the Lord reveals his salvation to all the nations” (T. Benj. 10:5) so they will be a part of the eschatological resurrection of the righteous: “And then you will

¹⁹¹The coming of an eschatological Prophet who will bring salvation to the people, is a unique element in Benjamin’s apocalyptic speech. It is interesting to note that there are four central savior figures appearing in this Testament, they are: Messiah ben Joseph (T. Benj. 3:8); Messiah the prophet (T. Benj. 9:2); Messiah ben Judah; and Messiah ben Levi (T. Benj. 11:2). Each of these figures play a significant role in God’s plan. Messiah ben Joseph will suffer and die in order to bring salvation to the Gentiles and the people of Israel, and bring destruction to Beliar and his servants (T. Benj. 3:8). Messiah the Prophet who will also bring salvation to the people. According to the Christian interpolation (T. Benj. 9:3) Jesus will die, resurrect from Hades, and return to Heaven where he will be glorified. Lastly, the Testament also mentions Messiah ben Judah and Messiah ben Levi, who God will raise up “in later times” who will also work towards the salvation of God’s people (T. Benj. 11: 2-5).

see Enoch and Seth and Abraham and Isaac and Jacob being raised up at the right hand in great joy” (T. Benj. 10:6) and “then shall we also be raised, each of us over our tribe, and we shall prostrate ourselves before the heavenly king” (T. Benj. 10:6). Following this resurrection, everyone will be changed, “some destined for glory, other for dishonor” (T. Benj. 10:8) as a result of the eschatological judgment (T. Benj. 10:10).

This resurrection statement borrows the phraseology of Daniel 12:2 (bolded and highlighted in red) while making an interpretative change regarding the scope of this resurrection. In Daniel 12:2, “many” (πολλοὶ) will resurrect on that day, suggesting a limited resurrection. However, in the *Testament of Benjamin* “all” (πάντες) will resurrect, suggesting a universal resurrection. It should also be noted that the reward for the righteous has been changed from eternal life (ζωὴν αἰώνιον) to glory (δόξαν), while the punishment in store for the wicked has been shortened from shame (ὀνειδισμόν), dispersion (διασποράν), and everlasting contempt (αἰσχύνην αἰώνιον) to only shame/dishonor (ἀτιμίαν). The resurrection event in *Testament of Benjamin* is clearly set in the context of the eschatological judgment (T. Benj. 10:8b-10), which is only implied in Daniel 12:1, when those who are written in the heavenly book will be saved (καὶ ἐν ἐκείνῃ τῇ ἡμέρᾳ ὑψωθήσεται πᾶς ὁ λαός ὃς ἂν εὑρεθῇ ἐγγεγραμμένος **ἐν τῷ βιβλίῳ**). Furthermore, both these resurrection statements follow a period of great tribulation (T. Benj. 9:1-2 || Dan 12:1).

Testament of Benjamin 10:8

τότε καὶ **πάντες ἀναστήσονται,**

οἱ μὲν εἰς δόξαν,
οἱ δὲ εἰς ἀτιμίαν.

Καὶ κρινεῖ Κύριος ἐν πρώτοις τὸν
Ἰσραήλ,
[περὶ τῆς εἰς αὐτὸν ἀδικίας,
ὅτι παραγενόμενον Θεὸν ἐν σαρκὶ
ἐλευθερωτὴν οὐκ ἐπίστευσαν].¹⁹²

Then also **all men will rise,**
some unto glory
and some unto shame.

And the Lord will judge Israel first
[**for the unrighteousness done to him,**
because they did not believe that God
appeared in the flesh as a deliverer].¹⁹³

The text highlighted in green is a Christian interpolation stating that the people of Israel will be held responsible for their unrighteous acts toward God incarnated. Be that as it may, the eschatological judgment seems to have three phases: first, God will judge the people of Israel (T. Benj. 10:8b); second, God will judge the other nations (T. Benj. 10:9); and third, God will “judge Israel by the chosen gentiles as he tested Esau by the Medianites who loved their brothers” (T. Benj. 10:10).

Daniel 12:2 (BGT and NETS)

καὶ **πολλοὶ** τῶν καθευδόντων ἐν τῷ
πλάτει τῆς γῆς **ἀναστήσονται**
οἱ μὲν εἰς ζωὴν αἰώνιον
οἱ δὲ εἰς ὀνειδισμόν
οἱ δὲ εἰς διασπορὰν καὶ αἰσχύνην
αἰώνιον.

And **many of those** who sleep in the flat
of the earth **will arise,**
some to everlasting life
but others to shame [reproach]
and others to dispersion [and contempt]
everlasting.

¹⁹²The Greek text is taken from Ken Penner and Michael S. Heiser, *Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology* (Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2008), Logos edition, T. Benj. 10:8.

¹⁹³This translation is taken from, Hollander and De Jonge, *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*, 437.

Benjamin concludes his eschatological resurrection and judgment statement with the wish that all his children will be counted among the righteous on that day as those who fear the Lord. He exhorts his children to “live in holiness, in accord with the Lord’s commands.” If they do, they will “again dwell with me [Benjamin] in hope; all Israel will be gathered to the Lord” (T. Benj. 10:10-11). This exhortation does not only summarize the message of the *Testament of Benjamin*, but it also summarizes the message of the whole *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*.

Concluding Remarks

The *Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs* does not reveal much about the period between death and the resurrection, apart from the souls of the righteous are imprisoned by Belial (T. Dan 5:11) until the messianic age and that “the spirits of those dispatched to achieve the punishment of mankind” are kept in the lowest heaven (T. Levi 3:1-2), both passages implying an eschatological resurrection. These testaments also contain several allusions to the eschatological resurrection in eight of the “death and burial” sections of the book (T. Sim. 8:1-2; T. Jud. 26:4; T. Iss. 7:9; T. Zeb. 10:6; T. Dan 7:1; T. Gad 8:1; T. Ash. 8:1; T. Jos. 20:4). In these passages, the word sleep is used as a metaphor for death which implies that at one point in the future, they will be woken up from their sleep and regain life.

There are six clear resurrection passages in these testaments (T. Sim. 6:7; T. Levi 18:14; T. Jud. 25; T. Zeb. 10:1-3; T. Dan 5:7-13; T. Benj. 10:4-10), but only one, *Testament of Benjamin* 10:4-10 describes an eschatological resurrection which will also

be universal, borrowing phraseology from Daniel 12:2. The other five describe a limited resurrection of only the patriarch and the righteous.

Testament of Job

The *Testament of Job* was most likely written in Greek during the first century BCE or perhaps as late as the second century CE, by a Hellenistic Jew living in Egypt.¹⁹⁴ Like the *Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs*, discussed in the previous section, the author uses the words of a dying biblical character as a vehicle for his/her ethical instructions, with some added apocalyptic and eschatological material.

Most scholars would note that the *Testament of Job* is a re-writing of the Masoretic version of the book of Job adding several elements from the Septuagint version of the book¹⁹⁵ and elements which parallel Rabbinic midrash and Jewish legends (i.e., Dinah, Jacob's daughter is named as Job's second wife; Abraham's conversion journey and iconoclastic fervor).¹⁹⁶ It also contains a highly developed view of Satan (T. Job 6:1-

¹⁹⁴Harold W. Attridge headings in his commentary on "*Testament of Job*" in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 1872-1873; Thomas S. Cason, "The Rhetoric of Disablement and Repair in the Testament of Job" (PhD diss., Florida State University, 2007), 9-17; John J. Collins, "Testament," in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*, ed. Michael Stone, CRINT 2 (Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 353-354; Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 42; Russell P. Spittler, "Testament of Job," OTP, 1:833-834; idem., "Testament of Job," DNTB, 1190-1191.

¹⁹⁵Some of these include: a further expansion of the speech of Job's wife which started in the LXX version of Job 2:9 (see T. Job 24:1-10 and 25:9-10); Job's name change from Jobab to Job; revealing that both Job and his friends were kings. Spittler writes: "The Testament of Job draws mainly from the narrative framework of the Septuagint Book of Job, which appears at Job 1-2; 42:7-17. But in addition, Job 29-31 (LXX) furnished Testament of Job 9-16 with numerous concepts and phrases by which to amplify Job's wealth, piety, and generosity. At times, merely a phrase of the Septuagint language is worked into the Testament (seven thousand sheep: Job 1:3 LXX; Tjob 9:3). In a few instances, more complete Septuagint quotations appear" ("Testament of Job," OTP, 1:831).

¹⁹⁶Joel S. Allen, "Job 3: History of Interpretation," DNTB, 363-364.

27:7), shows a special interest in the female characters associated with Job (his two wives and three daughters), and contains apocalyptic and mystic elements (T. Job 46-53).

Perhaps the two most important elements taken from the Septuagint are the resurrection belief (Job 42:7 [1], see highlighted text in *Testament of Job 4:4-11* section below) and the persevering theme. The resurrection belief appears in several passages throughout the Testament, the clearest and most crucial statement is *Testament of Job* 4:9, while it is implied in T. Job 33; 39:12; 41:4; 43; 47:11; 52-53. Table 31 shows the literary structure of the *Testament of Job* and is based on Harold W. Attridge's headings in his commentary on this Testament.¹⁹⁷ The sections where the resurrection passages appear are bolded and highlighted in red. The fourth literary division of the main body and the conclusion of the Testament have been shaded in gray to indicate that these last few chapters may be a later addition to the composition. If this is the case, then the *Testament of Job* 45:1-4 may have served as the original conclusion of the Testament.¹⁹⁸

¹⁹⁷Attridge, "Testament of Job," 1874-1898.

¹⁹⁸For the textual evidence for viewing T. Job 46-53 as a later addition and the function of this addition, see R. A. Kraft, *The Testament of Job According to the SV Text*, Pseudepigrapha Series 4 (Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1974), 58-69 and Spittler, "Testament of Job," OTP 1:834.

Table 31. Literary structure of the Testament of Job

I. Prologue (1:1-7)
- Title (1:1)
- Setting (1:2-7)
II. Four Literary Divisions (2:1-50:3)
1. Job and the Revealing Angel (2:1-5:3)
- Job's perplexity over idolatry (2:1-3:7)
- The angel's discourse of impending calamities (4:1-11)
- Job's destruction of the idol's shrine (5:1-3)
2. Job and Satan (6:1-27:7)
- Satan's attack and Job's tragedy (6:1-8:3)
- Satan disguised as a beggar (6:1-13)
- Satan implores the Lord for power over Job (8:1-3)
- Job's generosity and piety (9:1-15:9)
- His philanthropy (9:1-8)
- His hospitality (10:1-6)
- His underwritten charities (11:1-12:3)
- His fabulous wealth in cattle; the buttered mountains (13:1-6)
- His musical prowess (14:1-15:9)
- Job's losses (16:1-26:6)
- His cattle (16:1-7)
- His children (17:1-19:2)
- His wife (21:1-26:6)
- Sitis enslavement (21:1-22:2)
- Sitis sells her hair to Satan (22:3-23:11)
- The speech of Sitis: Begun (24:1-10)
- A lament for Sitis (25:1-8)
- The speech of Sitis: Concluded (25:9-10)
- Job's response (26:1-6)
- Job's triumph and Satan's defeat (27:1-7)
3. Job and the Three Kings (28:1-45:4)
- Job recognized and the kings astonished (28:1-30:3)
- Eliphaz: Laments Job's losses (31:1-34:5)
- Eliphaz confirms Job's identity (31:1-6)
- A lament for Eliphaz (31:7-32:12)
- Job's psalm of affirmation (33:1-9)
- Eliphaz's rejoinder (34:1-5)
- Baldad test Job's sanity (35:1-38:5)
- Sophar: Offers the royal physicians (38:6-8)
- Sitis: Laments her children, dies, and is buried (39:1-40:14)
- Job's recovery and vindication (41:1-45:4)
- Elihu's insult (41:1-6)
- The kings forgiven through Job's intercession (42:1-8)
- A hymn against Elihu (43:1-17)
- Job's restoration (44:1-5)
- Job's final counsels and division of the inheritance (45:1-4)

Table 31 – Continued

<p>4. Job and His Three Daughters (46:1-50:3)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The daughters' inheritance: Their father's phylactery (46:1- 47:11) - The charismatic sashes (48:1-50:3) <p>III. Epilogue (51:1-53:8)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Nereus's Literary Activity (51:1-4) - Job's Death, Soul Ascent, and Burial (52:1-53:8)
--

This new resurrection element reframes the whole book of Job. The Hebrew version of the canonical book of Job explores the problem of Theodicy, a concern barely voiced in the Testament,¹⁹⁹ placing God in the dock of the proverbial courtroom. In this context, John Walton sees God as the accused and notes that it is his policies that are questioned by הַשָּׂטָן, *haSatan*, the accuser.²⁰⁰ Job, however, just happens to serve as “exhibit-A” for the defense team.²⁰¹ In the *Testament of Job*, the resurrection belief solves the problem of Theodicy, thus the focus has shifted to Job's perseverance and victory against Satan's revenge attack after Job destroyed one of his shrines (T. Job 4:4; 5:1-3). Job had been forewarned about the coming suffering if he proceeded with his plans (T. Job 4:1-11) and the ultimate reward if he persevered, turning the Hebrew Job from a

¹⁹⁹The problem of Theodicy is only briefly mentioned in Job's response to his friend Baldad (T. Job 37:5-7), when Baldad is attempting to test Job's sanity (T. Job 35:1-38:5).

²⁰⁰It is important to note that הַשָּׂטָן, *haSatan*, is not a proper name since it carries the definite article, instead it describes the function of the person or the office of the accuser or persecutor. Over time, this title became the proper name for a specific individual, Satan, the archenemy of God.

²⁰¹John H. Walton, “Job 1: Book of,” DNTB, 340-342. Walton notes that there are three positions held in this court drama: 1) God is just - argued by Elihu; 2) Job is righteous - stated in the prologue and claimed by Job himself; and 3) the retribution principle (God rewards the righteous and punishes the wicked) - defended by Job's three friends. These three positions are mutually exclusive. The two questions under consideration are: 1) Is a person righteous because of the blessings God bestows on them, or are they righteous regardless of their lot in life - the question raised by the accuser and answered by Job's loyalty to God; and 2) why do righteous people suffer - the question Job asks God, but is never answered in the book. However, God asks Job to trust his wisdom, since he is the only person who sees the full picture, and thus, knows the best way to rule.

passive sufferer into a Job who, in Collins words, “understands and accepts his suffering,” a Job who willingly enters into a conflict with Satan.²⁰²

The perseverance theme was already introduced in the LXX version of the book of Job, as Allen writes: “In the opinion of the majority of scholars the Greek translator of Job rendered the text into a Greek version [LXX] that transformed the Job of the poetic sections [in the Hebrew version] from bombastic doubter into pious and persevering sufferer.”²⁰³ However, in this Testament it is explored even further.

Testament of Job 4:4-11

The clearest resurrection statement in the *Testament of Job* appears in the angel’s discourse of impending calamities (T. Job 4:1-11) before Job’s destruction of the idol’s shrine (5:1-3). In this discourse, Job is warned about the consequences of his planned actions – that Satan will be enraged and take his vengeance upon Job by many plagues in addition to losing his wealth and children (T. Job 4:4a-5). However, he is also told that if he is patient and perseveres against Satan’s attack, he will receive great reward in the end. If Job is victorious, his name will be renowned throughout the world until “the consummation of the ages,” his wealth will be doubled, and he will be raised up in the eschatological resurrection (T. Job 4:6-9).

²⁰²Collins, “Testaments,” 349.

²⁰³Allen, “Job 3,” 362. The perseverance theme is also the focus of the only reference to Job in the New Testament: “You have heard of Job’s endurance and have seen the outcome from the Lord. The Lord is very compassionate and merciful” (Jam 5:11, CSB).

⁴ Ἐὰν ἐπιχειρήσεις καθαρίσαι τὸν τόπον τοῦ Σατανᾶ, ἐπαναστήσεται σοι μετὰ ὀργῆς εἰς πόλεμον· μόνον ὅτι τὸν θάνατόν σοι οὐ δυνήσεται ἐπενεγκεῖν· ἐπιφέρει δέ σοι πληγὰς πολλὰς· ⁵ ἀφαιρεῖται σου τὰ ὑπάρχοντα· τὰ παιδία σου ἀναιρήσει· ⁶ ἀλλ' ἐὰν ὑπομείνης, ποιήσω σου τὸ ὄνομα ὀνομαστόν ἐν πάσαις ταῖς γενεαῖς τῆς γῆς ἄχρι τῆς συντελείας τοῦ αἰῶνος· ⁷ καὶ πάλιν ἀνακάμψω σε ἐπὶ τὰ ὑπάρχοντά σου, καὶ ἀποδοθήσεται σοι διπλάσιον· ⁸ ἵνα γνῶς ὅτι ἀπροσωπόληπτός ἐστιν, ἀποδοιδὺς ἐκάστῳ τῷ ὑπακούοντι ἀγαθὰ· ⁹ **καὶ ἐγερθήσῃ ἐν τῇ ἀναστάσει·** ¹⁰ ἔσῃ γὰρ ὡς ἀθλητῆς πυκτεύων καὶ καρτερῶν πόνους καὶ ἐκδεχόμενος τὸν στέφανον· ¹¹ τότε γνώσει ὅτι δίκαιος καὶ ἀληθινὸς καὶ ἰσχυρὸς ὁ κύριος, ἐνισχύων τοὺς ἐκλεκτοὺς αὐτοῦ.²⁰⁴

⁴ If you attempt to purge the place of Satan, death upon you. He will bring on you many plagues, ⁵ he will take away for himself your goods, he will carry off your children. ⁶ But if you are patient, I will make your name renowned in all generations of the earth till the consummation of the age. ⁷ And I will return you again to your goods. It will be repaid to you doubly, ⁸ so you may know that the LORD is impartial – rendering good things to each on who obeys. ⁹ **And you shall be raised up in the resurrection.** ¹⁰ For you will be like a sparring athlete, both enduring pains and winning the crown. ¹¹ Then will you know that the LORD is just, true, and strong, giving strength to his elect ones.²⁰⁵

καὶ ἐτελεύτησεν Ἰωβ πρεσβύτερος καὶ πλήρης ἡμερῶν [1] **γέγραπται δὲ αὐτὸν πάλιν ἀναστήσεσθαι μεθ' ὧν ὁ κύριος ἀνίστησιν** [2] οὗτος ἐρμηνεύεται ἐκ τῆς Συριακῆς βίβλου ἐν μὲν γῇ κατοικῶν τῇ Αὐσίτιδι ἐπὶ τοῖς ὁρίοις τῆς Ἰδουμαίας καὶ Ἀραβίας προὔπηρχεν δὲ αὐτῷ ὄνομα **Ἰωβαβ** [3] λαβὼν δὲ γυναῖκα Ἀράβισσαν γεννᾷ υἱόν ᾧ ὄνομα Εννων ἦν δὲ αὐτὸς πατὴρ μὲν Ζαρε **τῶν Ἡσαν** υἱὸν υἱὸς μητρὸς δὲ Βοσορρας ὥστε εἶναι αὐτὸν πέμπτον ἀπὸ Ἀβρααμ [4] καὶ οὗτοι **οἱ βασιλεῖς οἱ βασιλεύσαντες ἐν Ἐδωμ** ἦς καὶ αὐτὸς ἤρξεν χώρας πρώτος Βαλακ ὁ τοῦ Βεωρ καὶ ὄνομα τῇ πόλει αὐτοῦ Δειναβα μετὰ δὲ Βαλακ Ἰωβαβ ὁ καλούμενος Ἰωβ μετὰ δὲ τοῦτον Ἀσομ ὁ ὑπάρχων ἡγεμὼν ἐκ τῆς Θαϊμανίτιδος χώρας μετὰ δὲ τοῦτον Ἀδαδ υἱὸς Βαραδ ὁ ἐκκόψας Μαδιαμ ἐν τῷ πεδίῳ Μωαβ καὶ ὄνομα τῇ πόλει αὐτοῦ Γεθθαίμ [5] οἱ δὲ ἐλθόντες πρὸς αὐτὸν φίλοι Ἐλιφας τῶν Ἡσαν υἱῶν Θαϊμανῶν **βασιλεὺς** Βαλδαδ ὁ Σαυχαίων τύραννος Σωφαρ ὁ Μιναίων **βασιλεὺς**

¹⁷ And Job died, an old man and full of days: [1] **and it is written that he will rise again with those whom the Lord raises up.** [2] This man is described in the Syriac book as living in the land of Ausis, on the borders of Idumea and Arabia: and his name before was **Jobab**; [3] and having taken an Arabian wife, he begot a son whose name was Ennon. And he himself was the son of his father Zare, **one of the sons of Esau**, and of his mother Bosorrha, so that he was the fifth from Abraam. [4] And these were **the kings who reigned in Edom**, which country he also ruled over: first, Balac, the son of Beor, and the name of his city was Dennaba: but after Balac, Jobab, who is called Job, and after him Asom, who was governor out of the country of Thaeman: and after him Adad, the son of Barad, who destroyed Madiam in the plain of Moab; and the name of his city was Gethaim. [5] And *his* friends who came to him were Eliphaz, of the children of Esau, **king** of the Thaemanites, Baldad son of the Sauchaeans, Sophar **king** of the Minaeans.

In this key passage, Job is compared to an athlete who will have to suffer great pain to become victorious and win the crown (T. Job 4:10). This is the same imagery used

²⁰⁴Penner and Heiser, *Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology*, Logos edition, T. Job 4:4-11.

²⁰⁵Translation is taken from Attridge, "Testament of Job," 1876.

or alluded to in the New Testament (1 Cor 9:24-26; Gal 2:2; 5:7; Phil 2:16; 2 Tim 2:5; 4:7; Heb 12:1) when encouraging the followers of Christ to walk on the straight path in order to gain the ultimate reward, which will never fade. Thus, Job is told that there is a reward in store for him both in the near (after 48 years on the dung heap [T. Job 21:1] he was healed and had his possessions doubled) and in the distant future (resurrection and heavenly kingship [T. Job 31]), as long as he would persevere in his suffering. This promised reward, when Job “wins the crown” of victory at end of “the race,” will demonstrate that the Lord is indeed just, true, and strong, helping his elect to persevere and that he is impartial since he renders “good things to each one who obeys” (T. Job 4:7-8, 11).

In the Septuagint, the resurrection promise is mentioned almost as an afterthought as a part of the conclusion (Job 42:17 [1]), which also states Job’s original name, Jobab (Job 42:17 [2]), biographical material (Job 42:17 [3]-[4]), and additional information regarding his friends (Job 42:17 [5]), all these elements are integrated into the *Testament of Job* (see highlighted sections in the text above). In contrast, the promise appears in the framing of the story in the *Testament of Job*, and the promise is alluded to in key places throughout the narrative. *Testament of Job* 4:9 does not reveal much regarding the nature of this resurrection, however, it is clear from the context that it is a part of the promised reward held in store for Job and the use of the definite article, ἐν τῇ ἀναστάσει, *in the resurrection*, suggests that this resurrection is a specific event still in the future.

Allusions to the Resurrection

The first allusion to the resurrection appears in “Job’s psalm of affirmation” (T. Job 33:1-9), following Eliphaz’ lament over Job’s great losses (T. Job 31:7-32:12). In Job’s response, he tells his friends to not judge him based on his earthly situation. Although he has lost his earthly wealth and power, Job claims his throne is in heaven, in the upper world (T. Job 33:3a), among the holy ones (T. Job 33:2), receiving its “splendor and majesty” from the right hand of the father (T. Job 33:3b).²⁰⁶ According to Job, his throne and kingdom will last forever since it is in “the world of the changeless one” (T. Job 33:5-9).²⁰⁷ These words regarding Job’s heavenly throne demonstrates his strong resurrection hope, and that his focus had shifted from earthly matters toward the heavenly reward, to the upper world, a world which will have no end.²⁰⁸

The second allusion to the resurrection follows Sitis’ lament over her dead children, in which she begs Job’s royal friends to give her ten dead children a proper burial since they are still buried in the ruins after all these years (T. Job 39:4-11). Job’s friends are more than happy to oblige, but Job forbade them, telling them that they would

²⁰⁶Job’s words are similar to the response Jesus gave to Pilate when Pilate asked him if he was the King of the Jews: “**My kingdom is not of this world**,” said Jesus. “If My kingdom were of this world, My servants would fight, so that I wouldn’t be handed over to the Jews. As it is, **My kingdom does not have its origin here**” (John 18:36, CSB - my emphasis added).

²⁰⁷Eliphaz found Job’s words enraging (T. Job 34:1) and later, Elihu, “inspired by Satan” (T. Job 41:5) took an issue with these words which he viewed as “boastful grandeur” (T. Job 41:4). Elihu’s insulting words against Job, not recorded in the Testament, were deemed unforgivable. As a consequence, Elihu would suffer the destiny kept in store for the wicked (T. Job 42:1-2; 43:4-13).

²⁰⁸This change of focus is also seen in Job’s response to Baldad, when his friend is testing his sanity by asking Job if his heart was untroubled: “My heart is not fixed on earthly concerns, since the earth and those who dwell in it are unstable. But my heart is fixed on heavenly concerns, for there is not upset in heaven” (T. Job 36:3).

not be able to find the bodies of his children since “they were taken up into heaven by the Creator their King” (T. Job 39:11), suggesting a bodily resurrection, although not an eschatological one.²⁰⁹ Not unexpectedly, Job’s friends did not believe him, and one could also wonder how his wife Sitis reacted to Job’s words, if this was the first time he had revealed their children’s destiny to her or if she had not believed him earlier. Be that as it may, after Job had prayed to the heavenly Father, he asked them to “look up with your eyes to the east and see my children crowned with the splendor of the heavenly one” (T. Job 40:1). When his wife saw her resurrected children she worshiped God and said, “Now I know that I have a memorial with the Lord. So I shall arise and return to the city and nap awhile and then refresh myself before the duties of my servitude” (T. Job 40:4). With this newfound resurrection hope, Job’s wife died in good spirit that very night (T. Job 40:6).

The third allusion to the resurrection belief appears in the hymn against Elihu (T. Job 43:1-17), which concerns the destiny of the righteous and the wicked. God is righteous and his judgment is true, and he will judge everyone together (κρινεῖ ἡμᾶς ὁμοθυμαδόν) without showing favoritism (T. Job 43:13), a possible allusion to the eschatological judgment which would require an eschatological resurrection. The first half of the hymn concerns those, like Elihu, whose sins are not forgiven by God. They will have “no memorial among the living” (T. Job 43:5), instead “the honor of his tent

²⁰⁹There are a few biblical characters who were taken to heaven at the end of their earthly life or following closely after their death. Genesis 5:24 records that Enoch did not die but was taken by God, suggesting that he was brought to Heaven (an interpretation suggested by Heb 11:5 and later by 3 En. 6:2). According to ancient traditions, Moses was taken to heaven following his death (alluded to in Jude 1:9 and suggested by Josephus in *Ant.* 4.326), based on an interpretation of the comment that Moses’ burial place was unknown (Deut 34:5-6). 2 Kings 2:1 records Elijah’s heavenly journey with a horse of fire, at the end of his life (2 Kings 2:1, 11). It is interesting that the latter two characters, Elijah and Moses, appear with Jesus on the Mountain of Transfiguration (Matt 17:3-4), lending further support to this tradition.

lies in Hades” (T. Job 43:7). He will be forgotten by the Lord and abandoned by the holy ones (T. Job 43:10), “wrath and anger shall be his tent,” and he will have no hope or peace (T. Job 43:11). The righteous on the other hand, represented by Job’s three friends, Eliphaz, Baldad, and Sophar, will receive the splendor they awaited (T. Job 43:16) since their sins are gone and their lawlessness cleansed (T. Job 43:17).

The last allusion to the resurrection belief is found in the conclusion of the Testament (T. Job 46:1-53:8), which has a strong emphasis on the better world, the future life in heaven (T. Job 47:2; 48:2; 49:1; 50:2). In this final section of the Testament, Job reveals to his three daughters that “the creatures [angels?] of God” are about to come for his soul (T. Job 47:11), which takes place three days later when a gleaming chariot arrives and then, journeying east, takes his soul back to heaven (T. Job 52:6).²¹⁰ Job’s body, however, was left behind and was prepared for proper burial in a tomb (T. Job 52:11; 53:5). Three days later, “they laid him in the tomb in a beautiful sleep (T. Job 53:7).

Concluding Remarks

The separation of body and soul upon Job’s death (T. Job 52:10), is different from the view presented earlier in the Testament, when Job stated the bodies of his dead children would not be found among the ruins since they had already been taken to heaven by their Creator (T. Job 39:11). There could be two explanation for this important difference; first, the concluding chapters could be a later addition to the Testament (see

²¹⁰Like Enoch and Elijah, Job was also taken to heaven in a chariot when he was about to die. However, unlike Enoch and Elijah, the heavenly rider only came for Job’s soul, leaving his body for an earthly burial, where it would rest, perhaps in wait for the day of resurrection when the soul and body may once more be unified.

Table 26 above) and the author of this addition held a different death and resurrection view than the author of the preceding chapters; second, these two views could be harmonized in the sense that the death of Job and the death of his children represents two different death scenarios. Job's case could be the type of death most people would experience, where there will be an eschatological resurrection, while the death of his children represents more of a unique situation in which a person is resurrected not long after their death and are brought to heaven, similar to the case of Moses.

Based on the clear resurrection statement which seems to derive from the concluding remarks from the Septuagint version of the book of Job (Job 42:17 [1]), and the several allusions to this hope found in the Testament, it is still not clear if there will be an universal eschatological resurrection of both the righteous and the wicked dead, although there are hints in the text to support such a view. However, there is little doubt that the righteous can rest in the hope of a coming resurrection which would bring them great heavenly reward while the wicked will dwell in Hades. On the other hand, if the soul will be separated from the body until the day of the resurrection (as with Job), or, if body and soul go directly to heaven upon death (like in the case of Job's children) are open for scholarly discussion if these two views could be harmonized.

Testament of Abraham

The *Testament of Abraham* was most likely written during the 1st or the 2nd century CE by a Hellenistic Jewish author in Egypt.²¹¹ Ed P. Sanders notes that this testament was probably a part of a larger work which together with the *Testament of Isaac* and the *Testament of Jacob*, would have formed the *Testament of the Three Patriarchs*.²¹² Be that as it may, the *Testament of Abraham* exists in two manuscript traditions, the longer manuscript tradition is referred to as Recension A and the shorter as Recension B. Both traditions probably derive from a common source which is believed to have been closer to the longer manuscript tradition.²¹³ Although the title of this literary work suggests that it falls within the Testament genre, it is very different than the *Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs* and the *Testament of Job*, discussed earlier. John Collins writes: “it is now well-known that the *Testament of Abraham* is not a testament at all, since it contains no farewell discourse by Abraham,” instead, he argues that the Testament could be “viewed either as a narrative or as an apocalypse, but it is clearly not a testament.”²¹⁴

²¹¹Annette Yoshiko Reed, “Testament of Abraham,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, ed. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 1671.

²¹²Ed P. Sanders, “Testament of the Three Patriarchs,” OTP 1:869.

²¹³Jonathan M. Knight, “Testament of Abraham,” DNTB, 1188.

²¹⁴John J. Collins, “Testament,” *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*, ed. Michael Stone, CRINT 2 (Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 326. For further reading, see Anitra Bingham Kolenkow, “The Genre Testament and the Testament of Abraham,” in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*, ed. George W. E. Nickelsburg (Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976), 139-162.

In the *Testament of Abraham*, the archangel Michael is sent by God to inform Abraham that he is “about to leave this vain world and depart from the body,” and Abraham’s soul will come to dwell with God (T. Ab. A1:7). However, before Abraham is willing to give up his soul and leave this world, he requests to see “all the inhabited world and all the created things” which God had established (T. Ab. A9:6; cf. B7:8). Upon seeing the evil on earth, Abraham demands the destruction of the sinners (T. Ab. A10:6, 9, 11; cf. B12:3, 7, 10) which causes God to put an end to Abraham’s tour since God fears that if Abraham “were to see all those who pass their lives in sin, he would destroy everything that exists” (T. Ab. A10:13; cf. B12:12). This lack of mercy on sinners by Abraham causes God so much concern that Abraham is brought to the first gate of heaven, “so that he may see the judgments and the recompenses and repent over the souls of the sinners which he destroyed” (T. Ab. A10:15).²¹⁵

Michael reveals to Abraham that each person will experience three tribunals (T. Ab. A13:8). The first judgment (T. Ab. A11:1-13:5) is an individual judgment which takes place upon a person’s death, when the soul parts the body and is brought to the first gate of heaven. Abel determines, based on the record, which gate they should enter – the Strait Gate is for the righteous and leads to life in Paradise (T. Ab. A11:10) while the

²¹⁵ Although both Recensions of this Testament (A and B) have the same overarching narrative structure (a bipartite structure), the earthly journey and the journey to the place of judgment have been reversed in Recension B, which affects the role and purpose of these two narrative elements. In Recension B, the judgment scene no longer functions as a corrective element to change Abraham’s attitude towards sinners and make him into a more compassionate person, more like God, who “delay the death of the sinners until he should convert and live” (T. Ab. A10:14; cf. B12:13). Instead, Abraham of Recension B seems to be unchanged by witnessing the judgment, thus, upon seeing sinful behavior on the preceding earthly journey, demands the destruction of the wicked (T. Ab. B 12:1-12). For the structure of the *Testament of Abraham*, see: George W. E. Nickelsburg, “Structure and Message in the Testament of Abraham,” in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*, ed. George W. E. Nickelsburg (Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976), 85-93.

Broad Gate is intended for the wicked and “leads to the destruction and eternal punishment (T. Ab. A11:11). The second judgment is the universal eschatological judgment in which everyone will be “judged by the twelve tribes of Israel” (T. Ab. A13:6). The third and final judgment is given by God himself (T. Ab. A13:7).²¹⁶ These three judgments will ensure that the matter of God’s justice is ultimately settled, following the directions of Deuteronomy 19:15, which requires three witnesses to give a sentence in a criminal matter. The Targum adds that the Word of the Lord is also required since only he knows the crimes committed in secrecy.

T. Ab. A13:8	Deut 19:15 - BGT/LXT	Deut 19:15 - PJT/PJE
καὶ διὰ τοῦτο ἐπὶ ἑνὸς ἢ δύο μαρτύρων οὐκ ἀσφαλίζεται λόγος εἰς τέλος· ἀλλ’ ἐπὶ <u>τριῶν μαρτύρων</u> σταθήσεται <u>πάν ῥήμα</u> .	οὐκ ἔμμενεί μάρτυς εἰς μαρτυρῆσαι κατὰ ἀνθρώπου κατὰ πάσαν ἀδικίαν καὶ κατὰ πᾶν ἁμάρτημα καὶ κατὰ πάσαν ἁμαρτίαν ἣν ἂν ἁμάρτη ἐπὶ στόματος δύο μαρτύρων καὶ ἐπὶ στόματος <u>τριῶν μαρτύρων</u> <u>σταθήσεται πᾶν ῥήμα</u>	לא יתקיים סהרן דחד בגבר לכל סורחן נפש ולכל חוב ממון ולכל חטא דיחטי ברם על מימרא דייי הוא למחפרעא על טומריא על מימר סהיד חד יומי למיכפור ית מה דמסהיד עלוי ועל מימר תרין סהדין או תלתא סהדין יתקיים פיתנמא :
And therefore a matter is not ultimately established by one or two witnesses, but every matter <u>shall be established by three witnesses</u> .	One witness shall not stand to testify against a man for any iniquity, or for any fault, or for any sin which he may commit; by the mouth of two witnesses, or by the mouth of <u>three witnesses, shall every word be established</u> .	The testimony of one (witness) shall not be valid against a man for any crime (regarding the taking) of life, or guilt concerning money, or any sin with which one may be charged with sinning; but, by the Word of the Lord, (to insure) retribution upon secret crimes, (while) one witness may swear to deny what hath been attested against him, the sentence shall be confirmed upon the mouth of two witnesses, or of three.

²¹⁶For further reading regarding the judgment scene in the *Testament of Abraham*, see George W. E. Nickelsburg, “Eschatology in the Testament of Abraham: A Study of the Judgment Scene in the Two Recensions,” in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*, ed. George W. E. Nickelsburg (Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976), 23-64.

Abraham also learns that there are some souls who are found neither righteous nor wicked, and would have needed one more righteous deed than sin to have been saved (T. Ab. A14:4; cf. SrB9:8). These souls will be kept in limbo until the second coming, unless someone does supplications and offers prayers on their behalf (T. Ab. A14:6). The Testament ends with the death of Abraham, when he is tricked by death to give up his soul (T. Ab. A20:9), and Michael and the other angels “bore his precious soul in their hands in divinely woven linen” (T. Ab. A20:10), while his body was prepared for funeral and was buried three days later (T. Ab. A20:11).

There are only two clear resurrection passages in this Testament. The first case is a temporary resurrection (T. Ab. A18:9-11; B14:6), which regards the resurrection of Abraham’s servants who died from the shock of seeing the true nature of death (T. Ab. A18:3, 6; B14:5). The second case only appears in Recention B and describes the universal resurrection which will take place in the eschatological future:

Testament of Abraham B7:15b-16

^{15b} καὶ ἀναλαμβάνεσαι εἰς τοὺς οὐρανοὺς, ¹⁶ τὸ δὲ σῶμά σου μένει ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς ἕως ἂν πληρωθῶσιν ἑπτακισχίλιοι αἰῶνες· **τότε γὰρ ἐγερθήσεται πᾶσα σὰρξ.**

^{15b} and you will be taken up into the heaven. ¹⁶ while your body remains on the earth until seven thousand ages are fulfilled. **For then all flesh will be raised.**

According to this text, the soul gets separated from the body upon death. From the chapters that follow, Abraham learns that the soul will then proceed directly to the place of judgment where it will be led through one of two gates, either for punishment or reward, paralleling the first judgment in Recention A (T. Ab. A11:1-13:5). However, unlike Recention A, this textual tradition does not mention the additional two judgments which are both eschatological and universal. The body, on the other hand, remains on the

earth (μένει ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς), in the grave, until it will be resurrected at the end of the seven thousand ages in a universal judgment of both the righteous and the wicked. At this point, it could be assumed that the soul will once more unite with the body, in order to reverse the process of dying, when the soul left the body. Although Recention B does not mention the two eschatological and universal judgments, and this could be a point of divergence between these two traditions, it would not be difficult to speculate that the second and third judgment, which are both universal, would take place following this universal resurrection. However tempting it is to harmonize the Recensions, one element they do have in common is the ambiguity regarding what happens to the soul between the first judgment and the eschatological events, the two universal judgments (Recensions A), the bodily resurrection (Recention B), or a combination of the two (harmonized view). Do the souls receive the described reward or punishment upon the completion of the first judgment, or are the souls only shown the reward or punishment held in store for them in the eschatological time? If the former, will the souls receive additional reward or punishment in the eschatological time? If the latter, what will be the condition of the righteous and the wicked souls while waiting for that eschatological time? From this, it seems the main concern of the *Testament of Abraham* is the importance of the judgment scene, that the judgment follows a set procedure, that everyone will be judged by the same standard, whether the person is a Jew or Gentile, and that God is full of mercy but at the same time he is also ultimately just. This justice is beyond reproach. This message is in line with the canonical wisdom literature. Figure 16 illustrates the resurrection concept in the *Testament of Abraham*.

Fig. 16. Death and Resurrection in the Testament of Abraham.

Testament of Moses

The *Testament of Moses*, also known as the *Assumption of Moses*, was most likely written by a Jewish author living in Levant “during the 1st century BCE and later updated, or composed during the 1st century CE.”²¹⁷ It was probably composed in Hebrew or Aramaic, however, it has only survived in a badly damaged manuscript in Latin, dated to the 6th century CE. It is estimated that only half or two-thirds of the composition has survived to the present day. Thus, the concluding section of the Testament is missing.²¹⁸

Nickelsburg notes this testament is a “rewriting of Deuteronomy 31-34,” and follows closely the historical scheme outlined in Moses’ final words to the twelve tribes as demonstrated by the outline below:²¹⁹

Theme	Deuteronomy	Testament of Moses	
Sin	28:15	2:1-9	5:1-6
Punishment	28:16-68	3:1-4	8:1-5
Repentance	30:2	3:5-4:4	9:1-7
Salvation	30:3-10	4:5-8	10:1-15

²¹⁷Kenneth Atkinson, “Testament of Moses,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 1856. For a concise discussion on the dating and setting of this Testament, see: David A. deSilva, “Testament of Moses,” DNTB, 1193-1195. See also, Nickelsburg discussion “Excursus A: The Date and Provenance of the Testament of Moses,” in *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 61-64.

²¹⁸deSilva, “Testament of Moses,” 1192. He also notes that it has been speculated that Jude may have been aware of this Testament when referring to Michael and the devil’s battle over Moses’ body (Jude 9), assuming the assumption of Moses was a part of the now lost conclusion of the testament (see discussion under the subheading “Echoes in the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature,” in “Testament of Moses,” 1198; see also, John Priest, “Testament of Moses,” OTS 1:924-925).

²¹⁹Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 43-44.

Moses' prophetic deathbed words to Joshua is a great example of *ex eventu* prophecy. John Priest observes: "Deuteronomy 31-34 is clearly the author's model, though he has recast his own work in light of the history of the people from the conquest to his own day and through the prism of his own apocalyptic outlook."²²⁰ Interestingly, the author of the Testament, in the process of recasting Moses' prophecy, gave Deuteronomy 32-33 an eschatological reading by providing his own speculation of the events which will take place leading up to the eschatological judgment (T. Mos. 10), when God will finally "avenge the blood of His servants, and render vengeance to His adversaries" and "provide atonement for His land and His people" (Deut 32:43, NKJV). This is due to the great covenant loyalty demonstrated by Taxo, the Levite, and his seven sons' suggested martyrdom (T. Mos. 9:6-7).²²¹ This eschatological reading of Moses' final words, however, should not come as a surprise since his words are introduced by the technical term, בְּאַחֲרֵית הַיָּמִים, "in the last days" (Deut 31:29), referring to the eschatological time (see earlier discussion on this phrase).

There are three allusions to the resurrection belief in the *Testament of Moses*. In two texts, sleep is used as a metaphor for death (T. Mos. 1:15; 10:14), similar to the usage in the *Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs* (T. Sim. 8:1-2; T. Jud. 26:4; T. Iss 7:9; T. Zeb. 10:6; T. Dan 7:1; T. Gad 8:1; T. Ash. 8:1; T. Jos. 20:4) and *Testament of Job* (T. Job

²²⁰John Priest, "Testament of Moses," 1:923.

²²¹The covenant loyalty plays a similar function in 2 Maccabees 7. Like the suggested martyrdom of Taxo and his seven sons provoked God into action, so the martyrdom of the mother and her seven sons atoned for the sins of the people of Israel and mended the covenant relationship with God, thus, bringing to an end the Antiochian persecution and heralding the Maccabean revolt.

53:7), suggesting a future resurrection (see discussion on this metaphor, pages 220-221). The second sleep-death metaphor (T. Mos. 10:14) and the third resurrection allusion (T. Mos 10:9) both appear in the eschatological salvation-judgment section at the end of Moses' prophetic revelation, in which God will defeat the devil and put an end to sorrow (T. Mos. 10:1). At that moment, God's appointed messenger will avenge the enemies of the righteous (T. Mos. 10:2) and God will appear to "work vengeance on the nations" and destroy their idols (T. Mos. 10:3-7). This judgment scene borrows language from several eschatological judgment texts in TaNaKh, in which it is associated with earthquakes, the sun losing its light, the moon turning into blood, and the stars being thrown into disarray (Isa 13:10; 24:23; 34:4; Ezek 32:7; Joel 2-3; Amos 5:20; 8:9; Micah 1:3-4; Hab 3; Zeph 1; Eccl 12:2). The drying up of the waters or rivers is also viewed as a part of God's act of judgment (Isa 11:15; 19:5-8).

Following the judgment upon the nations, the prophecy turns to the destiny of Israel (T. Mos. 10:8-10), who will be exalted "above the necks and the wings of an eagle" (T. Mos. 10:8b), a possible allusion to God's work of salvation and loving care for his people in the past and promised blessing in store for those who show loyalty towards the covenant (Exod 19:4; Deut 32:11-13; Isa 40:31). The testament also notes that God "will fix you [Israel] firmly in the heaven of the stars, in the place of their habitations" (T. Mos. 10:9) – a very similar language used in Daniel 12:3 when describing the reward of the resurrected righteous: "Those who are wise will shine like the bright expanse of the heavens, and those who lead many to righteousness, like the stars forever and ever" (Dan 12:3, CSB). The final phase of the exaltation process is to see the destiny of their

enemies, who are still living on earth or, as suggested by Robert Charles, in Gehenna²²² (T. Mos. 10:10b). Recognizing the destiny of their former enemies, they will rejoice and give praise to God and confess their creator (T. Mos 10:10c-d). If Charles' translation of the Latin phrase "*in terram*" as Gehenna is accepted, the described punishment seems to be individual in nature, describing the final destiny of the wicked. This suggests the described exaltation of Israel could also be understood as individual in nature, describing the final destiny of the righteous as being in heaven or receiving astral immortality.

In addition to the similar image used when describing the reward of Israel or the righteous (T. Mos. 10:9 || Dan 12:3), the overall structure of this eschatological salvation-judgment scene parallels the prophetic vision of Daniel 11-12. Both visions describe a prophetic vision starting with the key character, Daniel or Moses. Both visions end with the eschatological judgment. Both prophecies reveal the final destiny of the righteous and the wicked before they conclude with a statement that Daniel and Moses will fall asleep as a metaphor for death. In Daniel 12:13, Daniel is asked to rest until the day of resurrection when he will receive his reward, while Moses states that he will sleep with his fathers (T. Mos. 10:14), noting that 250 times will pass between his burial until his coming (T. Mos. 10:12) and the beginning of the judgment. It should also be noted that, in both accounts, instructions were given to keep the prophetic visions in a book for future generations (Dan 12:4 [Daniel] || T. Mos. 10:11 [Joshua]).

²²²Robert Henry Charles, ed., *Commentary on the Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament* (Bellingham, WA: Logos Bible Software, 2004), 2:422.

However, in contrast to Daniel 12:2-3, the surviving part of the *Testament of Moses* does not explicitly state a resurrection hope. It is not even clear from the context if the judgment scene described in the Testament will be individual – referring to the righteous and the wicked person; or corporate – referring to the nation of Israel and her enemy nations. Even if assuming this eschatological judgment will be individual in scope, there is still a question of whether this judgment will be limited or universal in nature. Will God judge all the righteous and wicked who are alive during the eschatological judgment, or only some, or will he also include righteous and wicked dead? The latter option would require a limited or universal resurrection. Since a large part of the testament is missing, any attempt to answer these questions would involve speculation.

Testament of Adam

The *Testament of Adam* was most likely written by a Jewish author in Syriac, but contains Christian interpolations in the prophetic section of the Testament. Stephen Robinson notes the three sections of the Testament, the Horarium (T. Adam 1:1-2:12), the Prophecy (T. Adam 3:1-6), and the Hierarchy (T. Adam 4:1-8), “were not written at the same time, but the final Christian redaction, in which the testament took on its present form, probably occurred in the middle or late third century A.D.”²²³ However, he adds that “the Jewish portions of the testament are likely older than the Christian additions, the Horarium and perhaps some of the Prophecy may date from considerably before the third

²²³Stephen E. Robinson, “Testament of Adam,” *OTP* 1:990.

century A.D.”²²⁴ The resurrection hope appears in two statements in Adam’s prophecy to his son Seth, alluded to in T. Adam 3:2 and explicitly stated in T. Adam 3:4 in a Christian interpolation.

Adam’s prophecy reveals key events, with an emphasis on God’s act of salvation. It begins with the incarnation of God and summarizes His miraculous work while dwelling among the people (T. Adam 3:1), noting that God had revealed this to him, Adam, in Paradise “after I [Adam] picked some of the fruit in which death was hiding” (T. Adam 3:2). This was probably an explanation of the cryptic words to the Serpent in Gen 3:15 in which a future seed of the woman would crush the head of the Serpent, but in the process would have his heel crushed by the Serpent, prophesying death for both parties. The prophecy also reveals the reason for Adam eating the fruit, noting that Adam wanted to become a god (T. Adam 3:2, 4), an allusion to the promised effect of the fruit (Gen 3:5) and God’s described consequence following the act of eating it (Gen 3:22). Interestingly, Adam’s motivation to be a god becomes a central part of the two resurrection promises in the Testament.

Following Adam’s failed attempt to become a god, God reveals to him that He will grant him the wish and will make him a god. However, Adam must first be handed over to death, and he and his descendant’s bodies will be eaten by maggots and worms, since he had listened to the Serpent (T. Adam 3:2b-3a-b). However, Adam will be shown

²²⁴Ibid.

mercy since he was created in God's image, and as such, will not be left in Sheol to waste away forever (T. Adam 3:3c-f),²²⁵ hinting at a future resurrection.

At this point in the prophecy, there is clear Christian interpolation which adds to God's act of salvation mentioned in the beginning of the prophecy (T. Adam 3:1). It reveals how the promise of restoration given to Adam will be realized (T. Adam 3:3-5), and the time frame (T. Adam 3:5). The resurrection statement is highlighted in red while the time reference is highlighted in blue. It should also be noted that this part of the prophecy places the blame for the creation of sin squarely on Eve.²²⁶ It provides a rationale for Cain's murderous act of Abel as being due to great passion for his sister

²²⁵This part of the prophecy seems to expand on the two attributes of the forbidden fruit and the meaning of being created in the image of God. God warned the humans against the death aspect of the fruit, when He stated that the day they eat from it, they will certainly die (Gen 2:17; cf. Gen 3:3). However, the Serpent suggests a different aspect, a "divinity" aspect, when stating that they would not die but would instead become like God if they ate the fruit (Gen 3:5).

Depending on how God's evaluation of the new reality following Adam and Eve's act of eating of the fruit is understood, the words, הָיָה כְּאַחַד מֵאֵמָּנוּ הָאָדָם הָיָה could either affirm the Serpent's promise, if the verb הָיָה (qal perf. 3rd m.sg) is understood as "has become" (man has become like one of us), suggesting humans were not like God before they ate the fruit, or emphasizing their pre-fall divine nature if the verb is understood as a simple past "was" (man was like one of us), suggesting humans used to be like God, but after eating the fruit, they are not.

This section of the prophecy is also noting that humans were created in God's image and likeness (Gen 1:26-27), suggesting godlike attributes from the beginning, and explains why Adam's body needed saving, when Adam would once more be elevated, be made a god, and be seated at the right hand of "my divinity" (T. Adam 3:4). The word תְּצַלֵּם, *image*, used in the Creation narrative, is the same word as used for idols, an image representing a deity, thus, humans are an idol of God. In the *Books of Adam and Eve*, it is this association between humans and an idol of God that causes Satan to rebel. Satan and the other angels were commanded to bow down and worship Adam, the image of God (*Vita* 13:2-15:3), something Satan refused since he argued that he was created first and therefore should be ranked higher than Adam (*Vita* 14:3). As a consequence of this rebellion, he and his followers were expelled from Heaven (*Vita* 16:1).

²²⁶It should be noted that the Eden Narrative (Gen 2-3) does not place the blame for the fall solely on Eve as is evidenced in the *Testament of Adam* 3:5, instead, the emphasis is both the woman and the man ate the fruit, they both rebelled, and they both had to suffer the consequences for this act: expulsion from the Garden, pain, and suffering. However, the process of placing the responsibility for the rebellion on Eve alone took place during Second Temple Period Judaism, see Jan A. Sigvartsen, "The Creation Order - Hierarchical or Egalitarian?" *AUSS* 53 (Spring 2015): 127-142.

Lebuda who was intended as a wife for Abel,²²⁷ and suggests that the daughters of men in Genesis 6:2, 4 are the daughters of Cain (T. Adam 3:5).²²⁸

²²⁷Genesis 4:8 does not reveal what Cain said to Abel before he killed him, it merely states: *וַיֹּאמֶר קַיִן אֶל-הָבֶל אָחִיו*, and Cain said to his brother Abel . . ., leaving ample room for gap filling by a later interpreter. The Septuagint, Syriac, and the Vulgate translation of this text complete the sentence by adding “let us go out into the field.” However, Jewish Midrash suggests several more elaborate topics of conversation between Cain and Abel, which ended with Cain killing Abel. *Genesis Rabbah* 22:7 suggests four possible topics of disputes between Cain and Abel: First, a dispute over Land and property. Cain claimed the land and demanded that Abel should “fly” so as to get literally right off the ground, leaving Abel nowhere to go; Second, a dispute regarding a religious matter, where the Temple should be built. Cain claimed it should be built in his area; Third, a dispute regarding the first Eve (a possible reference to the mythological figure Lilith, who did not “submit herself” to Adam [*Sepher Ben Sira* 23 A-B]); and fourth, a dispute over a woman. Each brother was born with their own twin sister who was intended to become their spouse, however, Cain wanted Abel’s twin sister since she was the most beautiful of the two sisters (*Pirke De-Rabbi Eliezer*, 22). This tradition seems to be reflected in T. Adam 3:5. A fifth possible topic of dispute is suggested by *Targum Pseudo-Jonathan* on Genesis 4:8. In this expansion to the text, Cain and Able have a heated theological discussion involving the theodicy of God, eschatological judgment and the world to come, which would imply a resurrection belief. It states:

“I perceive that the world was created in goodness, but it is not governed (or conducted) according to the fruit of good works, for there is respect to persons in judgment; therefore it is that thy offering was accepted, and mine not accepted with good will. Habel answered and said to Kain, In goodness was the world created, and according to the fruit of good works is it governed; and there is no respect of persons in judgment; but because the fruits of my works were better than thine, my oblation, before thine, hath been accepted with good will. Kain answered and said to Habel, There is neither judgment nor Judge, nor another world; nor will good reward be given to the righteous, nor vengeance be taken of the wicked. And Habel answered and said to Kain, There is a judgment, and there is a Judge; and there is another world, and a good reward given to the righteous, and vengeance taken of the wicked. And because of these words they had contention upon the face of the field; and Kain arose against Habel his brother, and drave a stone into his forehead, and killed him.”

²²⁸The *Testament of Adam*, however, does not reveal the identity of the “sons of God,” whether they are the fallen angels (cf. Job 1:6; 2:1; 38:7) or humans. If humans, the phrase could refer to the noble class, or the male descendants of Seth marrying the female descendants of Cain, or the “sons of God” could represent the righteous who adhere to God’s way, as such, the “daughters of men” would represent the wicked, who rebel against God, as did Cain. For further discussion, see Shubert Spero, “Sons of God, Daughters of Men?” *JBQ* 40, no. 1 (Jan-Mar 2012): 15-18.

Testament of Adam 3:3-5

For your sake I will be born of the Virgin Mary.
For your sake I will taste death and enter the house of the dead.
For your sake **I will make a new heaven**,
and I will be established over your posterity.

And after **three days**, while I am in the tomb,
I will raise up the body I received from you.
And I will set you at the right hand of my divinity,
and I will make you a god just like you wanted.
And I will receive favor from God,
and **I will restore to you and to your posterity that which is the justice of heaven.**

You have heard, my son Seth, that **a Flood is coming and will wash the whole earth** because of the daughters of Cain, your brother, who killed your brother Abel out of passion for your sister Lebuda, since sins had been created through your mother, Eve.

And **after the Flood** there will be six thousand years (left) to the form of the world,
and **then its end will come.**

God makes it clear to Adam that it was for his sake that he would come to the earth and die, make a new heaven, receive favor from God, and become a ruler over Adam's posterity – all this in order to bring salvation to him and his posterity. God will die, however, he will resurrect from the tomb after three days and bring Adam's body with him. Upon Adam's resurrection, Adam will be established on the right hand of God's divinity and have his wish of becoming a god granted. The final phase of God's salvation work is perhaps the most important detail in this prophecy since it expands God's saving work from just restoring Adam to also include Adam's posterity, according to the justice of heaven. This added detail would suggest a future universal resurrection

for the righteous dead, probably at the end of the six thousand years²²⁹ after the flood, when it is suggested the end will come.²³⁰

The prophecy in the *Testament of Adam* concludes with Adam's death and funeral (T. Adam 3:6) in which Adam was borne to his grave by the angels since Adam had been created in God's image, and the sun and the moon were darkened for seven days following his death. It is important to note that this death scene, unlike the *Testament of Job* 52-53 and *Testament of Abraham* A20/B14, does not mention Adam's soul parting his body upon dying, suggesting that the soul is not immortal or can be separated from the body. As far as this prophecy is concerned, Adam's body (and that of his posterity) will be buried in the grave, be consumed by maggots and worms (T. Adam 3:2), and become food for the serpent (T. Adam 3:3). However, God will not let Adam (and his posterity) be left to "waste away in Sheol" forever (T. Adam 3:3), but in his grace, he will resurrect Adam's body when he comes into this world (T. Adam 3:3-4) and, it could be assumed, the bodies of his posterity at the end of the world (T. Adam 3:5). God will make Adam into a god, placing him at "the right hand of my divinity" and restore to Adam and his posterity "that which is the justice of heaven" (T. Adam 3:4).

²²⁹This is a similar time frame to 2 En. 33:1-2; T. Mos. A19:7; Ps.-Philo 28:8 where the world's history is stated as being seven thousand years long, or six thousand years following the flood.

²³⁰Several elements appearing in this prophecy regarding God's act of saving Adam and his posterity are also found in two of the death and resurrection passages from the New Testament, 1 Cor 15:20-28 (regarding the work of the New Adam) and 1 Pet 3:18-22 (regarding Jesus work while dead and his exaltation following his resurrection), and in the *Nicene Creed*.

Expansions of Stories and Legends

Due to the very economic writing style of the authors of the biblical books, the narratives of the TaNaKh emphasize the verbs, the doing, thus, often lacking details regarding the feelings, thoughts, and emotions of the character that is the subject of the doing. There are also narrative gaps, which begs the question of what took place in those gaps. In some narratives, God is surprisingly absent (eg. the Book of Esther), which sets the stage for later writers to make additions to show God's place in the narrative and celebrate his guidance and covenant loyalty towards his faithful (eg. LXX version of the Book of Esther). Sometimes names are mentioned in the plot-line without proper introduction, as if they were known to the original audience, but this common knowledge has been lost to later generations of readers. Alternatively, other characters are mentioned briefly, and then just disappear from the scene. There are also unresolved ambiguities in the narrative, which raises several questions when it comes to interpretation. These are some of the reasons for why biblical narratives lend themselves to narrative expansions during Second Temple period literature, and the reason legends developed around certain characters like Adam, Enoch, Abraham, Melchizedek, Joseph, and Moses. James Charlesworth notes "the biblical narratives were clarified, enriched, expanded, and sometimes retold from a different perspective,"²³¹ and some of these traditions were written down and became a part of the extensive literature from the Second Temple period.

²³¹James H. Charlesworth, "Introduction," OTP 2:5.

Some of the books belonging to this category of pseudepigraphical literature are apocalyptic in nature (*Jubilee, Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah, [Ladder of Jacob],* and *4 Baruch*); others are apologetic, showing the superiority of Judaism to possibly draw converts to the faith (eg., *Joseph and Aseneth*); some are legends and expansions on stories (*Letter of Aristeas, Life of Adam and Eve, the Lives of the Prophets, Jannes and Jambres, History of the Rechabites, Eldad and Modad, History of Joseph*); and yet others are retelling the sacred history of Israel from a different perspective and agenda (*Jubilee* and *Pseudo-Philo*). These books are interesting since, as noted by George Nickelsburg, “works that interpreted biblical stories by retelling and paraphrasing them, often adding new material,”²³² shed some light on how these narratives were understood, and provides some indicators regarding what elements of a narrative these pseudopigraphical writers found troublesome, problematic, interesting, and/or important to warrant said expansion. Rewritten Bible, according to Bruce Fisk, “open a window on early Jewish exegesis around the turn of the era and demonstrates the deeply held conviction that the ancient stories bore a message for the present day.”²³³ Table 32 provides a list of allusions and

²³²George W. E. Nickelsburg, “The Bible Rewritten and Expanded,” in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*, ed. Michael E. Stone, CRINT 2 (Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 130.

²³³Bruce N. Fisk, “Rewritten Bible in Pseudepigrapha and Qumran,” DNTB, 947. In his article, Fisk gives some of the basic characteristics of rewritten Bible. First, it is a retelling of the biblical narrative often following the chronological order. Second, it integrates extra biblical traditions into the narrative account. Third, “narrative additions function as implicit biblical exegesis, by filling gaps, solving problems and explaining connections in the biblical text” (948). Fourth, the rewritten account, although consistent, presupposes the reader’s awareness of the biblical account. Fisk also identifies various techniques or interpretative methods used by the author of the rewritten Bible, like 1) solving ambiguities in the biblical text; 2) paying close attention to the larger narrative context, assuming “that adjacent scriptural episodes were meaningfully related and thus mutually illuminating” (951); 3) one scriptural passage could be used to interpret another since scripture was considered “a single, unified story” (952); and 4) the idealization of biblical characters.

Table 32. Resurrection texts in the expansions on stories and legends

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
Jubilees	4:24 5:10 10:17 23:11 30:23 36:10-11 37:19 39:6	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection)	X				X	X
	10:15; 23:1; 36:18; 45:15	Sleep Death	X					X
	23:27-31	Bones rest in the earth, Spirits will increase joy	X					X
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	1:3-5	Hezekiah's vision	X					X
	3:18	Faith => salvation	X					
	4:14-22	2 nd Coming		X				X
	7:4; 8:14, 23, 27; 11:35	Rope of Flesh Rope of Angels	X					X
	9:7-11	Saints in Heaven	X					X
	9:16-18	Resurrection of Jesus and the Saints	X					X
Joseph and Aseneth	8:(10)-(11)	Joseph's blessing of Aseneth	X			X		X
	12:(12)	God's gift	X					X
	15:3-6, (7), 12x 16:(8)	The Book of Life	X					X
	16:21-23	Resurrection of bees		X				X
	20:7	God is the life giver		X				X
	22:(9)	Aseneth's place of rest	X					X
	27:10	The immortality of the Soul	X					X

Table 32 – Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
Apocalypse of Moses (Life of Adam and Eve)	10:2	Eve's woe		x				x
	13:2-6	Michael's words to Seth		x		x		x
	28:4	If you are righteous => resurrection => immortality		x			?	x
	37:5	Adam taken to Paradise	x					x
	39:2-3	Promise given to Adam	x					x
	41	Promised resurrection		x	x			x
	43:2-3	Burial practice Body => earth Soul => after 7 days back to heaven		x				x
Vita (Life of Adam and Eve)	47:2-3	Resurrection/ judgment	x					x
	51:2	The Sabbath is a sign of the resurrection		x	x			x
Pseudo-Philo	3:10	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x
	16:3	Rebellion of Korah	x					x
	19:2, 6	Death = sleep	x					x
	19:12-13	Resurrection of Moses		x				x
	23:13	The righteous		x	x			x
	25:7	Repentance => resurrection		x				x
	28:10	Death = sleep	x					x
	29:4	Death = sleep	x					x
	33:2-3	No repentance after death		x				x
	33:6	Death = Sleep	x					x
	35:3	Death = sleep	x					x
	48:1	Ascension of Phinehas	x					x
	62:9	The souls will know each other	x					x
	64:6-9	Samuel's resurrection caused by Saul		x	x			x

Table 32 – Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
Lives of the Prophets	2:11-19	The ark will appear at the resurrection		x				x
	3:10-12	Hope for Israel		x				x
Ladder of Jacob	7:21	Resurrection of Eve		x				x
4 Baruch	6:6-10	Promise to Abimelech	x					x
	7:18	Resurrection of the dead man		x				x
	9:12-14	Jesus the resurrector		x				x
History of the Rechabites	14-16	Soul Body		x				x

explicit resurrection passages appearing in the books categorized as “Expansions on Stories and Legends,” with the main emphasis being placed on the clear resurrection statements. The discussion for some of these passages will be brief as the details given in the book regarding the resurrection belief is scant.

Jubilees

The *Book of Jubilees* belongs to the genre of “rewritten Bible” and retells the biblical account starting with the Creation (Gen 1) and ending with God establishing his covenant with the people of Israel at Mt. Sinai (Exod 19-24).²³⁴ The title of the book provides the setting and the purpose of God’s revelation recorded in the *Book of Jubilees*:

²³⁴In this process of retelling the biblical narratives, O. S. Wintermute notes the author of Jubilees condensed, omitted, expurgated, explained, supplemented, and sometimes significantly recast these narratives (O. S. Wintermute, “Jubilees: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP, 2:35).

This is *The Account of the Division of Days of the Law and the Testimony for Annual Observance according to their Weeks and their Jubilees throughout all the Years of the World* just as the LORD told it to Moses on Mount Sinai when he went up to receive the tablets of the Law and the commandment by the word of the LORD, as he said to him, “Come up to the top of the mountain” [Exod 24:12].

Thus, the content of this book, according to the title and the first chapter, was revealed to Moses during the forty days and forty nights he was on the mountain (Jub. 1:4a || Exod 24:18), when God “revealed to him both what (was) in the beginning and what will occur (in the future), the account of the division of all of the days of the Law and the testimony” (Jub. 1:4b). There are only two sections of this book which describe the distant future from the standpoint of Moses – the introduction chapter of this literary work and Jubilee 23:9-32, an excursus following the death of Abraham. The only “resurrection” passage in this book appears in the latter section (Jub. 23:29b-31).²³⁵ Wintermute provides the following brief outline of the *Book of Jubilees* (see Table 33),²³⁶ showing the chapters and narrative sections. James L. Kugel’s list of passages, attributed to a later interpolator, have been added to this outline.²³⁷

²³⁵There are several allusions to the resurrection or a future afterlife in the Jubilees. Sleep is used as an analogy for death in several passages (Jub. 10:15; 23:1; 36:18; 45:15), which presumes a temporary nature for death as it alludes to a future time when the person will awaken (not be dead). There are also several judgment texts in the Jubilees (Jub. 4:24; 5:10; 10:17; 23:11; 30:23; 36:10-11; 37:19; 39:6) which would imply some form of resurrection and/or afterlife since each person will be held responsible for their actions in the present life.

²³⁶Wintermute, “Jubilees,” OTP, 2:35.

²³⁷James L. Kugel, “Jubilees,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 1:281.

Table 33. Outline of the Book of Jubilees

Chapter	Narrative section	Attributed to the interpolator	
1	Introduction		
2-4	Creation and Adam stories	2:24-33 3:9-14 3:29-31 4:5-6 4:31-32	The Laws of the Sabbath Impurity after Childbirth Nudity forbidden Cain's curse anticipates Deut. 27:24 Death of Cain and Lev. 24:19-20
5-10	Noah stories	5:13-19 6:10-14 6:17-22 6:23-38	Strict justice after the Flood and the Day of Atonement Blood not to be eaten, but instead used for <i>Tamid</i> sacrifices (connection to Exod. 29:38-42 and Num. 28:3-8). The Festival of Shavuot The 364-Day Calendar
11-23:8	Abraham stories	13:25-27 14:20b 15:25-34 16:3-4 16:9 16:28-31 18:18-19	Law of the Tithe Abraham kept Shevuot (Connected to "The Festival of Shavuot above Addition to the Laws of Circumcision Isaac's name was already written in Heavenly Tablets Lot condemned Supplement to Festival of Booths Laws The binding of Isaac took place on Passover
23:9-32	Digression on Abraham's death	0.98056	Moses's predictions recapitulate the Heavenly Tablets
24-45	Jacob and his family	24:33 28:6b-7 30:8-17 30:18-23 31:31-32 32:9c-15 33:10-20 41:23-26	Isaac's curse of Philistines recapitulates the Heavenly Tablets Wrong to marry the younger daughter first Prohibition of intermarriage operates in both directions God's friends and enemies Isaac's blessing written on the Heavenly Tablets Law of the Second Tithe The Eight Day of Assembly Why Ruben and Bilhah were not killed
46-50	Moses stories	49:2-17 49:22-23	Laws of Passover Sacrifice Law of Unleavened Bread

Regarding the dating and provenance of the *Book of Jubilees*, this literary work was originally written in Hebrew²³⁸ by a Jew who lived in Palestine, more specifically "in

²³⁸Several fragments of the book of Jubilees have been identified among the Dead Sea Scrolls, which attests to its Hebrew origin. At one point, someone translated the Hebrew version of the book into Greek and perhaps Syriac. Still later, the Greek version was translated into Latin and into Ethiopic. Only the

or near Jerusalem.”²³⁹ Due to his special interest in religious matters like the origin of festivals, sacred times, cult and rituals, strict interpretation of the Law, and the focus on the tribe of Levi, the author probably belonged to a priestly family.²⁴⁰ Based on the oldest fragment of the *Book of Jubilee*, found among the Dead Sea Scrolls (4Q216), dated to 125-100 BCE; that the *Damascus Document* (CD 16.2-4) quotes *Jubilees* as an authority in the mid-first century BCE; and that the author of the *Jubilees* does not seem to be aware of the Enochic *Animal Apocalypse* (1 Enoch 85-90) which is dated to the late 160s BCE, VanderKam argues the most likely date for *Jubilees* is between the late 160s BCE and the earliest surviving Qumran fragment of the book (125-100 BCE).²⁴¹ He concludes: “it seems best to say, in view of all the evidence, that the author composed *Jubilees* in the period between 160–150 BCE. One cannot exclude a slightly earlier date, but it was probably not written at a later time.”²⁴² The listed interpolations in the outline above is of a later date,²⁴³ however, the “resurrection” passage, which will be considered below, is not among these texts, but is instead a part of the oldest strata of the book.

Ethiopic version has survived more or less intact into the present time. For an overview of textual history of the book, see Kugel, “Jubilees,” 1:272-273; James C. VanderKam, *The Book of Jubilees* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 2001), 13-17; idem., “Jubilees,” DNTB, 600-601; Wintermute, “Jubilees,” OTP, 2:43.

²³⁹Kugel, “Jubilees,” 1:272; see also Wintermute, “Jubilees,” OTP, 2:45.

²⁴⁰Wintermute, “Jubilees,” OTP, 2:45.

²⁴¹VanderKam, “Jubilees,” DNTB, 600; see also idem., *The Book of Jubilees*, 17-21; Wintermute, “Jubilees,” OTP 2:43-44.

²⁴²VanderKam, *The Book of Jubilees*, 21.

²⁴³Kugel, “Jubilees,” 1:278-281.

Jubilees 23:29b-31

The resurrection passage, Jubilees 23:29b-31, is a part of a larger apocalypse (Jub. 23:16-31) which describes the “events of Israelite history that lead up to and constitute the eschaton.”²⁴⁴ The conclusion of this apocalypse (Jub. 23:29b-31), as noted by Nickelsburg, describes the eschatological judgment (verses 30f and 31c, underlined in the text below) in which the righteous will receive mercy and their reward and the wicked their punishment (verse 30f, highlighted in blue), emphasizing the vindication of the righteous (verse 31c, highlighted in green).²⁴⁵ The text is as follows (the “resurrection” statement has been highlighted in red, verse 31ab):

Jubilees 23:29b-31 (OTP, 2:102)

- 29b) and there will be no Satan and no evil (one) who will destroy,
c) because all of their days will be days of blessing and healing.
- 30a) And then the LORD will heal his servants,
b) and they will rise up and see great peace.
c) And they will drive out their enemies,
d) and the righteous ones will see and give praise,
e) and rejoice forever and ever with joy;
f) and they will see all of their judgments and all of their curses among their enemies.
- 31a) And their bones will rest in the earth,
b) and their spirits will increase joy,
c) and they will know that the LORD is an executor of judgment;
d) but he will show mercy to hundreds and thousands,
to all who love him.

The key element of this passage is the reward given to the righteous, in addition to seeing the punishment of their enemies (v. 30f), which will be an important part of their vindication by God (v. 31c), their bones will rest in the earth while their spirits will increase joy (v. 31ab), suggesting an eternal afterlife filled with joy for the righteous (v.

²⁴⁴Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life*, 47.

²⁴⁵Ibid.

30e). In the contrast between the bones and spirit, Nickelsburg presumes the spirit will experience much joy in heaven, thus, the contrast is between the bones in the earth and the spirits in heaven. However, he notes “the passage does not say whether the spirits pass directly into heaven at the time of death or whether they are resurrected at some specific time in the future, viz., at the judgment.”²⁴⁶ Nickelsburg argues that it all comes down to the relationship between the “servants” mentioned in verse 30ab and the “righteous ones” in verse 30d-31. If they are the same, it would support a resurrection of the souls of the righteous. If, on the other hand, the “servants” and the “righteous ones” refer to two different groups, the “servants” would describe those who are still alive at the time of God’s intervention “describing how they “rise from their humility and their subjugation to their enemies, or how they are taken up to join the spirits of the righteous, who are already in heaven.”²⁴⁷

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah

The *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* is the Ethiopic title²⁴⁸ of this composite work. It consists of two distinct literary works which probably existed independently from each other.²⁴⁹ The first half of this work (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1-5) is the oldest and is often titled the *Martyrdom of Isaiah*. M. Knibb notes this section is also a composite – a Jewish

²⁴⁶Ibid., 47-48.

²⁴⁷Ibid., 48.

²⁴⁸The most complete version of this literary work is the Ethiopic translation, although parts of this work is also attested in Greek, Latin, Coptic, and Slavonic.

²⁴⁹M. A. Knibb, “Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP, 2:143.

part (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:1-3:12; 5:1-16) and a Christian part (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 3:13-4:22). He remarks the Jewish section, *Martyrdom of Isaiah*, contains the tradition regarding Isaiah's martyrdom and probably dates to the second century BCE, to the period of the persecution by Antiochus Epiphanes. It was most likely written in Hebrew by a Jewish author living in Palestine. However, he adds the Christian apocalypse (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 3:13-4:22), also known by the title *Testament of Hezekiah* which is embedded in the Jewish section, may also have existed as an independent work, and probably dates to the end of the first century CE, most likely written in Greek. This Christian addition explains Satan's anger towards Isaiah, which ultimately caused his death by the hand of Manasseh.²⁵⁰

The second half of this work (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 6-11) is also known as the *Ascension of Isaiah* or *Vision of Isaiah* and records Isaiah's journey through the seven heavens which took place in the "twentieth year of the reign of Hezekiah" (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 6:1), six years prior to Isaiah's martyrdom (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:1). This is a Christian apocalypse, originating in Greek probably at the end of the first or beginning of the second century CE.

A final Christian redactor probably combined the above three sections into the present work by the third or the fourth century CE which, as noted by Knibb, is "confirmed by the fact that Jerome seems to have known the complete book," although "it is possible that there were two stages in this process, first the combination of 3:13-4:22 with the Martyrdom, and second the combination of the enlarged Martyrdom with the

²⁵⁰Ibid., OTP, 2:143, 146-150.

Vision.”²⁵¹ He also notes that this final Christian redactor is probably responsible for the Christian interpolation appearing in the introduction of the *Martyrdom of Isaiah* (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:2b-6a).

The following table (Table 34) shows the outline of the book²⁵² and the five resurrection passages, Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:3-5; 3:15b-20; 4:14-22; 9:6-11, 16-18 (highlighted in red), in the larger context of the book. From this, it becomes clear that all these five passages appear in the Christian material of the book, the first passage in the final redactor’s Christian interpolation (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:2b-6a, appearing in brackets in the Table below). These five resurrection passages will be considered briefly below.

²⁵¹Ibid., OTP, 2:150.

²⁵²This outline is utilizing the section headings used in Knibb’s translation of *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* in OTP, 2:156-176.

Table 34. Outline of the Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah

Outline of the book	Chapters	Resurrection
I. Martyrdom of Isaiah	1-5	
Martyrdom - Part 1		
Hezekiah, summons Manasseh	1:1-13 (1:2b-6a)	1:3-5
Manasseh's wicked reign	2:1-6	
Isaiah withdraws from Jerusalem	2:7-16	
Isaiah is accused	3:1-12	
Testament of Hezekiah		
A prophecy about the beloved and the Church	3:13-20	3:15b-20
The Corruption of the Church	3:21-31	
The reign of Beliar	4:1-13	
The second coming of the Lord	4:14-22	4:14-22
Martyrdom - Part 2		
The Execution of Isaiah	5:1-16	
II. The Ascension of Isaiah (6-11)	6-11	
Visits Hezekiah and has a vision	6:1-17	
Journey through the seven heavens	7:1-8	
The Firmament	7:9-12	
First Heaven	7:13-17	
Second Heaven	7:18-23	
Third Heaven	7:24-27	
Fourth Heaven	7:28-31	
Fifth Heaven	7:32-37	
Air of the Sixth Heaven	8:1-15	
Sixth Heaven	8:16-28	
Air of the Seventh Heaven	9:1-5	
Seventh Heaven	9:6-18	9:6-11; 9:16-18
Record of men's deeds	9:19-23	
Robes/thrones/crowns	9:24-26	
Worship of the Lord	9:27-32	
Worship of the angel of the Holy spirit	9:33-36	
Worship of God	9:37-42	
Worship of the Father by the 6 lower Heavens	10:1-6	
Lord Christ is commissioned by the Father	10:7-16	
Descent of the Lord through the 7 Heavens	10:17-31	
Miraculous birth of the Lord	11:1-16	
Infancy and life of the Lord	11:17-21	
Ascension of the Lord through the 7 Heavens	11:22-33	
Conclusion of the vision	11:34-35	
Instructions to Hezekiah	11:36-43	

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 1:3-5

The first resurrection passage appears in a Christian interpolation (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:2b-6a) by the final redactor of this literary work, in which king Hezekiah summons his son Manasseh “in order to hand over to him the words of righteousness which” Hezekiah himself had seen (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:2). This passage provides a whole list of topics Hezekiah brought up with his son:

- a. the eternal judgment;
- b. the torments of Gehenna;
- c. the prince of this world, his angels, and his powers;
- d. the words concerning faith in the Beloved [Christ];
- e. the judgment of the angels;
- f. the destruction of this world;
- g. the robes of the saints;
- h. the going out and the transformation, the persecution, and the ascension of the Beloved.

It should be noted that no details are provided in this passage regarding these topics, although most of them are expanded upon at a later point in this literary work.

Regardless, this list shows that these issues were a part of the final redactor’s world view.

The resurrection is only implied in this list as it mentions the eternal judgment, the destiny of the wicked (torments of Gehenna), and the reward of the righteous (robes of the saints). Most of these themes are discussed at a later point in this literary work

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 3:15b-20

The second resurrection passage appears at the beginning of the “Testament of Hezekiah,” the Christian apocalypse imbedded in *Martyrdom of Isaiah* (see Table 34 above), in a passage which summarizes the key elements of Christ’s first coming and the

spread of the gospel following his ascension to Heaven (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 3:13-20). The resurrection statement itself regards the resurrection of the Beloved (Jesus Christ) who will rise from his grave on the third day (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 3:16), and who will “send out his twelve disciples, and they will teach all nations and every tongue the resurrection of the Beloved, and those who believe in his cross will be saved” (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 3:17-18). In light of the reference to “the angel of the church which is in Heaven, whom he will summon in the last day” (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 3:15), this passage seems to hint at a future eschatological event, however, the nature of this event is not revealed in this passage.

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 4:14-18

The third resurrection passage appears at the end of the “Testament of Hezekiah,” at the climax of the vision, which summarizes the key events that will take place following the second coming of Christ (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:14-18). According to this apocalypse, the second coming of the Lord and the establishment of his temporary Messianic kingdom will take place following the 1332 days reign of Beliar (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:12, 14),²⁵³ during which the saints had to flee “from desert to desert” for safety

²⁵³This time period is reminiscent to the 1335 days of Daniel 12:12. Knibb notes the 1332 days (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:14) or the three years, seven months, and twenty-seven day period (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:12) are the same and, according to the Julian calendar, adds to 1335 days (Knibb, “Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah,” OTP, 2:162, n. j). Jonathan Knight observes the 1332 days is most likely an error for 1335, thus bringing the two references to the reign of Belial into agreement (Jonathan Knight, *The Ascension of Isaiah*, Guides to Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha [Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1995], 62). There is a precedence from the book of Revelation, a contemporary work, which refers to the same time-period in three different ways, as 3½ years (Dan 7:25; 12:7; Rev 12:14), 1260 days period (Rev 11:3; 12:6), and also as 42 months (Rev 13:5).

If the time-period in this text is indeed 1335 days, it is a clear link to the resurrection passage of Daniel 12 which describes a resurrection of the righteous and the wicked. It would also shed some light on how the author of this apocalypse understood the 1335 days period of Daniel 12:12, understanding that the end of this period would see the second coming and the establishment of an earthly Messianic kingdom, possibly an interpretation of the following passages from the book of Daniel 2:34-35, 44-45; 7:13-14, 18,

while awaiting his coming (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:13).²⁵⁴ This Apocalypse also states that following the Lord's arrival from the seventh heaven accompanied by his angels and the hosts of the saints,²⁵⁵ his first act in establishing his kingdom is to drag Beliar and his hosts²⁵⁶ into Gehenna²⁵⁷ (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:14). This act will bring "rest" to the righteous who were persecuted by Beliar and his hosts. In doing so, this would effectively bring an end to evil, thus establishing the supreme authority of the Lord (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:15).

The hosts of saints returning from the seventh heaven to earth at the beginning of the Messianic kingdom is the resurrection of the righteous. Upon dying, the righteous

22, 26-27; 12:1-13.

²⁵⁴This is a similar image as described in Rev 12:6, where the woman has to flee to the wilderness for protection during the 1260 days period, to a place God had prepared for her.

²⁵⁵Although this passage does not mention who these saints are, the fourth resurrection passage notes that all the righteous, upon death, go to dwell with God in the seventh heaven, leaving the "robes of the flesh" behind to receive "the robes of above" (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 9:7-9). This might be an interpretation of Zech 14:5 which states: "You will flee by My mountain valley, for the valley of the mountains will extend to Azal. You will flee as you fled from the earthquake in the days of Uzziah king of Judah. Then the LORD my God will come and **all the holy ones with Him** [עֲנִיִּים וְכָל־קְדוֹשִׁים/πάντες οἱ ἅγιοι μετ' αὐτοῦ]" (CSB, my emphasis added). This image is also present in the New Testament writings, where either angels (Matt 16:27; 24:29-31; 25:31; Mark 8:38; 13:24-27; Luke 9:26; 2 Thess 1:7; Rev 19:14) or the saints (1 Thess 3:13 [μετὰ πάντων τῶν ἁγίων αὐτοῦ]; Jude 1:14 [ἐν ἁγίαις μυριάσιν αὐτοῦ]) are depicted as coming with Jesus Christ at the second coming. The third resurrection passage mentions both the angels and the saints accompanying the Lord.

²⁵⁶From the immediate context, the hosts of Beliar seems to parallel the hosts of saints coming with the Lord. It is not clear if Beliar's hosts would also include Beliar's loyal angels since, in the parallel, the angels of the Lord were mentioned in addition to the saints.

