Andrews University

Digital Commons @ Andrews University

Dissertations

Graduate Research

1993

The Concept of God and Sacred Music Style : an Intercultural Exploration of Divine Transcendence/Immanence as a Stylistic Determinant for Worship Music with Paradigmatic Implications for the Contemporary Christian Context

Wolfgang Hans Stefani
Andrews University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations>

Part of the [Christian Denominations and Sects Commons](#), and the [Religious Thought, Theology and Philosophy of Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Stefani, Wolfgang Hans, "The Concept of God and Sacred Music Style : an Intercultural Exploration of Divine Transcendence/Immanence as a Stylistic Determinant for Worship Music with Paradigmatic Implications for the Contemporary Christian Context" (1993). *Dissertations*. 714.
<https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations/714>
<https://dx.doi.org/10.32597/dissertations/714>

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Research at Digital Commons @ Andrews University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Andrews University. For more information, please contact repository@andrews.edu.

Seek Knowledge. Affirm Faith. Change the World.

Thank you for your interest in the

**Andrews University Digital Library
of Dissertations and Theses.**

*Please honor the copyright of this document by
not duplicating or distributing additional copies
in any form without the author's express written
permission. Thanks for your cooperation.*

INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

U·M·I

University Microfilms International
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600

Order Number 9418108

**The concept of God and sacred music style: An intercultural
exploration of divine transcendence/immanence as a stylistic
determinant for worship music with paradigmatic implications
for the contemporary Christian context**

Stefani, Wolfgang Hans Martin, Ph.D.

Andrews University, 1993

Copyright ©1993 by Stefani, Wolfgang Hans Martin. All rights reserved.

U·M·I
300 N. Zeeb Rd.
Ann Arbor, MI 48106

Andrews University
School of Education

THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE: AN INTERCULTURAL
EXPLORATION OF DIVINE TRANSCENDENCE/IMMANENCE
AS A STYLISTIC DETERMINANT FOR WORSHIP
MUSIC WITH PARADIGMATIC IMPLICATIONS
FOR THE CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN
CONTEXT

A Dissertation
Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by
Wolfgang Hans Martin Stefani
October 1993

*Copyright by Wolfgang Hans Martin Stefani 1993
All Rights Reserved

THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE: AN INTERCULTURAL
EXPLORATION OF DIVINE TRANSCENDENCE/IMMANENCE
AS A STYLISTIC DETERMINANT FOR WORSHIP
MUSIC WITH PARADIGMATIC IMPLICATIONS
FOR THE CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN
CONTEXT

A dissertation
presented in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by

Wolfgang Hans Martin Stefani

APPROVAL BY THE COMMITTEE:

Chair: Roy C. Naden

Director, Graduate Programs

Member: George Akers

Dean, School of Education

Member: C. Warren Becker

External: Calvin M. Johansson

Date approved

ABSTRACT

THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE: AN INTERCULTURAL
EXPLORATION OF DIVINE TRANSCENDENCE/IMMANENCE
AS A STYLISTIC DETERMINANT FOR WORSHIP
MUSIC WITH PARADIGMATIC IMPLICATIONS
FOR THE CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN
CONTEXT

by

Wolfgang Hans Martin Stefani

Chair: Roy C. Naden

ABSTRACT OF GRADUATE STUDENT RESEARCH

Dissertation

Andrews University

School of Education

Title: THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE: AN INTERCULTURAL
EXPLORATION OF DIVINE TRANSCENDENCE/ IMMANENCE AS A STYLISTIC
DETERMINANT FOR WORSHIP MUSIC WITH PARADIGMATIC IMPLICATIONS
FOR THE CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN CONTEXT

Name of researcher: Wolfgang Hans Martin Stefani

Name and degree of faculty chair: Roy C. Naden, Ed.D.

Date completed: October 27, 1993

Problem

The conscious conservation of religious music style in most cultures contrasts with the stylistic pluralism of Western Christian worship music. This study addressed the problem of decision making within the diversity of music available for Christian worship.

Purpose of the Study

The study's purpose was to explore a core aspect of worldview concerning the nature of ultimate reality--the concept of divine transcendence/immanence--as a transcultural determinant of sacred music style. The focus was the music rather than associated lyrics.

Methodology and Sources

This interdisciplinary study followed a philosophical approach to develop a theoretical paradigm. Documentary research from the fields of historical musicology, sociology of music, sentics, philosophy of music, theology of music, ethnomusicology,

phenomenology of religion, and religious studies was incorporated to support the line of argument.

Findings

Evidence that music style is not religiously neutral is extensive. Documentation from the Islamic and traditional African contexts strongly suggests that their respective perceptions concerning divine transcendence or immanence are translated into aesthetic sensibilities that determine stylistic features of musical form, content, and performance practice.

The inherent Christian paradox regarding divine transcendence/immanence is a significant factor in the musical pluralism of Christian worship. The simultaneous manifestation of polar extremes in sacred music style, and the gradations in between, indicates the difficulty of maintaining the tension between polarities in Christian belief regarding the divine. There is evidence of a gradual shift from a transcendence to an immanence orientation in Western Christian belief, and a corresponding reflection in chosen worship music style. The extremes in emphasis can be related to the Islamic and traditional African religious contexts suggesting transcultural correlations.

Conclusions

Religio-philosophic determinants of sacred music style deserve wider acknowledgement and investigation in the sacred music debate. Rather than merely assessing cultural acceptability or aesthetic excellence, Christian evaluation of sacred music style should proceed on the basis of the worldview that birthed the expression. Given the significance of conceptions of the divine in the formation of sacred music style, Christian worship music should integrally embody the Christian concept of God, maintaining the inherent tension between transcendence and immanence. Hence, church music education is inseparable from religious education.

To Julie and Kristian

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	vii
LIST OF TABLES	vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	viii
Chapter	
I. MUSIC AND WORSHIP: THE PROBLEM	1
Introduction	1
Central African Religious Music	3
Islamic Sacred Sound Art	4
Hindu Religious Music	5
Christian Religious Music	6
Background to the Problem	8
The Contemporary Christian Discussion of Music in Worship	8
Approaches Currently Utilized	14
Aestheticism	14
The Influence of Music	16
Pragmatism	18
Theology of Music	21
Church Music and the Church's Mission	25
Church Music and Education	32
Phenomenology of Religion	42
Ethnomusicology	43
Western Musicology	45
Statement of the Problem	47
The Purpose of the Study	48
Methodology	51
Delimitations	57
Presuppositions	59
Metaphysical Presuppositions	60
An Axiological Presupposition	62
Epistemological Presuppositions	63
Definition of Terms	63
Organization of the Dissertation	64
II. WORLDVIEW AND THE DETERMINANTS OF MUSIC STYLE	65
Introduction	65
Worldview	67
Style	72
The Relationship Between Worldview and Artistic Style as It Relates to Music	75
Humanistic Theories	78
Theories Centered in the Human Being	79
The Apollonian/Dionysian antithesis	80
Ethos/pathos cycles	83
Personality types	85
Sentics	88
Psycho-pharmacological conditioning	94

Theories Centered in Human Society	96
Collective mentalities	99
Cantometrics/biosocial influences	102
Evaluation of Humanistic Theories	105
Naturalistic Theories	106
Theories Emphasizing the Cosmos	107
Conceptions of the cosmos	108
Theories Emphasizing the Terrestrial Order	111
Conceptions of the natural order	112
Biological considerations	114
Geographical considerations	115
Combination Naturalistic Theories	115
A socio-naturalistic theory	115
A religio-naturalistic outlook	116
Evaluation of Naturalistic Theories	118
Philosophical/Religious Theories	120
A Philosophical Theory: The	
<u>Geistesgeschichte</u> Approach	120
Religious Theories	124
The Hindu context	126
The Buddhist context	130
Oriental religious influence in	
contemporary Western music	131
Some general considerations	134
Evaluation of Religio-philosophic Theories	135
Western Musicological Scholarship and Religio-	
philosophical Explanations of Stylistic	
Development	136
The Process of Worldview Embodiment in Music	
Style	142
In a Composer's Creative Expression	142
In the Context of a Community	144
Under the Influence of a Religious	
Organization	145
Summary Observations	146
III. THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE: A CASE	
STUDY OF POLARITY	148
Introduction	148
The Transcendent/Immanent Concept of Deity	151
Islamic Sacred Sound Art and the Transcendent	
View of God	160
The Islamic View of God	161
The Relationship of Islamic Belief and	
Aesthetic Consciousness	161
<u>Tawhīd</u> and Islamic Sacred Sound Art Style	165
Characteristic of Content: Abstraction	170
Characteristic of Form: Infinite	
Patterning	172
Characteristic of Performance Practice:	
Monophonic Vocal Emphasis	174
Summary with an Exception	176
African Ritual Music and the Immanent View	
of God	178
The Traditional African View of God	179
The Relationship of Traditional African Belief	
and Aesthetic Consciousness	183
Immanent Deities and Ritual Music Style	194
Characteristics of Performance Practice:	
Percussive, Multi-dimensional Emphasis	199
Percussive quality	199

Performance media	200
Instruments	200
The human voice	202
The integration of movement and sound	203
Collective participation	204
Characteristic of Content: Danceable Rhythm	205
Rhythm	206
Characteristic of Form: Insistent Repetition	210
Summary	212
Confrontation of Traditional African Religion and Islām	213
Concluding Observations	213
IV. THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE: THE WESTERN CHRISTIAN CONTEXT	218
Introduction	218
The Christian Conception of Divinity	219
The Christian Concept of God and Aesthetic Consciousness	221
God Beyond Us	225
God For Us	229
God Beside Us/Within Us	232
The "God Beside Us" Emphasis	234
The "God Within Us" Emphasis	236
The Christian Concept of God and the Characteristics of Sacred Music Style	242
The "God Beyond Us" Orientation	242
The "God For Us" Orientation	247
The "God Beside Us/Within Us" Orientation	251
The "God Beside Us" Emphasis	251
The "God Within Us" Emphasis	254
Two Prevalent Christian Rationalizations Regarding Sacred Music Style	261
The Sacred/Secular Dichotomy	262
The Form/Content Dichotomy	264
Summary Observations	267
V. RECAPITULATION, PARADIGMATIC CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY	271
Recapitulation	271
Paradigmatic Conclusions and Implications	276
Regarding the Religious Determinants of Sacred Music Style	277
Regarding the Evaluation of Sacred Music Style	278
Regarding Christian Worship Music Style and "Christianness"	280
Regarding the Definition of the Sacred	287
Regarding Sacred Music as Wholistic Communication	287
Regarding Church Music and Mission	288
Regarding Church Music Education	293
Recommendations for Further Study	295
BIBLIOGRAPHY	297
VITA	351

LIST OF FIGURES

1. The Dependency Relationship between the Divine and the Non-divine among Pagan Religions	155
2. The Dependency Relationship between the Divine and the Non-divine among Pantheistic Religions	155
3. The Dependency Relationship between the Divine and the Non-divine among Biblical Religions	157

LIST OF TABLES

1. A Summary of Sorokin's Construct of Ideational and Sensate Music	101
2. Polarity Contrasted: A Summary of the Two Stylistic Traditions	215
3. A Summary of Stylistic Orientations in the History of Western Christian Sacred Music	268

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Though spurred on by ideological concerns arising from pastoral and teaching ministry, this study owes its completion to the encouragement and support of family, teachers, and friends who sensed the burden of the writer and were willing to countenance, inspire, facilitate, and sacrifice for it. My debt of gratitude is hereby humbly acknowledged--to Dr. Roy Naden for his friendship, discernment, and gentle guidance in the preparation of the manuscript; to Dr. C. Warren Becker, a companion in concern and interest, and a church musician of integrity; to Dr. George Akers for his empathetic encouragement and counsel; to the Oliver S. Beltz Endowment Fund for substantial financial assistance; to Brad Jamison for computer graphics advice; and to the Interlibrary Loan staff of the James White Library for their tireless assistance in obtaining many items essential to my research. I also acknowledge that the figures in chapter 3 are taken from The Myth of Religious Neutrality by Roy A. Clouser, © 1991 by University of Notre Dame Press. They are used by permission of the publisher.

To my dear wife, Julie, for her loving support, sacrifice, and unflinching commitment to this project; and to Kristian for his patient acceptance of an absent (and often absent-minded) dad, I owe more than words can express.

Finally, thanks be to God

Who, from our mother's arms
Hath blessed us on our way
With countless gifts of love;
And still is ours today.

Martin Rinkart, Now Thank We all Our God

CHAPTER ONE

MUSIC AND WORSHIP: THE PROBLEM

Introduction

The close relationship between music and religion in human society is recognized as a universal phenomenon.¹ Bruno Nettl captured the essence of this world-wide observation and research when he wrote:

Music is one of the few things common to all cultures. Furthermore throughout the world music has something to do with religion; in most cultures music frequently accompanies or is the vehicle for worship.²

Music in religious worship is used to enhance, intensify, or transform human religious experience.³ It may be employed to contact and communicate with a god,⁴ or to facilitate symbolic unity with the divine.⁵ It can be used to gratify a well-disposed deity or appease an angered one, even to the point of exerting a magical,

¹See, for example, Ter Ellingson, "Music and Religion," The Encyclopedia of Religion (1987), 10:163-172; David P. McAllester, "Music as Ecumenical Force," The Australian Journal of Music Education 27 (October 1980): 9; and Alain Daniélou, "Religious Music in the Countries of the Orient," The World of Music 16 (1974): 20.

²Bruno Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture: Iran, A Recently Developed Nation," in Contemporary Music and Music Cultures, by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975), 71.

³Ellingson, "Music and Religion."

⁴Edward O. Henry, Chant the Names of God: Musical Culture in Bhojpuri-Speaking India (San Diego: San Diego State University Press, 1988), 237; and Alain Daniélou, "Ethical and Spiritual Values in Music," The World of Music 22 (1980): 4.

⁵Abram Loft, "Musicians Guild and Union: A Consideration of the Evolution of Protective Organizations Among Musicians" (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1950), 7.

controlling influence over them.⁶ Music can also serve to translate "religious experience and a metaphysical conception of the world and of human existence into a concrete representational form,"⁷ or to elevate human consciousness from the everyday "to the mystical, the mythical, the cosmic, the supernatural."⁸

Whatever its function, music does not simply serve religion, or act as an accessory to it. On the one hand, as Susanne K. Langer pointed out, religion nurtures the arts because "whatever is holy to people inspires artistic conception."⁹ But, on the other hand, it can also be said that music profoundly influences religion. James George Frazer observed:

Indeed the influence of music on the development of religion is a subject which would repay a sympathetic study. For we cannot doubt that this, the most intimate and affecting of all arts, has done much to create as well as to express the religious emotions, thus modifying more or less deeply the fabric of belief to which at first sight it seems only to minister. The musician has done his part as well as the prophet and the thinker in the making of religion. Every faith has its appropriate music, and the difference between the creeds might almost be expressed in musical notation.¹⁰

If both Langer and Frazer are correct, the complex association between music and religion is mutually interactive.

Whatever the conceptual relationship, it is apparent that religious groups see the link between music and religious worship

⁶Johannes Quasten, Music and Worship in Pagan and Christian Antiquity, trans. Boniface Ramsey, O.P. (Washington, D.C.: National Association of Pastoral Musicians, 1983), 1-2.

⁷Mircea Eliade, Symbolism, the Sacred, and the Arts, ed. Diane Apostolos-Cappadona (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1985), 55. For a discussion of music as an aural representational form see Peter Kivy, Sound and Semblance: Reflections on Musical Representation (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1984).

⁸McAllester, "Music as Ecumenical Force," 9; and Daniélou, "Ethical and Spiritual Values in Music," 7.

⁹Susanne K. Langer, Feeling and Form: A Theory of Art (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1953), 402.

¹⁰James George Frazer, The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion, vol. 1, 3d ed. (New York: Macmillan Company, 1935), 53-54.

practice as no chance association, and are prepared to engage in conflict over it. From the study of music as a religious phenomenon, Joyce Irwin observed:

There is usually a form of music considered acceptable for worship, while other forms may be considered appropriate for non-liturgical gatherings, private devotion, or . . . secular occasions. If these latter forms are introduced into formal worship, conflicts arise and debates ensue.¹¹

Many writers have made mention of the conscious conservation of worship music in the world's cultures, as the following examples illustrate.¹²

Central African Religious Music

Writing about religious music in Africa, Ashenafi Kebede observed:

A religious attitude toward music and musical performance is maintained by most of the societies of Central Africa. Sacred music especially is performed and preserved with a high degree of authenticity because it is based on magicoreligious expression. In other words, the practitioners safeguard it from change as much as possible in order to keep their art potent.¹³

¹¹Joyce Irwin, preface to Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin (Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983), v.

¹²Note also the examples given in Curt Sachs, The Wellsprings of Music, ed. Jaap Kunst (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1965), 79-80; and Bruno Nettl, Music in Primitive Culture (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1956), 125. In contrast, Uri Sharvit suggested that certain changes in the liturgical music of some olim (diaspora) "contradict the common assertion that liturgical music is much less changeable than recreational and other non-religious genres" (Uri Sharvit, "Stylistic Change and Ethnic Continuity in Israeli Religious Music," Asian Music 17 [Spring/Summer, 1986]: 127-129). It could be argued, however, that this situation in Israel is unique, and complicated by numerous political and historical factors. It may, in fact, be an example of the exception proving the rule.

¹³Ashenafi Kebede, Roots of Black Music: The Vocal, Instrumental, and Dance Heritage of Africa and Black America (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1982), 44. J. H. Kwabena Nketia corroborated this: "The music for worshipping the gods is almost everywhere special music held in particular esteem" (J. H. Kwabena Nketia, African Gods and Music [Legon, Ghana: Institute of African Studies, University of Ghana, 1970], 2).

Similarly, Mary Collins affirmed that ritual music is generally considered to be "powerful, meaningful, mediatorial and transformative."¹⁴ And, "if ritual music is powerful and transformative, it can also be dangerous; and believing communities have regularly sought to contain the power of music by protocols and prohibitions."¹⁵

Referring to pre-Christian Zulu culture, Bongani Mthethwa suggested another reason for resistance to musical change. Because it was believed that ancestral spirits joined in communal worship rituals, it was critical that music and dance be kept "as ancient as possible to be understood by all ancestors"¹⁶ and facilitate their participation. To introduce new forms of music and dance would jeopardize their participation and thus destroy spiritual communication. Small wonder then, that such communities seek to shield their sacred music from change.

Islamic Sacred Sound Art

Yet, even in religious settings where music's magical properties are not considered paramount, conservation of religious music is maintained. Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, writing about sacred music in the Islamic context, observed:

Qur'ānic cantillation, or *qira'ah* (reading), has been performed with some variance of individual and regional style over the fourteen centuries of Islamic history; but exemplifications have

¹⁴Mary Collins, editorial, Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989), 3.

¹⁵Ibid.

¹⁶Bongani Mthethwa, "Music and Dance in Zulu Christian Worship: Meaning of Religious Dances in the Shembe Church," International Council for Traditional Music, UK Chapter Bulletin 9 (January 1985): 6. Mthethwa went on to explain: "The ancestors presumably participated in the dance. Their dancing with the living was regarded as a crucial link between the living and their Creator. Failure of ancestors to follow the dance steps as a result of some innovation would spell breakdown of communication between the people and their Creator," *ibid.*, 6.

rarely transgressed the boundaries of an acceptable style that has been strictly monitored by concerned Muslims in every century of Islamic history. Numerous works have been written to condemn and forestall aberrations of the pristine qualities of Qur'ānic chant and to guard against the assimilation of characteristics from the indigenous musical cultures of the various ethnic groups that make up the Muslim ummah (community). . . . A very sensitive and determined aesthetico-religious "conscience" has guarded against the intrusion of changes in the substance and performance of this chant that would reduce its conformance to the aesthetic and religious demands that determined its development.¹⁷

Thus, a staunchly monotheistic religion like Islām also has diligently preserved a particular form of musical expression for worship.¹⁸

Hindu Religious Music

The third example derives from the context of Eastern religions. William Purcell submitted that a well-accepted characteristic of Eastern music is "its relative resistance to change."¹⁹ He observed that:

Indian music as far as is known, is today much what it was a millennia ago. To a limited extent only is it an independent aesthetic art: almost all serious music is integrally related to religion as was European music during the Middle Ages.²⁰

The reason for the close connection of music to religion and of music's resistance to change in the Hindu setting is made clear in a succinct summary of the classical Indian view of music by Ravi Shankar in his autobiography, My Music, My Life. He wrote:

¹⁷Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Music, Musicians, and Muslim Law," Asian Music: A Journal of the Society for Asian Music 17 (Fall-Winter 1985): 9. (In most instances this author is called Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, however, she is also called Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī. The nomenclature of individual works will be used in citations.)

¹⁸Regarding whether or not Qur'ānic chant can legitimately be considered music, note Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's discussion (ibid., 6-15). For the purpose of the present discussion, it is assumed that Qur'ānic chant can be, and is considered to be, Islamic sacred music.

¹⁹William L. Purcell, An Introduction to Asian Music (New York: Asian Society, 1966), 2.

²⁰Ibid.

We are taught that one of the fundamental goals a Hindu works toward in his lifetime is a knowledge of the true meaning of the universe--its unchanging, eternal essence--and this is realized first by a complete knowledge of one's self and one's own nature. The highest aim of our music is to reveal the essence of the universe it reflects, and the rāgas are among the means by which this essence can be apprehended. Thus, through music, one can reach God."²¹

If indeed the highest aim of Hindu music, particularly the rāgas, is to reveal the unchanging eternal essence of the universe, then it would seem only natural that, once created, such music would resist essential change over time.

Christian Religious Music

Evidence of intentional conservation of sacred music forms can also be found among the various branches of Western Christianity.²² However, despite desire for musical continuity, the history of Western Christianity's liturgical music is one of unparalleled change. Viewed by Arnold Perris as "predominantly, if not exclusively, a Western cultural problem,"²³ the incessant and

²¹Ravi Shankar, My Music, My Life, with an introduction by Yehudi Menuhin (New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House, 1969), 17.

²²For a general discussion of this point, see Erik Routley, The Church and Music: An Enquiry into the History, the Nature, and the Scope of Christian Judgment on Music, rev. ed. (London: Gerald Duckworth and Company, 1950). Note also the affirmation and preservation by papal legislation of Gregorian chant as a standard in Roman Catholic liturgical music. See Robert F. Hayburn, Papal Legislation on Sacred Music: 95 A.D. to 1977 A.D. (Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1979). Note also the continued use and conservation of metrical psalmody by staunch Calvinist groups from the sixteenth century to the present. See Louis F. Benson, The Hymnody of the Christian Church (Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1956), 82-92.

²³Arnold Perris, Music as Propaganda: Art to Persuade, Art to Control (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 151. Although this book has received some critical reviews (see for example that of Joshua Kosman in Notes 43 [March 1987]: 563-564), Perris' point here has been well made and can be confirmed elsewhere. For example: Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations: Evidence from the Arab World," Asian Music: A Journal of the Society for Asian Music 12 (1981): 79; Carl F. Schalk, "The Seduction of Church Music: Perspectives on the American Scene," Church Music 79 (1979): 2; Routley, The Church and Music; and Edward Dickinson, Music in the History of the Western Church (New York: Greenwood Press, 1969), 392.

sometimes contradictory change has "produced a history of music peculiar to the West."²⁴ Of course, this did not occur without significant contention.

On the one hand, the engendered conflict underscores the seemingly innate urge to preserve sacred musical expression even in a religion that has become used to experiencing momentous changes. On the other hand, the regular appearance of new styles of worship music and the decision making necessitated by their appearance calls for explanation, or at least exploration.

The conflicts that have arisen over changing styles of Christian worship music, and the debates that have ensued, are by no means laid to rest despite their long history. Time has not diffused the dissensions or rendered them inconsequential. Those in pastoral ministry have no illusions regarding the persistence of this controversy in Christian circles. The intensity of feelings over the issue and the rigorous nature of the questions posed is unabated. Motivation for the present study was initially rooted in the practical concerns and experience of pastoral ministry, as well as the intense questioning that has followed the presentation of music seminars both in the United States and abroad.

The material briefly surveyed in this introduction seems to suggest that decisions regarding what music or types of music to conserve are more readily made in some religious contexts than in others. It would appear that where the conception of worship music is strongly religiously oriented, where sacred music is considered to be either a magico-religious or religio-conceptual expression, the regulations and directions regarding music used in worship are inherently provided and tend to be followed with little questioning. As a corollary, it would appear that the more worship music is conceived as devoid of religious roots beyond cultural associations,

²⁴Perris, Music as Propaganda, 151.

the more difficult it becomes to make decisions about it, the more frequently those decisions will be challenged, and the probability of conflict increased. It is this latter scenario that seems to speak pointedly to the contemporary Western Christian setting.

Background to the Problem

The Contemporary Christian Discussion of Music in Worship

In a recently published survey of twentieth century Protestant church music in America, retired dean of the School of Music at Hardin Simmons University, Talmage W. Dean, stated that "a major problem for the twentieth-century minister of music has been the choice of music literature"²⁵ for the worship service. He explained:

The simple gospel song and hymn controversy in the first half of the century has been compounded by the stylistic adoptions of ethnic music, contemporary gospel, complex harmonic techniques, and myriad electronic sounds undreamed of just decades before. These new sounds have brought problems of acceptance and performance.²⁶

In his discussion, Dean alluded to "the historical dilemma of church music--a general misunderstanding of the mysterious art of music and a continuing quest for 'good' church music."²⁷ He contextualized his observations as follows:

Throughout the history of Protestantism, the definition of the 'good' has been left to each congregation, within certain theological boundaries, and with as many differing solutions as there were churches. Often many committees have drawn up official guidelines for their churches but with so many generalities that the technical 'manuals' become meaningless and the churches were left to their own tastes and resources. . . . The scholars and theologians have been equally ambiguous or

²⁵Talmage W. Dean, A Survey of Twentieth Century Protestant Church Music in America (Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1988), 258.

²⁶Ibid.

²⁷Ibid., 259.

narrow in their standards, except in terms of their own musical knowledge and experience.³

Concurrence with Dean's description of this "major problem" and its context can be found among many Christian denominations today.⁴

Erik Routley, in his work The Church and Music, was the first to document the overall historical discussion and understanding of music choice within Christian circles.⁵ More recently, many others including Carl Schalk⁶, Joyce Irwin⁷, and Calvin Johansson⁸ have made thoughtful contributions to both the general and specific understanding of Protestant Christian judgment on music. But articles about worship music in contemporary Christian journals such as Christianity Today, The Christian Century, Contemporary Christian Music, Moody Monthly, and Church Music, and a plethora of denominational papers and magazines, are clear evidence that the choice of worship music remains a pandemic

³Ibid., 259-260.

⁴For another general description of this problem, though from a European rather than an American viewpoint, see Robin Sheldon, preface to In Spirit and in Truth: Exploring Directions in Music in Worship Today, ed. Robin Sheldon (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1989), viii-ix.

⁵Routley, The Church and Music, 9. Routley acknowledged other writers such as Percy A. Scholes, The Puritans and Music in England and New England: A Contribution to the Cultural History of the Two Nations (London: Oxford University Press, 1934) and Egon Wellesz, A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography (London: Oxford University Press, 1949) as contributing important "chapters" to his account.

⁶For example, Schalk, "The Seduction of Church Music," 2-10.

⁷For example, Joyce Irwin, "Shifting Alliances: The Struggle for a Lutheran Theology of Music," in Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin (Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983), 55-69.

⁸See the first chapter of Calvin M. Johansson, "Some Theological Considerations Foundational to a Philosophy of Church Music" (DMA dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, Fort Worth, Texas, 1974); and idem, Music and Ministry: A Biblical Counterpoint (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1984); and idem, Disciplining Music Ministry: Twenty-First Century Directions (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1992).

issue. Similar evidence can be found in a number of current books discussing the Christian view of popular rock music.

Despite interest in the subject, Protestantism's management of the problem has tended to be ineffectual. Whether because of the confusing maze of opinions, or the shortcomings of official and scholarly guidelines, congregations have been left to their "own tastes and resources." Predictably, calls to address and rectify the problem have been and are still being frequently and eloquently made.¹⁴

By way of comparison, the Roman Catholic communion has relied largely on papal legislation to prescribe worship music practice.¹⁵ However, judging by the continuing stream of pronouncements from the Vatican, these pontifical statements have not been recognized as conclusive. Discussion of the issue has not been quelled, and in some areas music practice has continued to

¹⁴The range and tone of these calls varies. For example: "How do we decide what is appropriate worship music?" (J. David Newman, "The Cross, The Center of Worship," Ministry, October 1991, 4); "Even if we accept the proposition that Christian rock and heavy metal bands are missionaries to this generation, how far can it go? How valid are such ministries?" (Dave Hart, "Focus on Music," Youthworker 5 [Summer 1989]: 14); "Where we still lag is in the provision of an explicit principle on which we can distinguish, not only in the music of the past, but in the musical compositions and choices of the present day, what is good from what is pernicious" (Erik Routley, Church Music and Theology [Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1959], 60); "So much of our church practice in music is thoroughly untheological and unprincipled . . . that it is time we revised our notions or its connection with the ground of our faith" (Erik Routley, Music Leadership in the Church: A Conversation Chiefly with My American Friends [Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon Press, 1967], 54); and "One reason secular society so easily modifies the thought and practice of the church is that all too little comprehensive dialogue is underway, all too little effort that addresses such concerns as what constitutes good literature, or good art, . . . and so on. The Bible does not--for example--say much about aesthetics (as we understand the term) and for good reason. But evangelicals have long said even less, and in the present cultural context they pay heavily for this neglect" (Carl F. H. Henry, Twilight of a Great Civilization: The Drift Towards Neo-Paganism [Westchester, Ill.: Crossway Books, 1988], 122).

¹⁵See Hayburn, Papal Legislation on Sacred Music 95 A.D. to 1977 A.D., for detailed documentation and a summary of Roman Catholic thought in this area.

probe the edge of legitimacy. Problems in this regard seem to have become more obvious since the circulation of the "Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy" adopted at the Second Vatican Council, 1963, in which Chapter VI dealt with sacred music. In 1966, three years after its adoption, the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America convened a meeting on church music, the proceedings of which were published under the title Crisis in Church Music. In the opening presentation, Rembert Weakland began by asking several revealing questions:

Why is it that Chapter VI of the Constitution on the Liturgy of Vatican Council II found us unprepared? Why is it that several years after its promulgation we are still groping for solutions and must use such labels, right, center, and left to distinguish positions? It would be insincere to say that musicians are not divided on the means of finding a solution, we must also say that liturgists and musicians have not yet come to a method of communicating with each other.¹⁶

This publication goes on to present the "right, center, and left positions" on the type of music suitable for and the place of music in Roman Catholic liturgy.

Nearly a decade later, Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, writing in a Festschrift for the centennial celebration of the church music school in Regensburg, Germany, delineated the problem over music in the church as "the tension between the demand of art and the simplicity of the liturgy."¹⁷ In the antagonism between the concerns of professional musicians and pastors, he discerned an

¹⁶Rembert Weakland, "Music and Liturgy in Evolution," in Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966 (Washington, D.C.: Liturgical Conference, 1967), 3.

¹⁷"Die Spannung zwischen dem Anspruch der Kunst und der Einfachheit der Liturgie," Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, "Zur Theologischen Grundlegung Der Kirchenmusik," in Gloria Deo Pax Hominibus: Festschrift zum 100-jährigen Bestehen der Kirchenmusikschule Regensburg Affiliert der Papstlichen Hochschule für Kirchenmusik Rom, ed. Franz Fleckenstein (Regensburg: Fachakademie für Katholische Kirchenmusik und Musikerziehung, 1974), 41. (All translations from foreign language sources are mine unless otherwise indicated.)

overall shift in favor of pastoral preoccupations, noting that a convenient prescription was emerging and gaining acceptance:

"Functional music [is best] for the liturgy. 'Proper church music' may be cultivated elsewhere--it no longer fits into the liturgy."³⁸ With irony, Ratzinger observed that those espousing this prescription overlooked the implication that "proper church music" is really no longer church music at all. In the end there is no real church music.

Granted that Ratzinger represented a conservative stance, his point underscored the fact that there are well-defined sides in this discussion. According to Thomas Day's recent and widely publicized book, Why Catholics Can't Sing, the sides have increasingly polarized,³⁹ and their disputes intensified. Judging by the reviews this book has received, it certainly touched a sensitive nerve in the Roman Catholic community.⁴⁰ Once again, calls to rectify the problem have been mingled with battle cries.⁴¹

Writing in 1947 from an Anglican background, renowned Oxford scholar and essayist, Dorothy Sayers, made a statement regarding the Christian church's approach to the arts that elucidated the general

³⁸"Gebrauchsmusik für die Liturgie, 'die eigentliche Kirchenmusik' mag man anderswie pflegen--in die Liturgie paßt sie nicht mehr." Ibid.

³⁹Thomas Day, Why Catholics Can't Sing: The Culture of Catholicism and the Triumph of Bad Taste (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1990).

⁴⁰See, for example, John T. Zuhlsdorf, review of Why Catholics Can't Sing by Thomas Day, Sacred Music 117 (Summer 1990): 22-24; and Haig Mardirosian, review of Why Catholics Can't Sing by Thomas Day, The American Organist 25 (January 1991): 79-80.

⁴¹See Miriam Therese Winter, Why Sing? Toward a Theology of Catholic Church Music (Washington, D.C.: Pastoral Press, 1984).

problem regarding church music.⁴² Her statement highlighted an important flaw in Christian thinking about the arts.

In such things as politics, finance, sociology and so on, there really is a philosophy and a Christian tradition; we do know more or less what the Church has said and thought about them, how they are related to Christian dogma, and what they are supposed to do in a Christian country.

But oddly enough, we have no Christian aesthetic--no Christian philosophy of the Arts. The Church as a body has never made up her mind about the Arts, and it is hardly too much to say that she has never tried. She has, of course, from time to time puritanically denounced the Arts as irreligious and mischievous, or tried to exploit the Arts as a means to the teaching of religion and morals. . . . And there have, of course, been plenty of writers on aesthetics who happened to be Christians, but they seldom made any consistent attempt to relate their aesthetic to the central Christian dogmas. Indeed, so far as European aesthetic is concerned, one feels that it would probably have developed along precisely the same lines had there never been an Incarnation to reveal the nature of God--that is to say, the nature of all truth. But that is fantastic. If we commit ourselves to saying that the Christian revelation discovers to us the nature of all truth, then it must discover to us the nature of the truth about Art among other things.⁴³

It certainly appears that the lack of a comprehensive Christian philosophy of the arts⁴⁴ is still conspicuously manifest in the way the Christian church is approaching the choice of worship music in the 1990s.⁴⁵

⁴²Judging by the number of times it has been cited, clearly this statement is still considered relevant forty years later. See for example, Nicholas Wolterstorff, Art in Action: Toward a Christian Aesthetic (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1980), ix; Leland Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective: A Door to Understanding and Enjoying the Arts (Portland, Oreg.: Multnomah Press, 1986), 12, 65, 66-67; and Frank E. Gaebelien, The Christian, the Arts and Truth: Regaining the Vision of Greatness, ed. D. Bruce Lockerbie (Portland, Oreg.: Multnomah Press, 1985), 72.

⁴³Dorothy L. Sayers, "Towards a Christian Aesthetic" in Christian Letters to a Post-Christian World: A Selection of Essays, with an introduction by Roderick Jellema (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1969), 69-70.

⁴⁴Sayers clearly used the term "aesthetic" in this broad sense.

⁴⁵Some writers have questioned "whether there can be such a thing as a 'Christian' aesthetic or a 'Christian' poetic" (Amos N. Wilder, Theology and Modern Literature [Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1958], 85, and Nathan A. Scott, Jr., "Prolegomenon to a Christian Poetic," Journal of Religion 35 [October, 1955]: 191-206). Wilder claimed the term "Christian aesthetic/poetic" should

Approaches Currently Utilized

In this debate the choice of music for worship has not been entirely haphazard. On the contrary, a number of evaluative approaches and criteria have been employed at different times. Aestheticism,⁴⁶ the influence of music, pragmatism, and theology of music have all be utilized, although the latter is the least well developed.

Aestheticism

Concerned as it is with excellence in the technical characteristics which give music its artistic worth, aestheticism has been a frequent yardstick⁴⁷ because it is generally considered that adherence to aesthetic values guarantees the quality and artistry necessary for worship acceptable to God. Further, as

only be used informally "to throw into relief the contributions that can be made to the problem of aesthetic judgment by the Christian understanding of man in the world" (Wilder, Theology and Modern Literature, 85). However, Sayers' point concerning Christian revelation "discovering to us the nature of all truth" still stands, indicating that a Christian aesthetic should have its own raison d'être, not merely provide additional insights to some other philosophical framework.

"Calvin Johansson's delineation of "aestheticism" and "pragmatism" as evaluation-approach categories are helpful, and thus indebtedness to him is acknowledged in the following pages regarding the use of these terms and their general meaning. See Johansson, Music and Ministry, 4-7.

⁴⁷For examples from Protestant writers, see Archibald T. Davison, Protestant Church Music in America (Boston: E. C. Schirmer Music Co., 1948), 94-142; and The Report of the Committee Appointed in 1948 by the Archbishops of Canterbury and York, Music in Church (Westminster: Church Information Office, 1957). See the discussion of this report in Routley, Church Music and Theology, 61-66; Harold Byron Hannum, Music and Worship (Nashville, Tenn.: Southern Publishing Association, 1969); Oskar Söhngen, "Do We Need a New Concept for Church Music Today? Current Considerations," in The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991), 183-195; and idem, "Church Music as Art," in Festschrift: Theodore Hoelty-Nickel: A Collection of Essays on Church Music, ed. Newman W. Powell (Valparaiso, Ind.: Valparaiso University Press, 1967), 24-33. For examples from Roman Catholic writers, see Ratzinger, "Zur Theologischen Grundlegung Der Kirchenmusik" and Winter's acknowledgement that "aesthetic factors have often been reflected in papal documents" (Winter, Why Sing? 237).

Andreas Marti explained, good art has certain qualities in common with religion because both deal with the inexpressible.⁴⁸ He wrote:

Religious conceptions are always only approximations which never embody the totality, but rather point beyond themselves to it. Ultimately they cannot be translated, just as an art work cannot be translated into concepts. To clothe religious messages in artistic forms means to safeguard this multi-dimensionality, pointing to Transcendence in a tangible manner.⁴⁹

In other words, "music as an art form expresses truths to which ordinary discourse can only allude."⁵⁰ It is not surprising therefore that emphasis on these aspects undergirds the predominant and sometimes exclusive use of high quality art music in worship.

Although the aesthetic approach makes some worthwhile points, not least that it emphasizes God as creator and valuer of the beautiful and the ability to experience beauty, it also has its deficiencies and dangers. As Calvin M. Johansson cautioned, it comes at "the risk of elevating art to a place where beauty becomes God, or if not thought to be God, is at least equal to God, or thought of as essential to knowing God."⁵¹ Marti also warned that aesthetic transcendence can be confused too readily with religious transcendence.⁵²

Further, the question of who decides what the aesthetic standards should be and on what basis is crucial. Because the measure of what is aesthetically superior tends to be somewhat

⁴⁸Andreas Marti, "Kunst und Kitsch als Problem der Hymnologie," Jahrbuch für Liturgik und Hymnologie 36 (1982): 180.

⁴⁹"Religiöse Begriffe sind immer nur Näherungen, die das Gemeinte nicht enthalten, sondern über sich hinaus auf es hinweisen. Sie sind letztlich nicht übersetzbar, genausowenig, wie ein Kunstwerk in Begriffe zu übersetzen ist. Religiöse Aussagen in Formen der Kunst zu kleiden, bedeutet damit, die Mehrdimensionalität zu wahren, bildhaft auf Transzendenz hinzuweisen." Ibid.

⁵⁰Linda Clark, "Ministry and the Arts: Music in the Community of Faith," Nexus 60 24 (Summer and Winter, 1981/82): 22.

⁵¹Johansson, Music and Ministry, 5.

⁵²Marti, "Kunst und Kitsch," 180.

subjectively determined,"³ it is difficult to be authoritative about what is really high quality art, especially in an age of rapidly shifting aesthetic standards and increased multi-cultural awareness.⁴

The Influence of Music

Another evaluative means that has been used extensively since the advent of rock music in the late 1950s is the "influence of music" approach that focuses primarily on the

³Distinction can be made between "enjoyable beauty" and "admirable beauty" (Mortimer J. Adler, Six Great Ideas [New York: Macmillan, 1981], 103-122). The former is, by definition, purely a matter of taste, whereas the latter contains an element of objectivity because the intrinsic characteristics of the beautiful object (using "object" in its broadest sense to include the non-material) can be evaluated and discussed by experts beyond the confines of taste and preference. Adler pointed out, however, that even experts are limited to their area of expertise (ibid., 119). Further, they can disagree over some criteria and ultimate value judgments within their specialized fields (ibid., 121, 122). Such disagreement between specialists obviously indicates that the final delineation of what is admirable is somewhat subjectively determined. Farnsworth's discussion of "musical taste" is also worthy of note. He posited that although it can be shown to operate somewhat "lawfully" in a given culture, it is essentially relative to culture and indoctrination (Paul R. Farnsworth, The Social Psychology of Music, 2d ed. [Ames, Iowa: The Iowa State University Press, 1968], 97-133).

⁴Roger Sessions alluded to this general problem at the outset of a chapter on aesthetic criteria in his classic, Questions About Music. He began by affirming his belief in the reality and distinctive nature of aesthetic criteria, and then went on to recognize the complexity and fragmentation of contemporary Western culture and the implications this has for the subject of criteria. He wrote: "The very possibility of criteria involves the existence or assumption of some stable point or points of reference; and in a time of general uneasiness it is inevitable that all of the generally accepted ones should be subjected to the closest scrutiny and the sharpest challenge. This does not mean, of course, that they will inevitably succumb, or that they will even necessarily be weakened. It does mean, I think, that in so far as they survive, their terms will be somewhat altered, and that quite possibly the new shapes which they assume will furnish us with new perspectives in regard to not only the present, but the past as well" (Roger Sessions, Questions About Music [New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1971], 124).

psycho-physiological effects of music and evaluates it by its impact.⁵⁵ Although this scientifically oriented view provides some important insights,⁵⁶ it too has deficiencies. First, its emphasis on delineating negative impact tends to engender prohibitions rather than positive guidance. Second, because precise knowledge about music's effect on the human organism is a relatively new field of scientific research, it is difficult to find comprehensive information as to which musical aspects have negative impact. In general only the extreme musical characteristics (such as excessive loudness and strong, persistent rhythms) can be pinpointed as deleterious to health, and hence incompatible with Christian ideals and worship. Third, the psycho-physiological approach tends to foster a polemic against contemporary popular music rather than development of an overall philosophy for church music.

Perhaps the most significant flaw in the "influence of music" approach is that science tends to be made the ultimate arbiter of what constitutes acceptable music, placing scientific research in the category of inerrant truth. No account is made for the limitations imposed by the researchers' philosophy of science that affects--perhaps determines--methodology, findings, and interpretation⁵⁷. This approach can enlighten understanding of what

⁵⁵See Bob Larson, The Day Music Died (Carol Stream, Ill.: Creation House, 1972); Lowell Hart, Satan's Music Exposed (Rossville, Ga.: Grapevine Book Distributors, 1981); and Paul Hamel, The Christian and His Music (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1973).

⁵⁶See Bernadette Skubik and Daniel Skubik, "The Neurophysiology of Rhythm," unpublished MS, Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University, 1987.

⁵⁷This point is crucial to interpreting works which espouse opposing points of view, but appeal to analogous scientific research to support their claims. For example, Larson, The Day Music Died versus Linda Martin and Kerry Segrave, Anti-Rock: The Opposition to Rock 'n' Roll (Hamden, Conn.: Archon Books, 1988).

is suitable worship music; however, its limitations and weaknesses must be acknowledged.

Pragmatism

In the latter half of the twentieth century one other approach for rating worship music has become particularly popular, namely, pragmatism. Pragmatism endorses whatever music "works," "gets through," "brings results," or simply appeals to the congregation or audience--in other words, the practical effect of the music determines its validity.⁵⁸ The "result (end) justifies the use of any music (means) as long as the anticipated result is worthy."⁵⁹

One application of this approach was urged by Walther P. Kallestad. Observing the increasing power of the entertainment industry, he maintained that the Christian church must learn how to utilize this tool to accomplish the Gospel commission.⁶⁰

If we are absolutely honest--what most churches do on Sunday morning is not working. We can give profound theological reasons why we "have to" do what we do. However, if what we are doing doesn't work, let the Spirit show us new and different ways to reach people with the "good news" of Jesus Christ.

Entertainment oriented churches are growing. The do-what-we-have-always-done-before churches are dying. When people come to Community Church of Joy on Sunday morning, they have fun. We may have a stage band, comedians, clowns, dramas, mini concerts and productions, high energy choreography, as well as many other entertainment forms. . . .

What was relevant in the sixteenth century in terms of the medium of the day is not relevant today. Certainly the changeless message remains the same. It is a matter of stylistic changes, not substance change. Entertainment is a gift of God. Entertainment evangelism will fill up our churches. . . .