²⁵⁷It is not clear what the nature of this "Gehenna" is in this passage, if it is a place of eternal torment as suggested by the final Christian redactor in Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:3. However, Mar. Ascen. Isa. 10:8 makes a distinction between Sheol and Haguēl, an Ethiopian word which means, "perdition." Knibb adds that "'destruction' is probably intended here as the name of the final place of punishment for the wicked" (Knibb, "Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah," OTP, 2:137, n. 1). Even though it may be tempting to assume Gehenna carries the same meaning as in Jewish apocalyptic literature, as a place of eternal punishment (4 Ezra 7:36; 1 En. 90:26; Sib. Or. 4.186; 2 Bar. 59:10), there is no indication in this Christian apocalypse that the wicked have an immortal soul, rather, the emphasis is on their complete destruction (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:18).

leave their “robes of the flesh” and ascend to the seventh heaven where they receive their “robes of above.”²⁵⁸ The righteous will once more be clothed in the “robes of the flesh” when returning to the earth (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:16), and they will become members of the temporary earthly Messianic kingdom, which will only include the “resurrected saints” (those who arrived with the Lord) and the righteous remnant who were still alive at the second coming. Although there are no indications in this resurrection passage, nor in this apocalypse as a whole, regarding the duration of this Messianic kingdom, it does reveal that there will be a second resurrection at the end of this period. This second resurrection is of the wicked dead who will be judged²⁵⁹ and sentenced to eternal destruction by an all consuming fire caused by the Beloved: “it will consume all the impious, and they will become as if they had not been created” (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:18).²⁶⁰ The righteous, on the other hand, will leave this earth, leaving their “robes of flesh” (bodies) behind and ascend to the seventh heaven where they will dwell for all eternity in their “robes of above” (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:17), bringing to an end the earthly Messianic kingdom. The end of

²⁵⁸The “robe of above” which will be given to the righteous upon their ascension to the seventh heaven is also mentioned in: Mar. Ascen. Isa. 1:5; 3:25; 7:22; 8:14, 26; 9:2, 9, 17-18, 24-26; 11:40. This robe symbolizes the necessary transformation which needs to take place in order to enable a person to dwell in the seventh heaven with God.

²⁵⁹It can be assumed there is a preliminary judgment taking place upon death in which the righteous are brought to the seventh heaven while the wicked will remain in their graves or Sheol until the second resurrection and judgment of the wicked.

²⁶⁰It should be noted this apocalypse is not clear if Beliar and his hosts, who were dragged to Gehenna at the beginning of the era of the Messianic kingdom, are the ones who are resurrected in the resurrection of the wicked, judged, and completely destroyed at the end of this era. If Beliar is not included in this destruction, he would remain in Gehenna, or on the primeval earth, much like John describes Satan’s destiny during the thousand years between the resurrection of the righteous and the resurrection of the wicked (Rev 20:1-3, the Greek word ἀβύσσου, abyss, used to describe the place in which Satan would be bound is the same word used in the Gen 1:2 [LXX] when describing the condition of the earth prior to the creation).

this world, as noted by Knight, “would involve a full-scale destruction in which the Beloved’s voice would angrily reprove”²⁶¹ the whole creation (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:18), thus, returning it to the state of pre-creation. There will be no need for a recreation, a new heaven, or a new earth, since all the righteous are gathered in the seventh heaven, their eternal home.

It seems the author of this Christian apocalypse has expanded upon the resurrection view appearing in Daniel 12:2, which suggests there will be a resurrection of the righteous and a resurrection of the wicked, although the reader is left with the impression that these two resurrections will take place at the same time. However, as discussed above, these two resurrections bookend the earthly Messianic kingdom, although no time interval is mentioned. The book of Revelation, on the other hand, follows a similar scenario as this apocalypse, but there are also several fundamental differences, like the description of the second coming in Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 4:14-18, the resurrection of the righteous (Rev 20:6) and the neutralization of Satan (Rev 20:1-3) are the starting point of the Messianic era (Rev 20:6), and the resurrection of the wicked will take place at the end of this special period (Rev 20:5). However, the book of Revelation adds the time interval between the first and second resurrection to be 1,000 years (Rev 20:4, 6). While the apocalypse in *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* seems to suggest that the Messianic kingdom will be an earthly kingdom as supposed to a heavenly (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:16), Revelation 20:4-6 does not provide the specific location

²⁶¹Knight, *The Ascension of Isaiah*, 63.

of the millennium kingdom.²⁶² Both apocalypses have the wicked resurrected, judged, and then destroyed by fire, however, the book of Revelation mentions specifically that Satan will be included in this destruction (Rev 20:9-10, 15; 21:8). There is a major structural difference between these two second coming accounts. First, the book of Revelation does not mention the saints²⁶³ ascending from heaven at the second coming. Instead, the righteous dead will be resurrected from the earth (Rev 20:4, 6). Moreover, following the 1,000 years, John the Revelator states that God will create a new heaven and a new earth (Rev 21:1), where the New Jerusalem will be located (Rev 21:2), and all the saints will dwell in this city with God forever (Rev 21-22). According to the third resurrection passage, the righteous ascend to the seventh heaven where they will receive “robes of above” while leaving their “robes of flesh” behind on earth. They will dwell in Heaven until the second coming, when they will descend to the earth together with the

²⁶²Joel Badina makes a case for the millennium kingdom being located in heaven based on a word-study of the word θρόνους, *throne*, used in Revelation 20:4. This word appears 47 times throughout the apocalypse and the throne’s location is always in heaven when associated with God or Jesus (three of the 47 cases refer to the throne of Satan [Rev 2:13], dragon [Rev 13:2] or the beast [Rev 16:10], all of which are located on earth as opposed to heaven). Thus, he states: “it is reasonable to conclude that the thrones of 20:4 are in heaven, too, since they are thrones of people who will ‘[reign]’ with Christ a thousand years’ (20:4, 6).” Badina also finds support for his conclusion by linking the “conquerors” in Revelation 20:4 with the “conquerors” seen in Revelation 15:2 and 3:21, who are located in heaven (see Joel Badina, “The Millennium,” in *Symposium on Revelation – Book II*, ed. Frank B. Holbrook, DARCOM 7 [Silver Springs, MD: Biblical Research Institute and General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, 1992], 239-241). These two arguments assume the location of God’s/Jesus’ throne is stagnant and does not move from heaven to earth at the second coming event. A case could be made that, if the messianic kingdom was established on earth, his throne would also be based on earth.

William Shea adds a third argument for locating the millennium kingdom in heaven based on the parallel literary structure of Revelation 12 and 20. Based on his analysis, he sees a similar shift “earth-heaven-earth,” in both chapters, thus, considering Revelation 20:1-3 and 20:7-15 as describing events taking place on earth while the middle section (Rev 20:4-6) takes place in heaven, thereby viewing the millennium kingdom as a heavenly kingdom (William Shea, “The Parallel Literary Structure of Revelation 12 and 20,” *AUSS* 23 [1985]: 47).

²⁶³Revelation 19:14 mentions the armies of heaven accompanying the Messiah, however, this may be an allusion to one of God’s titles used frequently (245x) in the TaNaKh, יהוה צבאות, the Lord of Hosts or armies, is most likely a reference to His angels.

Lord and take on their “robes of flesh,” which is the resurrection of the righteous, and dwell with Him on earth and be a part of His Messianic kingdom. At the end of the Messianic era, there will be a resurrection of the wicked, who will be destroyed by fire, and the righteous will ascend to the seventh heaven, leaving their “robes of flesh” to receive the “robes of above.” The earth will be uninhabitable, but the saints will dwell in the seventh heaven for all eternity. In the book of Revelation scenario, upon death, the righteous dwell in the ground until the resurrection of the righteous at the beginning of the millennium kingdom which also seems to be located on earth. At the end of the 1,000 years, the resurrection of the wicked and their judgment will take place before they are destroyed by the lake of fire. God will create a new heaven and a new earth on which the righteous will live together with God for all eternity.

Figure 17 in the “Concluding Remarks” section below illustrates the resurrection concept in the *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* 4:14-18. The final two resurrection texts in this composite work add a few more details and appears in Isaiah’s description of the seventh heaven (see Table 34 above).

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 9:6-11

The fourth resurrection passage appears in Isaiah’s description of the seventh heaven where he “saw all the righteous from the time of Adam onwards,” including “Abel and all the righteous” and “Enoch and all who (were) with him” (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 9:7–9), therefore indicating that all the righteous are brought to the seventh heaven upon their death. This passage also notes that, following death, the righteous are stripped of

their “robes of flesh” and are instead given their “robes of above,” thus, becoming like angels in appearance (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 9:9).

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 9:16-18

The final resurrection passage appears in the author’s description of Christ’s first coming, when he descends from the seventh heaven, dies on the cross, and plunders the angel of death (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 9:12-16). When Jesus resurrects on the third day, Isaiah states that “many of the righteous will ascend with him to the seventh heaven (Mar. Ascen. Isa. 9:17-18). This begs the question, who were these righteous people liberated from the angel of death, and why had these righteous people not ascended directly to the seventh heaven upon their death? The *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* does not provide these answers, and instead leaves these questions open for speculation.

Concluding Remarks

The five resurrection passages considered above, are all considered to be of Christian origin, the most important of which is Mar. Ascen. Isa. 4:14-18, which is also the basis for Figure 17 which illustrates the resurrection concept in *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah*.

Fig. 17. Death and Resurrection in Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah.

Joseph and Aseneth

Joseph and Aseneth is an ancient Greek novel²⁶⁴ which most likely originated in Egypt between 100 BCE and 115 CE.²⁶⁵ This novel is a rewrite of the Joseph narrative (Gen 37-50) and begins “in the first year of the seven years of plenty” (Jos. Asen. 1:1), just following Joseph’s interpretation of Pharaoh’s dream (Gen 41:1-36) and Pharaoh’s act of making Joseph second in Egypt, only Pharaoh himself outranking him (Gen 41:39-44).

This novel consists of two main sections. The first section (Jos. Asen. 1-21) greatly expands on Genesis 41:15 concerning Joseph’s marriage to Aseneth (Jos. Asen. 1-17), the daughter of Potiphera, the priest at On. This section concludes with the birth of Manasseh and Ephraim (Jos. Asen. 18-21), paralleling Genesis 41:50-52. The primary concern being, as stated by Klassen, “How can this famous Jewish patriarch have married a non-Jewish woman and how does this apply to the men in our community who are also tempted to marry outside the Jewish community?”²⁶⁶ To solve this apparent problem, the author of the novel provides Aseneth’s conversion story. The second half of the novel (Jos. Asen. 22-29) takes place after the family reunification (Gen 46-47) and is filled with

²⁶⁴Patricia Ahearne-Kroll categorizes this Jewish composition as an ancient Greek novel and notes the particular plot lines it shares with other works falling into this genre classification. However, as a Jewish composition, she also notes several distinct features, the most notable is Aseneth’s embrace of Judaism, the encounter with angels, and various instructions regarding Jewish ethical standards and customs. See Patricia Ahearne-Kroll, “Joseph and Aseneth,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, ed. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 3:2525-2526.

²⁶⁵For further reading regarding dating and providence of this book, see Ahearne-Kroll, “Joseph and Aseneth,” 2526; C. Burchard, “Joseph and Aseneth: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP, 2:187-188; W. Klassen, “Joseph and Aseneth,” DNTB, 588.

²⁶⁶Klassen, “Joseph and Aseneth,” 588.

intrigues regarding the plot to have Joseph and Aseneth killed. This plot was masterminded by the son of Pharaoh, who had wanted to marry Aseneth, and involved Joseph's brothers birthed by the concubines Bilhah and Zilpah. It concludes with Joseph and Aseneth being made the king and queen of Egypt (Jos. Asen. 29:8b-9).

Although there are no clear eschatological bodily resurrection passages in this novel, there are several allusions to the resurrection and a future life following death (see Table 32). In Joseph's intercessory prayer on behalf of Aseneth, which refers to God as the source of all life and who calls from death to life, Joseph petitions God to restore Aseneth to "life with your life" (reviving her from the state of distress [Jos. Asen. 8:8(10)]), "let her enter your resting place, which you prepared for your chosen one," and "let her live in your eternal life forever" (Jos. Asen. 8:9[11]). Allusions to eternal life also appear in Aseneth's confession of sin and prayer for acceptance, in which she compares worldly possessions with that of the divine gifts when she states: "For behold, all the gifts of my father Pentephres, which he gave me as an inheritance, are transient and obscure; but the gifts of your inheritance, Lord, are incorruptible and eternal" (Jos. Asen. 12:[12]). Aseneth also expresses a belief in the immortality of her soul when she was about to be killed by the sons of Bilhah and Zilpah. She addresses God, asking him to deliver her and reminded him about his promise that: "your soul shall live for ever" (Jos. Asen. 27:10). Levi also notes Aseneth's future and saw "her place of rest in the highest, and her walls like adamantine eternal walls, and her foundations founded upon a rock of the seventh heaven" (Jos. Asen. 22:[9]).

There is also a references to the *Book of the living*²⁶⁷ in this novel, and Aseneth is told that her name is written in it: “for behold, your name was written in the book of the living in heaven; in the beginning of the book, as the very first of all, your name was written by my finger, and it will not be erased forever” (Jos. Asen. 15:4[3]). This “heavenly register” or “book of life” is not a foreign biblical concept. However, it appears more frequently in Second Temple period Jewish literature.²⁶⁸ It suggests Aseneth is a citizen of the heavenly kingdom, following her conversion which made her into a new being: “behold, from today, you will be renewed and formed anew and made alive again, and you will eat blessed bread of life, and drink a blessed cup of immortality, and anoint yourself with the blessed ointment of incorruptibility” (Jos. Asen. 15:5[4]). A similar point is made a few verses later, when the author notes that “for all who repent she [Repentance] prepared a place of rest in the heavens. And she will renew all who repent, and wait on them herself for ever (and) ever” (Jos. Asen. 15:[7]).

Allusions to the resurrection and life after death also appear in the narrative section concerning the heavenly bees (Jos. Asen. 15:13-17:4). The angel reveals to Aseneth that all those who repent and “attach themselves to the Lord God” will eat from the comb of the heavenly bees – an angelic food. This comb is described as “big and

²⁶⁷Jos. Asen. 15:12x suggests God also has a heavenly book containing the unspoken names of the righteous angels, those who remained loyal to Him.

²⁶⁸See the following references from the TaNaKh: Exod 32:32-33 (Moses asks God to be removed from the book he has written, if he is not willing to forgive the people); Ps 69:28 (asks God to remove his enemies from the book of life and not be counted among the righteous); Dan 7:10 (books were open at the beginning of the judgment); 12:1 (those who are written in the book will escape); from the Pseudepigrapha: Jub 30:20-22 (which mentions the “Book of life” and the “Book of death”); 36:10 (refers to the two books in the context of the judgment); 1 Enoch 47:3; 81:4; 89:61-77; 90:17-20; 98:76; 104:1, 7; 108:3; 2 Bar. 24:1; Ascen. Isa. 9:20); and from the New Testament: Luke 10:8 Phil 4:3; Rev 3:5; 13:8; 17:8; 20:12-15.

white as snow and full of honey” (Jos. Asen 16:8) and full of the spirit of life (Jos. Asen. 16:14). Its honey “was like dew from heaven and its exaltation like breath of life” (Jos. Asen. 16:8). As such, the comb is a “comb of life, and everyone who eats of it will not die for ever (and) ever” (Jos. Asen. 16:13-14), alluding to the life-sustaining Manna given to God’s people in the wilderness (Exod 16:31, 35; Deut 8:3), whereas the “breath of life” alludes to God’s life-giving breath/spirit as a part of the creation process of humans recorded in the Eden Narrative (Gen 2:7).

The novel also describes the subservient bees who did not wish to return to heaven at the angel’s request (Jos. Asen. 16:20-21), but instead tried to attack Aseneth. Due to their disobedience, they all died. However, the angel resurrected them and bade them to dwell in Aseneth’s courtyard and settle in the fruit-trees (Jos. Asen. 16:22-23). Although the only clear resurrection statement in the book regards these bees, this passage does reveal a familiarity with the resurrection concept and, more specifically, with the bodily resurrection concept. The closest this novel comes to a clear human resurrection statement is the reaction of Aseneth’s family upon seeing her transformation as a result of her conversion: “they were amazed at her beauty and rejoiced and gave glory to God who gives life to the dead,” and they sat down and celebrated with her (Jos. Asen. 20:7-8). Burchard notes the phrase “He who gives life to the death” became “all but a definition of God in Judaism,”²⁶⁹ which emphasizes God’s powers and sovereignty, even over death. Therefore, although this novel does not specifically mention an

²⁶⁹Burchard, “Joseph and Aseneth,” OTP, 2:234, note p.

eschatological resurrection, due to the many references to eternal life and life after death, a resurrection is not excluded as a possible element within this afterlife framework.

Books of the Life of Adam and Eve

It was traditionally believed that the *Life of Adam and Eve*, was written by a Palestinian Jew around the Common Era (100 BCE – 200 CE), however among present day scholars, there is no consensus regarding the dating and provenance of this book.²⁷⁰ Highly valued by the Christian communities who safeguarded this book, Christian interpolations were added over time. Although the original language of this composition may have been Hebrew or possibly Greek, it only survived through its two textual traditions reflected in the various translations. The longer tradition is represented in Latin (by the name, “*Vita*”), Armenian, Georgian, and Slavonic, while the shorter tradition in the current Greek form (by the name, “*Apocalypse of Moses*”). These five textual traditions in their different languages are labeled the *Books of Adam and Eve*,²⁷¹ and with them many textual variations reflect how the Adam and Eve tradition developed independently in the various Christian communities.²⁷² The following outline by Gary Anderson shows the main content difference between the shorter (Greek) and the longer

²⁷⁰For a discussion on the providence and dating of the book, see: Gary A. Anderson, “Life of Adam and Eve,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 2:1332-1333; Craig A. Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 49; M. D. Johnson, “Life of Adam and Eve: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP 2:252; J. Levison, “Adam and Eve, Literature Concerning,” DNTB, 4-5.

²⁷¹For a synopsis of these books, see Gary A. Anderson and Michael E. Stone, eds. *A Synopsis of the Books of Adam and Eve*, 2d ed., SBLEJL 17 (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1999).

²⁷²Jan A. Sigvartsen, “The Creation Order - Hierarchical or Egalitarian?” *AUSS* 53 (Spring 2015): 135.

(Latin) version of the book, also known as the *Apocalypse of Moses* and the *Vita*. It shows the Latin version has two additional sections, “Adam’s penitence” and “Adam’s vision,” while missing one section that is found in the Greek version alone, “Eve’s story of the fall.” The resurrection passages have been added to the narrative units in brackets in this outline and are highlighted in red. The Greek chapter 43 and Latin chapters 49-51 have been added to the last narrative unit.

Narrative Unit	Greek	Latin
Adam’s penitence	—	1-21
Cain and Abel	1-4	22-24
Adam’s vision	—	25-29
Adam’s story of the fall	5-14 (10:2; 13:3-5)	30-44
Eve’s Story of the fall	15-30 (28:4)	—
Death and burial of Adam and Eve	31-43 (37:5; 39:2; 41:3; 43:2)	45-51 (42:1-5; 47:3; 51:2)

The Eden Narrative is the focus of this book and the ‘blessings’ and ‘curses’ mentioned in Gen 3 are expanded upon and explained in more detail. The narrative gap between Gen 3:24 and Gen 4 has been addressed by the author of this book who inserted a lengthy narrative section which, when read with the Eden Narrative, adds several new elements to the story.²⁷³ This composition follows closely and expands upon the Eden Narrative. The following table (Table 35) shows the topic expanded upon, including the

²⁷³Ibid., 136.

biblical reference with the corresponding reference to the *Life of Adam and Eve*.²⁷⁴ The resurrection passages are added in brackets and highlighted in red.

Table 35 shows that only one resurrection passage (Apoc.Mos. 28:4) appears in the narrative section which describes Adam and Eve's time in the Garden of Eden, although at this point in the narrative they have already eaten the forbidden fruit and God is in the process of expelling them from the Garden. The remaining six resurrection passages appear after the expulsion (Apoc.Mos. 10:2; 13:3-5||Vita 42:1-5; Apoc.Mos. 37:5||Vita 47:3; Apoc.Mos. 39:2-3; 41:3; 43:2||Vita 51:2). Therefore, for those who guard themselves "from all evil, preferring death to it" (Apoc.Mos. 28:4a), the resurrection hope is a crucial element in God's plan of undoing the consequences of their rebellion – death and lack of access to the Garden.

²⁷⁴Ibid., 137.

Table 35. The Eden Narrative and the Books of the Life of Adam and Eve

Topic	Genesis 3	Life of Adam and Eve	Pericope
Satan's explanation for why he tempted humans		Vita 11:1-17:2 also in Ar./Ge.	4-5
Temptation of the serpent	3:1	Apoc. Mos. 15:1-16:4b Ar./Ge. [44](15):1-[44](16):4b Sl. 18-20.1-18-20.6	17-18
Temptation of Eve	3:1-6a	Apoc. Mos. 17:1-20:5 Ar./Ge. [44](17):1-[44](20):5 Sl. 18-20.7-21-22.4a	19-22
Temptation of Adam	3:6b-7	Apoc. Mos. 21:1-6 Ar./Ge. [44](21):1-[44](21):6 Sl. 21-22.4b-21-22.8	23
God's investigation	3:8	Apoc. Mos. 22:1-4 Ar./Ge. [44](22):1-[44](22):4 Sl. 23-24.1-23-24.5	24
God questions Adam	3:9-11	Apoc. Mos. 23:1-3 Ar./Ge. [44](23):1-[44](23):5 Sl. 23-24.6-23-24.9	
Adam blames Eve	3:12	Apoc. Mos. 23:4a Ar./Ge. [44](23):4a	
Eve blames Serpent	3:13	Apoc. Mos 23:4b-5 Ar./Ge. [44](23):4b-[44](23):5	
God gives sentence to Adam	3:17-19	Apoc. Mos. 24:1-4 Ar./Ge. [44](24):1-[44](24):4	25
God gives sentence to Eve	3:16	Apoc. Mos. 25:1-4 Ar./Ge. [44](25):1-[44](25):4	
God gives sentence to Serpent	3:14-15	Apoc. Mos. 26:1-4 Ar./Ge. [44](26):1-[44](26):4	
Adam and Eve expelled from Garden	3:22-24	Apoc. Mos. 27:1-29:6 (28:4) Ar./Ge. [44](27):1-[44](29):6 Sl. 25-27.1-25-27.12	26-27
Life outside the Garden	4:1-5:5	Remaining sections (Apoc.Mos. 10:2; Apoc.Mos. 13:3-5 Vita 42:1-5; Apoc.Mos. 37:5 Vita 47:3; Apoc.Mos. 39:2-3; 41:3; Apoc.Mos. 43:2 Vita 51:2)	1-16 28-35

Apocalypse of Moses 10:2

The first reference to the resurrection in the Books of Adam and Eve appears in the Apocalypse of Moses 10:2 in a narrative section entitled “Encounter with Beast” (Pericope 12). It does not reveal much about the resurrection itself apart from Eve acknowledging her blame in bringing evil into this world and her sorrow that all those who have sinned will curse her on the day of resurrection, alluding to a resurrection of both the righteous and the wicked. The Armenian and Georgian tradition places Eve’s fear in the context of the Day of Judgment, while the Slavonic tradition in the context of the second coming (see the highlighted sections in the parallel texts below). This textual variation between these traditions, however, could easily be harmonized by considering the day of resurrection, the Day of Judgment, and the second coming as a reference to the same eschatological event. The Armenian tradition notes that all sins will be blamed on Eve, the Georgian tradition states that all the sins will burn her, and the Slavonic tradition notes that Eve introduced sin into this world (see the underlined sections of the parallel texts below). The Slavonic tradition is unique in its emphasis on the perpetual blame of Eve, in contrast to the other three which considers blame in the context of the day of Judgment (Ar./Ge.) or the resurrection (Gr.).

Gr. 10:2	Ar. 37(10):2	Ge. 37(10):2	Sl. 11-15.6a
And Eve wept, saying, “Woe is me! For when I come to the day of resurrection , <u>all who have sinned</u> will curse me, saying that Eve did not keep the command of God.”	Eve began to weep and she said, “[When] the day of Judgment comes; <u>all sins will be blamed</u> upon me and (men) will say, ‘Our mother did not hearken to the commandment of the Lord God!’”	Then Eve began to weep and said, “Woe is me, for when I arrive at the day of Judgment , <u>all my sins will burn me</u> and (people) will tell me, ‘In the first instance, it was you who did not observe God’s orders.’”	Eve began to cry bitterly and said, “Woe is me, my sweet child, <u>from now on until the end</u> and until the second coming <u>all will ruse me</u> , because it is on my account all sorts of evil have multiplied.

Apocalypse of Moses 13:3-5 || Vita 42:1-5

The second resurrection passage appears in Michael’s reply to Seth (Pericope 14),²⁷⁵ when he was requesting oil of mercy from the Garden so he could anoint his dying father, to sooth his pain. From this passage a few more details emerges regarding the eschatological event. According to the *Vita* and the Georgian tradition, this event will take place 5500 years in the future (underlined in the text).

²⁷⁵Michael is one of the archangels (Apoc. Mos. 13:2a). In the Armenian and the Georgian traditions, he is in charge of souls ([41](13):2a), while in the *Vita* he has been given power over the human body (41:1).

Gr. 13:3-5	Vita 42:1-5	Ar. 42(13):3a-4	Ge. 42(13):3a-4
³ For it shall not be yours now, [but <u>at the end of the times</u> . Then shall all flesh be raised up from Adam till that great day, – all that shall be of the holy people.	¹ [For in no wise can you receive any until the last days, <u>after 5500 years have passed</u> .	^{3a} This cannot be now: but then, at that time <u>when the years of the end are filled and complete</u> ,	^{3a} This is not to be right now but in the future times, <u>when five thousand years have been completed</u> . <u>Then, at the 5500 year</u>
⁴ Then shall the delights of the Garden be given to them and God shall be in their midst ⁵ And they shall no longer sin before his face, for the evil heart shall be taken from them and there shall be given them a heart understanding the good and to serve God only.]	² Then the most loving king of God will come upon the earth to resurrect the body of Adam and, with him, the bodies of the dead.	^{3b} then the beloved Christ will come to resurrect Adam's body, because of his sins which took place.	^{3b} the beloved Son of God, Christ, will come upon the earth to re[[urrect]] Adam's body from his fall, because of the transgression of the commands.
	³ The very Son of God, when he comes, will be baptized in the river Jordan, and when he comes forth from the water of Jordan, he will then anoint all who believe in him with the oil of mercy.	^{3c} He will come to the Jordan and be baptized [by] him, and when he will come forth from the water, then Michael will come and anoint the new Adam with the oil of joy.	^{3c} He will come and he will be baptized in the river Jordan. And as soon as he will have come forth from the water, with the (anointing) of oil, he will anoint him.
	⁴ This oil of mercy will be from generation to generation on those who are reborn of water and the Holy Spirit into eternal life.	⁴ Then after that, it shall happen in the same fashion to all the wild beasts of the earth, who will arise in resurrection and be worthy of entering the Garden . I shall anoint them with that oil.	⁴ and all his descendants, so that they will rise at the time of the resurrection. The Lord said, 'I will admit them into the Garden and I will anoint them with that unction.'
	⁵ Then, the most loving Son of God will descend into the earth and lead your father, Adam, back into the Garden to the tree of mercy.]		

From this resurrection passage, Michael reveals that everyone from the time of Adam until the “great day,” will be a part of the resurrection. The Armenian tradition even goes so far as including the wild beasts of the earth in this resurrection and notes that they will

be worthy to enter the Garden. No distinction is mentioned between the righteous and the wicked in the Apocalypse although the *Vita* seems to make a distinction by focusing on those “who are reborn of water and the Holy Spirit [baptism] into eternal life” (Vita 42:4b). In the Apocalypse, all the resurrected will be made into a holy people through the process of removing the evil heart and replacing it with “a heart that understands the good and worships God alone” (Apoc.Mos. 13:5). This is an allusion to the prophecy of Jeremiah and Ezekiel that God will give his people a new heart and write his law in their hearts (Jer 31:33; Ezek 18:31; 36:26). This procedure guarantees there will be no more sinners, they will “be given every joy of Paradise and God shall be in their midst” (Apoc. Mos. 13:4). According to the textual tradition recorded in the *Vita*, Armenian, and the Georgian version, it is Christ who will resurrect Adam and all his descendants (Vita 42:2; Ge. [42](13):4). The *Vita* also alludes to Christ’s journey to Hades: “Son of God will descend into the earth and lead your father, Adam, back into the Garden” (Vita 42:5). The subject of the oil of mercy or the tree of mercy (Apoc. Mos. 13:1-2; Vita 42:5; Ar. [42](13):4; Ge. [42](13):4) refers to the healing property of the oil – a lack of access to this tree means a loss of immortal life. However, access will be regained through the resurrection and, with it, a renewed access to the Garden.

Apocalypse of Moses 28:4

The third resurrection passage appearing in Eve’s tale regarding Adam’s plea (Pericope 26), provides a hope for a future life even though Adam and Eve had broken God’s command and eaten the fruit, an act which would lead to certain death (Gen 2:17;

3:3, 19b). They are told if they keep themselves from all evil after their expulsion, they will be a part of the eschatological resurrection, suggesting a different destiny for the righteous and the wicked (see underlined sections in the text below). Thus, there is hope for the righteous since they will be part of a future resurrection and regain access to the Tree of Life, which will make them immortal forever (highlighted in red). The wicked, on the other hand, will not be a part of the resurrection and will not receive fruit from the Tree of Life. As such, they will not have eternal life, but instead, death. Interestingly, the general statement that they should keep themselves from all evil is expanded upon in the Armenian tradition as: “slander, harlotry, adultery, sorcery, love of money, avarice, from all sin” (Ar. [44](28):4).

Gr. 28:4

⁴“Yet when you have gone out of the Garden, if you keep yourself from all evil, as one wishing to die, **when again the Resurrection has come to pass, I will raise you up and then there shall be given to you from the Tree of Life and you will be without death forever.**”

Ar. [44](28):4

⁴“Rather, when you go out of the Garden, guard yourself from slander, from harlotry, from adultery, from sorcery, from the love of money, from avarice and from all sins. Then, you shall arise from death (in the) resurrection which is going to take place. At that time, I will give you of the Tree of Life and you will be eternally undying.”

Ge. [44](28):4

⁴“If you go out of the Garden and guard yourself from every evil, [you will die and **after death you will arise in the future resurrection. Then, indeed,] I will give you of the Tree of Life and you will be undying for ever.**”

Apocalypse of Moses 37:5 || Vita 47:3

The fourth passage appears in the “assumption of Adam to Paradise” section (Pericope 31) and strongly alludes to the resurrection in most textual traditions. After the whole of nature prayed on Adam’s behalf, God pardoned him (Apoc. Mos. 37:2) for his rebellious deed. Upon his pardon, a Seraph came to retrieve his body and brought it to the

Acherusian Lake to wash him before he was led before God. God then hands Adam over to the archangel Michael, who is in charge of souls or of dead bodies. He leads him to the 3rd heaven where Adam will remain until God's resurrection (Sl. 45:46.2b), the day of God's judgment (Apoc. Mos. 37:5; Vita 47:3), or the day of 'oikonomia' (Ge. [47](37):5), highlighted in red in the text below. The eschatological judgment suggests there will be a day of reckoning when everyone will be held responsible for their evil deeds, which implies there are righteous and wicked who will meet different destinies in the judgment.

Gr. 37:5	Vita 47:3	Ge. [47](37):5	Sl. 45-46.2b
"Lift him up into the Garden unto the third Heaven, and leave him there until that fearful day of my reckoning, which I will make in the world."	"Let him be in your care until the day of retribution, in supplication until the last year when I shall change his mourning into joy. Then he will sit on the throne of him who beguiled him."	"Take him to the third heaven, to the Garden, and leave him before the altar until the day of the 'oikonomia' which I contemplate concerning all the fleshly (beings) with my wellbeloved Son."	"Carry his corpse into Paradise; his spirit shall tarry in the third Heaven, but his corpse shall remain here until my resurrection."

Apocalypse of Moses 39:2-3

The fifth resurrection passage is also only an allusion. It is a part of Adam and Abel's funerary rites (Pericope 32), in which God takes an active part in coming to the Garden in the same way as he came to the Garden when pronouncing his judgment after the rebellion (Apoc. Mos. 38:3; Ar./Ge. [47](38):3 || Apoc. Mos. 22:1-4; Ar./Ge. [44](22):1-4 and Sl. 23-24.1-4). The passage states that God grieved greatly over Adam's death, revealing God's feelings and emotions (Apoc. Mos. 39:1; Ar./Ge. [47](39):1). It is not clear from the text if the Garden or 3rd Heaven is a different place than the earth. The

enemy referred to in this text is clearly Satan, but the text is also referring to “those who borne you down to this place” without revealing who “those” are. It could be a reference to the angels who joined Satan in his rebellion. Regardless, this resurrection passage concerns the great reversal which will take place as a result of the eschatological resurrection. Those who show joy over Adam’s downfall and death will see Adam reinstated following the resurrection, and Adam will be seated on the throne of his deceiver. Following Adam’s future glorification, Satan and those who obeyed him “shall grieve when he see [*sic*] you [Adam] sitting upon his throne” (Apoc. Mos. 39:3) or be cast “into a place of darkness and death” (Ar. [47](39):3), see underlined section of the below text.

Gr. 39:2-3

²Yet, I tell you that I will turn their joy to grief and your grief to joy, and I will return you to your rule, and seat you on the throne of your deceiver.

³But that one [the one who sat on it prior to his becoming arrogant] shall be cast into this place that he may see you seated upon it. Then he himself shall be condemned along with those who obeyed him and he shall grieve when he see [*sic*] you sitting upon his throne.

Ar. [47](39):2-3

²But I will turn their rejoicing into sorrow, and I will turn your sorrow into rejoicing. I shall make you the beginning of rejoicing and I shall set you on the throne of him who deceived you,

³and I shall cast them into a place of darkness and death.”

Ge. [47](39):2-3

²But I will change his joy into sorrow and I will lead you back towards this realm and I will set you upon your enemy’s throne, where he was seated, close (by the place) where his rebellion was discovered.

³He will fall in the place (where) you (are) and he will see you in that (other) place sitting upon a throne.”

Apocalypse of Moses 41:1-3

The sixth resurrection passage appears in the dialogue between God and Adam’s dead body (Pericope 32) and is based on an interpretation of Genesis 3:19. In the Eden

Narrative, God reveals to Adam that he will have to work hard for living until the day he dies, when his body will once more return to the earth from which he was once taken. The author of the Apocalypse expands on this statement and has God calling out to Adam's body, who answers Him from the earth (see highlighted text in brown below). The Armenian tradition makes an even stronger link by emphasizing the dust, having God call to Adam's body through the dust, and Adam's body telling the dust to answer God.

The dialogue in the Apocalypse begins with God calling out to Adam's body. It continues with Adam's body answering God, and concludes with God repeating the words from Genesis 3:19b (highlighted in blue in the text below), that death is inevitable and that the body will return to dust.

Genesis 3:19

^{19a} ἐν ἰδρώτι τοῦ προσώπου σου φάγη τὸν ἄρτον σου ἕως τοῦ ἀποστρέψαι σε εἰς τὴν γῆν ἐξ ἧς ἐλήμφθης

^{19b} ὅτι γῆ εἶ καὶ εἰς γῆν ἀπελεύσῃ

^{19a} In the sweat of your face you will eat bread **until you return to the earth out of which you were taken,**

^{19b} **For dust you are and unto dust you will return**

Apoc.Mos. 41:1b-2

^{1b} καὶ ἀποκριθὲν τὸ σῶμα ἐκ τῆς γῆς εἶπεν· ἰδοὺ ἐγώ, κύριε.

² καὶ λέγει αὐτῷ ὁ κύριος· εἰπόν σοι ὅτι γῆ, καὶ εἰς γῆν ἀπελεύσει.

^{1b} And **the body answered from the earth** and said: "Here am I, Lord."

² And the Lord said to him,

"I told you **dust you are and unto dust you will return.**

However, God adds that this death is not final since there will be a universal eschatological resurrection (highlighted in red in the text below). The resurrection addition is similar to the interpretation discussed in the "Apocalyptic Literature" section in relation to 2 *Enoch* J32 and *Sibylline Oracles* 8.96-99. This resurrection interpretation is also evident in the *Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers* 3:25-26 and 12:49-50 as discussed in the section "Prayers, Psalms, and Odes."

Gr. 41:1-3	Ar. [48](41):1-3	Ge. [48](41):1-3	Sl. 49-50.1-3
¹ And God called and said, “Adam, Adam.” And <u>the body answered from the earth</u> and said: “Here am I, Lord.”	¹ God called to <u>Adam’s body through the dust</u> and said, “Adam, Adam.” <u>Adam’s body said to the dust</u> , “Answer and say, ‘Here (I am), Lord.’”	¹ Then God turned and called Adam. <u>Adam’s body answered him from the soil and said</u> , “Here I am, [[Lord]].	¹ And the Lord called Adam to himself and said, “Adam, Adam, where are you?” ² And <u>his body answered</u> , “I am here, O Lord,”
² And God said to him: “I told you (that) earth you are and to earth shall you return .	² The Lord said to him, “Behold, just as I said to you, ‘Adam, you are dust and you return to dust ;’	² And the Lord told him, “Behold, as I told you, you are soil and you have returned to the soil ,	^{3a} The Lord said, “So I told you, ‘ You are earth and to the same earth you will return again .’
³ Again I promise to you the Resurrection: I will raise you up in the Resurrection with every man, who is of your seed. ”	³ but I will raise you in the resurrection which [I] promised you. ”	³ but I will raise you up in the resurrection which I have promised you, at the time of resurrection.	^{3b} And at the resurrection, you will rise with all of mankind. ”

It should be noted that this apocalypse does not mention the eschatological judgment of *Targum Pseudo-Jonathan* Gen 3:19 in which everyone will be held responsible for their actions, instead it only emphasizes the universal nature of the eschatological resurrection.

Apocalypse of Moses 43:2-3 || Vita 51:2

The seventh and last resurrection passage in the Books of the *Life of Adam and Eve*, appears in a narrative section which concerns Eve’s funeral (Pericope 35). In this part of the narrative, Michael instructs Seth how to prepare Eve for burial before the angels came for her body to bury her with Adam and Abel. Michael then instructs Seth that this should be the burial practice until the day of the resurrection (highlighted in red in the text below). Both the Apocalypse and the Slavonic traditions mention the souls of the righteous as a separate entity from the body, an aspect also appearing in the *Vita*, which mentions that following the resurrection, the soul and the body of the holy will be

joined together for all eternity, never to be separated again by death (see boxed sections in the parallel texts below).

Gr. 43:2-3	Vita 51:2	Ar. [51](43):2-3	Ge. [51](43):2-3	Sl. 49-50.3-4
<p>²And afterwards Michael spoke to Seth saying: “<u>Lay out in this manner every man that dies until the day of the Resurrection.</u>”</p>		<p>²After this, Michael spoke with Seth and said, “<u>Thus shall you dress every human being who dies, until the day of the end, through the resurrection.</u>”</p>	<p>²And after that, the angel Michael told him, “<u>Thus dress every dead person who dies, until the death of all human beings.</u>”</p>	<p>³And the archangel said to Seth, “<u>So shall you bury every person who dies until the resurrection.</u>”</p>
<p>³And after giving him this rule he said: “Mourn not beyond six days, but on the seventh day, rest and rejoice on it, <u>because</u> on that very day, God and we the angels <u>rejoice with the righteous soul, who has passed away from the earth.</u>”</p>	<p>²Man of God, <u>mourn no longer than 6 days, for the 7th day is the sign of the resurrection, the repose of the coming age, and on the 7th day the Lord rested from all his works.</u> [III+ all his work. Indeed the 8th day is (the sign) of the future and eternal blessedness, in which all the holy will reign throughout endless ages with the Creator and Savior himself, in both soul and body, never again to die Amen.]III</p>	<p>³When the angels had said this to Seth, he ascended to heaven, praising the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit, now and forever.</p>	<p>³When he had taught Seth all that, he ascended to the uppermost heaven, far from Seth, and told him, “Do not mourn for the dead more than five days and on the seventh day rejoice <u>for</u> on that day God rested from all his (works) which the Lord had made.”</p>	<p>⁴Again he said to him, “<u>Arrange a memorial ceremony on the third day and on the ninth and on the twentieth and on the fortieth, and arrange everything in proper order, so that we angels might take joy in it along with the souls of the righteous.</u>”</p>

The variations between the burial practices in these five traditions may reflect the local practice in the region represented by each tradition. The Armenian and Georgian traditions emphasize the importance of dressing the dead before burial. The Apocalypse,

Vita, and the Georgian traditions mention the maximum length of mourning. In the case of the Apocalypse and the *Vita*, mourning should be limited to six days, while the Georgian version limits it to five days (highlighted in blue). The Slavonic tradition does not mention a mourning time, but instead focuses on the need of arranging several memorial ceremonies to celebrate the dead person. The first ceremony takes place on the third day, the second on the ninth day, the third on the twentieth day, and the final ceremony on the fortieth (highlighted in blue). The rationale for this mourning practice is also given in this passage (introduced by word underlined and highlighted in magenta). Both the *Vita* and the Georgian traditions associate the end of the grieving period with the Sabbath rest (highlighted in green), the *Vita* adding that “the 7th day is the sign of the resurrection, the repose of the coming age.” In some of the manuscripts of the *Vita*, the Christian interpolation considers the 8th day as an additional sign to the 7th day, which is the sign of the resurrection. The 8th day is a sign of “the future and eternal blessedness, in which all the holy will reign throughout endless ages with the Creator and Savior himself.”²⁷⁶ The Apocalypse also associates the end of mourning with rest, but unlike the *Vita* and the Georgian traditions, the rest is associated with the joy God and his angels have on that very day for “the righteous soul, who has passed away from the earth” (Apoc. Mos. 43:3). The Slavonic memorial ceremonies are “arranged in proper order, so that the angels might take joy in it along with the souls of the righteous” (Sl. 49-50.4).

²⁷⁶The importance of the 8th day in Christian circles is attested in the Epistle of Barnabas which states: “Your present Sabbaths are not acceptable to Me, but that is which I have made, [namely this,] when, giving rest to all things, I shall make a beginning of the eighth day, that is, a beginning of another world. Wherefore, also, we keep the eighth day with joyfulness, the day also on which Jesus rose again from the dead. And when He had manifested Himself, He ascended into the heavens” (Barnabas, *The Epistle of Barnabas*, 25).

Concluding Remarks

All the resurrection passages appear in the Apocalypse and in a combination of the Armenian, Georgian, and Slavonic textual traditions, while only three of them are recorded in the *Vita*. From the Apocalypse, the reader learns there will be both a universal eschatological resurrection and judgment. Those who have kept themselves from evil will be given access to the Tree of Life, thus, gaining immortality while the unrighteous will be condemned. Upon death, a person will be mourned for no more than six days. On the seventh, “God will rejoice with the righteous soul, who has passed away from the earth.” However, at the resurrection the soul will once more join the body. One of the resurrection passages seems to suggest everyone will be made into holy people through the process of removing the evil heart and replacing it with a heart that understands the good and worships God alone. Thus, they will not sin anymore. It is also suggested that, following the resurrection, they will have full access to the Garden and God will be in their midst. The following table (Table 36) summarizes the death and resurrection view found in the *Apocalypse of Moses*. However, the reader should keep in mind that most of the description in Table 36 relates specifically to Adam, Eve, and the Satan, and as such, the author of the Apocalypse may not have intended all the details to have a universal application.

Table 36. Death and resurrection view derived from the Apocalypse of Moses

Life Ap. Mos. 28:4; 39:1	Death Ap. Mos. 13	Day of Resurrection Ap. Mos. 10:2; 13:3-5; 28:4	Judgment Ap. Mos. 37:5	Reward/ Punishment Ap. Mos. 39:2-3
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - “If you keep yourself from all evil, as one wishing to die, when again the Resurrection has come to pass, I will raise you up” (28:4). - If you had kept my commandments (39:1). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adam’s soul departs with an awesome ascent (13:6). - Adam’s body in the ground until the day of resurrection (41:1-3). - Eve’s body buried in the ground (43:1). - 7th day, the soul of the righteous leaves the earth (43:3) - Adam soul brought to the 3rd Heaven (37:5). <p>=> not a state of non-existence</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All who have sinned will curse me, Eve (10:2). - All the righteous to be given to Paradise, and God shall be in their midst, no more sinners before God, be given ever joy of Paradise, the evil heart shall be given a heart that understands the good and worship God alone (13:3). - Given the three of life => become immortal forever (13:4). - Their joy shall be turned into sorrow, but your sorrow shall be turned into joy (39:2). - Establish Adam on the Throne of Satan (39:2). 	<p>“Fearful day of my reckoning, which I will make in the world” (37:5).</p>	<p>Reward for Adam/the righteous (39:2)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Grief turned into joy. - Adam will regain his rule, and be seated on the throne of his deceiver. - Access to the three of life => immortality (13:4; 28:4) <p>Punishment of the Satan/wicked (39:3)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Be cased down. - Be Condemned. - Shall greatly mourn and weep when they see Adam sitting on the glorious throne.

Pseudo-Philo

Pseudo-Philo refers to the unknown author of the *Biblical Antiquities*, also known as *Liber antiquitatum biblicarum* in Latin, and covers biblical history from Adam to David (Genesis – 1 Samuel). This work belongs to the genre of rewritten Bible and was most likely composed in Hebrew by a Palestinian Jew and later translated into Greek and Latin. Evans notes this work “may have been written as early as the first or even second

century BCE, but most scholars favor a date toward the end of the first century.”²⁷⁷

Harrington considers this work “as a reflection of how Palestinian Jews in the first century A.D. interpreted the Jewish Scriptures, as a source for popular biblical theology of the period and as a repository for motifs and legends that are paralleled or even unique in ancient Jewish literature.”²⁷⁸

Eschatological material appears throughout the book rather than being gathered into one section. This material focuses on what takes place after death, the events related to God’s eschatological visitation, and what comes after. Following is a list of details regarding the “afterlife” and the eschatological elements found in the book.

²⁷⁷Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 49. See also D. J. Harrington, “Pseudo-Philo,” DNTB, 865; idem, “Pseudo-Philo,” OTP, 2:299; Howard Jacobsen, “Pseudo-Philo, Book of Biblical Antiquities,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 1:470.

²⁷⁸Harrington, “Pseudo-Philo,” DNTB, 864.

Afterlife and Eschatological Elements	Textual Reference
Present World / World to Come	Ps.-Philo 3:10; 16:3; 19:7, 13; 32:17; 62:9
Death Sleep	Ps.-Philo 19:2, 6; 28:10; 29:4; 33:6; 35:3
Judgment I - the deeds while living in the present-world determines a person's placement while waiting for the resurrection	Ps.-Philo 44:10
Can not repent after death	Ps.-Philo 33:2-5
Souls of the just => experience peace until the eschatological resurrection	Ps.-Philo 23:13; 28:10; 51:5
Souls of the wicked => experience punishment for their sins until the eschatological resurrection	Ps.-Philo 16:3; 23:6; 31:7; 36:4; 38:4; 44:10; 51:5; 63:4
God will visit the world, which will introduce the age of the world-to-come	Ps.-Philo 3:9; 16:3; 19:12-13, 15; 23:13; 26:12; 48:1
Resurrection/judgment II	Ps.-Philo 3:9-10; 19:12-13; 25:7;
The just will dwell in happiness with God	Ps.-Philo 19:12-13; 23:13
The wicked like Korah and his band will be annihilated	Ps.-Philo 16:3

The most crucial element is the two separate ages, this present-world and the world-to-come, which will be introduced by God recreating heaven and the earth. The author of the *Biblical Antiquities* makes it clear that a person's prospects in the world-to-come is based on his/her decisions in the present-world. Thus there will be no opportunity for repentance following death, nor is it possible to intercede on their behalf. Instead, upon death, the soul parts from the body. Based on this judgment, the soul will either join the souls of the righteous to experience peace, or the souls of the wicked to be punished until God's visitation, the time of the universal resurrection and judgment. The following table (Table 37) shows narrative sections, the textual references to the TaNaKh and Pseudo-Philo, and the eschatological resurrection passages in the *Biblical Antiquities* (as listed in Table 32). The passages alluding to the resurrection are placed in brackets, most of these

use sleep as an analogy for death (Ps.-Philo 19:2, 6; 28:10; 29:4; 33:6; 35:3), suggesting death was regarded as a temporary condition like sleep.²⁷⁹

Table 37. Resurrection statement and allusions in Pseudo-Philo

Subject matter	TaNaKh	Ps.-Philo	Resurrection passages (allusions)
Adam → Joseph	Genesis	1-8	Ps.-Philo 3:9-10
Moses	Exodus Leviticus Numbers Deuteronomy	9-12 13 14-18 19	Ps.-Philo (16:3) Ps.-Philo 19:(2, 6-7), 12-13
Joshua	Joshua	20-24	Ps.-Philo 23:(6), 13
Kenaz	Judges	25-29	Ps.-Philo 25:7; (28:10; 29:4)
Deborah		30-33	Ps.-Philo (31:7); 33:2-5, (6)
Aod → Phinehas		34-48	Ps.-Philo (35:3; 36:4; 38:4; 44:10; 48:1)
Samuel → David	1 Samuel	49-65	Ps.-Philo (51:5; 62:9; 63:4); 64:6-9

The following five clear resurrection passages, Ps.-Philo 3:10; 19:12-13; 25:7; 33:1-3; 64:6-9, will be considered briefly below.

Pseudo-Philo 3:10

The first clear resurrection statement appears in God's promise to Noah following the flood. God promises that he will never again destroy all living creatures together as he had just done with the worldwide flood, "until time is fulfilled" (Ps.-Philo 3:9). However, at the end of the present-world, there will be a universal resurrection including both the righteous and the wicked, who will both be judged. God will judge between soul and

²⁷⁹This figurative language is also used in Daniel 12:2 when describing death and resurrection and is well attested in the New Testament (Matt 27:52; John 11:11; Acts 7:60; 13:36; 1 Cor 7:39; 11:30; 15:6, 18, 20, 51; 1 Thess 4:13–15; 2 Pet 3:4).

flesh, a possible allusion to the tradition appearing in the *Apocryphon of Ezekiel* (see discussion in the “Apocalyptic Literature” above), that for a person to be judged, both his body and soul has to be unified and judged as a whole since it was this united entity that committed both good and evil deeds during the present-age. Those who are pardoned in the judgment will not be tainted. God concludes by declaring “there will be another earth and another heaven, an everlasting dwelling place” for those who were pardoned in the judgment (Ps.-Philo 3:10), using similar language as Isa 65:17 and 66:22. Thus, this resurrection statement also alludes to a future destruction of the present-world, though this passage does not reveal how it will be destroyed. It should also be noted this passage does not reveal the final destination of those who were deemed wicked in the eschatological judgment, nor does it present a clear view on the immortality of the soul question.

This passage uses sleep as an analogy for death and describes the resurrection of the dead as raising “up the sleeping from the earth,” the same concept used in Daniel 12:2. However unlike Daniel, *Biblical Antiquities* describes a universal event. Resurrection is not a reward for the righteous, but rather, the precursor for the eschatological judgment in which everyone will be judged and receive their due. In the resurrection process, “the underworld will pay back its debt, and the place of perdition will return its deposit” using commercial terminology. Following the judgment, the author adds: “death will be extinguished, and the underworld will close its mouth,” describing death as a devouring beast, which will no longer serve a purpose since the righteous will become immortal.

Pseudo-Philo 19:12-13

The second resurrection passage appears in Moses' farewell speech where God promises Moses that his death is not the end, but rather, he will be resurrected. Moses resurrection is mentioned in both the New Testament (Moses and Elijah came to Jesus on the Mount of Transfiguration [Matt 17:3-4; Mark 9:4-5; Luke 9:30-33] and Michael and the devil disputed over Moses dead body [Jude 1:9]) and in Rabbinic Literature (b.Sanh. 90b). More details regarding this eschatological event are provided in the current text. It suggests God himself will visit the world to raise Moses and his fathers from the earth. Like the previous passage, this passage also uses the metaphor of sleep for death, emphasizing the temporary condition of death. Moses will be awoken from his unknown grave and join his fathers to "dwell in the immortal dwelling place that is not subject to time."

Pseudo-Philo 25:7

The third clear resurrection statement is a part of Cenaz's²⁸⁰ speech to the people in which he encourages sinners to confess, referring to the story of how Achan confessed his sins when confronted by Joshua when he had been singled out by God (Josh 7). However, unlike the story of Achan which ended with him and his entire family being stoned to death by the people of Israel and their remains being burnt (Josh 7:25-26), Cenaz suggests that their confession may have an impact on their prospects in the

²⁸⁰Cenaz is presented by Psdeudo-Philo as the first judge of Israel and a major figure. However, in the Book of Judges he is only mentioned briefly as Caleb's youngest brother and the father of Othiel, who, according to the TaNaKh, was the first judge of Israel (Judg 3:9-10).

eschatological judgment. He encourages their confession because “who knows that if you tell the truth to us, even if you die now, nevertheless God will have mercy on you when he will resurrect the dead?” (Ps.-Philo 25:7). Since the death of Achan and his family turned God’s wrath away from the people of Israel, Pseudo-Philo may have speculated that Achan’s confession, although not saving him from an untimely death in the present-world, may have functioned as an atonement, like in Achan’s case. Otherwise what purpose did his confession serve? The possible mercy mentioned by Cenaz may most likely refer to the judgment taking place after the universal resurrection, suggesting that God would accept their confessions and forgive their sins, thereby counting them among the righteous who will receive their reward in the world-to-come.

Pseudo-Philo 33:1-5

The fourth clear resurrection passage appears in Deborah’s farewell speech to the people of Israel, mirroring Joshua’s exhortation to the people before he died (Josh 23-24). She states everyone will die, using the words of Joshua (Josh 23:14), and emphasizes the importance of directing their hearts to the Lord in the present-world, since there will be no chance of repentance following death (Ps.-Philo 33:2). To underscore the latter point, she notes that in the underworld, even if they wanted to commit sins, which is far easier than doing righteous deeds, her listeners would not be able to since “the desire for sinning will cease and the evil impulse will lose its power” (Ps.-Philo 33:3). In other words, when God demands the souls back from the underworld at the time of the eschatological resurrection, they will be in the same state as when he deposited them. A righteous

person deposited in the underworld upon death will still be righteous when resurrected to stand in the eschatological judgment. The same would be true for the wicked. This being the case, Deborah implores the people to obey her voice and amend their ways and put their relationship with God in order while they are still living and there is time.

Upon hearing Deborah's exhortation, according to Pseudo-Philo, the people implored her to pray for them and requested that her soul should be mindful of them forever, after she passed away (Ps.-Philo 33:4). However, Deborah once more reminds them that when a person dies and enters the underworld, they cease to have an impact on others' destinies as they will no longer be able to pray or be mindful of anyone. She concludes by reiterating that the only way the righteous dead can profit, is by making them examples to follow. Her dying words to the people ends with the promise that if they live righteous lives, they "will be like the stars of the heaven" (Ps.-Philo 33:5), a possible allusion to Daniel 12:3. Howard Jacobson notes in the *Sifre* (Deut 10) "that in the future world the faces of the righteous will shine like seven things, and included are the sun, the heaven, and the stars."²⁸¹ This view may be based on Exodus 34:29-35, which describes Moses' face radiating light when returning from God's presence.

²⁸¹Jacobson, "Pseudo-Philo, Book of Biblical Antiquities," 1:554.

Pseudo-Philo 64:6-9

The last clear resurrection passage appears at the end of the *Biblical Antiquities*, in Pseudo-Philo's retelling of the narrative concerning Saul's visit to the Witch of Endor, recorded in 1 Samuel 28:7-20. Following is the two parallel accounts, the section highlighted will be discussed below :

Ps.-Philo 64:5-8

⁵ And when the woman saw Samuel rising up and she saw Saul with him, she shouted out and said, "Behold you are Saul, and why have you deceived me?"

And he said to her, "Do not be afraid, but tell what you have seen." She said, "Behold forty years have passed since I began **raising up the dead for the Philistines**, but such a sight as this has never been seen before nor will it be seen afterward."

⁶ And Saul said to her, "What is his appearance?"

She said, "**You are asking me about divine beings. For behold his appearance is not the appearance of a man. For he is clothed in a white robe with a mantle placed over it, and two angels are leading him.**"

And Saul remembered the mantle that Samuel tore when he was alive, and he struck his hand on the ground and pounded it.

⁷ And **Samuel** said to him, "Why have you disturbed me by raising me up? I thought that the time for being rendered the rewards of my deeds had arrived. And so do not boast, King, nor you, woman; for you have not brought me forth, but that order that **God spoke to me while I was still alive, that I should come and tell you** that you have sinned now a second time in neglecting God. Therefore **after rendering up my soul my bones have been disturbed** so that **I who am dead should tell you what I heard while I was alive.**"

1 Samuel 28:12-19

¹² When the woman saw Samuel, she screamed, and then she asked Saul, "Why did you deceive me? You are Saul!"

¹³ But the king said to her, "Don't be afraid. What do you see?" "I see a spirit form coming up out of the earth," the woman answered.

¹⁴ Then Saul asked her, "What does he look like?" "An old man is coming up," she replied.

"He's wearing a robe."

Then Saul knew that it was Samuel, and he bowed his face to the ground and paid homage.

¹⁵ "Why have you disturbed me by bringing me up?" **Samuel** asked **Saul**.

"I'm in serious trouble," replied **Saul**. "The Philistines are fighting against me and God has turned away from me. He doesn't answer me anymore, either through the prophets or in dreams. So I've called on you to tell me what I should do."

¹⁶ **Samuel** answered, "Since the LORD has turned away from you and has become your enemy, why are you asking me? ¹⁷ The LORD has done exactly what He said through me: The LORD has torn the kingship out of your hand and given it to your neighbor David. ¹⁸ You did not obey the LORD and did not carry out His burning anger against Amalek; therefore the LORD has done this to you today.

¹⁹ The LORD will also hand Israel over to the Philistines along with you. Tomorrow you and your sons will be with me, and the LORD will hand Israel's army over to the Philistines."

⁸Now therefore tomorrow you and your sons will be with me when the people have been delivered into the hands of the Philistines; and because your insides were eaten up with jealousy, what is yours will be taken from you."

When viewing these two accounts side by side it is easy to see the additions and the narrative sections left out by Pseudo-Philo. Both of these accounts concerns the temporary resurrection of the prophet Samuel. Both accounts also state the message Samuel gave to King Saul. However, the concern of Pseudo-Philo is how Samuel could have known what to say to Saul, since he was dead and supposedly did not communicate with God while dead. To solve this problem, Pseudo-Philo suggests that God had already revealed to Samuel what to tell Saul while he was still alive. Therefore, when resurrected, he could give Saul that very message (see text highlighted in blue).

Samuel is also presented as looking different than the dead Philistines that the witch had resurrected during her 40 year long career, stating that she had never seen such as sight nor will she see it again. She describes Samuel as a divine being clothed in a white robe with a mantle placed over it, escorted by two angels. The witch of Endor's

description suggests the righteous dead, when brought back to life, look different than those who are wicked.

The most significant difference between the two accounts are the words spoken by Samuel following the question: “Why have you disturbed me by raising me up?” (Ps.-Philo 64:7 || 1 Samuel 28:15). While in the biblical account, this question opens a dialogue between Samuel and Saul, in the *Biblical Antiquities* it functions more as a rhetorical question, introducing a long monologue by Samuel. In this monologue, Samuel says that it was not due to the powers of Saul nor the witch who had called him back from death, rather, it was solely on God’s order that he had come back to life. Additionally, Samuel states that when he died he had rendered up his soul, but seems a little surprised when he was resurrected. His expectation was that he was being brought to life in the eschatological resurrection to receive his reward in the eschatological judgment, but instead his bones had just been disturbed (Ps.-Philo 64:7, see text highlighted in red).

At the conclusion of the parallel temporary resurrection passage, Samuel reveals to King Saul that he will die together with his sons the following day. Saul’s reaction in these two accounts are quite different. In the biblical account, Saul becomes terrified by the prospect of his eminent death and was not able to eat nor drink. In the *Biblical Antiquities*, Saul is also described as growing faint upon hearing Samuel’s words, yet eventually he embraces his fate stating: “perhaps my destruction will be an atonement for my wickedness,” a possible hint that Saul hoped for a favorable outcome in the eschatological judgment.

Concluding Remarks

The clear resurrection passage in the *Biblical Antiquities* presents a universal eschatological resurrection and judgment. Upon death, the soul leaves the body and enters the first judgment, which decides if the soul will be placed with the righteous or the wicked souls. The righteous souls will experience peace while the wicked souls will be punished as they wait for God's eschatological visitation. At that time, God will resurrect all the dead in order to bring them to the judgment. Those who are deemed righteous will gain eternal life in the world-to-come while those deemed wicked will be annihilated.

Figure 18 illustrates the resurrection concept in Pseudo-Philo.

Fig. 18. Death and Resurrection in Pseudo-Philo.

Lives of the Prophet

The Lives of the Prophet is a Jewish composition most likely written in Greek during the first half of the first century CE, perhaps even predating Jesus' public

ministry.²⁸² Based on the content, the author probably lived in Jerusalem or in the surrounding area due to the great familiarity shown of its geography. This literary work provides insight into the popular religion of the first century, thus the sparse theological views presented could be considered a part of mainstream Judaism.²⁸³ The purpose of the *Lives of the Prophet* is clearly expressed in the opening statement: “The names of the prophets, and where they are from, and where they died and how, and where they lie.”²⁸⁴ The book mentions twenty-three prophets from the TaNaKh, all the literary prophets²⁸⁵ and seven of the nonliterary prophets.²⁸⁶ George Nickelsburg notes in addition to the geographical framework, which in some cases also provides the prophet’s tribal affiliation, “the bulk of the composition is given over to narratives of a decidedly legendary character. Some of these tales are purely extra-biblical and otherwise unattested.”²⁸⁷ Several statements in the *Lives of the Prophets*, reveals a belief in some form of life after death (Liv.Pro. 1:8; 2:4, 19) and alludes to a future judgment (Liv.Pro.

²⁸²Douglas R. A. Hare, “Lives of the Prophets,” DNTB, 653.

²⁸³Ibid.

²⁸⁴Douglas R. A. Hare, “The Lives of the Prophets: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP, 2:385.

²⁸⁵The four major prophets: Isaiah (Liv.Pro. 1:1-13), Jeremiah (Liv.Pro. 2:1-19), Ezekiel (Liv.Pro. 3:1-19) and Daniel (Liv.Pro. 4:1-21), and the Twelve minor prophets: Hosea (Liv.Pro. 5:1-2), Micah (Liv.Pro. 6:1-3), Amos (Liv.Pro. 7:1-3), Joel (8:1-2), Obadiah (Liv.Pro. 9:1-5), Jonah (Liv.Pro. 10:1-11), Nahum (Liv.Pro. 11:1-4), Habakkuk (Liv.Pro. 12:1-13), Zephaniah (Liv.Pro. 13:1-3), Haggai (Liv.Pro. 14:1-2), Zechariah (Liv.Pro. 15:1-6), and Malachi (Liv.Pro. 16:1-4).

²⁸⁶The seven nonliterary prophets mentioned are: Nathan (Liv.Pro. 17:1-4), Ahijah (Liv.Pro. 18:1-5), Joad (Liv.Pro. 19:1-2), Azariah (Liv.Pro. 20:1-2), Elijah (Liv.Pro. 21:1-15), Elisha (Liv.Pro. 22:1-17), and Zechariah son of Jehoiada (Liv.Pro. 23:1-2).

²⁸⁷George W. E. Nickelsburg, “Stories of Biblical and Early Post-Biblical Times,” in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*, ed. Michael Stones, CRINT 2 (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 57.

13:2; 15:5; 21:3), however, there are only two clear eschatological²⁸⁸ resurrection passages in this work (Liv.Pro. 2:11-19; 3:10-12).

Lives of the Prophets 2:15

The first resurrection statement is a part of the Jewish tradition that Jeremiah hid the ark of the covenant before the Babylonian army captured the city of Jerusalem and its Temple and, in this passage (Liv.Pro. 2:11-19); cf. 2 Macc. 2:4-8;), suggests it was swallowed up in a rock. The parallel tradition in 4 Baruch, reveals the ark and the vessels were delivered to the earth by Jeremiah with the aid of his scribe, Baruch (4 Bar. 3:8-20). An earlier version of this tradition has Jeremiah hiding the ark, the tabernacle, and the altar of incense in a cave at Mt. Nebo where God had previously shown Moses the Promised Land before he passed away (2 Macc 2:1-8). According to the *Lives of the Prophets*, the ark will be hidden until the eschatological resurrection: “And in the resurrection the ark will be the first to be resurrected and will come out of the rock and be placed on Mount Sinai, and all the saints will be gathered to it there as they await the Lord and flee from the enemy who wishes to destroy them” (Liv.Pro. 2:15). Apart from a belief in an eschatological resurrection and that all the Saints will gather around it on Mt. Sinai waiting for the Lord fleeing from their persecutors, this text does not reveal much regarding the nature of this resurrection and what will come after.

²⁸⁸There are a couple of references to a temporary bodily resurrection in which a person is resurrected to continue the present life, but will experience death a second time at one point in the future (Liv.Pro. 10:5-6; 21:7 || 1 Kings 17:17-24; Liv.Pro. 22:9-10 || 2 Kings 4:8-37; Liv.Pro. 22:17 || 2 Kings 13:20-21).

Lives of the Prophets 3:12

The second resurrection statement appears in a terrifying warning Ezekiel gave the enemy leaders who wished to destroy the people of Israel. His warning is based on the vision of the Valley of the Bones (Ezek 37:1-14): “‘Are we lost? Has our hope perished?’ and in the wonder of the dead bones he persuaded them that there is hope for Israel both here and in the coming (age)” (Liv.Pro. 3:12). This passage shows a dual understanding of Ezekiel’s vision, giving it both a personal and a corporate interpretation. Thus, it seems Ezekiel would argue that both the nation of Israel and the individual person will have a future. The enemy may think they will be able to defeat or destroy the nation of Israel, however, this will only be a temporary defeat since the nation will have a future in the present age and will be restored. The same is true on a personal level. Individuals are killed, however, through their resurrection, they will have a future in the age to come.

Concluding Remarks

Not much is revealed regarding the eschatological resurrection in the *Life of the Prophets*, but the scant details show that the resurrection hope was a part of mainstream Judaism during the early part of the first century CE, especially due to the non-polemic nature of the resurrection statement which just takes the resurrection belief for granted. It also becomes evident that during this period, Ezekiel 37:1–14 was understood both as a reference to a personal eschatological resurrection and to the restoration of the nation of Israel following the Babylonian captivity.

Ladder of Jacob

The *Ladder of Jacob* has a complex compositional history. Although it is possible that the original was written in Hebrew, Greek seems to be more likely.²⁸⁹ However, it has only survived into the present in Old Church Slavonic as a part of the *Tolkovaja paleja* which contains stories from the TaNaKh with commentaries. H. Lunt notes that “the date and provenance of the Ladder are unknown,” and “the time, place, and shape of the original compilation are controversial.”²⁹⁰ It was probably authored by a first century CE Jew²⁹¹ who wanted to emphasize God’s sovereignty, although chapter seven contains Christian interpolations “concerning the birth of Jesus and also the crucifixion.”²⁹²

Christfried Böttrich suggests the author of this literary work gave Jacob’s dream, recorded in Genesis 28:11-22, an apocalyptic interpretation, adding “that is why it seems plausible to attribute the Ladder of Jacob first of all to the genre of apocalypse.”²⁹³ The ladder of Jacob’s dream is considered a representation of the history of the world stretching from the time of Jacob to the end of time, when his descendants will finally

²⁸⁹Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 51; H. G. Lunt, “Ladder of Jacob: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP, 2:403; Andrei A. Orlov, “The Face as the Heavenly Counterpart of the Visionary in the Slavonic *Ladder of Jacob*,” in *Of Scribes and Sages*, ed. Craig A. Evans (London: T&T Clark/Continuum, 2004), 60-61.

²⁹⁰Lunt, “Ladder of Jacob,” OTP, 2:404.

²⁹¹For a discussion on the Jewish or Christian provenance of this work and dating, see Christfried Böttrich, “Apocalyptic Tradition and Mystical Prayer in the *Ladder of Jacob*,” *JSP* 23, no. 4 (June 2004): 304-305; Orlov, “The Face as the Heavenly Counterpart of the Visionary in the Slavonic *Ladder of Jacob*,” 60-61.

²⁹²Lunt, “Ladder of Jacob,” OTP, 2:402.

²⁹³Böttrich, “Apocalyptic Tradition and Mystical Prayer in the *Ladder of Jacob*,” 294.

possess the promised land and see God's promises spoken to Abraham in Genesis 12:1-3 fulfilled (Lad. Jac. 1:9-11).

Ladder of Jacob 7:21 is the only reference to the resurrection in this composition, in a section with extensive Christian interpolation, or as noted by Lunt, a chapter which should probably "be regarded as an independent work, juxtaposed to the Ladder of Jacob by a Slavic editor of the Palaia."²⁹⁴ This resurrection passage concerns the resurrection of Eve: "And he [Christ] will revive Eve, who died by the fruit of the tree" (Lad. Jac. 7:21). However, this passage does not clearly state when this event will take place, nor the extent of this resurrection, if the resurrection will happen at Christ's first coming, or in a future eschatological event. Also, it does not clearly state if Eve will be resurrected in a unique event, if she will be a part of a universal resurrection, or if this resurrection comes in the context of a judgment. Despite its brevity, the *Ladder of Jacob* still bears witness to a resurrection belief.

4 Baruch

4 Baruch, according to its Greek title, *TA ΠΑΡΑΛΕΙΠΟΜΕΝΑ ΙΕΡΕΜΙΟΥ ΤΟΥ ΠΡΟΦΗΤΟΥ*, contains "things omitted from the Prophet Jeremiah," or, as the Ethiopic title states, "the rest of the words of Baruch."²⁹⁵ Unlike *2 Baruch* and *3 Baruch*, which are

²⁹⁴Lunt, "Ladder of Jacob," 2:402.

²⁹⁵Ken Penner and Michael S. Heiser, "Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology" (Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2008), from "4 Baruch - Title, Summary, Genre" section; and Stephen E. Robinson, "4 Baruch: A Translation and Introduction," OTP, 2:415.

also attributed to Jeremiah's scribe,²⁹⁶ this book, although dependant on *2 Baruch*, falls into the "rewritten Bible" genre instead of *Apocalyptic Literature* since it does not contain a heavenly ascension element.

Stephen Robinson notes there seems to be three redaction levels in this literary work, two of which are Jewish,²⁹⁷ and a third by a Christian redactor,²⁹⁸ who interpolated the concluding section of the book, 4 Baruch 8:12-9:32, and possibly 4 Baruch 6:7, 13, 25,²⁹⁹ into this work following the failed Bar Kokhba revolt (132-136 CE), when "Judaism repudiated much of its apocalyptic tradition and the literature it produced, including *4 Baruch*," and left it to the various Christian communities to preserve it.³⁰⁰ Thus, although *4 Baruch* was probably composed in Hebrew, it only survived into the present time in several non-Semitic versions: Greek, Ethiopic, Armenian, Old Church Slavonic, and Romanian.³⁰¹

²⁹⁶The are four books which are attributed to Baruch – the *Book of Baruch* (*1 Baruch*) is a part of the apocrypha and appears in the Septuagint, while the other three (*2 Baruch*, *3 Baruch*, and *4 Baruch*) are a part of the Pseudepigrapha. *2 Baruch* is discussed in the Apocalyptic section above, since it contains a complex resurrection belief. The *Book of Baruch* and *3 Baruch*, however, do not contain any resurrection material.

²⁹⁷This could explain the shift in main characters of this book from Jeremiah (4 Bar. 1-4) to his scribe, Baruch (4 Bar. 7-8).

²⁹⁸Stephen E. Robinson, "Baruch, Book of 4," *ABD*, 1:622.

²⁹⁹Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 51.

³⁰⁰Robinson, "Baruch, Book of 4," *ABD*, 1:622.

³⁰¹Robinson, "4 Baruch," *OTP*, 2:413-414.

4 Baruch was probably authored by a Jew living in the Jerusalem region, based on his familiarity with the geographical places mentioned.³⁰² The reference to the vineyard or farm of Herod Agrippa I (4 Bar. 3:14, 21; 5:22) would rule out any compositional date prior to 41 CE, when Agrippa took possession of Judea and Samaria. Hence, the topic of the Chaldean destruction of Jerusalem in 4 Baruch 1-4 is best understood as a comment on the cataclysmic events relating to Titus' destruction of the Jewish Temple in Jerusalem in 70 CE.³⁰³ 4 Baruch, as noted by Jens Herzer, "picks up on certain feelings that were important among the Jewish people in the period 117-132 C.E." and the author seems "aware of the seething messianic atmosphere" which inevitably led to the second Jewish revolt.³⁰⁴ The Christian redaction probably took place soon after the failure of the revolt, and *4 Baruch* may have reached its current form by the middle of second century CE, serving as a "vehicle for validating Christian claims."³⁰⁵

Herzer considers the theology of 4 Baruch, with its de-emphasis on the role of a earthly temple as being in line with the Pharisaic wing of Judaism, which succeeded following the destruction of the Temple, and the spiritual-religious reorientation that took place under the leadership of Rabbi Johanan ben Zakkai and his successors in Yavneh,

³⁰²Jens Herzer, *4 Baruch (Paraleipomena Jeremiou)*, WGRW 22 (Atlanta, GA: Society of Biblical Literature, 2005), xxxiv; Robinson, "4 Baruch," OTP, 2:415.

³⁰³Robinson, "4 Baruch," OTP, 2:414.

³⁰⁴Herzer, *4 Baruch*, xxxiv. For further reading regarding the dating of this book, see section "Author, Location, and Date" in Herzer, *4 Baruch*, xxx-xxxvi; Robinson, "4 Baruch," OTP, 2:414; idem., "Baruch, Book of 4," *ABD*, 1:622; and the section regarding "Language, Texts, Date, and Authorship" of 4 Baruch, in Penner and Heiser, "Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology."

³⁰⁵Robinson, "4Baruch," OTP, 2:416.

which secured the survival of Judaism.³⁰⁶ 4 Baruch emphasizes the importance of God's law as the path to salvation, the eschatological resurrection hope associated with said salvation, and the focus on the Heavenly Jerusalem as the future home of the saved (4 Bar. 5:34), thus stressing this salvation can only come on God's initiative (4 Bar. 6:20-21; 8:1-2).³⁰⁷ This eschatological perspective also fits well with the perspective presented by the early Christian Church. The three resurrection passages in this composition are, 4 Baruch 6:6-10, 4 Baruch 7:18, and 4 Baruch 9:12-14. The third passage is in the Christian addition of the book.

4 Baruch 6:6-10

The first resurrection passage appears at the conclusion of the story regarding Abimelech the Ethiopian, who pulled Jeremiah out of the muddy cistern (4 Bar. 3:12 || Jer 38:4-13). Upon learning of the impending destruction of Jerusalem (4 Bar. 1-3), Jeremiah asks God to show Abimelech mercy and protect him from seeing destruction of the city and its desolation (4 Bar. 3:13). God promises Jeremiah that he will shelter Abimelech until God returns the people from exile, provided Jeremiah sends him to the vineyard of Agrippa the following morning (4 Bar. 3:14). He follows God's request and sends Abimelech to the farm to "get a few figs to give to the sick among the people" (4 Bar. 3:21). While picking figs on the farm, Abimelech decided to have a rest and fell into a sixty-six year long sleep (4 Bar. 5:1-2). When he woke up, he thought he had only slept

³⁰⁶Herzer, *4 Baruch*, xxxi-xxxii.

³⁰⁷*Ibid.*, xxxiv.

for a short time and his figs were still dripping milk, but he could not recognize the city of Jerusalem nor find any of his neighbors (4 Bar. 5:4, 7). When Abimelech finally found Baruch and showed him his basket of still “newly picked” sixty-six year old figs, Baruch considered the miraculous preservation of the figs and Abimelech’s awakening as proof of resurrection, representing the “Jewish belief in both personal and corporate resurrection.”³⁰⁸ Baruch states that God rewards those who loves him, and he will raise them in their tabernacles, therefore, they shall believe that they once more will live again (4 Bar. 6:6), he adds:

⁸Look at this basket of figs; for behold, they are sixty-six years old and they have not withered nor do they stink, but they are dripping with milk. ⁹Thus will it be for you, my flesh, if you do the things commanded you by the angel of righteousness. ¹⁰He who preserved the basket of figs, the same one again will preserve you by his power. (4 Bar. 6:8-10)

Robinson comments that the fig is an appropriate symbol for life since it “drips of” milk and is filled with seeds. Interestingly, according to some Jewish traditions, like the *Apocalypse of Moses* 20:4-5, the fig was the forbidden fruit of the Garden of Eden.³⁰⁹

³⁰⁸Penner and Heiser, “Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology,” in the section “4 Baruch: Relevance for Exegesis in Canonical Material.”

³⁰⁹In the Apocalypse, following Eve eating from the forbidden fruit, all the leaves fell from the trees except from the forbidden tree itself, thus, the reason Eve covered herself with fig leaves (see also, b. Ber. 40a; b. Sanh70b). The other potential candidates for the forbidden fruit are: wheat (b. Ber. 40a; b. Sanh70b; Gen. Rab. 15:7); grapes or wine (b. Ber. 40a; b. Sanh70b; Gen. Rab. 15:7; Zohar 1:73a); etrog/citron (Gen. Rab. 15:7), or a unique fruit which was a combination of these fruits (b. Ber. 40a).

4 Baruch 7:18

The second resurrection passage appears in the context of a funeral, officiated by Jeremiah, outside the city with the permission of King Nebuchadnezzar. The party was interrupted by an eagle, which carried a letter from Baruch and Abimelech. Jeremiah gathered together all the people and returned to the eagle to hear the message. At that moment the eagle resurrects the person who was about to be buried as a sign that the nation would be resurrected and they would return from their exile and once more live in Jerusalem. Thus, the second resurrection passage also links a personal and corporate resurrection, although the resurrection taking place in this passage was of a temporary nature, functioning as a type of the eschatological resurrection

4 Baruch 9:12-14

The third resurrection passage appears in the last chapter, the Christianized ending of the book (4 Bar. 8:12-9:32), “where Jeremiah’s ecstatic faint is described in terms reminiscent of the resurrection of Christ.”³¹⁰ Jeremiah’s faint is described by the author as making him become “as one of those who have given up their soul” (4 Bar. 9:7). Both Baruch and Abimelech thought he was dead and started weeping and crying: “woe to us, because our father Jeremiah has left us; the priest of God has departed” (4 Bar. 9:8). However, God told them not to bury him since he was still alive and that his soul would return to his body again (4 Bar. 9:12). Three days later, Jeremiah’s soul returned to his body and his ecstatic faint ended. Before he started to describe to Baruch and Abimelech

³¹⁰Robinson, “4 Baruch,” OTP, 2:416.

what he had seen, Jeremiah praised God saying: “Glorify God with one voice! All (of you) glorify God, and the Son of God who awakens us, Jesus Christ the light of all the aeons, the inextinguishable lamp, the life of faith!” (4 Bar. 9:14).

Jeremiah’s ecstatic faint foreshadows the death and the eschatological resurrection experience. In the same way as Jeremiah’s soul left his tabernacle or body at the beginning of his ecstatic faint, so does the soul of a person leave the body upon death. The Christian redactor mentions that it is Michael, “the archangel of righteousness who opens the gates for the righteous” (4 Bar. 9:5), although it is not clear if this is with regard to the soul of the righteous dead, or the resurrected righteous in the eschatological time. Be that as it may, in the eschatological resurrection, which will be orchestrated by the Son of God (4 Bar. 9:14), the soul will return and will dwell once more in its tabernacle, similarly to how Jeremiah’s soul returned to his body after the three day long ecstatic faint, and the person will return to life.

Concluding Remarks

4 Baruch presents a clear resurrection hope, both on a personal (bodily) and corporate level (the nation of Israel), based on the following three evidences, none of which are based on a biblical argument: the first evidence is Abimelech’s sixty-six year long sleep and the preservation of the harvested figs (4 Bar. 3-6); the second, the resurrection, which took place at the funeral service led by Jeremiah (4 Bar. 7); and the final evidence of Jeremiah’s ecstatic faint (4 Bar. 9). However, 4 Baruch does not show any concern for the period between death and resurrection, nor what will happen to the

wicked. Instead, 4 Baruch reveals that the soul parts from its tabernacle (body) following death, to be reunified at the time of the eschatological resurrection. The resurrection is presented as the reward for those who love God, who will be brought to the Heavenly Jerusalem (4 Bar. 5:34).

History of the Rechabites

James Charlesworth notes it would be “unwise to state the probable original language, date, or provenance of this document until critical editions of the Greek, Syriac, and Ethiopic texts are available,”³¹¹ for the *History of the Rechabites*. However, he notes the title found in MS D (fols. 209r-201v) supports the hypothesis of a Hebrew/Aramaic original, which was later translated into Greek, since it states:

The History of the Blessed Ones, the Sons of the Rechabites, Whose Record Is Recorded by Jeremiah the Prophet When He Said That They Are the Sons of Jonadab, the Son of Rechab, Who Are Inhabitants of the City Jerusalem. It Was Translated from Hebrew into Greek and from Greek into Syriac by the Hands of the Reverend Mar Jacob of Edessa.³¹²

If the original language was indeed Hebrew, the earliest strata of this document was probably authored by a Jew residing in Palestine, while the Christian sections were interpolated into this Jewish document at a later date. Charlesworth remarks that, based on the Greek document, the main body of the book (3-15) seems to have a Jewish provenance probably dated to the first or second century CE, while the introduction (1-2), chapter 16, and the conclusion (19-23) are of a clearly Christian origin and may have

³¹¹J. H. Charlesworth, “History of the Rechabites: A New Translation and Introduction,” OTP, 2:444.

³¹²*Ibid.*, 2:450, n. b.

been added in the third to fourth century.³¹³ However, Chris Knights argues for a Christian provenance for the whole document,³¹⁴ even the self-contained document *Abode of the Blessed* (chapters 11-16) containing the “resurrection” expectation,³¹⁵ which concludes this work “should no longer be classified among the Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament.”³¹⁶

The *History of the Rechabites* records the journey of Zosimus to the island of the Blessed Ones (Hist. Rech. 1:1-3), where he meets the Rechabites who left Jerusalem in the time of Jeremiah (Hist. Rech. 8:1a-10:8 || Jer 35), who live in an Eden-like condition (Hist. Rech. 14:1). Through his conversation with the Rechabites, he gains significant insight regarding death and the afterlife, and the ascent of the soul (Hist. Rech. 14:1a-16:8g).

History of the Rechabites 14:1a-16:8g

In this resurrection passage, it is revealed to Zosimus by the Blessed Ones that “(the soul) discerns and knows the day of its departure through a revelation from holy angels” (Hist. Rech. 15:4), when the angels of God come for the Rechabite’s pure soul (Hist. Rech. 14:2-5). Upon death, the soul parts the body (Hist. Rech. 14:2), in full view of the other members of the community (Hist. Rech. 15:10) and ascends in joy (Hist.