If Jesus were here today walking the face of the earth, he would without a doubt use the No. 1 medium of the day to tell

⁵⁸See Gunnar C. Urang, Church Music--For the Glory of God (Molien, Ill.: Christian Service Foundation, 1956), 5; W. Hines Sims, "What Is Good Church Music?" Church Musician 2 (November 1951): 12; and Doug Van Pelt, "Moshing for the Master," Contemporary Christian Music 11 (February 1989): 20-21.

⁵⁹Johansson, Music and Ministry, 5.

⁶⁰Walther P. Kallestad, "Entertainment Evangelism," The Lutheran, May 23, 1990, 17.

his story. Jesus would become all things to all people to save some. He would use entertainment."

Kallestad's case for entertainment evangelism features the two concerns repeatedly voiced in pragmatist arguments, notably relevancy--generally advocating experimentation with the newest forms of communication used by secular culture--and results⁴².

No one can doubt the sincerity of those who advocate this approach. Neither should the goals of "relevancy" and "results" be decried. However, while by God's grace this approach does sometimes result in "worthy outcomes," its dangers are serious.⁴³

Concerning its emphasis on relevance, Harold M. Best wrote: "In confusing relevance with immediacy and communication with imitation, we have reduced Christianity and what we mistakenly call

⁴²Ibid. Robert D. Berglund identified what is probably the most powerful impetus for incorporating entertainment-style components in contemporary Christian worship. He wrote: "Few pastors view their own roles as that of entertainer, yet they relegate the music program to that precise role. Undoubtedly the mass media and televised church services have influenced this trend. When entertainment ranks high on the list of objectives of the electronic church so as to capture its audience, local churches blindly follow suit" (Robert D. Berglund, A Philosophy of Church Music [Chicago: Moody Press, 1985], 16). Probably it is impossible to overestimate the influence of the mass media on pragmatists' "means" in today's cultural environment.

⁴³For other examples which emphasized relevance in music, see John W. Styll, "Are We the World?" Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (April 1986): 4; and Brian Quincy Newcomb, "When Christians Rock: Answering the Critics," Contemporary Christian Music 11 (July 1988): 26. For other examples which emphasized results with music, see John W. Styll, "Mylon Lefevre: The Solid Rocker," Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (March 1986): 19; Van Pelt, "Moshing for the Master," 20; and Bob Beeman, "Why Heavy Metal Is a Ministry," Contemporary Christian Music 12 (August 1989): 19. For a general discussion of pragmatist's concerns and emphases, see John Blanchard, Pop Goes the Gospel, rev. ed. (Durham, England: Evangelical Press, 1989), 75-90, 104-128.

⁴⁴Regarding the general notion that Jesus would use media-style entertainment to communicate the gospel, the incisive critique of Malcolm Muggeridge is worthy of note. Malcolm Muggeridge, "The Fourth Temptation," in Christ in the Media by Malcolm Muggeridge (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans, 1977), 23-42 and 81-88.

Christian music to the level of market research and audience response."⁶⁴

Similarly, several dangers are evident in the emphasis on results. Besides the fact that desirable ends can be accomplished by unworthy means and that the ends do not justify the means in Christian thinking, focusing on results is especially vulnerable to misapplication at a time when "one of the disturbing signs of our culture is the demand for instant gratification and for freedom from discipline."⁶⁵ In this context, the observations of the secular press about contemporary Western Christian culture are significant. Reporting on baby boomers who are returning to church, Newsweek noted that "a group affirmation of self is at the top of the agenda, which is why some of the least demanding churches are now in greatest demand."⁶⁶ It is suggested that "to attract churchgoers today you've got to please the consumer. That means hightech entertainment. Day care. Self-help groups. No pleas for money. No Bible thumping. Happy consumers from California to Maryland are eating up 'fast-food religion'."⁶⁷ If these observations are correct, or even partly so, then emphasizing results may prove to be one of contemporary Christianity's greatest liabilities.⁶⁸

⁶⁴Harold M. Best, "Christian Responsibility in Music," in The Christian Imagination: Essays on Literature and the Arts, ed. Leland Ryken (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker Book House, 1981), 402.

⁶⁵Austin C. Lovelace and William C. Rice, Music and Worship in the Church, rev. and enl. ed. (Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon, 1976), 201.

⁶⁶Kenneth L. Woodward et al., "A Time to Seek: With Babes in Arms and Doubts in Mind, A Generation Looks to Religion," Newsweek, December 17, 1990, 56.

⁶⁷Cindy Lafavre Yorks, "McChurch," USA Weekend, April 13-15, 1990, 4.

⁶⁸This is evident in the polarization of congregations into those that relish a particular worship music style and those that despise it. For example, see Lovelace and Rice, Music and Worship in the Church, 203.

Four other flaws are evident in the pragmatic approach. First, it "creates a sharp dichotomy between medium and message . . . in which each may go its own way without regard for the other,"⁶⁶ thus destroying the concept that in gospel witness both the ends and the means are determined by the gospel.

Second, "pragmatism does away with objective standards,"⁷⁰ allowing acceptability to control quality and legitimacy. Third, as a philosophy, pragmatism is self-contradictory, for while damning objective standards and absolutes on the one hand, on the other it promotes the notion that its own idea--relativity--is really an absolute.⁷¹ Finally, this approach is prone to degenerate into using music as a manipulative tool, supplanting the work of the Holy Spirit.⁷²

Theology of Music

Clearly, each of the evaluative approaches discussed above have contributions to make, but at the same time they have defects and are inadequate in themselves as philosophical bases for selecting music for Christian worship. Significantly, they are all based on criteria determined apart from Scripture or specific Christian beliefs--rendering Sayers' call for a comprehensive and consistent Christian philosophy of the arts related to Christian dogma⁷³ even more poignant.

⁶⁶Johansson, Music and Ministry, 6.

⁷⁰Ibid.

⁷¹Ibid., 6-7.

⁷²Ibid. See also Paul Westermeyer, "The Bottom Line: What Provides the Chief Influence in the Direction of Church Music in the Late Twentieth Century?" Choristers Guild Letters (December 1990): 130.

⁷³Sayers, "Towards a Christian Aesthetic," 69.

If one turns to Scripture, however, specific principles and precepts regarding music are difficult to find.⁷⁴ No Bible writer presents a systematic philosophy of sacred music. It is true that passages such as Phil 4:8,⁷⁵ 1 Cor 14:7,8 and Amos 5:23 have implications regarding music's use in worship, but they must be interpreted in the contemporary context.

Perhaps, as Sayers suggested, Christian dogma--the doctrines of Christianity rooted in Scripture--holds the key to a philosophy of worship music. In fact, since the time when Sayers made her statement, interest has grown in forging a conscious, theologically based understanding of worship music in both Protestant and Roman Catholic circles. The writings of Adolf Brunner,⁷⁶ Oskar Söhngen,⁷⁷ Erik Routley,⁷⁸ Winfried Kurzschinkel,⁷⁹ Edmund Schlink,⁸⁰ and

⁷⁴This is not to suggest that Scripture promotes a laissez-faire attitude to music in worship. On the contrary, for example, musical practice in the Old Testament was prescribed "by the Lord through his prophets." 2 Chr 29:25 NIV, and the temple musicians were Levites who lived "in the rooms of the temple and were exempt from other duties because they were responsible for the work day and night." 1 Chr 9:33 NIV.

⁷⁵William Lillie suggested that Phil 4:8 is the closest the New Testament comes to commenting on the arts (William Lillie, Studies in New Testament Ethics [Edinburgh and London: Oliver and Boyd, 1961], 157).

⁷⁶Adolf Brunner, Musik im Gottesdienst: Wesen, Funktion und Ort der Musik im Gottesdienst (Zurich: Zwingli Verlag, 1968).

⁷⁷See, for example, Oskar Söhngen, "Zur Theologie der Musik," Theologische Literaturzeitung 75 (1950): 15-24; and the more extensive discussion in idem, "Theologische Grundlagen der Kirchenmusik," in Leiturgia IV (Kassel: Stauda-Verlag, 1961), 2-267.

⁷⁸See, for example, Routley, Church Music and Theology.

⁷⁹See Winfried Kurzschinkel, Die Theologische Bestimmung der Musik: Neuere Beiträge zur Deutung und Wertung des Musizierens im Christlichen Leben (Trier, Germany: Paulinus-Verlag, 1971). This work also provides an overview of significant research done in this field up until 1970.

⁸⁰Edmund Schlink, Zum Theologischen Problem der Musik (Tübingen: Verlag von J. C. B. Mohr, 1950).

Calvin M. Johansson¹ are examples of valuable contributions to the literature in this field in the last several decades.

At the same time, however, awareness of the need for continued thought and development has been repeatedly expressed. For example, in his rationale for writing Church Music and Theology, Routley stated: "The only reason I have for attempting the present book is a conviction that there is work to be done by those who can bring to the study of church music a sense of theology."² Roman Catholic author, Miriam Therese Winter, writing of the situation in her community of faith, observed:

At present, music practice is regulated, not by clear theological criteria arising from a theology of church music, but by norms of an external nature guided, to some extent, by principles drawn from liturgical theology. Legal or regulatory norms without a sound theological foundation are inadequate for setting church music standards.³

She admitted that no theology of Catholic church music existed,⁴ and, furthermore that "there is still much ground work to be done to prepare a theology of church music."⁵ She challenged her readers with the fact that in the last twenty years

there is a new song in the Church arising from a new theological emphasis. This calls for a new set of standards with criteria clearly arising from this new theological base. But if there is no clearly articulated theology of music, how will one know when criteria for judgment, be they musical, liturgical, or pastoral, are open to the present or unconsciously conditioned by prejudice from the past?⁶

¹See Johansson, Music and Ministry.

²Routley, Church Music and Theology, 11.

³Winter, Why Sing? 195.

⁴Ibid., 239.

⁵Ibid., 232. Expressions of the need for a theology of music could be multiplied from various traditions. For example: Rodney H. Mill, "Needed, A Theology of Music," Review and Herald, May 14, 1970, 10; and Walter E. Buszin, "Music in the Life of the Church," Journal of Church Music 3 (June 1961): 3.

⁶Winter, Why Sing? 241.

In attempts to fulfill this need, there has been a tendency to rely on applied meanings from implications drawn out of a given doctrine. For example, Johansson's significant and respected contribution drew implications from such doctrines as creation, the incarnation, the gospel, faith, and stewardship. Insights were proffered regarding musical relevancy, for example, from the doctrine of the incarnation--how the divine Christ became relevant to humanity. Gospel characteristics were compared with popular music characteristics and certain conclusions drawn about the use of mass cultural music products in worship. The principle of stewardship, for example, was applied perceptively to both doing one's best and growth in worship music performance and appreciation.

However, it could be said that heavy reliance on implications tends to emphasize the subjective element of interpretation that gains its authority from the background and beliefs of the interpreter. In this case it is not the Christian dogma but the individual drawing the implications who becomes the arbiter of the philosophy. Granted that some interpretation of this kind is inevitable in a theology of music, perhaps the overriding deductive emphasis in tracing subjectively determined implications could be supplemented with insights rooted in cultural music developments. This would provide a more concrete foundation for the fulfillment of Sayer's vision that the Christian revelation can "discover to us the nature of the truth about Art among other things."

Two other areas of Christian thought and endeavor that contribute substantially to understanding of the problem of worship music choice are music in missiology and church music education. Because missiology tends to focus on pastoral and people concerns, there is a tendency for it to veer toward pragmatism. On the other hand, because music education focuses on the concerns of musicians

and musical excellence, its proclivity is toward aestheticism. However, because of their distinctive perspectives, these areas are treated separately.

Church Music and the Church's Mission

The Christian discussion of music in worship is rendered considerably more complex today by a growing awareness of our "global village." The drastically reduced "distance" between the world's cultures underscores the need for the international Christian church to address the issue of the arts, including worship music, from a transcultural rather than a purely Western perspective. In this context Mary Collins observed that:

In the last decade of the century in which Roman Catholicism is indeed becoming a 'world church' caught up in the dialogue of cultures, we find ourselves with new questions we never thought to raise earlier."

Small wonder that the church is judged to be "only at the start of a critical enquiry about the 'right use of music' in formal worship"²²--an opinion that may well be true of the Christian church as a whole, not merely the denomination referred to by Collins.

Questions of how music relates to the mission of the church revolve around two foci: (1) the use of music in cultures where Christianity has been introduced as a result of its witness and (2) the use of music in subcultures within a main culture such as that of the Western industrialized nations, where generational differences in musical taste and preference have become marked.

Commenting on Christianity's use of music in traditionally non-Christian cultures, Gerhard M. Cartford observed:

Prior to World War II the problem [of contextualizing Christianity in a traditionally non-Christian culture] was not so acute because the nations of the then "colonial" world generally tolerated the presence of alien religious organizations and

²²Collins, editorial in Music and the Experience of God, 8.

²³Ibid.

accepted their cultural foreignness. The period since the close of World War II, however, has seen profound social changes take place, and the new consciousness of national identity that has come with the formation of new nations and new churches will no longer tolerate such cultural alienism."⁹

It is now thought that missionaries once indulged in a certain amount of cultural imperialism by introducing--some would say imposing--Western forms of music and instruments as part of their witness to the gospel in foreign lands.¹⁰ Their predominant use of translated hymn texts sung to Western melodies, constructed as they were with unfamiliar scale systems and accents, and accompanied on foreign instruments, frequently produced far less than the best result.¹¹ Yet, entire generations of converts became habituated to

⁹Gerhard M. Cartford, "Report from Latin America," in The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991), 85-86.

¹⁰See Mary K. Oyer, "Hymnody in the Context of World Mission," in The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991), 58, 72; I-to Loh, "Toward Contextualization of Church Music in Asia," in The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991), 90; and Robin A. Leaver, "Theological Dimensions of Mission Hymnody: The Counterpoint of Cult and Culture," in The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991), 40-41.

¹¹See, for example, the following description of a situation prevalent among Korean Baptists: "If you had visited a Korean Baptist church prior to 1970, this is what you would have observed: Much of the congregational singing was off-key. Usually the first stanza would be pretty much on pitch, but with each additional stanza, the pitch would climb higher and higher, making noticeable discords with the instrument when one was played. The tempo of the hymns was slow and draggy--more like a dirge than a song of Christian hope. Most of the hymns were Western hymns that had been translated (some of them quite poorly) into the Korean language. A very small selection of the 586 [hymns] in the Union Hymnal, possible twenty to thirty, was sung over and over again, using all the stanzas and many times repeating the same hymn three or four times in succession. These hymns were sung with many alterations in pitch and rhythm. There was usually no one to direct them. The pastor standing in the pulpit would 'heist' the tune, and the congregation would follow him. When accompaniment was present, it was on a small pump organ by an accompanist who had little or no training. This had the effect of being unaccompanied since the congregation sang as they pleased, and the accompanist limped along behind!" (Nita Jones, "Korean Baptist Music Before 1970," Missionary

such practices, considering them mandatory in Christian worship.

In the last three decades a move toward indigenization has been increasingly demanded by local peoples and encouraged by those Western missionaries whose sensitivity to the problem has been aroused. Consequently, recognition of the validity of native cultures, as well as motivation to discover a unique indigenous form of expression appropriate in the Christian context, has begun to take place.² However, as Cartford noted, the full realization of this changed outlook cannot be effected instantaneously.

Only the passage of time allows the maturation needed for the local mission community to begin to separate the message of the gospel from the alien cultural wrappings that accompanied it initially. When this happens the local community can begin to search for and create an ambiance within its own culture that is authentic and gives a fresh contextual voice to the Christian message.³

During that "passage of time," questions inevitably emerge about what is appropriate to transfer into the new Christian worship setting, and what is not. How much syncretism should there be? The temptation to consider culture innately good and that what is, is what ought to be--and hence make its preservation paramount--needs also to be faced⁴. The issues surrounding music's associations

Notes [July 1977]: 1, in T. W. Hunt, Music in Missions: Discipling Through Music (Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1987), 84). In broad terms, this situation has been repeated in many localities the world around.

²For a good description of this process and some widely applicable principles of practice, see Loh, "Toward Contextualization of Church Music in Asia", 94-95.

³Cartford, "Report from Latin America," 85.

⁴Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī presented a forceful critique of cultural relativism in "Islām as Culture and Civilization," in Islām and Contemporary Society, ed. Salem Azzam (London: Longman in association with the Islamic Council of Europe, 1982), 141-142. See also Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" in Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies, vol. 50 (Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983), 22. The dangers of cultural relativism are also recognized in secular circles. For example: Allan Bloom, "Our Listless Universities," Change 15 (April 1983): 30. J. H. Kwabena Nketia evaluated the affect of relativism

also need to be addressed. As Cartford intimated, dealing seriously with some of these matters and finding answers to these questions may take several generations.*

This situation is further compounded by the relatively recent influence of Western commercial music and mass media on indigenous music the world around.* For many local musicians, the call to contextualize translates into a desire not so much to develop a genuinely indigenous musical expression for worship as to copy the popular Western entertainment idiom, perhaps include some trace of local musical flavor, and then simply add sacred lyrics in

on ethnomusicology in "Universal Perspectives in Ethnomusicology," The World of Music 26 (1984): 6-9.

*Cartford, "Report from Latin America," 85.

*Citing information from an unpublished paper, "The Influence of the Mass Media on Tomorrow's Public" by Narayana Menon read at the World Music Week Conference, Montreal, 1975, Kebede wrote: "Narayana Menon, a respected Indian musicologist who served as President of the International Music Council (UNESCO), said that some eight hundred million radio sets with a potential three billion or more listeners--about eighty percent of the population of the world--are tuned to music programs for something like four to five hours a day. This clearly makes radio the most popular and powerful instrument of music education or miseducation. According to Dr. Menon, 'It can make or unmake musical taste, develop or kill musical activity . . . on a scale unthinkable in the days before broadcasting.'

"The establishment of the communications media around the world has played a leading role in accelerating the processes of music change. . . . The popularity of radio in Africa has caused a marked decline in music making, threatening the very existence of the traditional forms of music; the audience for Western popular music has increased dramatically" (Kebede, The Roots of Black Music, 109, 110). More recently James Lull wrote: "The development of audio cassette units, 'dubbed' or 'pirated' tapes make it easy to disseminate music throughout the world. People from all classes of nearly all cultures seem to have found ways to obtain cassette playback or record/playback systems and tapes to use with them. The immediate problem that this distribution of music raises is the question of modern 'cultural imperialism,' the disruption, alteration, or replacement of local culture stimulated by the worldwide diffusion of software originating in more developed societies" (James Lull, "Popular Music and Communication: An Introduction," in Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull [London: Sage Publications, 1987], 29).

the vernacular.⁹⁷ Effectively, this has superimposed the questions and concerns of the Western Christian discussion of music in worship on top of the ongoing local concerns regarding contextualization.

The second of the two focal points in the discussion about music and the church's mission concerns the use of music among subcultures within a main culture. Generally, the emphasis here is on the communication of the gospel to the younger generation in a fast-changing society, although it also includes the communication of the gospel to ethnic minorities.

Writing about the youth of the Seventh-day Adventist Church, Gottfried Oosterwal observed:

They are part of a culture that in many ways differs radically from the one that shaped the Adventist Church yesteryear. Large --all too large--percentages of Adventist young people are leaving the church. They do not reject the message. To the contrary. Research indicates that the vast majority of them leave because they do not feel at home in this church. It represents to them a culture that no longer exists. Its forms and ways are foreign to them, and hold no appeal. And if they do respond to the message and want to experience and express it in their own way, many of the older members cannot accept them.⁹⁸

For a growing number of Christian denominations, this problem is all too familiar. Frequently the response is pragmatic--give the youth the music they want in order to keep them coming to church.⁹⁹

Alternatively, separate services are provided for various age groups in order to cater to their respective tastes in music.¹⁰⁰ Sadly,

⁹⁷See a report of an international conference conducted in Rome, November 14-18, 1974, concerning "the use of the native musical heritage of various peoples in missionary areas both for their liturgical worship and for the work of evangelization" (Richard J. Schuler, "Native Music for the Missions," Sacred Music 102 [Winter 1975]: 28). Since 1974 the situation in this regard has only intensified.

⁹⁸Gottfried Oosterwal, "Gospel, Culture, and Mission," Ministry 62 (October 1989): 25.

⁹⁹Berglund, A Philosophy of Church Music, ix-x.

¹⁰⁰See Lovelace and Rice, Music and Worship in the Church, 203.

tensions between those who like a certain type of music and those who dislike it have, at times, created deep local schisms.

However, certain exponents of church growth assure that:

Musical gifts that are solidly grounded in Christ, and in touch with current popular forms are essential to a growing church today. The hymnody that developed four hundred years ago in the Reformation has always been at odds with movements for evangelization of the masses. . . . No congregation can expand if it uses only a narrow range of music. No individual member should expect to like everything that is presented.¹⁰¹

Such statements, although betraying ignorance about the music of the Reformation¹⁰², are commonly accepted and increasingly are becoming the basis for experimentation and full-scale operation. Popular musical forms are now deemed "essential" to the church's mission.

Certainly it can be argued that the church must not become isolated in an ivory tower permitting its music to become a cultural backwater.¹⁰³ Nevertheless, others question this philosophy.¹⁰⁴

¹⁰¹Monte Sahlin, Sharing Our Faith with Friends: Without Losing Either (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1990), 123-124.

¹⁰²The idea that Reformation hymnody has always been at odds with movements for mass evangelism is not sustained by the facts of history. Witness the many assertions of opponents of the Protestant Reformation that Luther's hymns gained more converts (referred to as doing "damage" among the people) than did his writings and speeches. See Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, "Luther and Music" in Luther and Culture, by George Forrell, Harold J. Grimm, and Theodore Hoelty-Nickel (Decorah, Iowa: Luther College Press, 1960), 169-170; and Herbert R. Pankratz, "Luther's Utilization of Music in School and Town in the Early Reformation," Andrews University Seminary Studies 22 (Spring 1984): 101. Further, the wide acceptance, use, and dissemination of the more conservatively constructed Genevan Psalter has been called "a unique event in the history of Protestant hymnals" (Walter Blankenburg, "Church Music in Reformed Europe," trans. Hans Heinsheimer in Protestant Church Music: A History by Friedrich Blume [New York: W. W. Norton, 1974], 518-519). See also Waldo Seldon Pratt, The Music of the French Psalter of 1562: A Historical Survey and Analysis with the Music in Modern Notation (New York: Columbia University Press, 1939), 19.

¹⁰³Volkmar Hahn, "Gedanken über die Beziehungen zwischen Gottesdienst und Musik," Musik und Kirche 42 (July-August 1972): 174; and John Rutter, interview with Robert Mark McBain, January 7, 1981 in Robert Mark McBain, "The Choral Music of John Rutter: Analysis and Performance Practices" (DMA dissertation, Arizona State University, 1981), 259-260.

The call to cater to a wide range of musical tastes in worship is usually based on the assumption that decision making in music is solely a matter of conditioned taste. Music is considered an essentially neutral medium. Providing lyrics are in harmony with faith, the rest is inconsequential to the meaning of the communication. Other than the music being performed well or poorly, the medium is not part of the message.¹⁰⁵

Embracing this view of music's place in the church's mission raises a number of problems. For example, Marshall McLuhan's work, which emphasized that "the medium is the message",¹⁰⁶ impugns it. In addition, substantive evidence from the background music industry indicates that music without lyrics is not a neutral medium.¹⁰⁷ It raises questions concerning whether or not distinction can be made between the sacred and profane in music, as well as issues surrounding music's associations. Given the lack of a well-developed philosophy, it is evident that often immediate pressures almost overwhelmingly push church and mission-oriented leadership in the direction of pragmatic solutions.

¹⁰⁴For example, Johansson, Music and Ministry, 42-62; and Westermeyer, "The Bottom Line," 129-131.

¹⁰⁵For an example of this type of reasoning, see Dana Key with Steve Rabey, Don't Stop the Music (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan Publishing House, 1989), 68-69.

¹⁰⁶For discussion of this point, see W. Richard Comstock, "The Achievement of Marshall McLuhan: Formalist of Technological Culture," in Art and Religion as Communication, ed. James Waddell and F. W. Dillistone (Atlanta, Ga.: John Knox Press, 1974), 140-147.

¹⁰⁷For example, see Philip D. Tagg, Kojak--50 Seconds of Television Music: Towards the Analysis of Affect in Popular Music (Göteborg: Musikvetenskapliga Institutionen, 1979); Jerri Ann Husch, "Music of the Workplace: A Study of Muzak Culture" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Massachusetts, 1984); Manfred Clynes, "On Music and Healing," in Music in Medicine: Proceedings, Second International Symposium on Music in Medicine, Ludenscheid, West Germany, October 1984, ed. J. Steffens (N.p.: R. Spintge and R. Droh, 1985), 3-21; and Skubik and Skubik, "Neurophysiology of Rhythm."

Be that as it may, with pertinence reaching beyond his own denomination, Oosterwal summed up the greater problem well when he wrote:

The issue of gospel, culture, and mission is of such enormous consequence for the life and growth of the whole church that it deserves a world conference. The Adventist Church must consider this issue and develop guidelines for its work in all the world. Too much is at stake here: the salvation of the billions of people who now cannot even hear the message because of social and cultural barriers; the growth of the church in all its dimensions, which captivity to specific cultures threatens; the salvation of our own youth; and the finishing of God's work in this generation through a conscious attempt to make the one everlasting gospel relevant again--that is, to make it present truth in the diversity of cultures.¹⁰⁸

In short, the question that begs to be answered is: Can a viable, biblical-belief-oriented approach to the evaluation of music in Christian worship be developed to have transcultural application? Are there any universally applicable factors based on Christian belief to be considered when choosing music for Christian worship?¹⁰⁹

Church Music and Education

The role of the Christian church musician is changing, not least because church music styles and worship practices in both liturgical and non-liturgical churches have undergone immense changes in recent decades.¹¹⁰ Paul Wohlgenuth observed that with the rise of the charismatic movement--potentially "one of the most significant ecumenical music and worship influences of the last

¹⁰⁸Oosterwal, "Gospel, Culture, and Mission," 25.

¹⁰⁹Some of these questions are implied as areas for further study, though in the Seventh-day Adventist context, by James Thomas Bingham, "Liturgy and Ritual as Religious Education: Implications for the Seventh-day Adventist Church" (Ph.D. dissertation, Andrews University 1984), 256-257.

¹¹⁰See Paul W. Wohlgenuth, "Church-Music Education in American Protestant Seminaries," in Duty and Delight: Routley Remembered, ed. Robin A. Leaver and James H. Litton (Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1985), 89.

quarter of the 20th century"¹¹¹--a new style of worship has emerged, demanding a "new type of song leader, choir director, keyboard performer as well as instrumentalist."¹¹²

The number of undergraduate organ majors is steadily diminishing.¹¹³ Traditional organ music in worship services is gradually being replaced, or at least supplemented, by the use of orchestras. "usually of popular music instrumentation",¹¹⁴ more congregational participation in improvisational singing of praise choruses," and at times, even spontaneous spiritual dance."¹¹⁵ Traditional church musicianship training as a whole may be becoming outmoded. One may well ask: What of the future? How should church musicians be trained and prepared for their role? Is it simply a matter of exposing them to pluralism in styles and approaches--preparing them for any eventuality they may face? What should be the church musicians' philosophy? Should they have one? On what basis can they give direction to their church's music program?

The status of church music courses in seminaries is similarly problematic. Considerable discussion surrounds how church music should be taught to trainee ministers, if at all. Judging by

¹¹¹Ibid., 90.

¹¹²Ibid., 89-90.

¹¹³One survey found that "in the three academic years 1982-85, that the number of undergraduate organ majors in American decreased steadily from 673 to 469. Likewise, the number of schools offering a bachelor's degree in organ decreased from 378 to 347 during this period. In the year 1984-85, only 90 baccalaureate degrees were awarded in organ. The problem appears to be intensifying" (John Walker, "Task Force on the New Organist," The American Organist 21 [April 1987]: 5).

¹¹⁴Wohlgenuth, "Church-Music Education in American Protestant Seminaries," 90.

¹¹⁵Ibid.

the dearth of church music studies in North American seminaries,¹¹⁶ it would seem that many denominations are responding in the negative. Reflecting on this situation, Wohlgemuth concluded his short overview of the current status of church music study in American Protestant seminaries saying:

It seems ironic that if church music is regarded as a ministry within the church, as are preaching and Christian Education, seminaries have abdicated their responsibilities in this area and by default let universities with usually less Christian ministry orientation take leadership in church-music ministry education. Now in the mid-1980s seminaries generally still have not assumed major leadership roles in this specialized area.¹¹⁷

To understand the present problem in the education of both church musicians and ministers for worship music leadership, account must be made of the influence of an elemental change in the view of the arts in Western culture which occurred over two hundred years ago, during the period known as the Enlightenment. At that time the concept of art for its own sake with the attendant "feeling that one ought above all to contemplate works of art for the sake of aesthetic satisfaction"¹¹⁸ began to take root. Jerome Stolnitz designated this philosophical reorientation as "the most tremendous change in the whole history of art."¹¹⁹ Gradually this idea has

¹¹⁶See, for example, research cited in Wohlgemuth, "Church-Music Education in American Protestant Seminaries," 91-94; and Larry E. Oldham, "Biblical Foundations for Ministry through Music" (DMA dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1983), 162-183.

¹¹⁷Wohlgemuth, "Church-Music Education in American Protestant Seminaries," 94.

¹¹⁸Wolterstorff, Art in Action, 33.

¹¹⁹Jerome Stolnitz's complete statement is insightful. He wrote: "It is, in our own time, so much a commonplace that the work of art and the aesthetic object generally is 'autonomous' and 'self-contained,' and must be apprehended as such, that we have to catch ourselves up. This has not always been a commonplace. Indeed, throughout most of the history of Western Art, this notion would have seemed not so much false as incomprehensible. During these periods the values of art are iconic or otherwise cognitive, or moral and social, with nothing left over that art can call its own. To repudiate this conception of art is 'the most tremendous change . . . in the whole history of art'" (Jerome Stolnitz, "On the Origins

filtered down into the general philosophy of arts education.

Writing about relatively recent changes in music education philosophy, Michael L. Mark noted that until the middle of the twentieth century the justification for music education "was based on the fact that the aesthetic development of the individual influenced behavior in such a way that a better citizen (in terms of cultural, civic, religious or other values) was expected to be developed."¹²⁰ Since then "the prevailing philosophy of aesthetic education has supported the teaching of music for aesthetic development without expressing the value to society of the aesthetically developed individual."¹²¹ Among other things, this means in practice that music from all periods, cultures, forms, and styles is considered to be equally valid in the curriculum, and the foremost aim is to expose students to differing types of music, thereby developing their sensitivity for artistic expression.¹²²

Undoubtedly there is considerable merit in exposing students to different musics and developing the aesthetic sensitivities for their own sake--"discovering the uniqueness of music, the 'untranslatability of sound'."¹²³ However, it is also clear that exclusive emphasis on this is a direct consequence of "the art for its own sake" concept.

of 'Aesthetic Disinterestedness,' " Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 20 (Winter 1961): 131).

¹²⁰Michael L. Mark, "The Evolution of Music Education Philosophy from Utilitarian to Aesthetic," Journal of Research in Music Education 30 (Spring 1982): 15.

¹²¹Ibid., 20.

¹²²For further details and an expanded description of this approach, see R. A. Choate, ed., Documentary Report of the Tanglewood Symposium (Washington, D.C.: Music Educators National Conference, 1968); and Bennett Reimer, A Philosophy of Music Education (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1970).

¹²³Arthur J. Michaels, "Ground Rules for Aesthetic Education," New Jersey Education Association Review 53 (September 1979): 19.

The significance of this philosophy for church music education lies in the fact that once espoused, it basically assumes the arts to be closed systems. Any evaluation or criticism of an art work is only valid from within the framework of the art itself. There is no legitimate appeal to any other sets of values. Quality art, whether or not it is to be used for worship, is determined on the basis of its adherence to certain applicable aesthetic criteria regarding construction, logic, balance, and proportion. Appropriateness, if considered at all, is seen as a function of good taste, and so the cultivation of good taste is encouraged.¹²⁴ Delineation of the sacred and profane is considered essentially meaningless,¹²⁵ and the spiritual orientation of the composer of no consequence.¹²⁶

Students who study music in Western education systems tend to imbibe this philosophy,¹²⁷ and if they enter the realm of church

¹²⁴For example, see Hannum's comment in the preface to Music and Worship. He wrote: "Most matters of music and the arts are matters of taste, and are not questions of right and wrong."

¹²⁵Routley wrote: "There is--this we must emphasize--a connection between the reappearance of the professional musician as a person of consequence in society (sacred or secular) and the new approach of church music toward the secular. Music is music to a musician; it is sacred or secular to an amateur" (Routley, Music Leadership in the Church, 34). See also Charles T. Smith, Music and Reason: The Art of Listening, Appreciating and Composing (New York: Social Sciences Publishers, 1948), 44.

¹²⁶In this regard, notice the remark by Dominican priest, Father Couturier, and the concurrence of the author who cited him: "'It would be safer to turn to geniuses without faith than to believers without talent.' Indeed, it would, for the reason that it is now the artist who must instruct the believer in the exercise and expression of the capacity for enjoyment that has been so atrophied in Christian circles" (Roger Hazelton, A Theological Approach to Art [Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon Press, 1967], 135).

¹²⁷This is particularly true of musicians educated in secular institutions, although Christian colleges have also encouraged this way of thinking, often because their professors were themselves trained under this philosophy. For examples of Christian assent to this aesthetically oriented philosophy, see Gene Edward Veith, Jr., The Gift of Art: The Place of the Arts in Scripture (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1983), 58, 59; Jacques Maritain, Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry, Bolligen Series XXXVI (New York:

music they probably will apply the same outlook. Unfortunately their emphasis on aesthetic considerations often sets them on a collision course with both clergy and congregation.¹²⁸ As Robert D. Berglund aptly observed:

The musicians have often been well educated in the craft and art of music (they sing or play the piano or organ well) but have had little understanding in the theological and philosophical framework essential for providing stability and consistent direction.¹²⁹

This has helped to produce the tension often found between musicians and clergy, and it also highlights the fact that aesthetic values cannot be the only consideration in sacred music choice.

The pastors, on the other hand, "have been well educated theologically and philosophically, but often have had little or no understanding in the art of music and its application to church music."¹³⁰ Precisely because of their more rationally oriented theological education--rather than a broad philosophical education that would include the aesthetic--trainee ministers are less likely to accept an aesthetic approach in their church music courses. Consequently, what the musician upholds as quality and good taste frequently differs from what the seminarian thinks is appropriate. Because of this, seminary administrators are reticent to hire purely music-trained instructors to teach church music courses, and hence, finding instructors with an acceptable perspective to teach these

Pantheon Books, 1953), 51; and Harold Byron Hannum, Christian Search for Beauty (Nashville, Tenn.: Southern Publishing Association, 1975), 24, 35, 47, 50-51, 112.

¹²⁸In this regard, notice the following statement by Lovelace and Rice: "A church musician cannot serve as a minister through the medium of music unless he understands the theological implications of his work. The music chosen and performed will state a theological position whether the artist realizes it or not. If he is not careful, he may be promoting in his choice of music and opposite viewpoint from that of everything else that is said and done" (Lovelace and Rice, Music and Worship in the Church, 219).

¹²⁹Berglund, A Philosophy of Church Music, x.

¹³⁰*Ibid.*

courses can be difficult. Clearly the dichotomizing of two knowledge bases, the musician's predominantly aesthetic perspective and the minister's theological perspective--which, due to his orientation to either liturgy or evangelism, is probably also somewhat pragmatic--sets the stage for conflict.

Compounding this tension, congregations also may exhibit a particular orientation regarding church music. Using Dorothy Sayers telling phrase "the snobbery of the banal" to describe one such orientation in some conservatively aligned churches, Frank Gaebelein wrote:

They are the kind of people who look down upon good music as highbrow, who confuse worship with entertainment, who deplore serious drama as worldly yet are contentedly devoted to third rate television shows, whose tastes in reading run to the piously sentimental, and who cannot distinguish a kind of religious calendar art from honest art. For them better aesthetic standards are 'egghead' and spiritually suspect.¹³¹

The pretentious anti-aestheticism of many Christians who consider the fine arts as "worldly" and therefore to be shunned, but who, at the same time, absorb mass media fare unthinkingly, has been strongly attacked by Gaebelein and H. R. Rookmaaker. It is their contention that the church's self-righteous and mistaken retreat from the arts, where indeed it should provide a gospel witness, is partly responsible for the disparaging attitude toward the arts found in Christian circles today.¹³²

Given these congregational attitudes, the weaknesses of the narrow perspectives evident in ministerial training and their own one-sided aesthetic education, qualified musicians in the church frequently feel isolated and excluded. They often find themselves questioned as to whether or not their training has qualified them to

¹³¹Gaebelein, The Christian, the Arts, and Truth, 51-52. For a similar viewpoint see Donald A. Garlock, "Fundamentalism and the Fine Arts," Fundamentalist Journal 1 (December 1982): 36.

¹³²H. R. Rookmaaker, Art Needs No Justification (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1978), 17, 20.

make decisions about contemporary worship music styles.¹³³ Thus, in their field of expertise, the one area where they feel they could make a contribution to their community of faith, musicians find themselves marooned and unable to use what they have learned.

Reacting to this, some simply go ahead and do what they think should be done despite criticism. Others resort to doing what the congregation wants, gaining their musical fulfillment elsewhere than at church. Still others live with the tensions of compromise, or opt for a combination of approaches, and the standoff between musicians, clergy, and congregations often remains unresolved.

In this situation, one must ask if some educational modification, initially at least for church musicians and ministry, would help to alleviate the problem. Although educational changes are often glibly touted as solutions to monumental problems, in this case there may be considerable merit in pursuing this option.

In 1929 John Dewey wrote: "The problem of restoring integration and cooperation between man's beliefs about the world in which he lives and his beliefs about the values and purposes that should direct his conduct is the deepest problem of modern life."¹³⁴ Education must be a means of approaching this problem, even in the field of church music. But how? One thing is clear, overloading music curricula with courses in theory, history, technique, and even appreciation, has left no time for the consideration of the integration of faith, learning, and behavior in this field.¹³⁵

¹³³See Otto Mittermeier, "Wir Haben Einen Traum . . ." in Liturgie und Dichtung: Ein Interdisziplinäres Kompendium I, ed. Hansjakob Becker and R. Kaczynski (St. Ottilien, Germany: Eos Verlag Erzabtei, 1983), 867.

¹³⁴John Dewey; quoted in David W. Bolam and James L. Henderson, Art and Belief (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1967), 192.

¹³⁵It is an interesting fact of Western educational history that once all education was connected by philosophy--all subjects were integrated as part of an ultimate whole. Then, autonomy and specialization for each subject evolved, and learning was

In church music, perhaps even more than in other areas of music study, a Christian outlook is essential "to take stock of aesthetic theories, and to work out the implications of Christian belief in this area."¹³⁶ The following questions must be addressed:

How is music used? What does it communicate? . . . Does the music work with or against the theology of a particular liturgical practice? . . . What is the working philosophy that determines the way hundreds of little decisions are made about the use of music in the church?¹³⁷

Perhaps some even more fundamental issues need to be confronted first. For example: How does one really think "Christianly" in the arts?¹³⁸ What is the nature of a religious

fragmented. Presently, interdisciplinary studies are again coming into vogue, even in secular institutions of learning, because it is recognized that the answers to many questions are often multifaceted, and that the wholistic, integrated perspective is preferable.

¹³⁶Arthur F. Holmes, afterword to The Making of a Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur F. Holmes (Downers Grove, Ill.: Inter Varsity Press, 1985), 134. It is interesting to note that among music educators in general the lack of a serious music philosophy is acknowledged and lamented. For example, K. G. Pont wrote: "The absence of serious musica speculativa and the general ignorance of the philosophy of music are, I suspect, a great weakness in our musical culture" (K. G. Pont, "A Philosophy of Music Education," in Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974 [Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976], 293).

¹³⁷Linda Clark, "Toward a New Working Philosophy of Music in Worship," Reformed Liturgy and Music 17 (Summer 1983): 111.

¹³⁸In this regard, Leland Ryken made a telling observation: "The arts by their very nature are value-laden. They embody and express human values. Even the aspects of human experience that painters and composers and writers choose for artistic portrayal are an implied comment about what is important and worthy of attention.

"And once they have selected their subject, artists express an attitude toward the subject. The arts are affective: they are constructed so as to encourage an audience to share the artist's way of experiencing or perceiving reality. Works of art by their nature awaken attitudes or feelings of sympathy and aversion, approval and disapproval toward the whole range of human experience.

"While the importance of perspective in works of art is probably a truism, it is too often overlooked that the study of art, music and literature is just as influenced by perspective. Critics and teachers of the arts have a bias, too. They even reveal a bias in the works they choose to discuss or include in a course syllabus. And once they have chosen their works, they reveal a perspective in

work of art? What constitutes the "Christianness" of a work of art--is it the subject matter that associates it with Christianity, or the fact that Christianity makes use of it, or is it something else altogether?¹³⁹

It is true that the non-propositional nature of the musical art form intensifies the difficulty of pursuing these considerations in the field of church music. That they have received virtually no exposure in music education, or in seminary courses, may suggest several things: (1) that they are considered unimportant, (2) that there is ignorance or apathy regarding them, or (3) that those recognizing the issues feel helpless to know how to approach them. While the first two reasons may stem from attitudinal problems, the last clearly indicates a need for the development of philosophical thought.¹⁴⁰

the aspects of a work that they single out for comment and in the attitudes they express toward the topics they have chosen for scrutiny. What critics and teachers or the arts omit from discussion can tell us as much about their bias as what they include" (Leland Ryken, "The Creative Arts," in The Making of a Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur Holmes [Downers Grove, Ill: InterVarsity Press, 1985], 111).

¹³⁹These issues are profiled in an article by Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī in which he criticized Christian thinking and discussion about the arts. He noted that in Christian circles the question concerning what aspect of an art work constitutes its "Christianness" often escapes discussion because there is more interest in analyzing the artist's life and background in a sociological setting. He contended that what Christians say about "religion and the artist's means" is basically the same as that which would be found in a pagan culture (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "On the Nature of the Work of Art in Islām," Islām and the Modern Age 1 [1970]: 73).

¹⁴⁰Deciding how faith relates to behavior is never easy, particularly in an artistic area. However, to neglect wrestling with the problems, as they ultimately relate to worship music, leaves us precariously vulnerable to an unfortunate truism of our age--"For all values outside of our own field of expertise, the mass media judgments are authoritative" (Harry S. Broudy, "A Philosophy of the Arts in an Emerging Society," Music Educators Journal 56 [September 1969]: 45). Failure to develop a basis for decision making will ensure continuation of the proverbial conflicts and frustrations, particularly among the educated partners in worship leadership.

Phenomenology of Religion

So far, discussion has centered on the practical problems facing the Christian church in the choice of suitable worship music. At this point it is significant to note three scholarly fields concerned with some of the same issues and problems, albeit from their own perspectives. In addition to their being related to this study, recognition of their interests helps to avoid what could be termed preoccupation with a conservative Christian fetish.

Writing in the context of the study of music as a religious phenomenon--arguably the most closely related academic discipline to the core issues of Christian worship music choice--Joyce Irwin observed that in all religions "there is usually a form of music considered acceptable for worship."¹⁴¹ She went on to submit that when music forms considered appropriate to other occasions are introduced into the formal worship setting, debate ensues. The issues in such controversy are complex. They include interpretation of "the relationship of the sacred to the secular," "definition of sacred music," discussion concerning whether or not music's appeal to the senses detracts from or contributes to devotion, besides more fundamental questions "about human nature and human access to the divine."¹⁴²

Irwin concluded her comments, which actually form the introduction to Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, with the remark:

The present volume is only a first step in the direction of a phenomenology of religious music. The obscurity of primary sources, the scarcity of secondary analyses, and the absence of a common body of theory push a truly comparative study of music as a religious phenomenon well into the future.¹⁴³

¹⁴¹Irwin, Sacred Sound, v.

¹⁴²Ibid.

¹⁴³Ibid., vi.

Clearly this is a summons for the obstacles to the development of this field of study to be removed. Perhaps the "scarcity of secondary analyses and the absence of a common body of theory" in this field may relate to similar lacks of significant material pertaining to choice of Christian worship music, particularly in multi-cultural settings.

Irwin's observation that in the available studies, controversies over religious music have coincided with controversies over theological understanding¹⁴⁴ is also significant and seems to support the idea that beliefs and sacred music styles are somehow related. This places one of the interest areas in this field of study very close to those providing the main motivation for the present research; and perhaps exploration of the relationship between belief and sacred music style will begin to relieve the scarcity of secondary analysis and absence of theory that Irwin lamented.

Ethnomusicology

In a comprehensive, evaluative survey of the discipline of ethnomusicology in 1983, leading ethnomusicologist Bruno Nettl, pointed up a central question to this field. Having determined that "the function of music in human society, what music ultimately does, is to control humanity's relationship to the supernatural mediating between people and other beings, and to support the integrity of individual social groups,"¹⁴⁵ he later focused on what he felt was the fundamental issue in ethnomusicology--"the determinants of musical style."¹⁴⁶ He defined this issue by first noting that the

¹⁴⁴Ibid., v.