³¹³Ibid., 2:444-445.

³¹⁴Chris H. Knights, “The Rechabites Revisited: The History of the Rechabites Twenty-Five Years Later,” JSP 23, no. 4 (June 2014): 307-320.

³¹⁵Ibid., 309.

³¹⁶Ibid., 318.

Rech. 15:9a), guided by the angels to the highest heaven and brought before God to worship him (Hist. Rech. 16:1, 4). The soul, when leaving the body, is described as appearing in “the likeness of a glorious light, and formed and imprinted in the likeness and type of the body” (Hist. Rech. 15:10). When God raises the soul from its worship he “sends that soul to a stately mansion (to await) the day of resurrection for (the rest of our) community” (Hist. Rech. 16:7). Meanwhile, the body the soul left behind, when it ascended to Heaven, is buried by the angels in a sepulcher (Hist. Rech. 15:7, 8).

Concluding Remarks

This resurrection passage only concerns itself with the final destiny of the Rechabites and not the righteous in general, although it could be expected they would have a similar fate – the soul awaiting resurrection in a stately mansion. Thus, no interest is shown toward the final destiny of the wicked or what will happen to the wicked souls when it parts from the body. The nature of the resurrection is not revealed either, whether it will be limited to the Rechabites, or if it would be universal, including all the righteous and the wicked. This passage does not address what will take place following the resurrection, if the soul will once more unify with the body, where the righteous and the wicked souls will go, and finally, if there will be an eschatological judgment. No scriptural references or allusions are used in support of the resurrection belief in the *History of the Rechabites*, rather, this belief seems to be taken for granted.

Wisdom and Philosophical Literature

There is a strong wisdom tradition in Judaism which originated in the TaNaKh with the Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, Job, Song of Songs, and some Psalms. Unlike the biblical wisdom books, which are primarily associated with Solomon (Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, and Song of Songs), the wisdom literature of the Pseudepigrapha, with the exception of the *Testaments of Solomon*, are not. The books belonging to this category set out to present the best way of life and the ideal to follow, often using Greek philosophical terms and concepts. They also attempt to demonstrate the superiority of the Jewish religion, showing that the teaching of the Greek philosophers is biblical. James Charlesworth notes the generic character and the lack of God's presence in the Pseudepigraphical work as a complicating factor when demarcating unique Jewish aspects in the literature belonging to this category of Second Temple literature.³¹⁷ However, two of the books in this category, *4 Maccabees* and *Pseudo-Phocylides*, contain references to God and a strong faith in a life after death. The following table (Table 38) lists all the "resurrection" and "life-after-death" passages in these two books and they will be addressed in the pages below. *4 Maccabees* emphasizes the immortality of the Soul with little interest in a bodily resurrection, while *Pseudo-Phocylides* presents a tripartite view of human anthropology, body-spirit-soul, with a clear bodily resurrection expectation.

³¹⁷James H. Charlesworth, "Wisdom and Philosophical Literature: Introduction," OTP, 2:476.

Table 38. Wisdom and philosophical literature

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
4 Maccabees	7:18-19	Conquer the passion of the flesh => resurrection	x				?	x
	9:8-9, 22	The reward for virtue	x					x
	10:2-4	“Can not touch my soul”	x					x
	13:9-18	“Our forefathers will receive us”	x					x
	14:4-6	Righteous’ death => immortality	x					x
	15:3-4, 27	Righteous’ death => immortality	x					x
	16:12-13, 25	Righteous’ death => immortality	x					x
	17:4-5	Hope of endurance	x			x		x
	17:11-12, 17-21	Prizes for victory	x					x
	18:3	Martyrs => worthy of the divine portion	x					x
	18:10-23	The Father’s teaching		x	x			x
Pseudo-Phocylides	91-115	Death and afterlife; Immortality of the soul		x		x		x

4 Maccabees

4 Maccabees is a theological-philosophical treaty which appears in the appendix to the Greek Bible, however, it is not counted among the Apocryphical writings (see Table 2). It was originally composed in Greek by a devout Hellenized Jew, most likely from Asia Minor, between 18 and 72 CE.³¹⁸ David deSilva, one of the leading scholars associated with this topic, comments it is difficult to be more specific than this since the composition “is attached to no known author, connected with no known location, tied to

³¹⁸David A. deSilva, “4 Maccabees,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia, PN: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 2363.

no particular occasion, and devoid of references to contemporary events.”³¹⁹ Although in early Church history both Eusebius (*History* 3.10.6) and Jerome (*De viris illustribus* 13; *Dialogus adversus Pelagianos* 2.6) attributed this treaty to Flavius Josephus, deSilva remarks most scholars have rejected this provenance due to “historical inaccuracies, different styles and radically different stances towards accommodation to Gentile culture” than what is found in the writings of Josephus.³²⁰

Scholars have commented that the name 4 Maccabees is a misleading title since this composition neither dates to the Maccabean period nor gives an account of the events which took place during this crucial period in Jewish history, with the exception of the historical setting (4 Macc 3:19-4:26), martyrdom of Eleazar [2 Macc 6 || 4 Macc 5:1-6:30], and the seven sons [2 Macc 7:1-40 || 4 Macc 8:1-12:19], which concludes with the death of the mother of these sons [2 Macc 7:41 || 4 Macc 14:11-17:1]. Both Eusebius (*Hist. eccl.* 3.10.6) and Jerome (*De viris illustribus* 13) gave this work the more fitting title, “Περὶ αὐτοκράτορος λογισμοῦ,” “On the Absolute Power of Reason,” which is more in line with the purpose and context stated in the exordium of the book: “(1) Since I am about to demonstrate a most philosophical statement – that pious reason (ὁ εὐσεβὴς λογισμός) is absolute master of the passion (τῶν παθῶ[v]) – I would rightly counsel you that you should pay close attention to this philosophical inquiry.”³²¹

³¹⁹David A. deSilva, *4 Maccabees*, Septuagint Commentary Series (Leiden: Brill, 2006), xiv.

³²⁰David A. deSilva, “3 and 4 Maccabees,” DNTB, 664.

³²¹Translation provided by deSilva, *4 Maccabees*, 3.

The final example used in this theological-philosophical treaty to show the superior nature of Judaism and the teaching provided by Torah in achieving a virtuous life, to become fully in control of one's passion, "a goal almost universally admired by Greek and Roman ethicist,"³²² is the martyrdom of the seven brothers and their mother (4 Macc 8-18). Their loyalty to God and their Torah-trained reason have given these heroes full control of their passion. So much so that they rather die than comply with Antiochus' (representative of the Hellenistic culture) demands to eat defiling food, which would have been a transgression of the ancestral commands (4 Macc 9:1-2). Apart from the "resurrection" hope stated in the author's reflection following the martyrdom of Eleazar the priest (4 Macc 7:16-23), all the "resurrection" passages in 4 Maccabees appear in this section (4 Macc 8-18), see Table 38 above.

4 Maccabees 7:18-19 || 4 Maccabees 13:17

The first "resurrection" statement in 4 Maccabees appears in the author's concluding remarks regarding the account of Eleazar's torture and death (4 Macc 7:18-19). A similar statement appears in the author's reflection following the martyrdom of the seven brothers (4 Macc 13:17; 16:25). The parallel words in these three passages are highlighted in red, blue, brown and/or bolded and the relevant dying-living aspect has been underlined.

³²²deSilva, "3 and 4 Maccabees," 665.

¹⁸ ἀλλ' ὅσοι τῆς εὐσεβείας
προνοοῦσιν ἐξ ὅλης καρδίας,
οἳ τοι μόνοι δύνανται κρατεῖν
τῶν τῆς σαρκὸς παθῶν.

¹⁹ πιστεύοντες ὅτι θεῷ οὐκ
ἀποθνήσκουσιν, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ οἱ
πατριάρχαι ἡμῶν **Ἀβραὰμ καὶ**
Ἰσαὰκ καὶ Ἰακώβ, ἀλλὰ ζῶσιν
τῷ θεῷ.

¹⁸ But as many as have a care for
piety from the whole heart –
these alone are able to restrain
the passions of the flesh,

¹⁹ trusting that they do not die to
God, just as neither our
patriarchs **Abraham and Isaac**
and Jacob did, but live to God.

¹⁷ οὕτω γὰρ θανόντας ἡμᾶς
Ἀβραὰμ καὶ Ἰσαὰκ καὶ Ἰακώβ
ὑποδέξονται καὶ πάντες οἱ
πατέρες ἐπαινέσουσιν.

¹⁷ For **Abraham and Isaac and**
Jacob will welcome us, and all
the father praise us, for dying in
this way.

²⁵ ἔτι δὲ καὶ ταῦτα εἰδότες ὅτι
οἱ διὰ τὸν θεὸν ἀποθνήσκοντες
ζῶσιν τῷ θεῷ ὥσπερ **Ἀβραὰμ**
καὶ Ἰσαὰκ καὶ Ἰακώβ καὶ
πάντες οἱ πατριάρχαι

²⁵ but also, moreover, with them
knowing these things –that those
dying on account of God
continue to live to God, just as
Abraham and Isaac and Jacob
and all the patriarchs.

In these three texts, the author suggests that the patriarchs, Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob are not dead but alive, extrapolating that Eleazar and the seven brothers (and the mother [4 Macc 17:5]) did not die to God (θεῷ οὐκ ἀποθνήσκουσιν) but instead live to God (ζῶσιν τῷ θεῷ). Thus these heroes will be welcomed (ὑποδέξονται) by the patriarchs and all the fathers will praise them (ἐπαινέσουσιν). The author's reference to the patriarchs in support of a future after death is not unique. The same argument was used by Jesus when making the case for a bodily resurrection in his discussion with the Sadducees (Matt 22:31-32; Mark 12:26-27; Luke 20:37-38), basing it on a grammatical observation in Exodus 3:6. The parallels between 4 Maccabees 7:18-19, Matthew 22:31-32, and Exodus 3:6 have been highlighted to better see the link between these passages. The words highlighted in red appear in all three passages, while the words highlighted in green only

appear in Matthew and Exodus. Jesus' and the author of 4 Maccabees "resurrection" application of Exodus 3:6 is underlined.

4 Maccabees 7:18-19	Matthew 22:31-32 (BGT)	Exodus 3:6 (WTT/BGT)
<p>¹⁸ ἀλλ' ὅσοι τῆς εὐσεβείας προνοοῦσιν ἐξ ὅλης καρδίας, οἳ τοι μόνοι δύνανται κρατεῖν τῶν τῆς σαρκὸς παθῶν.</p> <p>¹⁹ πιστεύοντες ὅτι <u>θεῷ οὐκ ἀποθνήσκουσιν</u>, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ οἱ πατριάρχαι ἡμῶν Ἀβραὰμ καὶ Ἰσαὰκ καὶ Ἰακώβ, <u>ἀλλὰ ζῶσιν τῷ θεῷ</u>.</p>	<p>³¹ περὶ δὲ τῆς ἀναστάσεως τῶν νεκρῶν οὐκ ἀνέγνωτε τὸ ῥηθὲν ὑμῖν ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ λέγοντος·</p> <p>³² Ἐγὼ εἰμι ὁ θεὸς Ἀβραὰμ καὶ ὁ θεὸς Ἰσαὰκ καὶ ὁ θεὸς Ἰακώβ; οὐκ ἔστιν [ὁ] θεὸς νεκρῶν ἀλλὰ ζώντων.</p>	<p>וַיֹּאמֶר אֲנִכִּי אֱלֹהִים אֲבִיךָ אֱלֹהֵי אֲבֹתְךָ אֱלֹהֵי יִצְחָק וְאֱלֹהֵי יַעֲקֹב וַיִּסְתֶּר מִשְׁפָּנִי כִּי יָרָא מַהֲבִישׁ אֶל־הָאֱלֹהִים:</p> <p>καὶ εἶπεν αὐτῷ Ἐγὼ εἰμι ὁ θεὸς τοῦ πατρὸς σου θεὸς Ἀβραὰμ καὶ θεὸς Ἰσαὰκ καὶ θεὸς Ἰακώβ ἀπέστρεψεν δὲ Μωϋσῆς τὸ πρόσωπον αὐτοῦ εὐλαβέιτο γὰρ κατεμβλέψαι ἐνώπιον τοῦ θεοῦ</p>
<p>¹⁸ But as many as have a care for piety from the whole heart – these alone are able to restrain the passions of the flesh,</p> <p>¹⁹ trusting that <u>they do not die to God</u>, just as neither our patriarchs Abraham and Isaac and Jacob did, <u>but live to God</u>.</p>	<p>³¹ Now concerning the resurrection of the dead, haven't you read what was spoken to you by God: ³² I am the God of Abraham and the God of Isaac and the God of Jacob? He is not the God of the dead, <u>but of the living</u>."</p>	<p>And he said, I am the God of thy father, the God of Abraam, and the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob; and Moses turned away his face, for he was afraid to gaze at God.</p>

The "resurrection" application hinges on the word tense used in Exodus 3:6 (boxed phrases). The "I am" statement is in present form in the Septuagint (εἰμι – 1st person singular, present active indicative) and as a nominal clause in Hebrew (אֲנִכִּי אֱלֹהִים

אֲבִיךָ, *I am the God of your fathers*), thus suggesting the patriarchs must still be alive,

since God is still their God, not was nor will become their God sometime in the future.³²³

³²³ A similar grammatical "proof-text" argument in support of a resurrection belief is used by Rabbi Simai: "Whence do we learn resurrection from the Torah? – From the verse, And I also have established my covenant with them, [sc. the Patriarchs] to give them the land of Canaan [Exod 6:4]: '[to give] you' is not said, but 'to give them' [personally]; thus resurrection is proved from the Torah" (b. Sanh. 90b). The only way for this promise to be literally fulfilled is through the Patriarchs bodily resurrection.

The last phrase ζῶσιν τῷ θεῷ, *live to God* (4 Macc 7:19) and its parallel, [θεὸς] ζώντων, *[God] of the living* (Matt 22:32), is a key term used by Paul when describing the new reality experienced by those who have died to their self and have instead embraced a life in Christ (Rom 6:10-11; 14:8; Gal 2:19), who has conquered death (Rom 6:9; 14:9). This is an interesting similarity to the core message of 4 Maccabees, in the same way as Paul emphasizes the importance of dying to self in order to be living to God in Christ (Rom 6:11). The author of 4 Maccabees argues that a person who has gained control over his passion, through God's Torah, can rely on God that they will not die, but live to Him.³²⁴

Comparing the application of Exodus 3:6 by 4 Maccabees 7:18-19 and Matthew 22:31-32, it becomes clear that although the author of 4 Maccabees and Jesus alludes to and uses this passage in support of their "resurrection" hope, the resurrection hope itself is different. While Jesus argues for a bodily resurrection, the author of 4 Maccabees presents a very different view, in which a person is judged and receives his/her eternal destiny at the point of death, leaving no need for an eschatological resurrection and judgment. The remaining "resurrection" passages appear in 4 Maccabees 8-18 (see Table 38 above).

³²⁴This is very similar to the theological perspective voiced by Sirach and in rabbinic literature that each person is born with two inclinations, a good and an evil, with the necessity of the latter to be controlled by the former, and where the Torah functions as the "antidote" against uncontrolled passion, and will help a person gain full control over his/her evil desire. For further reading, see: Joseph Jacobs, "Yezer ha-ra," *JE* 12:601-602.

4 Maccabees 8-18

The dialogues and the author's comments and exhortations in the martyr account of the seven sons and their mother have been greatly expanded from the much older account in 2 Maccabees 7, from one chapter in 2 Maccabees to 11 chapters in 4 Maccabees. Table 39 shows the nature and the extent of this expansion. It should be noted that the mother's two speeches between the death of her sixth and seventh son in 2 Maccabees (2 Macc 7:20-23, 27-29) is missing in 4 Maccabees. However, the mother plays an important part in the five chapter long philosophical remark (4 Macc 14:11-15:32 and 18:6-9) towards the end of 4 Maccabees (4 Macc 13:1-18:19). This additional theological-philosophical element in 4 Maccabees provides not only the "moral" of the martyrdom story but it also serves as the climax and the ultimate example in support of the thesis put forth in the introduction of the book.

To get a better impression of the differences between these two accounts of the martyrdom of the seven sons and their mother, the parallel texts below show these two accounts. The core issue of eating defiled food has been underlined in the text, while the references to the ancestral laws are highlighted in green. The dialogues given by the brothers and the mother (introduced the first time in pink) are highlighted in blue, while references to the future hope are highlighted in red.

Table 39. Outline of 2 Maccabees 7 and 4 Maccabees 8-18

	2 Maccabees 7	4 Maccabees 8-18
Introduction	7:1-2	8:1-9:10
1 st Brother	7:3-6	9:11-25
2 nd Brother	7:7-9	9:26-32
3 rd Brother	7:10-12	10:1-11
4 th Brother	7:13-14	10:12-21
5 th Brother	7:15-17	11:1-12
6 th Brother	7:18-19	11:13-27
Mother's Speech I	7:20-23	—
7 th Brother Mother's Speech II 7 th Brother	7:24-26 7:27-29 7:30-40	12:1-19
Theological-philosophical Remark Example of Mother Philosophical Remark Mother's words to her sons Their Father's teaching	—	13:1-14:10 14:11-15:32 16:1-18:5 18:6-9 18:10-19
Conclusion	7:41-42	18:20-24

¹It happened also that seven brothers and their mother were arrested and were being compelled by the king, under torture with whips and thongs, to partake of unlawful swine's flesh. ²One of them, acting as their spokesman, said, **"What do you intend to ask and learn from us? For we are ready to die rather than transgress the laws of our ancestors."**

8:1 For this is why even the very young, by following a philosophy in accordance with devout reason, have prevailed over the most painful instruments of torture. ²For when the tyrant was conspicuously defeated in his first attempt, being unable to compel an aged man to eat defiling foods [2 Macc 6:21-20], then in violent rage he commanded that others of the Hebrew captives be brought, and that any who ate defiling food would be freed after eating, but if any were to refuse, they would be tortured even more cruelly. ³When the tyrant had given these orders, seven brothers-- handsome, modest, noble, and accomplished in every way-- were brought before him along with their aged mother. ⁴When the tyrant saw them, grouped about their mother as though a chorus, he was pleased with them. And struck by their appearance and nobility, he smiled at them, and summoned them nearer and said, ⁵"Young men, with favorable feelings I admire each and every one of you, and greatly respect the beauty and the number of such brothers. Not only do I advise you not to display the same madness as that of the old man who has just been tortured, but I also exhort you to yield to me and enjoy my friendship. ⁶Just as I am able to punish those who disobey my orders, so I can be a benefactor to those who obey me. ⁷Trust me, then, and you will have positions of authority in my government if you will renounce the ancestral tradition of your national life. ⁸Enjoy your youth by adopting the Greek way of life and by changing your manner of living. ⁹But if by disobedience you rouse my anger, you will compel me to destroy each and every one of you with dreadful punishments through tortures. ¹⁰Therefore take pity on yourselves. Even I, your enemy, have compassion for your youth and handsome appearance. ¹¹Will you not consider this, that if you disobey, nothing remains for you but to die on the rack?" ¹²When he had said these things, he ordered the instruments of torture to be brought forward so as to persuade them out of fear to eat the defiling food. ¹³When the guards had placed before them wheels and joint-dislocators, rack and hooks and catapults and caldrons, braziers and thumbscrews and iron claws and wedges and bellows, the tyrant resumed speaking: ¹⁴"Be afraid, young fellows; whatever justice you revere will be merciful to you when you transgress under compulsion." ¹⁵But when they had heard the inducements and saw the dreadful devices, not only were they not afraid, but they also opposed the tyrant with their own philosophy, and by their right reasoning nullified his tyranny. ¹⁶Let us consider, on the other hand, what arguments might have been used if some of them had been cowardly and unmanly. Would they not have been the following? ¹⁷"O wretches that we are and so senseless!

Since the king has summoned and exhorted us to accept kind treatment if we obey him, ¹⁸why do we take pleasure in vain resolves and venture upon a disobedience that brings death? ¹⁹O men and brothers, should we not fear the instruments of torture and consider the threats of torments, and give up this vain opinion and this arrogance that threatens to destroy us? ²⁰Let us take pity on our youth and have compassion on our mother's age; ²¹and let us seriously consider that if we disobey we are dead! ²²Also, divine justice will excuse us for fearing the king when we are under compulsion. ²³Why do we banish ourselves from this most pleasant life and deprive ourselves of this delightful world? ²⁴Let us not struggle against compulsion or take hollow pride in being put to the rack. ²⁵Not even the law itself would arbitrarily put us to death for fearing the instruments of torture. ²⁶Why does such contentiousness excite us and such a fatal stubbornness please us, when we can live in peace if we obey the king?" ²⁷But the youths, though about to be tortured, neither said any of these things nor even seriously considered them. ²⁸For they were contemptuous of the emotions and sovereign over agonies, ²⁹so that as soon as the tyrant had ceased counseling them to eat defiling food, all with one voice together, as from one mind, said:

9:1 "Why do you delay, O tyrant? For we are ready to die rather than transgress our ancestral commandments; ²we are obviously putting our forebears to shame unless we should practice ready obedience to the law and to Moses our counselor. ³Tyrant and counselor of lawlessness, in your hatred for us do not pity us more than we pity ourselves. ⁴For we consider this pity of yours, which insures our safety through transgression of the law, to be more grievous than death itself. ⁵You are trying to terrify us by threatening us with death by torture, as though a short time ago you learned nothing from Eleazar. ⁶And if the aged men of the Hebrews because of their religion lived piously while enduring torture, it would be even more fitting that we young men should die despising your coercive tortures, which our aged instructor also overcame. ⁷Therefore, tyrant, put us to the test; and if you take our lives because of our religion, do not suppose that you can injure us by torturing us. ⁸For we, through this severe suffering and endurance, shall have the prize of virtue and shall be with God, on whose account we suffer; ⁹but you, because of your bloodthirstiness toward us, will deservedly undergo from the divine justice eternal torment by fire." ¹⁰When they had said these things, the tyrant was not only indignant, as at those who are disobedient, but also infuriated, as at those who are ungrateful.

³The king fell into a rage, and gave orders to have pans and caldrons heated.

⁴These were heated immediately, and he commanded that the tongue of their

spokesman be cut out and that they scalp him and cut off his hands and feet, while the rest of the brothers and the mother looked on. ⁵When he was utterly helpless, the king ordered them to take him to the fire, still breathing, and to fry him in a pan. The smoke from the pan spread widely, but the brothers and their mother encouraged one another to die nobly, saying, ⁶**"The Lord God is watching over us and in truth has compassion on us, as Moses declared in his song that bore witness against the people to their faces, when he said, 'And he will have compassion on his servants' [Deut 32:36]."**

⁷After the first brother had died in this way, they brought forward the **second** for their sport. They tore off the skin of his head with the hair, and asked him, "Will you eat rather than have your body punished limb by limb?" ⁸He replied in the language of his ancestors and said to them, **"No."** Therefore he in turn underwent tortures as the first brother had done. ⁹And when he was at his last breath, he said, **"You accursed wretch, you dismiss us from this present life, but the King of the universe will raise us up to an everlasting renewal of life, because we have died for his laws."**

¹¹Then at his command the guards brought forward the **eldest**, and having torn off his tunic, they bound his hands and arms with thongs on each side. ¹²When they had worn themselves out beating him with scourges, without accomplishing anything, they placed him upon the wheel. ¹³When the noble youth was stretched out around this, his limbs were dislocated, ¹⁴and with every member disjointed he denounced the tyrant, saying, ¹⁵**"Most abominable tyrant, enemy of heavenly justice, savage of mind, you are mangling me in this manner, not because I am a murderer, or as one who acts impiously, but because I protect the divine law."** ¹⁶And when the guards said, **"Agree to eat** so that you may be released from the tortures," ¹⁷he replied, **"You abominable lackeys, your wheel is not so powerful as to strangle my reason. Cut my limbs, burn my flesh, and twist my joints; ¹⁸through all these tortures I will convince you that children of the Hebrews alone are invincible where virtue is concerned."** ¹⁹While he was saying these things, they spread fire under him, and while fanning the flames they tightened the wheel further. ²⁰The wheel was completely smeared with blood, and the heap of coals was being quenched by the drippings of gore, and pieces of flesh were falling off the axles of the machine. ²¹Although the ligaments joining his bones were already severed, the courageous youth, worthy of Abraham, did not groan, ²²**but as though transformed by fire** [Mal 3:2-3] **into immortality**, he nobly endured the rackings. ²³**"Imitate me, brothers,"** he said. **"Do not leave your post in my struggle or renounce our courageous family ties. ²⁴Fight the sacred and noble battle for religion. Thereby the just Providence of our ancestors may become merciful to our nation and take vengeance on the accursed tyrant."** ²⁵When he had said this, the saintly youth broke the thread of life.

²⁶While all were marveling at his courageous spirit, the guards brought in the **next eldest**, and after fitting themselves with iron gauntlets having sharp hooks, they bound him to the torture machine and catapult. ²⁷Before torturing him, they inquired if he were willing to eat, and they heard his noble decision. ²⁸These leopard-like beasts tore out his sinews with the iron hands, flayed all his flesh up to his chin, and tore away his scalp. But he steadfastly endured this agony and said, ²⁹**"How sweet is any kind of death for the religion of our ancestors!"** ³⁰To the tyrant he said, **"Do you not think, you most savage tyrant, that you are being tortured more than I, as you see the arrogant design of your tyranny being defeated by our endurance for the sake of religion? ³¹I lighten my pain by the joys that come from virtue, ³²but you suffer torture by the**

come from impiety. You will not escape, you most abominable tyrant, the judgments of the divine wrath."

¹⁰After him, the **third** was the victim of their sport. When it was demanded, he quickly put out his tongue and courageously stretched forth his hands, ¹¹and said nobly, **"I got these from Heaven, and because of his laws I disdain them, and from him I hope to get them back again."** ¹²As a result the king himself and those with him were astonished at the young man's spirit, for he regarded his sufferings as nothing.

¹³After he too had died, they maltreated and tortured the **fourth** in the same way. ¹⁴When he was near death, he said, **"One cannot but choose to die at the hands of mortals and to cherish the hope God gives of being raised again by him. But for you there will be no resurrection to life!"**

¹⁵Next they brought forward the **fifth** and maltreated him. ¹⁶But he looked at the king, and said, **"Because you have authority among mortals, though you also are mortal, you do what you please. But do not think that God has**

10:1 When he too had endured a glorious death, the **third** was led in, and many repeatedly urged him to save himself by tasting the meat. ²But he shouted, **"Do you not know that the same father begot me as well as those who died, and the same mother bore me, and that I was brought up on the same teachings?"** ³**I do not renounce the noble kinship that binds me to my brothers."** ⁴ ⁵Enraged by the man's boldness, they disjoined his hands and feet with their instruments, dismembering him by prying his limbs from their sockets, ⁶ and breaking his fingers and arms and legs and elbows. ⁷Since they were not able in any way to break his spirit, they abandoned the instruments and scalped him with their fingernails in a Scythian fashion. ⁸They immediately brought him to the wheel, and while his vertebrae were being dislocated by this, he saw his own flesh torn all around and drops of blood flowing from his entrails. ⁹When he was about to die, he said, ¹⁰**"We, most abominable tyrant, are suffering because of our godly training and virtue, ¹¹but you, because of your impiety and bloodthirstiness, will undergo unceasing torments."**

¹²When he too had died in a manner worthy of his brothers, they dragged in the **fourth**, saying, ¹³"As for you, do not give way to the same insanity as your brothers, but obey the king and save yourself." ¹⁴But he said to them, **"You do not have a fire hot enough to make me play the coward. ¹⁵No – by the blessed death of my brothers, by the eternal destruction of the tyrant, and by the everlasting life of the pious, I will not renounce our noble family ties. ¹⁶Contrive tortures, tyrant, so that you may learn from them that I am a brother to those who have just now been tortured."** ¹⁷When he heard this, the bloodthirsty, murderous, and utterly abominable Antiochus gave orders to cut out his tongue. ¹⁸But he said, **"Even if you remove my organ of speech, God hears also those who are mute. ¹⁹See, here is my tongue; cut it off, for in spite of this you will not make our reason speechless. ²⁰Gladly, for the sake of God, we let our bodily members be mutilated. ²¹God will visit you swiftly, for you are cutting out a tongue that has been melodious with divine hymns."**

11:1 When he too died, after being cruelly tortured, the **fifth** leaped up, saying, ²**"I will not refuse, tyrant, to be tortured for the sake of virtue. ³ I have come of my own accord, so that by murdering me you will incur punishment from the heavenly justice for even more crimes. ⁴ Hater of virtue, hater of humankind, for what**

forsaken our people. ¹⁷Keep on, and see how his mighty power will torture you and your descendants!"

act of ours are you destroying us in this way? ⁵Is it because we revere the Creator of all things and live according to his virtuous law? ⁶ But these deeds deserve honors, not tortures." ⁷ ⁸ ⁹While he was saying these things, the guards bound him and dragged him to the catapult; ¹⁰they tied him to it on his knees, and fitting iron clamps on them, they twisted his back around the wedge on the wheel, so that he was completely curled back like a scorpion, and all his members were disjointed. ¹¹In this condition, gasping for breath and in anguish of body, ¹²he said, "Tyrant, they are splendid favors that you grant us against your will, because through these noble sufferings you give us an opportunity to show our endurance for the law."

¹⁸After him they brought forward the **sixth**. And when he was about to die, he said, "Do not deceive yourself in vain. For we are suffering these things on our own account, because of our sins against our own God. Therefore astounding things have happened. ¹⁹But do not think that you will go unpunished for having tried to fight against God!"

¹³When he too had died, the **sixth**, a mere boy, was led in. When the tyrant inquired whether he was willing to eat and be released, he said, ¹⁴"I am younger in age than my brothers, but I am their equal in mind. ¹⁵Since to this end we were born and bred, we ought likewise to die for the same principles. ¹⁶So if you intend to torture me for not eating defiling foods, go on torturing!" ¹⁷When he had said this, they led him to the wheel. ¹⁸He was carefully stretched tight upon it, his back was broken, and he was roasted from underneath. ¹⁹To his back they applied sharp spits that had been heated in the fire, and pierced his ribs so that his entrails were burned through. ²⁰While being tortured he said, "O contest befitting holiness, in which so many of us brothers have been summoned to an arena of sufferings for religion, and in which we have not been defeated! ²¹For religious knowledge, O tyrant, is invincible. ²²I also, equipped with nobility, will die with my brothers, ²³and I myself will bring a great avenger upon you, you inventor of tortures and enemy of those who are truly devout. ²⁴We six boys have paralyzed your tyranny. ²⁵Since you have not been able to persuade us to change our mind or to force us to eat defiling foods, is not this your downfall? ²⁶Your fire is cold to us, and the catapults painless, and your violence powerless. ²⁷For it is not the guards of the tyrant but those of the divine law that are set over us; therefore, unconquered, we hold fast to reason."

²⁰The **mother** was especially admirable and worthy of honorable memory. Although she saw her seven sons perish within a single day, she bore it with good courage because of her hope in the Lord. ²¹She encouraged each of them in the language of their ancestors. Filled with a noble spirit, she reinforced her woman's

reasoning with a man's courage, and said to them, ²²"I do not know how you came into being in my womb. It was not I who gave you life and breath, nor I who set in order the elements within each of you. ²³Therefore the Creator of the world, who shaped the beginning of humankind and devised the origin of all things, will in his mercy give life and breath back to you again, since you now forget yourselves for the sake of his laws."

²⁴Antiochus felt that he was being treated with contempt, and he was suspicious of her reproachful tone. The **youngest brother** being still alive, Antiochus not only appealed to him in words, but promised with oaths that he would make him rich and enviable if he would turn from the ways of his ancestors, and that he would take him for his Friend and entrust him with public affairs. ²⁵Since the young man would not listen to him at all, **the king called the mother** to him and urged her to advise the youth to save himself. ²⁶After much urging on his part, she undertook to persuade her son. ²⁷But, leaning close to him, she spoke in their native language as follows, deriding the cruel tyrant: "My son, have pity on me. I carried you nine months in my womb, and nursed you for three years, and have reared you and brought you up to this point in your life, and have taken care of you. ²⁸I beg you, my child, to look at the heaven and the earth and see everything that is in them, and recognize that God did not make them out of things that existed. And in the same way the human race came into being. ²⁹Do not fear this butcher, but prove worthy of your brothers. Accept death, so that in God's mercy I may get you back again along with your brothers."

12:1 When he too, thrown into the caldron, had died a blessed death, the **seventh** and youngest of all came forward. ²Even though the tyrant had been vehemently reproached by the brothers, he felt strong compassion for this child when he saw that he was already in fetters. He summoned him to come nearer and tried to persuade him, saying, ³"You see the result of your brothers' stupidity, for they died in torments because of their disobedience. ⁴You too, if you do not obey, will be miserably tortured and die before your time, ⁵but if you yield to persuasion you will be my friend and a leader in the government of the kingdom." ⁶When he had thus appealed to him, **he sent for the boy's mother** to show compassion on her who had been bereaved of so many sons and to influence her to persuade the surviving son to obey and save himself. ⁷**But when his mother had exhorted him in the Hebrew language, as we shall tell a little later,** ⁸he said, "Let me loose, let me speak to the king and to all his friends that are with him." ⁹Extremely pleased by the boy's declaration, they freed him at once. ¹⁰Running to the nearest of the braziers, ¹¹he said, "You profane tyrant, most impious of all the wicked, since you have received good things and also your kingdom from God, were you not ashamed to murder his servants and torture on the wheel those who practice religion? ¹²Because of this, justice has laid up for you intense and eternal fire and tortures, and these throughout all time will never let you go. ¹³As a man, were you not ashamed, you most savage beast, to cut out the tongues of men who have feelings like yours and are made of the same elements as you, and to maltreat and torture them in this way? ¹⁴Surely they by dying nobly fulfilled their service to God, but you will wail bitterly for having killed without cause the contestants for virtue." ¹⁵Then because he too was about to die, he said, ¹⁶"I do not desert the excellent example of my brothers, ¹⁷and I call on the God of our ancestors to be merciful to our nation; ¹⁸but on you he will take vengeance both in his present life

³⁰While she was still speaking, the **young man** said, "What are you waiting for? I will not obey the king's command, but I obey the command of the law that was given to our ancestors through Moses. ³¹But you, who have contrived all sorts of evil against the Hebrews, **will certainly not escape the hands of God.** ³²For we are suffering because of our own sins. ³³And if our living Lord is angry for a little while, to rebuke and discipline us, he will again be reconciled with his own servants. ³⁴But you, unholy wretch, you most defiled of all mortals, do not be elated in vain and puffed up by uncertain hopes, when you raise your hand against the children of heaven. ³⁵**You have not yet escaped the judgment of the almighty, all-seeing God.** ³⁶For our brothers after enduring a brief suffering **have drunk of ever-flowing life, under God's covenant; but you, by the judgment of God, will receive just punishment for your arrogance.** ³⁷I, like my brothers, give up body and life for the laws of our ancestors, appealing to God to show mercy soon to our nation and by trials and plagues to make you confess that he alone is God, ³⁸and through me and my brothers to bring to an end the wrath of the Almighty that has justly fallen on our whole nation." ³⁹The king fell into a rage, and handled him worse than the others, being exasperated at his scorn. ⁴⁰So he died in his integrity, putting his whole trust in the Lord.

and when you are dead." ¹⁹After he had uttered these imprecations, he flung himself into the braziers and so ended his life.

13:1 Since, then, the seven brothers despised sufferings even unto death, everyone must concede that devout reason is sovereign over the emotions. ²For if they had been slaves to their emotions and had eaten defiling food, we would say that they had been conquered by these emotions. ³But in fact it was not so. Instead, by reason, which is praised before God, they prevailed over their emotions. ⁴The supremacy of the mind over these cannot be overlooked, for the brothers mastered both emotions and pains. ⁵How then can one fail to confess the sovereignty of right reason over emotion in those

who were not turned back by fiery agonies? ⁶For just as towers jutting out over harbors hold back the threatening waves and make it calm for those who sail into the inner basin, ⁷so the seven-towered right reason of the youths, by fortifying the harbor of religion, conquered the tempest of the emotions. ⁸For they constituted a holy chorus of religion and encouraged one another, saying, ⁹**"Brothers, let us die like brothers for the sake of the law; let us imitate the three youths in Assyria who despised the same ordeal of the furnace. ¹⁰Let us not be cowardly in the demonstration of our piety."** ¹¹While one said, **"Courage, brother,"** another said, **"Bear up nobly,"** ¹²and another reminded them, **"Remember whence you came, and the father by whose hand Isaac would have submitted to being slain for the sake of religion."** ¹³Each of them and all of them together looking at one another, cheerful and undaunted, said, **"Let us with all our hearts consecrate ourselves to God, who gave us our lives, and let us use our bodies as a bulwark for the law. ¹⁴Let us not fear him who thinks he is killing us, ¹⁵for great is the struggle of the soul and the danger of eternal torment lying before those who transgress the commandment of God. ¹⁶Therefore let us put on the full armor of self-control, which is divine reason. ¹⁷For if we so die, Abraham and Isaac and Jacob will welcome us, and all the fathers will praise us."** ¹⁸Those who were left behind said to each of the brothers who were being dragged away, **"Do not put us to shame, brother, or betray the brothers who have died before us."** ¹⁹You are not ignorant of the affection of family ties, which the divine and all-wise Providence has bequeathed through the fathers to their descendants and which was implanted in the mother's womb. ²⁰There each of the brothers spent the same length of time and was shaped during the same period of time; and growing from the same blood and through the same life, they were brought to the light of day. ²¹When they were born after an equal time of gestation, they drank milk from the same fountains. From such embraces brotherly-loving souls are nourished; ²²and they grow stronger from this common nurture and daily companionship, and from both general education and our discipline in the law of God. ²³Therefore, when sympathy and brotherly affection had been so established, the brothers were the more sympathetic to one another. ²⁴Since they had been educated by the same law and trained in the same virtues and brought up in right living, they loved one another all the more. ²⁵A common zeal for nobility strengthened their goodwill toward one another, and their concord, ²⁶because they could make their brotherly love more fervent with the aid of their religion. ²⁷But although nature and companionship and virtuous habits had augmented the affection of family ties, those who were left endured for the

sake of religion, while watching their brothers being maltreated and tortured to death.

14:1 Furthermore, they encouraged them to face the torture, so that they not only despised their agonies, but also mastered the emotions of brotherly love. ²O reason, more royal than kings and freer than the free! ³O sacred and harmonious concord of the seven brothers on behalf of religion! ⁴None of the seven youths proved coward or shrank from death, ⁵but all of them, **as though running the course toward immortality**, hastened to death by torture. ⁶Just as the hands and feet are moved in harmony with the guidance of the mind, so those holy youths, as though moved by an immortal spirit of devotion, agreed to go to death for its sake. ⁷O most holy seven, brothers in harmony! For just as the seven days of creation move in choral dance around religion, ⁸so these youths, forming a chorus, encircled the sevenfold fear of tortures and dissolved it. ⁹Even now, we ourselves shudder as we hear of the suffering of these young men; they not only saw what was happening, not only heard the direct word of threat, but also bore the sufferings patiently, and in agonies of fire at that. ¹⁰What could be more excruciatingly painful than this? For the power of fire is intense and swift, and it consumed their bodies quickly. ¹¹Do not consider it amazing that reason had full command over these men in their tortures, since the mind of woman despised even more diverse agonies, ¹²for the mother of the seven young men bore up under the rackings of each one of her children. ¹³Observe how complex is a mother's love for her children, which draws everything toward an emotion felt in her inmost parts. ¹⁴Even unreasoning animals, as well as human beings, have a sympathy and parental love for their offspring. ¹⁵For example, among birds, the ones that are tame protect their young by building on the housetops, ¹⁶and the others, by building in precipitous chasms and in holes and tops of trees, hatch the nestlings and ward off the intruder. ¹⁷If they are not able to keep the intruder away, they do what they can to help their young by flying in circles around them in the anguish of love, warning them with their own calls. ¹⁸And why is it necessary to demonstrate sympathy for children by the example of unreasoning animals, ¹⁹since even bees at the time for making honeycombs defend themselves against intruders and, as though with an iron dart, sting those who approach their hive and defend it even to the death? ²⁰But sympathy for her children did not sway the mother of the young men; she was of the same mind as Abraham.

15:1 O reason of the children, tyrant over the emotions! O religion, more desirable to the mother than her children!

²Two courses were open to this mother, **that of religion**,

and that of preserving her seven sons for a time, as the tyrant had promised. ³She loved religion more, the religion that preserves them for eternal life according to God's promise. ⁴In what manner might I express the emotions of parents who love their children? We impress upon the character of a small child a wondrous likeness both of mind and of form. Especially is this true of mothers, who because of their birth pangs have a deeper sympathy toward their offspring than do the fathers. ⁵Considering that mothers are the weaker sex and give birth to many, they are more devoted to their children. ⁶The mother of the seven boys, more than any other mother, loved her children. In seven pregnancies she had implanted in herself tender love toward them, ⁷and because of the many pains she suffered with each of them she had sympathy for them; ⁸yet because of the fear of God she disdained the temporary safety of her children. ⁹Not only so, but also because of the nobility of her sons and their ready obedience to the law, she felt a greater tenderness toward them. ¹⁰For they were righteous and self-controlled and brave and magnanimous, and loved their brothers and their mother, so that they obeyed her even to death in keeping the ordinances. ¹¹Nevertheless, though so many factors influenced the mother to suffer with them out of love for her children, in the case of none of them were the various tortures strong enough to pervert her reason. ¹²But each child separately and all of them together the mother urged on to death for religion's sake. ¹³O sacred nature and affection of parental love, yearning of parents toward offspring, nurture and indomitable suffering by mothers! ¹⁴This mother, who saw them tortured and burned one by one, because of religion did not change her attitude. ¹⁵She watched the flesh of her children being consumed by fire, their toes and fingers scattered on the ground, and the flesh of the head to the chin exposed like masks. ¹⁶O mother, tried now by more bitter pains than even the birth pangs you suffered for them! ¹⁷O woman, who alone gave birth to such complete devotion! ¹⁸When the firstborn breathed his last, it did not turn you aside, nor when the second in torments looked at you piteously nor when the third expired; ¹⁹nor did you weep when you looked at the eyes of each one in his tortures gazing boldly at the same agonies, and saw in their nostrils the signs of the approach of death. ²⁰When you saw the flesh of children burned upon the flesh of other children, severed hands upon hands, scalped heads upon heads, and corpses fallen on other corpses, and when you saw the place filled with many spectators of the torturings, you did not shed tears. ²¹Neither the melodies of sirens nor the songs of swans attract the attention of their hearers as did the voices of the children in torture calling to their mother. ²²How great and how many torments the mother then suffered as her sons

were tortured on the wheel and with the hot irons! ²³But devout reason, giving her heart a man's courage in the very midst of her emotions, strengthened her to disregard, for the time, her parental love. ²⁴**Although she witnessed the destruction of seven children and the ingenious and various rackings, this noble mother disregarded all these because of faith in God.** ²⁵For as in the council chamber of her own soul she saw mighty advocates – nature, family, parental love, and the rackings of her children – ²⁶this mother held two ballots, one bearing death and the other deliverance for her children. ²⁷She did not approve the deliverance that would preserve the seven sons for a short time, ²⁸but as the daughter of God-fearing Abraham she remembered his fortitude. ²⁹O mother of the nation, vindicator of the law and champion of religion, who carried away the prize of the contest in your heart! ³⁰O more noble than males in steadfastness, and more courageous than men in endurance! ³¹Just as Noah's ark, carrying the world in the universal flood, stoutly endured the waves, ³²so you, O guardian of the law, overwhelmed from every side by the flood of your emotions and the violent winds, the torture of your sons, endured nobly and withstood the wintry storms that assail religion.

16:1 If, then, a woman, advanced in years and mother of seven sons, endured seeing her children tortured to death, it must be admitted that devout reason is sovereign over the emotions. ²Thus I have demonstrated not only that men have ruled over the emotions, but also that a woman has despised the fiercest tortures. ³The lions surrounding Daniel were not so savage, nor was the raging fiery furnace of Mishaël so intensely hot, as was her innate parental love, inflamed as she saw her seven sons tortured in such varied ways. ⁴But the mother quenched so many and such great emotions by devout reason. ⁵Consider this also: If this woman, though a mother, had been fainthearted, she would have mourned over them and perhaps spoken as follows: ⁶"O how wretched am I and many times unhappy! After bearing seven children, I am now the mother of none! ⁷O seven childbirths all in vain, seven profitless pregnancies, fruitless nurturings and wretched nursings! ⁸In vain, my sons, I endured many birth pangs for you, and the more grievous anxieties of your upbringing. ⁹Alas for my children, some unmarried, others married and without offspring. I shall not see your children or have the happiness of being called grandmother. ¹⁰Alas, I who had so many and beautiful children am a widow and alone, with many sorrows. ¹¹And when I die, I shall have none of my sons to bury me." ¹²Yet that holy and God-fearing mother did not wail with such a lament for any of them, nor did she dissuade any of them from dying, nor did she grieve as they were dying. ¹³On the contrary, **as though having a mind**

like adamant and giving rebirth for immortality to the whole number of her sons, she implored them and urged them on to death for the sake of religion. ¹⁴O mother, soldier of God in the cause of religion, elder and woman! By steadfastness you have conquered even a tyrant, and in word and deed you have proved more powerful than a man. ¹⁵For when you and your sons were arrested together, you stood and watched Eleazar being tortured, and said to your sons in the Hebrew language, ¹⁶"My sons, noble is the contest to which you are called to bear witness for the nation. Fight zealously for our ancestral law. ¹⁷For it would be shameful if, while an aged man endures such agonies for the sake of religion, you young men were to be terrified by tortures. ¹⁸Remember that it is through God that you have had a share in the world and have enjoyed life, ¹⁹and therefore you ought to endure any suffering for the sake of God. ²⁰For his sake also our father Abraham was zealous to sacrifice his son Isaac [Gen 22:10], the ancestor of our nation; and when Isaac saw his father's hand wielding a knife and descending upon him, he did not cower. ²¹Daniel the righteous was thrown to the lions [Dan 6], and Hananiah, Azariah, and Mishael were hurled into the fiery furnace and endured it for the sake of God [Dan 3]. ²²You too must have the same faith in God and not be grieved. ²³It is unreasonable for people who have religious knowledge not to withstand pain." ²⁴By these words the mother of the seven encouraged and persuaded each of her sons to die rather than violate God's commandment. ²⁵**They knew also that those who die for the sake of God live to God, as do Abraham and Isaac and Jacob and all the patriarchs [Exod 3:6].**

17:1 Some of the guards said that when she also was about to be seized and put to death she threw herself into the flames so that no one might touch her body. ²O mother, who with your seven sons nullified the violence of the tyrant, frustrated his evil designs, and showed the courage of your faith! ³Nobly set like a roof on the pillars of your sons, you held firm and unswerving against the earthquake of the tortures. ⁴Take courage, therefore, O holy-minded mother, maintaining firm an enduring hope in God. ⁵The moon in heaven, with the stars, does not stand so august as you, who, **after lighting the way of your star-like seven sons to piety, stand in honor before God and are firmly set in heaven with them [Dan 12:3?].** ⁶For your children were true descendants of father Abraham. ⁷If it were possible for us to paint the history of your religion as an artist might, would not those who first beheld it have shuddered as they saw the mother of the seven children enduring their varied tortures to death for the sake of religion? ⁸Indeed it would be proper to inscribe on their

tomb these words as a reminder to the people of our nation: ⁹"Here lie buried an aged priest and an aged woman and seven sons, because of the violence of the tyrant who wished to destroy the way of life of the Hebrews. ¹⁰They vindicated their nation, looking to God and enduring torture even to death." ¹¹Truly the contest in which they were engaged was divine, ¹²for on that day virtue gave the awards and tested them for their endurance. **The prize was immortality in endless life.** ¹³Eleazar was the first contestant, the mother of the seven sons entered the competition, and the brothers contended. ¹⁴The tyrant was the antagonist, and the world and the human race were the spectators. ¹⁵**Reverence for God was victor and gave the crown to its own athletes.** ¹⁶Who did not admire the athletes of the divine legislation? Who were not amazed? ¹⁷The tyrant himself and all his council marveled at their endurance, ¹⁸because of which they now stand before the divine throne and live the life of eternal blessedness. ¹⁹For Moses says, "All who are consecrated are under your hands." [Deut 33:3] ²⁰These, then, who have been consecrated for the sake of God, are honored, not only with this honor, but also by the fact that because of them our enemies did not rule over our nation, ²¹the tyrant was punished, and the homeland purified – they having become, as it were, a ransom for the sin of our nation. ²²And through the blood of those devout ones and their death as an atoning sacrifice, divine Providence preserved Israel that previously had been mistreated. ²³For the tyrant Antiochus, when he saw the courage of their virtue and their endurance under the tortures, proclaimed them to his soldiers as an example for their own endurance, ²⁴and this made them brave and courageous for infantry battle and siege, and he ravaged and conquered all his enemies.

18:1 O Israelite children, offspring of the seed of Abraham, obey this law and exercise piety in every way, ²knowing that devout reason is master of all emotions, not only of sufferings from within, but also of those from without. ³Therefore those who gave over their bodies in suffering for the sake of religion were not only admired by mortals, **but also were deemed worthy to share in a divine inheritance.** ⁴Because of them the nation gained peace, and by reviving observance of the law in the homeland they ravaged the enemy. ⁵**The tyrant Antiochus was both punished on earth and is being chastised after his death.** Since in no way whatever was he able to compel the Israelites to become pagans and to abandon their ancestral customs, he left Jerusalem and marched against the Persians. ⁶The **mother** of seven sons expressed also these principles to her children: ⁷**"I was a pure virgin and did not go outside my father's house; but I guarded the rib from**

which woman was made [Gen 2:22]. ⁸No seducer corrupted me on a desert plain, nor did the destroyer, the deceitful serpent [Gen 3:1-7], defile the purity of my virginity. ⁹In the time of my maturity I remained with my husband, and when these sons had grown up their father died. A happy man was he, who lived out his life with good children, and did not have the grief of bereavement. ¹⁰While he was still with you, he taught you **the law and the prophets**. ¹¹He read to you about Abel slain by Cain [Gen 4:8], and Isaac who was offered as a burnt offering [Gen 22], and about Joseph in prison [Gen 39:7-23]. ¹²He told you of the zeal of Phinehas [Num 25:7-13], and he taught you about Hananiah, Azariah, and Mishael in the fire [Dan 3]. ¹³He praised Daniel in the den of the lions [Dan 6] and blessed him. ¹⁴He reminded you of the scripture of Isaiah, which says, 'Even though you go through the fire, the flame shall not consume you' [Isa 43:2]. ¹⁵He sang to you songs of the psalmist David, who said, 'Many are the afflictions of the righteous' [Ps 34:19 (LXX, 33:20)]. ¹⁶He recounted to you Solomon's proverb, 'There is a tree of life for those who do his will' [Prov 3:18]. ¹⁷He confirmed the query of Ezekiel, 'Shall these dry bones live?' [Ezek 37:2-3] ¹⁸For he did not forget to teach you the song that Moses taught, which says, ¹⁹'I kill and I make alive: this is your life and the length of your days.' [Deut 32:39, 47; 30:20]"

²⁰O bitter was that day – and yet not bitter – when that bitter tyrant of the Greeks quenched fire with fire in his cruel caldrons, and in his burning rage brought those seven sons of the daughter of Abraham to the catapult and back again to more tortures, ²¹pierced the pupils of their eyes and cut out their tongues, and put them to death with various tortures.

²²**For these crimes divine justice pursued and will pursue the accursed tyrant. ²³But the sons of Abraham with their victorious mother are gathered together into the chorus of the fathers, and have received pure and immortal souls from God,** ²⁴to whom be glory forever and ever. Amen.

⁴¹Last of all, the mother died, after her sons. ⁴²Let this be enough, then, about the eating of sacrifices and the extreme tortures.

Reading these two accounts of the seven brothers and their mother, it becomes apparent that the author of 4 Maccabees has taken some liberties when using this account to serve his theological-philosophical goal rather than attempting to giving a “historically-accurate” account of the events and dialogues that took place. This being the case, it also brings into question the historical accuracy of the dialogues in 2 Maccabees 7. Could the

author of 2 Maccabees also have been driven by a larger theological agenda which would have shaped his account of the events? Is it even possible for a theological-philosophical text to be completely historically accurate? Would the theological-philosophical argument be weakened if the author treats the account of the events too freely? Does it even matter if the events and the dialogues described by the author even took place?

The most significant difference between these two versions of the story is the view of the afterlife. The following table (Table 40) outlines the view presented in 2 Maccabees 7 and 4 Maccabees 8-18. It is organized according to the dialogues, blue highlights the reward of the martyr/righteous while red highlights the destiny of the tyrant/wicked.

Table 40. The final destiny of the righteous and the wicked in 2 Maccabees 7 and 4 Maccabees 8-18

	2 Maccabees 7	4 Maccabees 8-18
	Martyrs/Righteous vs. Tyrant/Wicked	Martyrs/Righteous vs. Tyrant/Wicked
Introduction		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Because of our religion, do not suppose that you can injure us by torturing us (9:7) • They will gain the prize of virtue and be with God (9:8) • Eternal torment by fire (9:9)
1 st Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compassion on his servants (v.6) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Martyrdom => immortality (9:22)
2 nd Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will be raised up to an everlasting renewal of life (v. 9) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will be judged and receive the divine wrath (9:32)
3 rd Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I hope to get my limbs back again (v. 11) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Their body can be tortured but the soul can not be touched (10:4) • Will undergo unceasing torments (10:11)
4 th Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will be raised by God again (v. 14a) • No resurrection to life for the wicked (v. 14b) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Everlasting life of the pious (10:15b) • Eternal destruction (10:15a)
5 th Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • God's mighty power will torture you and your descendants (v. 17) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will incur punishment from the heavenly justice for the crimes (11:3)
6 th Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Don't think God will not punish those who has tried to fight him (v. 19) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The brother himself will bring a great avenger upon him if killed (11:23)
Mother's Speech I	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • God in his mercy will give life and breath back to her sons (v. 23) 	
Mother's speech II 7 th Brother	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In God's mercy she may get him and her other sons back again (v. 29) • The brothers have drunk of ever-flowing life (v. 36) • Will certainly not escape the hands of God (v. 31) • Not escape the judgment of the almighty all-seeing God (v. 35) • By the judgment of God, he will receive just punishment for his arrogance (v. 36) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Justice has laid up for him an intense and eternal fire and tortures, and these throughout all times will never let him go (12:12) • God will take vengeance both in this present life and when dead (12:18)

Table 40 – Continued

	2 Maccabees 7	4 Maccabees 8-18
	Martyrs/Righteous vs. Tyrant/Wicked	Martyrs/Righteous vs. Tyrant/Wicked
Philosophical Remarks		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If they so die, Abraham and Isaac and Jacob will welcome them, and all the fathers will praise them (13:17) • Running the course toward immortality (14:5) • Religion that preserves them for eternal life according to God's promise (15:3) • She disregarded all these deaths because of faith in God (15:24) • Giving rebirth for immortality imploring them onto death (16:13) • Those who die for the sake of God live to God, as do Abraham and Isaac and Jacob and all the patriarchs (16:25) • Star-like seven sons to piety stand in honor before God and are firmly set in heaven with them (17:5) • Prize was immortality in endless life (17:12) • Reverence for God was victory and gave the crown to its own athletes (17:15) • Deemed worthy to share in a divine inheritance (18:3) • Great struggle of the soul and the danger of eternal torment lying before those who transgress the commandment of God (13:15) • Punished on earth and is being chastised after his death (18:5)
Conclusion		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gathered together into the chorus of the fathers, and have received pure and immortal souls from God (18:23) • Divine justice pursued and will pursue the accursed tyrant (18:22)

Comparing these two accounts of the final destiny of the righteous and the wicked, it becomes clear that the main emphasis of the author of 4 Maccabees seems to be the reward in store for the righteous (see the Introduction and Philosophical Remark

section). Similarly, it should also be noted that the mother's two speeches in 2 Maccabees 7 also focuses on the reward in store for the righteous.

The most significant change relevant for this study is the systematic modification made to the dialogues, turning the martyrdom account in 2 Maccabees from a bodily resurrection text into an account which has no need for a resurrection since the soul of the righteous and the wicked receives its deserved destiny upon death. Hugh Anderson observes: "His [the author's] espousal of the Greek doctrine of the immortality of the soul is clear-cut and striking; he consistently omits the passages in his primary source, 2 Maccabees, that testify unreservedly to the Jewish belief in the resurrection of the body (7:9, 11, 14, 22f.)."³²⁵

In the introduction section of this martyr account (4 Macc 8:1-9:10), the author makes plain the two destinies in store for everyone when he states:

If you can take our lives for the sake of our religion, do not think you can harm us with your torments. By our suffering and endurance we shall obtain the prize of virtue and shall be with God, on whose account we suffer. But you, because of our foul murder, will suffer at the hand of divine justice the everlasting torment by fire you deserve (4 Macc 9:7-9).

The author is clear that this life is not all there is, death is not final, and those who are righteous will receive their reward and be with God while those who are wicked will be tormented by an everlasting fire. This is the main framework of God's theodicy. The other "resurrection" passages expand and add a few more details.

Commenting on the torture sequence of the first brother, the author may have had the refiner's fire on the day of judgment (Mal 3:2-3) in mind when stating that this

³²⁵Hugh Anderson, "4 Maccabees: A New Translation and Introduction," *OTP* 2:539.

brother was stoic throughout the torture “as though he were being transformed into incorruption by the fire” (4 Macc 9:22). This suggests that the transition from this life to life after death will be instantaneous, which is further supported by the author’s report that instead of being filled with grief by the death of her sons, the mother “implored them and urged them on to death for the sake of religion” as if she was “giving rebirth for immortality to the whole number of her sons” (4 Macc 16:13). She saw only two roads before her sons (4 Macc 15:2, 26) – one would give them instant deliverance, but would be short-lived, since it would ultimately lead to eternal death (4 Macc 15:3, 27), while the other would uphold piety but would lead to instant death. However, this road would preserve them “to eternal life according to God’s word” (4 Macc 15:3).

Several passages liken the trials experienced by the martyrs to a race in which a great reward is in store for them if they persevere (4 Macc 9:8; 14:5, 6; 17:12; 18:3, 23), one of these states: “but all, as though running on the highway to immortality, hurried on to death by torture . . . as if impelled by the deathless soul of piety” (4 Macc 14:5, 6). The author also notes that “the world and the life of men were the spectators” (4 Macc 17:14).³²⁶ Others passages emphasize the invulnerable nature of the soul of the righteous. The tyrant may think he can harm them (4 Macc 9:7; 13:14), but they can not touch their

³²⁶A similar image is used by Paul, and he writes: “²⁴Don’t you know that the runners in a stadium all race, but only one receives the prize? Run in such a way to win the prize. ²⁵Now everyone who competes exercises self-control in everything. However, they do it to receive a crown that will fade away, but we a crown that will never fade away. ²⁶Therefore I do not run like one who runs aimlessly or box like one beating the air. ²⁷Instead, I discipline my body and bring it under strict control, so that after preaching to others, I myself will not be disqualified” (1 Cor 9:24-27, CSB). Paul is also referring to the Apostles as becoming “a spectacle to the world and to angels and to men” (1 Cor 4:9).

soul (4 Macc 10:4) since they will be receiving the reward of immortality (4 Macc 9:8; 13:17).³²⁷

The author's celebration of the mother notes that her "hope of endurance is secure with God (4 Macc 17:4), likening her to the moon in heaven among her starlike sons (4 Macc 17:5), an image alluded to Daniel 12:3 (see highlighted words in red).

4 Maccabees 17:5

οὐχ οὕτως σελήνη κατ' οὐρανὸν σὺν ἄστροις
σεμνὴ καθέστηκεν ὥς σὺ τοὺς ἰσαστέρους ἐπὶ τὰ
παῖδας φωταγωγήσασα πρὸς τὴν εὐσέβειαν
ἔντιμος καθέστηκες θεῶ καὶ ἐστήρισαι σὺν αὐτοῖς
ἐν οὐρανῷ

Not so much has the moon in heaven among **the stars** been made to stand as revered as you, who lit the path toward piety for the seven star-like children, have been made to stand honored in God's presence and firmly fixed with them **in the heavens**.

Daniel 12:3

καὶ οἱ συνιέντες φανοῦσιν ὥς φωστῆρες τοῦ
οὐρανοῦ καὶ οἱ κατισχύοντες τοὺς λόγους μου
ὥσθι **τὰ ἄστρα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ** εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα τοῦ
αἰῶνος

And the wise shall shine as the brightness of the firmament, and *some* of the many righteous as **the stars of heaven** for ever and ever.

This statement fully acknowledges the role she played in helping her sons by "lighting the way of piety" for them, thus she will also be honored by God by being "firmly set in heaven" (4 Macc 17:5).

The author of 4 Maccabees notes that the endurance, demonstrated by the brothers during their torment, even impressed the tyrant. Their perseverance and loyalty to God's Torah gave them victory "on account of which they now stand before the divine throne and live throughout the blessed eternity" (4 Macc 17:18). This assurance of a life after death is supported by quoting Deuteronomy 33:3 (highlighted in red):

³²⁷Jesus had a similar view, noting a person should not fear those who can kill the body, but only he who can kill the soul and body in Gehenna (Matt 10:28; Luke 12:5-6).

¹⁷ αὐτός γέ τοι ὁ τύραννος καὶ ὅλον τὸ συμβούλιον ἐθαύμασαν αὐτῶν τὴν ὑπομονήν ¹⁸ δι' ἣν καὶ τῷ θεῷ νῦν παρεστήκασιν θρόνῳ καὶ τὸν μακάριον βιοῦσιν αἰῶνα ¹⁹ καὶ γὰρ φησιν ὁ Μωυσῆς καὶ πάντες οἱ ἡγιασμένοι ὑπὸ τὰς χεῖράς σου ²⁰ καὶ οὗτοι οὖν ἁγιασθέντες διὰ θεὸν τετίμηνται οὐ μόνον ταύτῃ τῇ τιμῇ ἀλλὰ καὶ τῷ δι' αὐτοὺς τὸ ἔθνος ἡμῶν τοὺς πολεμίους μὴ ἐπικρατῆσαι ²¹ καὶ τὸν τύραννον τιμωρηθῆναι καὶ τὴν πατρίδα καθαρισθῆναι ὥσπερ ἀντίψυχον γεγονότας τῆς τοῦ ἔθνους ἁμαρτίας

¹⁷ Even the tyrant himself and the whole council admired their moral excellence and endurance, ¹⁸ on account of which they now stand before the divine throne and live throughout the blessed eternity. ¹⁹ For indeed Moses says, “**And all the sanctified are under your hand.**” ²⁰ And they themselves, then, having been sanctified {on account of God} have been honored not only with this honor, but also in that, on account of them, the enemies did not conquer our nation, ²¹ and the tyrant was punished, and the homeland purified, they having become, as it were, a life-in-exchange for the sin of the nation

καὶ ἐφείσατο τοῦ λαοῦ αὐτοῦ καὶ πάντες οἱ ἡγιασμένοι ὑπὸ τὰς χεῖράς σου καὶ οὗτοι ὑπὸ σέ εἰσιν καὶ ἐδέξατο ἀπὸ τῶν λόγων αὐτοῦ

And he spared his people, **and all his sanctified ones are under thy hands**; and they are under thee; and he received of his words

The author notes that all God’s sanctified are in His hands, supporting the claim that the brothers are now with God. Importantly, their death is also viewed as having a redemptive function for the people of Israel. Their righteous death prevented their nation from being conquered, the tyrant was punished, and their homeland was purified. Their deaths functioned as an atonement for the sins of the nations. Thus, he states: “they have become, as it were, a life-in-exchange for the sin of the nation” (4 Macc 17:21).

Mother’s Speech to Her Sons

In the mother’s speech to her sons (4 Macc 18:6-19), she expresses key life principles and provides a summary of the crucial teaching her deceased husband had taught them from the Law and the Prophets while growing up, which would be of special

comfort to them now when they were facing martyrdom. The first part of her husband's teaching (4 Macc 18:10-13) contains a list of six examples from the Law and the book of Daniel, which have great relevancy for the situation they were facing. The table below (Table 41) lists the six examples with a suggested explanation for how this specific narrative could be helpful to keep.

Table 41. Helpful examples to remember (4 Maccabees 18:11-13)

v.11	Abel slain by Cain	Gen 4:1-6, 8	Abel represents the pious whose gift is accepted by God. This story also represents the hostility experienced by those who please God, which may even lead to death.
	Isaac, offered as a burnt offering	Gen 22:1-19	Isaac was willing to be sacrificed as a burnt offering, in order to be loyal to God. God saved his life and gained the promises.
	Joseph in prison	Gen 39:7-23; 40:3	Joseph refused to commit adultery which ultimately led to his imprisonment. However, he was later greatly rewarded by God.
v.12	Zeal of Phineas	Num 25:6-13	Phineas actively addressed the problem of idolatry and assimilation among the people of Israel thereby ending God's wrath. God blessed him by giving him and his descendants the priesthood.
	Hananiah, Azariah, and Mishael in the fire	Dan 3:1-30	Daniel's friends would rather die than worship an idol (Dan 3:18). They were loyal to God in the face of certain death. God saved them miraculously and they received great rewards from the king.
v.13	Daniel in the lion's den	Dan 6:1-28	Daniel continued to bring his requests to God despite the prohibition that only the king could receive such requests. He was willing to die in order to stay loyal to God. God saved him and he was richly rewarded by the king.

The Second part of her husband’s teaching gives a list of five quotes from the Septuagint. deSilva observes that this list of quotations is not random. He writes, “The order of the quotations appears to be not haphazard but highly significant, as the author builds up a ‘case’ on the strength of written authorities that would support a person facing, and choosing, endurance of hardship for the sake of covenant loyalty.”³²⁸ A casual reader will note that these texts support the view of an afterlife. The author of this dissertation is indebted to deSilva’s more detailed discussion of these five quotations, the following brief comments summarize his main observations.³²⁹ To help the reader better see the immediate context of these five quotes, the quoted section of the verse is highlighted in red, while words missing from the quoted verse are highlighted in blue. The first link in the chain is Isaiah 43:2.

4 Maccabees 18:14

ὑπεμίμνησκεν δὲ ὑμᾶς καὶ τὴν Ἡσαιου γραφὴν
τὴν λέγουσαν **Κἂν διὰ πυρὸς διέλθῃς, φλόξ οὐ
κατακαύσει σε.**

And he would call to mind also the writings of
Isaiah that says, **“Even if you pass through fire,
a flame will not consume you.”**

Isaiah 43:2

καὶ ἐὰν διαβαίνῃς δι’ ὕδατος μετὰ σοῦ εἰμι καὶ
ποταμοὶ οὐ συγκλύσουσίν σε **καὶ ἐὰν διέλθῃς διὰ
πυρὸς οὐ μὴ κατακαυθῇς φλόξ οὐ κατακαύσει σε**

And if thou pass through water, I am with thee;
and the rivers shall not overflow thee: **and if thou
go through fire, thou shalt not be burned; the
flame shall not burn thee.**

It should be noted that the author of 4 Maccabees has made some subtle changes to the quoted text. The most obvious change is the words that are left out, which are marked in blue. A second difference is the word order, the words διὰ πυρός, through fire, in the phrase διέλθῃς διὰ πυρός in Isaiah has been changed to διὰ πυρὸς διέλθῃς in 4

³²⁸deSilva, *4 Maccabees*, 260.

³²⁹For a detailed discussion of these five quotations, see Ibid., 260-265.

Maccabees, possibly for the sake of emphasis. This verse recalls the fifth example in the first part of the husband's teaching (4 Macc 18:12), regarding Hananiah, Azariah, and Mishael who were faced with certain death by an all consuming fire, yet, by God's direct intervention, they walked through the fire without being burned and survived. Afterwards they received great rewards from the pagan king. Thus, the mother of the seven sons, by recollecting their father's teaching, ensures them that if they stay loyal to God, they will also be saved "from the fire and be preserved for eternal life in God's presence."³³⁰

deSilva concludes with this comment on the first link: "The catena, then, begins with a verse that acknowledges the reality of the fiery trials that come even upon the faithful, but also gives assurance that, in some sense, those fiery trials do not threaten the ultimate integrity of the faithful person's being, which is kept by God."³³¹

The second link in the chain is Psalms 34:20 which also makes an association with the first part of the father's teaching. Isaac, Joseph, Hananiah, Azariah, Mishael and Daniel were all faced with trials, which confronted them with a life or death situation. However, they were all delivered by God from their dire situations.

4 Maccabees 18:15

τὸν ὑμνογράφον ἐμελῶδει ὑμῖν Δαυὶδ λέγοντα
Πολλὰ αἱ θλίψεις τῶν δικαίων.

He would sing to you David the psalmist who said,
"Many are the trials of the just."

Psalm 34:20

πολλὰ αἱ θλίψεις τῶν δικαίων καὶ ἐκ πασῶν
αὐτῶν ῥύσεται αὐτούς

Many are the afflictions of the righteous: but
out of them all Lord will deliver them.

³³⁰Ibid., 261.

³³¹Ibid.

Although the author of 4 Maccabees does not cite the entire verse, most devout Jews of that period would probably have been able to finish this stanza of the psalm in their minds: “but out of them all Lord will deliver them.”³³² Psalm 34 presents a God of justice, who will deliver the righteous and will punish and destroy the wicked by erasing all memory of them upon the earth (Ps. 34:16), a very comforting message indeed to a person who is facing an imminent death by the hands of the wicked. deSilva makes the following important observation: “This logic leads the listener to firmly anticipate God’s rescue of the righteous in one form (temporal safety) or another (reward beyond death), explicating God as the source of the guarantee made by Isaiah (the rescue from fire) and thereby focusing attention on maintaining one’s relationship with God inviolable as the path to deliverance.”³³³

The third link in the chain is Proverbs 3:18 which describes Wisdom as a tree of life (ξύλον ζωῆς) for those who possesses her.

³³²It is interesting to note that the proceeding verse promises that: “He protects all his bones; not one of them is broken,” something which did not prove to be true in the case of the seven sons. This illustrates that although the overall message of the Psalm may fit the author’s agenda, some of the specific details may not, and are thus ignored. In some way, this comes close to a proof-text approach to the Scriptures. Reapplying and claiming promises given to someone else in a different situation, but brings some comfort to the person claiming the promise. deSilva considers this lack of fear that this verse could destroy the promise in verse 20 as an indication that the readers had no problem considering the fulfillment of this promise as something that could take place after death. Thus, demonstrating a strong belief in life beyond death (deSilva, *4 Maccabees*, 263).

³³³Ibid., 262.

τὸν Σαλωμῶντα ἐπαροιμίαζεν ὑμῖν λέγοντα
**Ξύλον ζωῆς ἐστὶν τοῖς ποιοῦσιν αὐτοῦ τὸ
 θέλημα.**

He made proverbial [the saying of] Solomon, who
 said **“There [or, He] is a tree of life for the ones
 who keep doing His will.”**

ξύλον ζωῆς ἐστι πᾶσι τοῖς ἀντεχομένοις αὐτῆς
 καὶ τοῖς ἐπηρειδομένοις ἐπ’ αὐτήν ὡς ἐπὶ κύριον
 ἀσφαλῆς

She is a tree of life to all that lay hold upon her;
 and she is *a* secure *help* to all that stay themselves
 on her, as on the Lord.

The phrase “a tree of life,” ξύλον ζωῆς, appears only in one additional passage apart from the two cases quoted above, in Revelation 22:2, which describes the New Jerusalem in the World to Come. It should be noted that the definite version of this phrase, “the tree of life,” τὸ ξύλον τῆς ζωῆς (Gen 2:9; Rev 22:14) and τοῦ ξύλου τῆς ζωῆς (Gen 3:22, 24; Isa 65:22; Rev 2:7; 22:19) also appear in either the Eden Narrative (Gen 2-3) or when describing the New Jerusalem and the New Earth. Apart from Genesis 2:9, the focus of the Eden Narrative is that humans should not have access to it due to their rebellion, however, one of the rewards for the righteous is to regain access to it. Therefore, there is a strong association between the wisdom in Proverbs 3:18 and the tree of life in the Garden of Eden and in the New Jerusalem. In the larger context of Proverbs 3 and the introduction of the book, a strong association is made between following God’s instruction and fearing God and gaining wisdom: “The fear of the Lord is the beginning of wisdom” (Prov 1:7, LXE). The association between wisdom and adhering to God’s Torah is already seen in the Wisdom of Sirach: “The fear of the Lord is all wisdom; and in all wisdom is the performance of the law, and the knowledge of his omnipotency” (Sir 19:20, KJA; Cf. Sir 1:26; 24:23). An association between the tree of life and God’s instructions is attested in the Targum Pseudo-Jonathan on Genesis 3:24 and in the Pirkei

Avot 6:7.³³⁴ In 4 Maccabees 18:6, the author states that there is a tree of life, i.e. a future place in the world to come, for those who keep on doing God's will, i.e. who follow God's Torah. Thus, the mother of the seven sons encourages them to stay true to God's Torah, even if they will suffer death, since there is a tree of life in store for them on the other side.

The fourth link in the chain is Ezekiel 37:2-3, which describes Ezekiel's vision of the valley of the bones, a text most often associated with a bodily resurrection. deSilva states: "the author comes close to making room for the resurrection of the dead in his discourse, which is even muted here in deference to the author's predilection for speaking instead of the immortality of the soul."³³⁵

³³⁴This Targum expands greatly on Genesis 3:24, the relevant section has been highlighted in red. "And He drove out the man from thence where He had made to dwell the glory of His Shekina at the first between the two Kerubaia. **Before He had created the world, He created the law**; He prepared the garden of Eden for the righteous, that they might eat and delight themselves with the fruit of the tree; **because they would have practised in their lives the doctrine of the law in this world, and have maintained the commandments**; (but) he prepared Gehinnam for the wicked, which is like the sharp, consuming sword of two edges; in the midst of it He hath prepared flakes of fire and burning coals for the judgment of the wicked who rebelled in their life against the doctrine of the law. **To serve the law is better than (to eat of) the fruit of the tree of life, (the law) which the Word of the Lord prepared, that man in keeping it might continue, and walk in the paths of the way of life in the world to come**" (Gen 3:24 PJE). The following statement is taken from Pirkei Avot: "**Great is Torah**, for it gives life to its doers in this world and in the next world, as it is written: 'For they [the teachings of the Torah] give life to those who find them and healing to all flesh' (Prov 4:22). It also says: 'Healing will it be for your flesh and marrow for your bones' (Prov 3:8). **It also says: 'It is a tree of life to those who take hold of it, and those who support it are fortunate' (Prov 3:18)**. And it says: 'They are a graceful garland for your head and necklaces for your throat' (1:9). And it says: 'It will give your head a graceful garland; it will provide you a crown of glory' (Prov 4:9). And it says: 'For in me [the Torah] will you lengthen days, and years of life will be added to you' (Prov 9:11). And it says: 'Length of days in its right hand; in its left are wealth and honor' (Prov 3:16). And it is written: 'For length of days, years of life, and peace will they [the Torah's teachings] increase for you' (Prov 3:2)."

³³⁵deSilva, *4 Maccabees*, 264.

τὸν Ιεζεκιηλ ἐπιστοποῖει τὸν λέγοντα **Εἰ ζήσεται
τὰ ὀστᾶ τὰ ξηρὰ ταῦτα;**

He used to confirm Ezekiel, who said: **“will these
dry bones live?”**

² καὶ περιήγαγέν με ἐπ’ αὐτὰ κυκλόθεν κύκλῳ καὶ
ἰδοὺ πολλὰ σφόδρα ἐπὶ προσώπου τοῦ πεδίου
ξηρὰ σφόδρα

³ καὶ εἶπεν πρὸς με υἱὲ ἀνθρώπου **εἰ ζήσεται τὰ
ὀστᾶ ταῦτα** καὶ εἶπα κύριε σὺ ἐπίστη ταῦτα

² And he led me round about them every way: and,
behold, *there were* very many on the face of the
plain, very **dry**.

³ And he said to me, Son of man, **will these bones
live?** and I said, O Lord God, thou knowest this.

The main part of the quote comes from the question asked in Ezekiel 37:3 (highlighted in red) with a minor addition from the preceding verse (highlighted in green). Again, these words are meant as encouragement for her seven sons. Even when they only see death around them and see no hope, like the dry bones, there is still hope. God has not forgotten them, death is not the end, as God will give them eternal life. The conclusion of Ezekiel’s vision declares:

Look how they say, “Our bones are dried up, and our hope has perished; we are cut off.” ¹²Therefore, prophesy and say to them: This is what the Lord GOD says: I am going to open your graves and bring you up from them, My people, and lead you into the land of Israel. ¹³You will know that I am the LORD, My people, when I open your graves and bring you up from them. ¹⁴I will put My Spirit in you, and you will live, and I will settle you in your own land. Then you will know that I am the LORD. I have spoken, and I will do it. (Ezek 37:11-14, CSB)

The fifth and final link in the chain is the Song of Moses (Deut 32:1-43), which functions as the climax to their father’s teaching and provides ultimate encouragement by giving a deeper meaning and purpose to their martyrdom. Much like Isaac’s willingness to be obedient until death, Joseph staying true to his father’s teaching as a result experiencing suffering, or the show of loyalty of the three friends, this demonstration of their commitment to God and his Torah brought great blessing to the people of Israel.

¹⁸ ὥδῃν μὲν γάρ, ἣν ἐδίδασκεν Μωυσεύς, οὐκ ἐπελάθετο διδάσκων τὴν λέγουσαν

¹⁹ **Ἐγὼ ἀποκτενῶ καὶ ζῆν ποιήσω, αὕτη ἡ ζωὴ ὑμῶν καὶ ἡ μακρότης τῶν ἡμερῶν.**

¹⁸ For he did not neglect teaching you the song which Moses taught, that says,

¹⁹ **“I will kill and I will cause to live. This is your life and the length of days.”**

ἴδετε ἴδετε ὅτι ἐγὼ εἰμι καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν θεὸς πλην ἐμοῦ **ἐγὼ ἀποκτενῶ καὶ ζῆν ποιήσω** πατάξω καὶ γὰρ ἰάσομαι καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν ὃς ἐξελεῖται ἐκ τῶν χειρῶν μου

ὅτι οὐχὶ λόγος κενὸς οὗτος ὑμῖν ὅτι **αὕτη ἡ ζωὴ ὑμῶν καὶ** ἔνεκεν τοῦ λόγου τούτου μακροημερεύσετε ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς εἰς ἣν ὑμεῖς διαβαίνετε τὸν Ἰορδάνην ἐκεῖ κληρονομήσαι αὐτήν

ἀγαπᾶν κύριον τὸν θεόν σου εἰσακούειν τῆς φωνῆς αὐτοῦ καὶ ἔχεσθαι αὐτοῦ ὅτι τοῦτο **ἡ ζωὴ σου καὶ ἡ μακρότης τῶν ἡμερῶν** σου κατοικεῖν σε ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς ἧς ὤμοσεν κύριος τοῖς πατράσιν σου Ἀβραὰμ καὶ Ἰσαὰκ καὶ Ἰακώβ δοῦναι αὐτοῖς

Behold, behold that I am *he*, and there is no god beside me: **I kill, and I will make to live:** I will smite, and I will heal; and there is none who shall deliver out of my hands.

For this *is* no vain word to you; **for it is your life, and** because of this word ye shall live long upon the land, into which ye go over Jordan to inherit it.

to love the Lord thy God, to hearken to his voice, and cleave to him; for this *is* thy **life, and the length of thy days**, that thou shouldest dwell upon the land, which the Lord sware to thy fathers, Abraam, and Isaac, and Jacob, to give to them.

The Song of Moses reveals the history of Israel, with its ups and downs, but it concludes with a message of hope for the people of Israel. The first part of the quote is taken from Deuteronomy 32:29 (highlighted in red), the middle section is quoting from Deuteronomy 32:47 and Deuteronomy 30:20 (highlighted in green), while the final section is taken from Deuteronomy 30:20 (highlighted in brown). deSilva indicates that the word order of the first part of the quote is highly significant, suggesting that the author understood them as “a temporal sequence rather than merely as a balanced expression of God’s power to give life and take away life: ‘I kill and [then] I make alive’

becomes support for the belief in the resurrection of the martyred faithful.”³³⁶ This is the final reason the mother of the seven sons gives for why they have nothing to fear. Even if they do die in the fire, as long as they stay true to God’s Torah, he will deliver them. Thus, there will be a tree of life for them, a future eternity. The reference to Deuteronomy 32:47 and 30:20 emphasizes the message that their loyalty to God and His Torah will bring them life and length of days, once more suggesting that there will be life after death. It should be noted that the author understood the last two quotes to go beyond the literal land of Israel. Rather, he considers the promised land as a reference to the World to Come, as noted by deSilva: “‘life and length of days’ is no longer limited to ‘living in the land’ located across the Jordan, but transferred to immortal life in the presence of God.”³³⁷

Concluding Remarks

Although the author of 4 Maccabees has gone to great lengths to amend the account of the martyrdom of the seven sons and their mother in 2 Maccabees 7, to remove the bodily resurrection hope by replacing it with an instant reward for the soul upon death, the speech of encouragement given to her sons at the conclusion of the book, still hints at a bodily resurrection. Interestingly, it could be argued that the father’s teachings to his sons, as summarized by the mother, could also be used to support a universal eschatological resurrection. The following figure (Fig. 19) gives an overview of

³³⁶Ibid., 264-265.

³³⁷Ibid., 265.

the death and afterlife view presented in 4 Maccabees. The eternal destiny of a person is based on the present life, if he/she has conquered his/her passion by making piety their primary concern (4 Macc 7:18). Following the point of death, the soul parts from the body to receive either eternal reward (4 Macc 9:8; 10:15b) or eternal punishment (4 Macc 9:9; 10:15a), which would imply a personal judgment. Thus, the author of 4 Maccabees does not need an eschatological universal judgment or bodily resurrection to solve the question of theodicy.

Fig. 19. Death and Afterlife in 4 Maccabees

Pseudo-Phocylides

Pseudo-Phocylides³³⁸ was written in Greek by an unknown Hellenistic Jewish poet who may have lived in Alexandria,³³⁹ sometime between 50 BCE and 50 CE.³⁴⁰ This book contains a 230 lines long didactic Wisdom poem, a *gnomology*.³⁴¹ The poem contains a “mixture of biblical and nonbiblical ethical rules,” with the purpose “to make clear that biblical and Greek ethics are not incompatible” since “even the famous Phocylides propagated biblical ethics.”³⁴² Walter T. Wilson notes that these maxims are not randomly presented but are grouped into the following topical paragraphs:³⁴³

³³⁸The prologue identifies the author as Phocylides (v.2), who was a sixth century BCE Greek gnomic poet who lived in Miletus in Ionia (western coast Anatolia in Asia Minor). By ancient sources, “he was regarded as a great authority concerning ethical matters and correct behavior in daily living (K. D. Clarke, “Pseudo-Phocylides,” DNTB, 868). However, the generally accepted view is this book is a pseudepigraphical book written by an unknown Jewish poet (see discussion in: Pieter W. van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides* [Leiden: Brill, 1978], 55-63), hence the title Pseudo-Phocylides..