¹⁴⁵Bruno Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology: Twenty-Nine Issues and Concepts (Urbana, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1983), 159.

¹⁴⁶Ibid., 235.

question is not "why is music as it is, or how did this piece come to sound that way but, rather, what determined the stylistic character of the main body of music of a particular society?"¹⁴⁷ This question, according to Nettl, continues to generate heated debate among ethnomusicologists.¹⁴⁸

Assuming Nettl's judgment that one of music's principal functions in society is to regulate humanity's relationship to the supernatural and mediate between people and other beings is trustworthy, could it be that what determines the stylistic character of society's music is at least somewhat related to that function?

Another ethnomusicologist, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, began a paper on music in Islamic culture with the assertion:

Art has been repeatedly defined by scholars in East and West as a sensory expression of the world-view of a people or culture. Despite the apparent agreement that religio-philosophical ideas have a determining influence on the arts as well as on other features of culture, little has been done by ethnomusicologists to bring into focus the relationship between religions and music.¹⁴⁹

Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī went on to point out that studies of religious or liturgical music done to that time, tended to document the superficial influences of religion on music indicating, for example: "What prayers are sung? For what religious occasion is the liturgy performed? Who performs it?"¹⁵⁰ She lamented that another type of investigation, the study of how religious ideas have "molded in subtle ways the content as well as the form of a culture's musical heritage,"¹⁵¹ has been neglected.

¹⁴⁷Ibid.

¹⁴⁸Ibid.

¹⁴⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Muwashshah: A Vocal Form in Islamic Culture," Ethnomusicology 19 (January 1975): 1.

¹⁵⁰Ibid.

¹⁵¹Ibid.

Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's overt interrelation of Nettl's point concerning music's key function in the religious context and the question about what determines the stylistic character of a society's music seem to indicate that the key question posed above is worthy of research and that the fundamental issue for ethnomusicology--as one eminent scholar perceived it--is not far removed from the issues endemic to Christian worship music choice. Perhaps the answers sought by ethnomusicologists to their main question will have relevance for the problem addressed in this study, and vice versa.¹⁵²

Western Musicology

During the last several decades, scholars of Western musicology increasingly have become aware that the extreme specialization and resultant abstract research has produced an artificial insulation in musical understanding.¹⁵³ Severe criticism has been made of the separation of music from its social context and

¹⁵²The issues raised here border closely on the study of universals in musical styles. Because of the difficulties involved in such study--the comparison and examination of data beyond one's own area of field research--few researchers have been able to pursue it to any extent. As Nketia observed: "There is at present no body of systematic information on the universals of music beyond the random listing of examples of the most obvious types" (Nketia, "Universal Perspectives in Ethnomusicology," 19). Mieczyslaw Kolinski calls the search for universals "one of the most ambitious objectives of musicological research" (Mieczyslaw Kolinski, "Recent Trends in Ethnomusicology," *Ethnomusicology* 11 [1967]: 5). Yet despite the difficulties, it "must be pursued" with due respect for the complexity of the task (Nketia, "Universal Perspectives in Ethnomusicology," 19).

¹⁵³For example, see the discussion of this in Ivo Supić, "Science on Music and Values in Music," *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 28 (Fall 1969): 71-77; Gilbert Chase, "Musicology, History, and Anthropology," in *Current Thought in Musicology*, ed. John W. Grubbs, Rebecca A. Baltzer, Gilbert L. Blount, and Leeman Perkins (Austin, Tex.: University of Texas Press, 1976), 231-246; and the preface to Jacob Oppen, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900: Concomitants of the Natural Sciences in the Musical, Literary, and Graphic Arts" (Ph.D. dissertation, Florida State University, 1970), iii-xiii.

meaning,¹⁵⁴ its psychological or physiological influence, and its ethical and spiritual role,¹⁵⁵ and calls have been made for a more integrated approach to music study.¹⁵⁶ Currently, a more wholistic perspective which takes into account the "social meaning and value encoded in musical works,"¹⁵⁷ including its religious role, is being proposed¹⁵⁸ and pursued.¹⁵⁹ Thus, what Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī saw as a neglect in ethnomusicology is also receiving attention in the parent discipline of musicology, as musical style is being studied not only in terms of its technical evolution, but also in its social and philosophical contexts.

However, as Ivo Supićić noted in 1987, the sociology of music as a unique field of study was only just beginning to establish itself in terms of definition of its subject and methods of research.¹⁶⁰ Thus, contributions to the broadening of

¹⁵⁴See Christopher Ballantine, Music and Its Social Meanings (New York: Gordon and Breach Science Publishers, 1984), xvi.

¹⁵⁵See Daniélou, "Ethical and Spiritual Values in Music," 3-7.

¹⁵⁶See also Ivan Vandro, "The Role of Music in the Education of Man: Orient and Occident," The World of Music 22 (1980): 11.

¹⁵⁷Ballantine, Music and Its Social Meanings, xvi.

¹⁵⁸For example, Supićić wrote: "Musicology as a whole needs a pluralistic conception according to which its subject, music, would be explored as an art--as a product of human creativity in the technical-theoretical, historical, sociological, cultural psychological, philosophical, and spiritual context" (Supićić, "Science on Music and Values in Music," 73).

¹⁵⁹See for example, Glen Alan Bauer, "A Contextual Approach to Schoenberg's Atonal Works: Self-Expression, Religion, and Music Theory" (Ph.D. dissertation, Washington University, 1986). Notice also McAllester's assertion that the influence of religious thought and experience can no longer be ignored in serious music study today (McAllester, "Music as Ecumenical Force," 8, 9). The development of music in the context of scientific thought has also been explored (Oppen, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900"; and Eugene Cluckman, "Tonality and Gravity," Current Musicology 36 [1983]: 113-124).

¹⁶⁰Ivo Supićić, Music in Society: A Guide to the Sociology of Music (New York: Pendragon Press, 1987), xii.

perspective in musicology are only gradually accumulating, and it will probably take a considerable amount of time for these new areas of study to provide the type of wholistic approach envisaged. Unfortunately, there is the danger that they will, in turn, also become isolated, specialized disciplines themselves.

Nonetheless, now that the problem of extreme specialization is recognized and a more wholistic perspective is being encouraged, the development of Western religious music style in its religious-philosophical context also deserves more thorough investigation. These newly emerged concerns in Western musicology are obviously akin to the problem addressed in this study.

Statement of the Problem

Christians have difficulty discerning what music is appropriate for worship. Because Scripture gives no explicit, systematically developed guidelines for worship music styles, an appeal has been made to a number of different approaches for guidance. However, each of these approaches has its weaknesses. Although the challenge has been issued to develop a Christian philosophy of the arts based on fundamental Christian beliefs, to date no fully satisfying philosophy has emerged to form the basis for Christian decision making in worship music.¹⁶¹

The question remains: Can distinctions between appropriate and inappropriate worship music be made on the basis of scriptural beliefs apart from predominantly subjective interpretation and culturally conditioned taste? Further, what constitutes Christian uniqueness in a transcultural or trans-generational worship music

¹⁶¹Neither this statement nor the following questions are meant to indicate that no study has been done in this area, or that no valuable material has been produced for discussion of these issues. However, what is available is not without its weaknesses, and hence this statement and the questions posed stand as a summons to provide more satisfying answers.

context? And, how can the interaction of faith and praxis be made more meaningful in church music education?

From the contexts of the phenomenology of religion, ethnomusicology, and musicology this study touched on three allied concerns: the lack of theory and secondary analysis in the study of music as a religious phenomenon; the influence of music's function as a facilitator of humanity's relationship to the supernatural on the stylistic development of a society's music; and, the impact of historical changes in fundamental belief conceptions on the development of Christian sacred music style.

The Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to explore a core aspect of worldview concerning the nature of ultimate reality, the concept of divine transcendence/immanence, as a transcultural influence in the development of sacred music style¹⁶², and to suggest this as a viable theoretical base for choices among sacred music styles in Christian worship.

In addition, this study attempts to synthesize research from the fields of musicology, ethnomusicology, sociology of music, philosophy of music, theology of music, phenomenology of religion, and sentics; to provide some secondary analysis and advances a theoretical base to facilitate the study of music as a religious phenomenon; and to contribute to the general understanding of musical style development in society, as well as that in Western Christianity, in particular.

¹⁶²Clyde S. Kilby described the embodiment of worldview in music as an "old and tantalizing problem" (Clyde S. Kilby, Christianity and Aesthetics [Chicago: InterVarsity Press, 1961], 25). James Earl Gardner, having surveyed the literature in this field, concluded that: "The concept of world projection [in the arts, particularly music] remains attractive even if specific analyses are only partial" (James Earl Gardner, "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics" [DMA dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1982], 196).

The contribution of the study does not lie in the suggestion that worldview affects musical style, for this has been posited already. Rather its contribution is in delineating how a core component of worldview affects musical style and the application of this knowledge to the evaluation of sacred musical styles appropriate for Christian worship.

It was also the purpose of this study to take up the challenge of two papers that have had a major impact on its conception and approach. The first, "Musical Communication of the Churches" by M. J. Grieger,¹⁶³ written for lay readership, made an insightful appraisal of music among the various Christian denominations on the basis of key beliefs and inquired concerning the direction of music in Lutheranism.

The second, by Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?,"¹⁶⁴ forcefully contended that historically, changes in religious thought and practice have brought concomitant revolutions in what is considered to be proper religious music and suggested this idea is worthy of in-depth study.¹⁶⁵ She wrote: "The problem is big and the materials diverse. But the rewards of the study are manifold."¹⁶⁶ She went on to submit that studies of interrelations between religious beliefs and music could contribute to intercultural/interreligious understanding, and "alleviate many practical problems which contemporary religious communities and leaders face."¹⁶⁷ Such studies, she suggested, "could provide

¹⁶³M. J. Grieger, "Musical Communication of the Churches," The Christian News 20 (July 29, 1982): 14-16.

¹⁶⁴Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 21-34.

¹⁶⁵Ibid., 29, 30.

¹⁶⁶Ibid., 30.

¹⁶⁷Ibid.

guidelines for solving the problems caused by cultural diversity, the revolt against established norms, and the controversy between conservative and liberal elements within the congregation," not only within Christendom, but also in Muslim circles.¹⁶⁸ In her conclusion she petitioned theologians, religious historians, and comparative religionists to combine their research and knowledge with that of aestheticians, music historians, and music theorists. She urged:

It is hoped that scholars as well as institutions will encourage and support such efforts for cooperation in future scholarly activities. It may be the only way to cope with the need, felt profoundly in our steadily more complex world community, to bridge the gaps which separate each of us from other branches of knowledge, as well as from our counterparts in other religious communities.¹⁶⁹

This study seeks to respond to this challenge and the concept proposed--termed by one reviewer a basic hypothesis that "needs to be further tested through more detailed examination of music and related concepts in specific liturgical orders."¹⁷⁰

Finally, the purpose of this study was not to provide definitive, final answers, rather it was to attempt a meaningful contribution to the ongoing investigation of the place of music in Christian worship. There is intentionality to reflect the spirit of the fourth proposition in the conclusion of Church Music and Theology, where Routley counseled:

That the criticism of church music in practice should proceed from the ground of doctrine, should avoid facile legalism, and should be constructive enough to encourage the good before being repressive enough to ensure the avoidance of error.¹⁷¹

¹⁶⁸Ibid.

¹⁶⁹Ibid., 31.

¹⁷⁰Kay Kaufman Shelemay, review of Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin in Ethnomusicology 30 (Winter 1986): 177.

¹⁷¹Routley, Church Music and Theology, 108.

Methodology

Grounded in the fields of music and religion, this dissertation is interdisciplinary and philosophic in nature. Therefore, research followed a methodology appropriate for philosophical investigation. Various lines of evidence, supported by documentary research from primary and secondary sources in several disciplines--including Western musicology, ethnomusicology, sociology of music, philosophy of music, theology of music, phenomenology of religion, and sentics--were collected, analyzed, and arranged to present a logically developed theoretical base to apply to the problem.¹⁷²

In several ways this study followed a methodology analogous to that used by Thomas R. Martland in his classic, philosophical study Religion as Art: An Interpretation. Among the points Martland enumerated as part of his methodology, he included the following that have relevance for the present study: First, he indicated that he would develop his argument "through analysis rather than synthesis, by way of thesis to evidence rather than by way of detail to summary."¹⁷³ Second, he explained that he would use only representative data.¹⁷⁴ Third, he presented his task not as

¹⁷²Francis Bacon drew an interesting illustration from the honeybee that resembles this approach. He wrote: "Those who have treated of the sciences have been either empirics or dogmatical. The former like ants only heap up and use their store, the latter like spiders spin out their own webs. The bee, a mean between both, extracts matter from the flowers of the garden and the field, but works and fashions it by its own efforts. The true labor of philosophy resembles hers, for it neither relies entirely nor principally on the powers of the mind, nor yet lays up in the memory the matter afforded by the experiments of natural history and mechanics in its raw state, but changes and works it in the understanding" (Sir Francis Bacon, "Novum Organum, Book I, 95," in Advancement of Learning, Novum Organum, New Atlantis by Sir Francis Bacon, Great Books of the Western World, vol. 30, ed. Robert Maynard Hutchins [Chicago: William Benton Publisher, 1952], 126).

¹⁷³Thomas R. Martland, Religion as Art: An Interpretation (Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press, 1981), 3.

¹⁷⁴Ibid., 4.

amassing an unconnected, comprehensive list of phenomena, but rather in revealing an underlying structure--"a system of probability relationships."¹⁷⁵ Fourth, recognizing that a thesis does not prove itself, he characterized his study only as an interpretation.¹⁷⁶ Last, he admitted that his thesis was "vulnerable to counter example," thus he wrote in terms of "justifying the thesis, rather than verifying it."¹⁷⁷

Similarly, the argument in the present study was essentially developed through analysis "by way of thesis to evidence." In this case the thesis--that there is a relationship between worldview and development of artistic expression--is rooted in well-established truisms. For example, Claude Levi-Strauss argued the connection between language and the mindset of its originating culture as follows:

Between culture and language there cannot be no relations at all. . . . If there were no relations at all that would lead us to assume that the human mind is a kind of jumble--that there is no connection at all between what the mind is doing on one level and what the mind is doing on another level.¹⁷⁸

The connection between worldview and artistic style is also overtly recognized in the realm of visual art. The closing remarks of Robert Scranton in Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art provide one forceful example of this. Summarizing his observations regarding causative forces in the formation of artistic style, Scranton wrote:

Changes in style represent changes in the conception of the nature of the order of truth and reality among those who espouse the style. This is the explanation of why style changes, if it changes, and why it does not, if it does not--a question that cannot be answered simply in terms of technique and forces and

¹⁷⁵Ibid., 4, 5.

¹⁷⁶Ibid.

¹⁷⁷Ibid., 9.

¹⁷⁸Claude Levi-Strauss, Structural Anthropology, vol. 1, trans. Claire Jacobson and Brook Grundfest Schoepf (New York: Basic Books Publishers, 1963), 79.

practices of art itself, but must be understood in relation to visions of the world in the profoundest sense.¹⁷⁹

Some evidence that this is recognized as true for the development of music's stylistic characteristics is presented in chapter 2.

However, the object is not to prove this connection, but to assume its existence as a well-founded hypothesis and proceed to understand by analysis how the mind's function on one level--an aspect of worldview--and its function on another level--the development of music style--are interrelated.

This approach is by no means out of place in a study investigating a religious context; in fact, it is intrinsically legitimate because it is commonly recognized that religious beliefs, in contrast with other sorts of beliefs, are not seen as conclusions from experience, but as "prior to it; for those who hold them, religious beliefs are not inductive, they are paradigmatic; the world . . . provides not evidences for their truth, but illustrations of it."¹⁸⁰

Of course, this view of reality, with its implied departure from the path of strict empiricism, may prove uncomfortable for

¹⁷⁹Robert L. Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964), 367. For statements by other authors who acknowledged the connection between worldview and artistic style, see Bruno Bettelheim and Leonardo Ricci (ibid., 2) and Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective, 143-177. See also Eric Gill's forcefully argued "Art and Reality," in The Hindu View of Art, by Mulk Raj Anand (Bombay: Asia Publishing House, 1957) xi-xix. The following writers have done significant work to establish the relationship between worldview and the visual arts: Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "God in Visual Aesthetic Expression--A Comparative Study in Transcendence Symbolization," in The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson (New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982), 234-266; H. R. Rookmaaker, Modern Art and the Death of a Culture, (London: InterVarsity Press, 1973); and Wolterstorff, Art in Action, 122-174. Note also Gardner's summary of other notable contributions in this area, "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics," 189-196.

¹⁸⁰Clifford Geertz, Islām Observed: Religious Development in Morocco and Indonesia (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968), 98. This is affirmed in Ananda K. Coomaraswamy, The Transformation of Nature in Art (New York: Dover Publications, 1956), 35.

non-believers and statistically oriented individuals. However, it must not be discounted in the study of a religious context such as a worship setting, where sacred symbols like the arts "work to create and sustain belief."¹¹ If, in a believing community, it is natural and accepted to work and think from belief (thesis) to phenomena (evidence), then it is in keeping with the nature of what this study explores to follow the same procedure in seeking to investigate the relationship between worldview and sacred music style. The imposition of strict empiricism with a totally inductive approach may, in fact, be precarious, potentially foisting pointless classification on what could ultimately prove to be insignificant phenomenological details.

This is not meant to belittle concern for avoiding willful bias, or to depreciate recognition of the tentative nature of the conclusions in a study of this kind. On the contrary, it is for this reason that the aim of this study was simply to proffer a theoretical base with paradigmatic implications,¹² and not to furnish irrefutable proof that satisfies empirical validity criteria and solves the problem once and for all.

Another point of parallel with Martland's methodology is in the use of representative data. Just as Martland contended for his own study that it was virtually impossible, in fact not even desirable, to present a full-scale inventory of phenomena in various contexts,¹³ it was likewise the case in the present study. Presentation of a broad-ranging analysis of ritual music practice from many religious communities in various world cultures is prohibitive, and not necessarily helpful. Rather, to develop a

¹¹Cartford, "Report from Latin America," 100.

¹²This parallels Martland's characterization of his study as an interpretation.

¹³Martland, Religion as Art, 4.

system of "probability relationships" which can constantly be tested against fresh data independent of that from which the thesis is derived seemed a more valuable pursuit, and certainly not out of keeping with the methodology of a number of other related disciplines.¹⁸⁴

Among those who appreciate the relevance of seeking to establish the relationship between worldview and artistic expression, most would agree that this is extremely difficult to accomplish in the art of music.¹⁸⁵ Recognition of this makes it

¹⁸⁴Martland noted that the disciplines of history and the history of religions use this approach (ibid., 4). This is born out by Mircea Eliade, respected historian of religion, who compared one aspect of the methodology of his discipline with the work of a psychoanalyst. He wrote: "One, like the other, is obliged not to lose touch with the given facts; they follow empirical methods; their goal is to understand 'situations'--personal situations in the case of the psychologist, historical situations in the case of the historian of religions. But the psychologist knows that he will not arrive at the understanding of an individual situation, and consequently cannot help his patient recover, except in so far as he can succeed in disclosing a structure behind the particular set of symptoms . . . the historian of religions proceeds no differently" (Mircea Eliade, "Methodological Remarks on the Study of Religious Symbolism," in The History of Religions: Essays in Methodology, ed. Mircea Eliade and Joseph M. Kitagawa with a preface by Jerald C. Brauer [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1959], 95). Eliade emphasized that the ultimate goal of the research is to discover a structure behind the set of phenomena. It is interesting also to note Eliade's suggestion that "the psychologist improves his means of research and rectifies his theoretical conclusions by taking into consideration the discoveries made during the process of analysis" (ibid.). Thus, continuing analysis of fresh data is recommended as a natural curb against skewed theories. However, while a single strand of evidence is insufficient to develop and sustain a theory of probability relationships, it is also inadequate to invalidate it.

¹⁸⁵See, for example, Akira Tamba's statement made in the context of a discussion of the influence of Buddhism on traditional Japanese music: "But, when one is attempting to establish relationships between dogma and the music, one lacks assured support and one is reduced to making hypotheses, to intuitions based on very general historical data" (Akira Tamba, "Confluence of Spiritual and Aesthetic Research in Traditional Japanese Music," The World of Music 25 [1983]: 31). See also Gardner's analysis: "In music, the most abstract of the arts, the connection between the sounds and the worlds is more illusive" ("An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics," 191).

imperative to proceed meticulously from the known to the unknown in the presentation of the argument.

There is, however, ample evidence that other researchers from a variety of disciplines have travelled this difficult road before. For example, in the introduction to a musicological study, Bauer observed: "No one who has studied the history and philosophy of science imagines that speculation can be avoided in any area if there is to be any significant addition to our understanding."¹⁸⁶ From the setting of the physical sciences, probably the most empirically oriented of all disciplines, Thomas S. Kuhn stated: "The scientist in crisis will constantly try to generate speculative theories that, if successful, may disclose the road to a new paradigm and if unsuccessful, can be surrendered with relative ease."¹⁸⁷

It has already been noted that many Christians sense that their worship music practice is in a state of crisis, and that there is little certainty of which way to turn. Perhaps what is needed is a theory that may disclose the road to a new paradigm. While it is important to keep "pure guesswork to a minimum," as Eric Werner advised, "the humanities must make use of well-founded working hypotheses, which seldom impair and often advance scientific thought."¹⁸⁸

¹⁸⁶Bauer, "A Contextual Approach to Schoenberg's Atonal Works," 15.

¹⁸⁷Thomas S. Kuhn, The Structure of Scientific Revolutions, 2d ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970), 87.

¹⁸⁸Eric Werner, The Sacred Bridge: The Interdependence of Liturgy and Music in Synagogue and Church During the First Millennium (London: Dennis Dobson, 1959), xx. See also Walter Pater's statement: "Theories which bring into connection with each other modes of thought and feeling, periods of taste, forms of art and poetry, which the narrowness of men's minds constantly tends to oppose to each other, have a great stimulus for the intellect, and are almost always worth understanding" (quoted in Curt Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art: Style in the Fine Arts, Music and the Dance [New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1946], 26).

Failure to develop and use such hypotheses and theories eventually reduces the researcher to a mere "accountant of phenomena."¹⁸⁹ At a time when diversity of practice predominates, as is the case in the arena of Christian worship music today, the temptation is great merely to record what is happening. As Martland contended, however, a boundless, full-scale inventory of facts has little value "until the information becomes predictable, until its randomness is structured by finite and ordered systems of probability relationships."¹⁹⁰ It is the philosophical exploration of one such probability relationship that sums up the methodology of this study.

Delimitations

Certain delimitations were applied to this study. Although the general term "worldview" is used in this study, the prime focus is on one aspect of worldview--the concept of divine transcendence/immanence. Recognizing that worldviews are packages of interrelated beliefs, not isolated, single tenets, reference was made to other aspects as they related to the main focus of attention.

This study focused on the general characteristics of sacred music style used in public worship, with the major concern being the music itself, not lyrics. The reasons for restricting this study to the general features of musical style were first, the need to tackle the most difficult aspect of church music evaluation. Second, Nettl contended that "if we are to be specific about the way in which music reflects the values of a culture, we can do so best by dealing with those aspects of music that are constantly present in its

¹⁸⁹This term was coined by Lecomte de Nouy, quoted in Werner, The Sacred Bridge, xx.

¹⁹⁰Martland, Religion as Art, 4.

musical repertory."¹⁹¹ This suggests that associated lyrics are not necessarily the best index to musical communication. Third, general features of style tend to be reflected in more than one form of artistic expression, thus permitting cross-referencing on several levels.¹⁹² Fourth, although individual composers have their own outlooks on life and modes of expression, and the power to influence the development of the art as a whole, they also partake of and reflect the general outlook of their culture's beliefs and values in their music.¹⁹³ Fifth, because predominant worldview conceptions are not so volatile, their greater stability over time suggests

¹⁹¹Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 150.

¹⁹²For an example of the development of this idea, see Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art. It should be noted that the concept of synchronous style development has its detractors. See Arnulf Omdal, "Tidsånden og Musikkhistorisk Periodisering," Studia Musicologica Norvegica 6 (1980): 81-95. Translated for the researcher by E. Lundstrom. Without doubt the Geistesgeschichte approach of which Sachs is a proponent has its defects. For example, Omdal's criticism of its imprecise definition of "the spirit of the age" is relevant. However, Omdal betrayed the orientation of his own assumptions and prejudices when he discussed Friedrich Blume's use of the "spirit of the age" as a causal explanation of stylist development. He argued vehemently that because discussion of Zeitgeist enters the realm of metaphysics it should be rejected out of hand (ibid., 88). Interestingly, Omdal made no mention of Sach's work The Commonwealth of Art which countered some of the criticisms he later developed. For example, he attacked the premise that art forms develop simultaneously (ibid., 90-91). However, in 1946 Sach's had already explained that "synchronous" style development does not necessarily indicate simultaneous development (The Commonwealth of Art, 370). Sach's main thrust of argument here seems to indicate that comparable features in the development of style among different art forms may be offset by several decades, but not by long centuries. In summary, to criticize and amend a viewpoint that has been widely recognized as having some validity and usefulness is one thing, but to reject the Zeitgeist concept as totally without foundation seems to approach another extreme without compelling cause.

¹⁹³See Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 342-343; and Titus Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West: Its Principles and Methods, trans. Lord Northbourne (London: Perennial Books, 1967), 153. For a perceptive analysis of how individual artists relate to the community at large, see Adriaan Peperzak, "Values: Subjective--Objective," The Journal of Value Inquiry 20 (1986): 75. See also Eric Gill's allusion to a similar concept in Eric Gill, "Christianity and Art," in Art Nonsense and Other Essays (London: Cassel and Company and Francis Walterston, 1929), 221.

correlation with the similarly stable, distinctive general features of artistic style.¹⁹⁴

Presuppositions

All pursuit of knowledge is undertaken on the basis of certain assumptions that provide the point of view adopted in approaching the problem and its discussion.¹⁹⁵ The assumptions undergirding the thought framework of a philosophical study of this kind are complex, but they supplement understanding of the purpose and methodology employed. Essentially, there are certain metaphysical and axiological presuppositions that have relevance to this study's purpose. They are particularly evident in the interpretation and application of the study's conclusions. Additionally, there are certain epistemological assumptions that apply more directly to the study's methodology. This is not meant to dichotomize the assumptions as applying exclusively to these areas, but rather to indicate a general link.

Any attempt to approach the theme of worldview and sacred music style with a view to delving into what comprises appropriate music for Christian worship assumes a view of God, of man, and of

¹⁹⁴Sachs used an interesting illustration which ties in with this phenomenon. He wrote: "The facts of outer life are spontaneous and often erratic; the evolution of art is much more regular. For art is reflection, not action. Man's acts may be rash; his art is deliberate and carefully prepared. The breath of history reminds one of the air in the bellows of a harmonium: the player operates the upper feeder bellows in irregular pushes; but the wind passes the reservoir bellows to be equalized before it becomes artistic tone" (Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 326).

¹⁹⁵Notice the recent stimulating discussion of this in Roy A. Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality: An Essay on the Hidden Role of Religious Belief in Theories (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991). Even in the setting of scientific research it has been recognized that the presuppositions held "may influence not only the problems scientists choose to investigate but also what they actually observe and fail to observe" (Armand M. Nicholi, Jr., "How Does the World View of the Scientist and the Clinician Influence Their Work?" Perspectives on Science and Christian Faith 41 [December 1989]: 216).

worship. It assumes, among other things, that there is both appropriate and inappropriate music for Christian worship, and furthermore, that there is a means of distinguishing between them. The following foundational assumptions provide the framework for discussion of these ideas.

Metaphysical Presuppositions

This study presupposed the validity of the conception of a living, loving personal Creator-God who has revealed Himself in Jesus Christ; that human beings are His children, made in His image, intended to worship Him and to gain the greatest meaning from existence by living in a dynamic relationship with their Creator and in harmony with His will as expressed in Holy Scripture. The significance of this presupposition is not merely for the ultimate meaning of this study in a Christian setting, but also to ensure respect in understanding music as a religious phenomenon in non-Christian settings.¹⁹⁶ To approach the study of sacred music as an unbeliever would restrict the perspective for insight into the religious situation and understanding of its phenomena.¹⁹⁷

¹⁹⁶In this regard, Mariasusia Dhavamony observed: "We can grasp only such mental states of another person which in some form, in some degree, and in some way have been included in our inner experience. What is totally alien to our inner experience remains outside the scope of our understanding other people's minds. This is much more so in regard to understanding other people's religious behavior" (Mariasusia Dhavamony, Phenomenology of Religion [Rome: Gregorian University Press, 1973], 20).

¹⁹⁷Indeed, in the religious context, it is recognized that: "If a student of religion does not know from personal experience of his own life what it means to pray, his views on prayer will be valueless" (ibid., 21). Maybe it is also true, to paraphrase Dhavamony, that if a student of sacred music does not know from personal experience what it means to worship God in music, his views on worship music will be valueless, especially in the discussion of what is appropriate worship music. It is noteworthy that in a bid to overcome the Western researcher's lack of empathy with and understanding of an alien inner religious experience, several humanistically oriented studies have advocated a participant-observer approach. See John Miller Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility: Aesthetics and Social Action in African Musical Idioms (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1979), 3-23; and Maya

It is assumed that life in our universe is causal not casual, purposeful not random, though the ultimate purpose may sometimes be obscured from immediate human view. That it is possible to reason meaningfully from cause to effect and perceive relationships between decisions and consequences, actions and reactions, is taken to indicate that life is not generally a haphazard process, even if there are some things that seem haphazard along the way. It is deemed to be a more reasonable step of faith to consider the many examples of order in the universe as evidences of planning and purpose than of chance and unlimited time. Included in this is the belief that the human species is a created family, that individuals from any nation, race, or culture are equal and that what they have in common far exceeds that which differentiates between them.¹⁹⁸ These assumptions undergird first, the meaningful investigation of the relationships between religious belief and the phenomenon of religious music. Second, they allow meaningful comparison of the music and worship experience of different peoples.

It is presupposed that the human being is an integrated whole--that mind, body, and spirit are interconnected and cannot function independently. Indeed, what affects or happens in one sphere of human existence automatically influences the total being. Human beings are considered to be free agents, influenced but not

Deren, Divine Horsemen: Voodoo Gods of Haiti (New York: Chelsea House Publishers, 1970). By way of comparison, note the consequences of Sigmund Freud's lack of understanding of religious experience discussed in Nicholi, "How Does the World View of the Scientist and Clinician Influence Their Work?" 217-218.

¹⁹⁸Notice another idea with similar implications from the Hindu perspective. Remarking on the transcultural acceptance of certain types of Indian music, Ritwik Sanyal stated: "Our analysis must therefore presuppose the working of an all human collective unconscious that is biological, rather than regional-cultural and the existence of a deep structure of music which only a logical definition of 'music' can lay bare. Ethnicity is not absolute" (Ritwik Sanyal, Philosophy of Music [Bombay: Somaiya Publications, 1987], 5).

controlled by their environment and inheritance. They have the power of choice. In fact, the ability to make choices is taken to indicate that we are so constituted as to perceive differences between options, and "to discern the reasons for one choice being better than another."¹⁹⁹ This is taken as an indication that humankind has a moral capacity.²⁰⁰ However, this study also presupposes that although created in God's image, human nature has been profoundly affected by the Fall. The natural human bent is towards evil, and though not totally depraved in the Calvinistic sense, everything we do is tainted by sin. This has special relevance for assessing music on the level of taste and preference in the Christian context.

An Axiological Presupposition

It is assumed that the realm of aesthetics is not divorced from the rest of life, but rather that the aesthetic dimension of existence is related to one's total philosophy. Values espoused in the aesthetic realm are assumed to be intrinsically connected to belief about the nature of reality.²⁰¹ Hence, in the context of

¹⁹⁹Desmond Ford, Answers on the Way: Scriptural Answers to Your Questions (Mountain View, Calif.: Pacific Press, 1977), 15.

²⁰⁰Recognition of a moral perspective on music has a long history in many cultures: For example, see the following comment by Sanyal: "The moral approach to music or to all art is too basic to human interests to be ignored as extrinsic" (Sanyal, Philosophy of Music, 56). For a summary of the views of Confucius, see Lin Yutang, ed. and trans., The Wisdom of Confucius (New York: Random House, 1938), 251-272 and for a summary of the views of Aristotle and Plato, see Donald Jay Grout, A History of Western Music, rev. ed. (London: J. M. Dent and Sons, 1973), 6-9. In the Western tradition, see Routley, The Church and Music.

²⁰¹Geertz reflected on the general religious perspective as evidenced around the world. There is, he maintained, a common conviction that: "The values one holds are grounded in the inherent structure of reality, that between the way one ought to live and the way things really are, there is an unbreakable inner connection. What sacred symbols do for those to whom they are sacred is to formulate an image of the world's construction and a program for human conduct that are mere reflexes of one another" (Geertz, Islām Observed, 97). This way of looking at the world provides one reason

religious worship it is reasonable to assume that the concept of God--the object of worship--is at least a significant factor, if not the significant factor in determining what constitutes worship and worship music. It is not that social or economic factors, changes in population, war, migration, and other factors do not have an influence on music style, rather, that in the worship situation, if anywhere, the "unbreakable inner connection" between the believed structure of reality and the way things really ought to be lived, is evidenced most of all. Thus, worldview is assumed to be a major influence on sacred music style.

Epistemological Presuppositions

The study presupposed that all truth is God's truth, and therefore truth in any field is part of a consistent, unified whole. In the search for truth, human observation, experience, rational thought, and appeal to expert authorities are legitimate, but not foolproof means of finding and understanding it.

Holy Scripture is accepted as God's written self-revelation. It is believed that this inspired record confronts the ultimate questions of man regarding his origins, purpose, and destiny; that it furnishes the most profound information towards an understanding of the problem of evil; and that it identifies the conflict between good and evil in earth's history. As the ultimate, authoritative source of truth, against which all else must be evaluated, the Bible is assumed as normative for Christian belief and behavior.

Definition of Terms

Technical terminology is defined at its first appearance in the text.

for this study's investigation into the relationship between worldview and sacred music style.

Organization of the Dissertation

The dissertation is divided into five chapters. Chapter 1 introduces and presents a rationale for the study.

Chapter 2 introduces the concept of worldview and its relationship to the development of music style. It seeks to portray, through the perspectives of several disciplines, how worldview factors impact general music style. It provides a broad framework for the more specific study of sacred music style, highlighting the significance of religio-philosophic considerations.

Chapter 3 introduces the main argument of the study focusing on the sacred music setting and exploring, through the avenue of two specifically chosen non-Christian religious orientations, how worship music reflects the concept of the Deity. It serves to identify and illustrate an archetypical polarity in how the conception of divine transcendence/immanence affects sacred music style.

Chapter 4 focuses on sacred music style and the concept of God in the context of Western Christianity. It is a historical case study that seeks to identify the relationship between musical expression and belief in the development of the Christian religion, highlighting a paradox in Christian belief about God.

Chapter 5 provides the summary and conclusions along with an application of the findings to the problem outlined in chapter 1 and recommendations for further study.

CHAPTER TWO

WORLDVIEW AND THE DETERMINANTS OF MUSIC STYLE

Introduction

The assertion that an artist "can transmute the viscous stuff of existential reality into the order of significant form only in accordance with what are his most fundamental beliefs about what is radically significant in life" is axiomatic in writings about the arts.¹ Similarly it is recognized that styles of artistic

¹Nathan A. Scott, Jr., "The Modern Experiment in Criticism: A Theological Appraisal," in The New Orpheus: Essays Toward a Christian Poetic, ed. Nathan A. Scott, Jr. (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1964), 155.

²Of the numerous aphorisms that affirm this dictum, the following are representative: "Through art we can know another's view of the universe" (Marcel Proust, Maxims; quoted in Rookmaaker, Modern Art and the Death of a Culture, 11); "True painting is full of the spirit that moves the brush" (George Sand, Letter to Gustave Flaubert; quoted in Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective, 164); "[Art] is always a vision, an attempt to express visibly what a particular age, a particular society, a particular person has viewed as the true nature and essence of reality, and this includes both the essence of man and his relations to significant aspects of the world" (Bruno Bettelheim; quoted in Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 2); and "Art [is] the embodiment of man's response to reality and his attempt to order his experience of that reality" (John W. Dixon, Jr., Nature and Grace in Art; quoted in Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective, 23). Some writers have discredited this notion by taking either a formalist approach to art or maintaining the arts' neutrality. For a description of the formalist approach and its implications see Sanyal, Philosophy of Music, 48. Of the neutrality of the arts, Veith propounded: "Art as art is essentially neutral" (Veith, The Gift of Art, 58, 59). Maritain's insistence on the separation of aesthetic and moral values in the arts implies the same neutrality (Maritain, Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry (1953), 51; and idem, The Responsibility of the Artist [New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1960], 29). Similarly W. H. Auden asserted that "there can no more be a 'Christian' art than there can be . . . a 'Christian' diet" (W. H. Auden, "Postscript: Christianity and Art," in The New Orpheus: Essays Toward a Christian Poetic, ed. Nathan A. Scott, Jr. [New York: Sheed and Ward, 1964], 76). However, besides noting an elementary flaw in Auden's logic, Ryken demonstrated that the notion

expression are an index to those fundamental beliefs about what is significant in life.³

This view of the arts is by no means limited to Western understanding.⁴ Despite popular Western notions to the contrary, acknowledgement seems to be pervasive that in the arts we do not encounter mere play things, but rather a revelation of a perception of basic reality.

of artistic neutrality does not account for "the-influence-of worldview-outlook," and hence is a misconception (Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective, 196).

³See Leonardo Ricci's rhetorical question, "But what do they mean when they speak of different styles, unless they mean different visions of the world?" (Leonardo Ricci; quoted in Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 2). Scranton explained the concept thus: "[The artist] has a vision of the world or of some part of it as, to him, it really is; this he tries to instill in the observer in the form of a sensory experience. . . . The aesthetic means must be so chosen and manipulated as to embody and participate in the qualities and characteristics of the original experience. The basis for the control of the selection and manipulation is the vision of reality, and the selection and manipulation bear a direct correspondence to the vision. If we could understand fully the formulation of the aesthetic means, we would understand some of the vision" (Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 43). Writing about ritual dance, Dickinson stated: "The dance was always an index of the higher or lower nature of the religious conception which fostered it" (Dickinson, Music in the History of the Western Church, 6). Ryken stated: "The arts are the most accurate index we have to basic human values--to human convictions about what is worth having, what is not important, and what matters most in life" (Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective, 131). Similarly Nettl wrote that "if we are to be specific about the way in which music reflects the values of a culture, we can do so best by dealing with those aspects of music that are constantly present in its musical repertory" (Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 150). See also the discussion of Paul Tillich's writings on art and the theology of culture in David Bailly Harned, Theology and the Arts (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1966), 64-65.

⁴This has already been alluded to in Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's statements concerning Islamic music and Shankar's concerning Hindu music (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Music, Musicians, and Muslim Law," 9; and Shankar, My Music, My Life, 17). See also W. Komla Amoaku's observation that "no musical activity [among the Ewe of Ghana] is devoid of the Ewe world view" in "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music: A Look at the Ewe of Ghana," in More than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 35.

A number of writers have remarked on the competence of artistic expression to portray the essence of a culture's outlook and attitudes. For example, John Ruskin observed:

Great nations write their autobiographies in three manuscripts, the book of their deeds, the book of their words and the book of their art. Not one of these books can be understood unless we read the two others, but of the three the only trustworthy one is the last.⁵

Theodor W. Adorno similarly commented that: "The forms of art reflect the history of man more truthfully than do documents themselves."⁶ More recently, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī asserted that a perusal of indigenous art work is much less prone to distort understanding of a people and their culture than the interpretive explanations of cultural historians. She wrote: "The art work of any people can never lie. The artistic 'translation' is a more difficult message to penetrate, but is is [sic] a considerably more reliable document for those who can 'read' its message."⁷

Before exploring the relationship between worldview and the musical art, several observations concerning the understanding of worldview and artistic style as independent concepts are noted.

Worldview

In his work The Universe Next Door: A Basic Worldview Catalog, James W. Sire described worldview as a set of presuppositions (assumptions that may be true, partially true, or entirely false) that are held (consciously or subconsciously,

⁵John Ruskin; quoted in Kenneth Clark, Civilization: A Personal View (New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1969), 1.

⁶Theodor W. Adorno, Philosophy of Modern Music, trans. Anne G. Mitchell and Wesley V. Blomster (New York: Continuum Publishing Corporation, 1985), 43.

⁷Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "God in Visual Aesthetic Expression," 262.

consistently or inconsistently) about the basic makeup of the world.⁸ These presuppositions or fundamental beliefs provide a framework that allows human beings to think and function in life, influencing both values and actions.⁹ Because of their impact on behavior, they have sometimes been termed "control beliefs."¹⁰ Of them Arthur Holmes observed: "Among all of a person's control beliefs, religious beliefs and values (or else religion-substitutes) play a decisive part."¹¹

Seeking to elucidate some of the essential components in a worldview framework, Sire suggested seven basic questions concerning the nature of prime reality and the world around us, human nature, the meaning of life and death, the certainty of knowledge, and the perception of truth.¹² However, such considerations do not only include ideas and rational thought processes. As Amoaku rightly

⁸James W. Sire, The Universe Next Door: A Basic Worldview Catalog, 2d ed. (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1988), 17.

⁹Victor Zuckerkandl endorsed this: "Human behavior is to a large extent shaped by beliefs and assumptions, mostly inexplicit, concerning the ultimate nature of reality" (Victor Zuckerkandl, Sound and Symbol: Music and the External World, trans. Willard R. Trask [New York: Pantheon Books, 1956], 363).

¹⁰Nicholas Wolterstorff, Reason Within the Bounds of Religion, 2d ed. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans, 1984), 18.

¹¹Arthur F. Holmes, "Toward a Christian View of Things," in The Making of a Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur F. Holmes (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1985), 16. Regarding the decisive role played by religious beliefs, Clouser stated: "Theories about math and physics, sociology and economics, art and ethics, politics and law can never be religiously neutral. They are all regulated by some religious belief. The effects of religious beliefs therefore extend far beyond providing the hope for life after death or influencing moral values and judgments. By controlling theory making, they produce important differences in the interpretation of issues that range over the whole of life" (Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 3).

¹²Sire, The Universe Next Door, 18. The actual questions were: "What is prime reality--the really real? . . . What is the nature of external reality, that is the world around us? . . . What is a human being? . . . What happens to a person at death? . . . Why is it possible to know anything at all? . . . How do we know what is right and wrong? . . . What is the meaning of human history?"

observed: "A worldview is much more than a mere intellectual concept. It expresses an attitude that reaches down to the very fabric of our being and thereby conditions our psychic and spiritual forces in the most comprehensive manner."¹³ What Amoaku termed "an attitude" could perhaps be related to what in other contexts has been called "a faith" or a trusting commitment to what is believed. Thus, it could be said that cognitive process and dispositional stance are essentially linked in the formation of a worldview.

Several observations concerning the nature and function of worldview deserve mention. A worldview is not merely passively received; it is largely adopted. For both individuals and communities, there is an element of intentionality in the way a worldview is derived. Being neither "a datum" nor "a donné," Walter J. Ong contended that a worldview is something that an individual or "the culture he shares partly constructs."¹⁴ It is a way of internally organizing "the data of actuality coming from without and from within. A worldview is a world interpretation."¹⁵

¹³Amoaku, "A Look at the Ewe of Ghana," 34. Similarly José Ortega y Gasset wrote: "A belief is not merely an idea that is thought, it is an idea in which one also believes. And believing is not an operation of the intellectual mechanism but a function of the living being as such, the function of guiding his conduct, his performance of his task" (José Ortega y Gasset, "History as a System," trans. William C. Atkinson, in Philosophy and History: Essays Presented to Ernst Cassirer, ed. Raymond Klibansky and H. J. Paton [Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1936], 284).

¹⁴Walter J. Ong, "World as View and World as Event," American Anthropologist 71 (1969): 634.

¹⁵Ibid. Day's short discussion of culture supported Ong's observation. He wrote: "'Culture' in its original sense, means cultivation of the land. . . . From this image of tilling the soil the meaning of the word expanded to include the breeding of animals, keeping of livestock, the building of dwellings, the establishment of laws, the development of customs, and indeed the whole ordering of society--all the things necessary to keep control over the land and nature. People who identify themselves with a particular culture have, in effect, made choices that help them to find a sense and an order in the chaos of the universe. Their culture is what they choose to remember and cherish. Culture, then, is a way of life, a system of signs and symbols which people call their own" (Day, Why Catholics Can't Sing, 7-8).

Assumptions regarding worldview may be consciously or subconsciously held. They may only be brought to mind if challenged from "another ideological universe."¹⁶ This suggests that discussion of worldview presuppositions may not always be readily accessible, unless there has been some provocation for the articulation of its components; the occurrence of which may, in any case, have determined the nature of the articulation.

Meaningful discussion of worldview issues relies heavily on semantic precision.¹⁷ For effective communication to occur it is crucial not merely to state what one believes by the use of certain terms, "but also what one does not believe by them."¹⁸

Fundamental beliefs tend to be interrelated,¹⁹ although they can be held inconsistently.²⁰ It is for this reason that Ortega y Gasset termed this network of interrelated beliefs a "repertory of convictions." Never completely or logically articulated or systematized, the beliefs that "coexist in any human life, sustaining, impelling, and directing it, are on occasion incongruous, contradictory, at the least confused."²¹ This reality lends support to the idea that worldviews do not occur as

¹⁶Sire, The Universe Next Door, 17-18.

¹⁷This is because the language used in one ideological context may be externally valid in another, although the actual meaning of terms could be entirely different (ibid., 74).

¹⁸Ronald M. Springett, "World Views," Adventist Perspectives 1 (November 1987): 24.

¹⁹This is evident, for example, in the way values are perceived to be related to one another. As Risieri Frondizi wrote: "Every value is related to other values. The beauty of a Gothic cathedral cannot be separated from the religious value which inspired it; the aesthetic quality of a piece of furniture is not independent of its utility; nor is the justice of a sentence something apart from its consequences" (Risieri Frondizi, What Is Value? An Introduction to Axiology, 2d ed. [La Salle, Ill.: Open Court Publishing Company, 1971], 154).

²⁰Sire, The Universe Next Door, 17.

²¹Ortega y Gasset, "History as a System," 284.

prepackaged bundles. Individual beliefs may be adopted at different times under conviction of their soundness. Logical integration may not occur instantaneously at the time of adoption, and may not occur at all unless challenged. This may explain why, in recent years, some have urged increased awareness regarding worldview and embracing the "examined" rather than the "unexamined" life.²²

The number of worldviews that exists is limited.²³ Even though "worldviews at first appear to proliferate, they are made up of answers to questions which have only a limited number of answers."²⁴ Perhaps this gives credence to William Fleming's observation that "the search for the underlying ideas that motivate human activities can often reduce to simplicity what appears on the surface as a confusing multiplicity of directions."²⁵ That is, what initially appears complex, even enigmatic, may not necessarily be so complicated.

The term worldview is visually oriented. Hence, individuals who use it tend to use visually and spatially oriented metaphors to communicate their perceptions.²⁶ Other sense orientations are also utilized providing different metaphors with alternate

²²Sire, The Universe Next Door, 19. See also Robert Nozick, The Examined Life: Philosophical Meditations (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1989).

²³Sire wrote: "Worldviews . . . are not infinite in number" (ibid., 213).

²⁴Ibid., 212. Sire illustrated his point by discussing some of the limited-answer options available to worldview questions (ibid., 212-213). See also Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 36.

²⁵William Fleming, Arts and Ideas, 7th ed. (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1986), 16.

²⁶Ong cited the following examples: "'areas' of study, 'fields' of investigation, 'levels' of abstraction, 'fronts' of knowledge, 'waves' of interest, 'movements' of ideas, 'trains' of thought, 'grounds' for analysis, and so on indefinitely" (Ong, "World as View and World as Event," 635).

characterizations of life.²⁷ Thus, it may be more inclusive to speak of a "worldsense." However, because of general usage, the term worldview is used in this study on the assumption that other sense metaphors, such as those used by cultures with an auditory orientation, are equally valid means of perception and descriptions of reality.

Style

Style has been variously described as "a characteristic way of doing something,"²⁸ a "generalization of the particular,"²⁹ an "idiom of knowledge and communication,"³⁰ or "a form of life."³¹ Although it is clear from works such as The Concept of Style³² that there is still considerable discussion regarding the understanding of style, it is evident that certain aspects have been accorded general consensus.

The term style is used of products or methods of human action. Kendall L. Walton wrote: "The notion of style seems peculiarly irrelevant to objects which are not products of human

²⁷See *ibid.*, 637.

²⁸Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 28. This would include definitions of style such as the following by Nettl: "By style we mean the aggregate of characteristics which a composition has, and which it shares with others in its cultural complex" (Bruno Nettl, Theory and Method in Ethnomusicology [London: Free Press of Glencoe, Collier-Macmillan, 1964], 169).

²⁹Dalia Cohen, "On Comparing Musical Styles: East and West," Israel Studies in Musicology 4 (1987): 73.

³⁰Coomaraswamy, The Transformation of Nature in Art, 85.

³¹Gerardus van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty: The Holy in Art, trans. David E. Green (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963), 274.

³²Berel Lang, ed. The Concept of Style (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979).

action, even when our interest in these objects is 'aesthetic'."³³ Walton believed that attribution of style to artifacts rather than natural objects "reflects a profound difference between how we understand and respond to works of art, and how we understand and respond to natural objects."³⁴ Recognition that style pertains only to human action or creation indicates it is defined by human thought and conditioned by humanity's constraints.

Style is the product of human choice, not chance. As Leonard B. Meyer stated: "Style is a replication of patterning, whether in human behavior or in the artifacts produced by human behavior, that results from a series of choices made within some set of constraints."³⁵ In the development of style there is a measure of intentionality.³⁶ However, as Meyer went on to point out, "only

³³Kendall L. Walton, "Style and the Products and Processes of Art," in The Concept of Style, ed. Berel Lang (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979), 46.

³⁴Ibid.

³⁵Leonard B. Meyer, "Toward a Theory of Style," in The Concept of Style, ed. Berel Lang (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979), 3. Scranton indicated that in the visual arts choices associated with style formation concern "materials, conceptual and sensory elements; characteristic emphases on the technical, rational or aesthetic aspects; and characteristic ways of using the elements in the aspects chosen" (Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 28-29). In a musical context, R. J. Pascall observed: "Style manifests itself in characteristic usages of form, texture, harmony, melody, rhythm and ethos" (R. J. Pascall, "Style," The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians [1980], 316). This should not be understood to mean that only the manner of expression, or the form of an art work exhibits its style. The content of the expression and the time and place of its creation and performance may also involve choices and contribute to its style (see Cohen, "On Comparing Musical Styles," 73; Pascall, "Style," 316; Meyer, "Towards a Theory of Style," 6-8; Nelson Goodman, "The Status of Style," Critical Inquiry 1 [June 1975]: 799-811; and Kebede, Roots of Black Music, xii).

³⁶The role of choice in the development of style has been recognized by a number of writers. Cohen, for example, defined style as "a set of rules governing the conscious or unconscious choice of organization of musical material distinctive of a work or of a body of works. Works governed by the same rules are considered as sharing the same style" (Cohen, "On Comparing Music Styles," 75). See also Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 28.

a small proportion of such 'style-defining' choices involve conscious consideration of alternatives."³⁷

Style can be conceived in many ways. Whether it is considered to be an attribute of objects or actions--either "a distinguishable ensemble of characteristics"³⁸ or "any distinctive and therefore recognizable way in which an act is performed or an artifact made"³⁹--there is no stipulation as to what comprises the "distinguishable ensemble" or the "distinctive and recognizable" action providing it is distinguishable and distinctive.⁴⁰

Style exemplifies individual or societal character.⁴¹ It "expresses some inner quality of the society that produced it."⁴² Striving to define how this inner quality is expressed in artistic styles, Cohen posited a "stylistic ideal" or a "meta-principle" that is nurtured to guide "the choice of stylistic framework or particular style."⁴³ Thus, the relationship between a "stylistic ideal" and a particular style of music is inferred to be one of

³⁷Meyer, "Toward a Theory of Style," 6. See also Cohen's allusion to "conscious or unconscious" choices in the definition of style she proffered (Cohen, "On Comparing Musical Styles," 75).

³⁸James S. Ackerman, "Style" in Art and Archeology, ed. James S. Ackerman and Rhys Carpenter (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1963), 164.

³⁹Ernst H. Gombrich. "Style," International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences, (1968), 15:352-361.

⁴⁰See also Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 19.

⁴¹See van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 274.

⁴²Cohen included this in a list of generally acknowledged points about style (Cohen, "On Comparing Music Styles," 73). This concept is similar to some scriptural proverbs. For example: "For as he thinketh in his heart, so is he" (Prov 23:7 KJV); "Guard your heart more than any treasure for it is the source of all life" (Prov 4:23 NEB); and "For the words that the mouth utters come from the overflowing of the heart. A good man produces good from the store of good within himself; and an evil man from evil within produces evil" (Matt 12:34, 35 NEB). See also Luke 6:45 NEB.

⁴³Cohen, "On Comparing Musical Styles," 75.

cause and effect."⁴⁴ In response to the question, What determines or nurtures a stylistic ideal? the position adopted and suggested for consideration in this study is the perception of life defined above as "worldview."

The Relationship between Worldview and Artistic
Style as It Relates to Music

During the last two centuries, the relationship between worldview and artistic style has become recognized as a significant scholarly pursuit in Western civilization.⁴⁵ However, because the artistic communication of worldview is a "difficult message to penetrate"⁴⁶ its purposeful exploration has at times been hampered by oversimplification, a tendency to bias, a disregard of specialized data, and the danger of slipping into a misplaced

⁴⁴Some scholars tend to be skeptical of direct causation theories. See Leonard B. Meyer, Music, the Arts, and Ideas: Patterns and Predictions in Twentieth-Century Culture (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1967), 109. Meyer believed, for example, that it is impossible to stipulate the role of cultural ideologies in the formation of styles and stylistic change (ibid., 132). He viewed ideologies as significant variables affecting stylistic development, but he chose to distinguish between "fostering" and "determining" in describing their role. He believed they may foster, but not necessarily determine specific stylistic development, though he did recognize their pervasive impact on human life (ibid., 129). The diminished importance Meyer accorded an ideology's impact on stylistic development may ensue from his endorsement of the "possibility of stylistic stasis" in contemporary Western culture (ibid., 114, 119, 132).

⁴⁵Ong observed that the notion of worldview as a life-organizing factor exercising control over human thought and behavior, including development of artistic style, has appeared relatively recently. He noted: "Preromantic concepts of man hold that the art he creates imitates or mirrors nature, whereas romantic and postromantic concepts hold that it throws light onto nature, interpreting the world" (Ong, "World as View and World as Event," 635). In other words, at least in pre-nineteenth century Western civilization, "the world was something he [human beings] could only participate in, not an object to be manipulated in his consciousness" (ibid.). While granting Ong's point in the general scholarly context, it should be noted that the belief that human thought affects human conduct has been held for millennia as evidenced in the scriptural passages cited above.

⁴⁶Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "God in Visual Aesthetic Expression," 262.

judgmentalism.⁴⁷ Further, the process of exploration is rendered more difficult with the passing of time,⁴⁸ and because of music's somewhat elusive, non-discursive, and ephemeral nature, these pitfalls evidence themselves even more readily in writing on music than the other arts.⁴⁹

Despite the problems, it is clear from the number of scholars who have commented on worldview and artistic style that the prudent exploration of the connection between them holds the promise of valuable insights--insights that far outweigh the caution and restraint urged by potential pitfalls.⁵⁰

Among those who strongly favor this kind of study, Paul Tillich suggested:

It is an art as much as a science to 'read styles,' and it requires religious intuition, on the basis of an ultimate

⁴⁷Maritain condemned Hans Sedlmayr's work Art in Crisis: The Lost Center and by implication other attempts in the same direction. He wrote: "There is no more misleading and unsound literary genus than ideological systematization of human history intent on disregarding the essentials of art, and its intrinsic laws of development, for the sake of a so-called cultural diagnosis and prognosis of art as a moral symptom" (Jacques Maritain, Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry, [New York: Meridian Books, World Publishing Company, 1970], 299). While Maritain highlighted an important problem, perhaps his contrary opinion is related to presuppositions intrinsic to his ardent affirmation of art's essential moral neutrality.

⁴⁸Oswald Spengler noted that when a particular cultural configuration passes away and its imaginative power and symbolism is gone "there are left 'empty' formulae, skeletons of dead systems, which men of another culture read literally, feel to be without meaning or value and either mechanically store up or else despise and forget" (Oswald Spengler, The Decline of the West: Form and Actuality, trans. Charles Francis Atkinson [New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926], 1:382).

⁴⁹See Maria Rika Maniates, "Musical Symbolism," The World of Music 20 (1978): 47; and Gardner, "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxists and Christian Musical Aesthetics," 191.

⁵⁰See Alan P. Merriam's statement: "Music is a product of man and has structure, but its structure cannot have an existence of its own divorced from the behavior which produces it. In order to understand why a music structure exists as it does, we must also understand how and why the behavior which produces it is as it is, and how and why the concepts which underlie that behavior are ordered in such a way as to produce the particularly desired form of organized sound" (Alan P. Merriam, The Anthropology of Music [Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1964], 7).

concern, to look into the depth of a style, to penetrate to the level where an ultimate concern exercises its driving power.⁵¹

Tillich's idea that styles be read on the basis of penetrating to where "an ultimate concern exercises its driving power" seems significant.⁵²

Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī observed that while there was little disagreement that the arts use sensory stimuli to present symbolic statements of ideas, there has been wide disagreement as to the kind of truth conveyed.⁵³ Seeking to classify the disparity about what the arts convey, she enumerated three general categories (deriving from three ultimate concerns) under which theories about the meaning of art cluster:

(1) "humanistic" theories, which deem art to be a statement about humanity or some aspect of human life, (2) "naturalistic" theories, which describe artistic meaning as an intuition of truth about the natural world, and (3) "transcendent" theories, which describe art as a means of conveying an intuition about divinity.⁵⁴

In his work Philosophy of Music, Sanyal identified four types of commonly held theories of music: (1) the Formalistic, (2) the Naturalistic (which he divided under two sub-headings: realism and romanticism), (3) the Humanistic (divided under psychologism and sociologism), and (4) the Idealistic (divided under moralism and mysticism).⁵⁵ A comparison of Sanyal's and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's

⁵¹Paul Tillich, Systematic Theology, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951), 1:40.

⁵²Tillich's suggestion that such "reading" requires "religious intuition" is also significant and is touched upon later in this chapter.

⁵³Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts: New Thoughts on Figural Representation," in Art, Creativity, and the Sacred: An Anthology in Religion and Art, ed. Diane Apostolos-Cappadona (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1985), 165.

⁵⁴Ibid.

⁵⁵Sanyal, Philosophy of Music, 48-57.

lists reveals strong similarities.⁴⁶

It seems that the tri-part division of categories espoused by Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, and supported by Sanyal, provides a useful differentiation between three major worldview orientations under which theories about derivation of music style cluster. Internal distinctions within the categories only enhance clarity and furnish interpretative nuances.

The following representative survey of ways in which music styles have been seen to reflect worldview is organized under the headings suggested above: (1) Humanistic Theories (those centered either in the human being or human society), (2) Naturalistic Theories (those centered either in the cosmos or the natural world order), and (3) Philosophic/Religious Theories (those centered in either philosophical or divine realities).⁴⁷

Humanistic Theories

Over the last two centuries, the predominant interpretation of music by Western scholars has been in terms of some human

⁴⁶By definition, Sanyal's first category--the Formalistic account--debars itself from consideration in Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's and the present context, for it excludes relation to any external reality beyond the music itself (ibid., 48). Music's "meaning (significance, value, purpose, use) is to be found in itself and not to be sought in the intention (purpose, commitment, psyche, social milieu, . . .) of the artist" (ibid.). Further, the musical act need not be taken in relation to the listener's likes, dislikes, tastes, aesthetic or moral sensibility, system of values, or any other predilections (ibid.). Clearly, in a discussion of the influence of worldview on artistic style this view stands in direct contradistinction.

The tendency of the Formalistic account of music is to explain the development of musical style through a process of natural evolution--one style growing out of another. However, insistence on the autonomy of the art, can rarely, if ever, be sustained as the sole explanation for music style development. Therefore, this view is often presented by way of emphasis, rather than exclusive explanation. Nettl's description of the historical orientation in Western musicology is an example of this approach (Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 236).

⁴⁷These three categories represent emphases in approach, not necessarily exclusive, unconnected concerns.

reality, whether psychological, sociological, or a combination of both."⁵⁸

Theories Centered in the Human Being

Albert Hofstadter, in Truth and Art, wrote: "Art is in the first place the articulation of human being"⁵⁹ or a "piece of human existence."⁶⁰ John W. Dixon, Jr., similarly affirmed that artistic styles "are explorations of modes of being human. . . . A style is an essay in human psychology. . . . All styles are thus revelatory of our humanity."⁶¹

Writing about music, Finkelstein stated: "In creating a work the artist draws more or less upon his entire personal and social experience. What results is therefore not merely a random mood, but

⁵⁸Prominence of this anthropocentric focus is evident in many fields of music study. In ethnomusicology emphasis is given to the influence of sociological and personal factors in contrast to the occasional mention of ideologically based values and ideals. (See Nettl's summary of the work of ethnomusicologists in relating music to its cultural environment. Nettl, Theory and Method in Ethnomusicology, 275-176.) See also Alan Lomax, Folk Song Style and Culture (Washington, D.C.: American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1968) as well as Gardner's discussion of a common assumption in ethnomusicology which results in the real value and meaning of music being interpreted as a product of social forces. Gardner, "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics," 42. Even the names of the disciplines of sociology of music and psychology of music betray their orientation. Nettl's summary of "the characteristic stance of the music historian" demonstrates this same alignment in historical musicology (Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 236).

⁵⁹Albert Hofstadter, Truth and Art (New York: Columbia University Press, 1965), 86.

⁶⁰Ibid., 72.

⁶¹John W. Dixon, Jr., Art and the Theological Imagination (New York: Seabury Press, 1978), 15. Describing the benefits of a structural method of historical artistic analysis that would provide a "whole range of assertions about being, knowledge, and value," Sheldon Nodelman emphasized the "human world" which engendered the art work and the use of "fundamental categories of human existence" as analytical categories clearly illustrating the same human focus (Sheldon Nodelman, "Structural Analysis in Art and Anthropology," in Structuralism, ed. Jacques Ehrmann [Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1970], 90-91). Further evidence that the structuralist approach to art is centered in human reality is found in Levi-Strauss, Structural Anthropology, vol. 1, ix and 21.

a set of concentrated psychological states that represent an attitude toward life."⁴² In the introduction to Chant the Names of God, Henry made reference to a whole school of thought that "asserted the existence of a deep mental structure which gives rise to both a particular style of music and a somehow homologous structure of society."⁴³

The Apollonian/Dionysian antithesis

An influential example of anthropocentric interpretations of musical expression proposed a basic competitive dualism in human nature between the "sensuous impulse" and the "formal impulse."⁴⁴ The essence of this theory has its roots in ancient Greek thought from whence Nietzsche derived his Dionysian and Apollonian antithesis,⁴⁵ and Sachs drew his descriptive "pathos" and "ethos" categories⁴⁶ for the historical analysis of artistic development. Discussion of the romantic and classic spirits in Western musicology has rested on the same foundation.

In tracing the roots of this human-oriented view to ancient Greek thought, it may be perceived as confusing it with an ideological or transcendent theory because Greek philosophy and

⁴²Sidney Walter Finkelstein, How Music Expresses Ideas (New York: International Publishers, 1970), 12.

⁴³Henry, Chant the Names of God, 10. For an example of this direction of thought, see the brief discussion of Werner Danckert's work below.

⁴⁴Friedrich Schiller used these two terms in his "Twelfth Letter" designating the first as proceeding from the physical existence of man and the second as proceeding from man's absolute existence or his rational nature (Friedrich Schiller, On the Aesthetic Education of Man: A Series of Letters, trans. with an introduction by Reginald Snell [New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Company, 1965], 64-67).

⁴⁵See Friedrich Nietzsche, "The Birth of Tragedy from the Spirit of Music," trans. Clifton P. Fadiman, in The Philosophy of Nietzsche (New York: Random House, The Modern Library, 193), 167-340. See also the analysis of Nietzsche's use of the terms in Richard Schacht, Nietzsche (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983), 482-506.

⁴⁶Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 202.

religion were so closely linked. However, it is well accepted that the Greeks had "an anthropocentric attitude to life,"⁶⁷ and that even their deities were conceived in unmistakably human terms.⁶⁸ But, perhaps their idealization of human characteristics contributed to the development of the famed Apollonian and Dionysian archetypes in subsequent theoretical discussions.

Various tabulations have been made of the distinction in characteristics between the Apollonian and Dionysian archetypes.⁶⁹ In modern applications it is often emphasized that value judgments between polarities is inappropriate. Neither is conceived to be

⁶⁷Werner Jaeger, Paideia, The Ideals of Greek Culture, trans. from the 2d German ed. by Gilbert Highet (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1954), 1:xxiii.

⁶⁸Edith Hamilton, The Greek Way to Western Civilization (New York: New American Library, A Mentor Book, 1942), 212.

⁶⁹Theologian James Houston contrasted the two models of man as expressing the elements of "order and chaos, fixity and spontaneity, discipline and ecstasy, domination and responsiveness" (James M. Houston, I Believe in the Creator [Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1980], 70). He summarized the two ways of living thus (ibid., 70):

"Apollonian Man

Man the maker, Homo faber,
is the molder and
manipulator of his
environment
Will and intellect dominate
Values are translated as
action; authenticity is
aggressiveness and
masculinity
God is encountered in
deism, in order, deed
Life is lived consciously

Dionysian Man

Man the dancer, Homo ludens
responds to the immediate
givenness of life
Feeling and sensation are
central
Values are discovered in
wonder and acceptance;
authenticity is passion and
femininity
God is defined as pantheistic,
in the power of being all, in
flux, and in the depths of
experience
Life is authenticated by the
unconscious"

See also the more extensive discussion in Sam Keen, "Manifesto for a Dionysian Theology," in New Theology No. 7, ed. Martin E. Marty and Dean G. Peckman (New York: Macmillan Company, 1970), 79-103.

right/good and the other wrong/evil. Both impulses are intended to be kept in creative tension.⁷⁰

It is clear that ancient Greeks saw a connection between styles of musical expression and the contrasting impulses to life embodied in the Apollonian/Dionysian distinction. In harmony with Atheneus' general observation that "they celebrate Dionysus with wine and drunkenness, but Apollo in quiet and order,"⁷¹ Grout saw the difference between the two kinds of music as follows:

We can discern a general division into two classes: music whose effect was toward calmness and uplift, and music which tended to produce excitement and enthusiasm. The first class was associated with the worship of Apollo; its instrument was the lyre and its related poetic forms the ode and the epic. The second class was associated with the worship of Dionysus; its instrument was the aulos and its related poetic forms the dithyramb and the drama.⁷²

From the Apollonian perspective, it is clear that the stylistic ideals of order, restraint, and peace characterized musical expression; that which was uninhibited, exciting, and stimulating was shunned. Manliness, discipline, and self-control were considered to be of true value.⁷³ On the other hand, the stylistic ideals of ecstasy and passion, sensation and feeling characterized

⁷⁰See Keen, "Manifesto for a Dionysian Theology," 102; and Schiller, On the Aesthetic Education of Man, 63-64. Even the Greeks acknowledged the complementary nature of the Dionysian and Apollonian ways (Hamilton, The Greek Way, 216; and Jaeger, Paideia, 1:168.) As Jaeger pointed out, these two violently contrasting deities were worshipped together in the Delphic cult much to the bafflement of historians of religion. Jaeger suggested that although the Apollonian way was the ideal, its "spirit of order, clarity, and moderation could not have sunk so deeply into men's hearts if the wild excitement of Dionysus . . . had not first broken the ground" (Jaeger, Paideia, 1:167).

⁷¹Atheneus, "Sophists at Dinner," in Source Readings in Music History: Antiquity and the Middle Ages, ed. Oliver Strunk (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1965), 53.

⁷²Grout, The History of Western Music, 9.

⁷³See Plato, Laws 653-660 in Source Book of the History of Education for the Greek and Roman Period, ed. Paul Monroe (New York: Macmillan Company, 1913), 224-225.

Dionysian music and instruments.⁷⁴ Music was meant to appeal to passion, even promote hedonism.⁷⁵

Ethos/pathos cycles

Building on this Greek duality, Sachs enumerated a series of antithetical notions to clarify his hypothesis of ethos/pathos cycles in the history of artistic development. His juxtapositions included: essence/appearance, beauty/character, impersonality/personality, limitation/boundlessness, serenity/passion, perfection/imperfection--all of which he incorporated in the general antithesis: permanence/change.⁷⁶ Sachs saw these abstract notions as expressing stylistic ideals "which guide the artist" as well as "concrete qualities which the artist gives to his work under this guidance."⁷⁷

It can be inferred from Sachs' terminology that translating these notions into artistic style mirrors the descriptions of the Apollonian and Dionysian distinctions, though with some extrapolation of ideas. For example, in his explanation of limitation versus boundlessness, Sachs noted that ethos styles tend to have strict commandments that issue in adherence to forms, whereas pathos styles reject all such restrictions in favor of imaginative freedom. The former emphasizes immortal, normalized

⁷⁴Percussion instruments, which contribute much to fulfilling such ideals, were almost exclusively used in this context. Giovanni Comotti stated: "Among the Greeks, unlike other ancient peoples, percussion instruments were never widespread nor particularly important. Their use was generally restricted to the rituals of the cults of Dionysus and Cybele and were always perceived as exotic instruments" (Giovanni Comotti, Music in Greek and Roman Culture, trans. Rosaria V. Munson [Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989], 74-75).

⁷⁵This was insinuated by Plato (Plato, Laws 700a-701c in Music in the Western World: A History in Documents, comp. Piero Weiss and Richard Taruskin [New York: Schirmer Books, 1984], 7, 8).

⁷⁶Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 214.

⁷⁷Ibid.

beauty, serenity, and perfection; the latter, the abundant but mortal realm of daily existence where strangeness, the exotic, and even "the characterful ugliness of the queer and the ill-fated"⁷ are embraced. Ethos styles tend toward crafting the beautiful; the tendency in pathos styles is to overstep natural boundaries in imaginative experimentation. Ethos styles abide by distinctions such as the separation of the religious and secular spheres; pathos styles set aside all such distinctions. Ethos styles uphold moderation, avoiding excessive size or length, density, and tempo. Pathos styles glory in exploring extremes. Ethos styles emphasize the sober, matter-of-factness evident in linear concerns such as "the solid weaving of polyphonic voice parts or the regular, functional march of chords,"⁸ whereas pathos styles lean toward the anti-linear, relying rather on colorations evident in "the shades of harmony, intensity, tempo, and orchestration."⁹

Discussions of the classic versus romantic spirit¹⁰ found in Grout¹¹ and Paul Henry Lang¹² essentially repeat this delineation of stylistic features although, as in Sachs' treatment, it is emphasized that any absolute categorization of historical periods is contrived.¹³ The dynamic process of interaction must be recognized

⁷Ibid., 217.

⁸Ibid., 260.

⁹Ibid.

¹⁰"Spirit" in this context generally refers to a manifestation of the human spirit.

¹¹Grout, A History of Western Music, 539-540.

¹²Paul Henry Lang, Music in Western Civilization (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1969), 734-740.

¹³Sachs maintained that it was a "fallacious thought that an art work necessarily belongs to one or the other side exclusively. . . . The two categories imply the courses steered toward one of two poles rather than the poles themselves" (Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 206).

in all periods for, as Schiller proposed, it is part of the endeavor to keep these contradictory, but complementary human impulses in tension. The historical blurring of clear distinctions in music exemplifying the mid-range is seen as evidence for this striving for equilibrium. However, the struggle for balance does not necessarily override manifestations of the extremes.

Personality types

In the late nineteenth century and first half of the twentieth century, there was considerable interest, particularly among German scholars, in the correlation of personality types and artistic styles. Werner Danckert's work Musik und Weltbild is an example of how this approach was integrated with an examination of the characteristics of ethnic/national styles of music, as well as the Geistesgeschichte approach to cultural history. For Danckert, the study of personality types⁴⁵ in relation to music style was probing one of the "elemental possibilities" (Elementarste Möglichkeiten) or ultimate concerns that governed the forms of musical expression.⁴⁶

Danckert opened his discussion of the relationship between musical expression and personality types with a statement by seventeenth-century writer, Athanasius Kircher: "The mind possesses a certain disposition which is subject to the inherited temperament of the individual; as a consequence of this disposition the musician is inclined more toward one particular type of composition than to

⁴⁵Danckert referred to these as "that ideological antecedent . . . which every creative being carries in the deep strata of the unconscious" ("das weltanschauliche Apriori . . . das jeder Schaffende in Tiefenschichten des Unbewußten trägt"). Werner Danckert, Musik und Weltbild: Morphologie der Abendländischen Musik, ed. Marianne Bröcker (Bad Godesberg: Verlag für Systematische Musikwissenschaft, 1979), 111.

⁴⁶Ibid., 111.

another."⁸⁷ Danckert then proceeded to profile what he perceived as a confluence of thought among contemporary scholars from various fields of expertise⁸⁸ concerning a consistent delineation of three basic categories of human personality⁸⁹ significant for understanding three basic styles or types of musical expression. He admitted difficulty in naming the three basic types;⁹⁰ therefore, throughout his discussion he used a cluster of improvised terms to distinguish between categories.

For example, Danckert described the Type I sense of being as "suspended, spherical, also enthusiastic [and] erotically fulfilled."⁹¹ Translating this into music style he described Type I melody lines as poised between the poles of high and low, light and dark, balanced between buoyancy/lift and solemnity. The tonal space of Type I music is uniformly and continually filled. There is no partitioning of the space, rather there is a sense of enclosure and convergence embodying the experience of cosmic security. For Danckert, this was exemplified in the pre-Baroque polyphony of Landini and Palestrina, although he also provided some later examples.⁹²

⁸⁷"Der Geist besitzt einen gewissen Charakter, der von dem angeborenen Temperament des Individuums abhängt; infolge dieses Charakters neigt den Musiker zu einem bestimmten Kompositionstyp mehr als zu einem anderen" (quoted in *ibid.*).

⁸⁸He referred to the work of Ottmar Rutz, E. R. Jaensch, H. Nohl, and Gustav Becking, besides his own musicological studies. The research of psychiatrists Ernst Kretschmer and Albrecht Langelüddeke, the worldview categories suggested by W. Dilthey, and the philosophic writings of Friedrich Schiller were also cited (*ibid.*, 111-117, 128-131).

⁸⁹Termed Type I, Type III, and Type II, and always presented in that order.

⁹⁰Danckert, *Musik und Weltbild*, 135.

⁹¹"Schwebend, sphärisch, auch enthusiastisch, eroserfüllt" (*ibid.*).

⁹²*Ibid.*, 137-140.

In contrast is what he termed the "descendence" experience of Type III--"condensed, controlled, partitioned, [and] measured. [It has] a drive for achievement which realizes itself from top to bottom: descent into the material world."³ Melody lines in this category exhibited prominent key centers and continual measuring of individual notes in relationship to this anchor point. Danckert considered that the music of the Baroque era through to the early Romantic period typified this kind of mathematical inclination.⁴

Type II, the "transcendental-type," is characterized by an impulse for height and breadth, expansiveness, and a "reaching beyond" arising from its centrifugal dynamic of life.⁵ The expansiveness of Gregorian chant-like melodies, in which melodic angularity is not prominent and individual tones are not significant, illustrated this type. Characteristic was a flowing melody, devoid of strong rhythmic pulsation that decelerated the dynamic psychic emotions, although not the spiritual heat.⁶

Danckert saw this complex psycho-philosophical analysis of categories as not merely descriptive of distinct personality types embodied in individual composers and their music, but also as "archetypes of humanity"--a means of describing the successive, organically related developmental steps in the historical unfolding of a nation's, and even world culture."

³"Das Verdichten, Beherrschen, Aufteilen, Ausmessen . . . Ein Verwirklichungsdrang, der von oben nach unten sich realisiert: Abstieg in die Stoffwelt" (ibid., 136).

⁴Ibid., 141-146.

⁵"Hoch- und Weitendrang, Expansion, 'Hinüberlangen' . . . entspringen seiner zentrifugalen Lebensdynamik" (ibid., 136).

⁶Ibid., 146-148.

⁷Ibid., 132-133. A large part of Musik und Weltbild is devoted to illustrating with musical examples Danckert's categories, his terminology, and the cultural developmental aspect. Included are investigations of melodic lines as well as rhythmic and harmonic constructions, the combination of musical elements in a composition,

Danckert was particularly impressed with the connection between individual and/or collective personality and the creative process.⁹⁸ However, his use of pre-existing typological categories may have predisposed the results of his musical investigations to conceptions deriving from those categories.⁹⁹ This, together with the complex descriptions of his categories, renders his analysis stilted and obscure.

The significance of his work for the present study is not its thesis or philosophical idiom, but its approach. Along with the Apollonian/Dionysian distinction, Danckert's work illustrates how conceptual terms embody stylistic ideals derived from humanistic ultimate concerns.

Sentics

Another human-oriented theory that claims a link between worldview and the compositional process has been developed as part of a new discipline called sentics.¹⁰⁰ While seeking to understand the nature of human emotion, Manfred Clynes, a neurophysiologist and musician, simultaneously discovered a key to the understanding of musical communication. His findings have given promise of a more empirical study of musical expression.

After designing a way to capture and document the expressive forms by which human beings recognize, communicate, and distinguish

sound ideals, the fusion of word and tone, the choice and use of thematic content. The creative process is also explored along with philosophic considerations such as aesthetics, the meaning of music, performance, and developmental possibilities.

⁹⁸The editor's afterword indicated that other writings of Danckert also emphasized this connection (ibid., 471).

⁹⁹Marianne Bröcker raised this criticism (ibid., 471).

¹⁰⁰The discipline was given its name--from the Latin sentire--by its founder Manfred Clynes. Though known and referred to in the early 1970s, the first comprehensive discussion of sentics did not appear until 1978 (Manfred Clynes, Sentics: The Touch of the Emotions [Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1978]).

emotion,¹⁰¹ Clynes demonstrated that music, as a language of emotion, employed these same forms (termed "essentic forms"). Using pitch, intensity, tone color, duration, and harmonic progression, either singly or in combination, music creates sound images of essentic forms.¹⁰² These become evident, for example, in both the placement of tones in melodic lines¹⁰³ and the phrasing of those melody lines in performance.

¹⁰¹So far Clynes has isolated, recorded, analyzed, and transculturally tested the forms of seven sentic states--love, grief, reverence, joy, sex, anger, and hate. For a complete explanation of these forms, their characteristics and functions, see Clynes, Sentics, 14-51.

¹⁰²Clynes, Sentics, 12, 77. Clynes' research provided empirical evidence for a concept that previously had been abstractly presented by a number of scholars. For example, Carroll C. Pratt wrote: "To say that music is the language of emotion does not mean that it embodies emotion. That is impossible. Emotions are bodily states, and bodily processes cannot be changed into sound. The pattern or form of bodily processes, however, can be duplicated in sound or in visual material. It is the similarity of pattern which leads to the use of the same words for otherwise very different states. The composer who strives to give musical expression to his mood or emotion manages to discover and mould, presumably in most cases quite unconsciously, a tonal design which resembles very closely the internal pattern of his own affective state. The music then sounds the way an emotion feels" (Carroll C. Pratt, "Structural versus Expressive Form in Music," The Journal of Psychology, 5 [January 1938]: 153-154). Frank Howes wrote: "Any competent musician can design patterns of tone, but it is only the true composer who can say something with them, and he does so by an alchemy of the mind, the fundamental nature of which would seem to be a kind of analogy. By virtue of some recondite likeness between two kinds of experience in two different sensory media, a relationship is established." (Frank Howes, Man, Mind and Music quoted in Terence McLaughlin, Music and Communication [New York: St. Martins Press, 1971], 78). Langer wrote: "The tonal structures we call 'music' bear a close logical similarity to the forms of human feeling. . . . The pattern of music is that . . . form worked out in pure, measured sound and silence. Music is a tonal analogue of emotive life" (Langer, Feeling and Form, 27). Gordon Epperson wrote: "Music is the expression . . . of the emotions: an aural image of how feelings feel, how they operate" (Gordon Epperson, The Musical Symbol: An Exploration in Aesthetics [New York: Da Capo Press, 1990], 75). Sam Reese wrote: "A composer expresses his knowledge of feelings, not his own actual feelings. He knows the forms of certain feelings, the way they change and move, and he symbolizes these feelings in music forms" (Sam Reese, "Forms of Feeling: The Aesthetic Theory of Susanne K. Langer," Music Educators Journal 63 [April 1977]: 49).

¹⁰³See Clynes' description of this in Manfred Clynes, "When Time Is Music," in Rhythm in Psychological, Linguistic, and Musical Processes, ed. James R. Evans and Manfred Clynes (Springfield, Ill.: Charles C. Thomas, 1986), 184-185.

Utilizing an extrapolation of the Apollonian/Dionysian distinctions,¹⁰⁴ Clynes found that in music composed before 1800, emotions were presented singly or with related emotions, or contrasted with their opposites. The emotions of love and reverence were given frequent expression. In more recent times, however, the tendency has been to juxtapose an array of emotions in a dramatic continuum. Emotions such as sexual longing, disdain, anger, despair, hope, and enthusiasm have become prominent.¹⁰⁵ Expectations tend to center around "situations of longings or of unaccountably tragic events, or magical reprieves, or fairy-tale like transportations into imaginary worlds."¹⁰⁶ Clynes noted that from the time of Debussy, essentic forms have been de-emphasized and replaced with "sounds that directly suggest sensory environments."¹⁰⁷

Such sentic analysis clearly assists the performer in music interpretation. It also provides alluring documentation of

¹⁰⁴Clynes used the terms Apollonian and Dionysian to distinguish between two modes of emotional experience. In the Dionysian mode, which according to Clynes is the most common, emotion is experienced as directly linked with self as an ego function, with a high degree of the personal involvement. It is felt as the actual emotion of the individual, involving his/her own drives and energies and affecting decisions and patterns of action. The Apollonian mode of experiencing emotion is considered and somewhat detached. Rather than being a sympathetic resonance that has been "caught," it is a considered quality evoked in the imagination, allowing empathetic, compassionate "in-tuneness." Clynes believed that in daily life there should be a balance between sympathetic (Dionysian) and empathetic (Apollonian) experiences (Clynes, Sentics, 71).

¹⁰⁵Ibid., 94.

¹⁰⁶Ibid., 83. Clynes evaluated this trend as follows: "The first type of music gives us an impression of increasing our empathy, our ability to be in touch with natural sentic order. It provides us with immediate knowledge of essentic forms in relation to their place in the larger order. Romantic music, on the other hand, is more seductive in nature, and will give us ecstasies of the moment--forgetfulness--but will not generally provide as lasting a sense of security" (ibid). In other words, he considered Romantic music less emotionally stable, less tied to reality in the sentic messages it communicates, and usually more Dionysian in nature.

¹⁰⁷Ibid., 68.

historical and compositional inclinations, but does not explain why composers employ essentic forms in certain ways. However, the discovery of another level of musical communication provided some additional insight. Presenting the total musical message as a two-tiered communication, Clynes explained that:

On one level there is the sentic story, a chain of essentic forms each having a clear beginning, middle and end, that constitute the elements of communication of emotional qualities. These tell the story. On another level is the musical pulse which also communicates the point of view, the identity of the composer--a unique person, in an intimate revelation of a point of view, a basic Weltanschauung. Everything in the story is told from that perspective.

The music logic thus combines these two hierarchial levels. The meaning is achieved combining the point of view of the intimate identity of the composer, with the particular story he tells.¹⁰⁸

The idea that each composer has a unique pulse indicating a personal worldview has provided an intriguing focus for study over two decades.¹⁰⁹

The significance of this pulse--a distinctive, durational shaping of the whole musical structure--is not simply its presence, but its influence on the compositional process and the performance of the work. For example, in performance, the pulse controls the microstructure of the music such as the amplitude shaping and duration of tones (phrasing), tempo, vibrato length, depth and rapidity, micropauses, and meaningful accelerandos and ritards.

¹⁰⁸Manfred Clynes, "Music Beyond the Score," Somatics 5 (Autumn-Winter, 1984-1985): 12.

¹⁰⁹Clynes' pulse research provided empirical evidence for an idea Epperson previously intimated. Commenting on Dewey's observation that rhythm does not exist as a uniform, even flow, Epperson wrote: "Even those 'natural' models which are extolled and pointed to as our rhythmic guides--the movement patterns of the heavenly bodies, the human heartbeat and respiration--have their peculiar deviations within a given order. But on the level of musical art it is often an understanding of the underlying rhythmic dynamism of a composition that means the difference between a live performance and a dead one. The sense of tempo--and not merely the dutiful recurrence of accents--is crucial rhythmically, while intensity of the beat is communicated only if the actual playing is relevant to an inner, and virtual, infallibility" (Epperson, The Musical Symbol, 221).

In the compositional process, Clynes observed that "expectations generated by the nature of the composer can be seen to influence the choices of musical ideas with which he composes, i.e. aspects of the kind of musical themes and their uses that may 'come' to him."¹¹⁰ Clynes further noted that:

We may now look at the music of the composer from the vantage point of the pulse matrix and ask what it might predict concerning how he composes, i.e. how it may act as a constraint on various aspects of composition and point to particular predilections.¹¹¹

Clynes illustrated this with the music of Haydn and Mozart. Although their general style is similar and belongs to the same historical period, "their pulse structures are considerably different."¹¹² He explained: "The most salient difference between the Haydn and the Mozart pulse microstructure lies in the fourth tone. This tone is much more emphasized in Haydn, yet without being elongated as in Beethoven."¹¹³ Thus, in the final movements of Haydn's compositions we would expect a larger proportion of salient or disjunct pitch progressions and increased loudness in upbeats in the fourth position of a pulse group, than in the finales of Mozart's compositions.¹¹⁴ Summarizing this discussion, Clynes concluded:

¹¹⁰Manfred Clynes, "Generative Principles of Musical Thought: Integration of Microstructure with Structure," The Journal for the Integrated Study of Artificial Intelligence, Cognitive Science and Applied Epistemology 3 (1986): 187.

¹¹¹Ibid., 196. Writing in 1971 about the patterns of musical composition, McLaughlin observed: "A composer 'feels' what is the right pattern for his own personal communication by rejecting the patterns which seem to him, introspectively, to be wrong, and holding on to the ones that are right" (McLaughlin, Music and Communication, 79).

¹¹²Clynes, "Generative Principles of Musical Thought," 202.

¹¹³Ibid. The "fourth tone" refers to the fourth note in a pulse group.

¹¹⁴Ibid., 203. Clynes also noted Schubert's elongation of the second tone in a pulse group and the resultant special emphasis given to this part of the pulse in his compositions (ibid., 197).

This kind of emphasis also brings out the playful, jovial character of the music typical of Haydn, whose open-hearted, somewhat naive and innocent humor founded in natural piety is far removed from the wit of Mozart. The spirit of the music, the nature of the composer and aspects of compositional technique convergently touch in that dynamic icon, the precise pulse form-- a powerful factor of integrity in musical thought."¹⁵

Thus the pulse structure, which carries its own "sentic charge," is like a window of understanding on the development of an individual composer's style.

Sentic research has also shown that distinct pulse structures exist in the music of different ethnic groups,¹⁶ indicating something about the collective character of a culture and suggesting a reason for stylistic predilections in a body of music derived from a unique pulse form. Fascinating as this study is, the discipline is young and much work remains to be done. Clynes admitted: "For those few composers whose pulse matrices we know already, it is clear intuitively that they relate to the personalities of the composers as we sense them through their music, and from a distance in time."¹⁷ That intuition is still part of the process of establishing the relationship between pulse forms and composers' personalities indicates that complete empiricism has not yet been attained.

¹⁵Ibid., 203.

¹⁶See the discussion in *ibid.*, 198, as well as Manfred Clynes and Janet Walker, "Neurobiologic Functions of Rhythm, Time, and Pulse in Music." in Music, Mind and Brain: The Neurophysiology of Music, ed. Manfred Clynes (New York and London: Plenum Press, 1982), 202-207. For comparison, see also the studies done on social rhythms that indicate that "music can be seen as a sort of rhythmic consensus." Edward T. Hall suggested that "one reason you get hit tunes is that someone composes something that is so close to what people are doing, saying, feeling and the rhythms they use that they recognize it immediately. The music releases feelings and rhythms that people are familiar with" (Edward T. Hall; quoted in Carole Douglis, "The Beat Goes On," Psychology Today 21 [November 1987]: 42).

¹⁷Manfred Clynes, "What Can a Musician Learn about Music Performance from Newly Discovered Microstructure Principles (PM and PAS)?" in Action and Perception in Rhythm and Music, ed. A. Gabrielsson (Stockholm: Royal Swedish Academy of Music, No. 55, 1987), 217.

Psycho-pharmacological conditioning

One other type of human-oriented explanation of musical expression deserves mention. Unlike the theories already canvassed, it derives from an experience of the human psyche rather than out of the psychological nature of the human being.

Roy F. Baumeister noted that a connection between the development of acid rock and use of the psychoactive drug LSD has been popularly recognized.¹¹⁸ Early in his discussion, Baumeister sought to clarify the relationship between the music and the drug.

The important point is that the ingestion of this chemical did not lead directly to certain musical forms. The psychopharmacological properties of LSD did not create or shape acid rock per se, but LSD's effects made people sensitive and receptive to certain innovations.¹¹⁹

Whatever the technical reality regarding cause and effect, the notion that "the music developed features that clearly derived from the effects of the drug"¹²⁰ seems significant. It suggests that an experience could also be considered the ultimate concern behind the development of a style of musical expression.