³³⁹The identification of Alexandria as the setting of this book is based on a possible reference to the act of dissecting a human body (Ps.-Phoc. 102) for the purpose of anatomical research, and Alexandria was the only known place in ancient time for such practices (see van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 82). However, John J. Collins questions this assumption and argues that line 102 may instead refer to “the Jewish practice of secondary burial” which took place in Palestine during this time, however, he concludes “the Sentences certainly come from a Greek-speaking environment. Egypt remains the most likely candidate” (John J. Collins, “Life after Death in Pseudo-Phocylides,” in *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture*, JSJS 100 [Leiden: Brill, 2005], 139, 142).

³⁴⁰For a discussion on the providence of this poetic work, see Clarke, “Pseudo-Phocylides,” 868; van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 81-83; Walter T. Wilson, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, CEJL (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2005), 5-8.

³⁴¹For a discussion on the genre of this poem, see van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 77-80.

³⁴²Pieter W. van der Horst, “Pseudo-Phocylides, Sentences,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 3:2353. See also, van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 70-76.

³⁴³Wilson, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 23. The outline uses the headings appearing in van der Horst’s commentary (*The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*), with the relevant section for this study bolded in red.

1-2	Prologue
3-8	Summary of the Decalogue
9-21	Exhortations to Justice
22-41	Admonitions to Mercy
42-47	Love of Money and its Consequences
48-58	Honesty, Modesty, and Self-Control
59-69	Moderation in All Things
70-96	The Danger of Envy and Other Vices
97-115	Death and After-life
116-121	The Instability of Life
122-131	Speech and Wisdom, Man's Distinction
132-152	Avoidance of Wickedness and Virtuous Life
153-174	The Usefulness of Labour
175-227	Marriage, Chastity and Family Life
228-230	Epilogue

Death and Afterlife (Ps.-Phoc. 97-115)

Van der Horst notes that most scholars find the death and afterlife section of this poem (Ps.-Phoc. 97-115) difficult to interpret since there seems to be more than one view presented on the afterlife. The text seems to present a bodily resurrection view (Ps.-Phoc. 103-104) while, at the same time, it states that the soul is immortal (Ps.-Phoc. 115). Scholars also debate the relationship between body (σῶμα), soul (ψυχὰν), and spirit (πνεῦμα), whether the poet held a tri-partite (body-soul-spirit) or a bi-partite (body-soul/spirit) anthropological view.³⁴⁴

This section of the poem begins with a set of instructions regarding proper mourning and burial practices (Ps.-Phoc. 97- 102), noting that one should mourn in moderation (Ps.-Phoc. 97-98) and show proper respect for the dead, by emphasizing the

³⁴⁴John J. Collins, "Life after Death in Pseudo-Phocylides," in *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture*, JSJS 100 (Leiden: Brill, 2005), 129-130; Pieter W. van der Horst, "Pseudo-Phocylides on the Afterlife: A Rejoinder to John J. Collins," *JSJ* 35 (2004): 70. It should be noted that Collins and van der Horst represent the two different sides of this debate. Collins defends the tri-partite view while van der Horst the bi-partite view. Collins' interpretation seems to provide a consistent view on the afterlife in contrast to the interpretation given by van der Horst.

importance of proper burial and noting that divine anger would be stirred up against whomever would disturb the deceased by digging up their grave and unearthing the dead (Ps.-Phoc. 99-101). The poet states that “it is not good to dissolve the human frame” (Ps.-Phoc. 102), perhaps referring to the practice of exhuming and dissecting cadavers in Alexandria for the purpose of anatomical research.³⁴⁵ However, the poet may be warning against corpse desecration in general, or perhaps he was alluding to the Palestinian practice of secondary burial during the late Second Temple period Judaism, in which the dead were initially placed in a burial cave while the flesh decomposed in order for the bones of the deceased to be collected and placed in an ossuary at a later time.³⁴⁶ The next two lines of the poem (Ps.-Phoc. 103-104) provide the underlying rationale for why corpses should be respected and for the instruction that dead loved ones should not be mourned excessively.

Verses 103-104

¹⁰³ καὶ **τάχα** δ' **ἐκ γαίης** **ἐλπίζομεν** ἐς φάος
¹⁰⁴ **ἐλθεῖν** **λείψαν' ἀποικομένων**· **ὀπίσω δὲ θεοὶ**
τελέθονται.

^{103-104a} For in fact **we hope** that the remains of
the departed will **perhaps** come to the light
again **out of the earth.** ^{104b} And afterwards they
become gods.

These two lines (Ps.-Phoc. 103-104a) present a bodily resurrection hope (highlighted in red) in which the very remains of the dead will once more come to light, “out of the earth.” In other words, the corpses need to be treated with respect due to the belief in a bodily resurrection, the body is needed in the future. The Greek adverb **τάχα**, based on the

³⁴⁵For this interpretation, see van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 183-184.

³⁴⁶See Collins, “Life after Death in Pseudo-Phocylides,” 142.

larger context, could either be translated as “perhaps, possibly, probably” (cf. Wis. 13:6; 14:19; Rom 5:7; Phil 1:15) or “soon” (as used in classical Greek writing from *Herodotus* down).³⁴⁷ Collins argues for the former (τάχα = “perhaps”), emphasizing the hope aspect of the statement, suggesting the poet may not have considered this future resurrection to be universal in nature,³⁴⁸ while Horst argues for the latter view (τάχα = “soon”), stressing the urgency and the strong conviction held by the poet in his resurrection hope.³⁴⁹

Following the bodily resurrection, the poet notes that they will become gods (Ps.-Phoc.104b, highlighted in blue). This seems to support a non-universal eschatological resurrection view since, if universal, both the righteous and the wicked would become gods, a view which is unprecedented in Second Temple Period Jewish literature, since it would not solve the problem of theodicy. Instead, the poet must be describing the elevation of the righteous which will take place after the eschatological resurrection of the righteous, who will be elevated in a special way.³⁵⁰ This elevation, becoming gods, may be a variant of Daniel 12:3 and 1 Enoch 104:2-6 (where the righteous are elevated to

³⁴⁷Henry George Liddell and Robert Scott, “τάχα,” in *A Greek-English Lexicon; Machine Readable Texts* (Oxford: Trustees of Tufts University, 1940), <http://perseus.uchicago.edu/cgi-bin/philologic/getobject.pl?c.73:4:27.LSJ>.

³⁴⁸This view would be in line with Daniel 12:2 which seems to present a limited eschatological resurrection.

³⁴⁹See van der Horst, “Pseudo-Phocylides on the Afterlife,” 72-73; Collins, “Life after Death in Pseudo-Phocylides,” 132, 140.

³⁵⁰If the poet describes a limited eschatological resurrection, it would, although not mentioned in the poem, require a pre-resurrection judgment, since it would be necessary to determine who should be a part of this resurrection. The alternative interpretation is nicely presented by Wilson. He writes: “What is surprising is that, for our author, resurrection appears to have no judiciary function or aspect whatsoever, as it does in most all Jewish or Christian writings that express this hope. The text projects a scenario in which the remains of all people, not just the worthy, are deified” (Wilson, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 145).

heaven to become like stars, shining for all eternity), or become like or be companions of the angels.³⁵¹ Perhaps it alludes to the Adam tradition, which suggests that God will grant Adam his wish to become god following his resurrection (T. Adam 3:3-5).³⁵²

One of the main questions of interpretation in the next four lines of the poem (Ps.-Phoc. 105-108) is, does the poet present a tri-partite (body-soul-spirit) or a bi-partite (body-soul/spirit) anthropological view? Does the poet perceive ψυχαὶ (soul) and πνεῦμα (spirit) as synonyms, or as two different parts of a human being? The answer to this question will effect the overall understanding of “the death and afterlife” section of this poem.

Verses 105-108

¹⁰⁵ **ψυχαὶ** γὰρ μίμνουσιν ἀκήριοι ἐν φθιμένοισιν.

¹⁰⁵ **For** **the souls** remain unharmed among the dead.

¹⁰⁶ **πνεῦμα** γάρ ἐστι θεοῦ **χρήσις** θνητοῖσι καὶ εἰκόν·

¹⁰⁶ **For** **the spirit** is **a loan** from God to mortals, and his image.

¹⁰⁷ **σῶμα** γὰρ ἐκ γαίης· ἔχομεν κάππειτα πρὸς αὐτὴν

¹⁰⁷ **For** we have **a body** out of earth, and when afterwards we are resolved ¹⁰⁸ again into earth we are but dust; but the air has received our **spirit**.

¹⁰⁸ **πνεῦμα** δέδεκται.

It is important to note that soul, spirit, and body are introduced in the same way by the author (noun – conjunction), suggesting he viewed them as three separate entities:

³⁵¹Collins observes that in contemporary Jewish literature, like the Dead Sea Scrolls, angels were often referred to as אלהים, gods (Collins, “Life after Death in Pseudo-Phocylides,” 133). Also see, John J. Collins, “Powers in Heaven, Gods and Angels in the Dead Sea Scrolls,” in *Religion in the Dead Sea Scrolls*, eds. J. J. Collins and R. A. Kugler (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000), 1-28.

³⁵²The poet may have expanded on several biblical statements; The Psalmist notes that humans were created a little lower than God (וְהָאָדָם מֵאֲדָמָה מִנְּעֵם מַלְאָכָיו) and were honored and glorified by him (Psalm 8:6, MT); the Creation account states that humans were created in the image and likeness (בְּצַלְמוֹ בְּעֶלְמֹוֹ) of God (Gen 1:26-27), and while in the Eden Narrative, God observes that humans have become/were like one of us (וְהָאָדָם הָיָה כְּאֶחָד מֵאֲנָשֵׁינוּ) following the fall (Gen 3:22). If this was the position of humans in the beginning, it would very likely also be the case following the resurrection. This elevated position of humans as “lesser gods” following their creation appears in the *Books of Adam and Eve*, and was the case for Satan’s rebellion (LAE 12:1-17:2).

ψυχὰν γὰρ (Ps.-Phoc., 105), πνεῦμα γάρ (Ps.-Phoc., 106), and σῶμα γὰρ (Ps.-Phoc., 107).

Upon death, the poem reveals the destiny of each entity.

Regarding the Soul (ψυχὰν), this poem is unambiguous in its immortality of the soul view (Ps.-Phoc. 105, 115). However, the important question is what happens to the soul when the person dies. The author states that death will not affect the soul itself, noting it will remain unharmed (μίμνουσιν ἀκήριοι), but it is not quite clear what he has in mind when he states that the soul remain unharmed ἐν φθιμένοισιν? Van der Horst seems to suggest that the soul will remain alive in the dead body, however, he acknowledges that his reading creates an inconsistency in the poem (he argues that the poet does not present a consistent view) when attempting to harmonize this statement with the latter statement, ἀἷρ δ' ἀνὰ πνεῦμα δέδεκται, *but the air has received our spirit* (Ps.-Phoc. 108b), suggesting a different location for the soul/spirit, assuming the author has used these two words as synonyms.³⁵³ According to Collins, a better translation of the phrase ἐν φθιμένοισιν, is “*among the dead*,” suggesting the soul parts for Hades when a person dies, which seems to harmonize with the poet’s description of Hades (Ps.-Phoc. 111-113).

Regarding the Spirit (πνεῦμα), the poet reveals two important details. First, the Spirit is only on loan (χρήσις) from God, as such, it will be returned to the lender upon death (Ps.-Phoc., 106). Second, the Spirit (πνεῦμα) is associated with God’s image (εἰκών). The idea that the Spirit is on loan from God is not a foreign concept in Judaism,

³⁵³Van der Horst, *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*, 188-189.

it may derive from an interpretation of Genesis 2:7 and Genesis 6:3 and Ecclesiastes 12:7 (see the highlighted key words in the texts below).

Ecclesiastes 12:7 (LXT/WTT/LXE)

καὶ ἐπιστρέψῃ ὁ χοῦς ἐπὶ τὴν γῆν ὥς ἦν καὶ τὸ
πνεῦμα ἐπιστρέψῃ πρὸς τὸν θεόν ὃς ἔδωκεν αὐτό

וְיָשָׁב הָעֹפָר עַל־הָאָרֶץ כַּשֶּׁהָיָה
וְהָרוּחַ תָּשׁוּב אֶל־הָאֱלֹהִים אֲשֶׁר נָתַןָּהּ:

and **the dust** also return **to the earth** as it was, and
the spirit return **to God** who gave it.

Genesis 2:7 (LXT/WTT/LXE)

καὶ ἔπλασεν ὁ θεὸς τὸν ἄνθρωπον χοῦν ἀπὸ τῆς
γῆς καὶ ἐνεφύσησεν εἰς τὸ πρόσωπον αὐτοῦ
πνοήν ζώης καὶ ἐγένετο ὁ ἄνθρωπος εἰς ψυχὴν
ζώσαν

וַיִּצְרֵם יְהוָה אֱלֹהִים אֶת־הָאָדָם עֹפָר מִן־הָאֲדָמָה
וַיִּפַּח בְּאַפָּיו נְשָׁמָת חַיִּים וַיְהִי הָאָדָם לְנֶפֶשׁ חַיָּה:

And God formed the man *of* **dust of the earth**, and
breathed upon his face **the breath of life**, and the
man became **a living soul**.

In the Eden Narrative, the first human was created from the dust of the earth and the breath of life (πνοήν ζώης/חַיִּים נְשָׁמָת) from God, in order to become a living soul (ψυχὴν ζώσαν/חַיָּה לְנֶפֶשׁ). In Ecclesiastes, the “breath of life” has been turned into the Spirit (τὸ πνεῦμα/רוּחַ) when it describes death, the reversal of the creation process. In fact, Ecclesiastes notes that the Spirit returns to God who gave it (Eccl 12:7). A similar thought appears in Genesis 6:3 when God declares that his Spirit (τὸ πνεῦμά μου/רוּחִי) will not dwell in the humans forever (ἐν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις τούτοις εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα/לְעֹלָם), suggesting that God will, at one point, repossess his belonging, his Spirit. The concept that life is on loan from God, as described by Pseudo-Phocylides, also appears in Wisdom 15:8 and Luke 12:20 (see highlighted phrases).

Luke 12:20

εἶπεν δὲ αὐτῷ ὁ θεός· ἄφρων,
ταύτη τῇ νυκτὶ **τὴν ψυχὴν σου**
ἀπαιτοῦσιν ἀπὸ σοῦ· ἃ δὲ
ἡτοίμασας, τίνι ἔσται;

"But God said to him, 'You fool!
This very night **your life** is
demanded of you. And the
things you have prepared--
whose will they be? '

Wisdom 15:8 (LXT/KJA)

καὶ κακόμοχθος θεὸν μάταιον ἐκ
τοῦ αὐτοῦ πλάσσει πηλοῦ ὃς πρὸ
μικροῦ ἐκ γῆς γενηθεὶς μετ'
ὀλίγον πορεύεται ἐξ ἧς ἐλήμφθη
τὸ **τῆς ψυχῆς ἀπαιτηθεὶς χρέος**

And employing his labours
lewdly, he maketh a vain god of
the same clay, even he which a
little before was made of earth
himself, and within a little while
after returneth to the same, out
when **his life** which was **lent**
him **shall be demanded**.

Genesis 6:3

καὶ εἶπεν κύριος ὁ θεός οὐ μὴ
καταμείνη **τὸ πνεῦμά μου** ἐν
τοῖς ἀνθρώποις τούτοις εἰς τὸν
αἰῶνα διὰ τὸ εἶναι αὐτοὺς
σάρκας ἔσονται δὲ αἱ ἡμέραι
αὐτῶν ἑκατὸν εἴκοσι ἔτη

וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה
לֹא יָדֹנָן בְּאֲדָמָה לְעַלְמָם
בְּשָׁנָם הוּא בָשָׂר
וְהַיּוֹמִים יָמִיו מֵאָה וְעֶשְׂרִים שָׁנָה:

And the Lord God said, **My Spirit**
Spirit shall certainly not remain
among these men for ever,
because they are flesh, but their
days shall be an hundred and
twenty years.

In both these accounts, death is described as God reclaiming his loan, demanding the return of the person's life (highlighted in blue). The technical word, debt/loan, used in this context, *χρησις* (Ps.-Phoc., 106) parallels *χρέος* in Wisdom 15:8 (both words are highlighted in green). The word *χρέος* also appears in the TaNaKh in the context of forgiving debt (Deut 15:2-3 – debt forgiveness every Sabbatical year) or a loan/life given to God (1 Sam 2:20).

The second detail mentioned by the author regarding the spirit (*πνεῦμα*), is its association with the image (*εἰκών*) of God, a clear allusion to the Creation of the first human couple (Gen 1:26-27). See the highlighted words in the text below.

^{26a} καὶ εἶπεν ὁ θεός ποιήσωμεν ἄνθρωπον κατ'
εἰκόνα ἡμετέραν καὶ καθ' ὁμοίωσιν ... ²⁷ καὶ
ἐποίησεν ὁ θεὸς τὸν ἄνθρωπον κατ' **εἰκόνα** θεοῦ
ἐποίησεν αὐτόν ἄρσεν καὶ θῆλυ ἐποίησεν αὐτοῦς

^{26a} וַיֹּאמֶר אֱלֹהִים
נַעֲשֶׂה אָדָם בְּצַלְמֵנוּ כְּדְמוּתֵנוּ
²⁷ וַיְבָרֵא אֱלֹהִים אֶת־הָאָדָם בְּצַלְמוֹ
בְּצֶלֶם אֱלֹהִים בָּרָא אֹתוֹ
זָכָר וּנְקֵבָה בָּרָא אֹתָם:

^{26a} And God said, Let us make man according to our **image** and likeness. . . ²⁷ And God made man, according to **the image** of God he made him, male and female he made them.

^{26a} Then God said, "Let Us make man **in Our image**, according to Our likeness. . .” ²⁷ So God created man **in His own image**; He created him **in the image** of God; He created them male and female.

By reading the two creation accounts of the origin of the first humans (Gen 1:26-27; Gen 2:7), in light of each other, it could be possible to see an association between God’s image in the first account with that of God’s breath of life (נְשִׁמַּת חַיִּים or רוּחַ, according to Gen 6:3 and Eccl 12:7) in the second. If a human being is a compound of dust of the ground and the breath of life, and if humans were also created in the image of God, it begs to reason that it is God’s breath of life (and not the dust of the ground), the only element, according to Genesis 2, which was uniquely given to the humans, that makes them into God’s image.³⁵⁴ According to Collins, Philo makes this very point when he is commenting on the image of God and the breath of life³⁵⁵ when writing: “οὐδὲν ἦν ἕτερον ἢ πνεῦμα θεῖον,” *he means nothing else than the divine spirit* (Philo, *Opi.* 1:135 [PHI/PHE]). Philo also notes that it is the possession of this **Spirit** that makes us into a being who is in God’s image and likeness, in contrast to the animals who do not possess God’s Spirit (Philo, *Opi.* 1:137, 139), showing a distinction between Spirit (πνεῦμα) and Soul (ψυχή).³⁵⁶

³⁵⁴Unlike the Eden Narrative which suggests that only humans received the Spirit from God, Ecclesiastes suggests that both humans and animals have a Spirit (πνεῦμα τοῦ κτήνους) which will part the body upon death (Eccl 3:21).

³⁵⁵Collins, “Life after Death in Pseudo-Phocylides,” 135.

³⁵⁶In light of the distinction shown between Spirit (πνεῦμα) and Soul (ψυχή) in both Pseudo-Phocylides and Philo, the tri-partite anthropological view is evident in Second Temple Period Jewish literature. This view is also evident in the writings of the early Church fathers such as Justine Martyr

Regarding the body (σῶμα), the author states that it will return to the substance it was originally taken (Ps.-Phoc., 107-108a), dust of the earth, alluding to the Eden Narrative (Gen 2:7; 3:19b) and Ecclesiastes (Eccl 3:20; 12:7). In the same way, the author reasons, the Spirit (πνεῦμα/רוּחַ) will return to the substance from which it was taken (ἀήρ, *air*). Thus, the earth receives the body, the air receives the Spirit, while Hades receives the Soul - the only part which survives death, since it is immortal (Ps.-Phoc., 115). Based on this perspective, the author makes the following exhortation to the rich:

(“Fragments on the Lost Work on Justine on the Resurrection,” *ANF*, 1:298 – “For the body is the house of the soul; and the soul the house of the spirit.”), Tation (“Address of Tation to the Greeks,” *ANF*, 2:70 – “We recognise two varieties of spirit, one of which is called the soul (ψυχή), but the other is greater than the soul, an image and likeness of God: both existed in the first men.”), Origen (“De Principiis,” *ANF*, 4:289 – “Into the hands of His Father He commends not His soul, but His spirit; and when He says that the flesh is weak, He does not say that the soul is willing, but the spirit: whence it appears that the soul is something intermediate between the weak flesh and the willing spirit.”), and Irenæus (“Irenæus against Heresies,” *ANF*, 1:534 [cf. 1:532] – “Now, spiritual men shall not be incorporeal spirits; but our substance, that is, the union of flesh and spirit, receiving the Spirit of God, makes up the spiritual man.”). This being the case, a tri-partite view should not too readily be ruled out in New Testament texts such as:

1 Thessalonians 5:23 (BNT/CSB)

Αὐτὸς δὲ ὁ θεὸς τῆς εἰρήνης ἀγιάσαι ὑμᾶς
ὁλοτελεῖς, καὶ ὁλόκληρον ὑμῶν τὸ πνεῦμα
καὶ ἡ ψυχὴ καὶ τὸ σῶμα ἀμέμπτως ἐν τῇ
παρουσίᾳ τοῦ κυρίου ἡμῶν Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ
τηρηθεῖη.

Now may the God of peace Himself sanctify
you completely. And may your **spirit**, **soul**,
and **body** be kept sound and blameless for
the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.

Hebrew 4:12 (BNT/CSB)

Ζῶν γὰρ ὁ λόγος τοῦ θεοῦ καὶ ἐνεργὴς καὶ τομώτερος
ὑπὲρ πᾶσαν μάχαιραν δίστομον καὶ διϊκνούμενος ἄχρι
μερισμοῦ
ψυχῆς καὶ **πνεύματος**,
ἁρμῶν τε καὶ μυελῶν,
καὶ κριτικὸς ἐνθυμήσεων καὶ ἐννοιῶν καρδίας·

For the word of God is living and effective and sharper
than any double-edged sword, penetrating as far as the
separation of
soul and **spirit**,
joints and marrow.
It is able to judge the ideas and thoughts of the heart.

Verses 109-110

¹⁰⁹ Πλούτου μὴ φείδου· μέμνησ' ὅτι **θνητὸς**
ὑπάρχεις.¹¹⁰ οὐκ ἔνι δ' **εἰς ΑἹδην** ὄλβον καὶ
χρήματ' ἄγεσθαι.

¹⁰⁹ When you are rich do not be sparing; remember
that you are **mortal**.¹¹⁰ It is impossible to take
riches and money with you **into Hades**.

The rich should not hoard their wealth but should instead share it generously, remembering they are but mortal, since their riches will not be of any use for them when they die.³⁵⁷ The rich can not bring their wealth with them to Hades. The author expands:

Verses 111-113

¹¹¹ πάντες ἴσον νέκυες· **ψυχῶν** δὲ θεὸς βασιλεύει.
¹¹² κοινὰ μὲν ἄθλα, τέλη δ' αἰώνια· καὶ πατρίς
Αἰδης,¹¹³ ξυνὸς χώρος ἅπασι, πένησί τε καὶ
βασιλευσιν.

¹¹¹ All alike are corpses, but God rules over the
souls.
¹¹² Their shared, eternal home and fatherland is
Hades,¹¹³ a common place for all, both poor and
kings.

All are on an equal footing, since all are corpses, and everyone will die. However, the Soul (ψυχῶν) survives and dwells in Hades, the common “eternal home and fatherland” for all. Whatever station a person possessed while living, it will have no meaning in Hades. In fact, there seems to be no distinction made between the righteous or the wicked souls either, indicating that immortality is not considered a reward for a righteous life. The author declares that God rules over all the souls, both the righteous and the wicked. Therefore, God is also the God of the dead, he is in sole control of all spheres of human existence, even when a person is dead. This, as pointed out by Collins,

³⁵⁷ Jesus makes a similar exhortation when he urges his listeners to save up treasures in heaven: “‘Don't collect for yourselves treasures on earth, where moth and rust destroy and where thieves break in and steal. But collect for yourselves treasures in heaven, where neither moth nor rust destroys, and where thieves don't break in and steal’” (Matt 6:19-20). Jesus expands on this concept when he tells the rich man to sell all that he has and then become his disciple: “go, sell your belongings and give to the poor, and you will have treasure in heaven” (Matt 19:21, CSB; cf. Mark 10:21; Luke 12:33). Paul claims that good deeds also adds to the person's treasures in heaven: “Instruct them to do what is good, to be rich in good works, to be generous, willing to share, storing up for themselves a good reserve for the age to come, so that they may take hold of life that is real” (1 Tim 6:18-19, CSB).

leaves the possibility open for a future resurrection which would include whomever God wishes, since their souls have been kept intact and are, as such, readily available to God who rules over all the souls.³⁵⁸ The author concludes his statement on “Death and Afterlife” with a last observation:

Verses 114-115

¹¹⁴ οὐ πολὺν ἄνθρωποι ζῶμεν χρόνον, ἀλλ’ ἐπὶ
καιρὸν·

¹¹⁵ ψυχῇ δ’ ἀθάνατος
καὶ ἀγήρω ζῇ διὰ παντός.

¹¹⁴ We humans live not a long time but for a
season.

¹¹⁵ But our soul is immortal
and lives ageless forever.

While humans may only live for a short while, their souls are immortal and will therefore live ageless forever. Whether a person lives an ethical life or not, upon death, all bodies will turn back to dust, all spirits will turn back to the air, and all souls will dwell in Hades under God’s rulership. However, the author leaves the possibility open for some of these souls to be reunified with their former bodies and spirits, and become gods, who will dwell in Heaven for all eternity. The following figure (Fig. 20) gives an overview of the death and resurrection view presented by the author of Pseudo-Phocylides.

³⁵⁸Collins, “Life after Death,” 137-138.

Fig. 20. Death and Resurrection in Pseudo-Phocylides.

Prayers, Psalms, and Odes

The Book of Psalms in the TaNaKh was not the only important collection of psalms, hymns, and prayers for the Jews during the Second Temple period and the first two centuries of the common era. David Flusser observes the majority of these extra-biblical

prayers were “put into the mouths of biblical persons who figure in these apocryphal works and it is clear that at least in their present form the primary purpose was not liturgical. Rather, such prayers and hymns were composed by the author as parts of their literary output.”³⁵⁹ This section will consider three collections which contain the resurrection hope. The following table (Table 42) provides a list of the resurrection passages contained in three of the collections belonging in this category, *Psalms of Solomon*, *Hellenistic Synagogical Prayers*, and *Odes of Solomon*.

Table 42. Resurrection texts in Prayers, Psalms, and Odes

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Imp.	Stat.	Ref	Allude	Phil.	Assum
Psalms of Solomon	2:31-35	Judgment/ Resurrection	x			x		x
	3:11-12	Righteous => Eternal life		x				x
	14:9-10	Righteous => Eternal life	x					x
	15:10-13	Judgment/Resurrection	x					x
Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers	3:24-27	“Loosed the boundary of death”		x				x
	7:11	God’s act of redemption		x				x
	12:46-50	The two ways theology		x		x	x	x
	16:7-9	Funeral prayer for the dead Rest Death		x		x		x
Odes of Solomon	17:12-15	Jesus’ work => Gift to the righteous		x				x
	22:8-12	Christ speaks		x	x			x
	42:11-20	Resurrection of Jesus and the many		x				x

³⁵⁹David Flusser, “Psalms, Hymns and Prayers,” in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*, ed. Michael E. Stone, CRINT 2 (Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984), 551.

Psalms of Solomon

Psalms of Solomon dates to the mid-first century BCE³⁶⁰ and is a collection of 18 pseudonymous psalms. These psalms were most likely composed by several authors who belonged to the same Jewish community, perhaps residing in Jerusalem. Although scholars have traditionally argued for a Pharisaic or more recently an Essenes background,³⁶¹ it is probably safer to consider the psalms as a product of an unknown Jewish community. These psalms were originally written in Hebrew, but have only survived in their Greek and Syriac translations.³⁶²

In *Psalms of Solomon*, God is presented as the righteous judge (Pss. Sol. 2:18; 4:24-25; 9:5; 17:10) who will destroy the wicked (Pss. Sol. 2:31, 34-35; 3:11-12a; 9:5; 13:6a, 11b; 14:9-10; 15:8-9, 12; 16:5c). He will also give glory and eternal life (Pss. Sol. 3:12; 13:11; 14:3) to the righteous in his eschatological judgment (Pss. Sol. 2:32-35; 14:9-10; 15:12-13). The following four passages refer or allude to the resurrection hope, Pss. Sol. 2:31; 3:11-12; 14:9-10; 15:10-13 (see Table 42).

Psalms of Solomon 2:31

The first allusion to the eschatological judgment and resurrection of the righteous appears toward the end of Psalms of Solomon 2, a psalm most likely pertaining to the

³⁶⁰This date is based on allusions made in these psalms to both national Jewish concerns and broader international events (Pompey's invasion and death), see M. Lattke, "Psalms of Solomon," DNTB, 855; Robert B. Wright, *The Psalms of Solomon: A Critical Edition of the Greek Text*, JCT 1 (New York: T&T Clarks, 2007), 1-7; and R. Wright, "Psalms of Solomon," OTP, 2:640-641.

³⁶¹Lattke, "Psalms of Solomon," 855; Wright, *The Psalms of Solomon*, 7-11; and Wright, "Psalms of Solomon," 2:641-642.

³⁶²Wright, *The Psalms of Solomon*, 11-13.

military invasion of Jerusalem by the Roman general Pompey in 63 BCE and to his assassination in Egypt in 48 BCE. This psalm presents the two destinies in store for the righteous and the wicked. The righteous will be raised up to glory (Pss. Sol. 2:31), shown mercy (Pss. Sol. 2:33b, 34a, 36a), and be kept from the humiliation which is in store for the sinners (Pss. Sol. 2:35), while the sinners will be put to sleep for eternal destruction in dishonor (Pss. Sol. 2:31b), be repaid according to their actions (Pss. Sol. 2:34b), and for what they did toward the righteous (Pss. Sol. 2:35b), because they did not know God (Pss. Sol. 2:31c).

The allusion to the resurrection hope, voiced by the righteous (Pss. Sol. 2:31a), carries several parallel ideas with the clear resurrection statement in Daniel 12, and has been highlighted in the two passages. The contrast in the psalm is between glory and dishonor while in Daniel it is between life and shame (see boxes). Both passages contain the “sleep” element (highlighted in blue), but in the psalm, “sleep” is also considered a part of the punishment of the sinners (Pss. Sol. 2:31b). Both texts contain the “raising” aspect (highlighted in red), however, it seems to only include the righteous in the psalm while both righteous and wicked will partake in the resurrection in Daniel, though it is still limited in nature. Both passages emphasize the “eternal aspect” (highlighted in green) of the two destinies and the shame in store for the sinners/wicked (highlighted in brown).

Psalms of Solomon 2:31

ὁ ἀνιστῶν ἐμὲ εἰς δόξαν καὶ κοιμίζων
 ὑπερηφάνους εἰς ἀπώλειαν αἰῶνος ἐν ἀτιμίᾳ,
 ὅτι οὐκ ἔγνωσαν αὐτόν.

Daniel 12:2 (LXX/LXE)

καὶ πολλοὶ τῶν καθευδόντων ἐν τῷ πλάτει τῆς
 γῆς ἀναστήσονται οἱ μὲν εἰς ζωὴν αἰώνιον οἱ
 δὲ εἰς ὀνειδισμόν οἱ δὲ εἰς διασποράν καὶ
αἰσχύνην αἰώνιον

He is the one who **raises** me up into **glory**, and who brings down the arrogant **to sleep**, to their **dishonorable** destruction for **forever**, because they did not know him.

And many of them that **sleep** in the dust of the earth **shall awake**, some to **everlasting life**, and some to reproach and **everlasting shame**.

One important difference between these two resurrection passages is the scope of the resurrection. While Daniel 12 presents a limited resurrection for the most righteous and the most wicked, in which most dead will not experience a resurrection, the psalm seems to suggest that only the righteous will participate in the eschatological resurrection, while the sinners will continue in their sleep, to “their dishonorable destruction forever.” It is not clear from the psalm if the judgment that will “separate the righteous and the sinners” (Pss. Sol. 2:34a) and will repay the sinners for their wicked deeds (Pss. Sol. 2:34b, 35b) requires an eschatological resurrection of the sinners, or if God has already measured out their punishment in full by their “eternal destruction in dishonor” (Pss. Sol. 2:31c).

Psalms of Solomon 3:11-12

The only clear resurrection statement in Psalms of Solomon appears at the end of the third psalm, which contrasts the behavior of the righteous (Pss. Sol. 3:3-8) with that of the sinners (Pss. Sol. 3:9-10) and their respective destiny (Pss. Sol. 3:11-12). This passage, like the previous (Pss. Sol. 2:31), also alludes to Daniel 12:2. The word *ἀναστήσονται*, *will cause to stand up*, appears in both passages (highlighted in red),³⁶³ in addition to the phrase *εἰς ζωὴν αἰώνιον*, *to everlasting life* (highlighted in pink and

³⁶³This verb in its future indicative middle form also appears in Isaiah 26:19 and Hosea 6:2, in the context of a bodily resurrection. In addition, the “life” aspect appears in Hosea 6:2, but only in the Hebrew version of Isaiah 26:19 (יָחִי – they will live). Thus, the poet could also have alluded to these passages.

green). Both passages also mention the eternal destruction/shame of the sinner/wicked (highlighted in brown).

Songs of Solomon 3:11-12

¹¹ ἡ ἀπόλεια τοῦ ἀμαρτωλοῦ εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα, καὶ οὐ μνησθήσεται, ὅταν ἐπισκέπτηται δικαίους.
¹² αὕτη ἡ μερὶς τῶν ἀμαρτωλῶν εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα· οἱ δὲ φοβούμενοι τὸν κύριον ἀναστήσονται εἰς ζωὴν αἰώνιον, καὶ ἡ ζωὴ αὐτῶν ἐν φωτὶ κυρίου καὶ οὐκ ἐκλείψει ἔτι.

¹¹ **The destruction** of [the sinner] is **forever**, and [the Lord] will not remember him when he looks after [the righteous].
¹² This is the portion of sinners **forever**; but those who fear the Lord **will rise** [to **eternal life**], and their **life** [will be] in the light of the Lord, and will come to an end no more.

Daniel 12:2

² καὶ πολλοὶ τῶν καθευδόντων ἐν τῷ πλάτει τῆς γῆς ἀναστήσονται οἱ μὲν εἰς ζωὴν αἰώνιον οἱ δὲ εἰς ὀνειδισμόν οἱ δὲ εἰς διασποράν καὶ αἰσχύνην αἰώνιον

² And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth **shall awake**, some [to **everlasting life**], and some to reproach and **everlasting shame**.

Similarly to the previous psalm, this psalm does not mention the resurrection of the sinners, it only speaks about their eternal destruction. The righteous, in contrast, will be resurrected, if dead, receive eternal life, and be in “the light of the Lord,” a possible allusion to Isaiah 2:5; 60:1; and Prov 20:27, noting that the righteous will be in God’s presence forever.

Psalms of Solomon 14:9-10

An allusion to the eschatological resurrection also appears in Psalms of Solomon 14, which is, according to Kennenth Atkinson, a midrash on the biblical Psalm 1.³⁶⁴ Like Psalms of Solomon 3, this psalm also expands on the difference in behavior and attitude between the righteous (Pss. Sol. 14:1-5) and the sinners (Pss. Sol. 14:6-8), and their

³⁶⁴Kennenth Atkinson, *An Intertextual Study of the Psalms of Solomon: Pseudepigrapha*, SBEC 47 (Lewiston, NY: Mellen, 2001), 275.

eternal destiny (Pss. Sol. 14:9-10). The key section of the psalm seems to expand on Psalm 1:5-6, which refers to the eschatological resurrection and judgment. The reader learns that the final destiny of the sinners is “Hades and darkness and destruction” (Pss. Sol. 14:9a) which probably expands on the statement regarding the destruction of the ungodly in Psalm 1:6b (highlighted in brown). This psalm also makes a clear statement that the sinners “will not be found in the day when the righteous obtain mercy” (Pss. Sol. 14:9b), a possible allusion to Psalm 1:5a which states that the ungodly will not participate in the resurrection to stand in the judgment (highlighted in blue and red).³⁶⁵ However, the author of Psalms of Solomon notes the righteous will resurrect, receive mercy, and inherit life with joy (highlighted in red).

Psalms of Solomon 14:9-10

⁹ διὰ τοῦτο ἡ κληρονομία αὐτῶν ἄδης καὶ σκότος καὶ ἀπώλεια, καὶ οὐχ εὐρεθήσονται ἐν ἡμέρᾳ ἐλέους δικαίων.
¹⁰ οἱ δὲ ὅσιοι κυρίου κληρονομήσουσιν ζωὴν ἐν εὐφροσύνῃ.

⁹ Therefore their inheritance [is] **Hades and darkness and destruction, and they will not be found in the day when the righteous [obtain] mercy.** ¹⁰ But **the pious ones of the Lord will inherit life with joy.**

Psalm 1:5-6

⁵ διὰ τοῦτο οὐκ ἀναστήσονται ἀσεβεῖς ἐν κρίσει οὐδὲ ἁμαρτωλοὶ ἐν βουλῇ δικαίων. ⁶ ὅτι γινώσκει κύριος ὁδὸν δικαίων καὶ ὁδὸς ἀσεβῶν ἀπολείται.

⁵ Therefore **the ungodly shall not rise in judgment, nor sinners in the counsel of the just.** ⁶ For the Lord knows the way of the righteous; but the way of the ungodly **shall perish.**

³⁶⁵Psalm 1:5a uses the word ἀναστήσονται, *will cause to stand up*, which is the same word used in Pss. Sol. 3:12; Dan 12:2; Isa 26:19 and Hos 6:2, when describing the eschatological bodily resurrection of the righteous.

Psalms of Solomon 15:10-13

The final allusion to the resurrection is found in Psalms of Solomon 15, a psalm revealing the final destiny of the righteous (Pss. Sol. 15:1-7, 13) and the sinners (Pss. Sol. 15:8-12). The righteous are marked for salvation (Pss. Sol. 15:6a), and as such, they are protected by God from evil and have nothing to fear in the eschatological judgment, since they will be shown mercy (Pss. Sol. 15:13), alluding to an eschatological resurrection for the righteous. However, the sinners have received the mark of destruction on their forehead (Pss. Sol. 15:9b), and thus, will not escape the Lord's judgment (Pss. Sol. 15:8b). They will inherit "destruction and darkness, and their lawless actions shall pursue them below into Hades" (Pss. Sol. 15:10). The sinners will "perish forever in the day of the Lord's judgment" (Pss. Sol. 15:12a, 13c), when "God oversees the earth at his judgment" (Pss. Sol. 15:12b). In contrast, the righteous will live by the mercy of their God (Pss. Sol. 15:13b), suggesting a future eternal life with God.

This psalm is unclear as to the nature of the eschatological resurrection or who will be a part of it. The mark of salvation placed on the righteous seems to suggest that the righteous dead will be resurrected on the day of the eschatological judgment to receive the mercy of God. The mark of destruction, however, may not include the necessity of a future resurrection of the sinners, since they are already experiencing their punishment in Hades, an everlasting destruction (Pss. Sol. 15:8b-11). The judgment of the sinners mentioned in the psalm (Pss. Sol. 15:12a), may only refer to the sinners who are still alive when the eschatological judgment takes place. In other words, when the

eschatological judgment has ended, there will be no more sinners, only the righteous will be alive by the mercy of their God.

Concluding Remarks

Assuming Psalms of Solomon represents the complete death and afterlife view held by the community which produced them, and that each resurrection passage describes various aspects of said view, the following two observations could be made regarding death and the eschatological resurrection. First, there is no indication in these psalms that humans have an immortal soul, or a soul that can exist independently from the body. Wright concludes: “the psalmist conceives of man as essentially embodied and the occasional use of the term ‘soul’ corresponds to its use in the psalter to mean ‘person.’ He posits no body/soul dualism and is not in the least ‘otherworldly’ in his thinking. The cosmos and the nature of humanity are undivided.”³⁶⁶ Secondly, the dead sinners seem to have no part in the eschatological resurrection. The following figure (Fig. 21) gives an overview of the death and resurrection view presented by the community who produced the Psalms of Solomon. Comparing this figure with the other resurrection views presented in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha, it becomes clear that it has the most in common with the view of 2 Maccabees (Fig. 2).

³⁶⁶Wright, “Psalms of Solomon,” OTP, 2:645.

Fig. 21. Death and Resurrection in *Psalms of Solomon*.

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers are found among the *Apostolic Constitution*, a Christian collection of liturgy. These sixteen prayers appear in books seven and eight of the collection. However, there is some scholarly disagreement if all sixteen should be

considered of Jewish origin.³⁶⁷ Van der Horst notes that only the first six prayers should be considered to have been adopted from Jewish prayers “in a Christianized form in order to be used in Church services,” since they seem to be based on the Seven Benedictions for Sabbath morning (*Avoth, Gevuroth, Kedushat ha-Shem, Avodah, Hoda’a, Birkat Shalom* – the first and last three benedictions from the *Amidah* and a special Sabbath/festival benediction in the middle).³⁶⁸ David Fiensy holds a more liberal view and believes all sixteen “may be remnant of Jewish Synagoga prayers,”³⁶⁹ noting the lack of peculiar Christian context, while it contains a distinctly Jewish context. He adds, the distinct Christian elements in these prayers are often “only loosely – often awkwardly – connected to the context,” which suggests these elements are Christian interpolations.³⁷⁰

Regarding dating and provenance of these prayers, they were probably composed either in Alexandria or in Syria where the *Apostolic Constitution* was compiled, sometime during the second and third century CE. Van der Horst suggests that these prayers were composed in Hebrew and were later translated into Greek and expanded to serve the synagogues in the Jewish Diaspora. He then suggests that Judaizing Christians adopted

³⁶⁷For a great overview of the history of research on these synagogal prayers, see Pieter W. van der Horst and Judith H. Newman, *Early Jewish Prayers in Greek*, CEJL (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008), 9-22, 27-29.

³⁶⁸Pieter van der Horst, “Greek Synagogal Prayers,” in *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, eds. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013), 2:2110.

³⁶⁹D. A. Fiensy, “Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers,” OTP, 2:671.

³⁷⁰*Ibid.*, 2:672-673.

these prayers in fourth century Syria and were added into the *Apostolic Constitutions* by an anonymous compiler “in Antioch in the 380s CE.”³⁷¹

A brief consideration will be given to the four clear resurrection passages in these prayers. The first two resurrection passages appear in the Synagogal prayers that are based on the Seven Benedictions for Sabbath morning, while the last two appear among the last ten prayers of the collection, they are: Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:24-27; 7:11; 12:46-50; 16:7-9.

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers 3:24-27

The first resurrection text appears in the context of the Creation Story, Genesis 1-3, in which the author expands on the Genesis 1:26 – “Let us make man according to our image and likeness.” From this expansion, we learn that God gave humans a “soul out of non-being” (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:21), a possible reference to Gen 2:7, contrasting the earth and the breath of God aspect of the human being.³⁷² The prayer also notes that God intended the humans to have immortal lives (probably alluding to Gen 2:17). However, due to their disobedience (alluding to Gen 3), God took their eternal lives away so they would experience death, though he promised that it would not be forever (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:24-25). The prayer ends with the resurrection promise that they will only have to sleep for a little while before they will be “called forth to new birth,” since God has “loosed the boundary of death” and is “the Maker of life for the dead” (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:27). This promise may

³⁷¹Van der Horst, “Greek Synagogal Prayers,” 2110. See also Fiensy, “Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers,” 2:673; Van der Horst and Newman, *Early Jewish Prayers in Greek*, 22-27.

³⁷²Van der Horst comments that God also provided humans with a spirit which could control the soul, noting that “the idea here is that the rational part of the soul, namely the spirit, enables humankind to take control over the irrational parts, the senses and their perceptions, that might otherwise lead to sin” (“Greek Synagogal Prayers,” 2:2121).

refer to Dan 12:2 or to the promise mentioned in *Life of Adam and Eve* tradition discussed earlier, however, the author may have seen the resurrection promise in Gen 3:19b as attested in the *Targum Pseudo-Jonathan* expansion and in *Sibylline Oracles* 8.96-99.

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers 7:11

The second resurrection passage appears in a thanksgiving prayer celebrating God's act of redemption and gift to human beings. In this prayer, the author marvels that God brings forth from the womb a rational and complex creature, just from a little drop, which he has also given an immortal soul (Hel.Syn.Pr. 7:9). This prayer considers God the creator of every human being, paralleling the creation account in Gen 2:7 and he is still actively forming and shaping new life and giving everyone his "breath of life." It should be noted that the prayer reveals that an immortal soul has been given to everyone, even before a person is shown to be righteous or wicked.

This thanksgiving prayer is also praising God for his instructions and ordinances which has cleansing powers (Hel.Syn.Pr. 7:10), assuming from the effect of sins which introduced death, despite the immortal spirit. However, God has promised that the dissolution will be temporary, due to the promised resurrection (Hel.Syn.Pr. 7:11), referring to the same promise as mentioned in the first resurrection passage (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:26). Although this prayer does not specifically state whether this resurrection will be universal, it could be assumed it will only contain the righteous dead, those who were cleansed by the God-given ordinances.

Hellenistic Synagoga Prayers 12:46-50

The third resurrection passage is similar to the first as both place the promise of a future resurrection in the context of the creation-rebellion narrative (Gen 1-3), the latter prayer expanding even further on the biblical account. In the following two parallel prayers, similar elements are highlighted, and the underlined words are clear Christian interpolations. Relevant references to the Creation Story (Gen 1-3) have been added into the text and are highlighted in blue.

Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:19b-27 (AC 7.34.6-8)

^{19b(6)}Let us make man according to our image and likeness [Gen 1:26];

²⁰having declared him a (micro-)cosm of cosmos,

having formed for him the body **out of the four elements**; ²¹and having **prepared for him the soul out of non-being**, [Gen 2:7]

and having given to him **fivefold perception**,
and having placed over the perceptions a mind,
the holder of the reins of the soul.

²²⁽⁷⁾And in addition to all these things, O Master, Lord, who can worthily describe the movement of rain-producing clouds, the flashing forth of lightning, the clashing of thunders; ²³ for the supplying of appropriate nourishment, and the blending of complex atmospheres?

Hel.Syn.Pr. 12:35-52 (AC 8.12.16-21)

³⁵⁽¹⁶⁾And you not only made the world, but you also made the world citizen in it,

declaring him (to be) a (micro-)cosm of the cosmos.

³⁶For you said by your Wisdom, *Let us make man according to our image, and according to (our) likeness; and let them rule the fish of the sea, and the winged birds of the heaven* [Gen 1:26].

³⁷⁽¹⁷⁾Therefore also you have **made him out of immortal soul**, and out of a body that may be scattered; [Gen 2:7] ³⁸ the one indeed out of that which is not, but the other **out of the four elements**.

³⁹And you have indeed given to him, with reference to the soul, rational discrimination, distinguishing of piety and impiety, observation of right and wrong.

⁴⁰While with reference to the body, you have given (him) **five senses**, and the movement involving change of place.

²⁴⁽⁸⁾**But when man was disobedient, You took away his deserved life.** [Gen 3:22, 24]

²⁵**You did not make it disappear absolutely, but for a time,**

²⁶**having put (him) to sleep for a little (while), by an oath you have called (him forth) to new birth** [Gen 3:19b]. ²⁷**You have loosed the boundary of death,**

You who are the Maker of life for the dead,³⁷³
through Jesus Christ, our hope! [1 Tim 1:1]

⁴¹⁽¹⁸⁾For you, O God Almighty, through Christ, planted a paradise in Eden, eastward [Gen 2:8a], with all manner of edible foods, in (proper) order; ⁴²and into it, as if into a very expensive home, you brought him [Gen 2:8b-9, 15]. ⁴³And indeed, you have given to him an implanted law to do [Rom 2:14f.], so that form himself, and by himself, he might have the seeds of divine knowledge.

⁴⁴⁽¹⁹⁾So, having brought (him) into the paradise of luxury, you allowed him the right to partake of all things [Gen 1:29, 16]. ⁴⁵But of only one things did you refuse him the taste [Gen 2:17]; in hope of greater things, in order that, **if he should keep the commandment** [Gen 2:15], **he might receive immortality as a reward for this** [Gen 2:9||Gen 3:22, 24 – access to the Tree of Life].

⁴⁶⁽²⁰⁾But, having cared nothing for the commandment, and having tasted of the forbidden fruit, by trickery of a serpent, and by the counsel of a woman [Gen 3:1-7], you indeed rightly thrust him out from paradise [Gen 3:23]. ⁴⁷**Yet in goodness, you did not overlook him who was perishing forever, for he was your work of art.**

⁴⁸But, having subjected to him the creation [Gen 1:26, 28], You have given to him, through sweat and hard labors [Gen 3:17-19], to provide by himself the nourishment for his own family, while you are causing all things to grow, and to ripen. ⁴⁹**And in time, having caused him to fall asleep for a while, you called (him) by an oath to new birth;** ⁵⁰**having dissolved the boundaries of death, you promised life by resurrection!** [Gen 3:19b]

⁵¹⁽²¹⁾And not only this; but also those who poured forth from him, to become an innumerable multitude— ⁵²**those who continued with you, you glorified, while those who separated from you, you punished.**

³⁷³Van der Horst translates the phrase, ὁ ζωοποιτὸς τῶν νεκρῶν, as “you reviver of the dead,” a phrase from the *Gevurot* - the second prayer of the Amidah which states: “You, O Lord, are mighty forever, **You are the Reviver of the dead**, You are greatly able to save. You sustain the living in lovingkindness, **You revive the dead with great compassion**, You support the falling, heal the sick, set free the bound and **keep faith with those who sleep in the dust**. Who is like You, O Master of mighty deeds? Who compares to You, a king who puts to death and **restores to life, and brings forth salvation?** And **You are faithful to revive the dead**. Blessed are You, O Lord, who revives the dead.

The additional elements appearing in the expanded version are qualifiers regarding God-given immortality. Although it is implied in the shorter version (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:24), the expanded version draws a specific link between obedience and receiving immortality as a reward for keeping the commandment (Hel.Syn.Pr. 12:45). Thus, suggesting the immortal soul bestowed upon humans at the point of creation (Hel.Syn.Pr. 12:37) was conditional, it, rather, carried the potential for immortality as long as humans adhered to God's instructions. The obedience-immortality relationship is emphasized once more when stating the resurrection promise that God would not let them perish forever, but he will instead dissolve the boundaries of death and bring the first human couple back to life, and their descendants, "an innumerable multitude" (Hel.Syn.Pr. 12:47, 49-50). The first resurrection passage (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:24-27) does not clearly state who will be included in this promised resurrection, but the expanded version does. It states that those who continue their relationship with God, he will glorify, "while those who separated from you [God] you punished" (Hel.Syn.Pr. 12:52). Thus, only the righteous are included in the promise of the future resurrection and will be glorified by God and receive immortality.

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers 16:7-9

The fourth resurrection passage appears in the last prayer of the Hellenistic Synagogal prayers collection, in a funeral prayer for the dead. In this prayer, the congregation begs God to receive the soul of the dead person and "forgive him every sin – voluntary and involuntary" and place him "among the godly ones," the patriarchs and

those of old who God found pleasing and “who did his will” (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:2-4, 12-13). Then the prayer addresses God as the immortal artisan creator of humans who promised him the resurrection (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:7), who saved both Enoch and Elijah from death (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:8a), and expands on Exodus 3:6 – “God of Abraham, and Isaac, and Jacob, not as of the dead, but as God of the living, are you. Because, with you, all **souls** are alive [πάντων αἱ **ψυχαὶ** παρὰ σοὶ ζῶσιν], and **the spirit of the righteous** are in your hands [**τῶν δικαίων τὰ πνεύματα** ἐν τῇ χειρὶ σοῦ εἰσιν]” (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:9).³⁷⁴ The prayer concludes the way it started with a request to forgive the sins of the dead person and place him with “favorable angels” and “the patriarchs, and the prophets” (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:12), in a place “where there cannot be grief, and pain, and moaning, but a free place of godly ones, and a land of upright ones, set up for you” (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:14).

There are several new elements added in this last prayer regarding the afterlife and resurrection hope. Unlike the previous resurrection passages in this prayer collection, this prayer states specifically that the soul of the dead is truly immortal (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:9) and exists apart from the body upon death. The prayer states that the soul returns to God (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:3a), and the spirit of the righteous will be under God’s protection (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:9b) – soul and spirit are probably used as synonyms. God assigns a place for the soul as it awaits the day of resurrection, when it will once more be unified with the body.

³⁷⁴Exodus 3:6 is also the text Jesus expands upon when arguing for a future bodily resurrection (Matt 22:32; Luke 20:38). However, the author of this prayer understands Exodus 3:6 as referring to the soul and spirit of the patriarchs, who are thus alive and with God.

It also seems like the communal prayer given on behalf of the dead is believed to have some effect on the soul's afterlife, since the prayer is begging God for forgiveness on behalf of the dead (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:3b, 12a), is asking for a favorable placement with good angels (Hel.Syn.Pr 16:12b), and with the patriarchs and prophets (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:4b-d, 12c-13). Not much is revealed regarding the destiny of the souls of the wicked, or if the wicked will also be a part of the eschatological resurrection. However, the text does infer that the souls of the righteous and the wicked will be treated differently, as it mentions the placement of the righteous souls as being with the godly ones, the patriarchs, prophets, and the faithful (Hel.Syn.Pr.. 16:4, 12-13), in a place where "pain and grief and moaning have fled away" (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:4e, 14a), where anguish will not touch the righteous (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:9b), since they will be under God's hand (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:10) and be "received into another sphere" (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:11), in "a land of upright ones" (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16:14). The reader could therefore assume that the wicked souls would be placed in a very different place, with other sinners, in a place where pain, grief, moaning, and anguish are found since they are not under God's hand.

Concluding Remarks

In this collection of Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers, humans are presented with a soul (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:21; 12:37; 16:3, 9) which is separate from the body. These resurrection passages also consider the soul or human as intended for immortality (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:24b; 7:9b; 12:37a, 45c), though their disobedience led to their "temporary" death (Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:26a; 7:11a; 12:47a, 49; 16:7b), God promised resurrection

(Hel.Syn.Pr. 3:26b; 7:11b; 12:50b; 16:7b). However, the author gives the impression that it is only the righteous who will participate in the resurrection, those who have been cleansed by God's law and ordinances (Hel.Syn.Pr. 7:10-11), showing little interest in the destiny of the wicked. It could be argued that, due to the close relationship between obedience and immortality shown in these resurrection passages, the soul of the wicked should be considered mortal, thus having no future hope, destiny, or life after death. Apart from the Prayer for the Dead (Hel.Syn.Pr. 16), no interest is shown regarding the whereabouts of the soul of the righteous between the time of death and the future resurrection.

Odes of Solomon

The *Odes of Solomon* is a late first to early second century³⁷⁵ Jewish-Christian Pseudepigraphical work, most likely composed in Syriac or Aramaic.³⁷⁶ It is not clear where these odes originated, but "Ephesus, Antioch, or western Syria"³⁷⁷ are good candidates. This collection consists of forty-two Odes and functioned as lyrical-books or a hymnal for the early Christian church.

³⁷⁵James H. Charlesworth, *Critical Reflections on the Odes of Solomon: Volume I – Literary Setting Textual Studies, Gnosticism, the Dead Sea Scrolls and the Gospel of John*, JSPSup 22 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1998), 22-23; J. H. Charlesworth, "Odes of Solomon," *OTP*, 2:726-727; J. H. Charlesworth, "Odes of Solomon," *DNTB*, 749; Michael Lattke, *Odes of Solomon: A Commentary*. Hermeneia, ed., Harold W. Attridge; trans. Marianne Ehrhardt (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2009), 6-10.

³⁷⁶For a discussion on the original language of the Odes, see Charlesworth, *Critical Reflections on the Odes of Solomon*, 78-136.

³⁷⁷Charlesworth, *Critical Reflections on the Odes of Solomon*, 23.

Charlesworth notes these Odes contain neither the Greek immortality belief, in which a soul transmigrates from one body to another, nor the Jewish bodily resurrection view. Instead, the Odist “exults in his salvation and experience of immortality” stating “emphatically that his immortality is geographically here and chronologically now.”³⁷⁸ However, Michael Novak makes a convincing case that these Odes are also apocalyptic in nature and “are set in the wider imaginative world of apocalypticism.”³⁷⁹ Suggesting that “transformation, resurrection, eternal life, otherworldly journeys and guides – dominates the *Odes*,”³⁸⁰ all motifs associated with apocalyptic literature. According to Novak’s analysis, the only apocalyptic motif missing in these Odes is *ex eventu* prophecies.³⁸¹ Apart from Odes containing Judgment events and the destruction of the wicked (Odes 5; 7; 11; 17-18; 23-25; 29), cosmic transformations (Odes 1; 3-15; 17-23; 25; 27; 29-33; 35-37; 39; 41-42), and other forms of afterlife (Odes 3; 5-11; 15; 17; 20-21; 26; 28-29; 31; 33-34; 38; 40), Novak considers the four Odes to contain a resurrection hope (Odes 17; 22; 28; 42).³⁸² However, none of these resurrection statements or allusions seem to describe an eschatological universal resurrection. Perhaps, as noted by Charlesworth, the

³⁷⁸Charlesworth, “Odes of Solomon,” OTP, 2:731.

³⁷⁹Michael A. Novak, “The Odes of Solomon as Apocalyptic Literature,” *VC* 66 (2012): 548.

³⁸⁰*Ibid.*, 547.

³⁸¹See Novak’s use of Collin’s analysis diagrams for Apocalyptic literature (see Table 17) on the Odes of Solomon in *Ibid.*, 538-539.

³⁸²There are a number of resurrection allusions in the Odes of Solomon, but this section will only consider the specific resurrection passages. For a list of these resurrection allusions and an anthology of these passages, see section “Prayers, Psalms, and Odes” in chapter one of this work.

focus of the Odes is the immortality already experienced by the community members, therefore, a future bodily resurrection is less relevant.

Resurrection in the Odes of Solomon

The Odist seems to speak as Christ in some of these resurrection passages (Odes 17:12-15; 22:8-12; 42:11-20), referring to Christ's act of salvation which even extended to those who were already dead, a possible interpretation of 1 Pet 3:18-22 and Acts 2:22-27. According to these three passages, Christ entered the realm of the dead, gave them knowledge and "resurrection,"³⁸³ and sowed his fruits in their hearts which transformed them, so "they received my blessing and lived, and they were gathered to me and were saved" (Odes 17:13-15). Odes 22:4-12 expands on Christ's work of salvation and alludes to Ezekiel 37:1-10 when referring to his act of resurrection (Odes 22:8-10). Both passages have the subject of the dead or very dry bones (underlined), and a reversal is taking place in which the bones are once more covered in flesh (highlighted in green). The same observation is made in both passages, that without God's energy of life (highlighted in blue), or God's breath (Ezek 37:8-10), the body remains motionless, still dead. It is only when the breath enters the dead body that it becomes a living being (highlighted in red). This is the reversal of the dying process when the breath went back to God and the body returns to dust (Gen 3:19b; Eccl 3:19-20; 12:7), paralleling God's act of creating humans from the dust of the earth and giving them his breath of life (Gen 2:7).

³⁸³Charlesworth, "Odes of Solomon," OTP, 2:751, note f. It is noted that the literal "my prayer" became a reference to the resurrection.

⁸And it chose them from the graves,
and separated them from the dead ones.
⁹It took dead bones
and covered them with flesh.
¹⁰But they were motionless,
so it gave (them) energy for life.

¹ The hand of the LORD was on me, and He brought me out by His Spirit and set me down in the middle of the valley; it was full of bones. ² He led me all around them. There were a great many of them on the surface of the valley, and they were very dry. ³ Then He said to me, "Son of man, can these bones live?" I replied, "Lord GOD, only You know." ⁴ He said to me, "Prophecy concerning these bones and say to them: Dry bones, hear the word of the LORD! ⁵ This is what the Lord GOD says to these bones: I will cause breath to enter you, and you will live. ⁶ I will put tendons on you, make flesh grow on you, and cover you with skin. I will put breath in you so that you come to life. Then you will know that I am the LORD."

In Odes 42:11-20, the Odist gives more details regarding the response of the dead who heard Christ's words when he entered Sheol and "made a congregation of living among his dead" (Odes 42:14). They begged Christ for pity, mercy, and resurrection, since they recognized that death had no power over him (Odes 42:15-17). They also recognized Christ as the Savior and asked if they could be saved (Odes 42:18), and then he placed his name on their heads and claimed them as his possession (Odes 42:18, 20). However, it is not clear from the text when this resurrection will take place, if it was instantaneous, if these dead resurrected together with Christ, or if they would have to be patient and wait for an eschatological resurrection.

Concluding Remarks

Although the *Odes of Solomon* uses resurrection language in several passages, even alludes to and presents a bodily resurrection view, it is not clear from these resurrection passages when this resurrection event will take place, or its nature.

CHAPTER 4

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

The resurrection passages appearing in Second Temple Period literature, in the Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha, present very diverse views. Each literary work containing a “life-after-death” view seems to present a unique perspective, even compositions presenting only scant details regarding the events following death and the eschatological time. This study identified eighteen distinct views¹ on “life-after-death” with various degrees of complexity ranging from the basic view of *2 Maccabees* (fig. 2) and *Psalms of Solomon* (fig. 21) to the more complex views of the *Book of Watchers* (fig. 6) and *2 Baruch* (fig. 15). Considering this literature, it becomes apparent there is no progress from a basic to a more complex death and resurrection view as various levels of complexity are attested throughout this period. Thus, there is no linear development of the resurrection belief, rather, multiple views co-existed, although an eschatological bodily resurrection belief became the central tenet for both Rabbinic Judaism and the Early Christian Church. Moreover, there seems to be no evidence in this literature in

¹These eighteen distinct views are found in: *2 Maccabees* (Fig. 2); *Wisdom of Solomon* (Fig. 3); *4 Ezra* (Fig. 5); *Book of Watchers* (Fig. 6); *Book of the Epistle of Enoch* (Fig. 7); *2 Enoch* (Fig. 8); *3 Enoch* (Fig. 9); *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* (Fig. 10); *Greek Apocalypse of Ezra* (Fig. 11); *Vision of Ezra* (Fig. 12); *Question of Ezra* (Fig. 13); *2 Baruch* (Fig. 15); *Testament of Abraham* (Fig. 16); *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* (Fig. 17); *Pseudo-Philo* (Fig. 18); *4 Maccabees* (Fig. 19); *Pseudo-Phocylides* (Fig. 20); and *Psalms of Solomon* (Fig. 21).

supporting the notion of a shift in focus from a bodily resurrection toward the immortality of the soul, as the fate of both the body and soul seems to be of great interest to the authors and the communities to which they belonged. From this study, it could also be concluded that just because Jewish and/or Christian texts borrowed or used terms or concepts also present in Greek philosophical texts does not necessarily mean the whole philosophical framework has been accepted. Rather, this study has shown these terms and concepts have been adapted to fit into the theological framework of the composition.

Human Anthropology

One of the primary elements impacting the various resurrection views is the understanding of human anthropology. Figure 22 shows the three positions present in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. The first considers a human being as only consisting of body and life giving breath from God which makes the person a living being. Following death, the body returns to dust while the breath returns to God. Thus, the person ceases to exist as there is no element of that person continuing to exist past the physical death of the body. The second is a bipartite view which suggests a person is both a body and a soul – a soul which lives on after the physical death of the person. The third is a tripartite view which suggests a person consists of a body, soul, and spirit, the latter two components existing beyond death. The books appearing in grey, in these three categories of Figure 22, do not clearly state the anthropological view although details provided in these literary works makes their suggested placement the most likely. From Figure 22, it becomes clear that the predominant view appearing in the Apocrypha and

the Pseudepigrapha is the bipartite view (Body + Soul), while only a handful of books seem to belong to the first category (Body). Only one book belongs to the tripartite category (Body + Soul + Spirit). The view that humans have a soul that exists independently from the body after the point of death, therefore, is by far the majority position presented by these books. As such, if a Jewish or Christian document dated to the Second Temple period seemingly presents a bipartite view, strong evidence from the larger context needs to be provided by the exegete if a different anthropological view is argued. It could also be argued that if the anthropological view of a certain text is not specifically stated, the reader could assume the writer held a bipartite view, unless there is evidence in the text to the contrary. This raises an important question for a New Testament scholar. If Jesus seems to present a bipartite view in the parable of the rich man and Lazarus (Luke 16:19-31), or in his warning against the one who can kill both the body and soul (Matt 10:28), could it be assumed this view of the afterlife and anthropology represent Jesus' personal theological view? If this is the case, Jesus' personal view would certainly be in line with the majority view appearing in Second Temple period literature (see fig. 22). On the other hand, if Jesus does not hold a bipartite view, an alternative explanation is warranted for His statements. With regard to parables, could a parable present an overarching theological framework (i.e., upon death the soul parts the body; the righteous are brought to Paradise for their reward while the wicked are brought to Hades for their punishment; the possibility of a resurrection) which contradicts the personal view of the person recounting the parable – making the main theological

point of the parable true, yet the overall theological framework false? Although this is an important question, this issue is outside the scope of this study.²

Fig. 22. Human Anthropology – The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha

²It might be helpful to consider Brad Young’s observation that although parables “are designed to portray a reality,” they only give “a pictorial representation” of said reality, and as such, careful consideration needs to be shown regarding the relationship between the picture and the portrayed reality. He notes there may be multiple “points of contact,” but suggests a parable only “communicates a single message” in order to “elicit a response” from the audience (*The Parables: Jewish Tradition and Christian Interpretation* [Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1998], 14). For a discussion on how to understand this parable, see e.g.: Kenneth E. Bailey, *Jesus Through Middle Eastern Eyes: Cultural Studies in the Gospels* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008), 378-396; Amy-Jill Levine, *Short Stories by Jesus: The Enigmatic Parables of a Controversial Rabbi*, pbk ed. (New York: HarperOne, 2015), 267-296; and Klyne R. Snodgrass, *Stories with Intent: A Comprehensive Guide to the Parables of Jesus* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008), 419-435.

The bi- and tripartite view of human anthropology introduces several additional elements impacting the death and resurrection view. First, what is the nature of this soul, is it mortal or immortal? Second, where does it go when parting from the body? Third, does the soul of the righteous and the wicked face a different fate following the physical death? If it does, it would require a postmortem evaluation of the soul – a judgment of the soul. Fourth, will the soul be reunified with the body in the eschatological future? An option requiring a bodily resurrection. Fifth, will the soul be in a conscious or an unconscious state while awaiting this eschatological reunification? The literature belonging to the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha provide a different answer to these questions, hence the many variations in the resurrection views (see Table 43). Table 43 lists the destination the disembodied soul of the righteous and the wicked, the state of the soul while disembodied (conscious/unconscious), and if the soul will experience its reward or punishment while in this state. A question mark indicated the literary work does not provide a clear answer. The righteous and the wicked soul have been given the abbreviation R and W respectively.

It should be noted this reunification at the time of the eschatological resurrection and judgment presented in most of these resurrection passages of this period, does not support the Platonic or Gnostic notion that the soul (“the spiritual”) is pure while the body (“the physical or material”) is impure (the source of evil which has imprisoned the soul), because the righteous will spend eternity in their bi- or tripartite state. Moreover, the soul described in these writings, at times, seems to have a very literal and physical

Table 43. The disembodied soul

Literary Work	Disembodied Soul		State of the Soul		Experiences its Reward/Punishment
	Righteous (R)	Wicked (W)	Conscious	Unconscious	
Wisdom of Solomon	God	?			
4 Ezra	Return to God for 7 days before sent to a holding chamber		R/W		R/W
Book of Watchers	Holding chambers		R/W		R/W
Book of the Epistle of Enoch	Sheol		R?/W	R?	
2 Enoch	?	?			
3 Enoch	3 days in the grave => judgment before God's throne		R/W		
Sibylline Oracles	Heavenly Vault	Hades, the Murky dark	R/W		R/W
Apocalypse of Zephaniah	3 days in the air => judgment in Hades • Righteous => Heaven • Wicked => remains in Hades		R/W		R/W
Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	Heaven/Paradise	Bowel of Hades	R/W		R/W
Vision of Ezra	Infernal Regions		R/W		R/W
Question of Ezra	Higher Atmosphere	Lower Atmosphere	R/W		R/W
Apocalypse of Sedrach	3 rd Heaven/Paradise God's Kingdom Bosom of Abraham	Place of Punishment	R/W		R/W
2 Baruch	Treasures for the Souls			R/W	
Apocalypse of Elijah	Western Region		R?/W		R?/W
Testament of the 12 Patriarchs	Captivated by Beliar			R/W	
Testament of Job	Heaven	Hades			
Testament of Abraham	Judgment at the first gate of Heaven • Righteous => Paradise • Inbetweens => Limbo • Wicked => Destruction		R/W		R/W

Table 43 – Continued

Literary Work	Disembodied Soul		State of the Soul		Experiences its Reward/Punishment
	Righteous (R)	Wicked (W)	Conscious	Unconscious	
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	7 th Heaven	Sheol	R	W?	R
Life of Adam and Eve	3 rd Heaven?	?		R?/W?	
Pseudo-Philo	Underworld		R/W		R/W
4 Maccabees	Heaven	Fiery torment	R/W		R/W
Pseudo-Phocylides	Spirit => God Soul => Hades		R/W		R/W
Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers	Placed with the godly ones	Placed with the ungodly ones?		R/W	
Odes of Solomon	Sheol		R/W		

depiction,³ as the reward and punishment experienced by the soul requires a “body,” the *Vision of Ezra* (fig. 12) serving as a good example.

The Nature of the Soul

Figure 23 shows the three categories pertaining to the nature of the soul. It is not helpful to consider the souls of the righteous as they will experience immortality as a part of their reward. The focus should be on the soul of the wicked as their fate is where one

³Using physical terminology when describing a disembodied soul is not unique to these texts. Steiner remarks “in a number of cultures, free souls of the living and/or spirits of the dead are depicted as ethereal miniature replicas of their owners” (*Disembodied Souls*, 121-122), noting “the Greek ψυχή, the Egyptian *ba*, and (less certainly) the Mesopotamian *eṭemmu* possessed a bodily form, and yet they fit the dictionary definition of *disembodied*: they had no material existence, and after death they were freed from their owner’s body” (Ibid., 123). He concludes that “it may well be that the Hebrews, Egyptians, and Greeks could not conceive of their souls in the shape of anything but a body – a body resembling their own” (Ibid.).

Fig. 23. Human Anthropology – The Souls of the Wicked.

would naturally see significant variation in the views relating to the immortality of the soul. The first category of books present the view that the soul is mortal in the sense that the wicked (Body + Soul) will be completely annihilated. The second category of books present the soul as having a beginning, but no end. Therefore, the souls of the wicked will also exist throughout eternity. Unlike the righteous, who will receive their eternal reward, the wicked will experience their eternal punishment. The third category of books present the soul as being truly immortal in that the soul has neither a beginning nor an end – they pre-existed life on earth and they will experience an eternity of reward or punishment. The books appearing in grey in these three categories do not clearly state the destiny of the wicked souls, although details provided in these literary works makes their suggested placement the most likely. It should also be noted that several books belonging to Second

Temple Period Literature do not seem to show much interest in the final destiny of the wicked but focus instead on the reward in store for the righteous, thus making it difficult to determine the nature of the soul in those books.

Scope of the Resurrection

The various resurrection views appearing in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha also differ in their scope, ranging from a universal resurrection to a more limited one. The limited resurrection views consider the resurrection as the eschatological reward of the righteous (figures 2, 20, 21), while views containing a resurrection both of the righteous and the wicked seem to emphasize God's theodicy, in which the righteous are rewarded for their loyalty and the wicked are punished or destroyed due to their disloyalty to God and His instructions. Although most of the resurrection views in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha contain a dual resurrection, they are not always universal in nature as demonstrated by the *Book of Watchers* (fig. 6) which only have some of the wicked resurrected to receive punishment. Most of the resurrection views also consider the dual resurrection, of both the righteous and the wicked, as an important aspect of the reward and punishment process. A portion of the reward of the righteous is to see the punishment given to their former persecutors and enemies, while a portion of the punishment of the wicked is to see rewards bestowed upon the righteous and those they previously persecuted (only one book, *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah*, presents a view similar to the *Book of Revelation*, introducing a time gap between the resurrection of the righteous and the wicked [fig.17]). The question of the nature of the resurrected body then becomes important – will their body look the same as before they died or

different? If seeing what happens to “the others” is a part of the reward or punishment, then it becomes very important that they recognize “the others.” Otherwise, who cares? This is the resurrection view presented in *2 Baruch* (fig.15).

Number and Function of the Judgments

There is also variation in resurrection views when it comes to the function and the number of judgments. If considering the eighteen unique death and resurrection views outlined in this study, it becomes apparent that most of these views present an eschatological judgment (Judgment II), in which the righteous will receive their reward and the wicked their punishment. It also becomes apparent that many of these views also have a judgment of the soul following the physical death of a person. This judgment determines if the soul is righteous, neutral, or wicked, and their immediate and/or future fate (Judgment I). In the case of resurrection being a reward for the righteous, it would also require a pre-resurrection judgment to determine who these righteous are. The *Testament of Abraham*, presents an additional Judgment process (Judgment III) which will also take place in the eschatological time and will be universal in nature (fig. 16). Figure 24 outlines the number of judgments presented in these eighteen unique views – brackets indicate the given judgment is not clearly mentioned in the literary work, although it is certainly implied. It should also be noted that Judgment I is an ongoing judgment as it judges the newly dead until the time of the eschatological resurrection and judgment, thus *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* (fig. 10) and *Questions of Ezra* (fig. 13) allows for repentant wicked souls to move to the category of the righteous souls. The neutral

souls of *Testament of Abraham*, those who are in need of an additional righteous deed to be counted among the righteous, are described as being in a state of limbo until the day of eschatological judgment unless someone intercedes on their behalf, an act deemed to push them over the line (fig. 16). *3 Enoch* also describes “intermediate souls” who are purified from sin in Sheol until they are deemed pure and can then join the “righteous” souls in heaven. However, *3 Enoch* does not describe an eschatological resurrection and judgment. Instead, it describes a daily ongoing judgment, leaving a potential category for in-between souls (fig. 9).

Literary Work	Judgment I Death/Judgment	Judgment II Resurrection/Judgment	Judgment III
2 Maccabees	X		
Wisdom of Solomon	X	X	
4 Ezra	X	X	
Book of Watchers	X	X	
Epistles of Enoch		X	
2 Enoch		X	
3 Enoch	X	X	(X)
Apocalypse of Zephaniah	X	X	
Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	X	X	
Vision of Ezra	X		
Questions of Ezra	X	X	
2 Baruch	(X)	X	
Testament of Abraham	X	X	X
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	(X)	X	
Pseudo-Philo	X	X	
4 Maccabees	X		
Pseudo-Phocylides		(X)	
Psalms of Solomon	(X)	(X)	

Fig. 24. Number of Judgments Presented in the Eighteen Unique Resurrection Views of the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha.

The relationship between resurrection and judgment within the context of the question of theodicy raises an interesting hermeneutical and theological question. This

study shows that a resurrection belief also requires a belief in a judgment as there is a need to determine who will be resurrected and/or to evaluate who is righteous or wicked since they will receive a different destiny. However, does a promise of a future judgment in Second Temple period literature, and by extension, in biblical literature, imply there will also be a form of afterlife and a possible future resurrection, even if this belief is not explicitly stated? Further research into the relationship between a future judgment and implied afterlife is warranted.⁴ Based on the reverse relationship noted in this study, a tentative suggestion could be made. The context and the nature of the future judgment would probably be the determining factor. If the future judgment seems to be personal and is mentioned in a composition which also promotes a set of ethical behaviors for an

⁴Two potentially fruitful biblical passages to explore regarding a future judgment after death and an implied afterlife are Ecclesiastes 11:9-12:14 and Hebrews 9:27-28. The author of the concluding words of Ecclesiastes urges the target audience to “fear God and keep His commandments” as “God will bring every work into judgment, including every secret thing, whether good or evil” (Eccl 12:13-14, NKJV). The concept *יִרְאָה-תְּהֵאֱלֹהִים*, *fear God*, appears in five additional passages in this wisdom book (Eccl 3:14; 5:6; 7:18; 8:12) which together with the expectation of divine judgment, forms the two great themes of the concluding words and provides an interpretative framework for the composition as a whole. In this book, a contrast is also made between two classes of people, “the righteous” (using terms like God-fearers [Eccl 3:14; 5:6; 7:18; 8:12; 12:13]; righteous [Eccl 3:17; 7:15-16, 20; 8:14; 9:2]; good [Eccl 9:2]; and the wise [e.g., Eccl 10:2]) and “the wicked” (using terms like sinners [Eccl 2:26; 7:26; 8:11; 9:2, 18]; wicked [Eccl 3:17; 7:15; 8:10, 12-14; 9:2]; and fool [e.g., Eccl 5:2]). For further study into the eschatological and universal nature of the concluding chapter of Ecclesiastes, see Jacques B. Doukhan, *Ecclesiastes: All is Vanity* (Nampa, ID: Pacific Press, 2006), 119-128. From this, it could be argued that unless there is some form of afterlife in which a person receives some form of reward or punishment based on their good or evil behavior, the warning of a pending judgment would not make much sense. However, the author does not reveal the nature of this implied afterlife.

The link between judgment and some form of afterlife is also implied in Hebrews 9:27-28, in the context of Christ’s Sacrifice (Heb 9:23-28). The author states: “And as it is appointed for men to die once, but after this the judgment, so Christ was offered once to bear the sins of many” (Heb 9:27-28a), suggesting there will be a judgment in store for everyone following death. Though this passage states all humans are faced with certain death, Leon Morris notes this is not “the complete and the final end.” He adds “death is more serious than that because it is followed by judgment. Men are accountable, and after death they will render account to God” (“Hebrews,” in *The Expositor’s Bible Commentary*, ed. Frank E. Gæbelein [Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1981], 93). This text is ambiguous regarding the nature of this judgment (if it will be an instant personal judgment at the point of death, or an eschatological universal judgment) and the nature of the implied afterlife.

individual to adopt or provides a list of behaviors to avoid – it could be assumed that an individual's actions will be evaluated at a future judgment, thus implying some type of afterlife. Otherwise, what would be the purpose of the judgment? Alternatively, if the future judgment is mentioned in the context of the nation of Israel, the judgment may probably not imply a personal afterlife but may instead provide a hope for the survival of the nation.⁵

Final Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked

The final destiny of the righteous and the wicked also impacts a death and resurrection view, as the wicked may be annihilated or punished for all eternity. The final destiny of the righteous also affects the type of body needed to live in that location. If the righteous will spend eternity on earth/new earth, they would only need an earthly body.

⁵The vivid resurrection vision in Ezekiel 37:1-14 serves as a good example of a belief in a life after death following God's catastrophic "judgment" of exile. Based on a rhetorical criticism on Ezekiel's vision of the *Valley of the Bones*, Michael V. Fox, notes "it would be a misinterpretation of Ezek. 37 to see there a concept of individual resurrection, but that misinterpretation would be rooted in Ezekiel's own rhetoric." He suggests this vision "contributed to the formulation of the later doctrine of corporeal resurrection." He adds "the resurrection that he [Ezekiel] is really interested in is not from actual death but from figurative death. Yet his image does offer a new perspective on the life-death polarity, one in which death is not seen as final" (Michael V. Fox, "The Rhetoric of Ezekiel's Vision of the Valley of the Bones," *HUCA* 51 [1980]: 12). Fox concludes Ezekiel's vision regarding the nation of Israel goes beyond a mere promised rebirth and restoration since God will fundamentally restructure her psychology with his "breath of life" (Ibid., 15). Moshe Greenberg notes this "resurrection metaphor of national restoration" was later interpreted literally by early Jewish and Christian interpreters as relating to the universal eschatological resurrection (see Moshe Greenberg, *Ezekiel 21-37: A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary*, AB 22A [Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1997], 749-751). The net effect was Ezekiel's vision was either interpreted figuratively or literally – referring to a national restoration or an individualized revivification.

This study noted several resurrection or personal afterlife passages appearing in the Pseudepigrapha which alluded or referred to the *Valley of the Bones* vision (Sib. Or. 2.221-226; 4.181-182; Apoc. El. [H]; Liv. Pro. 3:12; 4 Macc. 18:17; Odes Sol. 22:8-10). The most interesting in this context is the case in *Lives of the Prophets* as this passage shows a dual understanding of Ezekiel's vision, giving it both a personal and a corporate interpretation. It seems Ezekiel would argue that both the nation of Israel and the individual person will have a "future." The enemy may think they will be able to defeat or the destroy the nation of Israel, however, this will only be a temporary defeat since the nation will have a "future" in the present age and will be restored. The same is true on a personal level, individuals are killed, however, through their resurrection, they will have a "future" in the age to come.

However, if the righteous will be brought to heaven following the eschatological resurrection and judgment, they would need a “heavenly body” as described in *2 Baruch*, *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah*, and *Psalms of Solomon* (figs. 15, 17, 21). This view is best described in the *Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah* (fig. 17), which describes the “robes-of-flesh” intended for earthly dwelling and the “robes-of-above” necessary for dwelling in heaven. Table 44 shows the final destination of the righteous and the wicked as outlined in this study. Some of the resurrection passages considered in this work did not provide a full resurrection picture, as they only focused on either the fate of the righteous or the wicked, and did not reveal the final destiny of the other group, or only alluded to their final destination. This ambiguity or uncertainty has been indicated by the use of “?” in the following table.

In the light of the plethora of views regarding the afterlife in the Literature of Second Temple Period, a reader of the New Testament is faced with the following crucial question: “Is it reasonable to assume that the New Testament presents a harmonized view on the resurrection and afterlife (see Figure 25 for an example of a harmonized resurrection view)? Or, should the reader instead be open to New Testament writers holding various views, thus being more sensitive to the differences between the differing eschatological accounts?”⁶

⁶Jan A. Sigvartsen, “The Afterlife in the Apocalyptic Literature of Second Temple Period Judaism,” paper presented at the Midwest Region Society of Biblical Literature, Olivet Nazarene University, Bourbonnais, IL, 8 February 2015.

Table 44. Final destiny of the righteous and the wicked

Book	Righteous	Wicked
Sirach	World?	Fire and worms
2 Maccabees	World	Grave
Wisdom of Solomon	World	Grave
4 Ezra	World	Hades/Hell
Book of Watchers	World	Fiery Abyss
Book of Parables	Earth to Come/Dwell with God	Condemnation?
Book of Dream Visions	New Age	Fiery Abyss
Book of Epistles of Enoch	Heaven	Hell
2 Enoch	Paradise (3 rd Heaven)	Hell (5 th Heaven)
3 Enoch	God's Throne	Gehinnom
Sibylline Oracles 2	Recreated world	Destruction by fire
Sibylline Oracles 5	Pleasant life on a fertile earth	Punished in the fire of Gehenna
Sibylline Oracles 7	Recreated world	Burn in spirit by their perishing flesh
Sibylline Oracles 8	Recreated world?	Punished by a torturous fire forever
Sib.Or. Frag. 1	Paradise	Burned with torches all day, forever
Apocalypse of Zephaniah	Heavenly City	Hades
Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	Heaven/Paradise	Hades/Gehenna
Vision of Ezra	Heaven/Paradise	Infernal Regions/Hell fire
Question of Ezra	God's throne/Upper Atmosphere	Place of Punishment
Apocalypse of Sedrach	Paradise/3rd Heaven/God's Kingdom/ Bosom of Abraham	Place of Punishment
2 Baruch	Heaven/Paradise/World to come	Place of torment/Fire
Apocalypse of Elijah (C)	Heaven Recreated world	?
Apocalypse of Elijah (H)	New Jerusalem, Earth	Punishment

Table 44 - Continued

Book	Righteous	Wicked
T12P	Paradise/Presence of the Lord	Destroyed by eternal fire
T. Job	Heaven	Hades
T. Abraham	Paradise	Destruction and eternal punishment
T. Moses	?	Gehenna
T. Adam	Heaven	Sheol
Jubilees	Heaven	Sheol
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	7 th Heaven	Destruction
Joseph and Aseneth	7 th Heaven	?
Life of Adam and Eve	Garden of Eden with God	Condemned to Death
Pseudo-Philo	World-to-Come	Annihilation
Lives of the Prophets	World-to-Come	?
4 Baruch	Heavenly Jerusalem	?
4 Maccabees	Heaven	Fiery Torment
Pseudo-Phocylides	God	Hades
Psalms of Solomon	Haven/Glory/Light of the Lord	Destruction
Hellensistic Synagogal Prayers	Paradise (regained)	?
Odes of Solomon	New World	Destruction

Fig. 25. A Harmonized Resurrection View

This begs an important theological question regarding inspiration. If the Holy Spirit inspired the New Testament writers⁷ could they hold different views regarding the resurrection belief? Is it possible to have a “high-view-of-Scripture” while at the same time making allowance for different resurrection views? Could it be argued that the New Testament writers are in agreement on the main theological points (the big picture), that this life is not “all-there-is?” They reveal that there is a “life-after-death” where the righteous will be rewarded and the wicked will be punished, although they may have different views regarding some of the finer details of this afterlife. Would a consideration be regarded as an abandonment of the reformation principles of *Sola Scriptura*, *Tota Scriptura*, *Prima Scriptura* and the *Analogy of Scripture* by scholars belonging to a protestant tradition?

Use of the TaNaKh in Support of the Resurrection Belief

A careful reading of all the resurrection passages appearing in the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha reveal that most of the distinct views on “life-after-death,” regardless of their complexity, are often supported by several key passages from the TaNaKh or shared motifs with the TaNaKh. Future analysis of these key passages from the TaNaKh may shed further light on how the various literary works from this period interpreted, understood, used, and reused the TaNaKh. It may even determine if the resurrection belief is indeed present in these texts (based on good exegesis) or if this belief was read into

⁷This assumes the Greek phrase *πᾶσα γραφὴ θεόπνευστος*, *all Scriptures is God-breathed* (2 Tim 3:16a) is not only referring to the Scriptures in the TaNaKh but is also applicable to the New Testament writings – even those books written after this statement was written.

these texts by Second Temple Period authors (an example of eisegesis). Based on preliminary observations, some of these resurrection concepts seem to derive naturally from the TaNaKh, while others seems to be based on an interpretation or a more elaborate exegesis. Yet, other usages seem a bit more forced, and in those cases the TaNaKh appears to be considered a source of proof-texts, seemingly often disregarding the larger context of the text quoted or alluded to. Early Second Temple period resurrection texts seem to be supported by a creative use of the TaNaKh while late Second Temple Period texts, early Christian, and Rabbinic texts seem to utilize more proof-texting. A good example is the conclusion of *4 Maccabees*, which gives a list of important texts in support of an afterlife and the instant reward in store for the soul of the righteous, a view excluding the need for a bodily resurrection which is in stark contrast to the parallel narrative of 2 Maccabees 7. Interestingly, it could be argued that these proof-texts could easily be utilized to support a universal eschatological resurrection belief, and this study shows that some of these passages were indeed used by other literary works in support of their unique perspective on the afterlife. For the Christian writers, the main support for the resurrection belief was found in Jesus' resurrection, thus, questioning the bodily resurrection belief was equated with questioning the historicity of Jesus' resurrection, the guarantor for the Christians' salvation hope. Hence, the Christian interpolations found in the Pseudepigrapha do not add much additional support from the TaNaKh in support of the resurrection belief. In Rabbinic Judaism, questioning that the resurrection belief did not derive from the Torah would disqualify the person from any share in the world to come – thus their propensity to find proof-texts from the Torah, as attested in the

Babylonian Talmud (b. Sahn. 90a-92b). An awareness of Second Temple period literature is helpful for gaining a better understanding of the death and afterlife views presented in the New Testament and Early Rabbinic literature, as it shows they are a part of the larger discussion taking place during this critical period. Table 45 provides a list of “resurrection passages” from the TaNaKh which were referred or alluded to in the context of the resurrection statements surveyed from the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. However, “Resurrection Scripture Clouds” are not included in this table.⁸ Table 46 centers on the 18 distinct afterlife views and indicates which views are supported by the TaNaKh – references and allusions to the TaNaKh are bolded as a contrast to shared concepts. These two tables will give an indication of the number of TaNaKh texts which were perceived as resurrection texts and the texts which were most often referred or alluded to. The reader should keep in mind this great plethora of afterlife views continued beyond the close of the second Temple period⁹ and has survived into present time as reflected by the diverse beliefs held by the many Christian denominations.

⁸A “Resurrection Scripture Cloud” is a combination of passages carefully strung together to form a resurrection argument which individually would not necessarily support a resurrection belief. Several examples of such “Scripture Clouds” appear in Table 46, in which *Book of Watchers* and *4 Maccabees* serve as great examples. These “Scripture Clouds” have been unpacked and discussed in the main body of this dissertation.

⁹For a study on the multiple resurrection views held in the early Christian Church, see Eliezer Gonzalez, *The Fate of the Dead in Early Third Century North African Christianity: The Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas and Tertullian*. STAC 83 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2014).

Table 45. List of the TaNaKh passages referred or alluded to in the context of the resurrection statements surveyed from the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha

TaNaKh	Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha
Gen 3:19	2 En. J32:1; Sib. Or. 8:96-99; Apoc. Mos. 41:1-2; Hel. Syn. Pr. 3:25-26; 12:49-50.
Exod 3:6	4 Macc. 7:18-19; Hel. Syn. Pr. 16:7-9.
Deut 30:19-20	4 Ezra 7:129; 4 Macc. 18:18-19.
Deut 32:29, 47	4 Macc. 18:18-19.
Deut 32:29	2 Macc 7:6; Apoc. El. (H).
Deut 33:3	4 Macc. 17:17-21.
1 Sam 28:7-20	Ps.-Philo 64:5-8.
Isa 26:19-21	2 Macc 7:23; 4 Ezra 7:97; Apoc. Ezek. Frag.1.
Isa 35:4-7	Sib. Or. 8.205-212.
Isa 49:6	Sir 48:1-11.
Isa 52-53	2 Macc 7:23; Wis 3:5-6.
Isa 52:1-2	1 En. 62:15a.
Isa 54:8-10	2 Macc 7:28-29.
Isa 56:1	2 Macc 7:28-29.
Isa 64:4-11	2 Macc 7:28-29.
Isa 65:17	Ps.-Philo 3:10.
Isa 66:22-24	Sir 7:17b; Ps.-Philo 3:10; Apoc. El. (H).
Ezek 34	1 En. 90:33.
Ezek 37:1-14	1 En. 90:33; Sib. Or. 2.211-226; 4.181-182; Apoc. El (H); Liv. Pro. 3:12; 4 Macc. 18:17; Odes 22:8-10.
Hos 6:2	3 En. 28:7-10.
Mal 4:1-6	Sir 48:1-11; T. Zeb. 9:8.
Ps 1:5-6	Pss. Sol. 14:9-10.
Ps 50:1-6	Apoc. Ezek. Frag.1.
Prov 3:18	4 Macc. 18:16.
Job 42:17 LXX	T. Job 4:4-11.
Dan 7:18, 22	Wis 3:7-8.
Dan 12:1-2	T. Benj. 10:8.

Table 45 – Continued

TaNaKh	Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha
Dan 12:1-3	1 En. 51:1-5; 102:4-104:8.
Dan 12:2-3	4 Ezra 7:32-33; 2 Bar 49-51; T. Mos. 10:9-14.
Dan 12:2	2 Macc 7:9b, 14b; Mart. Ascen. Isa. 4:14-18; Ps.-Philo 3:10; Pss. Sol. 2:31; 3:11-12.
Dan 12:3	Wis 3:7-8; 2 En. 22:8, 10; 66:7; 4 Macc. 17:5; Ps.-Philo 33:1-5; Ps.-Phoc. 104b.
Dan 12:13	Wis 3:5-6; T. Mos. 10:9-14.

Table 46. The eighteen distinct afterlife views and the TaNaKh

Literary Work	Reference/Allusions
2 Maccabees	Gen 1 [<i>ex nihilo</i>]; Deut 28-32 [32:29]; Is 26 ; 52-53 ; Ecc1 12:13 .
Wisdom of Solomon	Isa 5:24 ; 52-53 ; Obad 18 ; Dan 7:18, 22 ; 12:1-3, 13 .
4 Ezra	Deut 30:11-20 ; Is 26:19 ; Dan 7:9-10 ; 12:2-3 .
Book of Watchers (1 En 1-36)	Gen 2:7 ; 4:9-10 ; 9:4-6 ; Ecc1 12:7 .
Book of the Epistle of Enoch (1 En 91-105)	Dan 12:1-3.
2 Enoch	Gen 3:19b .
3 Enoch	Hos 6:2 ; Dan 4 [celestial beings]; Dan 7:9-10, 27 .
Apocalypse of Zephaniah	—
Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	—
Vision of Ezra	—
Question of Ezra	—
2 Baruch	Gen 1:8 ; Exod 35:29-30 ; Dan 2 ; 7 ; 12:1-3, 13 .
Testament of Abraham	Deut 19:15 [the need for three witnesses judgments].
Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	Dan 2 ; 7 ; 12 [Dan 12:12 - 1335 day prophecy].
Pseudo-Philo	Exod 34:29-35; Josh 7; 1 Sam 28:12-19 ; Isa 65:17; 66:22; Dan 12:2-3.
4 Maccabees	Gen 3:24 ; 4:1-6, 8 ; 22:1-19 ; 39:7-23 ; 40:3 ; Exod 3:6 ; Num 25:6-13 ; Deut 30:20 ; 32:1-42 ; 32:39, 47 ; 33:3 ; Isa 43:2 ; Ezek 37:1-14 ; Mal 3:2-3 ; Ps 34:20 ; Prov 3:18 ; Dan 3:1-30 ; 6:1-28 ; 12:3 .
Pseudo-Phocylides	Gen 1:26-27 ; 2:7 ; 3:19b, 22 ; 6:3 ; Deut 15:2-3; 1 Sam 2:20; Ps 8:6 [MT]; Ecc1 3:20 ; 12:7 ; Dan 12:3.
Psalms of Solomon	Isa 2:5; 60:1; Ps 1:5- ; Prov 20:27; Dan 12:2 .

APPENDIX A

CLASSIFICATION OF RESURRECTION TEXTS

Appendix A gives a survey of the resurrection passages compiled from Second Temple period literature, the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. They have been divided into the below six tables. For a survey of the resurrection passages compiled from the Dead Sea Scrolls, Josephus, New Testament, and Early Rabbinic Period, see Appendix B.

Table 49	Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Apocrypha;
Table 50	Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha - Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works
Table 51	Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha - Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections)
Table 52	Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha - Expansions on Stories and Legends
Table 53	Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha - Wisdom and Philosophical Literature
Table 54	Resurrection Texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha - Prayers, Psalms, and Odes

Each of these six tables is followed by an anthology of the resurrection passages listed in the Table, to show the larger context of the resurrection statement and provide the general reader a convenient access to these resurrection texts which are discussed in this

dissertation.¹ Chapters two and three of this dissertation examine the passages listed in the tables of this Appendix which are either referring or alluding to texts from the TaNaKh in support of a resurrection belief.

Table 47 shows the different categories used when analyzing and classifying these resurrection texts and provides a short explanation of each category. Since the books appearing in the Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha were composed, edited and even redacted during a period ranging several centuries (Second century BCE [1 Enoch] – Ninth century CE [Greek Apocalypse of Ezra]) it becomes helpful to include a suggested dating for each book in these six Tables for a proper evaluation of the resurrection passage since it may also shed some light on the developmental stages of the resurrection belief.² This being the case, these Tables also include a category for the suggested religious background for each listed resurrection passage: Jewish, Christian, or Jewish-Christian. Appendix B provides similar table of categories to show the relevant categories when classifying and evaluating resurrections texts found in the Dead Sea Scrolls, Josephus, New Testament, Jewish Liturgy texts, and in early rabbinic literature.

¹The relevant passages for the anthologies are collected from: *King James Version Apocrypha* (KJA) – BibleWorks; Robert Henry Charles, *Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament* (Bellingham, WA : Logos Research Systems, 2004) and James H. Charlesworth, ed., *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* (2 vols; The Anchor Bible Reference Library, New York: Doubleday, 1983-1985).

²The suggested dates given for the literary works belonging to the Apocrypha are mainly based on David A. deSilva, *Introducing the Apocrypha: Message, Context, and Significance* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2002) and to a lesser degree on Craig A. Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies: A Guide to the Background Literature* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2005). The works belonging to the Pseudepigrapha are mostly based on Charlesworth's two-volume work, *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* and to a lesser degree on Craig A. Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*. Additionally, the dating of each literary work is considered in chapter two and three when discussing the resurrection passages appearing in these literary works.

Table 47. List of categories used in the resurrection texts tables in Appendix A

Category		Explanation
Date		Date the book was written.
Passage		Passage reference.
Notes		Author's notes.
Resurrection	Implied	A resurrection belief is implied in the passage.
	Stated	A resurrection belief is stated clearly in the passage.
Classification	Reference	The resurrection passage refers to a resurrection text in the TaNaKh.
	Allusion	The resurrection passage alludes to a resurrection text in the TaNaKh.
	Philosophical	Resurrection passage uses a philosophical argument as a proof for a resurrection belief.
	Assumed	Since the resurrection belief is assumed, no attempt is made to prove biblically or philosophically that their will be a resurrection.
	Eschatological	Eschatological resurrection.
	Jewish/Christian	Jewish, Christian, or a Jewish-Christian passage [J, C, J/C].

The relevant sections referring directly or indirectly to a resurrection belief have been highlighted in **red** and **bolded** for emphasis in the anthologies. The reader will also notice that these anthologies have placed these resurrection statements in the larger context, a decision made to better understand the underlying reasoning behind each statement. Additionally, references and allusions to the TaNaKh, Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Dead Sea Scrolls, Rabbinic Literature, and the New Testament, most of these references appears in the margin and in the footnotes of Charles' and Charlesworth's collections of Pseudepigraphical writings, are placed in a smaller font and in [brackets] in the resurrection passage. They are color coded as follows:

- [blue] – TaNaKh
- [black] – Apocrypha/Pseudepigrapha/Dead Sea Scrolls/Rabbinic Literature
- [green] – New Testament

References and allusions to the TaNaKh, alluding or directly supporting a resurrection belief have also been **bolded** for emphasis. It should be noted that many of these references are cross-references referring to synonymous or related thoughts found in the larger body of Second Temple period texts and as such, does not necessarily reflect or suggest a dependency between the passage and the given reference. Table 47 shows the various coding utilized in the anthology.

Table 48. The different coding utilized in the anthology in Appendix A

Black text	The context of the resurrection passage.
Red bolded text	Section referring directly or indirectly to a resurrection belief.
<u>Underlined text</u>	Obvious Christian interpolation in an original Jewish text.
Boxed words	Used for emphasis/structure.
[blue, 8pt]	A cross-reference to the TaNaKh.
[blue, 8pt]	A reference or allusion from the TaNaKh alluding or directly support a resurrection belief.
[black, 8pt]	A cross-reference to the Pseudepigrapha/Apocrypha/Qumran/ Rabbinic literature.
[green, 8pt]	A cross-reference to the New Testament.

RESURRECTION TEXTS IN THE APOCRYPHAL WRITINGS

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 49. List of resurrection texts: Old Testament Apocrypha

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE	Ecclesiasticus (Sirach)	2:9c; (7:17b) 16:22c 19:19	These passages in the longer GII recension hints to a resurrection hope.	x					x	J
		46:19-20	Sleep = Death	x					x	J
		48:11b	Ben Sira's grandson may have added this resurrection hope	x					x	J
First Century BCE	2 Maccabees	6:26	No one will escape the hands of God	x					x	J
		7	The Martyrdom of the seven brothers		x	x	x	x		J
		12:43-45	Made atonement for the dead. Paul uses this argument in 1 Cor 15:29		x			x	x	J
		14:37-46	Death of Razis		x				x	J

Table 49 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century BCE	Wisdom of Solomon	3:1-13a	Body/Soul They will shine forth	x		x			x	J
		4:16-5:16	The triumph of the righteous and the final judgment	x			x		x	J
Second Century CE	2 Esdras/5 Ezra	2:10-47	Exhortation to good work; Proper burial practice; Replacement theology; Resurrection/Reward of the Kingdom; Sleep Death		x				x	C
First Century CE	2 Esdras/4 Ezra	4:7-11	Exits of Hades – Entrances of Paradise	x						J
		4:33-43	Predestined time; Hades womb; Souls in the chambers of Hades are impatient; The number needs to be filled	x				x	x	J
		5:38-40	Only God knows his judgment and the goal of his love	x					x	J
		7:10-16	Two worlds, this world is the test	x					x	J
		7:26-51	Body+Soul=Resurrection; Universal resurrection (Individuals/nations); Detailed eschatology		x		x		x	J

Table 49 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century CE	2 Esdras/4 Ezra	7:66-105	The state of the departed before the judgment		x		x		x	J
		7:112-115	Universal judgment	x						J
		7:117-131	Future promises given to the righteous	x						J
		8:1-3	Two worlds. “Many have been created, but only a few shall be saved”	x					x	J
		8:12-19	Ezra questions God’s judgment/justice	x						J
		8:37-40	The final destiny of the two ways	x					x	J
		8:46-54	The final destiny of the righteous	x						J
		9:7-13	The wicked will acknowledge God’s justice	x					x	J
		10:10, 15-17	“If you acknowledge the decree of God to be just, you will receive your son back”	x						J
		14:34-35	Resurrection/Judgment	x					x	J

Resurrection Passages in Context

Sirach 2:7-11

- ⁷You who fear the Lord, wait for his mercy;
do not stray, or else you may fall [Ps 37:7-9].
- ⁸You who fear the Lord, trust in him,
and you reward will not be lost [Sir 51:30].
- ⁹You who fear the Lord, hope for good things,
for lasting joy and mercy
[For his reward is an everlasting gift with joy].
- ¹⁰Consider the generation of old and see:
has anyone trusted in the Lord and been disappointed?
Or has anyone persevered in the fear of the Lord [of him] and been forsaken?
Or has anyone called upon him and been neglected? [Ps 37:25; 145:18; 1 Macc 2:61]
- ¹¹For the Lord is compassionate and merciful;
he forgives sins and saves in time of distress [Ps 86:15; Sir 51:12].

Sirach 7:15-17

- ¹⁵Do not hate hard labor
or farm work, which was created by the Most High [Gen 3:19, 23].
- ¹⁶Do not enroll in the ranks of sinners;
remember that retribution does not delay.
- ¹⁷Humble yourself to the utmost,
for the punishment of the ungodly is fire and worms [Isa 66:24; Jdt 16:17; Sir 18:21; Mark 9:48]
[Heb: for the expectation of mortals is worms]

Sirach 12:4-7

- ⁴Give to the devout, but do not help the sinner [Tob 4:17; Matt 5:43-48].
- ⁵Do good to the humble, but do not give to the ungodly;
Hold back their bread, and do not give it to them,
for by means of it they might subdue you;
then you will receive twice as much evil
for all the good you have done to them.
- ⁶For the Most High also hates sinners
and will inflict punishment on the ungodly [Ps 11:5-6]
[and he is keeping them for the day of their punishment].
- ⁷Give to the one who is good, but do not help the sinner.

Sirach 16:17-23

- ¹⁷Do not say, "I am hidden from the Lord,
and who from on high has me in mind? [Ps 138:7]
Among so many people I am unknown,
for what am I in a boundless creation?
- ¹⁸Lo, heaven and the highest heaven,
the abyss and the earth, treble at his visitation! [1 Kings 8:27; Mic 1:3-4; 2 Pet 3:7, 10]
- ¹⁹The very mountains and the foundations of the earth
quiver and quake when he looks upon them [Isa 24:18; Ps 18:7; 104:32].
- ²⁰But no human mind can grasp this,
and who can comprehend his ways? [Rom 11:33]
- ²¹Like a tempest that no one can see,
so most of his works are concealed [Ps 97:2; Prov 25:2; Sir 43:32]
[Heb/Syr: If I sin, no eye can see me, and if I am disloyal all in secret, who is to know?].

²²Who is to announce his acts of justice?
Or who can await them? For his decree [Heb: the decree; Gr: the covenant] is far off”
[and a scrutiny for all comes at the end].

²³Such are the thoughts of one devoid of understanding;
a senseless and misguided person thinks foolishly.

Sirach 19:13-19

¹³Question a friend; perhaps he did not do it;
or if he did, so that he may not do it again [Lev 19:17].
¹⁴Question a neighbor; perhaps he did not say it;
or if he said it, so that he may not repeat it.
¹⁵Question a friend, for often it is slander;
so do not believe everything you hear.
¹⁶A person may make a slip without intending it.
Who has not sinned with his tongue? [Sir 14:1]
¹⁷Question your neighbor before you threaten him;
and let the law of the Most High take its course [and do not be angry] [Lev 19:17].
[¹⁸The fear of the Lord is the beginning of acceptance,
and wisdom obtains his love.
¹⁹The knowledge of the Lord’s commandments is life-giving discipline,
and those who do what is pleasing to him enjoy the fruits of the tree of immortality.]

Sirach 46:11-20

¹¹The judges also, with their respective names,
whose hearts did not fall into idolatry
and who did not turn away from the Lord –
may their memory be blessed! [Judg 2:17; Sir 45:1; 1 Macc 3:7]
¹²**May their bones send forth new life from where they lie,**
and may the names of those who have been honored
live again in their children! [Sir 49:10]

¹³Samuel was beloved by his Lord;
a prophet of the Lord, he established the kingdom
and anointed rulers over his people [1 Sam 10:1; Acts 13:20].
¹⁴By the law of the Lord he judged the congregation,
and the Lord watched over Jacob.
¹⁵By his faithfulness he was proved to be prophet,
and by his words he became known as a trustworthy seer [1 Sam 3:19, 20].
¹⁶He called upon the Lord, the Mighty One,
when his enemies pressed him on every side,
and he offered in sacrifice a suckling lamb [1 Sam 7:7-10; Ps 99:6].
¹⁷Then the Lord thundered from heaven,
and made his voice heard with a mighty sound;
¹⁸he subdued the leaders of the enemy
and all the rulers of the Philistines.
¹⁹**Before the time of his eternal sleep,**
Samuel bore witness before the Lord and his anointed:
“No property, not so much as a pair of shoes,
have I taken from anyone!”
And no one accused him. [1 Sam 12:3]
²⁰**Even after he had fallen asleep,** he prophesied
and made known to the king his death,

and lifted up his voice from the ground
in prophecy, to blot out the wickedness of the people. [1 Sam 28:16-19; Sir 48:13]

Sirach 48:1-11

- ¹Then Elijah arose, a prophet like fire,
and his word burned like a torch [Mal 4:5].
²He brought a famine upon them,
and by his zeal he made them few in number.
³By the word of the Lord he shut up the heavens,
and also three times brought down fire [1 Kings 17:1; 18:38; 2 Kings 1:10, 12].
⁴How glorious you were, Elijah, in your wondrous deeds!
Whose glory is equal to yours?
⁵You raised a corpse from death [1 Kings 17:21-22],
And from Hades, by the word of the Most High.
⁶You sent kings down to destruction,
and famous men, from their sickbeds [2 Kings 1:2-4, 6, 16-17; 2 Chron 21:12-15].
⁷You heard rebuke at Sinai,
and judgements of vengeance at Horeb [1 Kings 19:8-18].
⁸You anointed kings to inflict retribution [1 Kings 19:15-17; 2 Kings 8:12-15; 9:1-10],
and prophets to succeed you [1 Kings 19:15, 16].
⁹You were taken up by a whirlwind of fire,
in a chariot with horses of fire [2 Kings 2:1, 11; 6:17].
¹⁰At the appointed time, it is written, you are destined
to calm the wrath of God before it breaks out in fury,
to turn the hearts of parents to their children [Mal 4:5-6; Sir 36:13; Luke 1:17],
and to restore the tribes of Jacob.
¹¹**Happy are those who saw you
and were adorned, [and have died]
For we also shall surely live.**

2 Maccabees

2 Maccabees 6:21-30

²¹Those who were in charge of that unlawful sacrifice took the man aside because of their long acquaintance with him, and privately urged him to bring meat of his own providing, proper for him to use, and to pretend that he was eating the flesh of the sacrificial meal that had been commanded by the king [1 Macc 1:47; 2 Macc 6:7], ²²so that by doing this he might be saved from the death, and be treated kindly on account of his old friendship with them [1 Macc 2:18]. ²³But making a high resolve, worthy of his years and the dignity of his old age and the gray hairs that he had reached with distinction and his excellent life even from childhood, and moreover according to the holy God-given law, he declared himself quickly, **telling them to send him to Hades** [Prov 16:31; 20:29; 4 Macc 5:7].
²⁴"Such pretense is not worthy of our time of life," he said, "for many of the young might suppose that Eleazar in his ninetieth year had gone over to an alien religion [2 Macc 4:13], ²⁵and through my pretense, for the sake of living a brief moment longer, they would be led astray because of me, while I defile and disgrace my old age. ²⁶Even if for the present I would avoid the punishment of mortals, **yet whether I live or die I shall not escape the hands of the Almighty** [2 Esd 7:56; Matt 10:28; Luke 12:4-5; Heb 10:31]. ²⁷Therefore, by bravely giving up my life now, I will show myself worthy of my old age ²⁸and leave to the young a noble example of how to die a good death willingly and nobly for the revered and holy laws [2 Macc 6:31]."
When he had said this, he went at once to the rack. ²⁹Those who a little before had acted toward him with goodwill now changed to ill will, because the words he had uttered were in their opinion sheer madness [Wis 5:4]. ³⁰When he was about to die under the blows, he groaned aloud and said: "It is clear to the Lord in his

holy knowledge that, though I might have been saved from death, I am enduring terrible sufferings in my body under this beating, but in my soul I am glad to suffer these things because I fear him [4 Macc 6:27; [Heb 11:35-36](#)].”

2 Maccabees 7

¹It happened also that seven brothers and their mother were arrested and were being compelled by the king, under torture with whips and thongs, to partake of unlawful swine's flesh [2 Macc 6:18]. ²One of them, acting as their spokesman, said, "What do you intend to ask and learn from us? For we are ready to die rather than transgress the laws of our ancestors [2 Macc 4:48; 6:19]." ³The king fell into a rage, and gave orders to have pans and caldrons heated [2 Macc 7:39]. ⁴These were heated immediately, and he commanded that the tongue of their spokesman be cut out and that they scalp him and cut off his hands and feet, while the rest of the brothers and the mother looked on. ⁵When he was utterly helpless, the king ordered them to take him to the fire, still breathing, and to fry him in a pan. The smoke from the pan spread widely, but the brothers and their mother encouraged one another to die nobly, saying, **"The Lord God is watching over us and in truth has compassion on us, as Moses declared in his song that bore witness against the people to their faces, when he said, 'And he will have compassion on his servants'"** [Deut 31:21, 26, 30; 32:36; Ps 135:14]. ⁷After the first brother had died in this way, they brought forward the second for their sport. They tore off the skin of his head with the hair, and asked him, "Will you eat rather than have your body punished limb by limb? [[Heb 11:36](#)]" ⁸He replied in the language of his ancestors and said to them, "No." Therefore he in turn underwent tortures as the first brother had done [2 Macc 7:21, 27; 12:37; 15:29]. ⁹And when he was at his last breath, he said, "You accursed wretch, you dismiss us from this present life, **but the King of the universe will raise us up to an everlasting renewal of life, because we have died for his laws** [[Dan 12:2](#); 2 Esd 14:35; 2 Macc 7:14, 23, 36]." ¹⁰After him, the third was the victim of their sport. When it was demanded, he quickly put out his tongue and courageously stretched forth his hands, ¹¹and said nobly, **"I got these from Heaven, and because of his laws I disdain them, and from him I hope to get them back again."** ¹²As a result the king himself and those with him were astonished at the young man's spirit, for he regarded his sufferings as nothing. ¹³After he too had died, they maltreated and tortured the fourth in the same way. ¹⁴When he was near death, he said, **"One cannot but choose to die at the hands of mortals and to cherish the hope God gives of being raised again by him. But for you there will be no resurrection to life!"** [[Dan 12:2](#); 2 Esd 14:35; 2 Macc 7:23, 26] ¹⁵Next they brought forward the fifth and maltreated him. ¹⁶But he looked at the king, and said, "Because you have authority among mortals, though you also are mortal, you do what you please. But do not think that God has forsaken our people. ¹⁷Keep on, and see how his mighty power will torture you and your descendants! [2 Macc 9:5, 6, 9]" ¹⁸After him they brought forward the sixth. And when he was about to die, he said, "Do not deceive yourself in vain. For we are suffering these things on our own account, because of our sins against our own God. Therefore astounding things have happened [2 Macc 6:12-17; 7:32, 33, 38]. ¹⁹But do not think that you will go unpunished for having tried to fight against God! [2 Macc 9:5, 6, 9; [Acts 5:39](#)]" ²⁰The mother was especially admirable and worthy of honorable memory. Although she saw her seven sons perish within a single day, **she bore it with good courage because of her hope in the Lord.** ²¹She encouraged each of them in the language of their ancestors. Filled with a noble spirit, she reinforced her woman's reasoning with a man's courage, and said to them [2 Macc 7:8, 27; 12:37; 15:29], **"I do not know how you came into being in my womb. It was not I who gave you life and breath, nor I who set in order the elements within each of you [Ps 139:13-16; Eccl 11:5]. ²³Therefore the Creator of the world, who shaped the beginning of humankind and devised the origin of all things, will in his mercy give life and breath back to you again, since you now forget yourselves for the sake of his laws."** [2 Macc 1:24; 6:16; 7:9, 33] ²⁴Antiochus felt that he was being treated with contempt, and he was suspicious of her reproachful tone. The youngest brother being still alive, Antiochus not only appealed to him in words, but promised with oaths that he would make him rich and enviable if he would turn from the ways of his ancestors, and that he would take him for his Friend and entrust him with public affairs [1 Macc 2:18]. ²⁵Since the young man would not listen to him at all, the king called the mother to him and urged her to advise the youth to save himself. ²⁶After much urging on his part, she undertook to persuade her son. ²⁷But, leaning close to him, she spoke in their native language as follows, deriding the cruel tyrant: "My son, have pity on me. I carried you nine months in my womb, and nursed you for three years, and have reared

you and brought you up to this point in your life, and have taken care of you [2 Macc 7:8, 21; 12:37; 15:29]. ²⁸I beg you, my child, to look at the heaven and the earth and see everything that is in them, and recognize that **God did not make them out of things that existed. And in the same way the human race came into being** [Gen 1; 2:7; Rom 4:17; Heb 11:3]. ²⁹Do not fear this butcher, but prove worthy of your brothers. **Accept death, so that in God's mercy I may get you back again along with your brothers"** [2 Macc 7:9; 14:29; 2 Esd 10:16]. ³⁰While she was still speaking, the young man said, "What are you waiting for? I will not obey the king's command, but I obey the command of the law that was given to our ancestors through Moses. ³¹But you, who have contrived all sorts of evil against the Hebrews, will certainly not escape the hands of God [2 Macc 7:17; 15:37]. ³²For we are suffering because of our own sins [2 Macc 7:18]. ³³And if our living Lord is angry for a little while, to rebuke and discipline us, he will again be reconciled with his own servants [2 Macc 5:17, 20; 6:16; 7:23]. ³⁴But you, unholy wretch, you most defiled of all mortals, do not be elated in vain and puffed up by uncertain hopes, when you raise your hand against the children of heaven [2 Macc 5:17, 21]. ³⁵You have not yet escaped the judgment of the almighty, all-seeing God. ³⁶**For our brothers after enduring a brief suffering have drunk of ever-flowing life, under God's covenant;** but you, by the judgment of God, will receive just punishment for your arrogance [2 Macc 9:5-8; 2 Cor 4:17]. ³⁷I, like my brothers, give up body and life for the laws of our ancestors, appealing to God to show mercy soon to our nation and by trials and plagues to make you confess that he alone is God [2 Macc 9:12-17], ³⁸and through me and my brothers to bring to an end the wrath of the Almighty that has justly fallen on our whole nation" [2 Macc 7:18]. ³⁹The king fell into a rage, and handled him worse than the others, being exasperated at his scorn [2 Macc 7:3]. ⁴⁰**So he died in his integrity, putting his whole trust in the Lord.** ⁴¹Last of all, the mother died, after her sons. ⁴²Let this be enough, then, about the eating of sacrifices and the extreme tortures [4 Macc 17:1].

2 Maccabees 12:43-45

⁴³He [Judas Maccabeus] also took up a collection, man by man, to the amount of two thousand drachmas of silver, and sent it to Jerusalem to provide for a sin offering. In doing this he acted very well and honorably, **taking account of the resurrection** [Lev 4:2-35; 2 Macc 4:19]. ⁴⁴**For if he were not expecting that those who had fallen would rise again, it would have been superfluous and foolish to pray for the dead.** ⁴⁵**But if he was looking to the splendid reward that is laid up for those who fall asleep in godliness, it was a holy and pious thought. Therefore he made atonement for the dead, so that they might be delivered from their sin** [2 Macc 12:43].

2 Maccabees 14:37-46

³⁷A certain Razis, one of the elders of Jerusalem, was denounced to Nicanor as a man who loved his compatriots and was very well thought of and for his goodwill was called father of the Jews. ³⁸In former times, when there was no mingling with the Gentiles, he had been accused of Judaism, and he had most zealously risked body and life for Judaism [2 Macc 6:6; 14:3]. ³⁹Nicanor, wishing to exhibit the enmity that he had for the Jews, sent more than five hundred soldiers to arrest him; ⁴⁰for he thought that by arresting him he would do them an injury. ⁴¹When the troops were about to capture the tower and were forcing the door of the courtyard, they ordered that fire be brought and the doors burned. Being surrounded, Razis fell upon his own sword, ⁴²preferring to die nobly rather than to fall into the hands of sinners and suffer outrages unworthy of his noble birth. ⁴³But in the heat of the struggle he did not hit exactly, and the crowd was now rushing in through the doors. He courageously ran up on the wall, and bravely threw himself down into the crowd. ⁴⁴But as they quickly drew back, a space opened and he fell in the middle of the empty space. ⁴⁵Still alive and aflame with anger, he rose, and though his blood gushed forth and his wounds were severe he ran through the crowd; and standing upon a steep rock, ⁴⁶with his blood now completely drained from him, **he tore out his entrails, took them in both hands and hurled them at the crowd, calling upon the Lord of life and spirit to give them back to him again.** This was the manner of his death.

Wisdom of Solomon 3:1-13a

- ¹**But the souls of the righteous are in the hand of God,**
and no torment will ever touch them.
- ²In the eyes of the foolish they seemed to have died,
and their departure was thought to be a disaster [Wis 4:17; 5:4; Luke 9:31],
- ³and their going from us to be their destruction;
but they are at peace.
- ⁴For though in the sight of others they were punished,
their hope is full of immortality [Rom 8:24; 2 Cor 5:1].
- ⁵Having been disciplined a little, they will receive great good,
because God tested them and found them worthy of himself [Exod 15:25; Heb 12:11];
- ⁶like gold in the furnace he tried them,
and like a sacrificial burnt offering he accepted them [Prov 17:3; 2 Esd 16:73; Rom 12:1; 1 Pet 1:7].
- ⁷**In the time of their visitation they will shine forth** [Dan 12:3; Matt 13:43],
and will run like sparks through the stubble [Isa 5:24; Obad 18].
- ⁸**They will govern nations and rule over peoples,**
and the Lord will reign over them forever [Dan 7:18, 22; 1 Cor 6:2-3].
- ⁹Those who trust in him will understand truth,
and the faithful will abide with him in love,
because grace and mercy are upon his holy ones,
and he watches over his elect [Wis 2:20; 4:15; John 15:10].
- ¹⁰But the ungodly will be punished as their reasoning deserves,
those who disregarded the righteous and rebelled against the Lord [Prov 1:24-31];
- ¹¹for those who despise wisdom and instruction are miserable.
Their hope is vain, their labors are unprofitable,
and their works are useless.
- ¹²Their wives are foolish, and their children evil [Sir 41:5];
- ¹³their offspring are accursed [Isa 54:1; Wis 12:11].

Wisdom of Solomon 4:16-5:16

- ¹⁶**The righteous who have died will condemn the ungodly who are living,**
and youth that is quickly perfected [ended] **will condemn the prolonged old age of the**
unrighteous [Isa 65:20; Matt 12:41-42]
- ¹⁷For they will see the end of the wise,
and will not understand what the Lord purposed for them,
and for what he kept them safe [Wis 3:2].
- ¹⁸The unrighteous [they] will see, and will have contempt for them,
but the Lord will laugh them to scorn.
After this they will become dishonored corpses,
and an outrage among the dead forever [Isa 14:19; Ps 2:4; 37:13];
- ¹⁹because he will dash them speechless to the ground,
and shake them for the foundation;
they will be left utterly dry and barren,
and they will suffer anguish,
and the memory of them will perish [Ps 9:6].
- ²⁰They will come with dread when their sins are reckoned up,
and their lawless deeds will convict them to their face [Jer 2:19].
- ^{5:1}**Then the righteous will stand with great confidence**
in the presence of those who have oppressed them

- and those who make light of their labors** [Luke 21:36].
- ²**When the unrighteous** [they] **see them, they will be shaken with dreadful fear,**
and they will be amazed at the unexpected salvation of the righteous [2 Esd 9:9; Luke 13:28].
- ³They will speak to one another in repentance,
and in anguish or spirit they will groan, and say [2 Esd 16:19; Rom 8:35],
- ⁴“These are persons whom we once held in derision
and made a byword of reproach – fools that we were!
We thought that their lives were madness
and that their end was without honor [Jer 24:9; Ps 69:11; Wis 3:2; 4:17; Acts 26:24].
- ⁵Why have they been numbered among the children of God?
And why is their lot among the saints?
- ⁶So it was we who strayed from the way of truth,
and the light of righteousness did not shine on us,
and the sun did not rise upon us [Prov 2:31; John 3:19; 12:35].
- ⁷We took our fill of the paths of lawlessness and destruction,
and we journeyed through trackless deserts,
but the way of the Lord we have not known [Ps 107:40; Job 12:24].
- ⁸What has our arrogance profited us?
And what good has our boasted wealth brought us?
- ⁹All those things have vanished like a shadow,
and like a rumor that passes by [Wis 2:5];
- ¹⁰like a ship that sails through the billowy water,
and when it has passed no trace can be found,
no track of its keel in the waves [Job 9:26];
- ¹¹or as, when a bird flies through the air,
no evidence of its passage is found;
the light air, lashed by the beat of its pinions
and pierced by the force of its rushing flight,
it traversed by the movement of its wings,
and afterward no sign of its coming is found there [Prov 30:19; Job 9:26];
- ¹²or as, when an arrow is shot at a target,
the air, thus divided, comes together at once,
so that no one knows its pathway [Wis 5:21].
- ¹³So we also, as soon as we were born ceased to be,
and we had no sign of virtue to show,
but were consumed in our wickedness.”
- ¹⁴Because the hope of the ungodly is like thistle down [dust] carried by the wind,
and like a light frost [spider’s web] driven away by a storm;
it is dispersed like smoke before the wind,
and it passes like the remembrance of a guest who stays but a day [Ps 68:2; Job 21:18; Jas 1:10-11].
- ¹⁵**But the righteous live forever,**
and their reward is with the Lord;
the Most High take care of them [Gen 15:1; Rev 22:12].
- ¹⁶**Therefore they will receive a glorious crown**
and a beautiful diadem from the hand of the Lord,
because with his right hand he will cover them,
and with his arm he will shield them [Isa 28:5; 62:3; Wis 19:8; 1 Pet 5:4].

2 Esdras 2:10-47 (5 Ezra 2:10-47)

¹⁰Thus says the Lord to Ezra: "Tell my people that I will give them the kingdom of Jerusalem, which I was going to give to Israel. ¹¹Moreover, I will take back to myself their glory, **and will give to these others the everlasting habitations, which I had prepared for Israel.** ¹²**The tree of life shall give them fragrant perfume, and they shall neither toil nor become weary** [Prov 3:18; 2 Esd 8:52; Rev 22:14]. ¹³Go and you will receive; pray that your days may be few, that they may be shortened. The kingdom is already prepared for you; be on the watch! [Matt 24:22; 25:34] ¹⁴Call, O call heaven and earth to witness: I set aside evil and created good; for I am the Living One, says the Lord.

¹⁵"Mother, embrace your children; bring them up with gladness, as does a dove; strengthen their feet, because I have chosen you, says the Lord [Deut 7:6; Isa 60:8; 2 Esd 2:25, 30]. ¹⁶**And I will raise up the dead from their places, and bring them out from their tombs, because I recognize my name in them** [Ezek 37:12-13; John 5:28-29]. ¹⁷Do not fear, mother of children, for I have chosen you, says the Lord. ¹⁸I will send you help, my servants Isaiah and Jeremiah [Matt 16:14; Rev 22:2]. According to their counsel I have consecrated and prepared for you twelve trees loaded with various fruits, ¹⁹and the same number of springs flowing with milk and honey [Exod 3:8], and seven mighty mountains on which roses and lilies grow; by these I will fill your children with joy.

²⁰"Guard the rights of the widow, secure justice for the ward, give to the needy, defend the orphan, clothe the naked [Isa 1:17; 58:7; Matt 25:36], ²¹care for the injured and the weak, do not ridicule the lame, protect the maimed, and let the blind have a vision of my splendor. ²²Protect the old and the young within your walls; ²³**When you find any who are dead, commit them to the grave and mark it, and I will give you the first place in my resurrection** [Tob 1:17-18; Matt 19:28]. ²⁴**Pause and be quiet, my people, because your rest will come** [Exod 14:14; Isa 30:15].

²⁵Good nurse, nourish your children; strengthen their feet. ²⁶Not one of the servants whom I have given you will perish, for I will require them from among your number. ²⁷Do not be anxious, for when the day of tribulation and anguish comes, others shall weep and be sorrowful, but you shall rejoice and have abundance [John 16:20, 22]. ²⁸The nations shall envy you, but they shall not be able to do anything against you, says the Lord [Isa 54:17]. ²⁹My power will protect you, so that your children may not see hell [Gehenna].

³⁰Rejoice, O mother, with your children, because I will deliver you, says the Lord [2 Esd 2:2, 15, 17].

³¹**Remember your children that sleep, because I will bring them out from the hiding places of the earth, and will show mercy to them;** for I am merciful, says the Lord Almighty. ³²Embrace your children until I come, and proclaim mercy to them; because my springs run over, and my grace will not fail."

³³I, Ezra, received a command from the Lord on Mount Horeb to go to Israel [Exod 3:1; Deut 4:10, 15; Sir 48:7]. When I came to them they rejected me and refused the Lord's commandment. ³⁴Therefore I say to you, O nations that hear and understand, "Wait for your shepherd; he will give you everlasting rest, because he who will come at the end of the age is close at hand [Matt 11:2, 9; John 10:11; Heb 10:37]. ³⁵**Be ready for the rewards of the kingdom, because perpetual light will shine on you forevermore** [Isa 60:19-20; Rev 21:23]. ³⁶Flee from the shadow of this age, receive the joy of your glory [1 Chron 29:15; 2 Esd 2:39]; I publicly call on my savior to witness. ³⁷Receive what the Lord has entrusted to you and be joyful, giving thanks to him who has called you to the celestial kingdoms [1 Thess 2:12; 1 Pet 5:10]. ³⁸Rise, stand erect and see the number of those who have been sealed at the feast of the Lord [2 Esd 6:5; Rev 7:4]. ³⁹**Those who have departed from the shadow of this age have received glorious garments from the Lord** [Isa 61:10; 2 Esd 2:36]. ⁴⁰Take again your full number, O Zion, and close the list of your people who are clothed in white, who have fulfilled the law of the Lord [Isa 61:10; Rev 3:5; 7:13-14]. ⁴¹The number of your children, whom you desired, is now complete; implore the Lord's authority that your people, who have been called from the beginning, may be made holy [2 Esd 4:36; 9:8; Eph 1:4; Rev 6:11]."

⁴²I, Ezra, saw on Mount Zion a great multitude that I could not number, and they all were praising the Lord with songs [Rev 7:9; 14:1]. ⁴³In their midst was a young man of great stature, taller than any of the others, and on the head of each of them **he placed a crown**, but he was more exalted than they [2 Esd 2:46; Rev 2:10; 4:4]. And I was held spellbound. ⁴⁴Then I asked an angel, “Who are these, my lord?” [Rev 7:13-14] ⁴⁵He answered and said to me, **“These are they who have put off mortal clothing and have put on the immortal, and have confessed the name of God. Now they are being crowned, and receive palms** [1 Cor 15:53-54; Rev 2:10; 4:4; 7:9].” ⁴⁶Then I said to the angel, “Who is that young man who is placing crowns on them and putting palms in their hands?” ⁴⁷He answered and said to me, “He is the Son of God, whom they confessed in the world [Matt 10:32; Luke 12:8; Rev 3:5].” So I began to praise those who had stood valiantly for the name of the Lord.

2 Esdras 4:7-11 (4 Ezra 4:7-11)

⁷And he said to me, “If I had asked you, ‘How many dwellings are in the heart of the sea, or how many streams are at the source of the deep, or how many streams are above the firmament [Job 38:16], **or which are the exits of Hades, or which are the entrances of paradise?**’ [Lat. lacks the last part; 2 Esd 7:36; 123; 8:52] ⁸perhaps you would have said to me, ‘I never went down into the deep, nor as yet into Hades, neither did I ever ascend into heaven [Rom 10:6-7].’ ⁹But now I have asked you only about fire and wind and the day – things that you have experienced and from which you cannot be separated, and you have given me no answer about them [Eccl 11:5; Wis 9:16; John 3:12].” ¹⁰He said to me, “You cannot understand the things with which you have grown up; ¹¹how then can your mind comprehend the way of the Most High? And how can one who is already worn out by the corrupt world understand incorruption? [Ezek 1:28; 3:23; 2 Esd 4:2]”

2 Esdras 4:33-43 (4 Ezra 4:33-43)

³³Then I answered and said, “How long? When will these things be? Why are our years few and evil?” [2 Esd 5:56; 6:11; 8:42; 12:7] ³⁴He answered me and said, “Do not be in a greater hurry than the Most High. You, indeed, are in a hurry for yourself, but the Highest is in a hurry on behalf of many [2 Esd 5:44; 6:34; Heb 10:37; 2 Pet 3:9]. ³⁵**Did not the souls of the righteous in their chambers ask about these matters, saying, ‘How long are we to remain here? And when will the harvest of our reward come?’** [Esd 4:41; 5:9, 37; 7:32; Rev 6:9-10] ³⁶And the archangel **Jeremiel** [According to 1 En 20:1-8, he is the 7th Archangel who is responsible for the resurrection] answered and said, ‘When the number of those like yourselves is completed; for he has weighed the age in the balance [2 Esd 2:41; 5:43; 1 Thess 4:16; Rev 6:11], ³⁷and measured the times by measure, and numbered the times by number; **and he will not move or arouse them until that measure is fulfilled** [Wis 11:20].”

³⁸Then I answered and said, “But, O sovereign Lord, all of us also are full of ungodliness [Esd 7:17]. ³⁹It is perhaps on account of us that the time of threshing is delayed for the righteous – on account of the sins of those who inhabit the earth.”

⁴⁰He answered me and said, “Go and ask a pregnant woman whether, when her nine months have been completed, her womb can keep the fetus within her any longer.”

⁴¹And I said, “No, lord, it cannot.”

He said to me, **“In Hades the chambers of the souls are like the womb** [Esd 4:35; 5:9, 37; 7:32]. ⁴²For just as a woman who is in labor makes haste to escape the pangs of birth, **so also do these places hasten to give back those things that were committed to them from the beginning.** ⁴³Then the things that you desire to see will be disclosed to you.”

2 Esdras 5:38-40 (4 Ezra 5:38-40)

³⁸I said, “O sovereign Lord, who is able to know these things except him whose dwelling is not with mortals? [Dan 2:11; 2 Esd 4:38; 5:23] ³⁹As for me, I am without wisdom, and how can I speak concerning the things that you have asked me? [Jer 1:6]”

⁴⁰He said to me, “Just as you cannot do one of the things that were mentioned, so you cannot discover my judgment, **or the goal of the love that I have promised to my people** [Eph 3:19].”

2 Esdras 7:10-16 (4 Ezra 7:10-16)

¹⁰I said, "That is right, lord." He said to me, "So also is Israel's portion. ¹¹For I made the world for their sake, and when Adam transgressed my statutes, what had been made was judged [2 Esd 3:7; 6:55]. ¹²And so the entrances of this world were made narrow and sorrowful and toilsome; they are few and evil, full of dangers and involved in great hardships [Job 5:7; 14:1; 2 Esd 4:33]. ¹³But the entrance of the greater world are broad and safe, and yield the fruit of immortality [Gen 2:9]. ¹⁴**Therefore unless the living pass through the difficult and futile experiences, they can never receive those things that have been reserved for them [Matt 7:14].** ¹⁵**Now therefore why are you disturbed, seeing that you are to perish? Why are you moved, seeing that you are mortal?** ¹⁶**Why have you not considered in your mind what is to come, rather than what is now present?"**

2 Esdras 7:26-51 (4 Ezra 7:26-51)

²⁶"For indeed the time will come, when the signs that I have foretold to you will come to pass, that the city that now is not seen shall appear, and the land that now is hidden shall be disclosed [2 Esd 4:52; Rev 21:2]. ²⁷Everyone who has been delivered from the evils that I have foretold shall see my wonders [2 Esd 6:25]. ²⁸For my son the Messiah shall be revealed with those who are with him, and those who remain shall rejoice four hundred years [2 Esd 13:32, 37, 52; 14:9]. ²⁹After those years my son the Messiah shall die [Dan 9:26], and all who draw human breath. ³⁰Then the world shall be turned back to primeval silence for seven days, as it was at the first beginnings, so that no one shall be left [2 Esd 6:39]. ³¹After seven days the world that is not yet awake shall be roused, and that which is corruptible shall perish. ³²**The earth shall give up those who are asleep in it, and the dust those who rest there in silence [Isa 26:19; Dan 12:2; John 5:28-29]; and the chambers shall give up the souls that have been committed to them.** ³³The Most High shall be revealed on the seat of judgment [Dan 7:9-10; Matt 25:31; Luke 13:25], and compassion shall pass away, and patience shall be withdrawn. ³⁴Only judgment shall remain, truth shall stand, and faithfulness shall grow strong [2 Esd 6:28]. ³⁵Recompense shall follow, and the reward shall be manifested; righteous deeds shall awake, and unrighteous deeds shall not sleep [Ecc 12:14; 2 Esd 13:56; Matt 16:27]. ³⁶**The pit of torment shall appear, and opposite it shall be the place of rest; and the furnace of hell shall be disclosed, and opposite it the paradise of delight** [2 Esd 4:7; 6:2; 7:38; Luke 16:23f; Rev 9:2; 20:14-15]. ³⁷**Then the Most High will say to the nations that have been raised from the dead,** 'Look now, and understand whom you have denied, whom you have not served, whose commandments you have despised. ³⁸Look on this side and on that; here are delight and rest, and there are fire and torments [2 Esd 7:36].' Thus he will speak to them on the day of judgment – ³⁹a day that has no sun or moon or stars [2 Esd 7:42], ⁴⁰or cloud or thunder or lightning, or wind or water or air, or darkness or evening or morning, ⁴¹or summer or spring or heat or winter or frost or cold, or hail or rain or dew, ⁴²or moon or night, or dawn or shining or brightness or light, but only the splendor of the glory of the Most High [Isa 60:19-20; Rev 22:5], by which all shall see what has been destined. ⁴³It will last as though for a week of years. ⁴⁴This is my judgment and its prescribed order; and to you alone I have shown these things [2 Esd 6:33; 7:104; 13:53, 56]."

⁴⁵I answered and said, "O sovereign Lord, I said then and I say now: Blessed are those who are alive and keep your commandments! [Ps 1:1-2; 119:2] ⁴⁶But what of those for whom I prayed? For who among the living is there that has not sinned, or who is there among mortals that has not transgressed your covenant? [2 Esd 8:17, 35] ⁴⁷**And now I see that the world to come will bring delight to few, but torments to many** [2 Esd 8:1; 9:15]. ⁴⁸For an evil heart has grown up in us, which has alienated us from God, and has brought us into corruption and the ways of death, and has shown us the paths of perdition and removed us far from life – and that not merely for a few but for almost all who have been created [2 Esd 3:20-22; 4:30-31; 7:92]." ⁴⁹He answered me and said, "Listen to me, Ezra, and I will instruct you, and will admonish you once more. ⁵⁰For this reason the Most High has made not one world but two [2 Esd 8:1]. ⁵¹Inasmuch as you have said that the righteous are not many but few, hear the explanation for this.

2 Esdras 7:66-105 (4 Ezra 7:66-105)

⁶⁶It is much better with them [wild animals] than with us: **for they do not look for a judgment and they do not know of any torment or salvation promised after death.** ⁶⁷What does it profit us that we shall be

preserved alive but cruelly tormented? ⁶⁸For all who have been born are entangled in iniquities, and are full of sins and burdened with transgressions. ⁶⁹**And if after death we were not to come into judgment, perhaps it would have been better for us** [2 Esd 7:117].”

⁷⁰He answered them me and said, “When the Most High made the world and Adam and all who have come from him, he first prepared the judgment and the things that pertain to the judgment [Matt 20:23; 25:34, 41; Mark 10:40]. ⁷¹But now, understand from your won words – for you have said that the mind grows with us [Esd 7:64]. ⁷²For this reason, therefore, those who live on earth shall be tormented, because though they had understanding, they committed iniquity; and through they received the commandments, they did not keep them; and though they obtained the law, they dealt unfaithfully with what they received [2 Esd 7:21-24]. ⁷³What then, will they have to say in the judgment, or how will they answer in the last times? ⁷⁴How long the Most High has been patient with those who inhabit the world? – and not for their sake, but because of the times that he has foreordained [Rom 2:4; 2 Pet 3:9].”

⁷⁵I answered and said, “If I have found favor in your sight, O Lord, show this also to your servant: **whether after death, as soon as everyone of us yields up the soul, we shall be kept in rest until those times come when you will renew the creation, or whether we shall be tormented at once?** [Isa 65:17; Matt 19:28; Acts 3:21; Rev 21:1, 5]” ⁷⁶He answered me and said, “I will show you that also, but do not include yourself with those who have shown scorn, or number yourself among those who are tormented. ⁷⁷For you have a treasure of works stored up with the Most High, but it will not be shown to you until the last times [Tob 4:9; Matt 6:20; Luke 12:33]. ⁷⁸**Now concerning death, the teaching is:** When the decisive decree has gone out from the Most High that a person shall die, as the spirit leaves the body to return again to him who gave it, first of all it adores the glory of the Most High [Ecd 12:7; 2 Esd 7:91]. ⁷⁹If it is one of those who have shown scorn and have not kept the way of the Most High, who have despised his law and hated those who fear God – ⁸⁰such spirits shall not enter into habitations, but shall immediately wander about in torments, always grieving and sad, in seven ways [2 Esd 7:85, 95, 101]. ⁸¹The **first** way, because they have scorn the law of the Most High. ⁸²The **second** way, because they cannot now make a good repentance so that they may live. ⁸³The **third** way, they shall see the reward laid up for those who have trusted the covenant of the Most High [Wis 5:2; Luke 16:23]. ⁸⁴The **fourth** way, they shall consider the torment laid up for themselves in the last days. ⁸⁵The **fifth** way, they shall see how the habitations of the others are guarded by angels in profound quiet [2 Esd 7:80, 95, 101]. ⁸⁶The **sixth** way, they shall see how some of them will cross over into torments. ⁸⁷The **seventh** way, which is worse than all the ways that have been mentioned, because they shall utterly waste away in confusion and be consumed with shame, and shall wither with fear at seeing the glory of the Most High in whose presence they sinned while they were alive, and **in whose presence they are to be judged in the last time.**

⁸⁸“Now this is the order of those who have kept the ways of the Most High, when they shall be separated from their mortal body. ⁸⁹During the time that they lived in it, they laboriously served the Most High, and withstood danger every hour so that they might keep the law of the Lawgiver perfectly [1 Cor 15:30; Jas 4:12]. ⁹⁰Therefore this is the teaching concerning them: ⁹¹First of all, they shall see with great joy the glory of him who receives them, for they shall have rest in seven orders [2 Esd 7:78]. ⁹²The **first** order, because they have striven with great effort to overcome the evil thought that was formed with them, so that it might not lead them astray from life into death [2 Esd 7:48]. ⁹³The **second** order, because they see the perplexity in which the souls of the ungodly wander and the punishment that awaits them [Rev 14:10]. ⁹⁴The **third** order, they see the witness that he who formed them bears concerning them, that throughout their life they kept the law with which they were entrusted [Matt 10:32; Luke 12:8; Rev 3:5]. ⁹⁵The **fourth** order, **they understand the rest that they now enjoy, being gathered into their chambers and guarded by angels in profound quiet, and the glory waiting for them in the last days** [2 Esd 4:35; 7:32, 80, 85, 101]. ⁹⁶The **fifth** order, they rejoiced that they have now escaped what is corruptible and **shall inherit what is to come**; and besides they see the straits and toil form which they have been delivered, and **the spacious liberty that they are to receive and enjoy in immortality** [Rom 7:24; 8:18; 1 Cor 15:53-54]. ⁹⁷The **sixth** order, when it is shown them **how their face is to shine like the sun, and how they are to be made like the light of the stars** [Dan 12:3; 2 Esd 7:125; Matt 13:43], **being incorruptible from then on.** ⁹⁸The **seventh** order, which is greater than all that have been mentioned, because they shall rejoice with boldness, and shall be confident without confusion, and shall be

glad without fear, for the press forward to see the face of him [Matt 5:8; 1 John 3:2; Rev 22:4] whom they served in life **and from whom they are to receive their reward when glorified** [1 Cor 3:14; Rev 22:12]. ⁹⁹This is the order of the souls of the righteous, as henceforth is announced; and the previously mentioned are the ways of torment that those who would not give heed shall suffer hereafter.”

¹⁰⁰Then I answered and said, “Will time therefore be given to the soul, after they have been separated from the bodies, to see what you have described to me?”

¹⁰¹He said to me, “They shall have freedom for seven days, so that during these seven days they may see the things of which you have been told, and afterwards **they shall be gathered in their habitations** [2 Esd 7:80, 85, 95].”

¹⁰²I answered and said, “**If I have found favor in your sight, show further to me, your servant, whether on the day of judgment the righteous will be able to intercede for the ungodly or to entreat the Most High for them** [2 Esd 4:44] – ¹⁰³fathers for sons or sons for parents, brothers for brothers, relatives for their kindred, or friends for those who are most dear.”

¹⁰⁴He answered me and said, “Since you have found favor in my sight, I will show you this also. The day of judgment is decisive and displays to all the seal of truth [Joel 3:14; 2 Esd 7:44]. Just as now a father does not send his son, or a son his father, or a master his servant, or friend his dearest friend, to be ill or sleep or eat or be healed in his place, ¹⁰⁵**so no one shall ever pray for another on that day, neither shall anyone lay a burden on another; for then all shall bear their own righteousness and unrighteousness** [Ezek 18:20; Gal 6:7-8].”

2 Esdras 7:112-115 (4 Ezra 7:112-115)

¹¹²He answered me and said, “This present world is not the end; the full glory does not remain in it; therefore those who were strong prayed for the weak. ¹¹³**But the day of judgment will be the end of this age and the beginning of the immortal age to come, in which corruption has passed away** [2 Esd 6:27-28; 1 Cor 15:53-54], ¹¹⁴sinful indulgence has come to an end, unbelief as been cut off, and righteousness has increased and truth has appeared [2 Esd 7:34]. ¹¹⁵Therefore no one will then be able to have mercy on someone who has been condemned in the judgment, or to harm someone who is victorious [2 Esd 7:128; Rev 3:5].”

2 Esdras 7:117-131 (4 Ezra 7:117-131)

¹¹⁷For what good is it to all that they live in sorrow now [Jer 20:18; Job 3; Eccl 2:22-23] and **expect punishment after death?** [2 Esd 4:12; 7:69] ¹¹⁸O Adam, what have you done? For through it was you who sinned, the fall was not yours alone, but ours also who are your descendants [2 Esd 3:21; 4:30; 7:11; Rom 5:18].

¹¹⁹For what good is it to us, if an immortal time has been promised to us, but we have done deeds that bring death? ¹²⁰And what good is it that an everlasting hope has been promised to us, but we have miserably failed? ¹²¹Or the safe and healthful habitations have been reserved for us, but we have lived wickedly? ¹²²Or that the glory of the Most High will defend those who have led a pure life, but we have walked in the most wicked ways? ¹²³Or that a paradise shall be revealed, whose fruit remains unspoiled and in which are abundance and healing [2 Esd 4:7; Rev 2:7; 22:2], but we shall not enter it ¹²⁴because we have lived in perverse ways? ¹²⁵Or that the faces of those who practiced self-control shall shine more than the stars [Lam 4:8; 2 Esd 7:97; Matt 13:43], but our faces shall be blacker than darkness? ¹²⁶**For while we lived and committed iniquity we did not consider what we should suffer after death.**”

¹²⁷He answered and said, “This is the significance of the contest that all who are born on earth shall wage [Eph 6:10-17; 1 Tim 6:12]: ¹²⁸**if they are defeated they shall suffer what you have said, but if they are victorious they shall receive what I have said.** ¹²⁹For this is the way of which Moses, while he was alive, spoke to the people, saying, ‘**Choose life for yourself, so that you may live!**’ [Deut 30:19] ¹³⁰But they did not believe him or the prophets after him, or even myself who have spoken to them [2 Esd 1:32]. ¹³¹Therefore there shall not be grief at their destruction, so much as joy over those to whom salvation is assured [2 Esd 7:60-61; Luke 15:7, 10].”

2 Esdras 8:1-3 (4 Ezra 8:1-3)

¹He answered me and said, “**The Most High made this world for the sake of many, but the world to come for the sake of only a few** [2 Esd 7:47; 8:3, 55; 9:15; **Matt 7:14; Luke 13:24**]. ²But I tell you a parable, Ezra. Just as, when you ask the earth, it will tell you that it provides a large amount of clay from which earthenware is made, but only a little dust from which gold comes, so is the course of the present world [2 Esd 7:54; 10:9]. ³**Many have been created, but only a few shall be saved** [2 Esd 8:1].”

2 Esdras 8:12-19 (4 Ezra 8:12-19)

¹²You have nurtured it in your righteousness, and instructed it in your law, and reproved it in your wisdom. ¹³**You put it to death as your creation, and make it live as your work** [**Rom 8:11, 13; Col 3:5**]. ¹⁴If then you will suddenly and quickly destroy what with so great labor was fashioned by your command, to what purpose was it made [**Job 10:8**]? ¹⁵And now I will speak out: About all humankind you know best; but I will speak about your people, for whom I am grieved, ¹⁶and about your inheritance, for whom I lament, and about Israel, for whom I am sad, and about the seed of Jacob, for whom I am troubled. ¹⁷Therefore I will pray before you for myself and for them, for I see the failings of us who inhabit the earth [2 Esd 7:46]; ¹⁸and now also **I have heard of the swiftness of the judgment that is to come** [**Mal 3:5; 2 Esd 8:61; Jas 5:9; Rev 22:12**]. ¹⁹Therefore hear my voice and understand my words, and I will speak before you [2 Esd 6:26; 14:9, 36-48].”

2 Esdras 8:37-40 (4 Ezra 8:37-40)

³⁷He answered me and said, “Some things you have spoken rightly, and it will turn out according to your words. ³⁸For indeed I will not concern myself about the fashioning of those who have sinned, **or about their death, their judgment, or their destruction** [**Gen 6:5; 2 Esd 7:61; 9:12**]; ³⁹but I will rejoice over the creation of the righteous, over their pilgrimage also, **and their salvation, and their receiving their reward** [2 Esd 7:60; 13:56]. ⁴⁰As I have spoken, therefore, so it shall be.

2 Esdras 8:46-54 (4 Ezra 8:46-54)

⁴⁶He answered me and said: “Things that are present are for those who live now, and things that are future are for those who will live hereafter. ⁴⁷For you come far short of being able to love my creation more than I love it. But you have often compared yourself to the unrighteous. Never do so! ⁴⁸But even in this respect you will be praiseworthy before the Most High, ⁴⁹because you have humbled yourself, as is becoming for you, and have not considered yourself to be among the righteous. **You will receive the greatest glory**, ⁵⁰for many miseries will affect those who inhabit the world in the last times [2 Esd 8:63; 10:59; 12:23-24; **2 Tim 3:2**], because they have walked in great pride. ⁵¹But think of your own case, and inquire concerning the glory of those who are like yourself [2 Esd 4:36; 8:62], ⁵²because **it is for you that paradise is opened, the tree of life is planted, the age to come is prepared, plenty is provided, a city is built, rest is appointed, goodness is established and wisdom perfected beforehand** [2 Esd 2:12; 7:26; 10:27; **Heb 11:16; Rev 22:14**]. ⁵³**The root of evil is sealed up from you, illness is banished from you, and death is hidden; Hades has fled and corruption has been forgotten** [2 Esd 2:38; **Rev 20:14**]; ⁵⁴**sorrows have passed away, and in the end the treasure of immortality is made manifest** [**Rev 21:4**].

2 Esdras 9:7-13 (4 Ezra 9:7-13)

⁷It shall be that all who will be saved and will be able to escape on account of their works, or on account of the faith by which they have believed [2 Esd 8:33; 13:23; **Rom 3:28**], ⁸will survive the dangers that have been predicted, and will see my salvation in my land and within my borders, which I have sanctified for myself from the beginning [2 Esd 6:25; 12:34; 13:48]. ⁹Then those who have now abused my ways shall be amazed, and those who have rejected them with contempt shall live in torments [Wis 5:2]. ¹⁰For as many as did not acknowledge me in their lifetime, though they received my benefits [**Luke 16:25**], ¹¹and as many as scorned my law while they still had freedom, and did not understand but despised it while an opportunity of repentance was still open to them [2 Esd 8:56; **Heb 12:17**], ¹²**these must in torment acknowledge it after death** [2 Esd 8:38]. ¹³Therefore, do not continue to be curious about how the ungodly will be punished; but

inquire how the righteous will be saved, those to whom the age belongs and for whose sake the age was made [1 Cor 3:22].”

2 Esdras 10:10, 15-17 (4 Ezra 10:10, 15-17)

¹⁰From the beginning all have been born of her [Zion], and others will come; and, lo, almost all go to perdition, and a multitude of them will come to doom [Wis 7:1; 2 Esd 9:15].

¹⁵Now, therefore, keep your sorrow to yourself, and bear bravely the troubles that have come upon you.

¹⁶**For if you acknowledge the decree of God to be just [1 Sam 3:18; Ps 145:17], you will receive your son back in due time, and will be praised among women.** ¹⁷Therefore go into the town to your husband.”

2 Esdras 14:34-35 (4 Ezra 14:34-35)

³⁴**If you, then, will rule over your minds and discipline your hears, you shall be kept alive, and after death you shall obtain mercy.** ³⁵**For after death the judgment will come, when we shall live again; and then the names of the name of the righteous shall become manifest, and the deeds of the ungodly shall be disclosed [Eccl 12:14; Dan 12:1-2; Wis 5:15].** ³⁶But let no one come to me now, and let no one seek me for forty days [2 Esd 14:23, 45].”

RESURRECTION TEXTS IN THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHICAL WRITINGS

Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 50. List of resurrection texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha – Apocalyptic literature and related works

Date	Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification											
					Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.							
Second Century BCE First Century CE	1 Enoch	Book I (1-36) The Parable of Enoch	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection)		X				X	X	J							
			1:3-9 5:5-9 9:2-3 10:4-6, 11-13, 16-17, 20 13:6 14:2-6 15:7-10 16:1 27:2-3															
			20:8	Archangel Remiel									X				X	J
			22	Resurrection of the Soul?									X				X	J
			25:4-6	The Fragrant tree	X					X	J							

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE First Century CE	1 Enoch	Book II (37-71) The Book of the Similitudes	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) 38 41:1, 8-9 45:2-6 47 48:7 50:1 54:6 56:8 58:1-4 60:6, 24 61:5, 8 ----- 70:4 – Vision of earliest human ancestors 70:16 – all the righteous will follow the path of Enoch.	X				X	X	J
			40:9	Archangel Phanuel	x				x	J
			46:3	Son of Man	x				x	J
			49:3	Sleep Death	x				x	J
			51			x			x	J
			62:13-6	Son of Man		x			x	J
		Book III (72-82) The Book of Heavenly Luminaries	81:1-4	Judgment	x				x	J
		Book IV (83-90) The Dream Visions	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) 84:4							J
			89:36-37	Sleep = Death	x				x	J
			90:20-36	Judgment New Jerusalem	x		x		x	J

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
					Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE First Century CE	1 Enoch	Book V (91-107) The Two Ways of the Righteous and the Sinner: Including the Apocalypse of Weeks	91:8-17	Arise from sleep		x				x	J
			92:2-5	Arise from sleep		x		x		x	J
			The Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked (94-104): Judgment (Implied Resurrection) 94:9, 11 95:5-6 96:2-3, 8 97:6 98:6-8, 14 100:4-5, 10 102:4-8 103:1-4 104:1-7		x				x	x	J
			108:2-3	Book of Life	x			x		x	J
			108:8-15	Recompensed Resplended	x			x	x	x	J

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification					
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.	
Late First Century CE	2 Enoch	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) J 7:1 J/A 18:7 J/A 19:5 J 39:5/A 39:2 J 42:3, 5, 7 J/A 44:3-5 J/A 48:8-9 J/A 49:2 J/A 50:2, 4-5 J/A 51:3 J/A 52:15 J/A 58:4-6 J 60:4 J 66:6-7		x				x	x	J	
			Dust to dust		x	x			x	J	
		J 32									
		J/A 65:6-11	Judgment	x					x	J	
		J 70:1	Eternal inheritance	x					x	J	
		J/A 70:3	Rest Death	x					x	J	
Fifth to Sixth Century CE	3 Enoch	(18:24)	Books of the Dead Books of the Living		x				x	J	
		(28:7; 30:2; 31:2; 33:1)		Every Day is a Judgment	x				x	x	J
		28:7-10		Third day he will raise us up		x					J
		44:7-8		Rest of the Righteous		x				x	J

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
					Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE Seventh Century CE	Sibylline Oracles	Book 1	355	Lazarus' resurrection		x				x	C
			378	Announcing the resurrection to the dead		x				x	C
		Book 2	221-51	Resurreciton/ Judgment		x	x				J/C
			313-5	Rewards of the Rigteous		x				x	J/C
		Book 3	66	Satan's work		x				x	J
			769	Messianic kingdom		x				x	J
		Book 4	179-92	Resurrection/ Judgment		x	x			x	J
		Book 6	14	Lazarus' resurrection		x				x	C
		Book 7	144-5	Restoration of the world	x					x	J/C
		Book 8	82-3	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x	J
			170	Eschatological upheaval		x				x	J
			205-8	Messianic Age		x				x	J/C
			226-8	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x	J
			255	Faith => Eternal life	x					x	J
			286	Jesus' mission		x				x	C

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
					Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE Seventh Century CE	Sibylline Oracles	Book 8	293	Jesus' mission		x				x	C
			310-4	Jesus' mission		x				x	C
			413-6	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x	C
		Frag. 3	41-49	Inheritance of the Righteous	x					x	J
First Century BCE First Century CE	Apocryphon of Ezekiel	Fragment 1	Body = Blind Soul = Lame Judgment parable			x	x				J
Late First Century CE	Fourth Book of Ezra	2:16	Exhortation to good work			x				x	C
		2:22-24	Burial			x				x	C
		2:31	Sleep Death			x				x	C
		4:35-37	Predestined time			x		x		x	J
		4:42-43	Hades womb		x					x	J
		7:31-[44]	Resurrection/ Judgment			x		x		x	J
		7:75-101	The state of the departed before the judgment			x		x		x	J
		14:36	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x	x	J

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second to Ninth Century CE	Greek Apocalypse of Ezra	2:1; 5:22	The righteous/ Patriarchs	x					x	C
		4:36	Trumpet/ Resurrection		x				x	C
		7:2	Jesus' work		x				x	C
Date Unknown	Questions of Ezra	A. 5	The fate of the righteous and the sinners		x				x	C
		A. 10	The prophet's question	x					x	C
		B. 1-14	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x	C
Early Second Century CE	2 Baruch	11:4	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		14:12-13	Possesses hope in the future Resurrection	x					x	J
		15:7-8	The Righteous	x					x	J
		21:23-24	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		23:5	Appointed number	x					x	J
		24:1-2	Judgment/ Resurrection	x			x			J
		30:1-3	The end of time		x				x	J
		42:7-8	Dust => Resurrection		x		x		x	J
		49-52	The nature of the resurrection body: The final destiny of the Righteous and the wicked		x	x			x	J

Table 50 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Early Second Century CE	2 Baruch	57:2	Planned from the beginning		x				x	J
		66:3	Make sure that they are really dead	x					x	J
		85:3	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		85:9	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		85:15	Resurrect the righteous	x					x	J
First to Fourth Century CE	Apocalypse of Elijah	3:13	Satan can not resurrect the dead		x				x	C
		4:24-29	Persecution of the Saints		x		x		x	C
		4:31	Satan can not resurrect the dead		x				x	C
		5:25-39	End-time	x					x	C

Apocalyptic Literature and Related Works

Resurrection Passages in Context

1 Enoch 1:3-9**OTP 1:13-14**

³And I took up with a parable (saying) “The God of the universe, the Holy Great One, will come forth from his dwelling. ⁴And from there he will march upon Mt Sinai and appear in his camp emerging from heaven with a mighty power. And everyone shall be afraid, and Watchers shall quiver. ⁵And great fear and trembling shall seize them unto the ends of the earth. ⁶Mountains and high places will fall down and be frightened. And high hills shall be made low; and they shall melt like honeycomb before the flame. ⁷**And there shall be a judgement upon all, (including) the righteous. ⁸And to all the righteous he will grant peace. He will preserve the elect, and kindness shall be upon them. They shall all belong to God and they shall prosper and be blessed; and the light of God shall shine unto them.** ⁹Behold, he will arrive with ten million of the holy ones in order to execute judgement upon all. He will destroy the wicked ones and censure all flesh on account of everything that they have done, that which the sinners and the wicked ones committed against him.”

1 Enoch 5:5-10**OTP 1:15**

⁵Therefore, you shall curse your days, and the years of your life shall perish and multiply in eternal execration; and there will not be any mercy unto you. ⁶In those days, you shall make your names an eternal execration unto all the righteous; and the sinners shall curse you continually – you together with the sinners. ⁷**But to the elect there shall be light, joy, and peace, and they shall inherit the earth.** To you, wicked ones, on the contrary, there will be a curse. ⁸And then wisdom shall be given to the elect. And they shall all live and not return again to sin, either by being wicked or through pride, but those who have wisdom shall be humble and not return again to sin. ⁹And they shall not be judged all the days of their lives; nor die through plague or wrath, but they shall complete the (designated) number of the days of their life. ¹⁰And peace shall increase their lives and the years of their happiness shall be multiplied forever in gladness and peace all the days of their life.

1 Enoch 20:1-8**POT 2:201**

¹These are the names of the holy angels who watch. ²**Uriel**, one of the holy angels, who is in charge of the world and Tartarus. ³**Raphael**, one of the holy angels, who is in charge of the spirits of men. ⁴**Reuel**, one of the holy angels, who takes vengeance on the world of the luminaries. ⁵**Michael**, one of the holy angels, who has been put in charge of the good ones of the people. ⁶**Sariel**, one of the holy angels, who is in charge of the spirits who sin against the spirit. ⁷**Gabriel**, one of the holy angels, who is in charge of paradise and the serpents and the cherubim. ⁸**Remiel, one of the holy angels, whom God has put in charge of them that rise.**

1 Enoch 22**OTP 1:24-25**

¹Then I went to another place, and he showed me on the west side of a great and high mountain of hard rock ²and inside it four beautiful corners; it had [in it] a deep, wide, and smooth (thing) which was rolling over; and it (the place) was deep and dark to look at. ³At that moment, Rafael, one of the holy angels, who was with me responded to me; and he said to me, “these beautiful corners (are here) in order that the spirits of the souls of the dead should assemble into them – they are created so that the souls of the children of the people should gather here. ⁴**They prepared these places in order to put them (ie the souls of the people) there until the day of their judgement and the appointed time of the great judgement upon them.**” ⁵I saw the spirits of the children of the people who were dead, and their voices were reaching unto heaven until this very moment. ⁶I asked Rafuael, the angels who was with me and said to him, “This spirit, the voice of which is reaching (into heaven) like this and is making suit, whose (spirit) is it?” ⁷And he answered me, saying, “This is the spirit which had left Abel, whom Cain, his brother, had killed; it (continues to) sue him until all of (Cain’s) seed is exterminated from the face of the earth [Gen 4:10], and his seed has disintegrated from among the seed of the people.” ⁸At that moment, I raised a question regarding

him and regarding **the judgement of all**, “For what reason is one separated from the other?” ⁹And he replied and said to me, **“These three have been made in order that the spirits of the dead might be separated. And in the manner in which the souls of the righteous are separated (by) this spring of water with light upon it ¹⁰in like manner, the sinners are set apart when they die and are buried in the earth and judgement has not been executed upon them in their lifetime, ¹¹upon this great pain, until the great day of judgement** – and to those who curse (there will be) plague and pain forever, and the retribution of their spirits. They will bind them there forever – even if from the beginning of the world. ¹²And in this manner is a separation made for the souls of those who make their suit (and) those who disclose concerning destruction, as they were killed in the days of sinners. ¹³Such has been made for the souls of the people who are not righteous, but sinners and perfect criminals; they shall be together with (other) criminals who are like them, **(whose) souls will not be killed on the day of judgement but will not rise from there.”** ¹⁴At that moment I blessed the Lord of Glory and I said, “Blessed be my Lord, the Lord of righteousness who rules forever.”

1 Enoch 25:3-7

POT 2:204-205

³He answered, saying, “This tall mountain which you saw whose summit resembles the throne of God is (indeed) his throne, on which the Holy and Great Lord of Glory, the Eternal King, will sit when he descends to visit the earth with goodness. ⁴**And for this fragrant tree, not a single human being has the authority to touch it until the great judgment, when he shall take vengeance on all and conclude (everything) forever.** ⁵**This is for the righteous and the pious. And the elect will be presented with its fruit for life** [Ezek 47:12]. He will plant it in the direction of the northeast upon the holy place – in the direction of the house of the Lord, the Eternal King.

**⁶Then they shall be glad and rejoice in gladness,
And they shall enter into the holy (place)
Its fragrance shall (penetrate) their bones,
Long life will the live on earth,
Such as your fathers lived in their days.”**

⁷At that moment, I blessed the God of Glory, the Eternal King, for he has prepared such things for the righteous people, as he had created (them) and given it to them.”

1 Enoch 40:9-10

OTP 1:32

⁹And he said to me, “The first one is the merciful and forbearing Michael; the second one, who is set over all disease and every wound of the children of the people, is Raphael; the third, who is set over all exercise of strength, is Gabriel; and the fourth, **who is set over all actions of repentance unto the hope of those who would inherit eternal life, is Phanuel by name.** ¹⁰(So) these are his four angels: they are the Lord of the Spirits, and the four voices which I heard in those days.

1 Enoch 49

OTP 1:36

¹So for wisdom flows like water and glory is measureless before him forever and ever. ²For his might is in all the mysteries of righteousness, and oppression will vanish like a shadow having no foundation. The Elect One stands before the Lord of Spirits; his glory is forever and ever and his power is unto all generations. ³In him dwells the spirit of wisdom, the spirit which gives thoughtfulness, the spirit of knowledge and strength, **and the spirit of those who have fallen asleep in righteousness.** ⁴He shall judge the secret things. And no one will be able to utter vain words in his presence. For he is the Elect One before the Lord of the Spirits according to his good pleasure.

1 Enoch 51

POT 2:218-219

**¹And in those days shall the earth also give back that which has been entrusted to it,
And Sheol also shall give back that which it has received,
And hell shall give back that which it owes.**

^{5a}**For in those days the Elect One shall arise,**

²**And he shall choose the righteous and holy from among them:**

For the day has drawn nigh that they should be saved.

³**And the Elect One shall in those days sit on My throne,**
And his mouth shall **pour** forth all the secrets of wisdom and counsel:
For the Lord of Spirits hath given (them) to him and hath glorified him.

⁴And in those days shall the mountains leap like rams,
And the hills also shall skip like lambs [Ps 114:4] satisfied with milk,
And the faces of [all] the angels in heaven shall be lighted up with joy.

^{5b}And the earth shall rejoice,

^cAnd the righteous shall dwell upon it,

^dAnd the elect shall walk thereon.