Some of the psycho-physiological effects of LSD enumerated by Baumeister included a short attention span, emotional ambiguity, lack of unequivocal attitudes, interest in novel sensations, an egalitarian fascination with all activities, and the impatiently creative desire to explore complex and subtle elaborations.¹²¹

The state of mind thus depicted affected musical creation in various ways. It directed "attention to novel sources of

¹¹⁸Roy F. Baumeister, "Acid Rock: A Critical Reappraisal and Psychological Commentary," Journal of Psychoactive Drugs 16 (October-December 1984): 339.

¹¹⁹Ibid.

¹²⁰Ibid., 344.

¹²¹Ibid.

inspiration."¹²² New and varied sound effects like reverberation, percussive contrasts, varied use of the voice, and the alteration of guitar tone by means of distortion ("fuzz") were perceived as "highly stimulating to the listening LSD user because the subjective effects of the drug elaborated them further."¹²³ Harmonic structure became very simple because of "the inability to follow complex chord sequences."¹²⁴ There was "the occasional use of [a] brief repetition of a simple phrase, with either increasing volume or increasing tempo" to produce the sensation of "brief, agitated euphoria."¹²⁵ Lead guitar solos interspersed with group improvisations became a feature as players elaborated on their own parts. In fact, "the tendency to elaborate one's part might cause a band to move off in several different directions at once, leading to a fairly incoherent product."¹²⁶ Instead of pre-planned, well-rehearsed items with well-executed transitions, acid rock was characterized by the spontaneity of communal creation because of "LSD's disruption of memory and attention as well as its ability to foster spontaneity and exploration."¹²⁷ Although the information cited here emphasizes musical developments, LSD use also affected the evolution of lyrics.¹²⁸

Baumeister recorded that as LSD fell out of favor and "musicians and their audiences took new drugs . . . acid rock

¹²²Ibid., 345.

¹²³Ibid., 344.

¹²⁴Ibid., 345.

¹²⁵Ibid., 340-341.

¹²⁶Ibid., 341.

¹²⁷Ibid.

¹²⁸See the discussion in *ibid.*, 342-344.

declined."¹²⁹ Apparently, as the psychological experience changed, different preferences and receptivities encouraged different musical features.

Theories Centered in Human Society

The sociological explication of musical style was succinctly summarized--some might say caricatured--by Edward O. Henry's quip: "People in a uniquely structured society perform uniquely structured music--it must be the structure of the society that brings about the musical style."¹³⁰ This may be an uncharitable oversimplification of the position taken in the contemporary study of the sociology of music; however, its general thrust is supported from many sources. John Blacking wrote: "If we want to find the basic organizing principles that affect the shapes of patterns of music, we must look beyond the cultural conventions of any century or society to the social situations in which they are applied and to which they refer."¹³¹ Later in the same work he stated:

Music is not a language that describes the way society seems to be, but a metaphorical expression of feelings associated with the way society really is. It is a reflection of and response to social forces, and particularly to the consequences of the division of labor in society.¹³²

More recently, Christopher Ballantine described how he perceived the relationship between society and musical expression. He wrote: "What actually happens is that social structures crystalize in musical structures; . . . in various ways and with varying degrees of critical awareness, the musical microcosm replicates the social

¹²⁹Ibid., 345.

¹³⁰Henry, Chant the Names of God, 10.

¹³¹John Blacking, How Musical Is Man? (Seattle, Wash.: University of Washington Press, 1973), 73. In the same context he also wrote: "The decisive style-forming factor in any attempt to express feeling in music must be its social content" (ibid).

¹³²Ibid., 104.

macrocosm."¹³³ More recently still, John Shepherd argued that musical styles have inherent social significance:

Because people create music, they reproduce in the basic structure of their music the basic structure of their own thought processes. If it is accepted that people's thought processes are socially mediated, then it could be said that the basic structures of different styles of music are likewise socially mediated and so socially significant.¹³⁴

As a corollary, he concluded:

If musical styles have an inherent social significance, then it should be possible to demonstrate that significance by carrying out musical analysis in terms of the social reality which gave birth to and is articulated by a particular musical style.¹³⁵

The investigation of musical expression in terms of social realities¹³⁶--that is, assuming societal factors are an illuminative or ultimate concern--is not only establishing itself as a unique

¹³³Ballantine, Music and Its Social Meanings, 5.

¹³⁴John Shepherd, "Towards a Sociology of Musical Styles," in Lost in Music: Culture, Style and the Musical Event, ed. Avron Levine White (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987), 57.

¹³⁵Ibid. The predominant Marxist view of art is sympathetic to this perspective. George V. Plekhanov stated: "The first task of the critic consists in translating the ideas in a work of art from the language of art to the language of sociology" (quoted in Louis Dupré, Marx's Social Critique of Culture [New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1983], 269). See also Dupré's discussion of this in *ibid.*, 266-274.

¹³⁶Other writers expressed similar viewpoints: Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 36; Ronald Byrnside, "The Formation of a Musical Style: Early Rock," in Contemporary Music and Music Cultures, by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975), 161; Fabio Dasilva, Anthony Blasi, and David Dees, The Sociology of Music (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1984), vii; Ivo Supićić, "Science on Music and Values in Music," 75; and *idem*, Music in Society, 129-131. Note also the convenient summary/discussion of Alan Lomax's work in Gina Bari Kolata, "Singing Styles and Human Cultures: How Are They Related?" Science 200 (April 21, 1978): 287.

Others saw social factors as very important, but not the sole influence. Bruno Nettl summarized well the view of this group: "It is difficult not to believe that the character of society and its quality of life do not have a great deal to do with determining the style or styles of its music" (Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 93). See also Herbert Read, Art and Society (London: Faber and Faber, 1956), 83; and Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 339.

discipline,¹³⁷ but has several lines of sociological inquiry in support of its claims. These include the study of collective mentalities,¹³⁸ social attitudes,¹³⁹ sexual behaviors including the relative position of the sexes in a society, the treatment of children,¹⁴⁰ political and religious structures and orientations,¹⁴¹ and economic considerations such as the division of labor, class structures, and socio-economic status.¹⁴² Each of these facets of life has been suggested as influencing music styles. Two large team studies and resultant theories developed under the leadership of Pitirim Sorokin and Alan Lomax respectively serve as illustrations of this approach.

¹³⁷In 1987 Supićić wrote: "The sociology of music is only now beginning to establish itself as a specialized scholarly discipline. It is not yet entirely delimited and defined, and the existing literature, though relatively abundant, is inconclusive and fragmentary" (Supićić, Music and Society, xii).

¹³⁸See Pitirim A. Sorokin, The Crisis of Our Age: The Social and Cultural Outlook (New York: E. P. Dutton, 1944), 35.

¹³⁹See Leonard E. Barrett, Sr., The Rastafarians: Sounds of Cultural Dissonance, rev. and updated ed. (Boston: Beacon Press, 1988), 197.

¹⁴⁰See Alan Lomax, "Folk Song Style," American Anthropologist 61 (December 1959): 950. Prior to this, Sachs had suggested: "If singing is indeed an activity of all our being, sex, the strongest difference between human beings, must have a decisive influence on musical styles" (Curt Sachs, The Rise of Music in the Ancient World East and West [New York: W. W. Norton, 1943], 40.) See also Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 339.

¹⁴¹See Paul Honigsheim's discussion of this in Music and Society: The Later Writings of Paul Honigsheim, introduced and edited by K. Peter Etzkorn (Huntington, N.Y.: Robert E. Krieger Publishing Company, 1979), 111-129.

¹⁴²See Blacking, How Musical Is Man? 104; Günter Mayer, Weltbild -Notenbild: Zur Dialektik des Musikalischen Materials (N.p.: Röderberg-Verlag GmbH, 1978), 93; Georg Knepler, "Traditionen in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen," in Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer (Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987), 22; and Gardner, "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics," 8.

Collective mentalities

Sorokin distinguished two overarching types of integrated culture, each growing out of a unique collective mentality that manifested itself in singular types of religion, ethics, arts, morals, social relationships, economic and political organization, and types of human personality and conduct. He termed these mentalities "Ideational" and "Sensate;" and a third, a mixed mentality, he called "Idealistic."¹⁴³ Sorokin proceeded to outline the characteristics pertaining to each system of thought¹⁴⁴ and delineated their outworking in the fine arts.¹⁴⁵

Simply put, the Ideational style of art tends to be symbolic, "its physical exemplars being merely the visible signs of the invisible world and inner values."¹⁴⁶ The Sensate style of art is "sensate in form; 'naturalistic,' in the sense that its intention is to reproduce objects in a shape which imitates closely that in which they appear to our organs of sense." It uses "those materials which serve and help to increase the sensate happiness of man."¹⁴⁷

Ideational music is not concerned so much with "how it sounds--pleasant or unpleasant" to the ear, but with what the mind

¹⁴³Pitirim A. Sorokin, Social and Cultural Dynamics: A Study of Change in Major Systems of Art, Truth, Ethics, Law, and Social Relationships, rev. and abridged ed. (Boston: Porter Sargent Publisher, 1957), 24-25. His Ideational/Sensate classification appears to follow basic Apollonian/Dionysian distinctions on a macro or communal scale.

¹⁴⁴An enumeration of key variables in Ideational and Sensate cultures is presented in *ibid.*, 15. A summary of the main traits of the cultural mentalities is given in tabular form in *ibid.*, 37-39.

¹⁴⁵Sorokin clearly stated that: "The domination of this or that form in the fine arts is not a matter of the presence or absence of artistic skill, but is the result, rather, of the Ideational, Sensate, Idealistic, or mixed mentality of the respective peoples and cultures" (Sorokin, The Crisis of Our Age, 35).

¹⁴⁶*Ibid.*

¹⁴⁷*Ibid.*

can grasp behind the symbolic sounds.¹⁴⁸ It is "externally simple, archaic, devoid of sensory trimmings, pomp and ostentation."¹⁴⁹ Its emotional tone is described as "pious, ethereal, and ascetic."¹⁵⁰ In Sensate music the overt "aim is to please the ear"--to achieve audible beauty regardless of any hidden meaning.¹⁵¹ It must be sensational, passionate, and pathetic, deliberately making lavish use of pomp and circumstance and external adornment.¹⁵² Comparisons of Sorokin's construct are presented in table 1.¹⁵³

The Idealistic mentality adopts intermediary positions between the polar points, embodying elements of both in an integrated synthesis. Sorokin summarized the stylistic features of this category as "partly supersensory and partly sensory, but only in the sublimest and noblest aspects of sensory reality."¹⁵⁴ He continued: "It is an art intentionally blind to everything debasing, vulgar, ugly, and negative in the empirical world of the senses. Its style is partly symbolic and allegoric, partly realistic and naturalistic. Its emotional tone is serene, calm, and imperturbable."¹⁵⁵

Some concern has been expressed over Sorokin's mixing of musical technical distinctions with attitudinal definitions--"how it

¹⁴⁸Ibid., 160.

¹⁴⁹Ibid., 32.

¹⁵⁰Ibid., 31.

¹⁵¹Sorokin, Social and Cultural Dynamics, 160.

¹⁵²Sorokin, The Crisis of Our Age, 32, 33.

¹⁵³Adapted from Sorokin, Social and Cultural Dynamics, 162-164 and 181.

¹⁵⁴Sorokin, The Crisis of Our Age, 33.

¹⁵⁵Ibid., 33-34.

Table 1.--A Summary of Sorokin's Construct of Ideational and Sensate Music

Ideational Music	Sensate Music
An "inner" quality	Inclined to be theatrical and external
Not impressively technical	Designed to stun, to be a sensation
Uses simplest means	Wanton use of technical "tricks"
Not intended for popularity or success	Must be enjoyable, entertaining, successful
Does not strive to be the biggest, loudest, or best-selling (does not demand large choruses, concert halls, applause)	Uses or abuses any means to increase sensual effect (massing voices, large range, modulation, various consonances and dissonances, chromatics, contrasts of rhythms and intensity)
Comparatively pure in style (consistent and avoiding the unnecessary)	Cannot afford to be pure--captivates, adapts to the fancies and tastes of the masses
Does not force the composer to protect his/her rights, name, authorship	Must be "individualistic" and professional
The audible sign for inaudible, collective values	Expresses individual values
Relatively homogenous societal mentality is required to produce grand Ideational music	Heterogenous buyers' market is its milieu
Rooted in the communal consciousness, and therefore it does not need special aesthetic theorizing, critics, or professional appraisers	Its nature calls for criteria of beauty and perfection spawning aesthetic theorizing and professional criticism (Sensual taste is exceedingly variable calling forth an ever-increasing number of theories of beauty)
Has and needs religious and moral censors	Rejects religious and moral censors
Its composers usually purify and modify pre-existing symbols without radical alteration	Its composers constantly create, incessant change, unceasing variety, contrasting fashions

sounds" with "what it means."¹⁵⁶ However, in general Sorokin's descriptive terminology provides a "feel" for his categories of societal mentality and the type of music in them rather than a technical delineation of style. His historical analysis of musical development in several cultures clarified the meaning of his classifications by providing examples.¹⁵⁷

The comprehensiveness of Sorokin's analysis is impressive. The extensive presentation of parallel cultural phenomena in major systems of truth, ethics, law, and social relationships alongside the arts provides a broad foundation for his conclusions about collective mentalities. However, beyond the sociological understanding of the manifestation of different mentalities, his cyclical view of history betrays certain metaphysical assumptions. Although the Ideational, Idealistic, and Sensate views of reality are presented as precipitators of stylistic change in the arts, they themselves are subject to uncontrollable forces with which people should cooperate.¹⁵⁸

Cantometrics/biosocial influences

The work of Alan Lomax provides a different approach. Rather than using descriptive terminology that evoked a "feel" for certain categories of art music styles, Lomax employed more precise

¹⁵⁶Honigsheim, Music in Society, 24-26.

¹⁵⁷From the birth of Greek culture into the fifth century B.C. was designated by Sorokin as a period of Ideational domination of music. This was followed by an Idealistic mentality. After the fifth century, Sensate music arose until finally it dominated Hellenistic culture (Sorokin, Crisis of Our Age, 167).

In Western culture, from the fifth century A.D. into the 1300s, medieval music was predominantly Ideational. During the eleventh and twelfth centuries a Sensate influence arose, culminating in an Idealistic phase between the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries. The Sensate form predominated from the beginning of the nineteenth century until its decline in the late twentieth century (ibid., 173).

¹⁵⁸Ibid., 315-326.

technical distinctions in folk song performance style to establish classifications. He considered vocal range and timbre, bodily stance, gestures, muscular tensions, the degree of soloistic or communal participation, and conditions embracing the musical event as significant as formal elements like scales, interval systems, rhythmic patterns, melodic contours, and harmonic techniques.¹⁵⁹

In the development of his "cantometrics experiment," Lomax and his colleagues sought to combine a measure of musical behavior with the formal elements of music style in a socio-cultural context. A set of thirty-seven parameters was developed for evaluating recorded folk music examples.¹⁶⁰ Each parameter was rated on a scale between characteristics of individual-oriented music styles and those of group-oriented music styles.¹⁶¹

Lomax summed up his findings in 1968 with the simple statement, "As people live, so do they sing."¹⁶² He cited the principle discovery in cantometrics: "A culture's favored song style

¹⁵⁹See Lomax, "Folk Song Style," 929, 938.

¹⁶⁰The parameters rated included: leader/chorus emphasis, relation of orchestra to vocal part, choral tone, orchestral musical organization and tonal concert, vocal and orchestral rhythmic organization, melodic shape and form, phrase length and number, range of melody, tempo, volume, glissando, tremolo, vocal register, nasalization, raspiness, accent, and enunciation of consonants (ibid., 22-23).

¹⁶¹For a description of this procedure see Lomax, Folk Song Style and Culture, 13-74. The individualistic and "groupy" performance models that provide the underlying structure for the rating system were given in their extreme form as follows (ibid., 16):

Model A
Individualized
solo
textually complex
metrically complex
melodically complex
ornamented
usually noisy voice
precise enunciation

Model B
Integrated, groupy
choral, multileveled, cohesive
repetitious text
metrically simple
melodically simple
no ornamentation
usually clear voice
slurred enunciation

¹⁶²Ibid., 4.

reflects and reinforces the kind of behavior essential to its main subsistence efforts and to its central and controlling social institutions."¹⁶³ He asserted that statistical confirmation of the relationship between song style and features of social structure "is so strong as to indicate that expressive behavior may be one of the most sensitive and reliable indicators of culture pattern and social structure."¹⁶⁴ In other words, as he suggested elsewhere, musical style analysis can be used as a "diagnostic instrument" of the emotional character and aesthetic history of a people alongside the evolution of their economic and institutional structures.¹⁶⁵

By way of example of this relationship, Lomax indicated that his research had confirmed two early hypotheses, namely that:

1. Solo song characterized highly centralized societies, and leaderless performances were most common in societies with simple political structure.
2. Unified choirs occurred in highly cohesive societies and diffuse choruses in individualized cultures.¹⁶⁶

Other correlations were found between the use of higher energy levels (loudness, forcefulness, and higher voice register) and greater degrees of governmental centralization. Precision in enunciation, larger melodic intervals, and more textual repetition were related to greater social complexity.¹⁶⁷

As an indicator of a society's sexual mores, Lomax cited the wailing "high-pitched, strident singing" common in the folk songs of southern Italy and southern Spain as "a musical symbol of the

¹⁶³Ibid., 133.

¹⁶⁴Ibid., 4.

¹⁶⁵Lomax, "Folk Song Style," 949, 950.

¹⁶⁶Lomax, Folk Song Style and Culture, ix.

¹⁶⁷This is summarized in Kolata, "Singing Styles and Human Cultures," 287.

burning pain of sexual starvation."¹⁶⁸ Following a perceptive discussion, Lomax concluded:

Where women are made into chattels, as they have been during recent history in most areas of high culture, their feelings of melancholy and frustration have determined that the entire music of the various societies take on a nostalgic or agonized character, in singing style, melodic type, and emotional content. The women in these societies fix the early musical preferences of the young, so that when these children become adults they experience a pleasurable recall of childhood emotions associated with their mothers and their mothers' sad songs; thus a sorrowful music fills them with a feeling of security and they find it beautiful and pleasurable.¹⁶⁹

While Lomax forged some provocative connections between music styles and "biosocial" influences,¹⁷⁰ his interpretations seem to be somewhat intuitively derived. The inferential nature of his interpretation of correlations, his limited data analysis, and the validity of his song classification system have all been questioned.¹⁷¹ But, his development of a more wholistic analysis, including behavior patterns like vocal technique, is recognized as an important contribution.

Evaluation of Humanistic Theories

In critiquing the humanistic theories presented, it is evident that they provide important insights into musical style development. If the concept of style pertains only to human action or creation, then by definition, understanding human nature (individually and collectively) must provide insight into human artifacts and characteristic forms of expression.

¹⁶⁸Lomax, "Folk Song Style," 947.

¹⁶⁹Ibid., 950.

¹⁷⁰Merriam used this term to describe Lomax's focus (Merriam, The Anthropology of Music, 250).

¹⁷¹For a summary of some of the criticisms of Lomax's work, see Kolata, "Singing Styles and Human Cultures," 288. See also Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 92-94; and Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 93.

Judging by the number of humanistic theories that allude to the Apollonian/Dionysian delineation (and/or related distinctions), this underlying polarity is clearly significant. It is conceivable that the psychological makeup of humankind (personality, emotion, and mentality), the social structures, and relationships all influence the formation of music style.

Perhaps the inherent weakness of theories in this category is its inferential elevation of human nature to the status of ultimate reality.¹⁷² The tendency to focus on or limit exploration and evaluation of the development of musical style to psychological and social factors ignores the significance of other recognized data.¹⁷³ To assert that ultimately musical expression is "the articulation of human being"¹⁷⁴ or the replication of a social reality implies metaphysical assumptions that should also be acknowledged and discussed.

Naturalistic Theories

The belief that musical art is ultimately rooted in nature and therefore to be described or explained in relation to natural

¹⁷²For example, the ultimate humanistic focus in Clynes' sentic theory is evident in his belief that the cognitive substrates of sentic states provide a basis for the derivation of ethics. See his discussion of this in Clynes, Sentics, 183-185 and idem, "Generalized Emotion, How It Is Produced and Sentic Cycle Therapy," in Emotions and Psychopathology, ed. Manfred Clynes and J. Panksepp (New York: Plenum Press, 1988), 161. Clynes suggested that sentic states concerned with an affirmative worldview in which a positive relationship to the environment is experienced (particularly the sentic states of love and reverence) should be cultivated in individuals and society because they predicate positive forms of action. As a corollary, music that promotes this should be fostered.

¹⁷³This will be discussed below in, "Western Musicological Scholarship and Religio-philosophical Explanations of Stylistic Development."

¹⁷⁴Hofstadter, Truth and Art, 86.

realities has had considerable adherence for centuries.¹⁷⁵ Some theories relate to the universe beyond this world or the superterrestrial aspect of nature, while others focus on the natural order found on this planet. Often the distinction is more a matter of emphasis than exclusivity.¹⁷⁶

Theories Emphasizing the Cosmos

Music historian Peter Crossley-Holland noted: "All early civilizations saw their ideal music as an image of cosmic order and its practice in temple ritual and court ceremonial as a means of helping to maintain or reflect universal harmony."¹⁷⁷ Crossley-Holland also observed that this conception and its historical tenacity were responsible for the "very conservative traditions of music" maintained by those societies.¹⁷⁸ However, while this view was popular in early times, it is by no means a relic. More recently Henri Focillon stated that: "The formal relations within a

¹⁷⁵Because human beings are part of the natural world, it could be argued that humanistic theories are a subset of naturalistic theories. Frequently they occur in combination with what in this study has been defined as naturalistic. This may be why there is some difference of opinion as to whether or not Greek theories of art are humanistic or naturalistic. See the ambivalence implied in Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," Studia Islamica 37 (1973): 84. Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī categorized Plato's ideas as distinctly naturalistic (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 166-167).

¹⁷⁶See comments regarding the Chinese concept of music in Mieczyslaw Kolinski, "The Origin of the Indian 22-tone System," in Studies in Ethnomusicology, ed. Mieczyslaw Kolinski (New York: Folkways Records and Service, 1961), 17; Merriam, The Anthropology of Music, 245; Vandor, "The Role of Music in the Education of Man: Orient and Occident," 13; Yutang, The Wisdom of Confucius, 263-264; and Man-young Hahn, "Religious Origins of Korean Music," Korea Journal 15 (July 1975): 17.

¹⁷⁷Peter Crossley-Holland, "Music in Ancient Civilizations," Encyclopedia Britannica, 14th ed. (1971), 15:1091-1092.

¹⁷⁸Ibid.

work of art and among different works of art consist of an order for, and a metaphor of, the entire universe."¹⁷⁹

Conceptions of the cosmos

In 1970 Jacob Opper completed his study of the cosmological basis of three centuries in Western artistic culture with what he termed "the truistic proposition that civilizations are what they are by virtue of their view of nature."¹⁸⁰ His analysis revealed "that cultural change, beginning with the Renaissance-Modern world, is intimately linked with change in theories of nature and their attendant epistemologies."¹⁸¹

Among the ancients, a cosmologically oriented understanding of music was evidenced in a preoccupation with the significance of numerical proportions in musical tones,¹⁸² the setting of correct pitches in harmony with the universe,¹⁸³ the recognition and appropriate use of character-influencing modes or scales,¹⁸⁴ the "music of the spheres," and the musical foundation of society and

¹⁷⁹Henri Focillon, The Life of Forms in Art, trans. Charles Beecher Hogan and George Kubler (New York: George Wittenborn, 1948), 2.

¹⁸⁰Opper, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 301.

¹⁸¹Ibid., 300. For a similar affirmation, see Glickman, "Tonality and Gravity," 113-124.

¹⁸²For descriptions of the mathematical division of sound in ancient Chinese and Greek cultures, see Sachs, The Rise of Music in the Ancient World East and West, 114-120, 211-215; and Gustave Reese, Music in the Middle Ages: With an Introduction on the Music of Ancient Times (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1940), 20-44.

¹⁸³See William P. Malm's description of a Chinese belief that persisted until "very recent times" (William P. Malm, Music Cultures of the Pacific, the Near East and Asia [Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1967], 108).

¹⁸⁴Greek and Chinese concepts in this regard are well known. See Grout's summary of the Greek doctrine of ethos in Grout, A History of Western Music, 7-9. On the Chinese modes, see Yutang, The Wisdom of Confucius, 252-254; and Merriam, The Anthropology of Music, 245. See also Indian concepts in Kolinski, "The Origin of the Indian 22-tone System," 3-18.

government.¹⁸⁵ In recent times the physical (rather than philosophical) understanding of the cosmos gained through the natural sciences has been related to developments in musical expression. For example, the mechanistic understanding of nature that dominated Western thinking in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries finds its parallel in the arts of that period. The Newtonian understanding of gravity and the solar system was considered analogous to the musical conception of tonality that incorporated the idea of gravitation toward a tonal center and related keys.¹⁸⁶ Baroque music scholar Manfred E. Bukofzer acknowledged the historical connection between these notions when he wrote: "It is no mere metaphor if tonality is explained in terms of gravitation. Both tonality and gravitation were discoveries of the Baroque period made at exactly the same time."¹⁸⁷

The order evident in the systematic and logical exploitation of musical ideas showcased in Baroque contrapuntal technique and climaxed in the output of J. S. Bach was "not unlike the orderly

¹⁸⁵Evidence for these can be found in discussions of ancient Greek music. See Grout, A History of Western Music, 6. Of Chinese music, Confucius stated: "We see music and government are directly connected with one another" (Yutang, The Wisdom of Confucius, 252). "When rituals, music, punishments and governments are all in order, then the principles of political order are complete" (ibid., 256).

¹⁸⁶Opper described the chordal relationships of this harmonic system as consisting in "a tonal center (key) with neighboring 'satellite' tonalities which 'gravitate' towards the center. The degree of attraction between the tonal center and the neighboring tonalities may be said to be directly proportional to the distance between the two, figured by the circle of fifths" (Opper, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 83). He added that: "There is a clear analogy between this description of tonality and the Newtonian operation of the solar system with its inverse square law of gravitational attraction between the sun and the planets" (ibid.).

¹⁸⁷Manfred E. Bukofzer, Music in the Baroque Era: From Monteverdi to Bach (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1947), 12. See also the description of the function of tonality in ibid., 220.

universe postulated in Newton's Principia¹⁸⁸ and the codification of tonality in Rameau's treatise Traité de l'harmonie (1722). The Newtonian view of time as a relentless flow finds its counterpart in the Baroque use of "mechanically" regular rhythm, termed by Oppen the "mathematical uniformity of an eternally moving object in space and time."¹⁸⁹

Eugene Glickman submitted that correspondence between musical and scientific thought can be focused around three cosmological theories embodied in the work of Ptolemy, Newton, and Einstein. Ptolemy's cosmology, based on the conception that the earth is the center of the universe, supplied the framework for modal theory that reigned supreme as a constructional guide for music of the Middle Ages. His circumscribed universe was reflected in the restricted use of accidentals in the mode (theoretically only B-flat was allowed¹⁹⁰). Pitch material was limited in range (in the ambitus of a single mode and in the total number of pitches available in all modes), particularly in the music fostered by the Church.¹⁹¹

As the ideas of Copernicus, Kepler, and Newton supplanted Ptolemy's cosmology, tonality developed as indicated above.¹⁹² With the further discoveries of Max Planck's quantum mechanics and Albert

¹⁸⁸Oppen, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 81. This work was published in 1687.

¹⁸⁹Ibid., 97.

¹⁹⁰Glickman acknowledged certain practical discrepancies in the outworking of this rule. Nevertheless, the rule was maintained. Glickman, "Tonality and Gravity," 120.

¹⁹¹Ibid.

¹⁹²Glickman noted that Newton's Principia was published in 1687, while Corelli's Opus 1, in which tonality is clearly incorporated, appeared in 1681. Ibid., 119.

Einstein's relativity, tonality disintegrated, giving way to atonality.¹⁹³

In explaining this last development, Glickman proposed a correlation between the scientific realization that the momentum and position of a subatomic particle cannot be simultaneously calculated and "the atonal composer's viewpoint that each pitch is an isolate and has no identity beyond itself, except as defined by the composer, in a tone row of his or her own creation which is unique for each piece."¹⁹⁴ Ultimately, in Glickman's view, music style both reflected and contributed to developments in cosmological understanding.¹⁹⁵

Theories Emphasizing the Terrestrial Order

As early seventeenth-century Western thought developed, René Descartes articulated a mechanistic understanding of terrestrial natural order that, later in the same century, was amplified by Newton on a cosmic scale.¹⁹⁶ While the impact of the cosmological extrapolation has been noted above, the rational conception of nature proposed by Descartes also influenced many areas of thought including the arts. The Enlightenment's aesthetic philosophy came to be built on the notion that "as there are universal and inviolable laws of nature, so there must be laws of the same kind

¹⁹³Ibid., 119. Glickman noted: "Einstein's Special Theory was published in 1905; Schoenberg's first atonal pieces appeared in 1908" (ibid). Glickman added, however, that the coincidence of these dates is probable, not conclusive, evidence of a relationship between these events.

¹⁹⁴Ibid., 120.

¹⁹⁵Ibid., 123.

¹⁹⁶Because faith in his senses had been destroyed by experience, Descartes' passion was the rational conception of the external world (René Descartes, Meditations, trans. with an introduction by Laurence J. Lafleur [New York: Liberal Arts Press, 1951], 68).

and of the same importance for the imitation of nature."¹⁹⁷ In his study of Enlightenment thought, Ernst Cassirer contended that classical aesthetics was modelled after Descartes' theory of nature "point by point."¹⁹⁸

Conceptions of the natural order

In the link between the rationalistic view of nature and musical expression, Oppen perceived a connection with "the so-called doctrine of affections (Affectenlehre) of the Baroque era."¹⁹⁹ During this period, distinct stereotypes of certain emotional states were translated into musical motifs that a composer could use to create music. However, the rational, mechanistic orientation was clearly evident in the "static and schematized nature of the system."²⁰⁰ Bukofzer described the presentation of these affections in Baroque music as "not direct, psychological, and emotional, but indirect, that is intellectual and pictorial."²⁰¹ This engendered a controlled, objective style of music, rather than free expression of emotion. Summarizing the music of this period, Oppen wrote:

[It has] balance, proportion, control, stability, unity, and above all, a certain perceptual and epistemological optimality or 'rightness.' Any of these factors, alone or in combination, depends primarily on the logical processes, thus further supporting our contention that classicism is largely an analogue of the type of knowledge fostered by the mathematical physicists of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.²⁰²

¹⁹⁷Ernst Cassirer, The Philosophy of the Enlightenment, trans. Fritz C. A. Koelln and James P. Pettegrove (Boston: Beacon Press, 1955), 280.

¹⁹⁸Ibid., 284.

¹⁹⁹Oppen, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 71.

²⁰⁰Ibid.

²⁰¹Bukofzer, Music in the Baroque Era, 5.

²⁰²Oppen, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 102-103.

Focus on the natural world order was even more pronounced as the nineteenth century dawned on Western culture. Sir William Cecil Dampier characterized this when he wrote: "In the great advance which marked the nineteenth century . . . the point of real interest shifted from astronomy to geology and from physics to biology and the phenomena of life."³³ This new emphasis on the biological sciences saw a transition in the study of nature from a focus on "its products to one centered on the idea of process, from the generic to a genetic conception of natural phenomenon, from the elemental notion of being to the equally elemental notion of becoming."³⁴

Opper saw this change in viewpoint reflected in a number of ways in nineteenth-century music. For example, the biological processes of metamorphosis, change, and transformation--all properties of growth--had their counterparts in newly conceived compositional techniques. He elaborated:

With the year 1800 and forward, the number of works employing cyclical form and the metamorphosis of themes is directly proportional to the increasing influence of the biologically-evolutionary sciences and the organic world-view they engendered, and inversely proportional to the decreasing influence of the mathematico-physical sciences and their concomitant logico-mathematical cosmology.³⁵

Additionally, "the fusion of multi-movement works into one are [also] products of a biocentrically oriented mentality."³⁶ The move to make music a sensual expression of everyday life, rather

³³Sir William Cecil Dampier, A History of Science and Its Relations with Philosophy and Religion, 4th ed. with a postscript by I. Bernard Cohen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1961), 252.

³⁴Opper, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 177.

³⁵Ibid., 15-16.

³⁶Ibid., 262. Rather than contrasting entities, the idea is one of a growing organism.

than an abstraction of it,³⁰⁷ is further evidence of the focus on "real life." Increased complexity of thematic transformation also reflects the growing perception of a less predictable animate world.³⁰⁸ In the context of Western civilization, the pervasive nature of the correlations presented by Opper provide thought-provoking evidence for his thesis.

Biological considerations

Apart from philosophical connections of this type, other relationships between music and nature have also been suggested. Nettl cited Blacking among ethnomusicologists as intrepidly insisting on biological considerations in the development of different music styles.³⁰⁹ His recognition that musical behavior and action are part of human behavior suggested that "culture is in the end part of nature."³¹⁰ However, the abuse of biological/genetic considerations (with their potential racial overtones) during the Third Reich has tended to dampen enthusiasm for the exploration of the influence of such factors on the development of music style.

³⁰⁷See John F. Spratt, "Philosophical Implications of Modern Science as Reflected in the History of Music," Paper presented at Hiram College, Hiram, Ohio, November 1969, 8; quoted in Opper, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 262-263.

³⁰⁸Opper, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 271-272. Willi Apel contrasted the more thorough-going modification of the "personality" of musical subjects in nineteenth-century compositions by Berlioz, Liszt, Wagner, and Sibelius with the "earlier, more 'technical' methods of modification, as, e.g., the augmentation and diminution of a fugal subject or the ornamentation of a theme" (Willi Apel, "Transformation of Themes," Harvard Dictionary of Music [1972], 859).

³⁰⁹Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 237.

³¹⁰Ibid.

Geographical considerations

Nettl acknowledged other naturalistic suggestions such as topographical or climatic influences on musical style. For example, the "stark desert ecology of the Middle East" has been correlated with "monophonic and ornamented singing," and the long ballads of northern Europe with the natural restrictions of long winter nights.²¹¹ The use of certain types of instruments has been linked to local flora, and music's tempo has been related to a culture's walking environment.²¹² In general, Nettl took the view that "geographic determinism as a fundamental theory of culture . . . continues to be a credible explanation,"²¹³ although it appears more likely that "music is not affected directly by geographical features, but through the central core of culture."²¹⁴

Combination Naturalistic Theories

A socio-naturalistic theory

Ancient Chinese music, although concerned with cosmic harmony, was intent on preserving the unified function of earth and heaven. For the followers of Confucius, music both reflected and contributed to universal harmony.²¹⁵

Responding to a nobleman's query,²¹⁶ Tsehsia, a disciple of Confucius, explained the difference between music that promoted

²¹¹Ibid., 238.

²¹²Ibid.

²¹³Ibid., 239.

²¹⁴Ibid.

²¹⁵See Yutang, The Wisdom of Confucius, 259.

²¹⁶"Baron Wen of Wei asked Tsehsia . . . 'Why is it that I feel sleepy every time I listen to classical music in my official dress, and never feel tired when I listen to the music of (the states of) Cheng and Wei? Why is it that the classical music is like that and this new music is like this?'" (ibid., 262).

universal harmony and music that destroyed it. Regarding the former, he wrote:

In the ancient times . . . the forces of nature were in harmony and the weather was in accord with the four seasons; the people were good in character and the harvests were plentiful; there were no epidemics and no monsters of bad omen appeared. That was the time when everything was right. So then the Sages (or priests) arose and established social discipline in the relationships between parents and children, and kings and their ministers. With the establishment of social discipline, the world was brought into order, and after the world was brought into order, the Sages set the right standards for the six pitch-pipes and the five keys. People then began to sing songs and anthems to the accompaniment of hsuan string instruments and these were called sacred music (literally "virtuous sounds").²¹⁷

A little further on he added: "The Book of Songs says, 'The harmonious sounds are shu and yung and my ancestor listened to them.' Shu means 'pious' and yung means 'peaceful.' If you have piety and peacefulness of character, you can do everything you want with a country."²¹⁸ Thus, for the ancient Chinese, music that was harmonious with nature and society was accompanied by string instruments, with correct pitches and appropriate keys or modes. Typically it exhibited the qualities of piety and peacefulness.

Music incongruent with nature and society was described as lewd, corrupting, soft and effeminate, repetitious and annoying, harsh and haughty.²¹⁹ Ancient records, such as this account of Tsehsia, do not always provide complete explanations and leave many questions unanswered. However, they offer an example of how an ancient, composite, naturalistic/sociological worldview was linked to music style.

A religio-naturalistic outlook

In her study of the influence of Pueblo worldview on its vocal music, Janice Weinman noted that the Pueblo Indians'

²¹⁷Ibid., 263-264.

²¹⁸Ibid., 264.

²¹⁹Ibid.

existential perspective is strongly oriented to nature and the significance of natural forces.²⁰ "Pueblo life is highly dependent on the direct subjugation and cultivation of those natural forces which are necessary for survival."²¹ Weinman also noted that because of the importance of these natural forces they are implored in deified form by the Pueblo. Clearly, this view represents a merging of the naturalistic with the metaphysical outlook,²² just as sociological and naturalistic outlooks merged in the ancient Chinese culture discussed above.

Weinman described the influence of the Pueblo's worldview on their music style:

The Corn Dance represents a ceremonial invocation to the natural force of rain. At the same time it represents a religious personification of that product which the Pueblo hope the rain will provide them. It is not surprising then that the imploring tones of the chant, which are sung by a performer or religious observer, never assume the form of a detached melodic line, but rather sound like the natural wailing of the common man trying to influence the deified form of those forces from whom he seeks to gain unification. As such, the tones therefore do not attempt to thrill the senses of the onlooker nor to entangle his emotions. Instead, they merely serve as part of the natural order, not as a passive image of the orderly system of the universe, but rather as a force that could affect the universe.²³

Highlighting another aspect of Pueblo worldview, Weinman suggested that the awareness of constant conflict between the natural forces is reflected in the rhythmic structures of their chants. She wrote:

The constant recurrence of pairs of slow beats contrasted with faster beats in irregular patterns reflects their perpetually unattainable state of unity, and serves as well to emphasize the

²⁰Janice Weinman, "The Influence of Pueblo Worldview on the Construction of Its Vocal Music," Ethnomusicology 14 (September 1970): 313.

²¹Ibid.

²²Weinman's study could be seen as an example of a Western, naturalistically oriented explanation of an indigenous religious outlook.

²³Ibid.

ever-present state of contradiction which exists between the natural forces.²⁴

The constant repetition of melodic motifs, either in exact or sequential form, accompanied by the resemblance of an ostinato pattern²⁵ beaten out on a drum, was perceived as reflecting the unvarying pattern of life, "regulated and defined, primarily by the natural recurrence of day and night."²⁶ Likewise, the chant structure reflected the unending cyclic pattern of events.

There are no cadences throughout the chant. . . . The melodic line never comes to a point of repose as one would expect, but instead continues unpredictably thereby creating a greater sense of circularity. Moreover, the chant fades away at the end rather than coming to a decisive halt, thereby also mitigating against any sense of finality.²⁷

Weinman's analysis indicated that naturalistic, metaphysical, and social realities all played their part in the formation of Pueblo musical style.

Evaluation of Naturalistic Theories

It is apparent that some naturalistic theories intermingle humanistic/sociological and metaphysical elements with the naturalistic perspective. Nevertheless, the argument that perceptions of the world influence musical expression is impressive. The work of Oppen and Glickman, as well as the recurrent appeal to naturalistic explanations of musical style in different cultures, seem to indicate that this connection merits further study.

Perhaps Oppen's unequivocal statement "that civilizations

²⁴Ibid., 314.

²⁵An ostinato pattern is a "clearly defined phrase that is repeated persistently, usually in immediate succession throughout a composition or a section" (Willi Apel, "Ostinato," Harvard Dictionary of Music [1972], 634).

²⁶Ibid.

²⁷Ibid.

are what they are by virtue of their view of nature"²⁸ carries the seed of an important issue to be decided by theorists in this category. Does the correlation of a civilization's concept of nature and developments in artistic style necessarily imply a causal relationship between simple facts about nature and stylistic features? Or, does it indicate an underlying metaphysical conception of nature as prime reality? In other words, is music style merely a reflection of random natural observations and environmental factors, or is a perception of nature (which in turn controls what is observed) the driving, ultimate concern?

It would appear that in most cases, except where geographical phenomena are suggested, it is one's view of nature that drives the development of stylistic features in musical expression. Inevitably this assumes metaphysical considerations. Weinman acknowledged that there was a religious aspect to the Pueblo view of how nature influences their vocal music style. Even in Western culture the mechanistic view of the universe that developed in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries had a concomitant metaphysical aspect in the form of deism.²⁹ Musical style in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was undoubtedly influenced by an evolutionary view of nature.³⁰ The acknowledgement of such

²⁸Opper, "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900," 301.

²⁹Deism sees in nature the immutable impress of a supreme being who is the author of nature, but at the same time an absentee landlord who has left the universe to itself "without intervening further in the course of nature or of human life" (J. P. Reid, "Deism," Encyclopedic Dictionary of Religion [1979], 1:1014).

³⁰See Warren Dwight Allen, Philosophies of Music History: A Study of General Histories of Music, 1600-1960 (New York: Dover Publications, 1962), 152, 228-231, 261-262.

metaphysical aspects would seem to provide a significant contribution to the perspective.²¹

Philosophical/Religious Theories

In most cultures philosophical/religious realities have long been utilized to understand artistic expression. While Western culture has largely veered away from religio-transcendent explanations of human life, such conceptions still hold credence in other cultures.

In this category of theories, ultimate reality is usually seen as being beyond the natural world and the realms of psychology and sociology. The ultimate concern nurturing the stylistic ideals exemplified in artistic expression is perceived to transcend nature and human experience. The metaphysical implications of such realities are less easily hidden. Before exploring the religiously oriented transcendent theories that form the predominant group in this category, a unique Western philosophical conception should be acknowledged.

A Philosophical Theory: The Geistesgeschichte Approach

The Geistesgeschichte approach to art music history fostered in the early twentieth century comes closest among recent Western theories to recognizing metaphysical concerns in the study of musical style. It combined the insights of several non-metaphysical theories under the auspices of a philosophical construct called the Zeitgeist (spirit of the time) that was treated as a metaphysical reality. This influential approach was exemplified in the work of Curt Sachs and synthesized in the historical survey articles of Western musical development in Friedrich Blume's monumental, Die

²¹This is addressed later in this chapter under the heading "Western Musicological Scholarship and Religio-philosophical Explanations of Stylistic Development."

Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart.³²

Perhaps this theory would be more correctly classified as humanistic because its ultimate concern has at times been identified as the "human spirit."³³ However, as Omdal indicated, metaphysical considerations play a major role in this theory.³⁴ The Zeitgeist, which is seen as the causal force in artistic style development, is composed of a complex of influences including "intellectual and spiritual currents--scientific, artistic, religious, political, social"³⁵--that function together so the whole is greater than the sum of the parts. Although religio-transcendent considerations may be a part of the total Zeitgeist, they are not seen as a distinguished or even a major factor.³⁶ Religion itself could be conceived as a manifestation of the Zeitgeist.³⁷ The terms "spirit" or "spiritual" do not carry overtly religious connotations but designate an elusive, amorphous, humanistically derived entity.

³²These articles can be found under the headings, "Renaissance," "Barock," "Klassik," and "Romantik" in Friedrich Blume, ed., Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart: Allgemeine Enzyklopädie der Musik (Kassel: Im Bärenreiter-Verlag, 1949-1951), hereafter referred to as MGG. They have also been partially reproduced in monographic form in English translation in Friedrich Blume, Renaissance and Baroque Music: A Comprehensive Survey, trans. M. D. Herter Norton (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1967).

³³See Blume's indication of this in the preface to Blume, Renaissance and Baroque Music, viii.

³⁴Omdal, "Tidsånden og Musikkhistorisk Periodisering," 88. He cited its ultimate indefinability and its function as a final cause in the theory as evidence.

³⁵These are indicated, for example, as part of the complex of renaissance influences in Blume, Renaissance and Baroque Music, 3.

³⁶H. W. Eppelsheimer, "Das Renaissanceproblem," Deutsche Vierteljahrsschrift für Literaturwissenschaft und Geistesgeschichte, (1933): 497.

³⁷See Blume, "Barock," in MGG, 1285. Blume submitted that the same spiritual disposition that spawned Baroque music also gave rise to the Counter-Reformation and Jesuitism of the second half of the sixteenth century.