1 Enoch 61:1-5

OTP 1:42

¹I saw in those days that long ropes were given to those angels; and hoisting up their own (respective) portions (of the ropes), they soared going in the direction of the northeast. ²And I asked the angel, saying unto him, "Why have those (angels) hoisted these ropes and gone off?" And he said unto me, "They have gone in order to make measurements." ³The angel who was going with me also said unto me, "These (angels) are the ones who shall bring the measuring ropes of the righteous ones as well as their binding cords in order that they might lean upon the name of the Lord of the Spirits forever and ever. ⁴These are the measurements which shall be given to faith and which shall strengthen righteousness. ⁵And these measurements shall reveal all the secrets of the depths of the earth, those who have been destroyed in the desert, those who have been devoured by the wild beasts, and those who have been eaten by fish of the sea. **So that they all return and find hope in the day of the Elect One.** For there is no one who perishes before the Lord of the Spirits, and no one who should perish.

1 Enoch 62:12-16

OTP 1:43

¹²It shall become quite a scene for my righteous and elect ones. They shall rejoice over (the kings, the governors, the high officials, and the landlords) because the wrath of the Lord of the Spirits shall rest upon them and his sword (shall obtain) from them a sacrifice [Isa 34:6]. ¹³**The righteous and elect ones shall be saved on that day;** and from thenceforth they shall never see the faces of the sinners and the oppressors. ¹⁴The Lord of the Spirits will abide over them; **they shall eat and rest and rise with that Son of Man forever and ever.** ¹⁵The righteous and elect ones **shall rise from the earth and shall cease being of downcast face.** They shall wear the garments of glory. ¹⁶These garments of yours shall become the garments of life from the Lord of the Spirits. Neither shall your garments wear out, nor your glory come to an end before the Lord of the Spirits.

1 Enoch 81:1-4

OTP 1:59

¹Then he said unto me, "Enoch, look at the tablet(s) of heaven; read what is written upon them and understand (each element on them) one by one. ²So I looked at the tablet(s) of heaven, read all the writing (on them), and came to understand everything. I read that book and all the deeds of humanity and all the children of the flesh upon the earth for all the generations of the world. ³At that very moment, I blessed the Great Lord, the King of Glory for ever, for he has created all the phenomena in the world. I praised the Lord because of his patience; and I wept on account of the children of the people upon the earth. ⁴After that, I said:

Blessed is the man who dies righteous and upright,
Against whom no record of oppression has been written,
And who received no judgment on that day.

1 Enoch 90:20-36

OTP 1:70-71

²⁰Then I kept seeing till a throne was erected in a pleasant land; and he sat upon it for the Lord of the Sheep; and he took all the sealed books and opened those very books in the of the Lord of the sheep [Dan 7:9-10].

²¹Then the Lord called those people, the seven first snow-white ones, and ordered them to bring before him (some) from among the first star(s) that arose, and from among those stars whose sexual organs were like those of the horses, as well as (that) first star which had fallen down earlier. And they brought them all before him. ²²He spoke to the man who was writing in his presence – that (man) being one of those seven snow-white ones – saying, “Take those seven shepherds to whom I had handed over the sheep, but who decided to kill many more than they were ordered. ²³Behold, I saw all of them bound; and they all stood before him. ²⁴Then his judgment took place. First among the stars, they received their judgment and were found guilty, and they went to the place of condemnation; and they were thrown into an abyss, full of fire and flame and full of pillar of fire. ²⁵Then those seventy shepherd were judged and found guilty; and they were cast into that fiery abyss. ²⁶In the meantime I saw how another abyss like it, full of fire, was opened wide in the middle of the ground; and they brought those blinded sheep, all of which were judged, found guilty, and cast into this fiery abyss, and they were burned – the abyss is to the right of that house; ²⁷thus I saw those sheep while they were burning – their bones also were burning.

²⁸Then I stood still, looking at that ancient house being transformed. All the pillars and all the columns were pulled out; and the ornaments of that house were packed and taken out together with them and abandoned in a certain place in the South of the land. ²⁹I went on seeing until the Lord of the sheep brought about a new house, greater and loftier than the first one, and set it up in the first location which had been covered up – all its pillars were new, the columns new; and the ornaments new as well as greater than those of the first, (that is) the old (house) which was gone. **All the sheep were within it.**

³⁰Then I saw all the sheep that had survived as well as all the animals upon the earth and the birds of heaven, falling down and worshiping the sheep, making petition to them and obeying them in every respect.

³¹Thereafter, those three who were wearing show-white (clothes), the former ones who had caused me to go up, grabbed me by my hand – also the hand of that ram holding me – and I ascended; they set me down in the midst of those sheep prior to the occurrence of this judgment. ³²Those sheep were all snow-white, and their wool considerable clean. ³³**All those which have been destroyed and dispersed, and all the beasts of the field and the birds of the sky were gathered together in that house; and the Lord of the sheep rejoiced with great joy because they had all become gentle and returned to his house.** ³⁴I went on seeing until they had laid down that sword which was given to the sheep; they returned it to the house and sealed it in the presence of the Lord. All the sheep were invited to that house but it could not contain them (all). ³⁵The eyes of all of them were opened, and they saw the beautiful things; not a single one existed among them that could not see. ³⁶Also I noticed that the house was large, wide, and exceedingly full.

1 Enoch 91:8-19

OTP 1:72-73

⁸In those days violence shall be cut off from its roots,
And the roots of unrighteousness together with deceit,
And they shall be destroyed from under heaven.

⁹And all the idols of the heathen shall be abandoned,
And the temples burned with fire,
And they shall remove them from the whole earth,

And they (i.e. the heathen) shall be cast into the judgement of fire,
And shall perish in wrath and in grievous judgement for ever.

¹⁰**And the righteous shall arise from their sleep,**
And wisdom shall arise and be given unto them.

¹¹[And after that the roots of unrighteousness shall be cut off, and the sinners shall be destroyed by the sword ...shall be cut off from the blasphemers in every place, and those who plan violence and those who commit blasphemy shall perish by the sword.]

¹⁸And now I tell you, my sons, and show you
The paths of righteousness and the paths of violence.
Yea, I will show them to you again
That ye may know what will come to pass.

¹⁹And now, hearken unto me, my sons,
And walk in the paths of righteousness,
And walk not in the paths of violence;
For all who walk in the paths of unrighteousness shall perish for ever.’

1 Enoch 92:2-5

OTP 1:74

²Let not your spirit be troubled on account of the times;
For the Holy and Great One has appointed days for all things.

³**And the righteous one shall arise from sleep** [cf. Isa 26:19; Dan 12:2],
[hall arise] and walk in the paths of righteousness,
And all his path and conversation shall be in eternal goodness and grace.

⁴He will be gracious to the righteous and give him eternal uprightness,
And He will give him power so that he shall be (endowed) with goodness and righteousness,
And he shall walk in eternal light.

⁵And sin shall perish in darkness for ever,
And shall no more be seen from that day for evermore.

1 Enoch 98:13-14

OTP 1:79

¹³Woe unto you who rejoice in the suffering of the righteous ones!

For no grave shall be dug for you.

¹⁴Woe unto you who would set at nought the words of the righteous ones!

For you shall have no hope of life

1 Enoch 102:3c-8

OTP 1:82-83

^{3c}You, sinners, you are accursed forever; there is no peace for you! ⁴**But you, souls of the righteous, fear not; and be hopeful, you souls that died in righteousness!** ⁵Be not sad because yours souls have gone down into Sheol in sorrow; or (because) your flesh fared not well the earthly existence in accordance with your goodness; indeed the time you happened to be in existence was (a time of) sinners, a time of curse and a time of plague. ⁶When you die, the sinners will speak over you: “As we die, so do the righteous die. What then have they gained by their deeds? ⁷Behold, like us they died in grief and in darkness, and what have they more than we? From now on we have become equal. ⁸What will they receive or what will they see forever? Behold they have surely died; and from now on they shall never see light forever.

1 Enoch 103:1-4

OTP 1:83-84

^{1a}“I now swear to you, righteous ones, by the glory of the Great One and by the glory of his kingdom; and I swear to you (even) by the Great One. ²For I know this mystery; I have read the tablets of heaven and have seen the holy writings, and I have understood the writing in them; and they are inscribed concerning you. ³For all good things, and joy and honor are prepared for and written down for the souls of those who died in righteousness. Many and good things shall be given to you – the offshoot of your labors. **Your lot exceeds even that of the living ones.** ⁴**The spirits of those who died in righteousness shall live and rejoice;** their spirits shall not perish, nor their memorial from before the face of the Great One unto all the generations of the world.

1 Enoch 104:1-7

OTP 1:85

¹“I swear unto you that in heaven the angels will **remember** you for good before the glory of the Great One; and your names shall be written before the glory of the Great One. ²**Be hopeful**, because formerly you have pined away through evil and toil. But now you shall **shine like the light of heaven**, and you shall be seen; and the windows of heaven shall be opened for you. Your cry shall be heard. ³Cry for judgment, and it shall appear for you; for all your tribulations shall be (demanded) for investigation from the (responsible) authorities – from everyone who assisted those who plundered you. ⁴**Be hopeful**, and do not abandon your hope, because there shall be a fire for you; you are about to be making a great rejoicing like the angels of heaven. ⁵**You shall not have to hide on the day of the great judgment**, and you shall not be found as the sinners; but the eternal judgment shall be (far) away from you for all the generations of the world. ⁶Now fear not, righteous ones, when you see the sinners waxing strong and flourishing; do not be partners with them, but keep far away from those who lean onto their own injustice; for you are to be partners with the good-hearted people of heaven. ⁷Now, you sinners, even if you say, ‘All our sins shall not be investigated or written down,’ nevertheless, all your sins are being written down every day.”

1 Enoch 108:2-3

OTP 1:88

²You who have observed (the law) shall wait in all the days until (the time of) those who work evil is completed, and the power of the wicked ones is ended. ³As for you, wait patiently until sin passes away, **for the manner of (the sinners) shall be blotted out from the Book of Life and the books of the Holy One** [cf. Ps 69:28; 139:16] their seeds shall be destroyed forever and their spirits shall perish and die; they shall cry and lament in a place that is an invisible wilderness and burn in the fire – for there exists ground there (as upon the earth).

1 Enoch 108:8-15

OTP 1:88-89

⁸Those who love God have loved neither gold nor silver, nor all the good things which are in the world, but have given over their bodies to suffering ⁹ – who from the time of their very being have not longed after earthly food, and who regarded themselves as a (mere) passing breath. And they have observed this matter, the Lord having put them through much testing; then he received their pure spirits so that they should bless his name. ¹⁰And I have recounted in the books all their blessing. **He has caused them to be recompensed**, for they were all found loving God more than the fire of their eternal souls; and while they were being trodden upon by evil people, experiencing abuse and insult by them, they continued blessing us. ¹¹**So now I shall summon their spirits** if they are born of light, and change those who are born in darkness – those whose bodies were not recompensed with honor as they deserved for their faithfulness. ¹²I shall bring them out into the bright light, those who have loved my holy name, and seat them each one by one upon the throne of his honor; ¹³and they shall be resplendent for ages that cannot be numbered; for the judgment of God is righteousness, because he will give faith – as well as the paths of truth – to the faithful ones in the resting places. ¹⁴Then they shall see those who were born in darkness being taken into darkness, **while the righteous ones shall be resplendent**. ¹⁵(The sinners) shall go to the place which was prescribed for them concerning the days and the seasons.” Here ends the Revelation of the Secrets of Enoch.

2 Enoch

2 Enoch J32

OTP 1:154

After Adam’s transgression, God expels him into the earth from which he had been taken. But he does not wish to destroy him in the age to come. Word “28”]

¹“**And I said [to him], ‘You are earth, and into the earth once again you will go, out of which I took you** [Gen 3:19b]. And I will not destroy you, but I will send you away to what I took you from. **Then I can take you once again at my second coming**. And I blessed all my creatures, visible and invisible. And Adam was in paradise for five hours and a half. ²And I blessed the seventh day [which is the Sabbath] in which I rested from all my doings [Gen 2:2-3].

2 Enoch 65:6-11

[J]

⁶And when the whole of creation, visible and invisible, which the Lord has created, shall come to an end, **then each person will go to the Lord's great judgement.** ⁷[And] then [all] time will perish, and afterward there will be neither years nor months nor days or hours. They will be dissipated and after that they will not be reckoned. ⁸But they will constitute a single age. **And all the righteous, who escape from the Lord's great judgement, will be collected together into the great age. And the great age will come about for the righteousness, and it will be eternal.** ⁹And after that there will be among them neither weariness (nor sickness) nor affliction nor worry (nor) want nor debilitation nor night nor darkness. ¹⁰But they will have a great light, a great indestructible light, and paradise, great and incorruptible. For everything corruptible will pass away, and the incorruptible will come into being, and will be the shelter of the eternal residences.

2 Enoch J 70:1

¹And Methusalem began to stand at the altar in front of the face of the Lord, and all the people, from that day for 10 years, **hoping in an eternal inheritance**, and having thoroughly taught all the earth and all his own people. And there was not found one single person turning himself away in vanity from the Lord during all the days that Methusalam lived.

2 Enoch 70:3

[J]

³And when the time of the departure days of Methusalam arrived, the Lord appeared to him in a night vision and said to him, "listen, Methusalam! I am the Lord, the God of your father Enoch. I want you to know that the days of your life have come to an end, and **the day of your rest has come close.**

OTP 1:192-193

[A]

⁶**When the whole of creation, which the Lord has created, shall come to an end, and when each person will go to the Lord's great judgment,** ⁷then the time periods will perish, and there will be neither years nor months nor days, and hours will no longer be counted; ⁸But they will constitute a single age. **And all the righteous, who escape from the Lord's great judgment, will be collected together with the great age. And <the age> at the same time will unite with the righteous, and they will be eternal.** ⁹And there will be among them neither weariness nor suffering nor affliction nor expectation of violence nor the pain of the night nor darkness. ¹⁰But they will have a great light for eternity, <and> an indestructible wall, and **they will have a great paradise**, the shelter of an eternal residence. ¹¹How **happy are the righteous who will escape the Lord's great judgment, for their faces will shine forth like the sun.**

OTP 1:200

OTP 1:200-201

[A]

³And after the ending of the days of Methusalom, the LORD appeared to him in a night vision and said to him, "Listen, Methusalom! I am <the LORD>, the God of your father Enoch. <I want you to know> that the days of your life have come to an end, and **the day of your rest has come close.**

3 Enoch

3 Enoch 28:7-10

⁷Every day when the Holy One, blessed be he, sits on the throne of judgment and judges all the world, with the books of the living and the book of the dead open before him, all the celestials stand before him in fear, dread, terror, and trembling. When the Holy One, blessed be he, sits in judgment on the throne of judgment, his garment is white like snow, the hair of his head is as pure as wool, his whole robe shies like a dazzling light and he is covered all over with righteousness as with a coat of mail [Dan 7:9; Rev 20:11]. ⁸The Watchers and the holy ones stand before him like court officers before the judge; they take up and debate every single matter and they close each case that comes for judgment before the Holy One, blessed be he, as it is written, "Such is the sentence proclaimed by the Watchers, the verdict announced by the holy ones"[Dan

OTP 1:283-284

4:17]. ⁹Some of them decide the cases; some of them issue the verdicts in the great court in ‘Arabot; some of them raise the questions in the presence of the Almighty; some complete the cases before the One Above, and some carry out the sentence of the earth beneath, as it is written,

Behold, a Watcher and a holy one came down from heaven.
At the top of his voice he shouted,
“Cut the tree down, lop off its branches,
strip off its leaves, throw away its fruit;
let the animals flee from its shelter
and the birds from its branches” [Dan 4:10f. (MT)]

¹⁰Why are the names called Watchers and holy ones? Because they sanctify the body and the soul with lashes of fire on the third day of judgment, as it is written, “**After two days he will revive us, on the third day he will raise us and we shall live in his presence**” [Hos 6:2f]

3 Enoch 44:7-8

OTP 1:295

⁷I saw the souls of the fathers of the world, Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob and **the rest of the righteous, who had been raised from their graves and had ascended into heaven**. They were praying before the Holy One, blessed be he, and saying in prayer, “Lord of the Universe, how long will you sit upon your throne, as a mourner sits in the days of his mourning, with your right hand behind you, and not redeem your sons and reveal your kingdom in the world [Ps 20:6 (MT 20:7)]? Do you not pity your sons who are enslaved among the nations of the world? Do you not pity your right hand behind you, by which you stretched out and spread the heavens, the earth, and the heaven of heavens [Isa 42:5; 48:13; Jer 10:12; Ezek 1:22]? Have you no pity?”
⁸Then the Holy One, blessed be he, answered each and every one of them and said: “Since these wicked ones have sinned thus and thus, and have transgressed thus and thus before me, how can I deliver my sons from among the nations of the world, reveal my kingdom in the world before the eyes of the gentiles and deliver my great right hand, which has been brought low by them.”

Sibylline Oracles

Sibylline Oracles Book 1:324-386

OTP 1:342-344

³²⁴Then indeed the son of the great God will come,
incarnate, likened to mortal men on earth,
bearing for vowels, and the consonants in him are two.
I will state explicitly the entire number for you.
For eight units, and equal number of tens in additions to these,
and eight hundreds will reveal the name
³³⁰to men who are sated with faithlessness. But you, consider in your heart
Christ, the son of the most high, immortal God.
He will fulfill the law of God – he will not destroy it – [Matt 5:17]
bearing a likeness which corresponds to types, and he will teach everything.
Priest will bring gifts to him, bringing forward gold,
³³⁵myrrh, and incense [Matt 2:11]. For he will also do all these things.
But when a certain voice will come through the desert land
bringing tidings to mortals, and will cry out to all
to make the paths straight and cast away [Matt 3:1-6; Mark 1:1-6; Luke 3:1-6; John 1:23]
evils from the heart, and that every human person
³⁴⁰be illuminated by waters, so that, being born from above [John 3:3]
they may no longer in any respect at all transgress justice
– but a man with barbarous mind, enslaved to dances

will cut out this voice and give it as a reward –

then there will suddenly be a sign to mortals when a beautiful

³⁴⁵stone which have been preserved will come from the land of Egypt.

Against this the people of the Hebrews will stumble [Isa 8:14 ff.; 1 Pet 2:4]. But the gentiles will be gathered under his leadership.

For they will also recognize God who rules on high on account of this man's path in common light.

For he will show eternal life to chosen men

³⁵⁰**but will bring the fire upon the lawless for (all) ages.**

Then indeed he will cure the sick and all who are blemished, as many as put faith in him.

The blind will see, and the lame will walk.

The deaf will hear; those who cannot speak will speak [Isa 35:5-6; 26:19; 29:18-19; 61:1; Matt 11:2-6; Luke 7:18-23].

³⁵⁵He will drive out demons, **there will be a resurrection of the dead;**

he will walk the waves [Matt 14:24-27; Mark 6:45-51], and in a desert place

he will satisfy five thousand from five loaves

and a fish of the sea, and the leftovers of these

will fill twelve baskets for the hope of the peoples [Matt 14:13-21; Mark 6:30-44; 8:1-10; Luke 9:10-17; John 6:1-13].

³⁶⁰And then Israel, intoxicated, will not perceive

nor yet will she hear, afflicted with weak ears [Isa 6:9 f.; Matt 13:13-15; Mark 4:12; Luke 8:10; John 12:40; Acts 28:26].

But when the raging wrath of the Most High comes upon the Hebrews

it will also take faith away from them

because they did harm to the son of the heavenly God.

³⁶⁵Then indeed Israel, with abominable lips

and poisonous spittings, will give this man blows.

For food they will give him gall and for drink

unmixed vinegar [Matt 27:34], impiously, smitten in breast

and heart with an evil craze, not seeing with their eyes.

³⁷⁰more blind than blind rats, more terrible than poisonous creeping beasts, shackled with heavy sleep.

But when he will stretched out his hands and measure all,

and bear the crown of thorns [Matt 27:27-31; Mark 15:16-20; John 19:1-3] – they will stab

his side with reeds – on account of this, for three hours

³⁷⁵there will be monstrous dark night in midday [Matt 27:45; Mark 15:33; Luke 23:44].

And then indeed the temple of Solomon will effect

a great sign for men [Matt 27:51; Mark 15:38; Luke 23:45], when he goes to the house of Adonis [Hades]

announcing the resurrection to the dead [1 Pet 3:19].

But when he comes to light again in three days

³⁸⁰and shows a model to men and teaches all things,

he will mount on clouds and journey to the house of heaven [Acts 1:9]

leaving to the world the account of the gospel.

Named after him, a new shoot will sprout

from the nations, of those who follow the law of the Great One.

³⁸⁵But also after these things there will be wise leaders,

and then there will be thereafter a cessation of prophets.

Sibylline Oracles Book 2:221-251

OTP 1:350-351

²²¹**Then the heavenly one will give souls and breath and voice to the dead and bones fastened**

with all kinds of joining... flesh and sinews

and veins and skin about the flesh, and the former hairs [Ezek 37:1-10].

²²⁵**Bodies of humans, made solid in heavenly manner.**

Breathing and set in motion, will be raised on a single day.

Then Uriel, the great angel, will break the gigantic bolts,
of unyielding and unbreakable steel, of the gates
of Hades, not forged of metal; he will throw them wide open

²³⁰and **will lead all the mournful forms to judgement,**

especially those of ancient phantoms, Titans
and the Giants and such as the Flood destroyed.

Also those whom the wave of the sea destroyed in the oceans,
and as many as wild beasts and serpents and birds

²³⁵devoured; all these he will call to the tribunal.

**Again, those whom the flesh-devouring fire destroyed by flame,
these also will he gather and set at the tribunal of God.**

When Sabaoth Adonai, who thunders on high, dissolves fate

and **raises the dead**, and takes his seat.

²⁴⁰on a heavenly throne, and establishes a great pillar,

Christ, imperishable himself, will come in glory on a cloud [Matt 16:27; 24:30; 25:31; Mark 8:38; 13:26]

toward the imperishable one with the blameless angels [Luke 9:26].

He will sit on the right of the Great One [Acts 7:55-56], judging at the tribunal
the life of pious men and the way of impious men.

²⁴⁵**Moses, the great friend of the Most High, also will come,**

having put on flesh. Great Abraham himself will come,

Isaac and Jacob, Joshua, Daniel and Elijah,

Habbakuk and Jonah, and those whom the Hebrews killed [Matt 23:34, 37; Luke 11:49-51].

He will destroy all the Hebrews after Jeremiah

²⁵⁰judged on the tribunal, so that they may receive and make
appropriate retribution for as much as anyone did in mortal life.

Sibylline Oracles Book 2:313-338

OTP 1:353

But as for the others [the righteous], as many as were concerned with justice and noble deeds,
and piety and most righteous thoughts,

³¹⁵angels will lift them through the blazing river
and **bring them to light and to life without care,**

in which is the immortal path of the great God
and three springs of wine, honey, and milk.

The earth will belong equally to all, undivided by walls

³²⁰or fences. It will then bear more abundant fruits
spontaneously. Lives will be in common and wealth will have no division.

For there will be no poor man there, no rich, and no tyrant,
no slave. Further, no one will be either great or small anymore.

No kings, no leaders. All will be on a par together.

³²⁵No longer will anyone say at all "night has come" or "tomorrow"
or "it happened yesterday," or worry about many days.

No spring, no summer, no winter, no autumn,
no marriage, no death, no sales, no purchases,
no sunset, no sunrise. For he will make a long day.

³³⁰To these pious ones imperishable God, the universal ruler, will also give
another thing. **Whenever they ask the imperishable God**

**to save men from the raging fire and deathless gnashing
he will grant it, and he will do this.**

For he will pick them out again from the undying fire

³³⁵**and set them elsewhere and send them on account of his own people
to another eternal life with the immortals**

**in the Elysian plain where he has the long waves
of the deep perennial Acherusian lake.**

Sibylline Oracles Book 3:63-74

OTP 1:363

Then Beliar will come from the *sebastēnoi*
and he will raise up the height of mountains, he will raise up the sea,
⁶⁵the great fiery sun and shining moon,
And **he will raise up the dead**, and perform many signs
for men. But they will not be effective in him.
But he will, indeed, also lead men astray, and he will lead astray
many faithful, chosen Hebrews, and also other lawless men
⁷⁰who have not yet listened to the word of God.
But whenever the threats of the great God draws nigh
and the burning power comes through the sea to land
it will also burn Beliar and all overbearing men,
as many as put faith in him.

Sibylline Oracles Book 3:767-776

OTP 1:379

And then, indeed, he will raise up a kingdom for all
ages among men [[Dan 2:44](#); [7:27](#)], he who once gave the holy Law
to the pious, to all of **whom he promised to open the earth**
⁷⁷⁰and the world and the gates of the blessed and all joys
and immortal intellect and eternal cheer.
From every land they will bring incense and gifts
to the house of the great God [[Isa 2:3](#); [Mic 4:2](#); [Zech 14:16](#)]. There will be no other
house among men, even for future generations to know,
⁷⁷⁵except the one which God gave to faithful men to honor
(for mortal will invoke the son of the great God).

Sibylline Oracles Book 4:179-192

OTP 1:389

But when everything is already dusty ashes,
¹⁸⁰and God puts to sleep the unspeakable fire, even as he kindled it,
God himself will again fashion the bones [[Ezek 37:1-10](#)] and ashes of men
And he will raise up mortals again as they were before.
And then there will be a judgement over which God himself will preside,
Judging the world again. As many as sinned by impiety,
¹⁸⁵these will a mount of earth cover,
And broad Tartarus and the repulsive recesses of Gehenna.
But as many as are pious, they will live on earth again
When God gives spirit and life and favour
¹⁹⁰**to these pious ones. Then they will all see themselves**
Beholding the delightful and pleasant light of the sun.
Oh most blessed, whatever man will live to that time.

Sibylline Oracles Book 6:10-19

OTP 1:407

¹⁰He [Christ] will teach all with wise words.
He will come to judgment and persuade a disobedient people,
boasting praiseworthy descent from the Heavenly Father.
He will walk the waves [[Matt 14:26](#); [Mark 6:48](#); [John 6:19](#)]; he will undo the sickness of men;
He will raise the dead [[Matt 11:5](#); [Luke 7:22](#)]. He will repel many woes.
¹⁵From one wallet men will have surfeit of bread
when the house of David brings forth a shoot [[Isa 11:1](#)]. In his hand

are the whole world and earth and heaven and sea.
He will flash like lightening on the earth [Matt 24:27; Luke 17:24]
as the two begotten form each other's sides once saw him when he first shone forth [cf. John 8:56].

Sibylline Oracles Book 7:139-149

OTP 1:413

In the third lot of circling years,
¹⁴⁰of the first ogdoad, another world is seen again.
All will be night, long and unyielding,
and then a terrible smell of brimstone will extend
announcing murders, when those men perish
by night and famine. **Then he will beget a pure mind**
¹⁴⁵**of men and will set up your race as it was before you.**
No longer will anyone cut a deep furrow with a crooked blow;
no oxen will plunge down the guiding iron.
There will be no vine branches or ear of corn, but all, at once,
will eat the dewy manna [Exod 16] with white teeth.

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:76-109

OTP 1:419-420

No longer will you have the fame of your pride
nor will you ever be lifted up, ill-fated one, but you will be laid low.
For the glory of the eagle-bearing legions will also fall.
Where then is your strength? What sort of land will be an ally
⁸⁰which has been lawlessly enslaved by your vain thoughts?
For then there will be confusion of all the land of mortals,
when the universal ruler himself comes and judges [Dan 7:9-10] **on the tribunal**
the souls of the living and dead, and the whole world.
Neither will parents be friendly to children nor children to parents [Mic 7:6; Matt 10:35-36; Luke 13:28]
⁸⁵because of impiety and affliction beyond hope.
Then you will have gnashing of teeth [Matt 8:12; Luke 13:28] and scattering and capture
when the fall of cities comes and yawning gaps in the earth.
When the purple dragon [Isa 27:1; Dan 7; Rev 12; 13] comes on the waves,
pregnant with a host, and will nurture your children
⁹⁰when famine and civil war are at hand;
then the end of the world and the last day is near,
and the judgment of the immortal God for the approved elect.
First there will be implacable wrath of Romans.
A bloodthirsty time, and wretched life will come.
⁹⁵Who to you, Italian land, great savage nation.
You did not perceive whence you came, naked and unworthy
to the light of the sun, **so that you might go again naked**
to the same place [Job 1:21; Eccl 5:15] **and later come to judgment**
because you judged unjustly . . .
¹⁰⁰By gigantic hands, alone in the whole world,
you will come from a height and swell under the earth
in naphtha and asphalt and brimstone and much fire,
and you will disappear and will be blazing dust
forever. Everyone who looks will hear a mournful
¹⁰⁵great bellowing from Hades and gnashing of teeth
as you strike your godless breast with your hands.
Night is equal to all at once, to those who have wealth
and to beggars. Coming naked from the earth, going naked again
to the earth, they cease from life, having completed their time.

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:169-177**OTP 1:422**

Then a holy prince will gain control of the scepters of the whole world
¹⁷⁰for all ages, **he who raised the dead.**

Then Most High will lead there, then, in piteous fate at Rome,
all the men will perish in their own dwellings.

But they will not be persuaded, which would be much better.

But whenever there rises upon all the evil day

¹⁷⁵of famine and pestilence, hard to bear, and tumult,

and the again the former wretched lord

will assemble the council and deliberate how he will destroy . . .

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:202-212**OTP 1:423**

The entire year will be an age turned upside down.

The sun, seeing dimly, shines at night.

Stars will leave the vault of heaven. A raging storm with many hurricane

²⁰⁵will lay the earth desolate. **There will be a resurrection of the dead**

And most swift racing of the lame, and the deaf will hear

The blind will see, those who cannot speak will speak,

And life and wealth will be common to all [Isa 29:18-19; Matt 11:5].

The earth will equally belong to all, not divided

²¹⁰by the walls or fences, and will then bear more abundant fruits.

It will give fountains of sweet wine and white milk

and honey . . .

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:217-250**OTP 1:423-424**

The earth will sweat when there will be a sing of judgment.

A king will come from heaven who is to judge

all flesh and the whole world forever when he comes.

²²⁰Both faithful and faithless men will see God

the Most High with the holy ones at the end of time.

He will judge the souls of flesh-bearing men on the tribunal

when the whole world becomes barren land and thorns.

Men will throw away idols and all wealth [Isa 2:18].

²²⁵Fire will burn land, heaven and sea,

pursuing the hunt, **and will break the gates of the confines of Hades.**

Then all the flesh of the dead, of the holy ones, will come

to the free light. The fire will torture the lawless forever.

Whatever one did secretly, he will then say everything,

²³⁰for God will open dark breast with lights.

A lament will rise from all and gnashing of teeth [Matt 8:12; 13:42; Luke 13:28].

The light of the sun will be eclipsed and the troupes of stars.

He will roll up heaven. The light of the moon will perish [Isa 34:4; Rev 6:12-14].

He will elevate ravines, and destroy the heights of hills [Isa 40:4].

²³⁵No longer will mournful height appear among men.

Mountains will be equal to plains, and all the sea

will no longer bear voyage. For earth will then be parched

with its springs. Bubbling rivers will fail.

A trumpet from heaven will issue a most mournful sound [Matt 24:31; 1 Cor 15:52; 1 Thess 4:16],

²⁴⁰wailing for the defilement of limbs and the woes of the world.

The gaping earth will then show the abyss of the nether world.

All will come to the tribunal of God the king.

A river of fire and brimstone will flow from heaven.

There will then be a sign for all men, a most clear seal:

²⁴⁵the wood among the faithful, the desired horn [Luke 1:69],
the life of pious men, but the scandal of the world [Rom 9:33; 1 Cor 1:17-25; 1 Pet 2:6-8],
illuminating the elect [1 Pet 2:9] with waters in twelve streams.
An iron shepherd's rod will prevail [Ps 2:9; Rev 2:27; 12:5; 19:15].

This is our God, now proclaimed in acrostics,

²⁵⁰the king, the immortal savior, who suffered for us.

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:251-257

OTP 1:424

Moses prefigured him [Christ], stretching out his holy arms [Exod 17:11],
concerning Amalek by faith so that the people might know
that he is elect and precious with God his father,
the staff of David and the stone he promised [Isa 11:1; John 3:36; 1 Pet 2:6].

²⁵⁵**The one who has believed in him will have eternal life.**

For he will come to creation nor in glory, but as a man,
pitiable, without honor or form, so that he might give hope to the pitiable [Isa 53:2-3].

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:282-293

OTP 1:424-425

Perceiving everything and seeing everything and listening to everything,
he [Christ] will observe the heart and lay it bare for trial.

He himself is the hearing and mind and sight and reason

²⁸⁵of all, who creates forms, to whom everything is subject,

who saves the dead and cures every disease.

Later he will come into the hands of lawless and faithless men,
and they will give blows to God with unholy hands
and poisonous spittings with polluted mouths.

²⁹⁰Then he will stretch out his back and give it to the whips [Isa 50:6]

(for he will hand over to the world the holy virgin) [John 19:26f].

Beaten, he will be silent, lest anyone recognize

who he is, whose son, and whence he came, **so that he may speak to the dead;**

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:310-317

OTP 1:425

³¹⁰**He will come to Hades announcing hope for all** [1 Pet 3:19; 4:6]

the holy ones, the end of the ages and last day,

and he will complete the fate of death when he has slept the third day.

And then, returning from the dead, he will come to light,

first of the resurrection [1 Cor 15:20], showing a beginning to the elect,

³¹⁵having washed off their former vies with the waters

of an immortal spring, so that, born from above [John 3:3, 7],

they may no longer serve the lawless customs of the world.

Sibylline Oracles Book 8:412-418

OTP 1:427

For I will melt all things and separate them into clear air.

I will roll up heaven [Isa 34:4; Rev 6:14], open the recesses of the earth,

And then I will raise the dead, having undone fate

⁴¹⁵**and the sting of death** [1 Cor 15:55], **and later I will come to judgement,**

judging the life of pious and impious men.

I will set ram by ram and shepherd by shepherd

and calf by calf, near each other for trial.

Sibylline Oracles Fragment 3:41-49

OTP 1:471

You are not willing to become sober and come to a prudent mind
And know God the king who oversees all.
Therefore the gleam of blazing fire comes upon you.
You will be burned with torches all day, throughout eternity,
⁴⁵Shamed by lies on account of useless idols.

**But those who honour the true eternal God
inherit life, dwelling in the luxuriant garden** [Matt 19:29; Mark 10:17; Luke 18:18]
**of Paradise for the time of eternity,
feasting on sweet bread from starry heaven** [Exod 16:4; John 6:31-33].

The Apocryphon of Ezekiel

OTP 1:492494

The Apocryphon of Ezekiel (*Fragment 1*) *Epiphanius, Against Heresies 64.70, 5-17*

Leviticus Rabbah 4.5

Introduction

“**For the dead will be raised and those in the tombs will be lifted up,**” speaks the prophet [Isa 26:19 (LXX)]. And also, so that I might not pass over in silence **the things mentioned about the resurrection by Ezekiel the prophet in his own apocryphon,** I will present them here also. For speaking enigmatically, he refers to the righteous judgment, in which [soul] and [body] share:

Introduction (b.Sanh 91ab)

Antonius said to Rabbi, “The [body] and [spirit] are both able to escape from judgment. How? The [body] says, ‘The [spirit] is sinned, for from the day it separated from me, behold, I have been lying like a silent stone in the grave.’ Also the [spirit] can say, ‘The [body] sinned, for from the day I separated from it, behold I have been flying in the air like a bird.’ And he (Rabbi) said to him, “I will give you an illustration:”

The lame and blind mend in the garden

1 ¹A certain king had everyone in his kingdom drafted, and had no civilians except two only: one lame man and one blind man, and each one sat by himself and lived by himself. ²And when the king was preparing a wedding feast for his own son [Matt 22:2; Luke 14:16], he invited all those in his kingdom, but he snubbed the two civilians, the lame man and the blind man. ³And they were indignant within themselves and resolved to carry out a plot against the king.

Lame and blind men in the garden (Lev. Rab. 4.5)

Rabbi Ishmael taught: This may be compared to a king who possessed a garden which had beautiful early figs. And he set in it two guards, one lame man and one blind man to guard it. He said to them, ‘Be careful with these figs’.

⁴Now the king had a garden and the blind man called out from a distance to the lame man, saying, “How much would our crumb of bread have been among the crows who were invited to the party? So come on, just as he did to us, let us retaliate (against) him.” ⁵But the other asked, “In what way?” ⁶And he said, “Let us go into his garden and there destroy the things of the garden.” ⁷And the blind one spoke, “But how can I, being lame and unable to crawl?” ⁸And the blind one spoke, “What am I able to do myself, unable to see where I am going? But let us use subterfuge.” ⁹Plucking the grass near him and braiding a rope, he threw (it) to the blind man and said, “Take hold and come along the rope to me.” ¹⁰And he did as he (the lame man) had urged (and) when he approached, he said, “Come to me, be (my) feet and carry me, and I will be your eyes, guiding you from above to the right and left.” ¹¹And doing this they went down into the garden. ¹²Furthermore, whether they damaged or did not damage (anything), nevertheless the footprints were visible in the garden.

¹³Now when the partygoers dispersed from the wedding feast, going down into the garden they were amazed to find footprints in the garden.

¹⁴And they reported these things to the king, saying, “Everyone in the kingdom is a soldier and no one is a civilian. So how then are there footprints of civilians in the garden?” ¹⁵And he was astounded.

After a little while the lame man said to the blind man, ‘I see beautiful early figs’. He (the blind man) said to him, ‘Come and let us eat (them)’. He (the lame man) said to him, ‘And am I able to walk?’ The blind man said to him, ‘And can I see?’ What did they do?

The lame man rode upon the shoulders of the blind man and they picked the early figs and they ate them. They left and returned, this one in his place and this one in his place.

After a few days the king came.

Parenthetical remark by Epiphanius

So says the parable of the apocryphon, **making it clear that it refers to a man**, for God is ignorant of nothing. For the story says:

The judgment of the intruders

2 ¹He summoned the lame man and the blind man, and he asked the blind man, “Did you not come down into the garden?” ²And he replied, “Who, me, lord?” You see our inability, you know that I cannot see where I walk.” ³Then approaching the lame man, he asked him also, “Did you come down into my garden?” ⁴And answering, he said, “O lord, do you wish to embitter my soul in the matter of my inability?” ⁵And finally the judgment was delayed.

⁶What then does the just judge do [[cf. Luke 20:15](#)]? Realizing in what manner both had been joined, he placed the lame man on the blind man and examines both under the lash. ⁷And they are unable to deny; they each convict the other. ⁸The lame man on the one hand saying to the blind man, “Did you not carry me and lead me away?” ⁹And the blind man to the lame, “Did you yourself not become my eyes?” ¹⁰**In the same way the body is connected to the soul and the soul to the body, to convict (them) of (their) common deeds.** ¹¹**And the judgment becomes final for both body and soul, for the works they have done whether good or evil.**

He said to them, ‘Where are those beautiful early figs?’ The blind man said to him, ‘And can I see?’ The lame man said to him, ‘And am I able to walk?’

What did the king, who was clever, do? He made the lame man ride upon the shoulders of the blind man and he judged them as one. He (the king) said to them, ‘In this way you have done (this) and eaten them’.

In this way in the time to come the Holy One, blessed be He, will say to the soul, ‘Why have you sinned against me?’ It (the soul) will say to him, ‘Master of the Universe, I did not sin against you, the body sinned. From the day that I went out from it, I have not sinned’. He (God) will say to the body, ‘Why have you sinned?’ And it (the body) will say to him, ‘Master of the Universe, the soul sinned. From the day it went out from me, am I not like a piece of pottery thrown upon a dung-heap?’

What did the Holy One, blessed be He do? He will restore the spirit to the body and judge them as one. As it is said, ‘He will call to the heavens from above, etc . . .’ [[Ps 50:4](#)]. ‘He will call to the heavens’ – to bring the spirit. ‘And to the earth’, to bring the body. ‘And after this to judge his people’.

The Apocalypse of Zephaniah

The Apocalypse of Zephaniah 8:1-9:5

OTP 1:514

^{8:1} . . . **They helped me and set me on that boat.** ²**Thousands of thousands and myriads of myriads of angels gave praise before me.** ³**I, myself, put on an angelic garment,** I saw all of those angels praying. ⁴I, myself, prayed together with them, I knew their language, which they spoke with me. ⁵Now, moreover, my sons, this is the trial because it is necessary that the good and the evil be weighted in a balance. ^{9:1}Then a great angel came forth having a golden trumpet in his hand, and he blew it three times over my head, saying, **“Be courageous! O one who has triumphed. Prevail! O one who has prevailed. For you have triumphed over the accuser, and you have escaped from the abyss and Hades.** ²**You will now cross over the crossing place. For your name is written in the Book of the Living.”** ³I wanted to embrace him, (but) I was unable to embrace the great angel because his glory is great.

⁴Then he ran to **all the righteous ones, namely, Abraham and Isaac and Jacob and Enoch and Elijah and David.** ⁵He spoke with them as friend to friend speaking with one another.

Greek Apocalypse of Ezra

Greek Apocalypse of Ezra 1:21-2:3 and 5:20-23

OTP 1:572, 577

^{1:21}And Ezra said, “It were better if man were not born; it were well if he were not alive. ²²The dumb beasts are a better thing than man, for they do not have punishment. ²³[You to]ok us and delivered us to judgment. ²³Woe to the sinners in the world to come, for their condemnation is endless and the flame enquenched.”

^{2:1}As I said this to him, Michael and Gabriel and **all the apostles** came and said, “Greetings!” ²[And Ezra said, “Faithful man of God!”] ³Arise and come hither with me, O Lord, to judgment.” And God said, “Behold I am giving you my covenant, both mine and yours, so that you will accept it.”

^{5:20}And the prophet said, “Lord, reveal to me the punishments and Paradise.” ²¹And the angels led me away to the east [cf. [Gen 2:8](#)] and I saw the tree of life. ²²And I saw there Enoch and Elijah and Moses and **Peter and Paul and Luke and Matthew and all the righteous and the patriarchs.** ²³And I saw there the [punishment] of the air and the blowing of the winds and the storehouses of the ice and the eternal punishment.

Greek Apocalypse of Ezra 4:35-36

OTP 1:575

³⁵And God said, “Hear, my prophet! He [Antichrist] becomes a child and an old man and let no one believe him that that he is my beloved son. ³⁶**And after these things a trumpet** [[Isa 27:3](#); [Zech 9:14](#); [Matt 24:31](#); [1 Thess 4:16f.](#)], **and the graves will be opened and the dead will rise up uncorrupted** [[1 Cor 15:52](#)].

Greek Apocalypse of Ezra 7:1-4

OTP1:578

¹And God said to him, “Hear, Ezra, my beloved one. I, being immortal, received a cross, I tasted vinegar and gall [[Ps 69:21](#); [Matt 27:34](#); [Mark 15:36](#); [Luke 23:36](#)], I was set down in a grave. ²**And I raised up my elect ones and I summoned up Adam from Hades so that the race of men [. . .]. Therefore, fear not death.** ³For that which is from me, that is the soul, departs for heaven. That which is from the earth, that is the body, departs for the earth from which it was taken [[Gen 3:19b](#)].” ⁴And the prophet said, “woe, woe! What shall I do? How shall I act? I know not.”

Questions of Ezra A4-7

OTP 1:596

⁴The prophet said to the angel, “Lord, who of the living has not sinned against God? ⁵And if that is so, **then blessed are the beasts and the birds who do not await resurrection and have not expected the end.** ⁶If you will crown the righteous, who have endured all tortures, and the prophets and the martyrs when they were taking stones and with a hammer were pounding their faces until their innards were seen, ⁷they were tortured for your sake. Have mercy upon us sinners who have been occupied and have been seized by Satan.”

Questions of Ezra A8-10

OTP 1:596

⁸The angel replied and said, “If there is someone above you, do not talk with him anymore, otherwise great evil will befall you.” ⁹The prophet said to the angel, “Lord, I would speak a little more with you, reply to me! ¹⁰**When the day of the end arrives and he takes the soul, will he assign it to the place of punishment or to the place of honor until the Parousia?** [. . .]

Questions of Ezra B1-14

OTP 1:599

¹He saw the angel of God and asked concerning the righteous and sinners when they go forth from this world. ²The angel said, “**For the righteous there is light and rest, eternal life, but for the sinners, unending tortures.**” ³Ezra said, “If that is so, then blessed are the animals and the beasts of the field and the creeping things and the birds of heaven who do not await resurrection and judgment.” ⁴The angel said, “You sin in saying this, for God has made everything for the sake of man and man for the sake of God. And those things in which God finds man, by those is he judged.” ⁵Ezra said, “When you take the souls of men, where will you bring him?” ⁶The angel said, “I bring the souls of the righteous to worship God establish them in the upper atmosphere, and the souls of the sinners are seized by the demons who are imprisoned in the atmosphere.” ⁷And Ezra said, “And when will the soul which is seized by Satan be delivered?” ⁸The angel said, “When the soul has someone as a good memorial in this world, (this) one releases it from Satan through prayer and (acts of) mercy.” ⁹Ezra said, “By what means?” ¹⁰“If sinner’s soul has no good memorial, which helps him, what will happen to him?” ¹¹The angel said to him, “**Such a one is in the hand of Satan until the coming of Christ, when the trumpet of Gabriel sounds.** ¹²**Then the souls are freed from the hands of Satan and soar down from the atmosphere.** ¹³**And they come and are united each with its body which had been returned to dust and which the sound of the trumpet [Matt 24:31; 1 Cor 15:51f.; 1 Thess 4:16] had built and aroused and renewed.** ¹⁴**And it raises (it) up before Christ our God who comes to judge (those on) the earth, that is the righteous and the wicked, and requites each for his deeds.**”

2 Baruch

2 Baruch 11:4-7

OTP 1:625

⁴O Lord, how have you borne it? **Our fathers went to rest without grief and, behold, the righteous sleep at rest in the earth.** ⁵For they did not know this anguish nor did they hear that which has befallen us [Eccl 9:5]. ⁶Would that you had ears, O earth, and would that you had a heart, O dust, so that you might go and announce in the realm of death and say to the dead, ⁷“You are more happy than we who live.”

2 Baruch 14:8-14

OTP1:626

⁸O Lord, my Lord, who can understand your judgment [Job 40:8a]? Or who can explore the depth of your way [Job 28:23]? ⁹Or who can discern the majesty of your path? Or who can discern your incomprehensible counsel [Job 38:2]? Or who of those who are born has ever discovered the beginning and the end of your wisdom? ¹⁰For we all have been made like breath [Ps 146:4]. ¹¹For as breath ascends without human control and vanishes [Job 7:7; Jam 4:14], so it is with the nature of men, who do not go away according to their own will, and who do not know what will happen to them in the end. ¹²**For the righteous justly have good**

hope for the end and go away from this habitation without fear because they possess with you a store of good works which is preserved in treasures [Matt 6:19-20]. ¹³Therefore, they leave this world without fear and are confident of the world which you have promised to them with an expectation of joy. ¹⁴But woe to those of us who have also now been treated shamefully and who awaits evil at that time.

2 Baruch 15:5-8

OTP 1:626

⁵It is true that man would not have understood my judgment if he had not received the Law and if he were not instructed with understanding. ⁶But now, because he trespassed, having understanding, he will be punished because he has understanding. ⁷**And with regard to the righteous ones, those whom you said the world has come on their account, yes, also that which is coming is on their account.** ⁸**For this world is to them a struggle and an effort with much trouble. And that accordingly which will come, a crown with great glory** [Rom 8:18; 1 Cor 9:25; 2 Cor 4:17; 2 Tim 4:8; Jam 1:12; 1 Pet 5:4; Rev 2:10]

2 Baruch 21:12-13, 23-25

OTP 1:628

¹²You know where you have preserved the end of those who have sinned or **the fulfillment of those who have proved themselves to be righteous.** ¹³For if only this life exists which everyone possesses here, nothing could be more bitter than this. ²³Therefore, reprove the angel of death, and let your glory appear, and let the greatness of your beauty be known, and let the realm of death be sealed so that it may not receive the dead from this time, **and let the treasures of the souls restore those who are enclosed in them.** ²⁴For as many years have passed as those which passed since the days of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob and all those who were like them, **who sleep in the earth** – those on whose account you have said you have created the world. ²⁵And now, show your glory soon and so not postpone that which was promised by you.

2 Baruch 23:4-7

OTP 1:629

⁴For when Adam sinned and death was decreed against those who were to be born, the multitude of those who would be born was numbered. And for that number a place was prepared where the living ones might live and where the dead might be preserved. ⁵**No creature will live again unless the number that has been appointed is completed** [Rom 11:25; Rev 6:11]. For my spirit creates the living, and the realm of death receives the dead. ⁶And further, it is given to you to hear that which will come after these things [Rev 4:1]. ⁷For truly, my salvation [Luke 21:28; Jam 5:3; 1 Pet 4:7] which comes has drawn near and is not as far away as before.

2 Baruch 24:1-2

OTP 1:629

¹**For behold, the days are coming, and the books will be opened in which are written the sins of all those who have sinned** [Dan 7:10; Rev 20:12], **and moreover, also treasures in which are brought together the righteousness of all those who have proven themselves to be righteous.** ²And it will happen at that time that you shall see, and many with you, the long-suffering of the Most High [Rom 9:22], which lasts from generation to generation, who has been long-suffering toward all who are born, **both those who sinned and those who proved themselves to be righteous.**

2 Baruch 30:1-5

OTP 1:631

¹And it shall come to pass after these things, when the time of the advent of the Messiah [cf. Matt 24:37] is fulfilled, that He shall return in glory. 30:2–5. THE RESURRECTION. ²**Then all who have fallen asleep in hope of Him shall rise again.** And it shall come to pass at that time that the treasures will be opened in which is preserved the number of the souls of the righteous, and they shall come forth, and a multitude of souls shall be seen together in one assemblage of one thought, and the first shall rejoice and the last shall not be grieved [1 Cor 15:52]. ³For they know that the time has come of which it is said, that it is the consummation of the times. ⁴But the souls of the wicked, when they behold all these things, shall then waste away the more. ⁵For they shall know that their torment has come and their perdition has arrived.'

2 Baruch 42:7-8

OTP 1:634

⁷For corruption shall take those that belong to it, and **life those that belong to it.** ⁸**And the dust shall be called, and there shall be said to it: "Give back that which is not thine, and raise up all that thou hast kept until its time."**

2 Baruch 44:9-15

OTP 1:634-635

⁹For everything will pass away which is corruptible, and everything that dies will go away, and all presents time will be forgotten, and there will be no remembrance of the present time which is polluted by evils. ¹⁰For he who runs now runs in vain and he who is happy will fall quickly and be humiliated. ¹¹**For that which will be in the future, that is what one will look for, and that which comes later, that is what we shall hope for. For there is a time that does not pass away.** ¹²And that period is coming which will remain forever; and there is the new world which does not carry back to corruption those who enter into its beginning, and which has no mercy on those who come into torment or those who are living in it, and it does not carry to perdition. ¹³For those are the ones who will inherit this time of which it is spoken, and to these is the heritage of the promised time. ¹⁴These are they who prepare for themselves treasures of wisdom. And stores of insight are found with them. And they have not withdrawn from mercy and they have preserved the truth of the Law. **For the coming world will be given to these, but the habitation of the many others will be in the fire.**

2 Baruch 48:3-8, 45-50

OTP 1:635, 637

³Only you know the length of the generations,
and you do not reveal your secrets to many.
⁴You make known the multitude of the fire,
and you weigh the lightness of the wind.
⁵You investigate the end of the heights,
and you scrutinize the depths of darkness.
⁶**You command the number which will pass away, and which will be preserved.**
And you prepare a house for those who will be [John 14:2; 2 Cor 5:1-2].
⁷You remember the beginning which you created,
and you do not forget that destruction which will come.
⁸With signs of fear and threat you command the flames,
and they change into winds.
And with the word you bring to life that which does not exist,
and with great power you hold that which has not yet come.

⁴⁵You, O Lord, my Lord, you know that which is in your creation, ⁴⁶for you commanded the dust one day to produce Adam; and you knew the number of those who are born from him and how they sinned before you, those who existed and who did not recognize you as their Creator. ⁴⁷And concerning all of those, their end will put them to shame, and your Law which they transgressed will repay them on your day.
⁴⁸But now, let us cease talking about the wicked and inquire about the righteous. ⁴⁹And I will tell about their blessedness and I shall not be silent about their glory which is kept for them. ⁵⁰**For surely, as you endured much labor in the short time in which you live in this passing world, so you will receive great light in that world which has no end** [2 Cor 4:17].

2 Baruch 49-52

OTP 1:637-639

[The Nature of the Resurrection Body: The Final Destiny of the Righteous and the Wicked]

^{49:1}Nevertheless, I will again ask from Thee, O Mighty One, yea, I will ask mercy from Him who made all things.
²⁴In what shape will those live who live in Thy day?
Or how will the splendor of those who (are) after that time continue?
³Will they then resume this form of the present,
And put on these entrammelling members,

Which are now involved in evils,
And in which evils are consummated,
Or wilt Thou perchance change these things which have been in the world [1 Cor 15:51]
As also the world?"

^{50:1} And He answered and said unto me: 'Hear, Baruch, this word,
And write in the remembrance of thy heart all that thou shalt learn.

²**For the earth shall then assuredly restore the dead,
[Which it now receives, in order to preserve them].
It shall make no change in their form,
But as it has received, so shall it restore them,
And as I delivered them unto it, so also shall it raise them.**

³**For then it will be necessary to show to the living that the dead have come to life again, and that those who had departed have returned (again).** ⁴**And it shall come to pass, when they have severally recognized those whom they now know,** then judgement shall grow strong, and those things which before were spoken of shall come.

^{51:1} ⁴And it shall come to pass, when that appointed day has gone by, that then shall the **aspect** of those who are condemned be afterwards changed [1 Cor 15:51], and the glory of those who are justified. ²For the aspect of those who now act wickedly shall become worse than it is, as they shall suffer torment. ³**Also (as for) the glory of those who have now been justified in My law, who have had understanding in their life, and who have planted in their heart the root of wisdom, then their splendour shall be glorified in changes, and the form of their face shall be turned into the light of their beauty [Matt 17:2; 1 Cor 15:41; Phil 3:21], that they may be able to acquire and receive the world which does not die, which is then promised to them.** ⁴For over this above all shall those who come then lament, that they rejected My law, and stopped their ears that they might not hear wisdom or receive understanding [Zech 7:11]. ⁵**When therefore they see those, over whom they are now exalted, (but) who shall then be exalted and glorified more than they, they shall respectively be transformed, the latter into the splendour of angels,** and the former shall yet more waste away in wonder at the visions and in the beholding of the forms. ⁶For they shall first behold and afterwards depart to be tormented.

⁷**But those who have been saved by their works,
And to whom the law has been now a hope,
And understanding an expectation,
And wisdom a confidence,
Shall wonders appear in their time.**

⁸**For they shall behold the world which is now invisible to them,
And they shall behold the time which is now hidden from them:**

⁹**And time shall no longer age them [Luke 20:36].**

¹⁰**For in the heights of that world shall they dwell,
And they shall be made like unto the angels,
And be made equal to the stars [Dan 12:3],
And they shall be changed into every form they desire,
From beauty into loveliness,
And from light into the splendour of glory.**

¹¹**For there shall be spread before them the extents of Paradise, and there shall be shown to them the beauty of the majesty of the living creatures which are beneath the throne [Rev 6:4; 7:11], and all the armies of the angels, who [are now held fast by My word, lest they should appear, and] are held fast by a command, that they may stand in their places till their advent comes.** ¹²**Moreover, there shall then be excellency in the righteous surpassing that in the angels.** ¹³**For the first shall receive the last, those whom they were expecting, and the last those of whom they used to hear that they had passed away.**

¹⁴For they have been delivered from this world of tribulation,

And laid down the burthen of anguish.

¹⁵For what then have men lost their life,

And for what have those who were on the earth exchanged their soul [Matt 16:26]?

¹⁶For then they chose [not] for themselves this time,

Which, beyond the reach of anguish, could not pass away:

But they chose for themselves that time,

Whose issues are full of lamentations and evils,

And they denied the world which ages not those who come to it,

And they rejected the time **of** glory,

So that they shall not come to the honour of which I told thee before.'

^{52:1} And I answered and said:

'How can **we** forget those for whom woe is then reserved?

²And why therefore do we again mourn for those who die?

Or why do we weep for those who depart to Sheol?

³Let lamentations be reserved for the beginning of that coming torment,

And let tears be laid up for the advent of the destruction of that time.

⁴[But even in the face of these things will I speak.

⁵And as for the righteous, what will they do now?

⁶Rejoice ye in the suffering which ye now suffer [Matt 5:10; Acts 5:41; Jam 1:2]:

For why do ye look for the decline of your enemies?

⁷Make ready your soul for that which is reserved for you,

And prepare your souls for the reward which is laid up for you.']

2 Baruch 57

OTP 1:641

¹And after these you saw the bright waters; that is the foundation of Abraham and his generation, and the coming of his son, and the son of his son, and of those who are like them. ²**For at that time the unwritten law was in force among them**, and the works of the commandments were accomplished at that time, and **the belief in the coming judgment was brought about**, and the hope of the world which will be renewed was built at that time, and **the promise of the life that will come later was planted**. Those are the bright waters which you have seen.

2 Baruch 66:3

OTP 1:644

³**And he [Josiah] not only killed the impious who were living, but also the bones were taken from the graves of the dead and burned with fire.**

2 Baruch 76:1-2

OTP 1:646

¹And he answered and said to me: Since the revelation of this vision has been explained to you as you prayed for, hear the word of the Most High that you know that which will happen to you after these things.

²**For you will surely depart from this world, nevertheless not to death but to be kept unto (the end) of times.**

2 Baruch 84:5-6

OTP 1:650

⁵And now, Moses spoke to you before it befell you and, behold, it has befallen you for you have forsaken the Law. ⁶**Also I, behold, I say to you after you suffered that if you obey the things which I have said to you, you shall receive from the Mighty One everything which has been prepared and has been**

preserved for you.

2 Baruch 85:8-15

OTP 1:651

⁸And further, the Most High is also long-suffering to us here and has shown to us that which comes and has not concealed from us what will happen at the end. ⁹Therefore, before his judgment exacts his own and truth of that which is its due, let us prepare ourselves that we may possess and not be possessed, and that we

may home and not be put to shame, and **that we may rest with our fathers** and not be punished with those who hate us.

¹⁰For the youth of this world has passed away, and the power of creation is already exhausted, and the coming of the times is very near and has passed by. And the pitcher is near the well, and the ship to the harbor, and the journey to the city, and life to its end. ¹¹Further, prepare yourselves so that, when you sail and ascent from the ship, **you may have rest** and not be condemned when you have gone away. ¹²For behold, the Most High will cause all these things to come. There will not be an opportunity to repent anymore, nor a limit to the times, nor a duration of the periods, nor a change to rest, nor an opportunity to prayer, nor sending up petition, nor giving knowledge, nor giving love, nor opportunity of repentance, nor supplicating for offenses, nor prayers of the fathers, nor intercession of the prophets, nor help of the righteous. ¹³There is the proclamation of judgment to corruption, regarding the way to the fire and the path that leads to the glowing coals [Matt 7:13]. ¹⁴Therefore, there is one Law by One, one world and an end for all those who exist. ¹⁵**Then he will make alive those whom he has found, and he will purge them from sins, and at the same time he will destroy those who are polluted with sins.**

Apocalypse of Elijah (Coptic Version)

Apocalypse of Elijah 3:5-13

OTP 1:745

⁵But the son of lawlessness [cf. Dan 9:27; 11:31; 12:11; Matt 24:15; Mark 13:14; 2 Thess 2:4] will begin to stand again in the holy places.

⁶He will say to the sun [cf. 2 Thess 2:9; Rev 13:13], “Fall” and it will fall.

He will say, “Shine,” and it will do it.

He will say, “Darken,” and it will do it.

⁷He will say to the moon, “Become bloody,” and it will do it [Joel 2:31; Matt 24:29; Rev 6:12].

⁸He will go forth with them from the sky.

He will walk upon the sea and the rivers as upon dry land [Mark 6:48].

⁹He will cause the lame to walk [Matt 11:5].

He will cause the dumb to speak.

He will cause the blind to see.

¹⁰The lepers he will cleanse.

The ill he will heal.

The demons he will cast out [Matt 12:24-27].

¹¹He will multiply his signs and his wonders in the presence of everyone. ¹²He will do the works which the Christ did [cf. John 2:11; 2:23; 3:2; 4:31], except for raising the dead alone. ¹³**In this you will know that he is the son of lawlessness, because he is unable to give life.**

Apocalypse of Elijah 4:24-29

OTP 1:748-749

²⁴Now those who are unable to bear up under the tortures of that king will take gold and flee over the fords to the desert places [cf. Matt 24:16-20; Mark 13:14-19; Luke 17:31-33]. **They will lie down as one who sleeps.**

²⁵**The Lord will receive their spirits and their souls [cf. Eccl 12:7] to himself. ²⁶Their flesh will petrify.**

No wild animals will eat them until the last day of the great judgement. ²⁷And they will rise up and find a place of rest. But they will not be in the kingdom of the Christ as those who have endured because the Lord said, “I will grant to them that they sit on my right hand” [cf. Ps 110:1; Mark 12:36].

²⁸**They will receive favor over others, and they will triumph over the son of lawlessness. And they will witness the dissolution of heaven and earth. ²⁹They will receive the thrones of glory and the crowns.**

Apocalypse of Elijah 4:30-31

OTP 1:749

³¹Sixty righteous ones who are prepared for this hour will hear. ³¹And they will gird on the breastplate of God [cf. Isa 59:17; Eph 6:14; 1 Thess 5:8], and they will run to Jerusalem and fight with the shameless one, saying, “All powers which the prophets have done from the beginning you have done. **But you were unable to**

raise the dead because you have no power to give life. Therein we have known that you are the son of lawlessness.”

Apocalypse of Elijah 5:25-39

OTP 1:752-753

²⁵**One that day**, the mountain and the earth will utter speech [Isa 1:2; Mic 6:2; cf. 4 Ezra 5:11]. The byways will speak with one another, saying, “Have you heard today the voice of a man who walks who has not come to the judgment of the Son of God” [cf. e.g. 1 En 105:2; 4QFlor 1,11-13; 4QEzra 12:31-33; John 5:22, 27] ²⁶The sins of each one will stand against him [Cf. WisSol 4:20] in the place where they were committed, whether those of the day or of the night [1 En 104:7f]. ²⁷Those who belong to the righteous [cf. 1 En 62:11f.; 108:14f.; Jub 23:30; Luke 16:23-26] and . . . will see the sinners and those who persecuted them and those who handed them over to death in their torments. ²⁸Then the sinners [in torment] will see the place of the righteous. ²⁹And thus grace will occur. In those days, that which the righteous will ask for many times will be given to them.

³⁰On that day, the Lord will judge the heaven and the earth.

He will judge those who transgressed in heaven,
and those who did so on earth.

³¹He will judge the shepherds of the people [Ezek 34; 1 En 90:1-26].

He will ask about the flock of sheep,
and they will be given to him,

without any deadly guile existing in them.

³²After these things, Elijah and Enoch will come down. They will lay down the flesh of the world, and they will receive their spiritual flesh [1 Cor 15:44]. They will pursue the son of lawlessness and kill him since he is not able to speak [cf. Mark 1:34],

³³**On that day**, he will dissolve in their presence like ice which was dissolved by a fire. He will perish like a serpent [cf. T.Ash 7:3; Ap.Mose 15-17] which has no breath in it. ³⁴They will say to him, “Your time has passed by for you. Now therefore you and those who believe you will perish.” ³⁵They will be cast into the bottom of the abyss [cf. Rev 20:3] and it will be closed for them.

³⁶**On that day**, the Christ, the king, and all his saints will come forth from heaven [cf. 4 Ezra 7:28; Matt 24:30; 1 Thess 4:16]. ³⁷He will burn the earth. He will spend a thousand years [cf. Ps 94:4 vs. Gen 2:2; 2 En 32:1-33:2; Jub 4:30; 2 Pet 3:8; Rev 20:6] upon it. ³⁸Because the sinners prevailed over it, he will create a new heaven and a new earth [cf. Isa 65:17; 66:22; 1 En 91:16; Jub 1:29; 2 Pet 3:10-13; Rev 21:1]. No deadly devil [cf. Isa 25:8; 4 Ezra 8:53; Rev 20:14; 21:4] will exist in them. ³⁹He will rule with his saints, ascending and descending [cf. Gen 28:12; John 1:51], while they are always with the angels and they are with the Christ for a thousand years [Rev 20:4].

Apocalypse of Elijah (Hebrew Version)

<http://clas-pages.uncc.edu/john-reeves/research-projects/assorted-near-eastern-apocalypses/sefer-elijah/>

‘And he lay down and fell asleep beneath a broom-shrub. Then lo, this angel touched him and said, “Get up, eat!” (1 Kgs 19:5); Michael, ‘the great prince’ of Israel, revealed this mystery to the prophet Elijah at Mount Carmel; (namely), the eschaton and what was scheduled to transpire at the End of Days at the end of the four empires (and) the things which would take place during the reign of the fourth ruler.

A wind from the Lord lifted me (i.e., Elijah) up and transported me to the southern part of the world, and I saw there a high place burning with fire where no creature was able to enter. Then the wind lifted me up and transported me to the eastern part of the world, and I saw there stars battling one another incessantly. Again the wind lifted me up and transported me to the western part of the world, and **I saw there souls undergoing a painful judgment, each one in accordance with its deeds.**

. . . .

Elijah said: **I behold the dead taking form and their ‘dust’ being reshaped and made like (the forms they had) when they were formerly alive so that they might render praise to God, as scripture states: ‘See now that I indeed am He [and there is no deity other than Me; I put to death and I resurrect, I**

sicken and I heal: none can escape from My power]’ (Deut 32:39). Also un Ezekiel it says: ‘and I looked, and behold, sinews were upon them’ (Ezek 37:8). The ministering angles opened their tombs and injected them with their ‘animating breaths,’ and they revived. They (the angels) stood them up on their feet. They shoved everyone who merited punishment into a large hollow place two hundred cubits long and fifty cubits wide. The eyes of the righteous will witness the downfall of all those who did not take pleasure in (observing) the Torah of the Holy One, blessed be He, as scripture states: ‘they will go out and see the corpses of those people who rebelled against Me . . .’ (Isa 66:24).

Elijah said: I behold fire and brimstone coming down upon the wicked from heaven, as scripture says: ‘the Lord will rain coals of fire and brimstone upon the wicked’ (Ps 11:6). The Holy One, blessed be He, will move the Temple a great distance from the place of eternal torment so that the righteous will not hear the sound of the cry of the wicked (suffering) and seek to obtain mercy for them. ‘They will be as if they never were.’

Elijah said: I saw Abraham, Isaac, Jacob, and all the righteous ones in sitting postures, and the land before them was sown with every sort of delightful vegetation. That tree which the Holy One, blessed be He, had prepared was standing in the middle of the garden, as scripture says: ‘and there will grow by the stream on its bank on both sides every kind of fruit tree; their foliage will never wither, nor will their fruit ever fail’ (Ezek 47:12). Boats will come ‘from En-gedi as far as’ Eglayim bearing wealth and riches for the righteous one.

Elijah (may his memory be for a blessing) said: I behold a great city, both beautiful and glorious, descending from heaven wherein it had been built, as scripture states: ‘The already built Jerusalem, like the city associated to it’ (Ps 122:3), perfectly constructed and with its people dwelling within it. It is situated by three thousand towers, with 20,000 *ris* separating each tower. Within the span of every *ris* are 25,000 cubits of emeralds, pearls, and (other) jewels, as scripture says: ‘I will inlay your battlements with gemstones’ (Isa 54:12).

Elijah said: I saw the houses and the gates of the righteous with their thresholds and door-frames constructed of precious stones. (I saw) the treasuries of the Temple opened up to their doorways (sic), and among them were Torah and peace, as scripture states: ‘all your children will be instructed by the Lord;[your children will have great peace]’ (Isa 54:13), and it says: ‘those who love Your Torah have great peace’ (Ps 119:165), and it says: ‘How great is Your beneficence which You have stored up for those who revere You’ (Ps 31:20).

Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections)

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 51. List of resurrection texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha – Testaments (often with apocalyptic sections)

Date	Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
					Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE	Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs	Simeon	6	Arise in joy		x		x		x	J
			8:1	Sleep Death	x						J
		Levi	18:14	Patriarchs share in the eschatological blessings	x						J
		Judah	25	Resurrection of Patriarchs		x		x			J
			26:4	Sleep = Death	x					x	J
		Issachar	7:9	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		Zebulon	10:1-7	Righteous/ Wicked		x				x	J
		Dan	5:7-13	The work of the dual Messiah		x				x	J/C
			7:1	Sleep Death	x					x	J

Table 51 – Continued

Date	Passage			Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
					Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE	Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs	Gad	8:1	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		Asher	8:1	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		Joseph	20:4	Sleep Death	x					x	J
		Benjamin	10:4-10	Resurrection of patriarchs/ transformation/ Judgment		x	x			x	J/C
First Century BCE First Century CE	Testament of Job	4:9		Regarding the impending calamities		x	x			x	J
		33; 41:4		Job's throne in Heaven	x					x	J
		39:12		The Children have been taken up to Heaven	x					x	J
		43		The two ways	x					x	J
		47:11; 52; 53		Coming for the immortal Soul. Death Sleep	x					x	J
First to Second Century CE	Testament of the Three Patriarchs	Testament of Abraham	B7:16	Resurrection after 7000 ages are fulfilled		x				x	J

Table 51 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century CE	Testament of Moses	1:15	Death = Sleep	x					x	J
		10:9	The End-time	x			x		x	J
		10:15	Death = Sleep	x					x	J
Second to Fifth Century CE	Testament of Adam	3:2	Created in God's image	x				x	x	J/C
		3:4	Resurrection/ 2 nd Adam		x		x		x	J/C

Testaments (Often with Apocalyptic Sections)

Resurrection Passages in Context

Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs

Sleep || Death

- Simon 8:1-2 – **He fell asleep** with his fathers at the age of one hundred and twenty years.
(OTP 1:787) They placed him in a wooden coffin in order to carry his bones up to Hebron.
- Judah 26:4 – **Judah fell asleep** and his sons did everything as he had instructed them, and they buried him in Hebron with his fathers.
(OTP 1:802)
- Issachar 7:9 – And he stretched his legs and died at a good old age – the fifth son, with all his members sound and still strong; **he slept the eternal sleep**.
(OTP 1:804)
- Zebulun 10:6 – When he had said this, **he fell into a beautiful sleep**, and his sons placed him in a coffin.
(OTP 1:807)
- Dan 7:1 – When he had said this, he kissed them and **slept an eternal sleep**. And his sons buried him and later they carried his bones to be near Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob.
(OTP 1:810)
- Gad 8:1 – He drew up his feet and **fell asleep in peace**. And after five years they took him up and buried him in Hebron with his fathers.
(OTP 1:816)
- Asher 8:1 – After he had said these things he gave instructions, saying, “Bury me in Hebron.” And he died, **heaving fallen into a beautiful sleep**.
(OTP 1:818)
- Joseph 20:4-5 – And after he had said this he stretched out his feet and **fell into a beautiful sleep**. And all Israel and all Egypt mourned with great lamentation.
(OTP 1:825)

Simeon 6

OTP 1:787

¹"See, I have told you everything, so that I might be exonerated with regard to your sin.

² "If you divest yourselves of envy and every hardness of heart,
my bones will flourish as a rose [cf. Isa 35:1; Hos 14:5-7; Song 2:1] in Israel,
and my flesh as a lily in Jacob,
My odor shall be like the odor of Lebanon;
Holy ones shall be multiplied from me forever and ever,
and their branches shall extend to a great distance.

³ Then the seed of Canaan will be destroyed,
and there will be no posterity of Amalek,
All the Cappadocians (1QapGen 21:23 vs. Gen 14:9) shall be destroyed,
and all the Hittites shall be wholly obliterated.

⁴ The land of Ham shall be wanting,
and all that people shall perish.
Then the whole earth shall be at rest from trouble,
and everything under heaven shall be free from war.

⁵"Then Shem shall be glorified; because God the Lord, the Great One in Israel, will be manifest upon the earth [as a man]. By himself will he save Adam. ⁶Then all the spirits of error shall be given over to being trampled underfoot. And men will have mastery over the evil spirits. ⁷**Then I shall arise in gladness** [Dan 12:2 – however, both the just and unjust] and I shall bless the Most High for his marvels, [because God has taken a body, eats with human beings, and saves human beings].

Levi 18:1-14**OTP 1:794-795**

^{18:1}When vengeance will have come upon them from the Lord, the priesthood will lapse.
²And then the Lord will raise up a new priest [cf. Ps 110]
to whom all the words of the Lord will be revealed.
He shall effect the judgment of truth over the earth for many days.
³And his star [Num 24:17] shall rise in heaven like a king;
kindling the light of knowledge as day is illumined by the sun.
And he shall be extolled by the whole inhabited world.
⁴This one will shine forth like the sun in the earth;
he shall take away all darkness from under heaven,
and there shall be peace in all the earth.
⁵The heaven shall greatly rejoice in his days
and the earth shall be glad [Isa 44:23];
the clouds will be filled with joy
and the knowledge of the Lord will be poured out on the earth like the water of the seas [Isa 11:9].
And the angels of glory of the Lord's presence will be made glad by him.
⁶The heavens will be opened,
and from the temple of glory sanctification will come upon him,
with a fatherly voice, as from Abraham to Isaac.
⁷And the glory of the Most High shall burst forth upon him.
And the spirit of understanding and sanctification
shall rest upon him [in the water] [Isa 11:2; Mark 1:9-11].
⁸For he shall give the majesty of the Lord to those who are his sons in truth forever.
And there shall be no successor for him from generation to generation forever.
⁹And in his priesthood the nations shall be multiplied in knowledge on the earth,
and they shall be illumined by the grace of the Lord,
but Israel shall be diminished by her ignorance
and darkened by her grief.
In his priesthood sin shall cease
and lawless men shall rest from their evil deeds,
and righteous men shall find rest in him.
¹⁰And he shall open the gates of paradise [Gen 3:24];
he shall remove the sword that has threatened since Adam,
¹¹and he will grant to the saints to eat of the tree of life [Gen 2:9; Rev 22:2, 4, 19].
The spirit of holiness shall be upon them.
¹²And Beliar shall be bound by him [Isa 24:22-23; cf. Mark 3:27; Luke 10:19; 11:14-22].
And he shall grant to his children the authority to trample on wicked spirits.
¹³And the Lord will rejoice in his children;
he will be well pleased by his beloved ones forever.
¹⁴**Then Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob will rejoice** [cf. Matt 8:11; John 8:56],
and I shall be glad, and the saints shall be clothed in righteousness.

Judah 25**OTP 1:801-802**

¹**And after these things shall Abraham and Isaac and Jacob arise unto life**, and I and my brethren shall
be chiefs of the tribes [of Israel]: Levi first, I the second, Joseph third, Benjamin fourth, Simeon fifth,
Issachar sixth, and so all in order. ²And the Lord blessed Levi, and the Angel of the Presence, me; the
powers of glory, Simeon; the heaven, Reuben; the earth, Issachar; the sea, Zebulun; the mountains, Joseph;
the tabernacle, Benjamin; the luminaries, Dan; **Eden**, Naphtali; the sun, Gad; the moon, Asher.
³And ye shall be the people of the Lord [cf. John 17:22; Eph 4:4], and have one tongue [Gen 11:1-9; cf. Jub 3:28];
And there shall be there no spirit of deceit of [Beliar],
For he shall be cast into the fire for ever [Rev 20:2, 14].
⁴**And they who have died in grief shall arise [in joy],**

**[And they who were poor for the Lord's sake shall be made rich],
And they who are put to death for the Lord's sake shall awake [to life]** [Dan 12:2; Rev 12:11; 20:4].

⁵And the harts of Jacob shall run [joyfulness],
And the eagles of Israel shall fly [in gladness] [Isa 40:28-31];
And all the people shall glorify the Lord for ever.

Zebulon 10:1-7

POT 2:332

¹And now, my children, grieve not that I am dying, nor be cast down in that I am coming to my end. ²**For I shall rise again in the midst of you, [as a ruler in the midst of his sons]; and I shall rejoice in the midst of my tribe**, as many as shall keep the law of the Lord, [and the commandments of Zebulun their father].
³But upon the ungodly shall the Lord bring eternal fire, and destroy them throughout all generations [cf. Gen 19:24; Ps 11:5-7]. ⁴But I am now hastening away to my rest, as did also my fathers. ⁵But do ye fear the Lord [our God with all your strength all the days of your life]. ⁶And when he had said these things he fell asleep, [at a good **old age**]. ⁷And his sons laid him in a [wooden] coffin. And afterwards they carried him up and buried him in Hebron, with his fathers.

Dan 5:7-13

OTP 1:809-810

⁷My sons will draw close to Levi,
will participate with them in all manners of sins;
and with the sons of Judah they will share in greed,
like lions snatching what belongs to others.
⁸Accordingly you will be led off with them into captivity;
there you will receive all the plagues of Egypt,
and all the evils of the gentiles.
⁹Therefore when you turn back to the Lord, you will receive mercy,
and he will lead you into his holy place, proclaiming peace to you.
¹⁰And there shall arise for you from the tribe of Judah
and (the tribe of) Levi the Lord's salvation.
He will make war against Beliar;
he will grant the vengeance of victory as our goal.
¹¹**And he shall take from Beliar the captives, the souls of the saints;**
and he shall turn the hearts of the disobedient ones to the Lord,
and grant eternal peace to those who call upon him.
¹²And the saints shall refresh themselves in Eden;
the righteous shall rejoice in the New Jerusalem,
which shall be eternally for the glorification of God.
¹³And Jerusalem shall no longer undergo desolation [Dan 9:2],
nor shall Israel be led into captivity,
because the Lord will be in her midst [living among human beings].
The Holy One of Israel will rule over them in humility and poverty,
and he who trusts in him shall reign in truth in the heavens.

Benjamin 10:2-11**OTP 1:828**

^{10:2}After he had spoken these things to them he said, “You know then, my children, that I am dying. Do the truth, each of you to his neighbor; ³keep the Law of the Lord and his commandments, ⁴for I leave you these things instead of an inheritance. Give them, then, to your children for an eternal possession; this is what Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob did. ⁵They gave us all these things as an inheritance, saying, ‘Keep God’s commandments until the Lord reveals his salvation to all the nations.’ ⁶**And then you will see Enoch and Seth and Abraham and Isaac and Jacob being raised up at the right hand in great joy** [Dan 12:2]. ⁷**Then shall we also be raised** [ibid.], **each of us over our tribe** [cf. Matt 19:28-30], **and we shall prostrate ourselves before the heavenly king.** ⁸**Then all shall be changed** [1 Cor 15:51], **some destined for glory, others for dishonor**, for the Lord first judges Israel for the wrong she has committed ⁹and then he shall do the same for all the nations. ¹⁰Then he shall judge Israel by the chosen gentiles as he tested Esau by the Medianites who loved their brothers. You, therefore, my children, may your lot come to be with those who fear the Lord. ¹¹**Therefore, my children, if you live in holiness, in accord with the Lord’s commands, you shall again dwell with me in hope; all Israel will be gathered to the Lord** [Rom 11:26].

Testament of Job

Testament of Job 4:3-11**OTP 1:841**

³Again he said, “Thus says the Lord: ⁴If you attempt to purge the place of Satan, he will rise up against you with wrath for battle. But he will be unable to bring death upon you. He will bring in you many plagues, ⁵he will take away for himself your goods, he will carry off your children. ⁶But if you are patient, I will make your name renowned in all generations of the earth till the consummation of the age [Not in LXX; cf. Matt 13:39; Heb 9:26]. ⁷And I will return you again to your goods. It will be repaid to you doubly, ⁸so you may know that the Lord is impartial – rendering good things to each one who obeys. ⁹**And you shall be raised up in the resurrection** [Job 42:17a (LXX)]. ¹⁰For you will be like a sparring athlete, both enduring pains and winning the crown. ¹¹Then will you know that the Lord is just, true, and strong, giving strength to his elect ones.”

Testament of Job 33; 41:4**OTP 1:855-856, 860-861**

^{33:1}After Eliphaz finished wailing while his fellow kings responded to him all in a great commotion, ²when the uproar died down, I said to them, “Quiet! Now I will show you my throne with the splendor of its majesty, **which is among the holy ones.**

³**“My throne is in the upper world**, and its splendor and majesty come from the right hand [Matt 26:64; Mark 16:19; Luke 22:69; Acts 2:33; Eph 1:17, 20; Heb 1:3; 8:1] of the Father [Isa 63:16; 64:8; Mal 1:6; 2:10].

⁴The whole world shall pass away [1 Cor 7:31; 1 John 2:17]

and its splendor shall fade. And those who heed it shall share in its overthrow.

⁵**But my throne is in the holy land** [cf. Zech 3:2], **and its splendor is in the world of the changeless one.**

⁶*Rivers will dry up* [Job 14:11],

and the arrogance of their waves goes down into the depths of the abyss.

⁷**But the rivers of my land, where my throne is, do not dry up nor will they disappear, but they will exist forever** [the term “forever” is only used in Heb 7:3; 10:1, 12, 14].

⁸These kings will pass away, and rulers come and go; but their splendor and boast shall be as in a mirror [1 Cor 13:12; Jam 1:23].

⁹**But my kingdom is forever and ever, and its splendor and majesty are in the chariots of the Father.”**

^{41:4}But I [Elihu] will not hold on. From the start I too made lamentation for him [Job], remembering his former prosperity. And here now he speaks out in boastful grandeur, **saying he has his throne in heaven.**

Testament of Job 39:8-12

OTP 1:859

⁸But she [Sitis, Job's wife] began to beg them [Job's friends], saying, "I plead with you, order your soldiers to dig through the ruins of the house that fell on my children so that at least their bones might be preserved as a memorial ⁹since we cannot because of the expense. Let us see them, even if it is only their bones.

¹⁰Have I the womb of cattle or of a wild animal that my ten children have died and I have not arranged the burial of a single one of them?"

¹¹And they left to dig, but I forbade it, saying, "Do not trouble yourselves in vain. ¹²**For you will not find my children, since they were taken up into heaven by the Creator their King.**"

Testament of Job 43

OTP 1:861-863

¹Then when Eliphas, Baldad, and Sophar knew that the Lord had showed them favor regarding their sin – but had not considered Elihu worthy – ²Eliphas replied and spoke up with a hymn ³while the other friends and their troops sang to him in response near the altar. ⁴Eliphas spoke in this manner:

"Our sins were stripped off, and our lawlessness buried.

⁵Elihu, Elihu – the only evil one – will have no memorial among the living.

His quenched lamp lost its luster [Job 18:5],

⁶and the splendor of his lantern will flee from him into condemnation.

For this one is the one of darkness and not of light.

And the doorkeepers of darkness shall inherit his splendor and majesty.

⁷His kingdom is gone, his throne is rotted.

And the honor of his tent lies in Hades.

⁸He loved the beauty of the snake and the scales of the dragon.

Its venom and poison shall be his food.

⁹He did not take to himself the Lord, nor did he fear him.

But even his honored ones he provoked to anger.

¹⁰The Lord has forgotten him, and the holy ones abandoned him.

¹¹But wrath and anger shall be his tent.

He has no hope in his heart, nor peace in his body.

¹²He had the poison of asps in his tongue.

¹³Righteous is the Lord, true are his judgments.

With him there is no favoritism. **He will judge us all together.**

¹⁴Behold the Lord has come! Behold his holy ones are prepared, while crowns lead the way with praises.

¹⁵Let the holy ones rejoice, let them leap for joy in their hearts,

for they have received the splendor they awaited.

¹⁷Gone is our sin, cleansed is our lawlessness.

And the evil one Elihu has no memorial among the living."

Testament of Job 47:11; 52; 53:7

OTP 1:865, 867-868

^{47:11}Rise then, gird yourselves with them [the three multicolored cords] before I die in order that you may be able to see **those who are coming for my soul**, in order that you may marvel over the creatures of God."

^{52:1}After three days, as Job fell ill on his bed (without suffering or pain, however, since suffering could no longer touch him on account of the omen of the sash he wore), ²after those three days he saw those **who had come for his soul**. ³And rising immediately he took a lyre and gave it to his daughter Hemera. ⁴To Kasia he gave a censer, and to Amaltheia's Horn he gave a kettle drum, ⁵so that they might bless those who had come for his soul. ⁶And when they took them, they saw the gleaming chariots [Gen 5:24; 2 Kings 2:11] which **had come for his soul**. ⁷And they blessed and glorified God each one in her own distinctive dialect.

⁸After these things the one who saw in the great chariot got off and greeted Job ⁹as the three daughters and their father himself looked on, though certain others did not see. ¹⁰And taking **the soul** he flew up,

embracing it, and mounted the chariot and set off for the east. ¹¹But this **body, prepared for burial**, was borne to the tomb as his three daughters went ahead girded about and singing hymns to God.

^{53:8}But after three days they laid him **in the tomb in a beautiful sleep**.

Testament of the Three Patriarchs

Testament of Abraham B7:13-17

OTP 1:898-899

¹³When the radiant man said these things, I saw the sun of my house going up into heaven, but I saw that crown no more. ¹⁴That sun was like you, my father.” ¹⁵And Michael said to Abraham, “Your son Isaac has spoken the truth; for you are (the sun), and you will be taken up into the heavens, ¹⁶**while your body remains on the earth until seven thousand ages are fulfilled. For then all flesh will be raised**. ¹⁷Now, therefore, Abraham, make a will (governing) the things of your household and concerning your sons, for you have heard completely the dispensation concerning you.”

Testament of Moses

Testament of Moses 10:1-10

OTP 1:931-932

¹Then his kingdom will appear throughout his whole creation.
Then the devil will have an end.
Yea, sorrow will be led away with him.

²Then will be filled the hands of messenger,
 who is in the highest place appointed.
Yea, he will at one avenge them of their enemies [[Dan 10:13, 21; 12:1](#)].

³For the Heavenly One will arise from his kingly throne.
Yea, he will go forth from his holy habitation [[Deut 26:15; Isa 63:15; Jer 25:30; Mic 1:3](#)]
 With indignation and wrath on behalf of his sons.

⁴And the earth will tremble, even to its ends shall it be shaken.
And the high mountains will be made low.
Yea, they will be shaken, as enclosed valleys will they fall.

⁵The sun will not give light.
And in darkness the horns of the moon will flee.
Yea, they will be broken in pieces.

It will be turned wholly into blood.
Yea, even the circle of the stars will be thrown into disarray.

⁶And the sea all the way to the abyss will retire,
 to the sources of waters which fail.
Yea, the rivers will vanish away.

⁷For God Most High will surge forth,
 the Eternal One alone.
In full view will he come to work vengeance on the nations [[cf. Deut 32:11-13; Jos 10:24; Isa 40:31](#)].
Yea, all their idols will he destroy.

⁸Then will you be happy, O Israel!
And you will mount up above the necks and the wings of an eagle.
Yea, all things will be fulfilled.

⁹**And God will raise you to the heights.**
Yea, he will fix you firmly in the heaven of the stars [Dan 12:3],
in the place of their habitations.

¹⁰And you will behold from on high.
Yea, you will see your enemies on the earth.

And recognizing then, you will rejoice.
And you will give thanks.
Yea, you will confess your creator.

Testament of Adam

Testament of Adam 3:2-4

OTP 1:994

²He spoke to me about this in Paradise after I picked some of the fruit in which death was hiding: “Adam, Adam do not fear. You wanted to be a god [Gen 3:4, 22]; I will make you a god [cf. John 10:33-36], not right now, **but after a space of many years. I am consigning you to death, and the maggot and the worm will eat your body.**” ³And I answered and said to him, “Why, my Lord?” And he said to me, “Because you listened to the words of the serpent, you and your posterity will be food for the serpent. **But after a short time there will be mercy on you because you were created in my image [Gen 1:27], and I will not leave you to waste away in Sheol.** For you sake I will be born of the Virgin Mary. For your sake I will taste death and enter the house of the dead. For your sake I will make a new heaven, and I will be established over your posterity. ⁴**And after three days, while I am in the tomb, I will raise up the body I received from you. And I will set you at the right hand of my divinity [Ps 110:1], and I will make you a god just like you wanted. And I will receive favor from God, and I will restore to you and to your posterity that which is the justice of heaven.”**

Expansions on Stories and Legends

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 52. List of resurrection texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha – Expansions of the “Old Testament” and Legends

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Second Century BCE	Jubilees	Judgment Texts (Implied Resurrection) 4:24 5:10 10:17 23:11 30:23 36:10-11 37:19 39:6		X				X	X	J
		10:15; 23:1; 36:18; 45:15	Sleep Death	X					X	J
		23:27-31	Bones rest in the earth, Spirits will increase joy	X					X	J
Second Century BCE Fourth Century CE	Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah	1:3-5	Hezekiah’s vision	X					X	J
		3:18	Faith => Salvation	X						
		4:14-22	2 nd Coming		X				X	C
		7:4; 8:14, 23, 27; 11:35	Rope of Flesh Rope of Angels	X					X	C
		9:7-11	Saints in Heaven	X					X	C
		9:16-18	Resurrection of Jesus and the Saints	X					X	C

Table 52 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century BCE Second Century CE	Joseph and Aseneth	8:(10)-(11)	Joseph's blessing of Aseneth	x			x		x	J
		12:(12)	God's gift	x					x	J
		15:3-6, (7), 12x 16:(8)	The Book of Life	x					x	J
		16:21-23	Resurrection of bees		x				x	J
		20:7	God is the life giver		x				x	J
		22:(9)	Aseneth's place of rest	x					x	J
		27:10	The immortality of the Soul	x					x	J
First Century CE	Apocalypse of Moses (Life of Adam and Eve)	10:2	Eve's woe		x				x	J
		13:2-6	Michael's words to Seth		x		x		x	J
		28:4	If you are righteous => resurrection => immortality		x			?	x	J
		37:5	Adam taken to Paradise	x					x	J
		39:2-3	Promise given to Adam	x					x	J
		41	Promised resurrection		x	x			x	J
		43:2-3	Burial practice Body => earth Soul => after 7 days back to Heaven		x				x	J

Table 52 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century CE	Vita (Life of Adam and Eve)	47:2-3	Resurrection/ judgment	x					x	J
		51:2	The Sabbath is a sign of the resurrection		x	x			x	J
First Century CE	Pseudo-Philo	3:10	Resurrection/ Judgment		x				x	J
		16:3	Rebellion of Korah	x					x	
		19:2, 6	Death = sleep	x					x	J
		19:12-13	Resurrection of Moses		x				x	J
		23:13	The righteous		x	x			x	J
		25:7	Repentance => resurrection		x				x	J
		28:10	Death = Sleep	x					x	J
		29:4	Death = Sleep	x					x	J
		33:2-3	No repentance after death		x				x	J
		33:6	Death = Sleep	x					x	J

Table 52 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century CE	Pseudo-Philo	35:3	Death = Sleep	x					x	J
		48:1	Ascension of Phinehas	x					x	J
		62:9	The souls will know each other	x					x	J
		64:6-9	Samuel's resurrection caused by Saul		x	x			x	J
First Century CE	Lives of the Prophets	2:11-19	The ark will appear at the resurrection		x				x	J
		3:10-12	Hope for Israel		x				x	J
c. First Century CE	Ladder of Jacob	7:21	Resurrection of Eve		x				x	J
First to Second Century CE	4 Baruch	6:6-10	Promise to Abimelech	x					x	J
		7:18	Resurrection of the dead man		x				x	J
		9:12-14	Jesus the resurrector		x				x	J/C
First to Fourth Century CE	History of the Rechabites	14-16	Soul Body		x				x	J/C

Expansions on Stories and Legends

Resurrection Passages in Context

Jubilees 23:27-31

OTP 2:101-102

²²And there will be a great plague upon the deeds of the generation from the Lord and he will give them to the sword and to judgment and to captivity and pillage and destruction. ²³And he will rouse up against them the sinners of the nations who have no mercy or grace for them and who have no regard for any persons old or young or anyone [[Ezek 9:6](#)]. For (they will be) cruel and powerful so that they will act more evilly than any of the sons of men.

And they will cause turmoil in Israel and sin against Jacob;
and much blood will be shed upon the earth;
and there will be no one who will gather and no one who will bury [[Jer 8:2](#)].

²⁴In those days, they will cry out and call and pray
to be saved from the hand of the sinners, the gentiles,
but there will be none who will be saved,
²⁵and the heads of children will be white with gray hairs,
and an infant three weeks old will look aged
like one whose years (are) one hundred,
and their stature will be destroyed by affliction and torment.

²⁶And in those days, children will begin to search the law,
and to search the commandments
and to return to the way of righteousness.

²⁷And the days will begin to increase and grow longer
among those sons of men, generation by generation,
and year by year, until
their days approach a thousand years,
and to a great number of years than days.

²⁸And there (will be) no old men and none who is full of days [[Isa 60:20](#)].
Because all of them will be infants and children.

²⁹And all of their days they will be complete
and live in peace and rejoicing
and there will be no Satan and no evil (one) who will destroy,
because all of their days will be days of blessing and healing.

³⁰**And then the Lord will heal his servants,
and they will rise up and see great peace.**

And they will drive out their enemies,
and the righteous ones will see and give praise,
and rejoice forever and ever with joy;
and they will see all of their judgments and all of their curses among their enemies.

³¹**And their bones will rest in the earth,
and their spirits will increase joy.**

And they will know that the Lord is an executor of judgment;
but he will show mercy to hundreds and thousands,
to all who love him.

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 1:3-5

OTP 2:156-157

²He [Hezekiah] summoned him [Manasseh] in the presence of Isaiah, the son of Amoz, the prophet, and in the presence of Josab the son of Isaiah, in order to hand over to him the words of righteousness which the king himself had seen, ³and (the words concerning) **the eternal judgments, and the torments of Gehenna**, and the prince of this world, and his angels, and his authorities, and his powers [Eph 6:12; 1 Pet 3:22], ⁴and the words concerning faith in the Beloved [Matt 12:18; Mark 1:11; 9:7; Eph 1:6] which he himself had seen in the fifteenth year of his reign during his sickness. ⁵And he handed to him the written words which Samnas the secretary had written out, and also those which Isaiah the son of Amoz had given to him, and to the prophets also, that they might write out and store up with him what he himself had seen in the house of the king **concerning the judgment of the angels, and concerning the destruction of this world, and concerning the robes of the saints and their going out, and concerning their transformation and the persecution and ascension of the Beloved** which he himself had seen in the fifteenth year of his reign during his sickness [cf. 2 Kings 20:1-11; Isa 38; 2 Chron 32:24].

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 3:15b-20

OTP 2:160

^{15b}And the angel of the Holy Spirit ¹⁶and Michael, the chief of the holy angels, will open his [Christ's] gave on the third day, ¹⁷and that Beloved, sitting on their shoulders, will come forth and send out his twelve disciples, ¹⁸and they will teach all nations and every tongue **the resurrection of the Beloved, and those who believe in his cross will be saved**, and in his ascension to the seventh heaven from where he came; ¹⁹and that many who believe in him will speak through the Holy Spirit, ²⁰and there will be many sings and miracles in those days.

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 4:14-22

OTP 2:162-163

¹⁴And after [one thousand] three hundred and thirty-two days [Dan 12:12] the Lord will come with his angels and with the hosts of the saints [1 Thess 3:13; 2 Thess 1:7; Jude 14] from the seventh haven, with the glory of the seventh heaven, and will drag Beliar, and his hosts also, into Gehenna [Rev 19:20]. ¹⁵And he will **give rest** to the pious whom he finds in the body in this world, but *the sun will be ashamed* [Isa 24:23], ¹⁶and (to) all who because of their faith in him have cursed Beliar and his kings. But the saints will come with the Lord [1 Thess 3:13] with their robes which are stored up in the seventh heaven above; with the Lord will come those whose spirits are clothed [1 Thess 4:14; Rev 20:4], they will descend and be present in the world, and the Lord will strengthen those **who are found in the body**, together with the saints in the robes of the saints, and will serve those who have kept watch in this world [Luke 12:37]. ¹⁷And after this they will be turned in their robes upwards, and their body will be left in the world [1 Cor 15:50-53; 2 Cor 5:1-4; Phil 3:21]. ¹⁸Then the voice of the Beloved will reprove in anger this heaven, and this earth, and the mountains, and the hills, and the cities, and the desert, and the trees, and the angel of the sun, and that of the moon, and everywhere that Beliar has appeared and acted openly in this world. **There will be a resurrection and a judgment in their midst in those days** [Rev 20:11-15], **and the Beloved will cause fire to rise from him, and it will consume all the impious** [Isa 11:4; 2 Thess 1:8; 2:8], **and they will become as if they had not been created** [Eth. Job 10:19]. ¹⁹And the rest of the words of the vision are written in the vision of Babylon [LXX Isa 13:1, 19-22]. ²⁰And the rest of the vision about the Lord, behold it is written in parables in the words of mine that are written in the book which I prophesied openly. And the descent of the Beloved into Sheol [Isa 53:8 (LXX)], behold it is written in the section where the Lord says, "*Behold, my son shall understand*" [Isa 52:13 (LXX)] And all these things, behold they are written in the Psalms, in the parables of David the son of Jesse, and in the Proverbs of Solomon his son, and in the words of Korah [e.g. Pss 42; 44] and of Ethan [Ps 89 (LXX 88)] the Israelite, and in the words of Asaph [Pss 50; 73-83], and in the rest of the psalms which the angel of the spirit has inspired, ²²(namely) in those which have no name written, and in the words of Amos my father and of Hosea the prophet, and Micah, and of Joel, and of Nahum, and of Jonah, and of Obadiah, and of Habakkuk, and of Haggai, and of Zephaniah, and of Zechariah, and of Malachi, and in the words of the righteous Joseph, and in the words of Daniel.

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 9:6-11

OTP 2:170

⁶And he took me up into the seventh heaven, and there I saw a wonderful light, and also angels without number. ⁷And there I saw all the righteous from the time of Adam onwards. ⁸And there I saw the holy Abel and all the righteous. ⁹And there I saw Enoch and all who (were) with him, stripped of (their) robes of the flesh; and I saw them in their robes of above [cf. 2 Cor 5:1-4; Rev 3:4f.; 6:11; 7:9, 13f.], and they were like the angels who stand there in great glory. ¹⁰But they were not sitting on their thrones [Matt 19:28; Luke 22:30; Rev 3:21; 4:4], nor were their crowns of glory [1 Cor 9:25; 2 Tim 4:7f. Jam 1:12; 1 Pet 5:4; Rev 2:10; 3:11; 4:4] on them. ¹¹And I asked the angel who (was) with me, "How is it that they have received these robes, but are not on (their) thrones nor in (their) crowns?"

Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah 9:16-18

OTP 2:170

¹⁶“And when he has plundered the angel of death, he will rise on the third day and will remain in that world for five hundred and forty-five days. ¹⁷And the many of the righteous will ascend with him, whose spirits do not receive (their) robes until the Lord Christ ascends and they ascend with him. ¹⁸Then indeed they will receive their robes and their thrones and their crowns, when he has ascended into the seventh heaven.”

Joseph and Aseneth

Joseph and Aseneth 8:(10)-(11)

OTP 2:213

⁹And he [Joseph] lifted up his right hand and put it upon her [Aseneth] head and said:
⁽¹⁰⁾Lord God of my father Israel,
the Most High, the Powerful One of Jacob,
who gave life to all (things)
and called (them) from the darkness to the light,
and from the error to the truth,
and **from the death to the life** [cf. Luke 15:24, 32; John 5:24; 1 John 3:14];
you, Lord, bless this virgin,
⁽¹¹⁾and renew her by your spirit,
and form her anew by your hidden hand,
and **make her alive again by your life** [cf. Exod 17:16 (LXX)],
and let her eat your bread of life,
and drink your cup of blessing,
and number her among your people
that you have chosen [cf. Ps 33:12; Eph 1:4] before all (things) came into being,
and **let her enter your rest**
which you have prepared for your chosen ones [cf. Ps 95:11 (LXX rather than MT); Heb 3:7-4:13],
and live in your eternal life [e.g. Dan 12:2; Matt 25:46; John 3:5; Rom 5:21] **for ever (and) ever.**

Joseph and Aseneth 12:15(12)

OTP 2:222

¹⁵What father (is) as sweet as you, Lord,
and who (is as) long-suffering toward our sins as you, Lord?
⁽¹²⁾For behold, all the gifts of my father Pentephres,
which he gave me as an inheritance, are transient [cf. Matt 6:19-31; 2 Cor 4:18 || 1 Pet 1:4; Jam 1:17] and
obscure;
but the gifts of your inheritance, Lord, are incorruptible and eternal [Mark 10:17-31 || Heb 10:34].

Joseph and Aseneth 15:2b-6, (7), (12x); 16:(8)

OTP 2:226, 227, 229

^{15:2b}And the man said to her, "Courage, Aseneth, chaste virgin. Behold, I have heard all the words of your confession and your prayer. ³Behold, I have also seen the humiliation and the affliction of the seven days of your want (of food). Behold, from your tears and these ashes, plenty of mud has formed before your face. ⁴

⁽³⁾Courage, Aseneth, chaste virgin. **For behold, your name was written in the book of the living** [cf. eg. Exod 32:32f.; Ps 87:6; Luke 10:20; Rev 20:12, 15] **in heaven; in the beginning of the book, as the very first of all, your name was written by my finger, and it will not be erased forever.** ⁵⁽⁴⁾Behold, from today, you will be renewed and formed anew and made alive again [1 Cor 2:3; 4:9; Eph 2:5; 3:6], and you will eat blessed bread of life, and drink a blessed cup of immortality, and anoint yourself with blessed ointment of incorruptibility. ⁶⁽⁵⁾Courage, Aseneth, chaste virgin. Behold, I have given you today to Joseph for a bride, and he himself will be your bridegroom for ever (and) ever.

⁽⁷⁾For Repentance is in the heavens, an exceedingly beautiful and good daughter of the Most High. And she herself entreats the Most High God for you at all times and for all who repent in the name of the Most High God, because he is (the) father of Repentance. And she herself is guardian of all virgins, and loves you very much, and is beseeching the Most High for you at all times **and for all who repent she prepared a place of rest in the heaven** [cf. John 14:2f.]. And she will renew all who repent, and wait on them herself for ever (and) ever.

^(12x)What is your name, Lord; tell me in order that I may praise and glorify you for ever (and) ever.” And the man said to her, “Why do you seek this, my name, Aseneth? My name is in the heavens in the book of the Most High, written by the finger of God in the beginning of the book before all (the others), because I am chief of the house of the Most High. **And all names written in the book of the Most High are unspeakable, and man is not allowed to pronounce nor hear them in this world, because those names are exceedingly great and wonderful and laudable.**”

^{16:8}For this comb is (full of the) spirit of life. And the bees of the paradise of delight have made this from the dew of the roses of life that are in the paradise of God. And all the angels of God eat of it and all the chosen of God and all the sons of the Most High [e.g. Ps 89:7], because this is **a comb of life, and everyone who eats of it will not die for ever (and) ever.**

Joseph and Aseneth 16:21-23

OTP 2:230

²¹And all the bees rose and flew and went away into heaven. ²²⁽¹⁶⁾And those who wanted to injure Aseneth fell to the ground and died. ⁽¹⁷⁾**And the man stretched out his staff over the dead bees and said to them, “Rise you, too, and go away to your place.”** ²³**And the bees who had died rose** and went into the court adjoining Aseneth’s house and sought shelter on the fruit-bearing trees.

Joseph and Aseneth 20:6-8

OTP 2:234

⁶⁽⁵⁾And her father and mother and his whole family came from the field which was their inheritance. And they saw Aseneth like (the) appearance of light, and her beauty was like heavenly beauty. And they saw her sitting with Joseph and dressed in a wedding garment. ⁷And they were amazed at her beauty and rejoiced and **gave glory to God** [cf. Matt 5:16; 1 Pet 2:12] **who gives life to the dead** [Amidah 2]. ⁸And after this they ate and drank and celebrated [e.g. 1 Kings 4:20; Luke 12:19. **Could this be a conversion meal?** cf. Mark 2:15; Luke 15:23; Acts 16:34].

Joseph and Aseneth 22:(8)-(9)

OTP 2:239

¹³⁽⁸⁾And Aseneth grasped Levi’s hand. And Aseneth loved Levi exceedingly beyond all of Joseph’s brethren, because he was one who attached himself to the Lord, and he was a prudent man and a prophet of the Most High and sharp-sighted with ⁽⁹⁾his eyes, and he used to see letters written in heaven by the finger of God and he knew the unspeakable (mysteries) of the Most High God and revealed them to Aseneth in secret, because he himself, Levi, would love Aseneth very much, and **see her place of rest in the highest** [cf. Isa 66:1 (LXX ?)], and her walls like adamantine eternal walls, and her foundations founded upon a rock of the seventh heaven.

Joseph and Aseneth 27:9-10

OTP 2:245

⁹(⁸)And they came toward Aseneth holding their swords drawn, full of blood.

¹⁰And Aseneth saw them and was exceedingly afraid and said:

Lord my God, **who made me alive again**
and rescued me [cf. Isa 49:7, 26; 54:5, 8] from the idols and the corruption of death,
who said to me, **"Your soul will live for ever,"**
rescue me from the hands of these wicked men.

Apocalypse of Moses

Apocalypse of Moses 10

OTP 2:273

^{10:1}And Seth and Eve went into the regions of Paradise. As they were going, Eve saw her son and a wild beast attacking him. ²And Eve wept, saying, "Woe is me! **For when I come to the day of resurrection**, all who have sinned will curse me, saying that Eve did not keep the command of God." ³And Eve cried out to the beast and said, "O you evil beast, do you not fear to attack the image of God [Gen 1:26, 28]? How was your mouth opened? How did your teeth grove strong? How did you not remember your subjection, for you were once subjected to the image of God? [ibid.]"

Apocalypse of Moses 13

OTP 2:275

¹And Seth went with his mother Eve near to Paradise. And they wept there, praying God that he would send his angel to give them the oil of mercy. ²And God sent Michael the archangel, and he said to them, "Seth, man of God, do not labor, praying with this supplication about the tree from which the oil flows, to anoint your father Adam; it shall not come to be yours now (but at the end of times. **³Then all flesh from Adam up to that great day shall be raised, such as shall be the holy people; ⁴then to them shall be given every joy of Paradise and God shall be in their midst, ⁵and there shall not be any more sinners before him, for the evil heart shall be removed from them, and they shall be given a heart that understands the good and worship God alone [Jer 31:33; Ezek 18:31; 36:26].)** ⁶But you go again to your father, since the measure of his life is fulfilled, that is, in three days. And as his soul departs, you are sure to witness its fearful upward journey."

Apocalypse of Moses 28

OTP 2:285

¹And the LORD turned and said to Adam, "From now on I will not allow you to be in Paradise." ²And Adam answered and said, "LORD, give me from the tree of life that I might eat before I am cast out." ³Then the LORD spoke to Adam, "You shall not now take from it; for it was appointed to the cherubim and the flaming sword which turns to guard it [Gen 3:24] because of you, that you might not taste of it and be immortal forever, but that you might have the strife which the enemy has placed in you. ⁴But when you come out of Paradise, if you guard yourself from all evil, preferring death to it, **at the time of the resurrection I will raise you again**, and then there shall be given to you from the tree of life, and you shall be immortal forever."

Apocalypse of Moses 37

OTP 2:289, 291

¹While Seth was speaking to his mother, an angel sounded the trumpet and the angels who were lying on their faces stood up and cried out with a fearful voice, saying, ²"Blessed be the glory of the LORD over his works; he has had mercy on Adam, the work of his hands." ³When the angels had shouted out these things, one of the six-winged seraphim came and carried Adam off to the Lake of Acheron and washed him three times in the presence of God. ⁴He lay three hours, and so the LORD of all, sitting on his holy throne, stretched out his hands and took Adam and handed him over to the archangel Michael, saying to him, ⁵"Take him up into Paradise, to the third heaven [2 Cor 12:2], and leave (him) there **until that great and fearful day which I am about to establish for the world.**" ⁶And the archangel Michael took Adam and brought him away and left him, just as God told him at the pardoning of Adam.

Apocalypse of Moses 39

OTP 2:291

¹Now the body of Adam was lying on the ground in Paradise, and Seth was mourning greatly over him. And the LORD God said, “Adam, why did you do this? If you had kept my commandment, those who brought you down into this place would not have rejoiced. ²**Yet now I tell you that their joy shall be turned into sorrow, but your sorrow shall be turned into joy; and when that happens, I will establish you in your dominion on the throne of your seducer.** ³But that one shall be cast into this place, so that you might sit above him. Then he himself and those who listen to him shall be condemned, and they shall greatly mourn and weep when they see you sitting on his glorious throne.”

Apocalypse of Moses 41

OTP 2:293

¹And God called Adam and said, “Adam, Adam.” And the body answered from the ground and said, “Here I am.” ²And the LORD said to him, “I told you that *you are dust and to dust you shall return* [Gen 3:19b]. ³**Now I promise to you the resurrection; I shall raise you on the last day in the resurrection with every man of your seed.**”

Apocalypse of Moses 43

OTP 2:295

¹When she died, the archangel Michael stood by, and three angels came and took her body and buried it where the body of Abel was. ²And the archangel Michael said to Seth, “Thus you shall prepare for burial each man who dies **until the day of resurrection.** ³And do not mourn more than six days; on the seventh day rest and be glad in it, for on that day both God and we angels rejoice in the migration from the earth of a righteous soul” [Sabbath || resurrection]. ⁴And when he had said these things, the angel went up into heaven, glorifying (God) and saying, “Alleluia, to whom be glory and power forever and ever.”

Vita

Vita 47

OTP 2:290

¹And all the angels sounded the trumpets and said, “Blessed are you, LORD, who has pitied your creature.” ²Then Seth saw the extended hand of the LORD holding Adam, and he handed him over to Michael, saying, ³**“Let him be in your custody until the day of dispensing punishment at the last years, when I will turn his sorrow into joy. Then he shall sit on the throne of him who overthrew him.”**

Vita 51

OTP 2:294

¹After this, all her children buried her [Eve] with great weeping. ²Then, when they had mourned for four days, the archangel Michael appeared to them and said to Seth, “Man of God, do not prolong mourning your dead more than six days, **because the seventh day is a sign of the resurrection, the rest of the coming age, and on the seventh day the LORD rested from all his work**” [Gen 2:2] ³Then Seth made the tablets.

Pseudo-Philo

Pseudo-Philo 3:9-10

OTP 2:306-307

⁹And God said, “*I will never again curse the earth on man’s account, for the tendency of man’s heart is foolish from his youth; and so I will never destroy all living creatures at one time as I have done* [Gen 8:21]. But when those inhabiting the earth sin, I will judge them by famine or by the sword or by fire or by death; and there will be earthquakes, and they will be scattered to uninhabited places. But no more will I destroy the earth by the water of the flood. And *in all the days of the earth, seedtime and harvest, cold and heat, spring and fall will not cease day and night* [Gen 8:22] until I remember those who inhabit the earth, until the appointed times are fulfilled. ¹⁰“But when the years appointed for the world have been fulfilled, then the light will cease and the darkness will fade away. And **I will bring the dead to life and raise up those who are sleeping from the earth. And hell will pay back its debt, and the place of perdition will return its**

deposit so that I may render to each according to his works and according to the fruit of his own devices, until I judge between soul and flesh. And the earth will not be without progeny or sterile for those inhabiting it; and no one who has been pardoned by me will be tainted. And there will be another earth and another heaven, an everlasting dwelling place.”

Pseudo-Philo 16:3

OTP 2:324

³And now the thoughts of men are very corrupt; behold I command the earth, and it will swallow up the body and soul together. And their dwelling place will be in darkness and the place of destruction; and they will not die but melt away **until I remember the world and renew the earth**. And then they will die and not live, and their life will be taken away from the number of all men. And **hell will no longer spit them back**, and their destruction will not be remembered, and their passing will be like that of those tribes of nations of whom I said: ‘I will not remember them,’ that is, the camp of the Egyptians and the race that I destroyed with the water of the flood. And the earth will swallow them up, and I will do no more.

Pseudo-Philo 19:12-13

OTP 2:328

¹²Now I will take you [Moses] from here and glorify you with your fathers, and I will give you rest in your slumber and bury you in peace. And all the angels will mourn over you, and the heavenly hosts will be saddened. But neither angel *nor man will know your tomb* [Deut 34:6] in which you are to be buried **until I visit the world. And I will raise up you and your fathers from the land of Egypt in which you sleep and you will come together and dwell in the immortal dwelling place that is not subject to time**. ¹³But this haven will be before me like a fleeting cloud and passing like yesterday. And when the time draws near to visit the world, I will command the years and order the times and they will be shortened [e.g. Mark 13:20 (Matt 24:22)], and the stars will hasten and the light of the sun will hurry to fall and the light of the moon will not remain; **for I will hurry to raise up you who are sleeping in order that all who can live may dwell in the place of sanctification I showed you**.

Pseudo-Philo 23:12-13

OTP 2:333

¹²And now, if you listen to your fathers, I will set my heart among you forever and overshadow you, and your enemies will fight against you no more. And your land will be renowned over all the earth, and your seed special among all the peoples, who will say, “Behold a faithful people! Because they believed in the LORD, therefore the LORD freed them and planted them.” And so I will plant you like a desirable vine and tend you like a lovable flock; and I will command the rain and the dew, and they will be abundant for you during your lifetime. ¹³**But also at the end the lot of each one of you will be life eternal, for you and your seed, and I will take your souls and store them in peace until the time allotted the world be complete. And I will restore you to your fathers and your fathers to you [Mal 4:6 (MT 3:24)], and they will know through you that I have not chosen you in vain**. These are the words that the LORD spoke to me this night.

Pseudo-Philo 25:7

OTP 2:335

¹⁷And Kenaz brought them out and said to them, “Behold now you know how Achan confessed when he came out in the lot and how he declared everything he had done. And now declare to us your wicked deeds and schemes. **And who knows that if you tell the truth to us, even if you die now, nevertheless God will have mercy on you when he will resurrect the dead?**”

Pseudo-Philo 33:1-3

OTP 2:347-348

¹And when the days of her [Deborah’s] death drew near, she sent and gathered all the people and said to them, “Listen now, my people. Behold I am warning you as a woman of God and am enlightening you as one from the female race; and obey me like your mother and heed my words as people who will also die. ²*Behold I am going today on the way of all flesh* [Josh 23:14], on which you also will come. **Only direct your heart to the LORD your God during the time of your life, because after your death you cannot repent of those things in which you live**. ³For the death is sealed up and brought to an end, and the measure and the time and the years have returned their deposit. For even if you seek to do evil in hell after

your death, you cannot, because the desire for sinning will cease and the evil impulse will lose its power, **because even hell will not restore what has been received and deposited to it unless it be demanded by him who has made the deposit to it.** Now therefore, my sons, obey my voice; while you have the time of life and the light of the Law, make straight your ways.”⁴ And while Deborah was saying these words, all the people raised up their voice together and wept and said, “Behold now, Mother, you will die, and to whom do you commend your sons whom you are leaving? Pray therefore for us, and after your departure your soul will be mindful of us forever.”⁵ And Deborah answered and said to the people, “While a man is still alive he can pray for himself and for his sons, but after his end he cannot pray or be mindful of anyone. Therefore do not hope in your fathers. For they will not profit you at all unless you be found like them. **But then you will be like the stars of the heaven, which now have been revealed among you.**”

Pseudo-Philo 48:1

OTP 2:362

¹And in that time Phinehas laid himself down to die, and the LORD said to him, “Behold you have passed the 120 years that have been established for every man [Gen 6:3]. And now rise up and go from here and dwell in Danaben on the mountain and dwell there many years. And *I will command my eagle, and he will nourish you there* [1 Kings 17:4], and you will not come down to mankind until the time arrives and you be tested in that time; and you will shut up the heaven then, and by your mouth it will be opened up [ibid., 1]. **And afterward you will be lifted up into the place where those who were before you were lifted up, and you will be there until I remember the world. Then I will make you all come, and you will taste what is death.**”

Pseudo-Philo 62:9

OTP 2:375

⁹And Jonathan answered and said to David, “Come to me, my brother David, and I will tell you of your righteousness. My soul will pine away in sadness over you, because we are now separated from each other. And our sins have caused this, that we should be separated from each other; but let us be mindful of one another night and day while we live. **Even if death separates us, I know that our souls will know each other.** For yours is a kingdom in this world, and from you is the beginning of a kingdom which will come in its own time.

Pseudo-Philo 64:6-9

OTP 2:377

⁶And Saul said to her, “What is his appearance?” She said, “You are asking me about *divine beings* [1 Sam 28:13f.]. For behold his appearance is not the appearance of a man. For he is clothed in a white robe with a mantle placed over it, and two angels are leading him.” And Saul remembered the mantle that Samuel tore when he was alive [1 Sam 15:27], and he struck his hand *on the ground* and pounded it. ⁷**And Samuel said to him, “Why have you disturbed me by raising me up? [1 Sam 28:14-15] I thought that the time for being rendered the rewards of my deeds have arrived.** And so do not boast, King, nor you, woman; for you have not brought me forth, but that order that God spoke to me while I was still alive, that I should come and tell you that you have sinned now a second time in neglecting God. **Therefore after rendering up my soul my bones have been disturbed so that I who am dead should tell you what I heard while I was alive.** ⁸Now therefore *tomorrow you and your sons will be with me* [in death] when *the people* have been delivered *into the hands of the Philistines* [ibid., 19]; and because your insides were eaten up with jealousy, what is yours will be taken from you.” ⁹And Saul heard the words of Samuel and grew faint and said, “Behold I am going to die with my sons; perhaps my destruction will be an atonement for my wickedness.” And Saul rose up and went away from there [ibid., 25].

Lives of the Prophets

Lives of the Prophets 2:11-19

OTP 2:388

¹¹This prophet [Jeremiah], before the capture of the Temple, seized the ark of the Law and the things in it, and made them be swallowed up in a rock. ¹²And to those standing by he said, “The Lord has gone away from Zion into heaven and will come again in power. ¹³And this will be for you a sign of his coming, when

all the gentiles worship a piece of wood.” ¹⁴And he said, “This ark no one is going to bring out except Aaron, and none of the priests or prophets will any longer open the tablets in it except Moses, God’s chosen one. ¹⁵**And in the resurrection the ark will be the first to be resurrected and will come out of the rock and be placed on Mount Sinai, and all the saints will be gathered to it there as they await the Lord and flee from the enemy who wishes to destroy them.**” ¹⁶In the rock with his finger he set as a seal the name of God, and the impression was like a carving made with iron, and a cloud covered the name, and no one knows the place nor is able to read the name to this day and to the consummation. ¹⁷And the rock is in the wilderness, where the ark was at first, between the two mountains on which Moses and Aaron lie. ¹⁸And at night there is a cloud like fire, just like the ancient one, for the glory of God will never cease from his Law. ¹⁹And God bestowed this favor upon Jeremiah, that he might himself perform the completion of his mystery, so that he might become a partner of Moses, and they are together to this day [[cf. Matt 16:14](#)].

Lives of the Prophets 3:10-12

OTP 2:389

¹⁰Through prayer he [Ezekiel] furnished them of his own accord with an abundant supply of fish, and for many who were at the point of dying he entreated that life should come from God. ¹¹When the people was being destroyed by its enemies, he went to the (enemy) leaders and, terrified by the prodigies, they ceased. ¹²He used to say this to them: **“Are we lost? Has our hope perished?” and in the wonder of the dead bones [Ezek 37:1-14] he persuaded them that there is hope for Israel both here and in the coming (age).**

Ladder of Jacob

Ladder of Jacob 7:10-25

OTP 2:410-411

¹⁰Then the earth will be glorified, receiving heavenly glory. ¹¹What was above will be below also. ¹²And from your seed will bloom a root of kings; ¹³it will emerge and overthrow the power of evil. ¹⁴And he himself will be the Savior for every land and rest for those who toil, and a cloud shading the whole world from the burning heat. ¹⁵For otherwise the uncontrolled will not be controlled. ¹⁶If he does not come, the lower (things) cannot be joined with the upper. ¹⁷At his coming the idols of brass, stone, and any sort of carving will give voice for three days. They will give wise men news of him and let them know what will be on earth. ¹⁹By a star, those who wish to see on earth him whom the angels do not see above will find the way to him. ²⁰Then the Almighty will be on earth in body, and, embraced by corporeal arms, he will restore human matter. ²¹**And he will revive Eve, who died by the fruit of the tree.** ²²Then the deceit of the impious will be exposed and all the idols will fall face down. ²³For they will be put to shame by a dignitary. ²⁴For because (they were) lying by means of hallucinations, henceforth they will not be able to rule or to prophesy. ²⁵Honor will be taken from them and they will remain without glory.

4 Baruch

4 Baruch 6:1-10

OTP 2:421

¹After these things Abimelech went outside the city and prayed to the LORD. ²And behold, an angel of the LORD came and, taking hold of his right hand, brought him back to the place where Baruch was sitting, and he found him in a tomb. ³And when they saw each other, both (of them) wept, and they kissed each other. ⁴And looking up, Baruch saw with his (own) eyes the figs sheltered in Abimelech’s basket. ⁵And raising his eyes to heaven, he prayed, saying, ⁶**“You are the God who bestows a reward (on) those who love you. Prepare yourself, my heart; rejoice and be glad in your tabernacle, saying to your fleshly dwelling, ‘Your sorrow has been turned to joy.’ For the Mighty One is coming and will raise you in your tabernacle, for sin has not taken root in you. Be refreshed within your tabernacle, in your virgin faith, and believe that you will live. Look at this basket of figs; for behold, they are sixty-six years old and they have not withered nor do they stink, but they are dripping with milk. Thus will it be for you, my flesh, if you do the things commanded you by the angel of righteousness. He who preserved the basket of figs, the same one again will preserve you by his power.”**

4 Baruch 7:12-21

OTP 2:422

¹²Then the eagle took flight, having the letter around his neck, and departed for Babylon . And when he arrived (there), he rested in a certain tree outside the city in a deserted place. ¹³And he was silent until Jeremiah came by, for he and certain other people were coming out to bury a dead man outside the city. ¹⁴For Jeremiah had made a request of King Nebuchadnezzar, saying, “Give me a place where I may bury the dead of my people.” And the king had given (it) to him. ¹⁵And as they were going out with the dead man and weeping, they passed by the eagle. ¹⁶And the eagle cried in a loud voice, saying, “I say to you, Jeremiah, chosen one of God, go! Gather the people and come here that they may hear a letter which I have brought you from Baruch and Abimelech.” ¹⁷And when Jeremiah heard, he glorified God, and he went out and gathered the people with (their) wives and children, and he came to where the eagle was. ¹⁸**And the eagle descended upon the one who had died, and he came back to life.** ¹⁹This happened that they might believe. ²⁰And all the people marveled at what had happened, saying, “Is this the God who appeared to our fathers in the wilderness through Moses (who) has now also appeared to us through this eagle?” ²¹And the eagle said, “I say to you, Jeremiah, come untie this letter and read it to the people.” So, untying the letter, he read it to the people.

4 Baruch 9:1-14

OTP 2:424

¹And those who were with Jeremiah continued for nine days rejoicing and offering up sacrifices for the people. ²But on the tenth (day) Jeremiah alone offered up a sacrifice. ³And he prayed a prayer, saying, “Holy, holy, holy [Isa 6:3], incense of the living trees, true light that enlightens me [John 1:9] until I am taken up to you; ⁴for your mercy I plead, for the sweet voice of the two seraphim I plead, for another fragrant odor of incense. ⁵And may Michael, the archangel of righteousness who opens the gates for the righteous, be (the object of) my attention until he leads the righteous in. ⁶I implore you, Almighty LORD of all creation, unbegotten and incomprehensible, in whom all judgment was hidden before these things existed.” ⁷And as Jeremiah said these things, while standing at the altar with Baruch and Abimelech, he became as one of those who have given up their soul. ⁸And Baruch and Abimelech remained weeping and crying in a loud voice, “Who to us, because our father Jeremiah has left us; the priest of God has departed.” ⁹And all the people heard their weeping, and they all ran to them and saw Jeremiah lying on the ground as though dead. ¹⁰And they tore their garments and put dust on their heads and wept bitterly. ¹¹And after these things, they prepared themselves to bury him. ¹²**And behold, there came a voice saying, “Do not bury one still living, for his soul is coming into his body again.”** ¹³**And because they heard the voice, they did not bury him but remained in a circle around his tabernacle for three days, saying, “At what hour is he going to rise?”** ¹⁴**And after three days, his soul came into his body and he lifted up his voice in the midst of (them) all and said, “Glorify God with one voice [Rom 15:6]! All (of you) glorify God, and the Son of God who awakens us, Jesus Christ the light of all the aeons, the inextinguishable lamp, the life of faith!**

History of the Rechabites

History of the Rechabites 14-16

OTP 2:458-460

14 ¹And again we announce to you, O brothers, that among us there is no sickness, pain, fatigue to our bodies, mutilation, weariness, or temptations; not even Satan’s power can touch us, for there is not among us rage, jealousy, evil desire, or hateful thoughts. But (we experience only) quietness and gladness; and (exhibit) love and affection toward God and each other. ²**And the soul of each of us is not wearied or sorrowful or wishes to stay behind when the angels of God come to guide it from the body. But we are glad and rejoice and the holy angels (rejoice) with us when they are sent out after the soul of each of us.**

³As the bride rejoices over her betrothed bridegroom, so the soul rejoices at the good news of the holy angels. For they (the angels) say to it nothing except this alone: “O pure soul, your Lord is calling you to come to him.” ⁴Then the soul with great rejoicing leaves the body to meet the angel. And seeing that pure soul, which has (just) left the body, all the holy angels unfold (for it) their shining stoles. ⁵And they

receive it with joy, saying, “Blessed are you, O pure soul, and blest, for you have thoroughly done the will of God, your Lord.” ^{5a}And this (is how) he brings his providence to each one of us:

15 ⁽¹⁻³⁾⁴(The soul) discerns and knows the day of its departure through a revelation from holy angels. ^{4a}And we live an extremely long time; and the extent of our life (is) not brief and short as with you. ^{4b}When the holy angels are sent among us, in this beautiful order (of which) we have informed you, they visit among us. ⁽⁵⁾^{4c}However, first they come to our elders; and when they blessed elders see the angels who have come, they immediately with joy entreat (so that) all the blessed brothers assemble. ⁶And when all the people have assembled, immediately with praise we come with the angels to the place **in which bodies are buried**. ⁷And because we have nothing to use for digging, the angels themselves make a sepulchre for the bodies. ^{7a}And again when all of these (souls) have completed (their time), then they are separated from our assembly; and (each) departs with great joy. ⁸And all of us with exultation come near to it and offer it peace in the kiss of the LORD while it is being conducted and led (to the grave) by the holy angels. ⁹And then the soul of our blessed brother leaves the body in which it had settled; ^{9a}and with joy far removed from mourning it approaches and comes to the holy angels and ascends up to God with joy. ¹⁰But we with one accord see the soul when it leaves the body clearly and plainly; **the appearance of the soul when it leaves the body is the likeness of a glorious light, and formed and imprinted in the likeness and type of the body, and it is spiritually flying**.

16 ¹And while we are looking at that holy and spotless soul, the holy angels carry it away and salute it, and thus it ascends and goes up from us in glory. And after it ascends with them and passes into the region of the power of the highest heavens, then other orders (of angels) receive it with joy. ^{1a}And the archangels salute it; and afterward they stretch out to it (their hands and lead it) to the thrones and dominions that (are) above them. And thus it goes up and ascends until it enters (before) and worships the LORD. ^{1b}And when the highest order of cherubim and seraphim receive it, they rise to the gate of the holy Trinity. ²Then the Son of God receives that soul from their hands and brings it (forward) so that it may worship the father. ^(3,4)⁵And when the soul falls down upon its face to worship before God, then the revelation is revealed to us, (and) all of us fall upon the land and worship the LORD with the soul. ⁶And when God makes that soul rise from its worship, we also rise to our feet. ⁽⁷⁾^{7a}**And then God sends that soul to a stately mansion (to await) the day of resurrection for (the rest of our) community**. ^{7b}Then we also go away from the body of that soul of our brother to our (own) assembly and complete the service through praises to the Holy Spirit. ⁸And so we have engraved (upon) these tablets and sent (them) to you through the hands of our brother Zosimus.

⁽³⁾^{8a}And again God, our Creator, has given us this (privilege): we hear the voices of the spirits and the praises of the angels, the hosts, and the heavenly orders, who continually praise God. ⁽³⁾^{8b}When they praise (God), so also we in our land praise (him).

^{8c}And the angels receive and transmit our prayers and our praises (by) entering and worshipping in love before that divine and mystic throne, (which) knows secrets. ^{8d}And thus by the aid of the angels and the heavenly hosts our prayers pass on and find entrance before God. ^{8e}This is all of our manner (of life). And we are truly called the Blessed Ones, because we experience the benevolence of God. ^{8f}And we write and send (these tablets) to you, O people who dwell in that world of vanity, through the hands of this our brother Zosimus, who entered among us for your sake through the mercies (of God) and remained with us (for) seven days. ^{8g}And accompanying him we traveled with him until (we came) to the shores of the great ocean.

Wisdom and Philosophical Literature

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 53. List of resurrection texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha – Wisdom and Philosophical Literature

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century CE	4 Maccabees	7:18-19	Conquer the passion of the flesh => resurrection	x				?	x	J
		9:8-9, 22	The reward for virtue	x					x	J
		10:2-4	“Can not touch my soul”	x					x	J
		13:9-18	“Our forefathers will receive us”	x					x	J
		14:4-6	Righteous’ death => immortality	x					x	J
		15:3-4, 27	Righteous’ death => immortality	x					x	J
		16:12-13, 25	Righteous’ death => immortality	x					x	J
		17:4-5	Hope of endurance	x			x		x	J
		17:11-12, 17-21	Prizes for victory	x					x	J
		18:3	Martyrs => worthy of the divine portion	x					x	J
		18:10-23	The Father’s teaching		x	x			x	J
First Century BCE First Century CE	Pseudo- Phocylides	91-115	Death and afterlife; Immortality of the soul		x		x		x	J

Wisdom and Philosophical Literature

Resurrection Passages in Context

4 Maccabees 7:16-23**OTP 2:553**

¹⁶If, therefore, an old man despised torments unto the death on account of his piety, we must admit that devout reason is leader over the passion. ¹⁷But some may contend that not all men are masters of the passions, because not all men possess enlightened reason. ¹⁸Only those who with all their heart make piety their first concern are able to conquer the passions of the flesh, ¹⁹**believing that to God they do not die, as our patriarchs Abraham, Isaac. And Jacob died not, but live to God** [Mark 12:26; Rom 6:10; 14:8; Gal 2:19]. ²⁰Accordingly, the validity of our argument is not impaired by the fact that some men seem to be ruled by their passions because of the weakness of their reason. ²¹For what philosopher is there, who lives by the whole rule of philosophy and believes in God ²²and knows that it is blessed to endure every pain for the sake of virtue, who could fail to master his passions for the sake of piety? ²³Only the wise and courageous man is ruler of the passions.

4 Maccabees 9:7-9, 21-22**OTP 2:554, 555**

⁷Put us to the test then, tyrant; and if you take our lives for the sake of our religion, do not think you can harm us with your torments. ⁸**By our suffering and endurance we shall obtain the prize of virtue and shall be with God, on whose account we suffer.** ⁹**But you, because of our foul murder, will suffer at the hand of divine justice the everlasting torment by fire you deserve.**

²¹Even when his bodily frame was all dissevered, the great-souled youth, a true son of Abraham, uttered not a groan. ²²**As though he were being transformed into incorruption by the fire** [Mal 3:2-3], he nobly endured the torments.

4 Maccabees 10:1-4**OTP 2:555**

¹When he had bravely met his illustrious death, the third son was brought forward amid fervent exhortations from many people to taste of the food and save himself. ²But he cried aloud and said, "Do you not know that the very same father begot both me and my dead brothers, and the same mother bore us all, and **I was brought up on the same doctrines?** ³I do not abjure the noble bond of brotherhood. ⁴Therefore, if you have any means of torture, apply it to my body, **for my soul you cannot touch** even if you would."

4 Maccabees 13:8-18**OTP 2:558**

⁸They formed a holy choir of piety as they encouraged each other with the words, ⁹"Let us die like brothers all, brothers, for the Law's sake. Let us follow the example of the tree youths in Assyria, who despised the same trial by ordeal in the furnace [Dan 3]. ¹⁰Let us not be pusillanimous in the demonstration of true piety." ¹¹"Courage, brother!" said one, and another, "Hold on nobly!" ¹²And another, recalling the past, said, "Remember whence you came and at the hand of what father Isaac gave himself to be sacrificed for piety's sake" [Gen 22]. ¹³Each one severally and all together, looking at each other with most cheerful mien, aglow with courage, said, "With all our hearts let us consecrate ourselves unto God, who gave us our souls, and let us expend our bodies for the custodianship of the Law. ¹⁴Let us have no fear of him **who thinks he kills** [Matt 10:28]. ¹⁵Great is the ordeal and peril of the soul that lies in wait in eternal torment for those who transgress the commandment of God. ¹⁶Let us then arm ourselves with the control over the passions which comes from divine reason. ¹⁷**After our death in this fashion Abraham and Isaac and Jacob will receive us, and all our forefathers will praise us.**" ¹⁸And to each one of the brothers as they were dragged away, those who were left said, "Do not shame us, brother, nor be traitor to our brothers who have already died."

4 Maccabees 14:2-6**OTP 2:559**

²O reason, more kingly than kings, more free than freemen! ³How holy and harmonious the concord of the seven brothers for piety's sake! ⁴Not one of the seven lads turned coward, nor cowered away from death, ⁵**but all, as though running on the highway to immortality**, hurried on to death by torture. ⁶Just as hands and feet move in unison with the promptings of the soul, so did those holy youths, as if impelled by the deathless soul of piety, go in harmony to the death for piety's sake.

4 Maccabees 15:2-4, 25-28

OTP 2:559, 560

²When two options lay before her, namely piety or the instant deliverance of her seven sons according to the tyrant's promise, ³she loved piety better, **which preserves to eternal life according to God's word.** ⁴How can I possibly express the deep love of parents for their children? On the tender nature of the child we impress a wonderful likeness of **soul and form**, and especially mothers, who are more affectionate in their own feelings toward their children than fathers.

²⁵In the council chamber of her own heart, so to speak, she saw clever advocates, nature and parenthood and maternal love and the torment of her children – ²⁶a mother holding two votes in regard to her children, one to consign them to death and the other to preserve them alive; ²⁷**but she did not decide on the safe course that would preserve her sons for a little while,** ²⁸but like a true daughter of God-fearing Abraham called to mind Abraham's unflinching bravery.

4 Maccabees 16:12-13, 24-25

OTP 2:561, 562

¹²But the holy and God-fearing mother lamented none of them with any such dirge, nor urged any of them to avoid death, nor grieved over them in the moment of their death. ¹³Rather, as though she had a mind of adamant **and were this time bringing her brood of sons to birth into immortal life**, she encouraged them and pled with them to die for piety's sake.

²⁴With these words the mother of the seven exhorted each one and persuaded them to die rather than transgress the commandment of God, ²⁵and **they knew full well themselves that those who die for the sake of God live unto God, as do Abraham and Isaac and Jacob and all the patriarchs** [Exod 3:6; Mark 12:26f.].

4 Maccabees 17:4-6

OTP 2:562

⁴Be of good cheer, therefore, mother of **holy souls, whose hope of endurance is secure with God.** ⁵Now so majestic stands the moon in heaven as you stand, lighting the way to piety for **your seven starlike sons** [Dan 12:3], honored by God and firmly set with them in heaven. ⁶For your childbearing was from our father Abraham.

4 Maccabees 17:11-12, 17-21

OTP 2:562, 563

¹¹Truly divine was the contest in which they were engaged. ¹²On that day virtue was the umpire and the test to which they were put was a test of endurance. ¹²**The prizes for victory was incorruption in long-lasting life.** ¹³The first to enter the contest was Eleazar, but the mother of the seven sons competed also, and the brothers as will took part. ¹⁴The tyrant was the adversary and the world and the life of men were the spectators [1 Cor 4:9].

¹⁷The tyrant himself and his whole council were astonished at their endurance, ¹⁸**on account of which they now stand beside the divine throne and live the life of the age of blessing.** ¹⁹**For Moses says, All the holy ones are under your hands** [Deut 33:3 (LXX)]. **These then, having consecrated themselves for the sake of God, are now honored not only with this distinction** but also by the fact that through them our enemies did not prevail against our nation, ²¹and the tyrant was punished and our land purified, since they became, as it were, a ransom for the sin of our nation. ²²Through the blood of these righteous ones and through the propitiation of their death the divine providence rescued Israel, which had been shamefully treated.

4 Maccabees 18:3-5

OTP 2:563

³Those men who surrendered their bodies to suffering for piety's sake were in return not only admired by mankind **but were also deemed worthy of the divine portion.** ⁴And it was because of them that our nation enjoyed peace – they revived the observance of the Law in their land and repulsed their enemies' siege. ⁵And the tyrant Antiochus was punished on earth and continues to suffer punishment in death. For

when he had failed absolutely to compel the people of Jerusalem to adopt the pagan way of life, and to forsake the customs of their fathers, he departed from Jerusalem and marched away against the Persians.

4 Maccabees 18:10-23

OTP 2:563-564

¹⁰He [your father] while he was still with you, taught you [the Law] and [the Prophets]. ¹¹He read to you of Abel, slain by Cain [Gen 4:8], of Isaac, offered as a burnt offering [Gen 22], and of Joseph, in prison [Gen 39:7-23]. ¹²He spoke to you of the zeal of Phineas [Num 25:7-13], and taught you about Hananiah, Azariah, and Mishael in the fire [Dan 3:6]. ¹³He sang the praises of Daniel in the lions' den and called him blessed. ¹⁴He reminded you of the scripture of Isaiah which says, *Even though you walk through fire, the flame shall not burn you* [Isa 43:2]. ¹⁵He sang to you the psalm of David which says, *Many are the afflictions of the righteous* [Ps 34:19]. ¹⁶**He recited the proverbs of Solomon which says, *He is a tree of life*** [referring to God instead of wisdom] **to those who do his will** [Prov 3:18]. ¹⁷**He affirmed the word of Ezekiel, *Shall these dry bones live?*** [Ezek 37:2] ¹⁸**Nor did he forget the son that Moses taught which says, *I kill and I make alive*** [Deut 32:39], for this is your life and the length of your days.” ²⁰Ah! bitter was the day and yet no bitter when the cruel tyrant of the Greeks quenched fire with fire in his fierce braziers, and in a furious rage brought to the catapult and back again to his tortures those seven sons of the daughter of Abraham; ²¹he pierced the pupils of their eyes, their tongues he cut out, and slew them with all kinds of torment. ²²And for these acts the divine justice has pursued and will pursue the accursed tyrant. ²³**But the sons of Abraham, together with their mother, who won the victor's prize, are gathered together in the choir of their fathers, having received pure and deathless souls from God, to whom be glory forever and ever.** Amen.

Pseudo-Phocylides

Pseudo-Phocylides 97-115

OTP 2:577-578

Death and afterlife

⁹⁷Sit not in vain at the fire, weakening your heart.
⁹⁸Be moderate in your grief; for moderation is the best.
⁹⁹Let the unburied dead receive their share of the earth [Jer 16:4; 22:19].
¹⁰⁰Do not dig up the grave of the deceased, nor expose to the sun.
¹⁰¹what may not be seen, lest you stir up the divine anger.
¹⁰²It is not good to dissolve the human frame;
¹⁰³**for we hope that the remains of the departed will soon come to the light (again)**
¹⁰⁴**out of the earth** [cf. Isa 26:19; Dan 12:2]; **and afterward they will become gods.**
¹⁰⁵For the souls remain unharmed among the deceased.
¹⁰⁶For the spirit is a loan of God to mortals, and (his) image.
¹⁰⁷**For we have a body out of earth, and when afterward we are resolved**
again into earth [Gen 3:19; Eccl 12:7]
¹⁰⁸**we are but dust; and then the air has received our spirit.**
¹⁰⁹When you are rich, do not be sparing; remember that you are mortal.
¹¹⁰It is impossible to take riches and money (with you) into Hades [Job 1:21; 3:19; Ps 49:18f; Eccl 5:15].
¹¹¹All alike are corpses, but God rules over the souls.
¹¹²Hades is (our) common eternal home [Eccl 12:5] and fatherland.
¹¹³a common place for all, poor and kings.
¹¹⁴We humans live not a long time but for a season [Job 14:1f].
¹¹⁵But (our) soul is immortal and lives ageless forever.

Prayers, Psalms, and Odes

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 54. List of resurrection texts: Old Testament Pseudepigrapha – Wisdom and Philosophical Literature

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
First Century BCE	Psalms of Solomon	2:31-35	Judgment/ Resurrection	x			x		x	J
		3:11-12	Righteous => eternal life		x				x	J
		14:9-10	Righteous => eternal life	x					x	J
		15:10-13	Final destiny of the righteous	x						
Second to Third Century CE	Hellenistic Synagogue Prayers	3:24-27	“Loosed the boundary of death		x				x	J/C
		7:11	God’s act of redemption		x				x	J/C
		12:46-50	The two ways theology		x		x	x	x	J/C
		16:7-9	Funeral prayer for the dead Rest Death		x		x		x	C
Late First to Early Second Century CE	Odes of Solomon	3:8-9	Jesus => life	x					x	C
		9	God’s will/ written in the book	x					x	C
		10:2, 6	Walk in the way of Jesus	x					x	C
		11:2, 12, 16, 18	God’s work for the righteous	x					x	C
		15:8-10	God’s work for the righteous	x					x	C
		17:12-15	Jesus’ work => gift to the righteous		x				x	C
		20:7-9	God’s grace	x					x	C
		21:2	God’s grace	x					x	C

Table 54 – Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification				
				Imp.	Stat.	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assum.	Jew/Christ.
Late First to Early Second Century CE	Odes of Solomon	22:8-12	Christ speaks		x	x			x	C
		25:8-9	God's work		x				x	C
		28:6-8	Life giving spirit	x					x	C
		29:3-4	God's work	x					x	C
		31:4, 6-7, 13	Jesus' work	x					x	C
		33:8-12	Jesus' work	x					x	C
		36:1	The work of the Spirit of the Lord	x					x	C
		38:3	Truth => immortal life	x					x	C
		40:6	Jesus => immortal life	x					x	C
		41:11	Jesus, the life giver	x					x	C
		42:11-20	Resurrection of Jesus and the many		x				x	C

Prayers, Psalms, and Odes

Resurrection Passages in Context

The Psalms of Solomon 2:18, 28-35

OTP 2:653-654

¹⁸God is a righteous judge and he will not be impressed by appearances [[Deut 10:17](#)].

²⁸He did not consider that he was a man,
for the latter
do not consider (this).

²⁹He said, "I shall be lord of land and sea";
and he did not understand that it is God who is great,
powerful in his great strength.

³⁰He is king over the heavens,
judging even kings and rulers,

³¹**Raising me up to glory,
but putting to sleep the arrogant for eternal destruction in dishonor,
because they did not know him.**

³²And now, officials of the earth, see the judgment of the Lord [[Ps 2:10](#)],
that he is a great and righteous king, judging what is under heaven.

³³Praise God, you who fear the Lord with understanding,
for the Lord's mercy is upon those who fear him with judgment.

³⁴**To separate between the righteous and the sinner
to repay sinners forever according to their actions**

³⁵And to have mercy on the righteous (keeping him) from the humiliation of the sinner,
and **to repay the sinner for what he has done to the righteous.**

The Psalms of Solomon 3:11-16

OTP 2:655

¹¹⁽⁹⁾The sinner stumbleth and curseth his life,
The day when he was begotten, and his mother's travail.

¹²⁽¹⁰⁾He addeth sins to sins, while he liveth (?) [[Isa 30:1](#)];

¹³He falleth—verily grievous is his fall—and riseth no more.

⁽¹¹⁾ The destruction of the sinner is for ever,

¹⁴And he shall not be remembered, when the righteous **is visited**.

^{(12) 15}This is the portion [[e.g. Ps 49:13; 81:15](#)] of sinners for ever.

¹⁶**But they that fear the Lord shall rise to life eternal** [[see. Dan 12:2; Job 33:29f.](#)],
And their life (shall be) in the light of the Lord, and shall come to an end no more.

The Psalms of Solomon 14:6-10

OTP 2:663-664

⁶But not so are sinners and criminals,
who love (to spend) the day in sharing their sin.

⁷Their enjoyment is brief and decaying,
and they do not remember God.

⁸For the ways of men are known before him always,
and he knows the secrets of the heart before they happen.

⁹**Therefore their inheritance is Hades, and the darkness and destruction;
and they will not be found on the day of mercy for the righteous,**

¹⁰**But the devout of the Lord will inherit life in happiness.**

Psalms of Solomon 15:7-13

OTP 2:664

⁷Famine and sword and death shall be far from the righteous;
for they will retreat from the devout like those pursued by famine.

⁸But they shall pursue sinners and overtake them,
for those who act lawlessly shall not escape the Lord's judgment.

- ⁹They shall be overtaken as by those experienced in war,
for on their forehead (is) the mark of destruction.
- ¹⁰And the inheritance of sinners is destruction and darkness,
and their lawless actions shall pursue them below into Hades.
- ¹¹Their inheritance shall not be found for their children,
for lawless actions shall devastate the homes of sinners.
- ¹²And sinners shall perish forever in the day of the Lord's judgment,
when God oversees the earth at his judgment.
- ¹³**But those who fear the Lord shall find mercy in it
and shall live by their God's mercy;**
but sinners shall perish for all time.

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers 3:19b-27

OTP 2:679-670

3. A Prayer That Meditates upon God's Manifold Creative Power, Which Comes to Sinful Man in Redemption (*AposCon* 7.34.1-8)

- ^{19b}*Let us make man according to our image and likeness* [[Gen 1:26](#)];
- ²⁰having declared him a (micro-)cosm of cosmos,
having formed for him the body out of the four elements;
- ²¹and having prepared for him the soul out of non-being,
and having given to him fivefold perception,
and having placed over the perceptions a mind, the holder of the reins of the soul.
- ²²And in addition to all these things, O Master, Lord,
who can worthily describe the movement of rain-producing clouds,
the flashing forth of lightning, the clashing of thunders;
- ²³for the supplying of appropriate nourishment,
and the blending of complex atmospheres?
- ²⁴**But when man was disobedient,
You took away his deserved life.**
- ²⁵**You did not make it disappear absolutely, but for a time,**
- ²⁶**having put (him) to sleep for a little (while),
by an oath you have called (him forth) to new birth.**
- ²⁷**You have loosed the boundary of death,
You who are the Maker of life for the dead, through Jesus Christ, our hope!** [[1 Tim 1:1](#)]

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers 7:9-12

OTP 2:686

7. A Prayer of Thanksgiving to God for His Continuing Acts of Redemption in the Past, and Now in Christ; and for His Manifold Gifts to Man, the Rational Animal (*AposCon* 7.38.1-8)

- ⁹And all these things you have formed out of a little drop in a womb,
and after the shaping, you freely give immortal life,
and you bring forward into light the rational animal, the man.
- ¹⁰With laws, you have taught (him);
with just ordinances, you have cleansed (him);
- ¹¹bringing on dissolution for a little while,
You have promised the resurrection!
- ¹²Therefore indeed, what manner of life is fully able,
and how great length of ages will be sufficient for men for thanksgiving?

**12. A Prayer of Praise to God, Rehearsing the Grounds in Redemption and in Creation
Which Make Praise So Fitting for God's Redeemed Creature, Man** (*AposCon* 8.12.6-27)

³⁵⁽¹⁶⁾ And you not only made the world,
but you also made the world citizen in it,
declaring him (to be) a (micro-)cosm of the cosmos.

³⁶ For you said by your Wisdom,
*Let us make man according to our image,
and according to (our) likeness;
and let them rule the fish of the sea,
and the winged birds of the heaven* [[Gen 1:26](#)].

³⁷⁽¹⁷⁾ Therefore also you have made him out of immortal soul,
and out of a body that may be scattered;
³⁸ the one indeed out of that which is not,
but the other out of the four elements.

³⁹ And you have indeed given to him, with reference to the soul,
rational discrimination,
distinguishing of piety and impiety,
observation of right and wrong.

⁴⁰ While with reference to the body,
you have given (him) five senses,
and the movement involving change of place.

⁴¹⁽¹⁸⁾ For you, O God Almighty, through Christ,
planted a paradise in Eden, eastward [[Gen 2:8](#)],
with all manner of edible foods, in (proper) order;
⁴² and into it, as if into a very expensive home, you brought him.

⁴³ And indeed, you have given to him an implanted law to do [[Rom 2:14f.](#)],
so that form himself, and by himself,
he might have the seeds of divine knowledge.

⁴⁴⁽¹⁹⁾ So, having brought (him) into the paradise of luxury,
you allowed him the right to partake of all things.

⁴⁵ But of only one things did you refuse him the taste [[Gen 2:15-17](#)];
in hope of greater things,
in order that, **if he should keep the commandment,
he might receive immortality as a reward for this** [access to the Tree of Life].

⁴⁶⁽²⁰⁾ But, having cared nothing for the commandment,
and having tasted of the forbidden fruit,
by trickery of a serpent,
and by the counsel of a woman,
you indeed rightly thrust him out from paradise [[Gen 3](#)].

⁴⁷ **Yet in goodness, you did not overlook him who was perishing forever,
for he was your work of art.**

⁴⁸ But, having subjected to him the creation,
You have given to him, through sweat and hard labors [[Gen 3:17-19](#)], to provide by himself
the nourishment for his own family,
while you are causing all things to grow, and to ripen.

⁴⁹ **And in time, having caused him to fall asleep for a while,
you called (him) by an oath to new birth;**

⁵⁰ **having dissolved the boundaries of death,
you promised life by resurrection!**

⁵¹⁽²¹⁾ And not only this; but also those who poured forth from him,

52 to become an innumerable multitude—
**those who continued with you, you glorified,
while those who separated from you, you punished.**

Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers 16

OTP 2:696-697

16. Funeral Prayer for the Dead (*AposCon* 8.41.2-5)

¹⁽²⁾ **And on behalf of those our brothers who are at rest** in Christ,
let us beg;
² on behalf of the repose of this brother or that sister,
let us beg;
³ that God, the lover of man, having received his soul,
may forgive him every sin – voluntary and involuntary;
⁴ and being gracious and favorable,
may appoint him to a position among the godly ones,
sent into the embrace of Abraham [[Luke 16:23](#)], and Isaac, and Jacob,
with all those from of old who were well pleasing, and who did his will;
where pain and grief and moaning have fled away [[Isa 35:10](#)].
⁵ Let us arise! Let us commit ourselves, and one another, to the eternal God,
through the Word (which was) in the beginning!
⁶⁽³⁾ And let the bishop say,
⁽⁴⁾ “O you who are by nature immortal and unending,
through who everything immortal and mortal has come into being;
⁷ who with artistic skill made this rational living being, man, the mortal world citizen,
and who promised resurrection;
⁸ who did not permit Enoch and Elijah to experience death,
the God of Abraham, and Isaac, and Jacob,
not as of the dead, but as God of the living, are you [[Matt 22:32](#); [Luke 20:38](#)].
⁹ **Because, with you, all souls are alive,**
and the spirits of the righteous are in your hand, whom anguish will not touch.
¹⁰ For all those who are set apart are under your hand [[Deut 33:3](#)].
¹¹⁽⁵⁾ Also now yourself, look upon this your servant,
whom you have chosen, and received into another sphere;
¹² and forgiven him, if he has committed any great sin, voluntarily or involuntarily;
and place beside him favorable angels;
and appointed him (a place) in the embrace of the patriarchs, and the prophets, and
¹³ the apostles,
and of all those who from of old were pleasing to you;
¹⁴ where there cannot be grief, and pain, and moaning [[Isa 35:10](#)],
but a free place of godly ones,
and a land of upright ones, set up for you,
and for those in it who see the glory of Christ;
¹⁵ With whom to you be glory, honor, and awe, thanksgiving and worship,
and to the Holy Spirit, forever [possible Christian elements in its resemblances to: [John 1:1](#); [22:32](#); [Luke 20:38](#)]. Amen.

Odes of Solomon

Odes of Solomon 3:7-9

OTP 2:735-736

⁷ I have been united (to him), because the lover has found the Beloved,
because I love him that is the Son, I shall become a son.

⁸Indeed he who is joined to him who is immortal,
truly will be immortal [[John 14:19](#); [1 Cor 6:17](#)].

⁹**And he who delights in the Life
will become living** [[cf. John 11:25](#); also [John 1:4](#); [5:26](#), [40](#); [10:10](#), [28](#); [14:6](#)].

¹⁰This is the Spirit of the Lord, which is not false [[cf. Tit 1:2](#)],
which teaches the sons of men to know his ways [[cf. 1QS 3.13-4.26](#); [John 14:17](#), [26](#); [15:26](#)].

¹¹Be wise and understanding and vigilant.

Hallelujah.

Odes of Solomon 9

OTP 2:743

¹Open your ears,
and I shall speak to you.

²Give my yourself,
so that I may also give you myself;

³The rod of the Lord and his desire,
the holy thought which he has thought concerning his Messiah.

⁴**For in the will of the Lord is your life,
and his purpose is eternal life,
and your perfection is incorruptible.**

⁵Be enriched in God the Father;
and receive the purpose of the Most High.
Be strong and saved by his grace.

⁶For I announce peace to you, his holy ones,
so that none of those who hear will fall in the war.

⁷And also that those who have known him may not perish [[John 3:16](#)],
and so that those who receive (him) may not be ashamed.

⁸An everlasting crown is Truth;
blessed are they who set it on their head [[Ps 20:4 \(LXX\)](#); [MT 21:3](#)].

⁹(It is) a precious stone,
for the wars were on account of the crown.

¹⁰But Righteousness has taken it,
and has given it to you.

¹¹Put on the crown in the true covenant of the Lord,
and all those who have conquered will be inscribed in his book.

¹²**For their book is the justification which is for you,
and she sees you before her and wills that you will be saved.**

Hallelujah

Odes of Solomon 10:1-2, 5-6

OTP 2:743, 744

¹The Lord has directed my mouth by his Word,
and has opened my heart by his Light.

²**And he has caused to dwell in me his immortal life** [John 4:14],
and permitted me to proclaim the fruit of his peace.

⁵And the gentiles who had been scattered were gathered together [John 11:52],
but I [Christ] was not defiled by my love (for them),
because they had praised me in high places [cf. Mal 1:11].

⁶And the traces of light were set upon their heart,
and they walked according to my life and were saved,
and they became my people for ever and ever.

Hallelujah.

Odes of Solomon 11:2, 12, 16, 18

OTP 2:744-745

²For the most High circumcised me by his Holy Spirit,
then he uncovered my inward being toward him,
and filled me with his love.

¹²**And from above he gave me immortal rest** [cf. Ps 95:11; Heb 3:7-4:13];
and I became like the land which blossoms and rejoices in its fruits.

¹⁶**And he took me to his Paradise,**
wherein is the wealth of the Lord's pleasure.

^{16c}And the river of gladness was irrigating them,
and the region round about them **in the land of eternal life.**

¹⁸And I said, blessed, O Lord, are they
who are planted in your land,
and **who have a place in your Paradise;**

Odes of Solomon 15:8-10

OTP 2:748

⁸**I have put on incorruption** [cf. 1 Cor 15:54f.] **through his name,**
and stripped off corruption by his grace.

⁹**Death has been destroyed before my face,**
and Sheol has been vanquished by my word [Rev 1:18].

¹⁰**And eternal life has arisen in the Lord's land,**
and it has become known to his faithful ones,
and been given without limit to all that trust in him.

Hallelujah.

Odes of Solomon 17:12-16

OTP 2:751

¹²**And I went toward all my bondsmen in order to loose them;**
that I might not abandon anyone bound or binding.

¹³And I gave my knowledge generously,
and my **resurrection** through my love.

¹⁴And I sowed my fruits in hearts,
and transformed them through myself.

¹⁵**Then they received my blessing and lived,
and they were gathered to me and were saved;**

¹⁶Because they became my members,
and I was their head [[John 15](#); [Rom 12:4f](#); [Col 1:15-20](#)].

Odes of Solomon 20:7-9

OTP 2:753

⁷**But put on the grace of the Lord generously,
and come into his Paradise [[Rev 2:7](#)],
and make for yourself a crown from his tree.**

⁸**Then put (it) on your head and be refreshed,
and recline upon his serenity.**

⁹**For his glory will go before you;
and you will receive of his kindness and of his grace [[cf. Isa 58:8](#)];
and you will be anointed in truth with the praise of his holiness.**

Odes of Solomon 21:1-3

OTP 2:754

¹I raised my arms on high
on account of the grace of the Lord.

²Because **he cast off my chains** from me,
and **my Helper raised me according to his grace and his salvation.**

³And I stripped off darkness,
and put on light.

Odes of Solomon 22:8-12

OTP 2:755

⁸**And it chose them from the graves,
and separated them from the dead ones.**

⁹**It took dead bones
and covered them with flesh [[Ezek 37:1-6](#)].**

¹⁰**But they were motionless,
so it gave (them) energy for life.**

¹¹Incorruptible was your way and your face;
you have brought your world to corruption,
that everything might be broken and renewed.

¹²And the foundation of everything is your rock.
And upon it you have built your kingdom [[Matt 16:18](#)],
and it became the dwelling place of the holy ones.

Hallelujah.

Odes of Solomon 25:8-9

OTP 2:758

⁸And I was covered with the covering of your spirit,
and **I removed from me my garments of skin.**

⁹**Because your right hand raised me,**
and caused sickness to pass from me.

Odes of Solomon 28:6-8

OTP 2:760

⁶**Because I am ready before destruction comes,**
and have been placed in his incorruptible arms.

⁷**And immortal life embraced me,**
and kissed me.

⁸**And from that (life) is the Spirit which is within me.**
And it cannot die because it is life.

Odes of Solomon 29:1-4

OTP 2:761

¹The Lord is my hope [Ps 31:1; 71:1],
I shall not be ashamed in him.

²For according to his praise he made me,
and according to his grace even so he gave to me.

³And according to his mercies **he raised me,**
and according to his great honor **he lifted me up.**

⁴And **he caused me to ascend from the depths of Sheol,**
and **from the mouth of Death he drew me.**

Odes of Solomon 31:4, 6-7, 13

OTP 2:762-763

⁴Then he raised his voice toward the Most High,
and offered to him those that had become sons through him [John 17:1-9].

⁶Come forth, you who have been afflicted,
and receive joy.

⁷And possess yourselves through grace,
and take unto you immortal life.

¹³And that I might not nullify the promises to the patriarchs [John 15:8],
to whom I was promised for the salvation of their offspring.

Odes of Solomon 33:8-12

OTP 2:764

⁸**And I will enter into you,**
and bring you forth from destruction,
and make you wise in the ways of truth.

⁹Be not corrupted
nor perish.

¹⁰Hear me and be saved,
for I am proclaiming unto you the grace of God.

¹¹**And through me you will be saved and become blessed.
I am your judge;**

¹²**And they who have put me on will not be rejected,
but they will possess incorruption in the new world.**

Odes of Solomon 36:1-2

OTP 2:765

¹I rest on the Spirit of the Lord,
and **she raised me up to heaven;**
²And caused me to stand on my feet in the Lord's high place,
before his perfection and his glory,
where I continued praising (him) by the composition of his odes.

Odes of Solomon 38:1-3

OTP 2:766

¹I went up into the light of Truth as into a chariot,
and the Truth led me and caused me to come [cf. Ps 43:3].

²And caused me to pass over chasms and gulfs,
and saved me from cliffs and valleys.

³And became for me a heaven of salvation,
and set me on the place of immortal life.

Odes of Solomon 40:4-6

OTP 2:769

⁴My face rejoices in his exultation,
and my spirit exults in his love,
and my nature shines in him.

⁵And he who is afraid will trust in him,
and salvation will be established in him.

⁶**And his possession is immortal life,
and those who receive it are incorruptible.**

Hallelujah.

Odes of Solomon 41:11-15

OTP 2:770

¹¹And his Word is with us in all our way,
the Savior who gives life [John 6:33-37] and does not reject ourselves.

¹²The Man who humbled himself,
but was raised because of his own righteousness [Phil 2:6-9].

¹³The Son of the Most High appeared
in the perfection of his Father.

¹⁴And light dawned from the Word [John 1:1]
that was before time in him.

¹⁵The Messiah in truth is one.

And he was known before the foundations of the world,
that he might give life to persons forever by the truth of his name.

Odes of Solomon 42:11-20

OTP 2:771

¹¹**Sheol saw me and was shattered,
and Death ejected me and many with me** [Rev 20:13f.].

¹²I have been vinegar and bitterness to it,
and I went down with it as far as its depth.

¹³Then the feet and the head it released,
because it was not able to endure my face.

¹⁴**And I made a congregation of living among his dead;
and I spoke with them by living lips;
in order that my word may not fail.**

¹⁵And those who had died ran toward me;
and they cried out and said, "Son of God, have pity on us.

¹⁶"And deal with us according to your kindness,
and bring us out from the chains of darkness.

¹⁷"And open for us the door
by which we may go forth to you [John 10:7-10; Rev 3:7f.],
for we perceive that our death does not approach you.

¹⁸"May we also be saved with you,
because you are our Savior."

¹⁹Then I heard their voice,
and placed their faith in my heart.

²⁰And I placed my name upon their head,
because they are free and they are mine.

Concluding Remarks

The above six resurrection texts tables (Tables 49-54) give a comprehensive list of resurrection passages from the literature of Second Temple period, the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. Chapters 2 and 3 outline the numerous afterlife views and analyze the resurrection texts listed in these tables which are classified as text referring or alluding to the TaNaKh in support of a resurrection belief. Based on this analysis, the final chapter of

this dissertation compile a list of all the TaNaKh passages which were viewed as resurrection texts by the group of believers who produced the compositions belonging to the Apocrypha and the Pseudepigrapha. In addition, this final chapter will summarize the main findings, consider their implications, make some general observation regarding the role the TaNaKh played in the development of the resurrection beliefs, and make some suggestions for further research.

APPENDIX B

RESURRECTION PASSAGES IN QUMRAN, JOSEPHUS,
NEW TESTAMENT, AND EARLY RABBINIC JUDAISM

Appendix B gives an analysis of resurrection passages compiled from the Dead Sea Scrolls (Table 56), Josephus (Table 57), New Testament (Table 58), Jewish Liturgy (Table 59), and early rabbinic literature (Table 60). These five tables give various categories by which each passage is analyzed and classified (see Table 55). It should be noted that a category only appear in a given table if it is of relevance for the resurrection passages falling within that category. Due to the complicating factor that Rabbinical literature tends to contain a non-chronological collection of oral traditions credited to Rabbis living in various generations, Table 60 does not include the dating of the Rabbinical resurrection passages. The author also decided to exclude the dating of the resurrection texts found among the Dead Sea Scrolls (Table 56),¹ Josephus (Table 57),²

¹In future research into the resurrection texts appearing among the Dead Sea Scrolls, the dating will be taken into consideration. However, for the purpose of this Appendix, the dates have been excluded.

²Dating the various resurrection texts found in Josephus' writings would not be helpful for this study since they were written during a fairly short time-period. Josephus was born towards the end of the Second Temple period, in the year of Gaius Caligula's accession (37/38 CE). His writings dates to the tumultuous political period following the first Jewish Revolt, which effectively ended the Second Temple period. As such, his writings were composed during the latter part of his life: The *Jewish War* (seven books) dates to the late 70s, the *Jewish Antiquities* (twenty books) dates to the mid-90s, and the appendix to *Jewish Antiquities, Life*, was completed shortly after 100 CE – falling within a period of about twenty years (Evans, *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies*, 173-174).

Table 55. List of categories used in the seven resurrection texts tables

Category		Table					Explanation
		56	57	58	59	60	
Date				x	x		Date the book was written.
Passage		x	x	x	x	x	Passage reference.
Notes		x	x	x	x	x	Author's notes.
Resurrection	Implied		x	x	x	x	A resurrection belief is implied in the passage.
	Stated		x	x	x	x	A resurrection belief is stated clearly in the passage.
Classification	Reference		x	x	x	x	The resurrection passage refers to a resurrection text in the TaNaKh.
	Allusion		x	x	x	x	The resurrection passage alludes to a resurrection text in the TaNaKh.
	Philosophical		x	x	x	x	Resurrection passage uses a philosophical argument as a proof for a resurrection belief.
	Assumed		x	x	x	x	Since the resurrection belief is assumed, no attempt is made to prove biblically or philosophically that their will be a resurrection.
	Jesus			x			Reference to Jesus' resurrection.
	Miracle			x			Jesus resurrects a person.
	Eschatological			x			Eschatological resurrection.
	Jewish/ Christian						Jewish, Christian, or a Jewish-Christian passage [J, C, J/C].

and Jewish Liturgy (Table 59).³ The above table also shows the uniqueness of the New Testament writings (see Table 58) regarding the resurrection belief, since Jesus' death and resurrection functions as a proof for the New Testament community.

³Dating Jewish Liturgy is difficult since "prayers were not written down during the Talmudic times" (David Instone-Brewer, *Prayer and Agriculture* [TRENT 1; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2004], 95). In the case of the Amidah prayer, it evolved over centuries. According to traditions, *Shemoneh Esreh* originated during the early Second Temple period with the "men of the Great Synagogue" (b. Ber. 33a) or the "120 elders, prophets among them" (b. Meg. 17b). Instone-Brewer notes that "the timing of the Eighteen [Benedictions] appear to be linked to Temple sacrifices, and it is possible that they were part of the private prayer service by the priest before starting their duties (m. Tam. 5.1.)" (Instone-Brewer, *Prayer and Agriculture*, 107). It was not until the end of the Second Temple period, according to Rabbinic tradition, that the order, number and the wording of the Amidah was fixed by Rabban Gamaliel II of Yavneh and his two disciples, Simeon of Pakula and Shmuel Hakatan (Instone-Brewer, *Prayer and Agriculture*, 108 and Gershom Bader, *Encyclopedia of Talmudic Sages* [Northvale, N.J.: Jason Aronson, 1988], 191).