Blume gave his clearest definition of an epochal spirit when he wrote:

"The spirit of the age" is here understood not only in the sense of a factor in itself inexplicable, operating to impel the people of a given time and area to think, feel and express themselves in common form, but also in the sense of a definite manner in which those people look upon themselves and place themselves in relation to the physical and metaphysical worlds.²³⁸

Understandably the relative imprecision of this definition of a foundational concept in the Geistesgeschichte approach/theory has been criticized.²³⁹ It is, nevertheless, presented as part of an attempt to understand music's development in a broad, rather than purely musical, context.²⁴⁰

In The Commonwealth of Art, Sachs indicated that artistic style is essentially the gestalt of the Zeitgeist. He wrote:

[Style] is the configuration of spiritual qualities that a certain man or age or country has created as the effigy of a certain will and emotion; and the easy characteristics that the handbooks teach are nothing but their outer marks.²⁴¹

To illustrate such a "configuration of spiritual qualities" in Renaissance musical style, Blume first cited societal stirrings that contributed to the configuration of that time, including the increased use and sponsorship of music for different settings among "nations, religious denominations, social classes, public and private institutions."²⁴² This broadened the tasks of both composers and performers. The discovery of printing, the development of instruments, the nurture of professional musicians and music schools, and the increased potential for travel all

²³⁸Blume, Renaissance and Baroque Music, 96. For the original German see Blume, "Barock," in MGG, 1286.

²³⁹Omdal, "Tidsånden og Musikkhistorisk Periodisering," 87-88.

²⁴⁰See Blume, preface to Renaissance and Baroque Music, viii-ix.

²⁴¹Sachs, The Commonwealth of Art, 20.

²⁴²*Ibid.*, 70.

combined to form a "European [rather than parochial] image of noble art music."²⁴⁰ Additionally, a "transition from successive to simultaneous composition"²⁴⁴ occurred as composers began to see their art works as a unity which they could personally shape, rather than employing elements drawn from inherited patterns. Thus, the "breakthrough of an individual artistic intent in music"²⁴⁵ was facilitated.

The infusion of individual freedom increased the exploitation of melodic, harmonic, rhythmic, and sonorous possibilities. The prescribed dimensions of traditional melodies and strophic schemes were replaced by conceptions deriving from the sonorities themselves. Blume suggested that Western civilization "owes to the Renaissance a music in which each voice unrestrictedly, in equal freedom, value, authority, can weave at the whole fabric and each voice is an individuality intimately interwoven in the whole."²⁴⁶ Released from the tyranny of prescribed texts and Latin, a new relationship was forged between word and tone. Choosing their own texts, with a free hand composers set them to music. With the advent of printing, a simplified mensural notation replaced the older, more complicated forms of written music. Thus, this theory contends that the social, intellectual, and spiritual currents in the fifteenth- and sixteenth-century Zeitgeist, spawned new stylistic ideals that were instrumental in forging what we now recognize as a stylistic period.²⁴⁷

²⁴⁰Ibid., 72.

²⁴⁴Ibid., 73.

²⁴⁵Ibid.

²⁴⁶Ibid., 75.

²⁴⁷See also Blume's summary of Renaissance music in *ibid.*, 79-80. Similar kinds of relationship between Zeitgeist and musical style have been noted for other historical periods. For example, Blume's detailed explanation of the difference between Renaissance

Religious Theories

The principal theories in the philosophical/religious category perceive the ultimate concern that nurtures style as located in a culture's basic ideology--"those deepest convictions of a culture and people"²⁴⁸ in which religion plays a major part.

A forceful exposition of this view is found in Eric Gill's essay "Art and Reality." Gill submitted that "Whatever men do or make, their philosophy and religion are at the back of it."²⁴⁹ Furthermore, he contended "it is to this or that philosophy and religion that such works owe their very existence, their very being."²⁵⁰ Tillich expressed it this way:

Religion as ultimate concern is the meaning-giving substance of culture, and culture is the totality of forms in which the basic

and Baroque artistic styles epitomizes the Geistesgeschichte approach and provides valuable insight into what is meant by the spirit of the time and how it translates into stylistic features (ibid., 90-91).

²⁴⁸Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 170. Her contextual explanation is as follows: "Characteristics of structure, along with explicit and literally symbolic elements, can all be shown to be determined by and expressive of the basic ideology of a culture. Not only the subject matter, the iconography, of the artwork is determined by those deepest convictions of a culture and people; equally affected are the style and form, that is, the implicit symbolism. The very interrelatedness of content and structure makes them difficult and even impossible at times to separate in a work of art" (ibid., 170).

²⁴⁹Gill, "Art and Reality," xiv. Confirmation of this view can be drawn from a number of other Western music scholars. For example, Ferguson, in his dialogues The Why of Music, protested that various historic music styles are often only described in terms of their features "as if style were no more than a manner of manipulating tones." He continued: "But it seems to me that each one of those styles really implied a whole background of convention, not merely in manner but in belief; and I don't feel that I've projected the music unless I've projected the belief as well as the manner" (Ferguson, The Why of Music, 246-247). Lewis Rowell wrote: "The music product (because it embodies important culture values) constitutes a philosophical statement and can be read as such" (Lewis Rowell, Thinking about Music: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Music [Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1983], 7).

²⁵⁰Gill, "Art and Reality," xiv.

concern of religion expresses itself. In abbreviation: religion is the substance of culture, culture is the form of religion.³¹

The view that religion and philosophy ultimately nurture artistic style has been strongly endorsed by writers from Hindu, Muslim, African, and Japanese cultures.³² Changes in style have also been linked with ideological change. Again Gill wrote:

As religion and philosophy lose their hold on men's minds, so the works done under their inspiration become decadent--fanciful, vulgar, pretty, elegant, extravagant, grandiose--until a new religion and a new philosophy enthrall us and a new enthusiasm inspires new works.³³

As noted earlier, in Music, the Arts, and Ideas, Meyer recognized a connection between cultural ideologies and change in artistic styles.³⁴ Van der Leeuw went so far as to credit all "the great

³¹Paul Tillich, Theology of Culture, ed. Robert C. Kimball (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), 42.

³²Affirming Gill's forthright essay, Hindu scholar, Mulk Raj Anand wrote: "Though disagreeing with several incidental opinions, I still share with him the basic conviction that, as is the philosophy of a people, or their way of life, so will be their art, and that if we are to understand the great creative periods of the past, we must look at them not only in terms of the food surpluses which were available or not available, but also in terms of the ideas generated by the way of life which is the outcome of a subtler dialectic than that yet comprehended by contemporary sociologists" (Mulk Raj Anand, preface to The Hindu View of Art, 2d ed. [Bombay: Asia Publishing House, 1957], vii). From the Islamic context, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī wrote: "It is only through an Islamic transcendence theory of aesthetic meaning that we can explain the nature of Islamic art in general, and the rejection of figural representation in particular" (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 168). From the African context, Fela Sowande affirmed: "The organization of the raw material of sound into formal and structural patterns . . . relate directly and in a most intimate manner to the World View and the life experiences of that society viewed as a homogeneous whole, and are accepted as such by that society" (Fela Sowande, The Role of Music in African Society [Washington, D.C.: African Studies and Research Program, Howard University, 1969], 18). Tamba, writing about Japanese music, described what he called the "confluence of the aesthetic and spiritual aims in the Noh" (Tamba, "Confluence of Spiritual and Aesthetic Research in Traditional Japanese Music," 41).

³³Gill, "Art and Reality," xviii.

³⁴Meyer, Music, the Arts, and Ideas, 131.

changes in style" to "a change in the religious consciousness of life."²³⁵

This view is not surprising if, as Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel maintained,

fine art . . . only achieves its highest task when it has taken its place in the same sphere with religion and philosophy, and has become simply a mode of revealing to consciousness and bringing to utterance the Divine Nature, the deepest interests of humanity, and the most comprehensive truths of the mind. It is in works of art that nations have deposited the profoundest intuitions and ideas of their hearts; and fine art is frequently the key--with many nations there is no other--to the understanding of their wisdom and of their religion.²³⁶

The Hindu context

Illustrations of the influence of overtly religious ideology on musical style are not difficult to find. Scholars of Indian

²³⁵The complete quotation is as follows: "The great changes in style, from Romanesque to Gothic, from the Greek of the fifth century to that of the fourth, all have a change in the religious consciousness of life as their precondition" (van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 274). Similarly, Wilhelm Wundt wrote: "Among the ideas whose changing fortune determine these transformations [in style], the religious ones again stand first in line. . . . Every significant change in religious life and perception repeatedly marks a turning point in the development of forms of style." ("Unter den Ideen, deren wechselnde Schicksale diese Transformationen bestimmen, stehen wieder die religiösen in erster Linie. . . . So bezeichnet jede bedeutsame Veränderung in dem religiösen Leben und Fühlen abermals einen Wendepunkt in der Entwicklung der Stilformen" (Wilhelm Wundt, Völkerpsychologie: Eine Untersuchung der Entwicklungsgesetze von Sprache, Mythos und Sitte, Book 3 [Leipzig: Alfred Kröner Verlag, 1923], 323). As already noted in chapter 1 of this study, Scranton also asserted the "causative" influence of truth and reality concepts on the formation of artistic style (Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 367).

²³⁶Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, The Introduction to Hegel's Philosophy of Fine Art, trans. with notes and prefatory essay by Bernard Bosanquet (London: Kegan Paul, Trench and Company, 1886), 12-13. Hegel saw music as peculiarly fitting for the expression of religious truths in that it is "completely withdrawn into the ideality of soul-life, both in its aspect of conscious life and in that of its external expression" (Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, "Vorlesungen über die Ästhetik," in Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader, vol. 2, "The Nineteenth Century," ed. Edward A. Lippman [Stuyvesant, N.Y.: Pendragon Press, 1986], 87). See also Hegel, The Introduction to Hegel's Philosophy of Fine Art, 52-53.

Hindu music accept that "religion and art are indivisible"²⁵⁷ in that culture. Art is seen "as an apparatus of worship to achieve identical consciousness in the worshipper and the deity."²⁵⁸ The music itself, the sound (nāda), not merely the text, is conceived as "the best and purest means for attaining the God realization."²⁵⁹

As an example of how this has affected music style, Edward O. Henry noted in his study of a northern Indian musical culture that for ideological reasons, songs (both words and music) are frequently repetitious. He indicated that belief in the meritorious reiteration of the god's name has engendered a repetitive form of music.²⁶⁰ Further, extreme repetitiousness, as found in women's group songs, "undoubtedly has significant psychological effects, and invites comparison with japa-yoga, the repeated chanting of a word or phrase in order to approach union with the divine."²⁶¹ Henry also noted that the changed state of consciousness brought about by repetitious chanting or singing is valued because it is considered a "means of attaining salvation,"²⁶² in the sense that it has the very

²⁵⁷Narayana Menon, "Interdisciplinary Research: Its Contribution to the Understanding of the Music Cultures of Our Time," in Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974 (Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976), 68. Similarly O. C. Gangoly wrote: "In all Indian art there is a recognition of the fact that art is primarily prophecy--that it is a translation into natural form of the inspiration man receives from God" (O. C. Gangoly, Indian Art and Heritage, ed. and comp. A. Goswami [Calcutta: Oxford Book and Stationery Company, 1957], 10).

²⁵⁸Menon, "Interdisciplinary Research," 68.

²⁵⁹Swāmi Prajñānānanda, A Historical Study of Indian Music (Calcutta: Anandadhara, Prakashan, 1965), 419.

²⁶⁰Henry, Chant the Names of God, 9, 110.

²⁶¹Ibid., 106. See also a similar comment about men's devotional group song in *ibid.*, 139.

²⁶²Ibid., 143.

real effect of "turning the mind away from phenomenal experience"²⁶³ and its attendant suffering,²⁶⁴ especially for the underprivileged.

Repeatedly rāgas have been identified as a means by which one can reach God.²⁶⁵ Their careful maintenance and performance have long been considered essential to avoid cosmic calamity.²⁶⁶ The emphasis, not on harmonies but on cultivated reproductions of specific melodies (in improvised forms), reflects the "unity in diversity" principle rudimentary to Hindu understanding of the divine.²⁶⁷ The use of the drone--that primal or fundamental note that acts as a "center of unification" in relation to which all other notes are projected--is also "recognized as a synthetic force-center that brings unity in diversity."²⁶⁸

Because Hindu music tends to portray the same aspects and ideas as other Hindu art forms,²⁶⁹ Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's analysis of Hindu visual art²⁷⁰ has its echo in musical expression. The implicit expression of maya, evident in the depiction of seething

²⁶³Ibid., 183.

²⁶⁴Ibid., 185.

²⁶⁵Shankar, My Music, My Life, 17.

²⁶⁶Donna Marie Wulff, "On Practicing Religiously: Music as Sacred in India," in Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies, vol. 50 (Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983), 159.

²⁶⁷See Ananda K. Coomaraswamy, "The Philosophy of Ancient Asiatic Art," in The Hindu View of Art, by Mulk Raj Anand (Bombay: Asia Publishing House, 1957), 102.

²⁶⁸Swāmi Prajñānānanda, Historical Development of Indian Music (Calcutta: Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyay, 1960), 394.

²⁶⁹Menon noted: "Music, painting, sculpture all strive towards the same thing. Hence, the recreation of the same ideas in different idioms and the transliteration of one idiom into another" (Menon, "Interdisciplinary Research," 68).

²⁷⁰See Al Fārūqī, "God in Visual and Aesthetic Expression," 237-248.

movement and life in the visual art forms, is paralleled in Coomaraswamy's description of art (including music) as having no central, punctiliar focus, "no emphasis, no dramatic crisis, apparently no structure, though we are ready to admit that the space has been wonderfully utilized, and so call the work decorative."²⁷¹ Lengthy, repetitious musical renditions likewise mirror the relentless flow of life.

The stylization of artistic expression in Hindu culture--where realistic portrayal of nature is deliberately avoided--ensures the propagation of conventions that are perceived to encapsulate eternal realities. The rāgas provide musical examples of such "conventions" that have been discovered and purveyed by highly respected teachers or gurus.²⁷²

The lack of concern for realism is also evident in the lack of concern for external attractiveness in the rendition of Indian music. Rabindranath Tagore, cited and elaborated on by Coomaraswamy, described the phenomenon thus:

'Our master singers . . . never take the least trouble to make their voice and manner attractive. . . . Those of the audience . . . whose senses have to be satisfied as well are held to be beneath the notice of any self-respecting artist,' while 'those of the audience who are appreciative are content to perfect the song in their own mind by the force of their own feeling.' In other words, while the formal beauty is the essential in art,

²⁷¹Coomaraswamy, "The Philosophy of Ancient Asiatic Art," 103. In this context, see also Routley's comment that it has long been recognized that "[Indian] music is associated with religious exaltation and that this music consists of a steady, monotonous pulsation sustained by percussion instruments and a wayward ecstatic melody sung or played above it. There is no internal connection between the melody and the pulsation, such as there is in modern music of the West; the effect indeed is not of melody shaped and disciplined by rhythm, but of a melody (containing its own rhythm) doing furious battle with the pulsation of the drums like a bird dashing itself against a window-pane. Scholars have already pointed out that this tension is symbolic of the tension in oriental religion between the One and the Many, the static and the wayward, the timeless Negative and the temporal vitality" (Routley, The Church and Music, 14).

²⁷²See Gangoly's description of the role of such gifted persons in Indian Art and Heritage, 17.

loveliness and convenience are, not indeed fortuitous, but in the proper sense of the word, accidents of art, happy or unhappy accidents as the case may be.²⁷³

The Buddhist context

The companion culture of Buddhism exhibits the same tendency for music to reflect its ideology. The emphasis on "the blessedness and serenity of the individual who has experienced the supreme enlightenment and who has been transported from his human condition"²⁷⁴ in Buddhist belief is paralleled by the objective of Buddhist music. Trần Van Khê wrote:

The objective of Buddhist music, which is essentially vocal, is not to entertain. It invites listeners to meditate and contemplate and induces a peace of mind in the bonzes who chant as well as in the congregation listening to them.²⁷⁵

Additionally, Khê observed that besides being essentially vocal, Eastern Asian Buddhist liturgical music employs low- rather than high-pitched voices, a relatively limited range (no more than an octave in recitation, though somewhat larger in chanting), and free, non-measured rhythm.²⁷⁶ Whatever is musically, sensually attractive is shunned, particularly among those in the monastic regimen.²⁷⁷ Religious music among the laity is permitted, however, as John Ross Carter observed:

[It] is considered [for example, among Buddhists in Sri Lanka] at

²⁷³Coomaraswamy, The Transformation of Nature in Art, 28. For similar observations, see also Gangoly, Indian Art and Heritage, 12; and Henry, Chant the Names of God, 142.

²⁷⁴Eliade, Symbolism, the Sacred and the Arts, 61-63.

²⁷⁵Trần Van Khê, "Buddhist Music in Eastern Asia," The World of Music 26, (1984): 30.

²⁷⁶Summarized from *ibid.*, 24-28.

²⁷⁷In some Theravada Buddhist monasteries, for example, music may be eliminated altogether because it is deemed distracting to meditation. See John Ross Carter, "Music in the Theravāda Buddhist Heritage: In Chant, in Song, in Sri Lanka," in Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, *Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies*, vol. 50 (Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983), 137-139.

its best when it tends to efface itself in the presence of the message. In this way, religious music becomes fully consonant with the religious activity of renouncing the cosmic centrality of the self.²⁷⁸

This is further confirmed in discussions of Korean and Japanese Buddhist music.²⁷⁹

Oriental religious influence in contemporary Western music

In a fascinating study of contemporary Western music styles, Huntley Beyer and Rebecca Parker Beyer provided insight as to how music communicates theological enquiry by its composers. The first type of music discussed is termed "pan-historical" music. Composers of this music eclectically quote from or imitate all periods of music history²⁸⁰ contrasting the past and present in a dynamic continuum. Time boundaries are broken down and everything is "enfolded into the present moment," thus creating "a kind of musical fusion."²⁸¹ For example, the third movement of Luciano Berio's Sinfonia is described as projecting "a dreamlike stream of consciousness."²⁸²

Pan-historical composer George Rochberg offered an insight into the perception of reality that undergirds his compositional process when he wrote:

Each of us is part of a vast physical-mental-spiritual web of previous lives, existences, modes of thought, behavior, and perception. . . . We are filaments of a universal mind; we dream

²⁷⁸Ibid., 141.

²⁷⁹See Hahn, "Religious Origins of Korean Music," 17-22; and Tamba, "Confluence of Spiritual and Aesthetic Research in Traditional Japanese Music," 30-43.

²⁸⁰Huntley Beyer and Rebecca Parker Beyer, "Music Informing Spirit: A Commentary on the Theological Implications of Contemporary Music," Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies 49 (1983): 8.

²⁸¹Ibid.

²⁸²Ibid.

each others' dreams and those of our ancestors. Time, thus, is not linear, but radial.³⁰

Clearly, Rochberg's ideas are reminiscent of Eastern metaphysics, and as such they provide an example of a trend among some Western composers who have found inspiration for their music in Eastern religions or their derivatives during the latter half of the twentieth century.

The second type of contemporary Western art music the Beyers discussed was indeterminate or aleatoric music. They found that the compositional and performance techniques of this music "serve to negate all traditional harmonic, melodic, rhythmic and structural relationships between sounds, liberating each sound to be heard in its independent uniqueness."³⁴ John Cage, one of the chief exponents of this style, avowed an intentional connection to Zen Buddhism³⁵ in which it is believed that "each immediate moment is radically self-determining, open to a wide range of influencing data, non-determined by habits, and spontaneous in being."³⁶ Thus, "indeterminate music embodies the character of maximized freedom"³⁷ and provides "within Western tradition Eastern ways of feeling and presents to the Western listener an alternative feeling structure."³⁸

The third style discussed by the Beyers was labeled "minimalism." Exploiting the contrast derived from "massive

³⁰George Rochberg, String Quartet, No. 3, Nonesuch Records, H-71283, jacket notes by George Rochberg, 1973; quoted in Beyer and Beyer, "Music Informing Spirit," 8.

³⁴Beyer and Beyer, "Music Informing Spirit," 11.

³⁵Ibid., 12-13.

³⁶Ibid., 12.

³⁷Ibid.

³⁸Ibid., 13.

repetition and incremental change,"²⁹⁹ minimalist music is characterized by the repetition of melodic-rhythmic patterns.³⁰⁰ Again, the Beyers recognized the influence of non-Western sources, particularly Indian rhythmic structures and the rāgas, as well as the geometric repetitions of Islamic art.³⁰¹ Minimalism emphasizes physicality over mentality³⁰² and in this it shares the Buddhist perspective.

The Beyers concluded their discussion with two suggestions. First, the Christian West would do well to use the opportunity this contemporary music provided to broaden its thinking to include some of these non-Western perspectives; and second, the real significance and value of such study is the recognition that "the music gives us forms of feeling in which these insights are embodied."³⁰³ In other words, they affirmed that musical style is a sensual incarnation of metaphysical beliefs.

The Beyers' belief that music can provide non-Western perspectives on life is significant, even if their notion that the Christian West should broaden its thinking to include such perspectives is debatable. If, musical style is a sensual

²⁹⁹Ibid.

³⁰⁰They described the style thus: "The patterns are usually short, simple and tonal, involving a minimal amount of musical material. The music changes as one repeating pattern shifts to another. The new pattern is often similar in design to the previous one. The music gains intricacy as patterns are superimposed on each other, creating a polyphonic web of pulsating, interlocking sound" (ibid).

³⁰¹Ibid. This is corroborated in Bryan R. Simms, Music of the Twentieth Century: Style and Structure (New York: Schirmer Books, 1986), 424.

³⁰²Mentality is merely the "spark that energizes the entire massive realm of physical interconnectedness" (Beyer and Beyer, "Music Informing Spirit," 15). This is in contrast to the view that mentality is a source of radical transformation (as in Christianity) or a source for radical transcendence (as in Vedantic Hinduism). Ibid.

³⁰³Ibid., 16.

incarnation of metaphysical belief, then recognition of this is essential in the study of music style.

Some general considerations

The discussion thus far has dealt with the impact of ideologies on the micro-level of music structure. However, the influence of religious belief on the arts is also evident on other levels. As Walter Kaufmann observed, even rudimentary decisions such as which arts will be fostered and, by corollary, which ones discouraged, may be religiously conditioned. For example, Judaism, which religiously prohibited image making, channeled its people's artistic impulses into literature and music, rather than sculpture and painting.³⁴

Regarding music performance practice, Alfred Sendrey pointed out that instruments used by neighboring ancient cultures, although of common stock, would often be altered to suit a particular culture's ideologically derived preferences and expectations. He stated:

A people who took over an instrument from another people would experiment with and attempt more or less essential changes. Even if the basic form was left in tact, something would be added here or taken away there, so that ultimately a different treatment of the instrument became necessary. The change in technique possibly transformed the character of its sound. This should be borne in mind if, as ancient records testify, we sometimes come across instruments having the same name, but serving entirely opposite purposes and being used at completely different occasions.³⁵

After describing how the pipe (oboe) was played strongly or softly for festivals or funerals in different cultures, Sendrey noted that

³⁴Walter Arnold Kaufmann, Religions in Four Dimensions: Existential and Aesthetic, Historical and Comparative (New York: Readers Digest Press, 1976), 359.

³⁵Alfred Sendrey, Music in the Social and Religious Life of Antiquity (Rutherford: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1974), 74-75. He suggested that the musical cultures of Phoenicia and Israel provide an example of ideologically engendered difference in music practice (ibid., 68).

when a modified instrument was taken back into its area of origin it was frequently renamed, hence the multitude of terms applied to the same instruments.³⁶ Interestingly, Spengler conjectured that it would be revealing to write a history of musical instruments: "Not (as it always is) from the technical standpoint of tone production, but as a study of the deep spiritual bases of the tone colours and tone effects aimed at."³⁷

Evaluation of Religio-philosophical Theories

Theories in this category tend to acknowledge the metaphysical nature of their ultimate concern and overtly describe features of music style connected with corresponding metaphysical realities. What is often a hidden agenda in other theories is here prominent from the outset. This is one of its strengths.

This does not obviate the difficulties of correlating metaphysics and musical style. Because philosophical/religious beliefs provide their own validation for stylistic features, empirical proof of correlation is emphasized less than spiritual congruence. Conceptual beliefs are viewed as embodying stylistic ideals, and the style of music expression is considered a sensual, phonic incarnation of belief.

If there is a weakness in religious theories, it is the lack of integration of compatible findings³⁸ from humanistic and naturalistic research that would produce a more wholistic picture.

³⁶Ibid., 75.

³⁷Spengler, The Decline of the West, 1:62.

³⁸The term "compatible findings" is not meant in the sense of overt, prejudiced selection. Rather it is an attempt to recognize that not all information gathered under the auspices of another worldview is necessarily significant, or even valid in a new setting. However, this should not restrict the exploration of all options.

Western Musicological Scholarship and Religio-philosophical
Explanations of Stylistic Development

The West's proclivity to humanistic and naturalistic explanations of a culture's musical style, to the neglect or minimization of religio-philosophical interpretations, deserves further comment. Recognition of this fact is not new. Criticism of the Geistesgeschichte movement's use of metaphysics in the analysis of musical style has been noted in chapter 1. The overt devaluation of religious and philosophical concepts in understanding the nature of art is readily discerned in musicological literature.²⁹⁹ Even if metaphysical considerations are not openly devalued, they are often avoided.

Writing as an ethnomusicologist, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī noted in 1975 that:

Despite the apparent agreement that religio-philosophical ideas have a determining influence on the arts as well as on other features of culture, little has been done by ethnomusicologists to bring into focus the relationships between religions and music.³⁰⁰

Wulff reiterated the same basic criticism in 1983 in her paper on Indian music when she wrote:

When one studies any Indian cultural form in depth, one comes to realize that the religious and the secular are not discrete realms in India, as they tend to be conceived in the modern West. The arena of music is no exception. Yet it was years before I discerned the roots of such a reverence for music, which lie deep in the Hindu past, and realized that although the study of Indian music shorn of such attitudes may yield insight of a theoretical sort, it is not an adequate mode of studying what an Indian understands by music. Unfortunately, Western scholarly categories have here as elsewhere been far too narrow, with the result that most works on Indian religions hardly make mention of music, whereas works on Indian music have by and large treated only the technical aspects of the subject and ignored its religious contexts and significance.³⁰¹

It is interesting that Shelemay's 1986 critical review of the book

²⁹⁹See Read, Art and Society, 2, 55; and Smith, Music and Reason, 75, 76.

³⁰⁰Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Muwashshah," 1.

³⁰¹Wulff, "On Practicing Religiously," 149.

of which Wulff's paper forms a part indicated the typical Western inclination Wulff deplored. Of the three issues or themes Shelemay pinpointed as deserving more exploration and focus, two were sociological concerns.³⁰² Thus, a book specifically compiled to explore music as a religious phenomenon, highlighting more metaphysically oriented concerns and relationships between religion and music, was criticized for its lack of humanistic/sociological weight and direction. This seems to be typical of the temper and emphasis of Western scholarly focus.³⁰³

Nowhere is this bent more evident than in Nettl's masterly summaries of issues and concepts in ethnomusicology. In 1975, having noted the close association of music and religion in all cultures, he wrote:

This strong connection of music with religion draws us to the conclusion that one of the main functions of music for man is communication with the supernatural; indeed, there is, among the many unprovable theories of the origin of music, one that maintains that music was first developed by man for precisely this reason. We will never know how music first came into existence, but we may readily believe that at its beginning it was somehow connected with religion; we can see this tradition carried on in all known cultures, simple and complex, in the world today.³⁰⁴

Again in 1983 he affirmed this in his landmark work, The Study of Ethnomusicology.³⁰⁵ However, when canvassing the discussion of the determinants of musical style,³⁰⁶ Nettl first pointed out the

³⁰²Shelemay, review of Sacred Sound, 177-178.

³⁰³For another example of this emphasis, see John A. Sloboda's discussion of African music, including Islamic music. Inquiring into the cause of differences between various musics, he merely asked: "What factors, cultural or social, can help account for the wide differences between musical cultures in the world?" (John A. Sloboda, The Musical Mind: The Cognitive Psychology of Music [Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985], 242).

³⁰⁴Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 98-99. See also Siegfried Nadel, "The Origins of Music," The Musical Quarterly 16 (1930): 540, 542-543.

³⁰⁵Nettl, The Study of Ethnomusicology, 159, 165.

³⁰⁶*Ibid.*, 235.

complexity of the issue and the general apprehension regarding "final answers" to this enticing question. He noted also that cause and effect determinations are generally evaded in the literature. Then, as he proceeded to enumerate the different possible areas of focus in the exploration of this issue, humanistic and naturalistic concerns dominated the discussion. Religion, as such, despite previous assertions, did not even merit mention as a possible determinant of musical style.

There appears to be a reluctance to explore religio-transcendent considerations,¹⁰⁷ despite recognition of their existence and importance. Even when acknowledged, they are often viewed sociologically--idiosyncratic of a particular culture, culture-specific, or one factor among many. Rarely is religion seen as a factor in its own right. It appears that Western scholarship with its increasing anti-supernaturalist bent has gradually shut itself off from an entire field of exploration in the metaphysical realm, and hence, biased its data collection regarding the determinants of musical style.¹⁰⁸ Perhaps this has been succored by a preoccupation with empiricism and assessment. Undoubtedly, humanistic and naturalistic factors lend themselves more readily to measurement¹⁰⁹ than do those in the metaphysical realm.

¹⁰⁷There may also be a fear of utilizing the "religious intuition" necessary to conduct such exploration either because it is perceived as fraught with dangers, or because religious intuition is a rarity. See Tillich, Systematic Theology, 1:40 and Sachs The Commonwealth of Art, 324.

¹⁰⁸It seems significant that the contemporary study of sociology historically "stems from naturalistic roots (the assumption that the cosmos is all there really is; there is no deity)" (James W. Sire, foreword to The Making of the Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur F. Holmes [Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1985]).

¹⁰⁹This is evident in the frequent use of statistics or other measurement techniques in sociological studies. See, for example, James S. Leming, "Rock Music and the Socialization of Moral Values in Early Adolescence," Youth and Society 18 (June 1987): 363-383.

Nevertheless, among Western scholars there has been repeated recognition that sociological, economic, biological, and environmental factors are inadequate to explain artistic style.¹⁰

For example, Sendrey noted:

The ethnographic, economic, and cultural interrelationships between Phoenicia and Israel might give support to the assumption that the music of both peoples had many affinities. Such conclusions would be logical, were it not for one serious but completely insurmountable obstacle: the gap between religious ethics of the two neighboring peoples.¹¹

Similarly, Alfred L. Kroeber, describing style in the fine arts throughout the history of ancient Egypt, concluded:

In fact, the totality of ancient Egyptian civilization underwent much more change in these two thousand years than did its art. Wheels, iron, new domestic animals were introduced from abroad along with new materials and new inventions, and other inventions were made at home. The consequence was that from 2600 to 600 B.C. the totality of life and culture altered at hundreds of points, while Egyptian art stood almost still. Here was a figurative and symbolic art which, contrary to the rule that styles flow, froze contentedly and repeatedly back to its first culmination, whereas in the actual and practical business of carrying on his life, the Egyptian slowly admitted innumerable innovations. It is evident that when they so wish, people can hold their ideal outlook, their art and religion as the most nearly constant part of their universe.¹²

In the present context Kroeber's joint reference to art and religion in this manner seems highly significant. Also writing about the Egyptians, Scranton further pointed out that:

The Egyptians had the means to complete the inventions of the doric style and adopt it. . . . Why they chose as they did

¹⁰Among scholars of other cultures this is taken for granted. See, for example, Anand's affirmation of a "basic conviction that, as is the philosophy of a people, or their way of life, so will be their art, and that if we are to understand the great creative periods of the past, we must look at them not only in terms of the food surpluses which were available or not available, but also in terms of the ideas generated by the way of life which is the outcome of a subtler dialectic than that yet comprehended by contemporary sociologists" (Anand, preface to The Hindu View of Art, vii).

¹¹Sendrey, Music in the Social and Religious Life of Antiquity, 68.

¹²Alfred L. Kroeber, Style and Civilizations (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1957), 38-39.

depends not on any control of knowledge, technique, function, tradition, but on their sense of what is essentially real.¹¹³

In other words, metaphysical belief was a major reason why ancient Egyptian fine arts style persistently endured, and perhaps, it was also the explanation for its original form.¹¹⁴

A more recent example of this is forcefully presented by Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī. He wrote:

It is idle to dispute the unity of Islamic art. Although the historian will recognize a large variety of motifs, of materials, of styles differentiated geographically or chronologically, the overwhelming fact of all Islamic art is its unity of purpose and form. From Cordova to Mindanao, the arts of these lands once converted to Islām betrayed the same constitutive characteristics.¹¹⁵

Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī wrote similarly, though she added an important explanation for the observation:

An art which spans lands from Spain eastward to the Philippines and a time span of fourteen centuries, undoubtedly includes a great variety of elements. Yet there are constitutive characteristics of this art which make it indisguisably a product of the Islamic soul.¹¹⁶

Clearly, humanistic/sociological factors are inadequate to explain the Islamic art forms, and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī and Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī deplored the fact that Western scholars have never

¹¹³Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 44. See also *ibid.*, 46, 94.

¹¹⁴Even modern ethnomusicological studies recognize that while social organization may be obliterated, superstition and belief remain. In a study of ethnic Caribbean dance and music, Lisa Lekis observed: "The last things renounced by a people, enslaved or free, are their mythology, their religion and the practices associated with the perpetuation of their spiritual and metaphysical beliefs" (Lisa Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music" [Ph.D. dissertation, University of Florida, 1956], 7). This may explain why liturgical music has universally maintained a conscious conservatism, and why musical change in a culture has generally been associated with foreign influences (Sachs, The Rise of Music in the Ancient World East and West, 62).

¹¹⁵Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 81.

¹¹⁶Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art (Islamabad, Pakistan: National Hijra Council, 1985), 12.

penetrated to the heart of what makes Islamic music Islamic-- Islām.¹¹⁷

At times, Western scholars have overtly acknowledged that "religion, in fact, is that aspect of culture which alone can unify the human spirit, either in the individual or as a society of men,"¹¹⁸ and that "the external unity of a civilization can only be the outward expression of the inner unity of its spirit."¹¹⁹ Yet, against the backdrop of the assertions and thought patterns generally favored, such statements appear to create an uneasy tension. If the metaphysical concerns religion represents stand above human, sociological, or other natural factors, performing an organizational function for the way humans and society operate, then to ignore this realm when attempting to determine the influences on musical style is to bypass a major key to understanding.

It has been observed that a culture's "political, social and economic institutions; its arts and even its natural sciences and mathematical contributions are determined by . . . [its] religious and ideational complex."¹²⁰ Further, as Will Herberg noted:

The structure of the human being is such that man cannot live his life or understand himself without some ultimate concern that he takes as the that-beyond-which-there-is-nothing of his world.

¹¹⁷See Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 13; and Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 82. See also Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Misconceptions of the Nature of Islamic Art," Islām and the Modern Age 1 (1970): 29-49.

¹¹⁸John MacMurray, "The Modern Spirit," in Some Makers of the Modern Spirit: A Symposium, ed. John Macmurray (London: Methuen and Company, 1933), 4.

¹¹⁹Ibid.

¹²⁰Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "God in Visual Aesthetic Expression," 235. Oswald Spengler observed a similar relationship between mathematics, natural science, and other branches of learning and religious presuppositions (Spengler, The Decline of the West, 56-62, 380-381).

This is indeed his god and the articulation of his life in terms of it is his religion.¹²¹

The implications for the artist/musician are starkly portrayed in Jon Michael Spencer's assertion that: "Artists need not be conscious of the fact that they are expressing a particular theological reality in order to do so, for they are inescapably a part of a religious tradition."¹²² Seen from this perspective, all music ultimately reflects the focus of our "worship," and is religious in the sense that it is related to our "god/s"--the "that-beyond-which-there-is-nothing" that governs our lives. If this is true, it certainly deserves much wider acknowledgement and investigation.

The Process of Worldview Embodiment in Music Style

Having reviewed examples of theories relating worldview and musical style, it seems appropriate to include some observations of how worldview comes to be embodied in musical expression. In general, it appears that in humanistic- and naturalistic-oriented theories the process entails a somewhat measurable cause/effect connection. With philosophical/religious theories, the connection is more elusive and therefore tends to be more theoretical or hypothetical.

In a Composer's Creative Expression

Several insights emerged in a study by Glen Alan Bauer integrating an understanding of the Western, twentieth-century composer, Arnold Schoenberg as a man, with his music. Bauer found that Schoenberg's outlook on life centered in his own psyche, with a religious element interwoven for authentication.

¹²¹Will Herberg; quoted in Bolam and Henderson, Art and Belief, 137.

¹²²Jon Michael Spencer, conclusion to "The Theology of American Popular Music," The Journal of Black Sacred Music: A Journal of Theomusicology 3 (Fall 1989): 158. This is confirmed in Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 1-3.

Following his first wife's adultery and the public's rejection of his second Quartet, Schoenberg responded by bolstering his self-confidence with the belief that his musical intuitions were special revelations from God.³²³ Adopting the role of a martyr and prophet, he used religion "as the foundation for his belief in the value of his intuitive judgments."³²⁴

Schoenberg considered the compositional process--and hence, the formation of his own unique twelve-tone style--to arise from "the intensity of the original artist's need for expression."³²⁵ This need for expression would generate artistic forms appropriate to that expression, only if the artist created freely, "unimpeded by his intellect and conscious manipulation or calculation."³²⁶ Thus, he believed he must allow the subjective unconscious free reign,³²⁷ creating out of the inner self as God did, spontaneously, and eliminating the conscious will.³²⁸ Compositional decisions were to be made according to feeling.³²⁹

For Schoenberg, ultimate reality resided in the depths of the unconscious which, because its impulses were the result of divine inspiration, was to be allowed free expression. Convicted of the infallibility of his own fantasy and inspiration,³³⁰ it is no surprise that he often maintained musical ideas as they first came

³²³Bauer, "A Contextual Approach to Schoenberg's Atonal Works," 53.

³²⁴Ibid., 54.

³²⁵Ibid., 93.

³²⁶Ibid.

³²⁷Ibid., 84, 88.

³²⁸Ibid., 115.

³²⁹Ibid., 195.

³³⁰Ibid., 197.

to him,³¹ and eventually worked out a music theory rationalizing his style.

The process, implicit in Schoenberg's experience, that allows the unimpeded expression of impulses already present in the subconscious, is analogous to a number of humanistic theories. Whether it is the individual's intuitions, psychological orientation, personality factors, pulse formation, human experience, or even societal structures and collective patterns of interaction--these factors are seen as unconsciously predisposing composers, performers, and listeners to the use and expectation of certain characteristic features that contribute to the formation of a unique style.

In the Context of a Community

Another insight regarding the process of worldview embodiment in music style is suggested in the personal testimony of W. Komla Amoaku. As part of his discussion of the music of the Ewe he wrote:

I can define traditional African music only from within the Ewe world view. For me, it is the involuntary alteration that occurs in my psyche, the spiritual upliftment, my transcendental imaginations of a spirit world, my oneness with the gods and spirits of departed relatives, and that temporary transformation of my physical body into spirit. Whenever I participate in this music, whether physically or silently, I look for the properties that make the activity spiritually satisfying and fulfilling--properties that link me with the invisible world and constantly remind me of a world beyond, in which I believe without asserting it to myself.

To me, traditional African music is the phonic expression of psychic experiences generated within the spiritual framework of traditional institutions which, in turn, constitute the basis of society. These psychic experiences belong to and are revered by all members of the society, a homogeneous unit with common ancestry and a shared worldview.³²

Embodiment of a worldview in music style is sparked by a search,

³¹Ibid., 166.

³²Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 37.

conscious or unconscious, for "fittingness" between a form of experience, action, image or statement and a corresponding musical form. The refinement of that "fittingness" stimulates formation of a traditional style that is "perpetuated without difficulty, in a quasi-organic manner, by the power of the spirit that animates it."¹³³ This quest for appropriateness may be relevant as part of the explanation of process, not only for philosophical/religious theories, but also for some sociological and naturalistic ones.

Under the Influence of a Religious Organization

One final observation particularly relevant for philosophical/religious-theory explanations of process was made by Eric Gill in his essay "Christianity and Art." Describing the Roman Catholic church as purveyor of the Christian religion during the Middle Ages, Gill noted:

The church is not responsible for medieval architecture or any other medieval art. She was responsible for maintaining the ideas and the attitude of mind in which alone any great art is possible.¹³⁴

Employing the Roman church as a type of all who have lived and worked under a belief in absolute values, Gill continued:

Although the church has not formulated any aesthetic doctrine, a certain relation of art to life may be implicit in her teaching and explicit in her effects. She has not said art is such a thing, life is such a thing, and such is the relation between them. She defines the nature of man and as far as may be possible, the nature of God, and she defines the relationship of man to God. In these definitions the nature of the work of the artist and its relation to life are implicit.¹³⁵

Thus, a religious (or possibly a political) organization inculcates an ideology, a set of values, and perhaps creates a ritual action such as a liturgy or an attitude to a way of life as part of its

¹³³Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 8.

¹³⁴Gill, "Christianity and Art," 223.

¹³⁵Ibid., 245.

philosophy. Although nothing specific may be said or written about the arts, there is a natural stimulus, unless quashed, to discover the implicit, fitting isofunctional/isoformal³³⁶ artistic expression of that ideology, its values, and attitude to life. Possibly that stimulus is not merely altruistic, especially if the ideology has a pervasive influence in a society, for the organization transmitting the values may then also foster those art forms in harmony with its philosophy by employing them and encouraging their patronage.³³⁷

Summary Observations

There is abundant evidence that worldview affects the understanding of music style determinants. The specific influence of humanistic, naturalistic, and philosophical/religious realities on music style development has been explored in the gamut of music structure, content, and performance practice. Descriptions of this influence range from relatively detailed delineations (e.g., Clynes and Lomax) to broader, more general profiles (e.g., Sachs, Danckert, and the philosophical/religious theorists). Interestingly, the more precisely delineated theories spark as much debate as more general characterizations.

A number of theories discussed in this chapter openly incorporate a complex fabric of concerns into their understanding of the formation of music style. The Chinese concept of music blends sociological and cosmological elements, while Pueblo Indian music reflects naturalistic, sociological, and religious concerns. Many humanistic theories recognize naturalistic components, while philosophical/religious theories may accept the influence of

³³⁶Ellingson suggested these terms in "Music and Religion," 168-169. Isofunctional referred to musical congruity with the goals of liturgical action or religious practice. Isoformalism referred to congruity with religious forms of experience or cognitive constructs.

³³⁷Implied in *ibid.*, 231.

naturalistic and/or humanistic factors. This does not invalidate the theory categories, for they highlight the focus of the ultimate concern--which realities seem most significant in each theory.

There is a sense in which all of the theories canvassed display complexity. Whatever their focus, all could be classified as metaphysical because all exhibit some notion of prime reality and reveal by their emphasis (the questions asked, the areas explored, the bias in data collection) what that reality is. In other words, each theory manifests a worldview. Even if the term "final cause" is strictly avoided in the scholarly investigation of music style formation, each theory reveals its own predispositions, and these should also be acknowledged and discussed.

Lastly, while recognizing the value of humanistic and naturalistic insights, to ignore religio-philosophical considerations in the development of music style is to deny the close connection between music and religion that has been recognized in all cultures. Because such metaphysical concerns unify and organize all human thought and activity, to neglect them in a study of the arts is willful ignorance and preparation for distorted conclusions.

It is important to reaffirm the religio-philosophical component in the development of any musical style and to accord it its rightful place among other considerations. In discussions of sacred music style, it is crucial to include such considerations if meaningful conclusions are to be reached.

CHAPTER THREE

THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE A CASE STUDY OF POLARITY

Introduction

In pursuing the notion of worldview as a valid framework for informing discussion of Christian worship music choice, three major worldviews or paradigms have been canvassed regarding their view of music style determinants. It has been argued that while humanistic and naturalistic interpretations have provided important insights into the development of music style, religio-philosophical considerations comprise a significant (albeit neglected) overarching impact that is particularly relevant to the study of sacred music style. Exploring how one prominent, religio-philosophical worldview consideration translates into characteristics of sacred music style is the task in this chapter.

Oskar Söhnngen submitted that church music¹ consists of "the transformation of worship into music."² This statement posits more than a functional use of music in a liturgical or ritual

¹Although Söhnngen used this term in the Western Christian context, he was conscious of its wider applicability. In this study the term "church music" was used synonymously with sacred music, or liturgical/worship music.

²Oskar Söhnngen, "Music and Theology: A Systematic Approach," in Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, *Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies*, vol. 50 (Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983), 8. Söhnngen called this "one of the grandest conceptions of intellectual history" (ibid.).

progression.³ Rather, it avows that worship is the substratum from which worship music is generated; that church music is the metamorphosis into ordered sound of a believer's homage, confession, and supplication to deity.⁴

This evocative understanding of sacred music must be conditioned by the fact that "the quality of worship in every religion is determined by the worshippers' conception of the nature of their deity."⁵ If this deduction is valid, it would seem logical to assume that a religion's conception of deity has a determinative impact on the musical expression of worship.⁶

Commenting on the observable human quest for compatibility between fundamental beliefs and the character of art utilized in a religious setting,⁷ Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī wrote:

One set of . . . religious beliefs predicates one kind of religious experience and, by extension, a particular notion of suitable religious music. Another set of religious beliefs gives rise to a different kind of religious experience and accordant religious music. . . . The examples of religious music are then

³Writing about developments in the Roman Catholic worship music tradition, Karl Gustav Fellerer delineated three categories of church music--"music of worship," "music in worship," and "music for worship" ("Musik des Gottesdienstes," "Musik im Gottesdienst," and "Musik zum Gottesdienst"). See Karl Gustav Fellerer, Geschichte der Katholischen Kirchenmusik (Düsseldorf: Musikverlag Schwann, 1949), 6. By means of the broad difference intimated between "music of worship" versus "music for worship," Fellerer outlined a retreat from a genuine liturgical expression to a functional, autonomous art that has relevance for the wider Western Christian worship music tradition.

⁴This idea is analogous to Mircea Eliade's portrayal of sacred visual art (Eliade, Symbolism, the Sacred and the Arts, 55).

⁵Horton Davies, Worship and Theology in England: The Ecumenical Century 1900-1965 (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1965), 121.

⁶This is implied in Söhnngen's observation that "the goal which is set for worship determines the theological yardstick by which the appropriateness of music for worship is measured" (Söhnngen, "Music and Theology," 10).

⁷See Wolterstorff, Art in Action, 187.

but reflections and expressions of the complex of religious ideas held in a given culture at a particular time.⁹

She went on to observe that in her own faith, Islām, the concept of God was the determining factor for the rest of the "complex of religious ideas."⁹ Frequently a religion's conception of the nature of its deity comprehends and predicates metaphysical issues: cosmological, anthropological, and eschatological. It is a focal point, a key pillar in the worldview.

In her essay "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī began to explore how a religion's "idea of the nature of divinity" explains "the aesthetic products which are created to enhance and deepen the religious experience"¹⁰ within its communion. She found that determining what a religion believes about deity should make it "possible to investigate which musical elements, which styles, and which forms best symbolize the subtle elements of that religious ideology." Conversely, less suitable characteristics should also become evident.¹¹

Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's analysis of sacred music style focused on the impact of transcendence or immanence in a religion's idea of the nature of divinity.¹² The validity of her notion is explored in chapters 3 and 4 of this study. First, however, some

⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 27. See also William T. Flynn, "Church Music," Dictionary of the Ecumenical Movement (1991), 182.

¹⁰Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 27. See also Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī and Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1986), 73-91.

¹¹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 27.

¹²Ibid., 30. Wolterstorff implied the same general point in Art in Action, 188.

¹³Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 27.

considerations regarding the "idea of the nature of divinity" need to be delineated.

The Transcendent/Immanent Concept of Deity

Discussions about the concept of deity quickly expose the limitations of human thought and language. Consequently, in the latter half of the twentieth century, many have turned to the use of bipolar, antithetical notions to elucidate the problem of describing the complex, sometimes apparently contradictory nature of divinity. Charles Hartshorne and William Reese, in Philosophers Speak of God, provided a rationale for this approach:

There seems a good deal of support in experience, logic, and intellectual history for what Morris Cohen called the 'Law of Polarity'. According to this law, ultimate contraries are correlatives, mutually interdependent, so that nothing real can be described by the wholly one-sided assertion of simplicity, being, actuality, and the like, each in a "pure" form devoid and independent of complexity, becoming, potentiality, and related contraries.¹³

Endorsing the same methodology, Karl Rahner and Herbert Vorgrimler wrote:

A philosophy and theology of polarity can help avoid a monolithic or atomistic interpretation of reality and a false dualism, since a polar relation simultaneously unites and distinguishes.¹⁴

It should be noted that the same polar notions that may clarify individual concepts of deity can also be symbolic of polar categories towards which whole ideologies may veer in emphasis.

Several classifications of conceptions of deity have employed this approach. Joachim Wach, in his comparative examination of notions about God in myths and theologies, utilized a threefold scheme that provided for "a pair of polar concepts in each

¹³Charles Hartshorne and William L. Reese, Philosophers Speak of God (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1953), 2.

¹⁴Concise Theological Dictionary, 2d ed. (1983), s.v. "Polarity."

case."¹⁵ The categories he discussed were: pluralism versus monism, personalism versus impersonalism, and distance versus nearness.¹⁶

The transcendent/immanent polarity is a major, overarching conception in discussions of deity.¹⁷ When used to describe the divine, transcendence refers to the "otherness" of the deity--the aspects of divine being that are of a totally different order than human existence. It includes infinite qualitative differences such as omnipotence, omniscience, eternal existence, changelessness, and holiness--the elements of deity that are incomprehensible to humankind. Immanence, when ascribed to deity, refers to proximity, immediacy, and accessibility. It includes such qualities as presence, personal association, the feeling of identity, and indwelling relationship--in other words, those aspects of deity that relate directly to human experience. It implies that boundaries between natural human existence and the existence of deity are blurred or erased. In short, when speaking of transcendence, emphasis is placed on distinctions and dissimilarities. When speaking of immanence, the focus is on oneness and affinity.

Like other polarities, the transcendent/immanent polarity can be utilized in the two ways indicated above: (1) to clarify understanding of contrasts within a particular concept of God (that is, on what could be termed the "micro level"), and (2) to represent polar categories in the general classification of ideologies (that is, on what could be termed the "macro level"). It is the macro

¹⁵Joachim Wach, The Comparative Study of Religions, ed. with an introduction by Joseph M. Kitagawa (New York: Columbia University Press, 1958), 78.

¹⁶Ibid.

¹⁷For example, in Wach's classification both the personalism/impersonalism and distance/nearness polarities incorporate aspects of the transcendent/immanent antithesis.

level of application that has particular significance for this study.

As has been adroitly observed, "the specific ideas of exactly what is divine are extremely diverse and can be typed or grouped in many ways depending on what someone is looking for."¹⁸ To avoid meaningless proliferation of categories, Clouser sidestepped the simple, descriptive approach and advanced a classification based on "how the non-divine depends on the divine or a religion's 'dependency arrangement'."¹⁹ The significance of his approach for the present study is twofold: (1) it legitimately reduced a plethora of ideas about the divine to a manageable number of major categories, and (2) it highlighted and illuminated the transcendent/immanent polarity in the understanding of deity on the macro level.

Exploring how the non-divine depends on the divine in the study of religious conceptions of deity, Clouser verified the claim that worldview options are not infinite in number. He wrote:

It becomes clear that there are three dependency arrangements which prevail in the world today. These are not the only ones possible . . . but the vast majority of the world's population now holds to one or another of only three.²⁰

He named the three dependency ideas: (1) the pagan, (2) the pantheistic, and (3) the biblical.²¹ They were portrayed thus:

¹⁸Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 35.

¹⁹Ibid., 36.

²⁰Ibid. See also Alfred North Whitehead, Religion in the Making (New York: Macmillan Company, 1926), 67-69.

²¹He explained his use of terms thus: "'Biblical,' as I use it, is a blanket term for the traditions that believe in a transcendent creator: Judaism, Christianity, and Islām; while the term 'pantheist' includes Hinduism, Buddhism, and the more recent forms of Taoism. The pagan type of religions cover such a wide variety of specific traditions that I cannot represent it by simply naming a few of its most famous members" (Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 36).

Clouser went on to explain that the term "pagan" is not used in a derogatory sense, neither is it meant to infer only the

1. In the pagan dependency idea "the divine is some part, aspect, force, or principle in the created universe. . . . There is only one continuous reality, part of which is the divine segment on which all the rest depends."²² Although various pagan traditions may differ regarding specific ideas of the divine, they all believe that the divine is to be "sought within the world [or universe]--not outside it."²³ Using a solid line to represent the divine, and a broken line the non-divine, Clouser's depiction of the pagan conception is shown in fig. 1.

2. The pantheistic dependency idea "may best be seen as the inverse of the one held by paganism. Instead of locating the divine as a subdivision of all reality, the pantheistic belief is that the non-divine is a subdivision of the divine."²⁴ The divine is coextensive with reality.²⁵ Clouser schematized this conception as in fig. 2 (with the proviso that because divinity is regarded as infinite, the solid line circle should, in fact, be infinitely large).

The distinction between the divine and the non-divine is less transparent in the pantheistic conception than in the pagan.²⁶

superstitious or irrational. Rather, it is employed as a technical term that also encompasses highly sophisticated forms of belief that "still exercise a tremendous influence in the world today" (ibid.). He provided illustrations of this category in nature religions which worship a divine power in the universe (such as the sun, rivers, and the sea); in mathematics where numbers or other elements are considered "self-existent realities"; in science and Marxism where matter or energy have the same role; and in dualism in which two divinities--one the source of good, the other the source of evil--are postulated (ibid., 36-40).

²²Ibid., 36.

²³Werner Jaeger, Theology of the Early Greek Philosophers: The Gifford Lectures 1936 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1947), 17.

²⁴Ibid., 40.

²⁵Ibid., 40-41.

²⁶Ibid., 41.

Fig. 1. The dependency relationship between the divine and the non-divine among pagan religions.²⁷ Reprinted, by permission, from Roy A. Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality: An Essay on the Hidden Role of Religious Belief in Theories (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991), 37.

Fig. 2. The dependency relationship between the divine and the non-divine among pantheistic religions. Reprinted, by permission, from Roy A. Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality: An Essay on the Hidden Role of Religious Belief in Theories (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991), 41.

²⁷Clouser represented the dependency arrangement among dualistic pagan religions (where two divinities are the source of two categories of the non-divine), by a broken line bisecting the two circles (see *ibid.*, 39).

Because of belief in "the divine being of all things," this distinction does not derive from separate portions of reality, but from "the illusory appearance that there are realities which are not divine."²⁹ In other words, superficial appearances can mask the divine, making it difficult to detect. For this reason pantheistic religions emphasize that "only by mystical experience can a person overcome the veil of illusion, see behind the world of mere appearance, and become aware of the divine reality which is hidden by it."³⁰

3. In the biblical dependency arrangement, the creator is distinct from the universe that he created ex nihilo. "The divine is not part of the universe, nor is the universe part of the divine; there is a fundamental discontinuity between the creator and all else which is his creation."³⁰ This conception is represented in fig. 3.

He further explained the biblical dependency arrangement:

Biblical traditions neither exalt some part of creation to divine status, nor demean its reality as illusory. The universe is real . . . but at the same time, there is nothing about it which is not dependent on God. . . . Everything other than God himself has been brought into being by God who is the only divinity there is."³¹

As a corollary to this dependency arrangement, "intelligible revelation"³² is conceived as the chosen communication mode between God and humankind. Such revelation is a God-initiated "body of teaching" about "his relation to the universe, especially his

²⁹Ibid.

³⁰Ibid. As Clouser observed, this is why pantheistic traditions do not simply teach doctrine, but aim "at inducing a mystical experience of it" (ibid.).

³¹Ibid., 43.

³²Ibid., 44.

³³Ibid.

Fig. 3. The dependency relationship between the divine and the non-divine among biblical religions. Reprinted, by permission, from Roy A. Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality: An Essay on the Hidden Role of Religious Belief in Theories (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991), 44.

relation to humans."³³ It is necessary because humankind cannot discover God by searching the universe or through a mystical pantheistic-type experience.³⁴

Religious experience in the biblical category is characterized by some significant distinguishing features. Its role is "indispensable," but confined.

Experience is never 'mystical experience' in the pantheistic sense. The experience of God is never direct experience of the Divine Being, but is always mediated through creation. Still less does this experience lead to union with the being of God.³⁵

God can and does communicate through his creation utilizing human faculties, but this is an accommodation of Himself to human experience. Therefore, wrote Clouser:

The religious experience itself is never the norm or standard of belief in biblical religions, instead it is the experience of recognizing God's word as the norm and standard of belief. In other words, the experience is not the ultimate religious authority, God's self-revelation in his word is. And this is the reverse of the pantheistic idea of mystical religious experience

³³Ibid.

³⁴Ibid.

³⁵Ibid., 44-45.

where the experience itself is the ultimate religious authority.³⁶

In his description and analysis of the three categories, Clouser noted a significant contrast between the first two and the last. He observed that the pagan and pantheistic notions of deity differ regarding what is divine and in their dependency arrangement with the non-divine, but they share "the conviction that there is only one continuous reality."³⁷ The biblical idea, however, denies this.³⁸ Summarizing this fundamental difference (referring to the pagan and pantheistic ideas as Greco-Oriental and the biblical idea as Hebraic), Will Herberg observed:

Hebraic and Greco-Oriental religion, as religion, agree in affirming some Absolute Reality as ultimate, but they differ fundamentally in what they say about this reality. . . . As against the Greco-Oriental conception of immanence, of divinity permeating all things and constituting their reality, Hebraic religion affirms God as a transcendent Person who has indeed created the universe but who cannot without blasphemy be identified with it. Where Greco-Oriental thought sees continuity between God and the universe, Hebraic religion insists on discontinuity.³⁹

This is not meant to suggest that pagan and pantheistic beliefs about deity reject the notion of transcendence, or that the biblical understanding of God discards the notion of immanence. However, their respective orientations predispose them to an inherent directional emphasis in relation to the transcendent/immanent polarity.

Thus, because it provides a categorical distinction between major religious belief systems, the fundamental difference in the conception of deity evidenced in the orientation to the

³⁶Ibid., 46.

³⁷Ibid., 40.

³⁸Ibid., 43.

³⁹Will Herberg, "The Fundamental Outlook of Hebraic Religion," in The Ways of Religion, ed. Roger Eastman (San Francisco: Canfield Press, 1975), 283.

transcendence/immanence polarity is used as a framework for discussion in this study.

In this chapter, the impact of this difference in the concept of deity on sacred music style is explored through the self-understanding of two representative religions--Islām in the biblical category and African traditional religion in the pagan category. These case studies were chosen for four reasons:

1. Of the three religions in Clouser's biblical category, Islām (apart from certain groups like the Sūfīs) most zealously emphasizes the transcendent aspect of deity. By contrast, African traditional religion and its derivatives generally exemplify a strong emphasis on immanence as can be seen in possession rituals.
2. Several significant discussions of the impact of the concept of deity on sacred or ritual music style are extant from respected or favorably disposed sources within both of these traditions.
3. Islām's impact on northern and eastern Africa permits some assessment of these religions' interrelationship.
4. The pagan rather than the pantheistic category has been chosen to represent the immanence emphasis in order to maintain as much parity as possible between the religious orientations being contrasted, delimiting certain features that may be considered to have a complicating impact on musical style. For example, like biblical religions, pagan religions tend to maintain some concept of personalism rather than the impersonalism apparent in pantheistic views of deity. The distinction between the divine and the non-divine in pagan and biblical belief (albeit of a different order and quality) provides more opportunity for comparison than the pantheistic notion which, through the concept of an all-pervading divine presence, blurs that distinction. Pantheism's posture regarding the illusory nature of physical reality also predisposes

it to more mystical conceptions of divine immanence than are evident in pagan notions.

It should be noted, however, that the inherent notion of immanence found in both the pagan and pantheistic categories may predispose them to certain similarities, if not congruities, of worship practice and sacred music style.

Islamic Sacred Sound Art and the
Transcendent View of God

Muslims as well as non-Muslims acknowledge that Islām has had a significant impact on Muslim culture, although understanding the essence of its impact has eluded many Western scholars.⁴⁰

Francesco Gabrieli summed up Muslim civilization well when he wrote:

Religious faith unquestionably furnished to this civilization not only its common denominator but also its axis, and fundamental aspect. All other aspects of life--material and spiritual, political and literary, economic and social--bear this religious element's mark, take color from its reflections, and develop under its influence. Islām, it has been said, is more than any other a totalitarian religion, and it encompasses the whole man, not his religious consciousness alone.⁴¹

Among the most cogent and insightful contributions to understanding the relationship of Islamic faith to Islamic artistic culture are the writings of Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī and Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī.⁴²

⁴⁰See Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Misconceptions of the Nature of Islamic Art," 29. A number of prominent Western scholars have propounded that Islām has "impeded or restricted and thereby impoverished" the artistic tendencies of Muslim peoples (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 82).

⁴¹Francesco Gabrieli, "Literary Tendencies," in Unity and Variety in Muslim Civilization, ed. Gustave E. von Grunebaum (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1955), 87.

⁴²Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī was born in the United States, converted to Islam, and thereafter in her scholarly career pursued the understanding of Islamic music and other arts in relation to Islam in a distinguished interdisciplinary manner. See Regula Burckhardt Qureshi, "In Memoriam: Lois Lamyā' Ibsen Al Fārūqī (1927-1986)," Ethnomusicology 32 (Spring/Summer 1988): 93-96. Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, a Palestinian Muslim who emigrated to the United States, was a specialist in Islamics and religion. Both he and his wife, Lois, were active thought leaders in Islamic studies in the United States, and both taught at Temple University until their tragic, untimely deaths in May 1986. Their writings form the basis of the

The Islamic View of God

The Al Fārūqī stated that "the essence of Islām is tawhīd, the act of affirming Allah to be the One, absolute, transcendent Creator, Lord and Master of all that is."⁴³ Elaborating on the meaning of this monotheistic belief, Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī explained that for Muslims,

This tawhīd, or unizational theology, rules out any immanentism and all confusion, diffusion, incarnation, emanationism, or absorption of the divine in, or by the non-divine, of the creator and the creature. It rules out all revelation or disclosure of the divine Self, for such would imply an entry into space-time compromising to its transcendence. The two realms of being can never meet!⁴⁴

Thus, in Islām,

Reality is dual--transcendent and natural--and . . . the two realms can never be confused with each other; the transcendent reality is the source of truth and value, and . . . the only contact possible between God and man is . . . a process of intellection.⁴⁵

These descriptions identify Islamic belief with Clouser's biblical category.

The Relationship of Islamic Belief and Aesthetic Consciousness

Perceiving ultimate reality in terms of transcendent divinity, it is not surprising that Muslims see God and His will as the "absolute beauty."⁴⁶ As Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī explained:

The beautiful, the significant in art, therefore, is for the

following synthesis.

⁴³Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 73. See also Geoffrey Parrinder, Worship in the World's Religions (London: Faber and Faber, 1961), 203; Frithjof Schuon, The Transcendent Unity of Religions, trans. Peter Townsend (London: Faber and Faber, 1953), 128; and Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 11.

⁴⁴Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 88-89.

⁴⁵Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "On the Nature of the Work of Art in Islām," 76. See also Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 74.

⁴⁶Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islam, 88.

Muslim not an aesthetic portrayal of humanity or human attributes. . . . It is not a symbolic statement of the truths of nature. . . . Instead, this transcendence-obsessed culture sought, through the creation of the beautiful to stimulate in the viewer or listener an intuition of, or an insight into, the nature of God and of man's relation to Him."

It is as if Muslims "have demanded an art that would turn attention to a divine Being who is neither human nor part of nature."⁸

By choice, Islām has rejected naturalistic images of any aspect of human life or any other phenomenon in the natural world. For Muslims, art is not the imitation or symbolization of nature.⁹ Utilizing the created realm for aesthetic means is not merely unsuitable, it is blasphemous.¹⁰ Because Islām deems that "the natural, and above all the human-natural, is the mightiest contender for the divine place,"¹¹ it is morally requisite to exclude them from aesthetic expression. This view has led to a de-emphasis, or even rejection, of certain art forms such as dance, figural sculpture, figural painting, and drama in Muslim culture.¹² As

⁸Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 170-171.

⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Unity and Variety in the Music of Islamic Culture," in The Islamic Impact, ed. Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, Byron Haines, and Ellison Findly (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1984), 178.

¹⁰Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islam, 86; and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 171.

¹¹Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī wrote: "Blasphemous is . . . the claim that anything in rerum natura, and especially man, is taken in any way to serve as symbol, vehicle, revelation, expression, incarnation, or emanation of divinity. No sensory thing, and no sensory intuition of any kind is adequate or becoming. Hence, Islām resolved to do away with all figurative representation" (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islam and Art," 89).

¹²Ibid., 84.

¹³See Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Aesthetic Expression," in Islām and Contemporary Society, ed. Salem Azzam (London and New York: Longman and the Islamic Council of Europe, 1982), 204-205. Although dance exists among Muslim peoples it has always been subordinated and never connected with religious services (except among the Sūfis) because of the difficulty of purging it of naturalistic elements while utilizing the human body. It has been

Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī asserted, semitic consciousness (of which Islām is a manifestation) held as part of its understanding of the commandment "Thou shalt not make any graven image" that "the less the senses were involved in intuiting the First Principle of all being, the more transcendent the object of that intuition, the purer the vision itself."³

Because the transcendent realm cannot be depicted by anthropomorphic, zoomorphic, or other natural images, and because sensory intuitions are regarded as inadequate, even unworthy,⁴ the transcendent realm itself must become the source of inspiration for aesthetic impulses. As Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī observed:

The Muslim artist . . . sought to express the non-representableness, the inexpressibility of the divine; and in this pursuit he created structures in the visual arts, music, and literature to suggest infinity.⁵

Thus, a form of aesthetic expression fashioned to realize and communicate the Islamic perception of truth came into being. This unique artistic style--"arabesque"⁶--has been termed Islām's aesthetic breakthrough.⁷

The characteristics of this style encompass aspects of both form and content. They include: abstraction through denaturalization and stylization, modular structure and successive

suggested that because this difficulty is subconsciously realized, motives for de-emphasizing dance have "often been explained as dictated by moral considerations" (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Dance as an Expression of Islamic Culture," Dance Research Journal 10 [Spring-Summer 1978]: 7). See also *ibid.*, 6 and 12.

³Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 86.

⁴Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "On the Nature of the Work of Art in Islām," 77.

⁵Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 173.

⁶Arabesque is "a structural entity that accords with the aesthetic principles of Islamic ideology" (Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 165).

⁷Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islam and Art," 89-90.

combinations in which numerous small components are combined to form increasingly larger designs, non-developmental repetition intended to create the infinite pattern, dynamism of design which must be appreciated serially, and intricacy that captures attention and concentration, and draws the spectator into the intuition of infinity.*

To some extent these stylistic features have permeated all Islamic arts, resulting in a recognizable internal unity throughout international Islamic culture.⁹ This is not meant to suggest that Islām has never utilized foreign culture elements. However, it has always digested them first, recasting their forms and relations before integrating them into its own system¹⁰ and imprinting its own stamp upon them.

The remarkable continuity of the characteristic features of Islamic arts, despite changes that inevitably occur over time, was insightfully analyzed by Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī. She wrote:

*Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 165-168. A similar list is presented by Muhammad A. Hamdūn in "What Is 'Islāmic' in Islāmic Literature?" in Islāmic Thought and Culture: Papers Presented to the Islamic Studies Group of the American Academy of Religion, ed. Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī (Washington, D.C.: International Institute of Islamic Thought, 1982), 69-70. For a description of how the intuition of the infinite is related to the notion of beauty, see *ibid.*, 70.

⁹See the discussion of architecture, the visual arts, dance, literature and music in Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām; Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art; and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Dance as an Expression of Islamic Culture," 6-13. Regarding transcultural unity in Islamic artistic culture, Malm observed that despite some regional differences, "the pan-Islamic label is still useful, for the spread of Islām has directly or indirectly brought certain unifying elements to . . . [a] vast area" (Malm, Music Cultures of the Pacific, the Near East, and Asia, 39). See also Ashenafi Kebede, "The Music of Ethiopia: Its Development and Cultural Setting" (Ph.D. dissertation, Wesleyan University, 1971), 142-143 and Kaufmann's statement: "The great buildings of Islām in different countries have much more in common than do Christian churches in different countries. Looking at Muslim art one does not get the feeling that in winning so much of the world, Islām has lost its soul" (Kaufmann, Religions in Four Dimensions, 108).

¹⁰Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 76.

If we are to understand a musical culture . . . we should be as concerned about that which does not change as with that which changes. . . . That which exemplifies non-change is perhaps much more crucial to the cultural matrix than that which exemplifies drastic change. It is as if the community had put its stamp of essentiality on the former, of non-essentiality on the latter.⁶¹

It is the non-changeables, those features that have come to bear the stamp of essentiality, that provide the focus of attention in the next section.

Tawhīd and Islamic Sacred Sound Art Style

It is evident from Islamic literature that for centuries there has been discussion about its music. Generally, Western scholars have interpreted this to indicate an inherently negative attitude toward the art form on the part of Islamic religious leaders.⁶² However, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's explanation that misapprehension of Islamic terminology and the imposition of Western definitions and categories of music⁶³ have led Western scholarship to misunderstand the Islamic "Handasah al Sawt" ("Art of Sound")⁶⁴ seems more plausible. Her assertion that "Islamic art is as it is, not because it is hamstrung by prohibitions, but because it is

⁶¹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations," 77.

⁶²See Henry George Farmer, "The Music of Islām," in New Oxford History of Music, vol. 1, ed. Egon Wellesz (London: Oxford University Press, 1957), 427, 439; Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 77; and A. Shiloah, "The Dimension of Sound," in Islām and the Arab World: Faith, People, Culture, ed. Bernard Lewis (New York: Alfred A. Knopf in association with American Heritage Publishing Company, 1976), 168.

⁶³See the discussion of this in Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant: A Study in Musical Tawāzun," Yearbook of the International Folk Music Council 10 (1978): 53; Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations," 56-59; Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Music, Musicians, and Muslim Law," 5-7; and Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 441.

⁶⁴See Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 441.

following a positive ideal,"⁴⁶ has a ring of truth that invites investigation.

The same scholar pointed out that the Western term "music" is all-inclusive with no equivalent in the Islamic context. She demonstrated that the term mūsīqā (or mūsīqī), which is often equated by Westerners with "music" has a much more limited connotation, referring in most instances "only to certain secular musical genres of the culture."⁴⁶ Thus, when negative attitudes to mūsīqā are expressed in Islamic literature they are directed from the outset at a specific type of sound art. For this reason, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's broader term "sound art" has displaced "music" in this discussion.

"Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "Development and the Islamic Arts," in Islām and Development: Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Convention of the Association of Muslim Social Scientists (Plainfield, Ind.: The Association of Muslim Social Scientists, 1977), 29-30.

"Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 177. Mark Slobin's research in Northern Afghanistan supported this observation about terminology (Mark Slobin, Music in the Culture of Northern Afghanistan [Tucson, Ariz.: University of Arizona Press, 1976], 26, 27, 59).

According to Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's analysis, in Muslim culture there is a recognizable hierarchy of sound genres⁷ of which

⁷Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī tabulated this hierarchy as shown below. Source: Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art (Islamabad, Pakistan: National Hijra Council, 1985), 179.

HIERARCHY OF HANDASAH AL SAWT GENRES
(The Status of Music in the Muslim World)

the sacred sound art forms of Qur'ānic chant (or qirā'ah) and other religious chants constitute the pinnacle. For religious reasons, these forms were never included in the Muslim understanding of mūsīqā.

(It was as if) spokesman for the Muslim ummah ('community'), whether consciously or unconsciously, hoped to lift qirā'ah from the intellectual and moral controversies concerning music, and at the same time to immunize it from the de-spiritualizing innovations which were experienced in much of the secular music.⁶⁶

The seven lower categories of sound art were referred to as mūsīqā, and of these forms the four lowest categories sparked discussion on the moral or ethical legitimacy of "music," mainly because of associations with certain questionable behavior.⁶⁷ Religious sound art forms were never questioned. On the contrary, their purity was maintained by a sensitive communal "aesthetic-religious 'conscience'."⁶⁸

Since it was commanded in the Qur'ān,⁷¹ Qur'ānic cantillation became the leading form of religious sound art. As such it has been a model or standard by which all other sound art was judged, thus contributing to Islamic music's distinctiveness. Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī indicated that the conformance or divergence of other genres to the archetypical Qur'ānic chant contributed to the initial formation of the hierarchy of Islamic sound art.⁷²

⁶⁶Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant," 53.

⁶⁷Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 176, 189. Other scholars also support the idea that music was considered questionable because of its association with questionable behavior. See David W. Ames, "Contexts of Dance in Zazzau and the Impact of Islamic Reform," in African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg (Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982), 137; Shiloah, "The Dimension of Sound," 168; and Farmer, "The Music of Islām," 435.

⁶⁸Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Music, Musicians, and Muslim Law," 9; and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant," 53.

⁷¹See Qur'ān 2:121; 25:32; 73:4.

⁷²Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 187.

The more a certain genre or type of musical expression draws for its musical, poetic and religious inspiration from Qur'ānic chant, the more it has been appreciated and 'legitimized.' The more it strays from that model, the more susceptible it is to correction by an alert community aesthetic conscience, or to assignment to a lower level of approval and appreciation.⁷³

By influencing the music of an entire civilization, this religious genre helped to diffuse the distinction between the sacred and the secular⁷⁴ for, to a greater or lesser degree, much of the sound art has been permeated by characteristics considered "capable of directing the hearers' minds and attention to Allah (SWT) and to the God-commanded duties and ethical desiderata of life."⁷⁵ Additionally, because Qur'ānic cantillation and the call to prayer are inescapable sound art experiences in the course of everyday life in Muslim communities, they perpetrate the regular injection of the sacred into the secular.⁷⁶

Called "the main carrier and purest form of the core characteristics of handasah al sawt,"⁷⁷ Qur'ānic chant "models" the ideal tonal form of the tawhid-inspired aesthetic features mentioned above. Although an improvised art, it has maintained a "continuity and homogeneity . . . which makes it possible for the Muslim to feel comfortable with the competent Qur'ānic recitation heard in any part

⁷³Ibid. In support of her claim, she gave a detailed description of the degree of correspondence shown at each level of the hierarchy. She concluded that: "Each descent to another level of the hierarchy, however, reveals a successive lessening of correspondence to the model, a fact which helps account for the reduced acceptability and appreciation of the genres of those levels" (ibid., 187-188).

⁷⁴Such a separation, in any case, is not fostered in Islamic ideology (Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 442).

⁷⁵Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 189.

⁷⁶Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 457. Interestingly, because the traditional sound arts correspond to the "Qur'ānic prototype" they are aesthetically accessible to Muslims on all social strata, and consequently "there is no need for enforced listening or formal appreciation courses" (ibid., 443).

⁷⁷Ibid.

of the Muslim world."⁷⁸ Besides Qur'ānic chant (or qirā'ah), the call to prayer (or adhān) is the other sound art form which is of essential significance in the religious worship service. Other forms considered legitimate in the sacred setting include:

The aural art of the dhikr ('remembrance') service of the mystical brotherhoods, and similar examples of takbīrāt (exaltation of God), hamd (thanks to God), madīh (praise of the prophet Muhammad), or du'ā' (supplication).⁷⁹

While religious forms of sound art are by no means limited to the formal worship context,⁸⁰ it is noteworthy that

the reciprocal freedom of non-religious music to enter the mosque service has never been the practice in Arab or Islamic society. Only Qur'ānic cantillation and the call to prayer can be heard as essential parts of the Islamic ritual, whereas takbīrāt, hamd, madīh, and du'ā' are optional or occasional additions before or after the ṣalāt (prayer).⁸¹

Characteristic of Content: Abstraction⁸²

The ultimate contentual focus of Islamic sacred sound art is undoubtedly the Qur'ānic text or the prayer being recited; however, its presentation as sound art equally reveals the distinguishing characteristics of its Islamicness. To communicate an intuition of tawhīd, the abstract, non-programmatic quality of Islamic sacred sound art intentionally avoids arousal of "psychological or

⁷⁸Ibid.

⁷⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations," 57.

⁸⁰In fact, they are considered appropriate for use on a wide variety of secular occasions (ibid., 60).

⁸¹Ibid., 61.

⁸²Organization of the sections "Characteristic of Content" and "Characteristic of Form" basically follows that used in one of Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's last publications (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Aesthetic Characteristics of the Traditional Music of the Arabian Gulf and the Peninsula," Al Ma'thurāt Al Sha'biyyah 1 [April 1986]: 23-25).

kinesthetic correspondences to beings, events, objects or ideas within nature."⁶³ The Al Fārūqī explained:

Melodic and rhythmic elements in the sound arts of Islamic culture are not used or altered in order to match a dramatic unfolding of events and ideas. The genres of handasah al sawt make little or no attempt to be musically imitative of the creatures of nature. Neither are these elements manipulated to create specific and changing moods. Tempo, volume, style, pitch level, register, soloist or performance group--all may change; but such changes result from the demands of aesthetic structure rather than in accordance with extramusical ideas of either implicit or explicit nature.⁶⁴

Particularly in Qur'ānic chant, "no changes of mood are apparent from beginning to end of a single recitation, nor from one recitation to another."⁶⁵ Dramatic volume changes, wide leaps between low and high pitches, and durational changes are never used for textual description or emphasis. In fact, "the chant . . . reveals little change in volume within a musical phrase, or throughout the reading."⁶⁶ Pitches used in the performance of any passage remain within a small range.⁶⁷ Durational note values reveal remarkable continuity, employing, for the most part, sixteenth, eighth and quarter notes,⁶⁸ and there is little or no change in tempo.⁶⁹ The intention, as Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī explained, is that the musical line lead "the mind away from the self, away from particular emotions, away from the everyday world

⁶³Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 466.

⁶⁴Ibid.

⁶⁵Ibid.

⁶⁶Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant," 60. Extremes of loudness or softness would be considered undesirable innovations (ibid.).

⁶⁷Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 192.

⁶⁸Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant," 61. Longer notes are broken up by repetition (Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 193).

⁶⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Aesthetic Characteristics of the Traditional Music of the Arabian Gulf and the Peninsula," 24.

and nature," and arouse contemplation of the divine or transcendent world.⁹⁰

Characteristic of Form: Infinite Patterning

Infinite patterning involves elements of both structure and content, but essentially it results from the treatment of content material in particular structural ways.

1. Repetition: Repetition plays a significant role in achieving "the never-ending quality that the aesthetic expression of tawhīd should manifest."⁹¹ It also communicates abstraction and neutralizes the individualization of sound art entities.⁹² Included in this feature are reiteration of individual tones to displace sustained notes, repetition of important tones in scale segments, recurrence of short musical patterns/motifs (both melodic and durational) and of different types of refrain phrases.

2. Modular Structure and Successive Combination: Islamic sacred sound arts are divided into many distinct, small units.

In Qur'ānic chant . . . the phrases corresponding to a literary āyah (verse) or part thereof are clearly separated from each other by periods of silence. . . . As each sound module nears completion, its closure is marked by a descent in pitch and a cadencing on an important tone of the scalar materials being used.⁹³

This aesthetic segmentation, not linked in any way to tone painting, reinforces poetic rhyme and assonance⁹⁴ and provides the building blocks for patterning. The successive, non-developmental combination of such small modules is an important device for

⁹⁰Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 193-194.

⁹¹Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 475.

⁹²Ibid.

⁹³Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 469.

⁹⁴Ibid.

heightening the impression of infinite pattern."⁹⁵ Manipulation of short motifs also facilitates improvisational creativity and compositional dynamism.⁹⁶

3. Intricacy: Tonal and durational intricacy also augment the impression of infinite patterning. As the Al Fārūqī explained:

The infinite patterning which is the hallmark of all the Islamic arts focuses the listener's concentration on a single-line melody whether executed by vocalist, instrumentalist, chorus, or instrumental ensemble. But this melody, while eschewing the complications of an extended range, wide intervals, and multi-part counterpoint or harmony, puts emphasis instead on the density of activity in that single line.⁹⁷

Religious chant, which "abounds with ornamental melodic and rhythmic figures," reveals this same characteristic.⁹⁸ Trills, slides, grace notes, quick alternations between the main tone and either its lower or upper neighbor, turns, vibrato or tremolo, accents, terminal trail off, as well as intervals smaller and larger than the half and whole step, are used as ornamental features.⁹⁹ Not "expendable decorations" or adjuncts "to a particular tune or to specific tones of that tune," these ornaments comprise "the very material of which the tonal progression is made."¹⁰⁰ Thus, ornamentation is also content, not just its embellishment.

⁹⁵Ibid., 475. Fulfillment of the creative impulse is considered to be achieved by the skillful combination and reiteration of these internal modules rather than in the creation of entirely new entities (ibid.).

⁹⁶Ibid., 476.

⁹⁷Ibid.

⁹⁸Ibid.

⁹⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Ornamentation in Arabian Improvisational Music: A Study of Interrelatedness in the Arts," The World of Music 20 (1978): 24-25; and Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 201.

¹⁰⁰Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Ornamentation in Arabian Improvisational Music," 20. See also Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 477.

Characteristic of Performance
Practice: Monophonic Vocal
Emphasis

The performance of Islamic sacred sound art confirms its commitment to a more "other worldly," contemplative emphasis.

1. Monophonic Texture: Single line melodic texture is normative, even when groups or accompanying instruments are utilized. As Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī indicated:

Religious music is primarily a solo, unaccompanied music in the Arab-Islamic world. . . . The Qur'ānic chant and the adhān are always solo vocal renderings, without instrumental accompaniment. Other musical settings of religious poetry or pious sayings which can be defined as religious music are performed by soloists or by groups, with or without instrumental accompaniment. The performance group, however, is always small, and the musicians sing or play in unison or heterophonically.¹⁰¹

Mood-enhancing harmonic development is thus precluded.

2. Vocal Medium: Islamic sacred sound art is largely vocal, often soloistic.¹⁰² It is not essentially a professionally cultivated art.¹⁰³ Muslims from all walks of life, both male and female,¹⁰⁴ commonly take part in the various religious genres.¹⁰⁵

Vocal performance style is not programmatically aligned with the text. Dramatic trembling of the voice, exaggerated lengthening or shortening of vowels, and changing of vocal timbre are

¹⁰¹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations," 62. Heterophony is a term used to describe the occasional disturbance of monophonic texture by multi-line texture.

¹⁰²Ibid. See also Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Unity and Variety in the Music of Islamic Culture," 185.

¹⁰³"Any member of the Muslim community may chant the Scripture in public and does actually recite it in private prayer. It is the goal of every committed Muslim to learn to chant the Qur'ān, not only to know and memorize its words, but to combine them with vocal modulations as well" (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations," 61).

¹⁰⁴Ibid., 62.

¹⁰⁵Ibid., 61. This has the concomitant effect of lifting restrictions imposed by the availability of performers for vocal or instrumental ensembles on the widespread use of religious sound art (ibid., 62).

discouraged.¹⁰⁶ Although instruments are never used on their own or to accompany chant in Islamic prayer ritual,¹⁰⁷ when utilized for settings of religious poetry they tend to follow the vocal line.¹⁰⁸

3. Improvisatory Technique: Using small modal scale segments of three, four, or more adjacent tones, vocalists improvise "for as long as inspiration dictates,"¹⁰⁹ before moving to another segment. The improvisatory nature of religious chant is not confined by any predetermined segment sequence. Neither is it dependent on written notation,¹¹⁰ which has been virtually excluded.

The extent of improvisational freedom in this sound art is evident in what is considered to be a completed performance.

[The vocalist] may stop after any number of verses or phrases or after any ayah. The listener may hear as many or as few units of the performance of patterns as he desires. There is no necessary place to start, no definite place to end. The infinite design in musical sounds provides another example of that open-ended art creation of the Islamic spirit which proclaims its message of transcendence in one or in one thousand and one beautiful patterns.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁶Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant," 56, 61-63.

¹⁰⁷Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Music, Musicians and Muslim Law," 24.

¹⁰⁸"Vocal music not only statistically dominates the musical genres of the Muslim world, but is also determinative of instrumental styles of performance" (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Unity and Variety in the Music of Islamic Culture," 186). It should also be noted that "certain sawtī characteristics are achieved better or more easily with certain types of instruments than with others. . . . Idiophones, instruments made of a sonorous material that produce the sound themselves by shaking, percussion techniques or concussion . . . have not played as important a role in the performance of sawtī genres as have the chordophones, aerophones, and membranophones" (Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 443-447).

¹⁰⁹Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Unity and Variety in the Music of Islamic Culture," 185.

¹¹⁰Ibid.

¹¹¹Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 208. It is evident that this conception derived from the arrangement of the Qur'ān itself. Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī explained: "The Qur'ān is arranged in sūrahs or chapters of varying lengths, the longer coming ahead of the shorter, except for 'Al Fātiḥah' or 'The Opening,' which is only seven verses long. There is absolutely neither rhyme nor reason for

No doubt, this emphasizes and supports the abstract, non-developmental nature of the sacred sound art form.

Summary with an Exception

It is clear that the combination of and emphasis in Islamic sacred sound art characteristics are unique, though some individual elements may be paralleled in non-Islamic music traditions. It is similarly evident that the sacred sound arts manifest an integral relationship to the religion of Islām, particularly the core doctrine of tawhīd.

In summary, the stylistic features of Islām's transcendence-inspired art form accentuate the "other worldly" rather than the phenomenal and the naturalistic. The rejection of the dramatic in favor of the abstract; the restricted use of pitch and volume and the non-use of metrical rhythm; reliance on the human voice to the virtual exclusion of instruments; and the emphasis on horizontal, solo, or unison melodic structures rather than vertical, polyphonic, or chordal structures all contribute to avoidance of sensual associations with kinesthetic impulses and emotional states. Their

the arrangement either of its sūrahs or of the verses within each sūrah. For the untrained, it represents the widest, helter-skelter diffusion of detached statements touching on all subjects in the fields of religion, social and personal morality, and culture. The disappointment of the Western reader who, hearing of the Qur'ān's renown as a literary masterpiece, reads it expecting a logically and topically systematized treatise, will be endless and full of bitterness. The Arab, on the other hand, reads or hears mā layassara of the Qur'ān, i.e., whatever portion he is guided by chance or by another person to read. There can be no rationale of the selection, of where it begins or of where it comes to an end--and he knows this only too well! He concentrates his attention on each verse individually, and he is moved to tears, joy, contrition, wonder, terror, sacrifice, bliss, awe, magnanimity, charity, or war, equally by the meaning as by the rendering of that meaning in percepts--and concepts--constructs and words--within one and the same verse at one and the same time" (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 95).

appeal is largely to the mind,¹¹² to "an attitude of contemplation and departure from worldly involvement."¹¹³

Before leaving the Islamic setting, some reference should be made to how Sūfism, "the mystical current within Islām,"¹¹⁴ uses music in worship. Sūfism's search for mystical union with the divine¹¹⁵ as a goal of religious worship has resulted in much less care being taken to maintain "the clear distinction between the transcendent and the natural realms."¹¹⁶ Consequently, the Sūfī have highly esteemed music and dance as a means of attaining divine ecstasy in their dhikr ceremonies.¹¹⁷

¹¹²This should not be taken to mean that Islamic arts fail to touch the emotions. As Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī pointed out: "Islamic literature and music certainly aroused emotion in the listener, but in its best examples, it avoided depicting examples or instances of specific moods or emotions" (Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Aesthetic Expression," 194). The emotion aroused is a response to what the mind hears, not what the music portrays.

¹¹³Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 28.

¹¹⁴Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 179.

¹¹⁵Parrinder, Worship in the World's Religions, 203. See also van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 62. For a description of how the dhikr ceremony is used to achieve the ecstasy of this experience, see Seyyed Hossein Nasr, "Sūfism and the Integration of Man," in The Ways of Religion, ed. Roger Eastman (San Francisco, Canfield Press, 1975), 482.

Gilbert Rouget distinguished between the "'communal' trance" achieved by the practice of dhikr and the possession experience of African tribal religion, seeing the former as "an encounter . . . a communion, a revelation, or an illumination" rather than an embodiment of or personality merger with Allah which would be impossible in Islām (Gilbert Rouget, Music and Trance: A Theory of the Relations between Music and Possession, trans. and rev. by Brunhilde Biebuyck [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985], 26). He suggested that "nonidentificatory trance inspiration or communion trance appears to be characteristic of Islām, Christianity, and Judaism. In other words, it seems to be linked with the logic of religions of transcendence. It nonetheless signals the presence of a divinity. It is an epiphany, and in this respect it should be ranked along side possession" (ibid., 28).

¹¹⁶Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 179.

¹¹⁷See Duncan B. Macdonald, "Emotional Religion in Islām as Affected by Music and Singing," Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland (1901): 195-252, 707-748 and (1902): 1-28; Farmer, "The Music of Islām," 441; Shiloah, "The Dimension of

Though still exhibiting some common structural features, other characteristics provide a marked contrast to the sound art utilized in the orthodox Islamic worship setting. These include the use of instruments, pronounced rhythmic communal chanting, the developmental intensification of dynamic level and the gradual increase of tempo reaching toward distinct climaxes marked by strong physical and emotional involvement (exemplified in frenzied dance movement and rasping vocal sound).¹¹⁸ Sūfī worship provides an alluring comparison with its parent religious heritage as well as a phenomenological link with a belief system where the indisputable focus is divine immanence.

African Ritual Music and the Immanent
View of God

There is general agreement that traditional African societies are controlled by a strong, religiously oriented worldview. In the introduction to African Religions and Philosophy, John S. Mbiti wrote:

Africans are notoriously religious. . . . Religion permeates into all the departments of life so fully that it is not easy or possible always to isolate it. A study of these religious systems is, therefore, ultimately a study of the people's themselves in all the complexities of both traditional and modern life. . . . To ignore these traditional beliefs, attitudes and practices can only lead to a lack of understanding [of] African behavior and problems. Religion is the strongest element in traditional background, and exerts probably the greatest influence upon the thinking and living of the people concerned.¹¹⁹

Sound," 168, 169; and Annemarie Schimmel, "Aspects of Mystical Thought in Islām," in The Islamic Impact, ed. Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, Byron Haines and Ellison Findly (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1984), 132.

¹¹⁸Rouget, Music and Trance, 266, 271-272 and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "Dance as an Expression of Islamic Culture," 12. Sūfism also countenances departure from total abstraction by incorporating the literally symbolic into their artistic expressions (Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 172).