Resurrection Texts in the Dead Sea Scrolls

Table 56. List of resurrection texts: Dead Sea Scrolls

Passage		Notes
1QH (1QHodayot)	XI 19-23	
	XII 5-XIII 4	
	XIV 34-35	
	XV 22-31	
	XIX 10-14	
1QS (1QRule of the Community)	IV 6-8, 11-14	
4Q245 (Pseudo-Daniel ar)	Frag. 2	
4Q385 (4QPseudo-Ezekiel ^a)	Frag. 1-3, 12	
4Q386 (4QPseudo-Ezekiel ^b)	Frag. 1 col. i	
4Q388 (4QPseudo-Ezekiel ^d)	Frag. 8	
4Q416 (4QInstruction ^b)	Frag 2 col. iii	
4Q418 (4QInstruction ^d)	Frag 69 ii	
4Q504 (4QWords of the Luminaries ^a)	Frag 1-2 col. vi	
4Q521 (4QMessianic Apocalypse)	Frag 1 col. ii Frag 2 col. ii-iii Frag 7 + 5 col. ii	
4Q548 (4QVisions of Amram ^f ? ar)	Frag 1	

Resurrection Texts in Josephus

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 57. List of resurrection texts: Josephus

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Antiquities	18:1.3	Pharisees		X				X
	18:1.4	Sadducees						
	18:1.5	Essenes						
Jewish War	2.8.10-11	Essenes	X					X
	2.8.14	Pharisees	X					X
	2.8.14	Sadducees						
	3.8.5	Immortality of the soul/ Resurrection		X			X	X

Resurrection Texts in the New Testament

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 58. List of resurrection texts: New Testament

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschatological
40-100	Matthew	5:3, 10-12	The Beatitudes	x								x
		5:20	Righteous = enter the kingdom	x								x
		6:19-20	Treasures in Heaven	x								x
		7:13-14	The two ways	x								x
		7:21-23	Day of Judgment	x								x
		8:11-12	Feast in Heaven	x								x
		9:18-25	A dead girl Death Sleep	x							x	
		10:8	Jesus sends out the Twelve		x						x	
		10:28	Body Soul									
		11:5	John's question		x		x				x	
		12:38-42	Sign of Jonah		x	x				x		
		13:43	Parable of the Weed	x			x					x
		16:1-4	Sign of Jonah	x		x				x		
		16:21-28	Jesus Predicts His Death		x					x		x
		17:2-4	Moses and Elijah	x					x			
		17:22-23	Jesus Predicted His Death		x					x		

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
40-100	Matthew	19:16-28	Rich young ruler	x								x
		20:17-19	Jesus Predicted His Death		x					x		
		22:23, 28, 30	Discussion with the Sadducees		x	x						x
		24:29-31	The End of the Age	x		x						x
		25:31-46	The sheep and the goats	x								x
		26:63-64	2 nd Coming	x								x
		27:52-53	Resurrection of Holy People		x					x	x	
		27:62-66	Guarding the Tomb		x					x		
		28:1-15	Jesus Resurrection		x					x		
60-70	Mark	5:22, 35-43	Jarirus daughter Death Sleep		x						x	
		6:14, 16	Believed that John had been raised from dead		x						x	
		8:31	Predicts His death		x					x		
		8:35	He who loses his life will save it	x								
		9:4-5	Moses and Elijah	x					x			
		10:17-31	The Rich man	x								x
		10:33-34	Predicts His Death		x					x		

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
60-70	Mark	12:18-27	Discussion with the Sadducees		X							X
		13:24-27	Signs of the End of the Age	X								X
		14:62	The Son of Man coming on the clouds of Heaven	X								X
		16:6, 9, 12, 14	Jesus' Resurrection		X					X		
60-70	Luke	2:29-32	Simeon's praise	X								X
		3:4-6	John's mission	X								X
		6:22-23	Reward in Heaven	X								X
		7:11-17	Widow's son at Nain		X						X	
		7:18-23	John's question		X		X				X	
		8:40-56	Jairus' daughter		X						X	
		9:7-9, 19	Believed in a resurrection		X					X		
		9:22	Jesus predicts his death		X					X		
		9:23-27	He who loses his life will save it	X								X

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
60-70	Luke	9:30-33	Moses and Elijah	x					x			
		10:20	Book of life	x								
		11:29-32	Sign of Jonah		x					x		x
		13:28-29	The Feast in Heaven	x								x
		14:12-14	Jesus at the Pharisee's House		x				x			x
		14:15	The Great Banquet	x								x
		16:29-31	Lazarus and the Rich man		x				x			
		17:33	He who loses his life will save it	x								x
		18:18-29	The rich ruler	x								x
		18:31-33	Jesus predicts His Death		x					x		
		20:27-40	Discussion with the Sadducees		x							x
		21:19, 36	The End of the Ages	x								x
		22:30	Judge the tribes	x								x
		23:42-43	The Criminal on the cross	x					x			x
		24:6-7, 23, 34, 46-47	Jesus' resurrection		x					x		

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
85-90	John	2:18-22	Rebuild temple in three days		X					X		
		3:14-18 4:36, 14	Belief = eternal life	X					X			X
		5:21-29	Resurrection		X				X			X
		6:33-40, 44, 47, 51, 54	Resurrection		X							X
		10:17-18	Jesus' resurrection predicted	X						X		
		11:24-26, 43-44	Lazarus		X						X	X
		12:1, 9-10	Lazarus		X						X	
		12:23-25	The Seed has to die		X					X		X
		14:1-4	Jesus will prepare a place for his people	X								X
		20:9; 21:14	Jesus' resurrection		X					X		

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
Early 60s	Acts	1:22 2:31-32 3:15 4:2, 10, 33 5:30 10:40 13:30, 34, 37 17:3, 18, 31 26:23	Jesus' resurrection		X					X		
		9:37, 40-41	Dorcas' resurrection		X				X		X	
		10:42-43	Jesus, the judge	X								X
		13:46	Belief in Jesus eternal life	X								
		17:32	Resurrection/ judgment		X				X	X		X
		20:7-11	Eutychus raised from the dead		X						X	
		23:6-8	Pharisees and Sadducees on resurrection		X							X
		24:15, 21	Resurrection of righteous and wicked		X							X
		26:6-8, 18, 23	Resurrection belief		X				X			

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
56-57	Romans	1:4 4:24-25 5:10 6:9-10 7:4 8:11, 34 10:5-9 14:9	Jesus' resurrection		X					X		
		1:16-17	Righteousness gives life	X		X						
		2:5-16	Judgment	X								X
		5:18-19	Righteousness brings life	X								
		6:4-5, 8	Jesus sacrifice gives life		X					X		
		8:11	God will give life to mortal bodies	X								
		8:38-39	Nothing can separate us from His love	X								
		14:10-12	Everyone will be judged	X								X

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
55-56	1 Corinthians	6:14	Resurrection		X				X	X		X
		9:24-27	Win the crown	X				X	X			X
		15:4, 12-28, 21, 42	Jesus' resurrection		X					X		
		15:12-57	General resurrection		X			X		X		X
55-56	2 Corinthians	1:9	God raises the dead	X								X
		4:14	Resurrection		X				X	X		X
		5:1-10	Resurrection/ judgment		X							X
52	Galatians	1:1	Jesus' resurrection		X					X		
60-63	Ephesians	1:15-23	Jesus' resurrection		X					X		
		2:1-10	Made alive in Christ	X						X		X
		2:19-22; 3:6	Member of God's household	X								X
		4:7-13	Body of Christ	X						X		

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
c. 61	Philippians	2:6-11	Jesus' resurrection	x		x				x		
		3:10-11, 14	Resurrection, the Heavenly price		x					x		x
		3:20-21	Citizens of Heaven	x								x
c. 62	Colossians	1:9-14	A part of His kingdom	x						x		
		2:12-13, 20; 3:1-4	Jesus' resurrection Our resurrection		x					x		x
50	1 Thess	1:10	Jesus' resurrection/judgment		x					x		x
		4:13-18	Resurrection		x				x	x		x
50	2 Thess	1:5-10	God's judgment	x				x	x	x		x
62-66	1 Timothy	6:12, 18-19	Eternal life	x					x	x		x
65-67	2 Timothy	1:10-12	Death destroyed	x						x		x
		2:8-13, 18-19	Resurrection		x				x	x		x
		4:7-8	Crown of righteousness	x				x	x			x
62-66	Titus	2:11-14; 3:7	God, our savior	x					x	x		x

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschatological
66-70	Hebrews	2:14-15	Freed from death	x						x		x
		6:2	Resurrection		x							x
		9:15, 27-28	Promised eternal inheritance	x					x	x		x
		10:35-39	Receive the promise	x					x			x
		11:4, 6, 10, 13, 16, 19, 35, 39-40	Resurrection		x				x			x
		12:22-24, 28-29	Heavenly Jerusalem	x					x	x		x
		13:20	Jesus' resurrection		x		x			x		
45-50	James	4:10	Sin => Death	x				x	x			x
62-64	1 Peter	1:3-9, 11, 21	Jesus' resurrection => resurrection		x					x		x
		3:18,-21	Jesus' resurrection saves		x					x		x
		4:5-6	God judges living and dead	x				x	x			x
		4:13, 16-18	Suffering = reward	x				x		x		x
		5:1, 4	Crown of glory	x					x			x

Table 58 - Continued

Date	Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification						
				Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil	Assumed	Jesus	Miracle	Eschato-logical
64-68	2 Peter	1:10-11	Great reward	x					x	x		x
		2:4-22	God's judgment		x			x	x			x
		3:4-13	God's judgment	x				x	x			x
c. 90	1 John	2:17, 25; 4:17; 5:10-13	Belief in Jesus => life	x						x		x
60-65	Jude	6	Judgment	x					x			x
		9	Moses' death/ resurrection	x					x			
		14-15	Judgment	x				x	x			x
		21	Eternal life	x					x	x		x
81-96	Revelation	1:18	Keys of death	x						x		x
		2:7; 3:21	The one who conquers will: eat from the Tree of Life/ sit with Jesus on his throne	x								x
		20:4-6, 12-15	The first and Second resurrection/ Judgment		x		x					x

Resurrection Texts in Jewish Liturgy

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 59. List of resurrection texts: Jewish liturgy

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Eighteen Benedictions	2 nd Benediction	Concerning the resurrection		X		X		
	12 th Benediction	Birkat HaMinim	X					X

Resurrection Texts in Rabbinic Literature

Classification of the Resurrection Passages

Table 60. List of resurrection texts: Rabbinic literature

Mishnah								
Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Sotah	9:15	The Holy Spirit leads to the resurrection which comes through Elijah		X				X
Sanhedrin	10:1-3	These have no portion in the world to come		X	X			X
Berakhot	5:2	Amidah 2		X				X
Avot	4:21-22	“Those who die are [destined] for resurrection”/ Judgment/ Theodocy		X			X	X
The Tosefta								
Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Berakhot	3:9, 24	Prayers		X				X
Sanhedrin	13:3-5	Three groups of people		X	X			

Table 60 - Continued

Jerusalem Talmud								
Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Berakhot	5:2	Amidah 2 Rain Resurrection		X	X			
Ta'anith	1:1	Amidah 2 Rain Resurrection		X	X			
Ketubbot	12:3	Rabbi's death and his wishes		X	X			
Sanhedrin	10	All Israelites have a share in the world to come, except . . .		X	X			

Table 60 - Continued

Babylonian Talmud								
Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Berakhot	15b	The grave and the womb		x	x			
	18b	Regarding prayers		x				x
	26b	Regarding prayers		x				x
	29a	Regarding prayers		x				x
	33a	Why the rainfall is mentioned in the benediction of the resurrection		x			x	
	60b	Blessing God for restoring souls to dead corpses		x			x	
Sabbath	152b	God will open the graves		x	x			
Pesachim	68a	The righteous are destined to resurrect the dead/ God will resurrect		x	x			
	118a	Resurrection Psalm		x	x			
Rosh HaShana	17a	Three groups at the Day of Judgment		x	x			
	31a	Resurrection after 1000 or 2000 years		x	x			
	32a	The order of the blessings		x				x
Megillah	17b	The origin of the Amdiah prayer	x		x			

Table 60 - Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Chagigah	12b	The dew which will revive the dead		X	X			
Sotah	5a	Arrogant people will not resurrect		X	X			
Kiddushin	39b	Every precept in the Torah depends on the resurrection		X	X			
Baba Bathra	16a	Job denied the resurrection of the dead		X	X			
	16b	Esau denied the resurrection of the dead		X	X			
Ketubbot	111a	Who will resurrect (geographically)		X	X			
	111b	Who will not resurrect (the illiterate)/ Resurrection in Jerusalem		X	X			
Sanhedrin	90a	All Israel have a portion in the world to come, except...		X	X			
	90b	Resurrection is derived from the Torah		X	X			
	91a	Can dust come to life?		X			X	
	91b	The parable about the lame (body) and the blind (spirit) men/ Judgment and the world to come/ Resurrection is derived from the Torah		X	X			

Table 60 - Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Sanhedrin	92a	Resurrection is derived from the Torah		X	X			
	92b	The identity of the people whom Ezekiel resurrected		X	X			
	113a	Elijah asked for the keys of resurrection		X				X
Avodah Zarah	18a	No portion in the world to come		X				X
	20b	The holy spirit leads to life eternal		X				X
Chullin	142a	Every precept in the Torah depends on the resurrection		X	X			
Nidah	70b	What conveys uncleanness		X				X

Table 60 - Continued

Midrash Rabbah								
Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Genesis	13:3-6	Parallel between rain and resurrection		X	X			
	14:5, 8	Two formations, one in this world and one in the next		X	X			
	20:10	You shall return from the dust		X	X			
	21:1	The decree against Adam has a limit		X	X			
	26:2	There will be no death and Sheol will be destroyed	X		X			
	26:6	The righteous will receive a reward while the wicked will burn	X		X			
	28:3	A person will be resurrected from the nut of the spinal column		X			X	
	32:1	The generation of the Flood will neither be resurrected nor judged		X	X			
	35:3	The last blessing is greater than the first		X	X			
	56:1-2	The third day/ Resurrection a reward for worshipping		X	X			
	63:11, 14	Esau denied the resurrection		X	X			

Table 60 - Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Genesis	73:4	Three keys belongs to God		X	X			
	74:1	The land of the living = resurrection		X	X			
	77:1	All God's deeds have been anticipated: Elijah and Elisha resurrected the dead		X	X			
	78:1	Waking up in the morning resurrection		X	X			
	84:11	Joseph's dream: Sun, <i>moon</i> and stars		X	X			
	94	The importance of being buried in Israel		X	X			
	95:1	A person will be resurrected in the same state as he/she died		X	X			
	96:5	The importance of being buried in Israel		X	X			
	102:2	Burial practices		X				X
Exodus	1:1	Esau denied the resurrection		X				X
	15:21	Ten things which God will renew in the Time to Come	X		X			
	32:2	People buried in Israel will resurrect first		X				X
	40:2	The Book of Adam		X				X

Table 60 - Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Exodus	48:2	The day of death is better than the day of birth since closer to the day of resurrection		X	X			
Leviticus	18:1	A person will be resurrected from the nut of the spinal column		X	X			
	27:4	Elijah, Elisha and Ezekiel resurrected the dead => God will resurrect the dead		X	X			
Numbers	11:2	The Abrahamic promise		X				X
	14:1	God has already revived people		X	X			
	15:13	God has already revived people		X	X			
	19:13	The first wilderness generation also has a share in the world to come		X	X			
Deuteronomy	2:9-10	The reason Moses had to die in the wilderness		X	X			
	3:15	Moses counted the patriarchs among the living righteous		X	X			
	7:6	God's three keys/ rain resurrection		X	X			
	10:3	Everything that God does can also be done by the righteous		X	X			

Table 60 - Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Lamentation	1:45	The women who through themselves into the sea believed in the resurrection		X	X			
	2:6	God gave a resurrection promise to Daniel		X	X			
	3:8	God renews our life each morning => resurrection		X	X			
Ruth	3:2	Some people will never resurrect		X	X			
	6:2	See Rab Eccl 7:17		X	XX			
Ecclesiastes	1:6-7	People will resurrect with their blemishes		X	X			
	1:19-20	As the river returns to its source so will people resurrect from the dead		X	X			
	3:2	Parallel between birth and death		X	X			
	3:18	God has already revived people		X	X			
	5:11, 17	Secret or a public resurrection?/ Parallel between birth and death		X	X		X	
	7:16	Reward in the Age to Come		X	X			
	12:5	A person will be resurrected from the nut of the spinal column		X			X	

Table 60 - Continued

Passage		Notes	Resurrection		Classification			
			Implied	Stated	Ref.	Allude	Phil.	Assumed
Esther	9:2	The dead will come alive after three days		X	X			
Song of Songs	1:9	Holy Spirit => resurrection => Elijah		X	X			
	2:2	The hidden bodies in the ground will resurrect		X	X			
	2:18	Acts of kindness => resurrection		X	X			
	7:15	Ezekiel brought the dead to life in the Valley of Dura		X	X			

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Afonso, Laurentino Jose. "Netherworld." *Encyclopaedia Judaica on CD-ROM*. Judaica Multimedia Version 1.0. 1997. Print ed.: Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigod, eds. *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 26 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1972-1994.
- Ahearne-Kroll, Patricia. "Josph and Aseneth." Pages 2525-2589 in vol. 3 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Ahn, Ché. *When Heaven Comes Down: Experiencing God's Glory in Your Life*. Grand Rapids: Chosen Books, 2009.
- Alexander, Philip S. "Jewish Aramaic Translations of Hebrew Scriptures." Pages 217-253 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA.: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Allen, Joel S. "Job 3: History of Interpretation." Pages 361-371 in *Dictionary of the Old Testament: Wisdom, Poetry and Writings*. Edited by Tremper Longman III and Peter Enns. Downers Grove, IL.: InterVarsity, 2008.
- Anderson, Gary A. *Life of Adam and Eve*. Pages 1331-1358 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Anderson, Gary A., and Michael E. Stone, eds. *A Synopsis of the Books of Adam and Eve: Second Revised Edition*. Society of Biblical Literature: Early Judaism and Its Literature 17. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1999.
- Andersen, H. "4 Maccabees: A Translation and Introduction." Pages 531-564 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.

- Aptowitzer, V. "Die Seele als Vogel: Ein Beitrag zu den Anschauungen der Agada." *Monatsschrift für Geschichte und Wissenschaft des Judentums* 69 [May/June 1925]: 150-168.
- Assmann, Jan. "Resurrection in Ancient Egypt." Pages 124-135 in *Resurrection: Theological and Scientific Assessments*. Edited by Ted Peters, Robert John Russell and Michael Welker. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2002.
- Atkinson, Kenneth. *An Intertextual Study of the Psalms of Solomon*. Studies in the Bible and Early Christianity 49. Lewiston, NY: Mellen, 2001.
- _____. "Psalms of Solomon." Pages 1903-1923 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- _____. "Testament of Moses." Pages 1856-1868 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Attridge, Harold W. "Greek and Latin Apocalypses." *Semeia* 14 (1979): 159-186.
- _____. "Historiography." Pages 157-184 in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. "Josephus and His Works." Pages 185-232 in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. "Testament of Job." Pages 1872-1899 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Aune, D. E., T. J. Geddert, and C. A. Evans. "Apocalypticism." Pages 45-58 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL.: InterVarsity, 2000.

- Avery-Peck, Alan J. "Soul in Judaism." Pages 1343-48 in vol. 3 of *The Encyclopaedia of Judaism*. 2nd. Edited by Jacob Neusner, Alan J. Avery-Peck, and William Scott Green. 5 vols. Boston: Brill, 2000.
- Badina, Joel. "The Millennium." Pages 225-242 in *Symposium on Revelation – Book II*. Edited by Frank B. Holbrook. Daniel and Revelation Committee Series 7. Silver Springs, MD: Biblical Research Institute and General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, 1992.
- Bailey, Daniel P. "Suffering Servant." Pages 1257-1258 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Bailey, Kenneth E. *Jesus Through Middle Eastern Eyes: Cultural Studies in the Gospels*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008.
- Bauckham, Richard. *The Jewish World around the New Testament*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2008.
- Baumgarten, Joseph M. "The Heavenly Tribunal and the Personification of Sedeq in Jewish Apocalyptic." Pages 219-39 in *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung*. Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1979.
- Bergland, Kenneth. "A Methodolgy for Inner-Biblical Legal Reuse and Application in the Prophets." Term paper for OTST695 - Directed Reading in Inner-Biblical Legal Exegesis in the Prophets, Andrews University, 3 May 2013.
- Bergren, Theodore A. "Christian Influence on the Transmission History of 4, 5, and 6 Ezra." Pages 102-127 in *The Jewish Apocalyptic Heritage in Early Christianity*. Edited by James C. VanderKam and William Adler. *Compendia Rerum Iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum* Sect. 3. vol. 4. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1996.
- Bernstein, Alan E. *The Formation of Hell: Death and Retribution in the Ancient and Early Christian Worlds*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1993.
- Berthelot, Katell. "Early Jewish Literature Written in Greek." Pages 181-199 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Blanco, Carlos. *Why Resurrection? An Introduction to the Belief in the Afterlife in Judaism and Christianity*. Eugene, OR.: Pickwick, 2011.

- Bloch-Smith, Elizabeth. *Judahite Burial Practices and Beliefs about the Dead*. Journal for the Study of the Old Testament: Supplement Series 123. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1992.
- _____. "Burials." Pages 785-89 in vol. 1 of *Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
- Boccaccini, Gabriele. *Middle Judaism: Jewish Thought, 300 B.C.E. to 200 C.E.* Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991.
- _____, ed. *The Origins of Enochic Judaism: Proceedings of the First Enoch Seminar, University of Michigan, Sesto Fiorentino, Italy, June 19-23, 2001*. Turin: Zamorani, 2002.
- Bóid, Ruairidh, (and M. N. Saraf). "Use, Authority and Exegesis of Mikra in the Samaritan Tradition." Pages 595-633 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA.: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Böttrich, Christfried. "Apocalyptic Tradition and Mystical Prayer in the *Ladder of Jacob*." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 23, no. 4 (June 2004): 290-306.
- Bowker, John Westerdale. *The Meanings of Death*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Boyarín, Daniel, and Seymour Siegel. "Rabbinic Period." *Encyclopaedia Judaica: CD-ROM Edition*. Judaica Multimedia Version 1.0. 1997. Print ed.: Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigodór, eds. *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 26 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1972-1994.
- Brand, Miryam T. "1 Enoch." Pages 1359-1452 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*, ed. Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Brooke, George J. "The Structure of 1QH^a XII 5-XIII 4 and the Meaning of Resurrection." Pages 15-33 in *From 4QMMT to Resurrection: Mélanges Qumraniens en Hommage à Émile Puech*. Edited by Emile Puech, Florentino García Martínez, Annette Steudel, and Eibert J. C. Tigchelaar. Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah. Leiden: Brill, 2006.

- Brown, Dennis. "Jerome and the Vulgate." Pages 355-379 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- Bruce, Frederick F. *The Letter of Paul to the Romans: An Introduction and Commentary*. 2nd ed. Tyndale New Testament Commentary. Leicester, England: Inter-Varsity; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1985.
- Buchanan, George Wesley. "Eschatology and the 'End of Days.'" *Journal of Near Eastern Studies* 20, no. 3 (July 1961): 188-193.
- Bullard, Roger A., and Howard A. Hatton. *A Handbook on the Wisdom of Solomon*. United Bible Societies Handbook Series. New York: United Bible Societies, 2004.
- Burchard, C. "Joseph and Aseneth: A New Translation and Interpretation." Pages 177-247 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.
- Buttenwieser, Moses. *Die Hebraische Elias-Apokalypse, Part 1: Und Ihre Stellung In Der Apokalyptischen Litteratur Des Rabbinischen Schrifttums Und Der Kirche*. 1897; repr., Whitefish, MT: Kessinger Publishing, 2010.
- Byron, John. *Cain and Abel in Text and Tradition: Jewish and Christian Interpretations of the First Sibling Rivalry. Themes in Biblical Narrative Jewish and Christian Traditions 14*. Leiden: Brill, 2011.
- Callaway, Mary Chilton. "The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: An Anglican/Episcopal View." Pages xxxv-xxxix in *The Parallel Apocrypha*. Edited by John R. Kohlenberger III. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Carson, D. A. "Pseudonymity and Pseudepigraphy." Pages 857-864 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: An Evangelical View." Pages xlv-xlvii in *The Parallel Apocrypha*. Edited by John R. Kohlenberger III. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Carter, George William. *Zoroastrianism and Judaism*. New York: AMS Press, 1970.
- Cason, Thomas S. "The Rhetoric of Disablement and Repair in the Testament of Job." PhD diss., Florida State University, 2007.

Cavallin, Hans Clements Caesarius. *Life After Death: Paul's Argument for the Resurrection of the Dead in 1 Cor 15 - Part 1: An Enquiry into the Jewish Background*. Coniectanea Biblica - New Testament Series 7:1. Lund, Sweden: CWK Gleerup, 1974.

Cavallin, von Hans C. "Leben nach dem Tode im Spätjudentum und in frühen Christentum." Pages 240-345 in *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung*. Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. New York: de Gruyter, 1979.

Charlesworth, James H. "A History of Pseudepigrapha Research: The Re-Emerging Importance of the Pseudepigrapha." Pages 54-88 in *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung*. Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. New York: de Gruyter, 1979.

_____. "A Rare Consensus Among Enoch Specialists: The Date of the Earliest Enoch Books." Pages 225-234 in *The Origins of Enochic Judaism: Proceedings of the First Enoch Seminar, University of Michigan, Sesto Fiorentino, Italy, June 19-23, 2001*. Edited by Gabriele Boccaccini. Turin: Zamorani, 2002.

_____. "Apocrypha." Pages 293-295 in vol. 1 of *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Edited by David N. Freedman. 5 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.

_____. "Conclusion: The Origin and Development of Resurrection Beliefs." Pages 218-31 in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth, C. D. Elledge, J. L. Crenshaw, H. Boers, and W. W. Willis, Jr. Faith and Scholarship Colloquies Series. New York: T&T Clark, 2006.

_____. *Critical Reflections on the Odes of Solomon: Volume 1- Literary Setting, Textual Studies, Gnosticism, the Dead Sea Scrolls and the Gospels of John*. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series 22. Sheffield: Sheffield Press, 1998.

_____. "Odes of Solomon." Pages 749-752 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.

_____. "Odes of Solomon: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 725-771 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.

- _____. "Pseudepigrapha, OT." Pages 538-541 in vol. 5 of *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Edited by David N. Freedman. 5 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
- _____. "Resurrection: The Dead Sea Scrolls and the New Testament." Pages 138-86 in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth, C. D. Elledge, J. L. Crenshaw, H. Boers, and W. W. Willis, Jr. Faith and Scholarship Colloquies Series. New York: T&T Clark, 2006.
- _____. "The Interpretation of the Tanak in the Jewish Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha." Pages 253-282 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- _____, ed. *The Odes of Solomon*. Translated by James H. Charlesworth. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1977.
- _____. *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha and the New Testament: Prolegomena for the Study of Christian Origins*. Harrisburg, PN: Trinity Press, 1998.
- _____, ed. *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha -- Volume 1: Apocalyptic Literature and Testaments*. The Anchor Bible Reference Library. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- _____, ed. *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha -- Volume 2: Expansions of the "Old Testament" and Legends, Wisdom and Philosophical Literature, Prayers, Psalms, and Odes, Fragments of Lost Judeo-Hellenistic Works*. The Anchor Bible Reference Library. New York: Doubleday, 1985.
- _____. "Where Does the Concept of Resurrection Appear and How Do We Know That?" Pages 1-21 in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth, C. D. Elledge, James L. Crenshaw, Hendrikus Boers, and W. Waite Willis, Jr. Faith and Scholarship Colloquies Series. New York: T&T Clark, 2006.
- Charlesworth, James H., and Craig A. Evans, eds. *The Pseudepigrapha and Early Biblical Interpretation*. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha. Supplement Series 14. Sheffield: JSOT Press, 1993.
- Chesnutt, Randall D. "Solomon, Wisdom of." Pages 1242-1244 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.

- Chester, Andrew. "Resurrection and Transformation." Pages 47-78 in *Auferstehung-Resurrection: The Fourth Durham-Tübingen Research Symposium, Resurrection, Transfiguration and Exaltation in Old Testament, Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity (Tübingen, September 1999)*. Edited by F. Avemarie and H. Lichtenberger. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. Second Series 135. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001.
- Chilton, Bruce D. "Judaism and the New Testament." Pages 603-616 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Rabbinic Literature: Targumim." Pages 902-909 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Chilton, Bruce, and Jacob Neusner. *Judaism in the New Testament: Practices and Beliefs*. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Christo, Gordon E. "The Eschatological Judgment in Job 19:21-29: An Exegetical Study." PhD diss., Andrews University, 1992.
- Clarke, K. D. "Pseudo-Phocylides." Pages 868-869 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Cohn-Sherbok, Dan. *A Dictionary of Judaism and Christianity*. Philadelphia: Trinity Press, 1991.
- Cohn-Sherbok, Daniel. "Jewish Doctrine of Hell." *Religion* 8 (1978): 196-209.
- Collins, Adela Yarbro. "The Early Christian Apocalypses." *Semeia* 14 (1979): 61-121.
- Collins, John J. "Apocalyptic Literature." Pages 40-45 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *Apocalypticism in the Dead Sea Scrolls. The Literature of the Dead Sea Scrolls*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- _____. *Between Athens and Jerusalem: Jewish Identity in the Hellenistic Diaspora*. 2nd ed. The Biblical Resource Series. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000.

- _____. *Daniel: A Commentary on the Book of Daniel*. Hermeneia. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993.
- _____. "Ecclesiasticus, or The Wisdom of Jesus Son of Sirach." Pages 667-698 in *The Oxford Bible Commentary*. Edited by John Barton and John Muddiman. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- _____. "Eschatology." Pages 256-61 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls*. Edited by Lawrence H. Schiffman and James C. VanderKam. 2 vols. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- _____. "Introduction: Towards the Morphology of a Genre." *Semeia* 14 (1979): 1-20.
- _____. *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture: Essays on the Jewish Encounter with Hellenism and Roman Rule*. Supplement to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 100. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- _____. *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age*. The Old Testament Library. Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 1997.
- _____. "Life after Death in Pseude-Phocylides." Pages 130-142 in *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture*. Supplement to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 100. Leiden: Brill, 2005.
- _____. "Persian Apocalypses." *Semeia* 14 (1979): 207-217.
- _____. "Powers in Heaven, Gods and Angels in the Dead Sea Scrolls." Pages 1-28 in *Religion in the Dead Sea Scrolls*. Edited by J. J. Collins and R. A. Kugler. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000.
- _____. "Testament." Pages 325-355 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. *The Apocalyptic Imagination: An Introduction to Jewish Apocalyptic Literature*. 2nd ed. The Biblical Resource Series. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998.
- _____. "The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: A Catholic View." Pages xxxi-xxxiv in *The Parallel Apocrypha*. Edited by John R. Kohlenberger III. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

- _____. "The Essenes and the Afterlife." Pages 35-53 in *From 4QMMT to Resurrection: Mélanges Qumraniens en Hommage à Émile Puech*. Edited by Emile Puech, Florentino García Martínez, Annette Steudel, and Eibert J. C. Tigchelaar. Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah. Boston: Brill, 2006.
- _____. "The Jewish Apocalypse." *Semeia* 14 (1979): 21-59.
- _____. "The Sibylline Oracles." Pages 357-381 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- Constantelos, Demetrios J. "The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: An Orthodox View." Pages xxvii-xxx in *The Parallel Apocrypha*. Edited by John R. Kohlenberger III. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Cook, Stephen L. "Funerary Practices and Afterlife Expectations in Ancient Israel." *Religion Compass* 1, no. 6 (Nov 2007): 660-683.
- Costa, José. *L' Au-delà et la Résurrection dans la Littérature Rabbinique Ancienne*. Collection de la Revue des Études Juives 33. Leuven: Peeters, 2004.
- Coward, Harold G. "Introduction." Pages 1-9 in *Life After Death in World Religions*. Edited by Harold G. Coward. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Cowley, A. E., and Ad Neubauer. *The Original Hebrew of a Portion of Ecclesiasticus (XXXIX. 15 to XLIX. 11) together with the Early Versions and an English Translation, Followed by the Quotations from Ben Sira in Rabbinical Literature*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1897.
- Crenshaw, James L. "Love Is Stronger Than Death: Intimations of Life beyond the Grave." Pages 53-78 in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth, C. D. Elledge, J. L. Crenshaw, H. Boers, and W. W. Willis, Jr. Faith and Scholarship Colloquies Series. New York: T&T Clark, 2006.
- Cullmann, Oscar. *Immortalité de l'ame ou résurrection des morts? Le témoignage du Nouveau Testament*. Paris: Delachaux & Niestle, 1956.
- Dahood, Mitchell. *Psalms*. 3 vols. Anchor Bible 16-17A. Garden City: Doubleday, 1965-1970.

- Daley, Brian E. "A Hope for Worms: Early Christian Hope." Pages 136-164 in *Resurrection: Theological and Scientific Assessments*. Edited by Ted Peters, Robert John Russell and Michael Welker. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2002.
- Darnell, D. R. "Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers: Translation." Pages 677-697 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.
- Davies, Jon. *Death, Burial, and Rebirth in the Religions of Antiquity*. Religion in the First Christian Centuries. New York: Routledge, 1999.
- Davies, Philip R. "Biblical Interpretation in the Dead Sea Scrolls." Pages 144-166 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- Davies, T. W. "Apocrypha." Pages 161-165 in vol. 1 of *The New International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*. Edited by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 4 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1979.
- Davies, W. D., and Louis Finkelstein, eds. *The Cambridge History of Judaism: Introduction; The Persian Period*. Vol. 1 of The Cambridge History of Judaism. Edited by W. D. Davies and L. Finkelstein. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- _____, eds. *The Cambridge History of Judaism: The Hellenistic Age*. Vol. 2 of The Cambridge History of Judaism. Edited by W. D. Davies and L. Finkelstein. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Davila, James R. "Pseudepigrapha, Old Testament." Pages 1110-1114 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- _____. *The Provenance of the Pseudepigrapha: Jewish, Christian, or Others?* Leiden: Brill, 2005.
- Davis, Stephen T. *After We Die: Theology, Philosophy, and the Question of Life after Death*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2015.
- Davka. "Babylonian Talmud." *Soncino Classics Collection: The CD-ROM Judaica Classics Library*. Judaica Press 2.2. 1991-1996.
- _____. "Midrash Rabbah." *Soncino Classics Collection: The CD-ROM Judaica Classics Library*. Judaica Press 2.2. 1991-1996.

- Day, John. "A Case of Inner Scriptural Interpretation: The Dependency of Isaiah xxvi.13 – xxvii.10 [Eng. 9] and Its Relevance to Some Theories of the Redaction of the 'Isaiah Apocalypse'." *Journal of Theological Studies* 31 (1980): 309-19.
- De Jonge, Marinus. *Jewish Eschatology, Early Christian Christology and the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*. Leiden: Brill, 1991.
- _____. "The Future of Israel in the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs." *Journal for the Study of Judaism* 17, no. 2 (1986): 196-211.
- _____, ed. *Studies on the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*. Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha 3. Leiden: Brill, 1975.
- Delamarter, Steve. *A Scripture Index to Charlesworth's the Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. New York: Sheffield Academic, 2002.
- DeSilva, David Arthur. "3 and 4 Maccabees." Pages 661-666 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "4 Maccabees." Pages 2362-2398 in vol. 3 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- _____. *4 Maccabees: Introduction and Commentary on the Greek Text in Codex Sinaiticus*. Septuagint Commentary Series. Leiden: Brill, 2006.
- _____. "Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha." Pages 58-64 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *Introducing the Apocrypha: Message, Context, and Significance*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2002.
- _____. "Sirach." Pages 1116-1124 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *The Jewish Teachers of Jesus, James, and Jude: What Earliest Christianity Learned from the Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.

- _____. "Testament of Moses." Pages 1192-1199 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs as Witnesses to Pre-Christian Judaism: A Re-Assessment." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 22, no. 4 (2013): 21-68.
- _____. "Wisdom of Solomon." Pages 1268-1276 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Dhalla, Maneckji Nusservanji. *Zoroastrian Theology: From the Earliest Times to the Present Day*. New York: [s.l.], 1914.
- Di Lella, Alexander A. "Ben Sira's of the Ancestors of Old (Sir 44-49): The History of Israel as Parenetic Apologetics." Pages 151-170 in *Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook 2006: History and Identity – How Israel's Later Authors Viewed Its Earlier History*. Edited by Núria Calduch-Benages and Jan Liesen. New York: de Gruyter, 2006.
- _____. "Conservative and Progressive Theology: Sirach and Wisdom." *The Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 28 (1966): 139-154.
- Dimant, Devorah. "Qumran Sectarian Literature." Pages 483-550 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. "Use and Interpretation of Mikra in the Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha." Pages 379-419 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Dirksen, Peter B. "The Old Testament Peshitta." Pages 255-297 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Doermann, Ralph Walter. "Sheol in the Old Testament." PhD diss., Duke University, 1961.
- Doukhan, Jacques B. *Ecclesiastes: All is Vanity*. Nampa, ID: Pacific Press, 2006.

- _____. "From Dust to Stars: The Vision of Resurrection(s) in Daniel 12,1-3 and Its Resonance in the Book of Daniel." Pages 85-98 in *Resurrection of the Dead: Biblical Traditions in Dialogue*. Edited by Geert Van Oyen and Tom Shepherd. Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium 249. Walpole, MA: Peeters, 2012.
- _____. "Le judaïsme et l'immortalité de l'âme." M.A. thesis, s.l., 1967.
- _____. "Radioscopy of a Resurrection: The Meaning of *niqqepû sō't* in Job 19:26." *Andrews University Seminary Studies* 34, no. 2 (Autumn 1996): 187-93.
- Downing, F. Gerald. "The Resurrection of the Dead: Jesus and Philo." *Journal for the Study of the New Testament* 15 (1982): 42-50.
- Dunn, James D. G. *Romans 1-8*. Word Biblical Commentary 38A. Nashville: Nelson, 1988.
- Edrei, Arye, and Doron Mendels. "A Split Jewish Diaspora: Its Dramatic Consequences." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 16, no. 2 (2007): 91-137.
- _____. "A Split Jewish Diaspora: Its Dramatic Consequences II." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 17, no. 3 (2008): 163-187.
- Edwards, Timothy M. "Targumim." Pages 784-791 in *Dictionary of the Old Testament: Wisdom, Poetry and Writings*. Edited by Tremper Longman III and Peter Enns. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008.
- Eldersheim, Alfred. *Sketches of Jewish Social Life* [book]. Philologos, 1901. Online: http://philologos.org/_eb-sjsl/.
- Elledge, C. D. *Life After Death in Early Judaism: The Evidence of Josephus*. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. Second Series 208. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2006.
- _____. "Resurrection of the Dead: Exploring Our Earliest Evidence Today." Pages 22-52 in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth, C. D. Elledge, J. L. Crenshaw, H. Boers, and W. W. Willis, Jr. Faith and Scholarship Colloquies Series. New York: T&T Clark, 2006.

- _____. "The Resurrection Passages in the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*: Hope for Israel in Early Judaism and Christianity." Pages 79-103 in *Resurrection: The Origin and Future of a Biblical Doctrine*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth, C. D. Elledge, J. L. Crenshaw, H. Boers, and W. W. Willis, Jr. Faith and Scholarship Colloquies Series. New York: T&T Clark, 2006.
- Ellis, E. Earle. "Biblical Interpretation in the New Testament Church." Pages 691-725 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Endsjø, Dag Øistein. *Greek Resurrection Beliefs and the Success of Christianity*. New York: Macmillan, 2009.
- Enns, Peter. "Biblical Interpretation, Jewish." Pages 159-165 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Wisdom of Solomon." Pages 885-891 in *Dictionary of the Old Testament: Wisdom, Poetry and Writings*. Edited by Tremper Longman III and Peter Enns. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008.
- Evans, Craig A. *Ancient Texts for New Testament Studies: A Guide to the Background Literature*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2005.
- _____. "The Interpretation of Scripture in the New Testament Apocrypha and Gnostic Writings." Pages 430-456 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- _____. *The Interpretation of Scripture in Early Judaism and Christianity: Studies in Language and Tradition*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth and Lester L. Grabbe. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha: Supplement Series 33. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 2000.
- Fee, Gordon D. *The First Epistle to the Corinthians*. New International Commentary on the New Testament. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1987.
- Feldman, Louis H. "Josephus: Interpretive Methods and Tendencies." Pages 590-596 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.

- _____. "Use, Authority and Exegesis of Mikra in the Writings of Josephus." Pages 455-518 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Feldman, Louis H., James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman, eds. *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. 3 vols. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Fernández Marcos, Natalio. *The Septuagint in Context: Introduction to the Greek Version of the Bible*. Translated by Wilfred G. E. Watson. Boston: Brill, 2001.
- Fiensy, D. A. "Hellenistic Synagogal Prayers: Introduction." Pages 671-676 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.
- Fishbane, Michael. "Use, Authority and Interpretation of Mikra at Qumran." Pages 339-377 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Fisk, B. N. "Rewritten Bible in Pseudepigrapha and Qumran." Pages 947-953 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Fitzmyer, Joseph A. *The Dead Sea Scrolls and Christian Origins*. Edited by Peter W. Flint and Martin G. Abegg, Jr. Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls and Related Literature. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000.
- Flesher, Paul. "Pentateuchal Targums as Midrash." Pages 630-646 in vol. 2 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Flusser, David. *Judaism of the Second Temple Period – Volume 1: Qumran and Apocalypticism*. Translated by Azzan Yadin. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2007.
- _____. *Judaism of the Second Temple Period – Volume 2: Sages and Literature*. Translated by Azzan Yadin. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008.
- _____. "Psalms, Hymns and Prayers." Pages 551-577 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.

_____. *The Spiritual History of the Dead Sea Sect*. Tel-Aviv: MOD Books, 1989.

Fox, Michael V. "The Rhetoric of Ezekiel's Vision of the Valley of the Bones," *Hebrew Union College Annual* 51 [1980]: 1-15

Frankovic, Joseph. "Treasures in Heaven." Online:
<http://www.jerusalemerspective.com/4661>.

Fritsch, C. T. "Apocrypha." Pages 161-166 in vol. 1 of *The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible*. Edited by G. A. Buttrick. 4 vols. Nashville: Abingdon, 1962.

_____. "Pseudepigrapha." Pages 960-964 in vol. 3 of *The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible*. Edited by G. A. Buttrick. 4 vols. Nashville: Abingdon, 1962.

Froom, Le Roy Edwin. *The Conditionalist Faith of Our Fathers: The Conflict of the Ages Over the Nature and Destiny of Man*. 2 vols. Washington, DC: Review and Herald, 1965.

Gafni, Isaiah. "The Historical Background." Pages 1-31 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.

Galenieks, Eriks. "The Nature, Function, and Purpose of the Term Sheol in the Torah, Prophets and Writings." PhD diss., Andrews University, 2005.

Gamble, Harry. "The Formation of the New Testament Canon and Its Significance for the History of Biblical Interpretation." Pages 409-429 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.

Gane, Roy. *Cult and Character: Purification Offerings, Day of Atonement, and Theodicy*. Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 2005.

García Martínez, Florentino, and Eibert J. C. Tigchelaar, eds. *The Dead Sea Scrolls Study Edition: Volume One 1Q1-4Q273*. Leiden: Brill, 1997.

_____, eds. *The Dead Sea Scrolls Study Edition: Volume Two 4Q274-11Q31*. Leiden: Brill, 1997.

Gibson, Arthur. "Logic of the Resurrection." Pages 166-194 in *Resurrection*. Edited by Stanly E. Porter, Michael A. Hayes and David Tombs. Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series 186. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic, 1999.

- Gilbert, Maurice. "The Origins According to the Wisdom of Solomon." Pages 171-185 in *Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook 2006: History and Identity – How Israel's Later Authors Viewed Its Earlier History*. Edited by Núria Calduch-Benages and Jan Liesen. New York: de Gruyter, 2006.
- _____. "Wisdom Literature." Pages 283-324 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- Gillman, Neil. *The Death of Death: Resurrection and Immortality in Jewish Thought*. Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights, 1997.
- _____. "Death and Afterlife, Judaic Doctrines of." Pages 196-212 in vol. 1 of *The Encyclopaedia of Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner, Alan J. Avery-Peck, and William Scott Green. 5 vols. Boston: Brill, 2000.
- Giversen, Søren, and Peder Borgen. *The New Testament and Hellenistic Judaism*. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 1995.
- Goldstein, Jonathan A. *II Maccabees*. Anchor Bible 41A. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1983.
- _____. "Creation Ex Nihilo: Recantations and Restatement." *Journal of Jewish Studies* 38 (1987): 187-194.
- _____. "The Origins of the Doctrine of Creation Ex Nihilo." *Journal of Jewish Studies* 35 (1984): 127-135.
- Gonzalez, Eliezer. *The Fate of the Dead in Early Third Century North African Christianity: The Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas and Tertullian*. Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum 83. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2014.
- Goodman, Martin. "Introduction to the Apocrypha." Pages 617-626 in *The Oxford Bible Commentary*. Edited by John Barton and John Muddiman. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Gowan, Donald E. *Bridge Between the Testaments: A Reappraisal of Judaism from the Exile to the Birth of Christianity*. Edited by Dikran Y. Hadidian. Pittsburg Theological Monograph Series 14. Pittsburgh: Pickwick Press, 1976.

Grabbe, Lester L. "1 and 2 Maccabess." Pages 657-661 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.

_____. *An Introduction to First Century Judaism: Jewish Religion and History in the Second Temple Period*. Edinburg: T&T Clark, 1996.

_____. *Judaic Religion in the Second Temple Period: Belief and Practice from the Exile to Yavneh*. New York: Routledge, 2000.

_____. "Judaism, History of, Part II: Second Temple Times (586 B.C.E. - 70 C.E.)." Pages 602-17 in vol. 2 of *The Encyclopaedia of Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner, Alan J. Avery-Peck, and William Scott Green. 5 vols. Boston: Brill, 2000.

Greenberg, Moshe. *Ezekiel 21-37: A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary*. Anchor Bible 22A. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1997.

_____. "Resurrection: In the Bible." *Encyclopaedia Judaica: CD-ROM Edition*. Judaica Multimedia Version 1.0. 1997. Print ed.: Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigodur, eds. *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 26 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1972-1994.

Greenspoon, Leonard J. "Hebrew into Greek: Interpretation In, By, and Of the Septuagint." Pages 80-113 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.

_____. "The Origin of the Idea of Resurrection." Pages 189-240 in *Traditions in Transformation: Turning Points in Biblical Faith*. Edited by B. Halpern and J. Levenson. Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1981.

Grintz, Yehoshua M. "Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha." Pages 258-261 in vol. 2 of *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 2nd ed. Edited by Fred Skolnik. 22 vols. Detroit: Macmillan, 2007.

Haas, Volkert. "Death and Afterlife in Hittite Thought." Pages 2021-30 in vol. 2 of *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East*. Edited by Jack M. Sasson. 2 vols. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1995.

Hachlili, Rachel. *Jewish Funerary Customs, Practices and Rites in the Second Temple Period*. Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 94. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

- _____. "Burials: Ancient Jewish." Pages 789-94 in vol. 1 of *Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
- Hagner, Donald A. *Matthew 14-28*. Word Bible Commentary 33B. Dallas: Word, 1998.
- Halivni, David Weiss. *Revelation Restored: Divine Writ and Critical Responses*. Radical Traditions: Theology in a Postcritical Key. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997.
- Hallote, Rachel S. *Death, Burial, and Afterlife in the Biblical World: How the Israelites and Their Neighbors Treated the Dead*. Chicago: Ivan R. Dee, 2001.
- Halpern-Amaru, Betsy. "Jubilees, Midrash in." Pages 333-350 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Harrelson, Walter J. "The Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books: A Protestant View." Pages xl-xliii in *The Parallel Apocrypha*. Edited by John R. Kohlenberger III. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Harrington, Daniel J. "Pseudo-Philo." Pages 864-868 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Pseudo-Philo: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 297-377 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.
- Harris, R. Laird, Gleason L. Archer, Jr, and Bruce K. Waltke. *Theological Wordbook of the Old Testament*. 2 vols. Chicago: Moody, 1980.
- Hasel, Gerhard F. "Resurrection in the Theology of Old Testament Apocalyptic." *Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft* 92 (1980): 267-84.
- Hauser, Alan J., and Duane F. Watson, eds. *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- _____. "Introduction." Pages 1-54 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.

- Healey, J. F. "'Death is Swallowed up in Victory' (1 Corinthians 15:54): Canaanite Mot in Prophecy and Apocalypse." Pages 205-15 in *New Heaven and New Earth Prophecy and the Millennium: Essays in Honour of Anthony Gelston*. Edited by P. J. Harland and Robert Hayward. Boston: Brill, 1999.
- Helyer, Larry R. *Exploring Jewish Literature of the Second Temple Period: A Guide for New Testament Students*. Downer Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2002.
- Herzer, Jens. *4 Baruch (Paraleipomena Jeremiou)*. Writings from the Greco-Roman World 22. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2005.
- Hillers, Roy. "Burial." Page 291 in vol. 4 of *Encyclopaedia Judaica. Second Edition*. Edited by Fred Skolnik. 22 vols. Detroit: Thomson Gale, 2007.
- Hobbins, John F. "Resurrection in the Daniel Tradition and other Writings at Qumran." Pages 395-420 in vol. 2 of *The Book of Daniel: Composition and Reception*. Edited by John J. Collins and Peter W. Flint. 2 vols. Boston: Brill, 2002.
- Hodgens, David. "Our Resurrection Body: An Exegesis of 1 Corinthians 15:42-49." *Melanesian Journal of Theology* 17 (2001): 65-91.
- Hollander, Harm W., and Marinus De Jonge. *The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs: A Commentary*. Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha 8. Leiden: Brill, 1985.
- Horbury, William. "The Wisdom of Solomon." Pages 650-667 in *The Oxford Bible Commentary*. Edited by John Barton and John Muddiman. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Horbury, William, W. D. Davies, and John Sturdy, eds. *The Cambridge History of Judaism: The Early Roman Period*. Vol. 3 of The Cambridge History of Judaism. Edited by W. D. Davies and L. Finkelstein. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Hyman, Aaron, and Arthur B. Hyman. *Torah HaKethubah VeHamessurah: A Reference Book of the Scriptural Passages Quoted in Talmudic, Midrashic and Early Rabbinic Literature, Compiled by the Late Rabbi Aaron Hyman [Hebrew]*. 2nd. rev. enlarged ed. 3 vols. Tel-Aviv: Dvir, 1979.
- Illman, Karl-Johan. *Old Testament Formulas about Death*. Åbo: Åbo Akademi University, 1979.

Instone-Brewer, David. "Hermeneutics, Theology of." Pages 292-316 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.

_____. *Prayer and Agriculture*. Traditions of the Rabbis from the Era of the New Testament 1. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2004.

_____. *Techniques and Assumptions in Jewish Exegesis Before 70 CE*. Texte und Studien zum Antiken Judentum 30. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1992.

Mack, Burton L. *Wisdom and the Hebrew Epic: Ben Sira's Hymn in Praise of the Fathers*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985.

Jacobson, Howard. "Pseudo-Philo, Book of Biblical Antiquities." Pages 470-613 in vol. 1 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.

Jewish Encyclopedia. "Apocalyptic Literature, Neo-Hebraic." No pages. Cited 17 April 2013. Online: <http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/1643-apocalyptic-literature-neo-hebraic>.

Jobes, Karen H., and Moisés Silva. *Invitation to the Septuagint*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2000.

Johnson, Christopher Jay, and Marsha G. McGee, eds. *Encounters with Eternity: Religious Views of Death and Life After Death*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1986.

_____. *How Different Religions View Death and Afterlife*. Philadelphia: Charles Press, 1991.

Johnson, Sherman E. "The Preaching to the Dead." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 79 (March 1960): 48-51.

Johnston, Philip S. "Afterlife." Pages 5-8 in *Dictionary of the Old Testament: Wisdom, Poetry and Writings*. Edited by Tremper Longman III and Peter Enns. Downer Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008.

_____. *Shades of Sheol: Death and Afterlife in the Old Testament*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2002.

- Jonge, Marinus. *Jewish Eschatology: Early Christian Christology and the Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs*. Supplements to Novum Testamentum 63. Leiden: Brill, 1991.
- Josephus, Flavius. *The Works of Josephus: Complete and Unabridged*. Translated by William Whiston. New updated ed. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1988.
- Judaica, Editorial Staff Encyclopaedia. "Afterlife." *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. Judaica Multimedia Version 1.0. 1997. Print ed.: Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigodan, eds. *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 26 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1972-1994.
- _____. "Death." *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. Judaica Multimedia Version 1.0. 1997. Print ed.: Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigodan, eds. *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 26 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1972-1994.
- _____. "Soul, Immortality of: In the Bible." *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. Judaica Multimedia Version 1.0. 1997. Print ed.: Cecil Roth and Geoffrey Wigodan, eds. *Encyclopaedia Judaica*. 26 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1972-1994.
- Juel, Donald H. "Interpreting Israel's Scriptures in the New Testament." Pages 283-303 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- Kaiser, Otto. *The Old Testament Apocrypha: An Introduction*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Kasher, Rimon. "The Interpretation of Scripture in Rabbinic Literature." Pages 547-594 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Katz, Steven T., ed. *The Cambridge History of Judaism: The Late Roman-Rabbinic Period*. Vol. 4 of The Cambridge History of Judaism. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Kearns, Conleth. "Ecclesiasticus, or the Wisdom of Jesus the Son of Sirach," Pages 541-562 in *A New Catholic Commentary on Holy Scripture*. Edited by R. C. Fuller. London: Nelson, 1969.
- _____. *The Expanded Text of Ecclesiasticus: Its' Teaching on the Future Life as a Clue to Its' Origin*. Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Studies, Berlin. de Gruyter, 2011.

- Kee, Howard Clark. "Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs." Pages 1200-1205 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 775-828 in vol. 1 of *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- _____, ed. *Cambridge Annotated Study Apocrypha: New Revised Standard Version*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Kern-Ulmer, Rivka B. "Hermeneutics, Techniques of Rabbinic Exegesis." Pages 268-292 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- _____. "Theological Foundations of Rabbinic Exegesis." Pages 944-964 in vol. 2 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Kim, Daewoong, "Wisdom and Apocalyptic in 2 Baruch." *Henoch* 33 (2011): 250-274.
- Klassen, William. "Joseph and Aseneth." Pages 588-589 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Knibb, M. A. "Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 143-176 in vol. 2 of *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Knight, Chris H. "The Rechabites Revisited: The History of the Rechabites Twenty-Five Years On." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 23, no. 4 (June 2014): 290-306.
- Knight, Jonathan M. "Ascension of Isaiah." Pages 129-130 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Testament of Abraham." Pages 1188-1189 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *The Ascension of Isaiah*. Guides to the Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1995.

- Kohlenberger, John R. III., ed. *The Parallel Apocrypha*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Kolarcik, Michael. *The Ambiguity of Death in the Book of Wisdom 1-6: A Study of Literary Structure and Interpretation*. Analecta Biblica 127. Roma: Pontificio Istituto Biblico, 1991.
- Kolenkow, Anitra Bingham. "The Genre Testament and the Testament of Abraham." Pages 139-162 in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*. Edited by George W. E. Nickelsburg. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976.
- Kraemer, David Charles. *The Meanings of Death in Rabbinic Judaism*. New York: Routledge, 2000.
- Kraft, Robert A. "Reassessing the 'Recensional Problem' in Testament of Abraham." Pages 121-137 in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*. Edited by George W. E. Nickelsburg. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976.
- Kramer, Kenneth. *The Sacred Art of Dying: How World Religions Understand Death*. New York: Paulist, 1988.
- Kreitzer, L. J. "Resurrection." Pages 806-812 in *Dictionary of Paul and His Letters*. Edited by Gerald F. Hawthorne, Ralph P. Martin and Daniel G. Reid. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1993.
- Kugel, James L. "Early Jewish Biblical Interpretation." Pages 121-141 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- _____. "Jubilees." Pages 272-465 in vol. 1 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- _____. "Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs." Pages 1697-1855 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Kugler, Robert A. "Testaments." Pages 1295-1297 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.

- _____. *The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*. Edited by Michael A. Knibb. Guides to Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 2001.
- Kwon, Ohyun. "The Formation and Development of Resurrection Faith in Early Judaism." PhD diss., New York University, 1984.
- Laato, Antti and Johannes C. de More, eds. *Theodicy in the World of the Bible: The Goodness of God and the Problem of Evil*. Leiden: Brill, 2003.
- Ladd, G. E. "Pseudepigrapha." Pages 1040-1043 in vol. 3 of *The New International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*. Edited by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 4 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1986.
- Lampe, Peter. "Paul's Concept of a Spiritual Body." Pages 103-114 in *Resurrection: Theological and Scientific Assessments*. Edited by Ted Peters, Robert John Russell and Michael Welker. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2002.
- Lattke, Michael. "Psalms of Solomon." Pages 853-857 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *Odes of Solomon*. Hermeneia. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2009.
- Lee, Thomas R. *Studies in the Form of Sirach 44-50*. Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series 75. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1986.
- Lesko, Leonard H. "Death and Afterlife in Ancient Egyptian Thought." Pages 1763-74 in vol. 2 of *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East*. Edited by Jack M. Sasson. 2 vols. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1995.
- Levenson, Jéon Douglas. *The Death and Resurrection of the Beloved Son: The Transformation of Child Sacrifice in Judaism and Christianity*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Levenson, Jon Douglas. *Resurrection and the Restoration of Israel: The Ultimate Victory of the God of Life*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006.
- Levine, Amy-Jill. *Short Stories by Jesus: The Enigmatic Parables of a Controversial Rabbi*. Pbk ed. New York: HarperOne, 2015.
- Levison, J. R. "Adam and Eve, Literature Concerning." Pages 1-6 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.

- Lied, Liv Ingeborg. "Recognizing the Righteous Remnant? Resurrection, Recognition and Eschatological Reversal in 2 Baruch 47-52." Pages 311-335 in *Metamorphoses: Resurrection, Body and Transformative Practices in Early Christianity*. Edited by Turid Karlsen Seim and Jorunn Økland. New York: de Gryter, 2009.
- Linebaugh, Jonathan A. *God, Grace, and Righteousness in Wisdom of Solomon and Paul's Letter to the Romans: Texts in Conversation*. Novum Testamentum Supplements 152. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Longenecker, Bruce W. *2 Esdras*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1995.
- Longenecker, Richard N. *Life in the Face of Death: The Resurrection Message of the New Testament*. McMaster New Testament Studies. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998.
- Lunt, H. G. "Ladder of Jacob: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 401-411 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Maccoby, H. "Rabbinic Literature: Talmud." Pages 897-902 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Madigan, Kevin, and Jon Douglas Levenson. *Resurrection: The Power of God for Christians and Jews*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.
- Markos, Louis. *Heaven and Hell: Visions of the Afterlife in the Western Poetic Tradition*. Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2013.
- Marmorstein, Arthur. *Studies in Jewish Theology: The Arthur Marmorstein Memorial Volume*. Edited by J. Rabbinowitz and M. S. Lew. Essay Index Reprint Series. Freeport, NY: Books for Libraries Press, 1972.
- Martin-Achard, Robert. *From Death to Life: A Study of the Development of the Doctrine of the Resurrection in the Old Testament*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1960.
- _____. "Resurrection: Old Testament." Pages 681-85 in vol. 5 of *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Expanded. Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1996.
- Ma'sâumiân, Farnâaz. *Life After Death: A Study of the Afterlife in World Religions*. Rockport, MA: Oneword, 1995.

- Mason, Steve. "Josephus: Value for New Testament Study." Pages 596-600 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Theologies and Sects, Jewish." Pages 1221-1230 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *Understanding Josephus: Seven Perspectives*. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha: Supplement Series 32. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1998.
- McGlynn, Moyna. *Divine Judgment and Divine Benevolence in the Book of Wisdom*. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament II 139. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001.
- McNamara, Martin. "Interpretation of Scripture in the Targumim." Pages 167-197 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- _____. *Targum and Testament Revisited: Aramaic Paraphrases of the Hebrew Bible*. 2nd ed. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Meier, John P. "Critical Notes: The Grammar of Resurrection in Isaiah 26:19a-c." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 122 (2003): 145-55.
- Mendels, Doron. "Why Paul Went West: The Difference Between the Jewish Diasporas." *Biblical Archaeology Review* 37, no. 1 (Jan/Feb 2011): 49-54, 68.
- Menn, Esther. "Inner-Biblical Exegesis in the Tanak." Pages 55-79 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- Mitchell, David C. "A Dying and Rising Josephite Messiah in 4Q372." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 18, no. 3 (2009): 181-205.
- Morris, Leon. "Hebrews." Pages 3-158 in vol. 12 of *The Expositor's Bible Commentary*. Edited by Frank E. Gæbelein. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1981.
- Mueller, James R. *The Five Fragments of the Apocryphon of Ezekiel: A Critical Study*. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series 5. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1994.

- Muller, R. A. "Resurrection." Pages 145-150 in vol. 4 of *The New International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*. Edited by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 4 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1988.
- Murphy, Frederick J. *Early Judaism: The Exile to the Time of Jesus*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002.
- Myers, Jacob M. *I and II Esdras*. Anchor Bible 42. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1974.
- Nagakubo, Senzo. "Investigation into Jewish Concepts of Afterlife in the Beth She'arim Greek Inscriptions." PhD diss., Duke University, 1974.
- Neusner, Jacob. "Judaism, History of, Part III: Late Antiquity." Pages 617-32 in vol. 2 of *The Encyclopaedia of Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner, Alan J. Avery-Peck, and William Scott Green. 5 vols. Boston: Brill, 2000.
- _____. "Rabbinic Literature: Mishnah and Tosefta." Pages 893-897 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *The Tosefta: Translated from the Hebrew with a New Introduction*. 2 vols. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002.
- Neusner, Jacob, and Bruce Chilton. *Jewish and Christian Doctrines: The Classics Compared*. New York: Routledge, 2000.
- Nielsburg, George W. E. *1 Enoch 1: A Commentary on the Book of 1 Enoch, Chapters 1-36: 81-108*. Hermeneia. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2001.
- _____. "Eschatology in the Testament of Abraham: A Study of the Judgment Scene in the Two Recensions." Pages 23-64 in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*. Edited by George W. E. Nielsburg. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976.
- _____. *Jewish Literature Between the Bible and the Mishnah*. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981.
- _____. "Resurrection." Pages 1142-1144 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- _____. *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism and Early Christianity*. Harvard Theological Studies 56. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2006.

- _____. "Resurrection: Early Judaism and Christianity." Pages 685-92 in vol. 5 of *Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Expanded. Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1996.
- _____. "Stories of Biblical and Early Post-Biblical Times." Pages 33-87 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. "Structure and Message in the Testament of Abraham." Pages 85-83 in *Studies on the Testament of Abraham*. Edited by George W. E. Nickelsburg. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976.
- _____. "The Bible Rewritten and Expanded." Pages 89-156 in Stone, Michael, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____, ed. *Studies in the Testament of Abraham*. Society of Biblical Literature Septuagint and Cognate Studies 6. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1976.
- Nickelsburg, George W. E., and James C. VanderKam. *1 Enoch 2: A Commentary on the Book of 1 Enoch, Chapters 37-82*. Hermeneia. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2012.
- Nickelsburg, George W. E., and Michael E. Stone. *Early Judaism: Texts and Documents on Faith and Piety*. Rev. ed. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2009.
- Novak, Michael Anthony. "The Odes of Solomon as Apocalyptic Literature." *Vigiliae Christianae* 66 (2012): 527-550.
- O'Donnell, Matthew Brook. "Some New Testament Words for Resurrection and the Company They Keep." Pages 136-163 in *Resurrection*. Edited by Stanly E. Porter, Michael A. Hayes and David Tombs. Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series 186. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic, 1999.
- Obayashi, Hiroshi. *Death and Afterlife: Perspectives of World Religions*. Contributions to the Study of Religion 33. New York: Greenwood Press, 1992.
- Odeberg, Hugo. *3 Enoch or The Hebrew Book of Enoch*. Library of Biblical Studies. New York: Ktav, 1973.
- Olyan, Saul M. *Biblical Mourning: Ritual and Social Dimensions*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.

- _____. "Some Neglected Aspects of Israelite Interment Ideology." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 124 (2005): 601-616.
- Orlov, Andrei A. "The Face as the Heavenly Counterpart of the Visionary in the Slavonic *Ladder of Jacob*." Pages 59-76 in *Of Scribes and Sages*. Edited by C. Evans. London: T&T Clark/Continuum, 2004.
- Osborne, Grant R. "Resurrection." Pages 673-688 in *Dictionary of Jesus and the Gospels*. Edited by Joel B. Green, Scot McKnight and I. Howard Marshall. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1992.
- _____. "Resurrection." Pages 931-936 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Park, Joseph S. *Conceptions of Afterlife in Jewish Inscriptions: With Special Reference to Pauline Literature*. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. Second Series 121. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2000.
- Patte, Daniel. *Early Jewish Hermeneutic in Palestine*. Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series 22. Missoula, MT.: Society of Biblical Literature and Scholars Press, 1975.
- Pauline, Jon. *Decoding Revelation's Trumpets: Literary Allusions and the Interpretation of Revelation 8:7-12*. Andrews University Seminary Doctoral Dissertation Series 11. Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University Press, 1988.
- Penelhum, Terence. "Christianity." Pages 11-30 in *Life after Death in World Religions*. Edited by Harold G. Coward. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Penner, Ken, and Michael S. Heiser. "Old Testament Greek Pseudepigrapha with Morphology." Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2008.
- Perkins, Pheme. *Resurrection: New Testament Witness and Contemporary Reflection*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1984.
- Philo. *The Works of Philo: Complete and Unabridged*. Translated by Charles Duke Yonge. New Updated ed. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1993.
- Phua, M. "Sirach, Book of." Pages 720-728 in *Dictionary of the Old Testament: Wisdom, Poetry and Writings*. Edited by Tremper Longman III and Peter Enns. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008.

- Porter, Stanley E. "Resurrection, the Greeks and the New Testament." Pages 52-81 in *Resurrection*. Edited by Stanley E. Porter, Michael A. Hayes and David Tombs. Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series 186. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic, 1999.
- _____. "Septuagint/Greek Old Testament." Pages 1099-1106 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Porton, Gary G. "Hermeneutics, A Critical Approach." Pages 250-268 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- _____. "Rabbinic Literature: Midrashim." Pages 889-893 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Rabbinic Midrash." Pages 198-224 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- Price, Robert M. "New Testament Narrative as Old Testament Midrash." Pages 534-574 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Priest, John. "Testament of Moses: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 919-934 in vol.1 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Pryce, Bertrand C. "The Resurrection Motif in Hos 5:8-6:6: An Exegetical Study." PhD diss., Andrews University, 1989.
- Puech, Émile. "Ben Sira 48:11 et la Résurrection." Pages 81-89 in *Of Scribes and Scrolls: Studies on the Hebrew Bible, Intertestamental Judaism, and Christian Origins, Presented to John Strugnell on the Occasion of His Sixtieth Birthday*. Edited by Harold W. Attridge, John J. Collins, and Thomas H. Tobin. Lanham, MD: University of America, 1990.
- _____. "Death." Pages 183-86 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls*. Edited by Lawrence H. Schiffman and James C. VanderKam. 2 vols. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Raphael, Simcha Paull. *Jewish Views of the Afterlife*. Northvale, NJ: J. Aronson, 1994.

- Reed, Annette Yoshiko. "Testament of Abraham." Pages 1671-1696 in vol. 1 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Reese, J. M. *Hellenistic Influence on the Book of Wisdom and Its Consequences*. Analecta Bible 41; Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1971.
- Reeves, John C. "Sefer Elijah." Online:
<http://clas-pages.uncc.edu/john-reeves/research-projects/assorted-near-eastern-apocalypses/sefer-elijah>.
- Riemer, Jack, and Sherwin B. Nuland. *Jewish Insights on Death and Mourning*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2002.
- Robinson, Stephen Edward. "4 Baruch: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 413-425 in vol. 2 of *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- _____. "Baruch, Book of 4." Pages 622 in vol. 1 of *Anchor Yale Bible Dictionary*. Edited by David Noel Freedman. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
- _____. "Testament of Adam: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 989-995 in vol. 1 of *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- _____. *The Testament of Adam: An Examination of the Syriac and Greek Traditions*. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1980.
- Rodriguez, Angel Manuel. "The Heavenly Book of Life and of Human Deeds." *Journal of the Adventist Theological Society* 13, no. 1 (Spring 2002): 10-26.
- Russel, D. S. *The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic*. The Old Testament Library. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1964.
- Sailhamer, John H. *The Pentateuch as Narrative: A Biblical-Theological Commentary*. Library of Biblical Interpretation. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1992.
- Saldarini, Anthony J. "Apocalypses and 'Apocalyptic' in Rabbinic Literature and Mysticism." *Semeia* 14 (1979): 187-206.
- Sanders, E. P. *Judaism: Practice and Belief 63 BCE-66CE*. Philadelphia: Trinity Press, 1992.

- _____. "Testament of Abraham: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 871-902 in vol. 1 of *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Sanders, James A. "The Stabilization of the Tanak." Pages 225-252 in *A History of Biblical Interpretation: Volume 1 - The Ancient Period*. Edited by Alan J. Hauser and Duane F. Watson. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- Sawyer, John A. "Hebrew Words for the Resurrection of the Dead." *Vetus Testamentum* 23 (1973): 18-34.
- Schaper, Joachim. *Eschatology in the Greek Psalter*. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. Second Series 76. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1995.
- Schmitz, Philip C. "The Grammar of Resurrection in Isaiah 26:19a-c." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 122 (2003): 145-49.
- Scott, J. Julius, Jr. *Jewish Backgrounds of the New Testament*. Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 1995.
- _____. "Paul and Late-Jewish Eschatology: A Case Study, I Thessalonians 4:13-18 and II Thessalonians 2:1-12." *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 15 (1972): 133-143.
- Scurlock, JoAnn. "Death and Afterlife in Ancient Mesopotamian Thought." Pages 1883-93 in vol. 2 of *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East*. Edited by Jack M. Sasson. 2 vols. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1995.
- Segal, Alan F. *Life After Death: A History of the Afterlife in the Religions of the West*. New York: Doubleday, 2004.
- Segal, Eliezer. "Judaism." Pages 11-30 in *Life After Death in World Religions*. Edited by Harold G. Coward. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Setzer, Claudia. *Resurrection of the Body in Early Judaism and Early Christianity: Doctrine, Community, and Self-Definition*. Boston: Brill, 2004.
- Siebeneck, Robert T. "May Their Bones Return to Life! – Sirach's Praise of the Fathers." *The Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 21 (1961): 411-428.
- Siebert, Folker. "Hellenistic Jewish Midrash, I: Beginnings." Pages 199-220 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.

- _____. "Hellenistic Jewish Midrash, III: Developed Non-Allegorical Forms. Josephus." Pages 232-250 in vol. 1 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Sievers, Joseph. "Josephus and the Afterlife." Pages 20-34 in *Understanding Josephus: Seven Perspectives*. Edited by Steve Mason. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha: Supplement Series 32. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1998.
- Sigvartsen, Jan. A. "Messiah Son of Joseph: Genesis 49:22-26." MA Thesis, Andrews University, 1998.
- _____. "The Afterlife in the Apocalyptic Literature of Second Temple Period Judaism." Paper presented at the Midwest Region Society of Biblical Literature, Olivet Nazarene University, Bourbonnais, IL, 8 February 2015.
- _____. "The Creation Order - Hierarchical or Egalitarian?" *Andrews University Seminary Studies* 53 (Spring 2015): 127-142.
- Skarsaune, Oskar. *In the Shadow of the Temple: Jewish Influences on Early Christianity*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2002.
- Skehan, Patrick W., and Alexander A. Di Lella. *The Wisdom of Ben Sira*. Anchor Bible 39. New York: Doubleday, 1987.
- Slingerland, H. Dixon. *The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs: A Critical History of Research*. Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series 21. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press for the Society of Biblical Literature, 1977.
- Snodgrass, Klyne R. *Stories with Intent: A Comprehensive Guide to the Parables of Jesus* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008)
- Sonsino, Rifat, and Daniel B. Syme. *What Happens After I Die? Jewish Views of Life After Death*. New York: UAHC Press, 1990.
- Spero, Shubert. "Sons of God, Daughters of Men?" *Jewish Bible Quarterly* 40, no. 1 (January-March 2012): 15-18.
- Spittler, Russel P. "Testament of Job." *Dictionary of New Testament Background*, 1189-1192.
- _____. "Testament of Job." Pages 829-868 in vol. 1 of *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1983.

- Spronk, Klaas. *Beatific Afterlife in Ancient Israel and in the Ancient Near East*. Edited by Kurt Bergerhof, Mandried Dietrich, and Oswald Loretz. Alter Orient und Altes Testament 219. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 1986.
- Steiner, Richard C. *Disembodied Souls: The Nefesh in Israel and Kindred Spirits in the Ancient Near East, with an Appendix on the Katumuwa Inscription*. Society of Biblical Literature: Ancient Near East Monographs 11. Edited by Ehud Ben Zvi. Atlanta: SBL Press, 2015.
- Stele, Arthur A. "Resurrection in Daniel 12 and Its Contribution to the Theology of the Book of Daniel." PhD diss., Andrews University, 1996.
- Stemberger, Günter. *Jewish Contemporaries of Jesus: Pharisees, Sadducees, Essenes*. Translated by Allan W. Mahnke. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1995.
- Stone, Michael E. *A Textual Commentary on the Armenian Version of IV Ezra*. Society of Biblical Literature Septuagint and Cognate Studies Series 34. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1990.
- _____. "Apocalyptic Literature." Pages 383-441 in *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Edited by Michael Stone. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. *Features of the Eschatology of IV Ezra*. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1989.
- _____. *Fourth Ezra: A Commentary on the Book of Fourth Ezra*. Hermeneia. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1990.
- _____, ed. *Jewish Writings of the Second Temple Period: Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha, Qumran Sectarian Writings, Philo, Josephus*. Compendia Rerum Iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum 2. Assen: Van Gorcum; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1984.
- _____. "Pseudepigrapha." Pages 710-712 in *Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible: Supplementary Volume*. Edited by K. Crim. Nashville: Abingdon, 1976.
- _____. *Selected Studies in Pseudepigrapha and Apocrypha: With Special Reference to the Armenian Tradition*. Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha 9. New York: Brill, 1991.
- Stone, Michael E., and Matthias Henze. *4 Ezra and 2 Baruch: Translation, Introduction, and Notes*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2013.

- Stuckenbruck, Loren T. "Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha." Pages 143-162 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Sysling, Harry. *Tehiyyat Ha-Metim: The Resurrection of the Dead in the Palestinian Targums of the Pentateuch and Parallel Traditions in Classical Rabbinic Literature*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1996.
- Tal, Abraham. "The Samaritan Targum of the Pentateuch." Pages 189-216 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Tanzer, Sarah J. "A View from History: The Place of the Apocrypha in the Jewish Community." Pages xxi-xxvi in *The Parallel Apocrypha*. Edited by John R. Kohlenberger III. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Thielicke, Helmut. *Death and Life*. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1970.
- Tigheelaar, Eibert. "The Dead Sea Scrolls." Pages 163-180 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Torijano, Pablo. "4 Baruch." Pages 2662-2680 in vol. 3 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- Torrey, Charles Cutler. *The Apocryphal Literature: A Brief Introduction*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1945.
- Tov, Emanuel. "The Septuagint." Pages 161-188 in *Mikra: Text, Translation, Reading and Interpretation of the Hebrew Bible in Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity*. Edited by Martin Jan Mulder and Harry Sysling. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004.
- Trebilco, P. R., and C. A. Evans. "Diaspora Judaism." Pages 281-296 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Tromp, Nicholas J., and Pontificio Istituto Biblico. *Primitive Conceptions of Death and the Nether World in the Old Testament*. Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1969.

- Van der Horst, Pieter W. "Greek Synagogal Prayers." Pages 2110-2137 in vol. 2 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- _____. "Jewish Literature: Historians and Poets." Pages 580-584 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Pseudo-Phocylides: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 565-582 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. New York: Doubleday, 1985.
- _____. "Pseudo-Phocylides on the Afterlife: A Rejoinder to John Collins." *Journal for the Study of Judaism* 35, no. 1 (January 2004): 70-75.
- _____. "Pseudo-Phocylides, Sentences." Pages 2353-2361 in vol. 3 of *Outside the Bible: Ancient Jewish Writings Related to Scripture*. Edited by Louis H. Feldman, James L. Kugel, and Lawrence H. Schiffman. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 2013.
- _____. *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*. Leiden: Brill, 1978.
- Van der Horst, Pieter W., and Judith H. Newman. *Early Jewish Prayers in Greek: A Commentary*. Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature. Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008.
- VanderKam, James C. *An Introduction to Early Judaism*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001.
- _____. *From Joshua to Caiaphas: High Priests after the Exile*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2004.
- _____. "Jubilees." Pages 600-603 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "Prophecy and Apocalypics in the Ancient Near East." Pages 2083-94 in vol. 2 of *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East*. Edited by Jack M. Sasson. 2 vols. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1995.
- _____. *The Book of Jubilees*. Edited by Michael A. Knibb. Guides to Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 2001.

- VanderKam, James C., and William Adler. *The Jewish Apocalyptic Heritage in Early Christianity*. Compendia Rerum Iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum (Sec. 3 vol. 4). Minneapolis: Fortress, 1996.
- VanGemeren, Willem, ed. *New International Dictionary of Old Testament Theology & Exegesis*. 5 vols. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1997.
- Veltri, Giuseppe. "Septuagint, Midrashic Traditions and." Pages 777-802 in vol. 2 of *Encyclopedia of Midrash: Biblical Interpretation in Formative Judaism*. Edited by Jacob Neusner and Alan J. Avery Peck. Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Vermès, Géza. *The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English*. New York: Penguin Press, 1997.
- Vetne, Reimar. "The Influence and Use of Daniel in the Synoptic Gospels." PhD diss., Andrews University Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 2011.
- Voicu, Sever J., ed. *Apocrypha*. Ancient Christian Commentary on Scripture 15. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2010.
- Wacker, Marie-Theres. *Weltordnung und Gericht: Studien zu 1 Henoch 22*. Forschung zur Bibel 45. Würzburg: Echter, 1982.
- Washburn, David L. *A Catalog of Biblical Passages in the Dead Sea Scrolls*. Text-Critical Studies 2. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2002.
- Watts, John D. W. *Isaiah 1-33*. Word Biblical Commentary 24. Dallas: Word, 2002.
- Wilson, Walter T. "Hellenistic Judaism." Pages 477-482 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. *The Sentences of Pseudo-Phocylides*. Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature. New York: de Gruyter, 2005.
- Winston, David. "Creation Ex Nihilo Revisited: A Reply to Jonathan Goldstein." *Journal of Jewish Studies* 37 (1986): 88-91.
- _____. *The Wisdom of Solomon*. Anchor Bible 43. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1979.

- Wintermute, Orval S. "Apocalypse of Elijah." Pages 721-753 in vol. 1 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. 2 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- _____. "Elijah, Apocalypse of." Pages 466-469 in vol. 2 of *Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Edited by D. N. Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
- _____. "Jubilees: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 35-142 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. 2 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Wise, M. O. "Dead Sea Scrolls: General Introduction." Pages 252-266 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- Walton, John H. "Job 1: Book of," Pages 333-346 in *Dictionary of the Old Testament: Wisdom, Poetry and Writings*. Edited by Tremper Longman III and Peter Enns. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008.
- Wright, Benjamin G. *No Small Difference: Sirach's Relationship to Its Hebrew Parent Text*. Society of Biblical Literature: Septuagint and Cognate Studies Series 26. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1989.
- Wright, J. Edward. "Esdras, Books of." Pages 337-340 in *Dictionary of New Testament Background*. Edited by Craig A. Evans and Stanley E. Porter. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2000.
- _____. "The Social Setting of the Syriac Apocalypse of Baruch." *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 16 (1997): 81-96.
- Wright, N. T. "Jesus' Resurrection and Christian Origins." *Gregorianum* 83 (2002): 615-35.
- _____. "The Resurrection of Resurrection." *Bible Review* 16, no. 4 (August 2000): 10, 63.
- _____. *The Resurrection of the Son of God*. Vol. 3 of Christian Origins and the Question of God. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2003.
- Wright, Robert B. *The Psalms of Solomon: A Critical Edition of the Greek Text*. Jewish and Christian Texts in Contexts and Related Studies 1. New York: T&T Clark, 2007.

- _____. "Psalms of Solomon: A New Translation and Introduction." Pages 639-670 in vol. 2 of *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. 2 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Wyllen, Stephen M. *The Jews in the Time of Jesus: An Introduction*. New York: Paulist, 1996.
- Wyrick, Jed. "Pseudepigrapha." Pages 1114-1117 in *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*. Edited by John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Xella, Paolo. "Death and Afterlife in Canaanite and Hebrew Thought." Pages 2059-70 in vol. 2 of *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East*. Edited by Jack M. Sasson. 2 vols. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1995.
- Yadin, Yigael. *The Ben Sira Scroll from Masade: With Introduction, Emendations and Commentary*. Jerusalem: Israel Exploration Society and the Shrine of the Book, 1965.
- Yamauchi, Edwin. "Life, Death, and Afterlife in the Ancient Near East." Pages 21-50 in *Life in the Face of Death: The Resurrection Message of the New Testament*. Edited by Richard N. Longenecker. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998.
- Yehudah, Joshua. *Le monothéisme doctrine de l'unité*. Geneva, 1952.
- Young, Brad. *The Parables: Jewish Tradition and Christian Interpretation*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1998.

VITA

Since 2008, Jan Sigvartsen has taught at the Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, the Religion and Biblical Languages Department, and the School of Distance Education at Andrews University. Possessing three areas of specialty, Old Testament Exegesis, Early Judaism/Second Temple Period Literature, and Biblical Archeology, his research focus is the use of the Tanakh in the development of the resurrection concept in the literature of the

Second Temple Period and Early Rabbinic Judaism. Jan also spent two years as a Visiting Research Fellow at Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel. For a full CV and publication list, see www.jansigvartsen.com.

For the past four years, he has also been a primary researcher in the global [Beyond Beliefs study](#) which is investigating Millennial young adults' responses to the official 28 Beliefs of the Seventh-day Adventist church and over 100 social, behavioral, and religious issues. His main contribution to this study was to develop a curriculum, textbook, and electronic teaching resources to teach these 28 Beliefs as a university General Education class, with an emphasis on content retention and the development of critical thought.

Jan is best known for his biblical exegesis research website ExegesisPaper.com, which is currently the most visited site on the internet relating to how to write scholarly exegesis papers and receives over 23,000 visitors a year from over 150 countries. Jan also started ClergyEd.com, a free website which allows academics and students of ministry disciplines around the world to share teaching resources and build a collaborative scholarly community.