¹¹⁹John S. Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy (London: Heinemann, 1969), 1. See also Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 34.

One of the telling evidences of religion's influence on traditional African culture is the manifestation of its art forms. The relationship between traditional arts and religion has been described as organic¹²⁰ with the arts articulating and objectifying the ultimate reality at the religion's core.¹²¹

As was found in the study of Islamic sacred sound art, however, criticism has been levelled at some Western scholars who have failed to understand African music from this African perspective, thereby contributing to misapprehensions regarding its nature.¹²² However, particularly in the latter half of the twentieth century, a body of what appears to be more widely accepted and reliable research has been assembled. This material strives to be true to the African perception of music, both in Africa and in the African diaspora.¹²³ The following synthesis is based on that research.

The Traditional African View of God

Practically all traditional African religions hold in common the concept of a Supreme Being or God who is conceived as the transcendent creator of the universe. However, this Being is considered to be removed from everyday human existence, playing only

¹²⁰Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 35. See also *ibid.*, 32; and Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 94.

¹²¹For example, Chernoff observed that: "Africans use music and the other arts to articulate and objectify their philosophical and moral systems, systems which they do not abstract but which they build into the music-making situation itself" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 37).

¹²²See Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 31-32.

¹²³The term "African diaspora" is used to include peoples of African descent in North and South America and the Caribbean. See Albert J. Raboteau, Slave Religion: The "Invisible Institution" in the Antebellum South (New York: Oxford University Press, 1978), 3-42; and Jon Michael Spencer, Protest and Praise: Sacred Music of Black Religion (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1990), 135.

a minor role, if any, in human affairs.¹²⁴ Thus, He is a subject more for philosophical thought and speculation¹²⁵ than worship. The main focus of worship is directed toward natural manifestations or personifications of Him and lesser spiritual beings and forces who owe their existence to the Supreme God, yet function as powerful entities in themselves as well as intermediaries¹²⁶ between Him and humankind.

These gods, of whom there are many, are believed to relate intimately to everyday African experience. Associated with the forces of nature and human ancestors,¹²⁷ they are conceived as omnipresent spirits that have a vested interest in human affairs.¹²⁸ Devotion and appeals for help are addressed to them. Their powers of control over nature and their acquaintance and frequent interaction with human beings "means that their requirements must be cared for as continuously and conscientiously as the other practical

¹²⁴See J. H. Kwabena Nketia, "Musical Interaction in Ritual Events," in Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989), 112; Mircea Eliade, The Sacred and the Profane: The Nature of Religion, trans. Willard R. Trask (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1959), 123-124; Robert W. Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igede," in More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 97; Geoffrey Parrinder, "The Nature of God in African Belief," in The Ways of Religion, ed. Roger Eastman (San Francisco: Canfield Press, 1975), 493; and Deren, Divine Horsemen, 55.

¹²⁵Nketia, "Musical Interaction in Ritual Events," 113.

¹²⁶Ibid., 112; Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 75-91; Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igede," 97. Parrinder observed that while there are many temples, priests, sacrifices, and prayers for the gods and ancestors, there are none for the supreme God (Parrinder, "The Nature of God in African Belief," 498).

¹²⁷Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 54-55; and Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igede," 97.

¹²⁸Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igede," 98. In the broadest sense, the ancestors are "the myriads of psyches of all those who have lived and died," who are now "continually watching over their kindred and influencing their lives" because they "have a vested interest in perpetuating their lineage" (ibid., 97, 98).

needs of life."¹²⁹ They are considered to be "as close as personal intimate friends--or enemies"¹³⁰ with attendant, often capricious, personalities.

Using the Ewe of Ghana as an example, Amoaku described traditional African cosmology, indicating that "the invisible world of spirit, the world of man, and the visible world of nature form an indivisible unit; that the visible world of nature is the reflection of the true invisible world of spirit." He continued: "There is but one life that manifests itself at all levels throughout the three worlds."¹³¹ This description of the continuous nature of reality,¹³² of which the divine level is the ultimate or the "true" portion that the others reflect, positively places the traditional African conception of the divine in Clouser's pagan category.¹³³

In harmony with traditional African religion's focus on divine immanence, worship ritual upholds possession by a deity "as the supreme religious experience."¹³⁴ Called "the outstanding

¹²⁹Melville J. Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past (Boston: Beacon Press, 1958), 214.

¹³⁰Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 53.

¹³¹Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 34. See also Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 57; and Jan Knappert, "The Religions of Africa," in The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson (New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982), 227, 228.

¹³²This still holds even for the conception of the Supreme Being. For example, in Nigerian Igbo society the Supreme God is depicted as "clear, blue sky"--still part of the indivisible unity of the three levels (Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igbo," 98).

¹³³This also fits Sire's list of commonly held notions among pagan religions (Sire, The Universe Next Door, 166-167).

¹³⁴Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 215. Gerad Béhague observed that the purpose of almost all ceremonies in Afro-Brazilian cults "is to provoke the coming of the gods among the believers which is manifested by possession" (Gerad Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," The World of Music 19 [1977]: 6). See also Nketia's comment that the character of worship in Akan societies is the same on all occasions

manifestation of West African religion,"¹³⁵ possession (as an organized activity) occurs only in public worship and is considered to be a social phenomenon in which the worshipper "merges his identity in that of the god, losing control of his conscious faculties and knowing nothing of what he does until he comes to himself."¹³⁶ Describing the process, Herskovits wrote:

As a rule possession comes on at some ceremony where a follower of a god is moved by the singing, dancing, and drumming of a group of which he is a member; the god 'comes to his head,' he loses consciousness, becomes the deity, and until his release dances or performs after the fashion of the spirit who has taken possession of him.¹³⁷

The actual moment of cranial penetration by the deity has been observed to manifest diverse symptoms, "from accidental swooning or

except at festivals when it may be protracted and combined with display (J. H. Kwabena Nketia, Drumming: In Akan Communities of Ghana [London: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1963], 97).

¹³⁵Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 215. Béhague termed it "the primordial act" (Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 6).

¹³⁶Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 215. See also Daphne D. Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," in More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 59.

¹³⁷Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 215. Harrison described common manifestations in possession ceremonies as including "movement in dance-like form which becomes increasingly agitated, erratic, and jerky, sometimes approaching the convulsive; a glazed expression; unusual sounds or archaic language; and sometimes bodily prostration" (Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 56). See also Nketia's delineation of six stages in such rituals quoted in *ibid.*, 59; a description of candomblé ritual by Ramos quoted in David B. Welch, "A Yoruba/Nagô 'Melotype' for Religious Songs in the African Diaspora: Continuity of West African Praise Song in the New World," in More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 150; Robert Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society: The Shona," The World of Music 18 (1976): 12; and Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 61.

fainting to violent explosions accompanied by classic convulsions."¹³⁸ The controlling deity can often be identified "for the adept starts acting out the spirit's appropriate gestures and movements."¹³⁹ In short, aided by music and dance, the worshipper becomes the worshipped spirit.¹⁴⁰

The significance of possession experiences rests not only in the fact of divine visitation and intimate identification with deity (frequently spoken of in terms of the deity mounting or riding the adept), but also because they are considered prime opportunities for communicating with deities or spirit beings.¹⁴¹ Unquestionably, this phenomenon highlights the strong emphasis on immanence in the conception of deity in traditional African religions.

The Relationship of Traditional African Belief and Aesthetic Consciousness

The distant and incomprehensible transcendence of the supreme being in contrast with the apparently tangible immanence of the lesser gods in traditional African conceptions of divinity undoubtedly has contributed to the lesser beings' frequent portrayal

¹³⁸Béahgue, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 7. See also Deren's description of her own possession experience in Divine Horsemen, 256-262.

¹³⁹Veit Erlmann, "Trance and Music in the Hausa Bòorii Spirit Possession Cult in Niger." Ethnomusicology 26 (January 1982): 50. Lekis' observations of Haitian dance confirmed this (Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 190).

¹⁴⁰Erlmann, "Trance and Music in the Hausa Bòorii Spirit Possession Cult in Niger," 55, 56. Although not to be equated in all respects with this type of possession experience, it is interesting to note the conceptual and implemental similarity in Hindu worship that confirms the link in immanental orientation between the pagan and pantheist categories. Menon wrote: "Art is an apparatus of worship to achieve identical consciousness in the worshipper and the deity. There is a well-known saying that the deity can be worshipped only in so far as the worshipper becomes the deity" (Menon, "Interdisciplinary Research," 68).

¹⁴¹Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 12.

in mythology and creativity.¹⁴² Their extraordinary behavior, "their capacity for good and evil, their frequent interaction with human beings, their hierarchical structures, roles and functions, and the supernatural ways in which they reveal themselves"¹⁴³ is the focus of aesthetic expression. However, the aesthetic ramifications of this focus are much deeper than a superficial interest in exciting story-line content. The entire gamut of what is aesthetically valued in content, form, and artistic presentation is influenced, even controlled, by the understanding of these deities.

The framework that relates traditional African belief and aesthetic consciousness includes the following six components:

1. Pluralism: Belief in a multiplicity of spirits (each with their individual personalities) has been cogently related to the profound pluralism of African sensibility.¹⁴⁴ Respected as "a source of vitality,"¹⁴⁵ the pluralistic understanding of ultimate reality is reflected both in the extensive participation in artistic events¹⁴⁶ as well as in the structure of the arts themselves.¹⁴⁷

¹⁴²Nketia, "Musical Interaction in Ritual Events," 114.

¹⁴³Ibid.

¹⁴⁴Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 155.

¹⁴⁵Ibid., 158.

¹⁴⁶The pluralistic nature of the participation is highlighted in Chernoff's explanation of polyrhythmic music performance: "The aesthetic requirement of participation . . . is the ability to stand back from the rhythms of the scene and find an additional rhythm which compliments and mediates those other rhythms" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 125). In other words, in an African musical event "the values represent not an integrity from which we are moving away, but rather an integrity which, with understanding, we might approach" (ibid., 156).

¹⁴⁷See Alan Merriam, "Music--Bridge to the Supernatural," Tomorrow 5 (1957): 66. Significantly, Chernoff also noted: "There is a clear parallel, certainly, between the aesthetic conception of multiple rhythms in music and the religious conception of multiple forces in the world" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 156).

In the traditional African mindset there is evidence that multifaceted diversity is valued above perfect synchrony.¹⁴⁸

2. Naturalism: Naturalism is a major, overarching component in traditional African aesthetic consciousness.¹⁴⁹ It has been observed that in traditional religions where "the celestial supreme being appears to have lost religious currency," the focus of "religious experience becomes more concrete, that is, more intimately connected with life."¹⁵⁰ As Paul Bohannan succinctly observed of the Tiv of Nigeria: "In their religion they are far more interested in the Creation than in the Creator."¹⁵¹ It is not surprising that the gods are identified with aspects of nature, and interest in nature and experience of the natural realm is prodigious.¹⁵²

¹⁴⁸See Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 125; and Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 3.

¹⁴⁹The next four points are essentially extrapolations of naturalism.

¹⁵⁰See Eliade, The Sacred and the Profane, 125-126. In confirmation of this, Mbiti contended that African ontology is "extremely anthropocentric . . . in the sense that everything is seen in terms of its relation to man" (Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 16). Interestingly, Eliade also suggested that increased interest in the natural realm and self-centered discovery precipitates the conception of remoteness of the supreme being (Eliade, The Sacred and the Profane, 125-126).

¹⁵¹Paul Bohannan, "Artist and Critic in an African Society," in The Many Faces of Primitive Art, ed. Douglas Fraser (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1966), 248.

¹⁵²Preoccupation with nature and human life was insightfully related to the accompanying emphasis on divine immanence by Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī. He wrote: "Immanence requires the natural, the concrete and empirical because it is a dimension of it. It does not shun the concrete because it is an idealization of the natural; and without the natural it cannot be reached" (Isma'il Al Fārūqī, "Divine Transcendence and Its Expression," in The Global Congress of the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson [New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982], 299).

A significant corollary of this outlook is the equation of natural experience with spiritual experience.¹⁵³ This has been observed in the regular paralleling of sexual and spiritual experiences.¹⁵⁴ However, it is also apparent in the aesthetic realm. As Kebede wrote:

It is clear why music is closely related to religion in almost all African cultures. Music helps us to pass into other realms of consciousness. The heightened feeling enhanced by musical experience is aligned with spirituality and the other world.¹⁵⁵

Lekis commented similarly regarding dance when she wrote: "Although ritualistic in origin, religious ecstasy becomes an end in itself, and dance is the medium by means of which ecstasy can be achieved; it is the road that leads to the gods."¹⁵⁶ Such equating of natural experience with spiritual experience leaves room for considerable subjective interpretation.

3. Realism: Traditional African religions have a predilection toward realism rather than idealism.¹⁵⁷ As Mbiti

¹⁵³"African peoples 'see' that invisible universe when they look at, hear or feel the visible and tangible world" (Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 57).

¹⁵⁴See Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 64, 67-68; Henry Moore; quoted in Bolam and Henderson, Art and Belief, 100; and I. M. Lewis, Ecstatic Religion: An Anthropological Study of Spirit Possession and Shamanism (Baltimore, Md.: Penguin Books, 1971), 58-64.

¹⁵⁵Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 94. Compare also Abraham D. Cáceres, "In Xochitl, In Cuicatl: Hallucinogens and Music in Mesoamerican Amerindian Thought" (Ph.D. dissertation, Indiana University, 1984), 138-139.

¹⁵⁶Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 60.

¹⁵⁷Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 157. Mbiti wrote: "To live here and now is the most important concern of African religious activities and beliefs. There is little, if any, concern with the distinctly spiritual welfare of man apart from his physical life. No line is drawn between the spiritual and the physical. Even life in the hereafter is conceived in materialistic and physical terms" (Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 4-5).

observed: "Man's acts of worship and turning to god are pragmatic and utilitarian rather than spiritual or mystical."¹⁵⁸

4. Interaction: Traditional African worship consists much less of contemplation, than of interaction¹⁵⁹ with the forces of nature. The vital point of public worship is that "both the gods and the worshippers participate."¹⁶⁰ The elements of the entire ritual event are carefully orchestrated "to attain the central purpose of the rituals--a visit from the god(s)."¹⁶¹ Among some tribes active physical involvement in the form of dance is perceived as virtually compelling the gods to descend and manifest themselves.¹⁶²

5. Aural-Tactile Emphasis: Traditional African religion's deemphasis of the contemplative, philosophical, and abstract¹⁶³ in

¹⁵⁸Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 5. See also *ibid.*, 67.

¹⁵⁹Nketia, "Musical Interaction in Ritual Events," 113. This is born out in Jane Ellen Harrison's observation that ritual action, rather than prayers to and prostration before an unseen god, typifies traditional tribal religion (Jane Ellen Harrison, Ancient Art and Ritual [New York: Greenwood Press, 1969], 30). See also Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 81, 184-185; and Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 58.

¹⁶⁰Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 55.

¹⁶¹*Ibid.*, 63.

¹⁶²N. S. Fiagbedzi; quoted in *ibid.*, 61.

¹⁶³Mbiti noted that: "Broadly speaking, Africa thought forms are more concrete than abstract" (Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 30). He also observed that concretized realism is very evident in the African concept of time. He wrote: "According to traditional concepts, time is a two-dimensional phenomenon with a long past, a present, and virtually no future. The linear concept of time is Western thought, with an indefinite past, present, and infinite future is practically foreign to African thinking. The future is virtually absent because events which lie in it have not taken place, they have not been realized and cannot, therefore, constitute time. . . . Time has to be experienced in order to make sense or to become real" (*ibid.*, 17). See also *ibid.*, 15-23.

favor of nature-bound,¹⁶⁴ concretized realism and action has been related to an "aural-tactile emphasis" in sense perception that contrasts sharply to the "aural-visual emphasis" so overwhelmingly prevalent in Western civilization.¹⁶⁵

6. Psychic Energy/Intuition: In traditional African religion, major emphasis is placed on "the importance of psychic energy and the development of the individual's intuition" rather than mere intellectual growth.¹⁶⁶

The theologically spawned interest in nature and the experience of nature highlighted in the last five points are revealed in the affinity shown for certain art forms--music, dance,

¹⁶⁴Reid pointed out that "a high degree of naturalism excludes a co-existent abstractionism" (Reid, Art and Society, 31).

¹⁶⁵Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 10. Although Kauffman initially made this point about the Shona, he acknowledged that "the nature of their perceptive processes and the ecstatic aspects of their music making are probably shared by other African groups" (ibid., 14). This point is not intended to suggest a lack of visual sense perception in African culture, rather it indicates an emphasis that has been accorded some validity in contradistinction to the Western emphasis.

By way of further explanation of the significance of the contrast in perception emphasis between Africa and the West, it is evident that the African interest in the tactile sense demonstrates preference for "contact" rather than "distance" receptors, and this coincides with the inclination to concretized realism and action. For Africans, the sensuous immediacy of emotional "feeling" is more valuable than intellectual "insight." Examining Western notions of aesthetics, Arnold Berleant suggested that "since the organs of sight and hearing are distance receptors, detachment from direct contact with the physical may be retained. . . . The other senses call attention to the body, so destroying the isolation of the contemplative mind" (Arnold Berleant, "The Sensuous and the Sensual in Aesthetics," Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 23 [1964]: 186-187). Kauffman added that the West's de-emphasis of the tactile sense renders it possible, even "necessary for the Western world to make primarily intellectual rather than emotional decisions about the artistic process" (Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 10). Perhaps this aural-visual emphasis in the West is itself evidence of a worldview-induced understanding of epistemology implanted by the Christian appeal to revelation as a source of knowledge in which searching or reading and hearing the Word is considered key to the discovery of truth. (Compare Rom 10:17 with John 5:39, 2 Tim 2:15, and 2 Tim 3:15, 16.)

¹⁶⁶Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 33.

and drama. These arts (often used in combination) engender a more direct physical and emotional experience than do intellectually mediated art forms such as literature.¹⁶⁷ Nketia explained that

although purely contemplative music, which is not designed for dance or drama, is practiced in African societies in restricted contexts, the cultivation of music that is integrated with dance, or music that stimulates affective motor response, is much more prevalent. For the African, the musical experience is by and large an emotional one: sounds, however beautiful, are meaningless if they do not offer this experience or contribute to the expressive quality of a performance.¹⁶⁸

Because psycho-physiological experience is identified with spiritual experience, affective motor response and multi-sense-stimulated¹⁶⁹ emotional experience are esteemed; and this, in turn, determines what is aesthetically valued--what is considered excellent and beautiful.¹⁷⁰

¹⁶⁷Berleant designated theater, dance, music, and sculpture as arts "acknowledged to have a strong tendency to decrease distance" in perception. His emphasis on their sensuous immediacy corresponds with the above-mentioned aural-tactile orientation (Berleant, "The Sensuous and Sensual in Aesthetics," 188).

Further, Honigsheim observed that Western culture's more recent inclination to turn away from rationalism and intellectualism" is obvious in an increasing emphasis on nature and emotion and a focus on body rhythm and movement (Honigsheim, Music and Society, 230). See also *ibid.*, 35, 204-205.

¹⁶⁸J. H. Kwabena Nketia, The Music of Africa (London: Victor Gollancz, 1975), 206. See also Kauffman's comment that: "The human [response] aspects of music making take on special significance" in Africa (Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 9).

¹⁶⁹See John Kennedy's description of the Zar ceremony that induces possession trance among the Nubians (from Sudan and Egypt) by "all the sensory systems being stimulated simultaneously" (John Kennedy in James Porter et al., "Trance, Music, and Music/Trance Relations: A Symposium," Pacific Review of Ethnomusicology 4 [1987]: 9). See also *ibid.*, 6-9. Compare Nketia, The Music of Africa, 244; and Cáceres, "In Xochitl, In Cuicatl," 132-133.

¹⁷⁰In this regard Chernoff noted: "Excellence arises when the combination of rhythms is translated into meaningful action" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 111). Again, this emphasis on movement rather than aural impressions--the dancers use "the earth the same way that the drummers use the membrane of a drum"--furnishes evidence for the tactile orientation in traditional African thinking (Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 10-11). A further point of interest in this regard is that in Igbo vocabulary there is no word that refers to music exclusive of dance (Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in

Thus, the arts have been deliberately shaped¹⁷¹ to facilitate the experience of emotional and kinesthetic involvement that is actively pursued by worshippers seeking divine contact.¹⁷² Further, because the symbolic/dramatic portrayal of the deities is vital to the ritual ceremony, the music is "predetermined" by this goal.¹⁷³ In that the dancers' movements must represent the deity, the rhythms that control the dancers¹⁷⁴ must facilitate the correct movements. Hence, especially in the ritual worship setting, a "chain of causality" is set up to achieve specific experiential ends.

It has been observed that African religions are "danced faiths,"¹⁷⁵ in which worship is transformed into a style of movement giving visible form to the music.¹⁷⁶ However, dance is not merely

Igede," 99).

¹⁷¹The element of deliberate choice was also noted by Robert Farris Thompson in his discussion of the "dominance of a percussive concept of performance" in traditional African music and dance. He maintained that this characteristic "has to do with aesthetic choices and not the inevitable use of a drum" (Robert Farris Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool: West African Dance," African Forum 2 [Fall 1966]: 88).

¹⁷²Rouget, Music and Trance, 117-118. See also Merriam, The Anthropology of Music, 224. In Shona society it is said that kudzamirwa (meaning "to be deeply moved"), which is equated with the feeling of ecstasy, "must be present in any religious music . . . regardless of whether or not possession occurs" (Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 13).

It is noteworthy, however, that the overt search for stimulation and excitement in ritual events has been traditionally tempered by the ancient, indigenous ideal of the "cool"--a sense of decorum, patience, and collectedness of mind that seeks to avoid total disintegration into disorder and abandonment (Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool," 85-86; and Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 105-106).

¹⁷³See Nketia's explanation in The Music of Africa, 206.

¹⁷⁴*Ibid.*, 210.

¹⁷⁵*Ibid.*, 85. See also Marion Joseph Franklin, "The Relationship of Black Preaching to Black Gospel Music" (Ph.D. dissertation, Drew University, 1982), 88.

¹⁷⁶Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 144.

movement for its own sake or effects. It is symbolic action intended to communicate specific messages. Such use of explicit and literal symbolism¹⁷⁷ is further evidence of African interest in the natural.

The expression of religious dance as a symbolic portrayal of the personality characteristics of specific deities has already been alluded to above. Harrison indicated that when a particular spirit's characteristics are manifested during a ritual, the expectations of worshippers are fulfilled.¹⁷⁸ She went on to explain that "if the spirit is warlike the movements will incorporate those gestures; if it is an animal then its form, movements, and sounds will be similar."¹⁷⁹ Sometimes the legendary life of the deity is dramatized.¹⁸⁰

Even the music itself is perceived as symbolic. Amoaku maintained that "indisputable, traditional African music is psychologically and symbolically, rather than mathematically and structurally conceived."¹⁸¹ He called African music "the phonic

¹⁷⁷These are the first two of three levels of aesthetic-symbolic statements suggested by Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī in "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts," 169. Explicit symbolism in this context would apply to overtly imitative actions, whereas literal symbolism would comprise abbreviated, kinetic "clues" that substitute for larger, intellectual ideas.

¹⁷⁸Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 55-56.

¹⁷⁹Ibid., 56. See also van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 16.

¹⁸⁰Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 84. See also *ibid.*, 91, 191-195.

¹⁸¹Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 33.

expression of psychic experiences" and the symbolic "expression and validation of psychic energy."¹²

Musical instruments are also potent symbols, pregnant with meaning. Sue Carole DeVale explained:

The names for parts of instruments may simultaneously symbolize both social and musical hierarchies. Each part of an instrument may be considered a physical part of the spirit embodied within it; its music, the voice of that spirit. Or an instrument, or even an entire ensemble may be manifestations of cosmological concepts.¹³

Likewise, dramatic elements such as "costume, paraphernalia, acting and scenery"¹⁴ are symbols of perceptions of reality.

It should be noted, however, that the emphasis in the type of symbolism utilized is not so much implicit (as in the Islamic arts) as explicit and literal, and generally tied to naturalistic interpretation. Again, there is ample evidence of preference for realism rather than idealism, action rather than contemplation, the aural-tactile emphasis in perception, and psychic energy rather than intellectual apprehension.

Last, it should be noted that cultures influenced by traditional African religions exhibit a similar general aesthetic consistency apparent in Muslim cultures. Despite some diversity in the details of aesthetic practice, there is a perceptible coalescence in aspects of style, practice, and usage¹⁵ that

¹²Ibid., 37. Ellen B. Basso's description of Brazilian Kalapalo Indian ritual music provided a significant comparison from a similar religious orientation (Ellen B. Basso, A Musical View of the Universe [Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1985], 8).

¹³Sue Carole DeVale, "Power and Meaning in Musical Instruments," in Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989), 107. See also Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 96-100; Ter Ellingson, "Drums," The New Encyclopedia of Religion, 1987, 4:494-503; Nketia, The Music of Africa, 26; and idem, African Gods and Music, 9.

¹⁴Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 54, 55.

¹⁵Nketia, The Music of Africa, 4.

encapsulates "essential" worldview-controlled tenets. For example, in his study of the Igbo of Nigeria, Nicholls noted that certain musical characteristics consistently connected different cultural groups. Significantly, he explained: "This musical diffusion over vast areas is not surprising since the Igbo share many religious traditions with their neighbors."¹⁸⁶ Similarly, Nketia observed that indigenous African musical traditions as a whole are not "mutually exclusive traditions or style clusters, but . . . a network of overlapping styles which share common features of structure, basic procedures and similar contextual relations."¹⁸⁷

The same perception has also been found to be true of the music of the African diaspora. In this connection, Ronald R. Smith wrote:

It is becoming more and more evident to scholars that within the diversity that characterizes musical styles of Black societies in the Americas, there exists a unity, which is far more important. Common aesthetic values and a striking similarity in performance techniques, overall style, and expressive focus predominate, even though regional and structural differences seem to separate various groups.¹⁸⁸

For Smith, focusing on this unity was a means of acquiring a broader understanding of "Blacks as a group in the Americas."¹⁸⁹ In the context of ritual music, recognition of this unity is particularly significant.

¹⁸⁶Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igbo," 96.

¹⁸⁷Nketia, The Music of Africa, 241.

¹⁸⁸Ronald R. Smith, "They Sing with the Voice of the Drum: Afro-Panamanian Musical Traditions," in More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 163.

¹⁸⁹Ibid. The link between traditions on both sides of the Atlantic is increasingly evident. See Joseph G. Moore, "Music and Dance as Expressions of Religious Worship in Jamaica," in African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg (Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982), 265. See also Barrett, The Rastafarians, 246; Spencer, Protest and Praise, 140-150; and Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 4.

Immanent Deities and Ritual Music Style

The integral connection between music and religion in traditional African culture is rendered unmistakable by the vigorous response of the gods and spirits to music set aside for them. Indeed, to perform such music "is to invite their attention and active presence,"¹⁹⁰ and thus to provide the desired worship experience for believers. As Nketia claimed: "The most compelling reason for music making in Africa derives from religious experience."¹⁹¹

Elaborating on the implications of this affinity between the gods and music, Nketia stated:

The concept of the gods as music-loving gods shows itself in the social control of music (through the application of religious sanctions) and in the choice of musical medium. It also results in the creation of musical types appropriate for the worship of each god or pantheon of gods, and in the building up of a repertoire of songs and dances through which they can be reached.¹⁹²

He also noted that various gods "cannot be reached except by the music and the form of worship to which they are accustomed."¹⁹³ In fact, the gods are known to object to the singing of particular songs and to show displeasure with slipshod or unanimated performances.¹⁹⁴ They are also known to bring new songs and themes to worshippers,¹⁹⁵ and to indicate preferences regarding the scheduling of musical activities.¹⁹⁶

¹⁹⁰Nketia, "Musical Interaction in Ritual Events," 115.

¹⁹¹J. H. Kwabena Nketia, "Music and Religion in Sub-Saharan Africa," The Encyclopedia of Religion, (1987), 10:172-176.

¹⁹²Nketia, African Gods and Music, 1.

¹⁹³Ibid.

¹⁹⁴Nketia, "Music and Religion in Sub-Saharan African," 172.

¹⁹⁵Ibid.

¹⁹⁶Nketia, The Music of Africa, 27.

The relationship between music and religion is so strong that individual cults and their deities can be distinguished not only by their beliefs and rituals, but also by their musical organization.¹⁹⁷ Such musical differentiation includes the use of distinctive rhythmic patterns and chants, as well as particular instruments for the worship of specific deities.¹⁹⁸

Summarizing his observations about traditional African worship music, Nketia wrote: "The music for worshipping the gods is almost everywhere special music held in particular esteem."¹⁹⁹ Significantly, for him this illustrated "a fundamental principle that appears to underlie the use of music in worship: namely, the selection, use and control of musical forms and instruments in accordance with the conceptualization of the gods or of individual focus of worship."²⁰⁰

Interestingly, Nketia also indicated that the music used in the worship of a particular deity was not solely designed for the deity's pleasure. It also "offers a point of attraction to those who become devotees of their cults."²⁰¹ As Harrison noted:

The rhythms of machetes and drums not only entice the spirit to wage war or to dance, but also provide pleasure for the women and children who add counterpoints with taunts and cries. The great attention given to form and style in dancing may be overtly aimed at pleasing the spirit, but it also pleases the community.²⁰²

¹⁹⁷Nketia, African Gods and Music, 2.

¹⁹⁸See *ibid.*, 3-11; Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 7 and 9; and Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 96, 98.

¹⁹⁹Nketia, African Gods and Music, 2.

²⁰⁰*Ibid.*, 11-12. Nketia noted that the manner of worship associated with a god as well as the social context are also closely related influences (*ibid.*, 12).

²⁰¹*Ibid.*, 2.

²⁰²Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 57.

Additionally, the prevalent use of motor response in African ritual music "intensifies . . . enjoyment of music through the feelings of increased involvement and the propulsion that articulating the beat by physical movement generates."³³ The coincidence of pleasure and worship in which the music and dance in a cult's worship attracts prospective as well as established adherents provides a good example of how the immanent concept of merging natural human experience and religious experience manifests itself in an anthropocentric orientation³⁴ in the worship setting.³⁵ Thus (as an extension of the equation of natural experience with spiritual experience), what the individual interprets as an enjoyable, moving experience is simultaneously embraced as a legitimate spiritual experience.

Frequently it has been observed that in traditional African culture "there is no formal distinction between the sacred and the secular."³⁶ While generally this is true, in the musical context this needs some qualification. For example, some musical instruments are considered sacred and are used only in the worship setting.³⁷ Each god has its own rhythms to which mediums are sensitized during initiation³⁸ and which are not used with impunity

³³Nketia, The Music of Africa, 207.

³⁴Compare Mbiti's comment regarding the "extremely anthropocentric" orientation of African ontology (Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 15-16).

³⁵There are exceptions to this merging of religion and pleasure. For example, Harrison observed: "Among the Anlo-Ewe people of Ghana who belong to the Yeve cult, Thunder-God . . . music is performed only to meet a religious need rather than for pleasure" (Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 61).

³⁶Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 2; and Collins, "Editorial," 4.

³⁷See Nketia, African Gods and Music, 9; Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 85-86; and Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 96.

³⁸Harrison, "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 61.

outside the sacred context.²⁰⁹ Further, "the music for a rite, a ceremony, or festival may not normally be performed in another context unless there is some special reason for doing so."²¹⁰ Thus, there is a distinction between the sacred and the non-sacred. But, because all of life is lived in the purview of the gods, consciousness of their preferences is never eclipsed. Thus, to some extent, even the secular has imbibed characteristics akin to the sacred which has contributed to the apparent blurring of the distinction.

This is made manifest in a discernable hierarchy of music in traditional African culture, reminiscent of Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī's construction in the Islamic context. In discussing the music of the Ewe of Ghana, Amoaku explained that even though all of their music reflects the Ewe worldview, the role that a musical type plays in society reveals "the degree to which a particular musical activity involves the gods or spirits. . . . A ritually restricted musical activity therefore, is one which occupies the uppermost level of the society."²¹¹ This would seem to indicate that in traditional African music, as in the Islamic context, ritual music is at the pinnacle.

Nketia supported this notion when he wrote:

Because sacred music is held in high esteem, the borrowing and adaption of instruments or musical items of particular aesthetic or verbal interest occurs now and then in the music performed in the public domain. While in the past this was done with discretion, social change now seems to have opened the door to conscious exploitation of the aesthetic potential of sacred music, both in traditional music practice and in the new forms of African popular and art music. The reverse process, whereby traditional sacred music is influenced by secular music, does not

²⁰⁹Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 37.

²¹⁰Nketia, The Music of Africa, 26.

²¹¹Amoaku, "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music," 35-36.

seem to be common, although a few notable examples can be cited.²¹²

The indication of a general directional flow of influence seems significant here. While sacred music is rarely or minimally influenced, it influences the levels of musical art beneath it. Kauffman, in his description of Zimbabwean Shona music, provided further evidence:

As a whole, most Shona music is probably more ecstatic than is most Western music, and the Shona trance music represents the extreme aspects of ecstasy with all Shona music sharing some aspects of that extreme.²¹³

Caribbean reggae music (a secular genre) is also acknowledged to be "an imitation of the Rastafarian religious drumming known as Nyabingi music."²¹⁴

Clearly, ritual music--the music that embodies the influence of religious conceptions about deity--is considered to be a stylistic standard bearer.²¹⁵ Understandings about deities have become determinants of style that have filtered down through the entire musical hierarchy as common characteristics, erasing or diffusing sacred/secular distinctions.

The actual musical repertoire of the possession ritual includes an array of "songs and instrumental pieces or sound events that function as codes or signals for indicating divine presence or for inviting undivided attention."²¹⁶ A wide variety of resources affects the desired changes of mood in worship. These include both simple and complex music, in strict and free rhythms. Some solo

²¹²Nketia, "Music and Religion in Sub-Saharan Africa," 174.

²¹³Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 12.

²¹⁴Barrett, The Rastafarians, 245.

²¹⁵By contrast, Nketia indicated that "recreational music . . . is more subject to [stylistic] change and innovation than any other category of music" (Nketia, The Music of Africa, 240).

²¹⁶Nketia, "Music and Religion in Sub-Saharan Africa," 172.

chants using special vocal techniques, besides the more prevalent specialized groups and leader/congregation combinations using call-response patterns, can be heard. The songs and chants may be accompanied or unaccompanied. Instrumental music is also used in its own right; in fact "it is the instrumental ensemble that provides the required energy levels for movement expression and more especially for trance and spirit possession."²¹⁷ In a performance, vocal music, instrumental music, and dance are all combined.²¹⁸

Congruent with the emphasis on concretized realism and action in African aesthetic consciousness, it appears that performance-generated experience rather than theoretical-content considerations have substantially guided ritual music formation. The following presentation of stylistic features is arranged accordingly.

Characteristics of Performance

Practice: Percussive

Multi-dimensional Emphasis

Percussive quality

The most prominent characteristic of traditional African musical performance is its percussive quality. Designated a "percussive musical diction"²¹⁹ that is evident in the use of the voice²²⁰ and body movement,²²¹ as well as the selection of instruments, this characteristic has wide applicability. "The dominance of a percussive concept of performance"²²² in African

²¹⁷Ibid., 173.

²¹⁸Ibid.

²¹⁹Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool," 88.

²²⁰Smith, "They Sing with the Voice of the Drum," 173.

²²¹Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool," 89-90.

²²²This phrase is attributed to Merriam in Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool," 88.

music has been attributed to a distinct bias toward this quality of sound and style in the African aesthetic. As Nketia observed:

It would seem . . . that an examination of the aesthetics of African music reveals a distinct bias toward percussion and the use of percussive techniques, not only because of the structural functions of such instruments, but also because of a preference for musical textures that embody percussive sounds or sounds that increase the ratio of noise to pitch.²³

Performance media

The varied means used to realize this musical expression contribute to its multi-dimensional impact.

Instruments. Commenting on West African aesthetic principles, Portia K. Maultsby concluded: "Instrument selection is based on range, timbre and potential ability to be played in a percussive manner."²⁴ Because the African concept of musical sound lends "equal prominence to sounds of indefinite as well as definite pitch,"²⁵ it is not surprising that membranophones (various kinds of drums) and idiophones (e.g., bells, sticks, clappers, and rattles) are prevalent.²⁶ Interestingly, the indefinite pitch,

²³Nketia, The Music of Africa, 115. See also *ibid.*, 242-243; and Smith, "They Sing with the Voice of the Drum," 173.

²⁴Portia K. Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music: A Sociocultural Study," in More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 50.

²⁵Nketia, The Music of Africa, 111.

²⁶Richard Alan Waterman, "African Influence on the Music of the Americas," in Anthropology and Art: Readings in Cross-Cultural Aesthetics, ed. Charlotte M. Otten (Garden City, N.Y.: Natural History Press, 1971), 234. See also Olavo Alén Rodríguez's discussion of the polytimbric preference in African and related cultures in "Some Aspects of the Present Situation of the Different Musics of the World and Their Future," in Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer (Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987), 38.

percussive sounds are most closely associated with the invocation of the gods.²⁷

Definite pitch instruments, such as flutes, trumpets, and bowed or plucked lutes, harps, and lyres, are employed where the lack of "clear external definition of pulse structure" is not considered a deficiency, but with relatively infrequent use on their own.²⁸ Usually they are combined in an ensemble with indefinite pitch instruments and "played with percussive bias instead of in ways soft and legato."²⁹

Nketia maintained that while the aggregate of musical instruments found in Africa is quite large, "idiophones are the most widespread and varied, for almost all societies, even those that do not possess drums, use idiophones of some sort."³⁰ The rich palette of timbres provided by various drums and idiophones facilitates distinction between cross rhythms that would become a confused blur of sound without such tonal contrast.³¹ Concurrent with extensive idiophone use is the widespread incidence of hand clapping in religious rituals.³²

²⁷See Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 14; Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 9; and Ellingson, "Drums."

²⁸Nketia, The Music of Africa, 112.

²⁹Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool," 88.

³⁰Nketia, The Music of Africa, 242. This predilection also evidenced itself in African-American music. Despite the restrictive impositions of slavery, folk musicians were able and aesthetically willing to utilize everyday objects like "pots, pans, spoons, sticks, jawbones, blades, spring teeth from harrows, wagon clevises, washboards, frying pans, lard cans, and glasses" as ready substitutes for African instruments in their music making (Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music," 49).

³¹J. H. Kwabena Nketia, "Traditional Music of the Ga People," African Music 2 (1958): 23.

³²Gerad Béhague, "Percussion and Noise," The Encyclopedia of Religion (1987), 11:235-239. Employed both for "reinforcing or enhancing accompanied rhythms" and as "a highly symbolic language," this body-originated sound makes a significant contribution to a

The human voice. Instrumental music's percussive, polytimbric emphasis carries over into the use of the human voice. Summarizing the residual African characteristics in African-American vocal style (most, if not all, of which are confirmed in other descriptions of indigenous African music²³), Maultsby wrote:

Creating a cross between speech and song, the performer dramatizes his delivery with rhythmic moans, grunts, wails, shouts, glides, bends, dips, cries, hollers, vocables (words composed of various, possibly meaningless sounds), falsetto, and melodic repetition. Interjections and irregular phrasing rhythmically punctuate the song. Airy tones, sudden and drastic changes in dynamic levies, and singing in very high or very low registers enable the performer to achieve musical contrast.²⁴

As Harold Courlander noted, considerations other than "sweetness of voice" are judged "more relevant to good singing" in the African tradition.²⁵ On the contrary, a full-throated singing, "less prone to micro tonal variation"²⁶ and produced by "a harsh, tense vocal technique"²⁷ is preferred.

While singing is very important in traditional African music, it is not generally soloistic.²⁸ Widespread call-response

music event (ibid.). Its significance is indicated in Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 215; and Paul Berliner, "Music and Spirit Possession at a Shona Bira," African Music: Journal of the African Music Society 5 (1975-6): 131 and 134-135.

²³See Sloboda, The Musical Mind, 241; Welch, "A Yoruba/Nagô 'Melotype' for Religious Songs in the African Diaspora," 156-160; and Pearl Williams-Jones, "Afro-American Gospel Music: A Crystallization of the Black Aesthetic," Ethnomusicology 19 (September 1975): 378.

²⁴Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music," 49.

²⁵Harold Courlander, Negro Folk Music, USA (New York and London: Columbia University Press, 1963), 23.

²⁶Sloboda, The Musical Mind, 241.

²⁷Nettl, Music in Primitive Culture, 130.

²⁸Sloboda, The Musical Mind, 241. Nketia wrote: "Singing provides the greatest scope for participation in group musical activities, as well as an avenue for verbal communication" (Nketia, The Music of Africa, 244).

technique is considered to be a fundamental form of performance practice. Sloboda described call-response singing as a solo leader singing "some short phrase, followed by an answering phrase from a chorus."²⁹ Elaborating further, Waterman explained that in such antiphonal singing, solo and chorus often overlap in favor of rhythmic dynamism rather than maintaining strict antiphonal effects.³⁰ Additionally, Nketia observed:

Various kinds of vocal polyphony are also used: some societies sing in parallel thirds, while others sing in parallel fourths, fifths, or octaves. There are instances of parallel seconds here and there, as well as fairly elaborate contrapuntal polyphony.³¹

The integration of movement and sound. Because sound and motion are considered an integrity in African aesthetic consciousness,³² dance is a significant performance medium in an African musical event. Maultsby explained:

The process of music-making, both in West Africa and Black America, extends beyond mere sound production. Bodily movements and their dance manifestations constitute an integral part of the process. In all genres of Black music, various forms of motion, including head movement, shoulder jerking, foot-tapping, hand-clapping, arm extension, body swaying and other types of physical movement accompany the production of sound. These motions are executed in rhythm with the music and display an emotional response to it.³³

Conceptualized as one process rather than "the fusion of two separate entities,"³⁴ motion and music have been characterized as

²⁹Sloboda, The Musical Mind, 241. Amplifying this, Nketia wrote: "The forms common to vocal music include solo-chorus alternations, solo and chorus refrain, and solo-chorus alternations with ostinato accompaniment" (Nketia, The Music of Africa, 244).

³⁰Waterman, "African Influence on the Music of the Americas," 237-238.

³¹Nketia, The Music of Africa, 244.

³²Nketia maintained that "the union of 'sound and action' is of supreme importance whatever the context" (Nketia, Drumming, 174). See also Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 265.

³³Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music," 46.

³⁴Ibid., 47.

"patterned behavior."²⁴⁵ The movement "exaggerates subtleties in the sound"²⁴⁶ explicating overall meaning.

The multi-dimensional character of a musical performance is also evident in the fact that in some cultures there are no separate words for music and dance.²⁴⁷ Meanwhile, the nature of the music itself, with its emphasis on the generally loud,²⁴⁸ percussive beat of the drum, proclaims that it is not intended for listening, but for action.²⁴⁹

Collective participation

Widespread social interaction and participation in aesthetically significant events²⁵⁰ is another hallmark of traditional African music making. In a study of the South African Venda, Blacking noted that the shared experience of Venda music is "valuable and beautiful to the Venda" both because of the quantity

²⁴⁵Ollly Wilson, "The Association of Movement and Music as a Manifestation of a Black Conceptual Approach to Music-Making," in More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 16.

²⁴⁶Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music," 47.

²⁴⁷Nicholls, "Music and Dance Guilds in Igede," 99.

²⁴⁸For example, Nketia observed that in Akan communities "all drums are beaten loudly irrespective of the modes of drumming which are applied or the time of the day, the place of performance or the occasion of performance" (Nketia, Drumming, 18).

²⁴⁹Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 62.

²⁵⁰Chernoff noted, for example, that "compared to Western societies, African societies have many more people who participate in making music" (African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 34). It has also been observed that solo musical performance was relatively unknown in traditional West African music (Leroi Jones; quoted in Steve Perry, "Ain't No Mountain High Enough: The Politics of Crossover," in Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith [New York: Pantheon Books, 1988], 74).

of people and tones involved as well as the quality of relationships between people and tones when it is performed.²³¹

Deren called the various forms of Haitian Voudoun "collective religions" in which individual exaltation derives from participation in collective action.²³² She maintained that in the ritual setting, accessibility of both song and dance to the diverse participatory capacities of all individuals in the community is "perhaps, the most astonishing achievement of the forms of Voudoun."²³³ She explained:

The steps of the dances, for example, require no special training other than that of gradual familiarity; they can be performed by children of ten and women of sixty; they are so designed that they can be maintained for six or eight hours by persons of normal energy. Yet they engage and elevate both the individuals for whom all this represents an effort and those who might, otherwise, be capable of much more.²³⁴

Chernoff pointed out that even listeners "must be actively engaged in making sense of the music"²³⁵ in the African music setting.

Characteristic of Content: Danceable Rhythm

It seems evident that the power of the music rather than verbal meanings is considered most important in African religious cults.²³⁶ In response to the observations that the textual content

²³¹Blacking, How Musical Is Man? 51. The general importance of participation in music is also acknowledged by Lekis in "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 49.

²³²Deren, Divine Horsemen, 228-229.

²³³Ibid., 229.

²³⁴Ibid. It is interesting to note that the time element at possession rituals may be considerably more than the 6 to 8 hours Deren mentioned. For example, Berliner observed 12 hours of continuous music at a Shona ritual (Berliner, "Music and Spirit Possession at a Shona Bira," 133).

²³⁵Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 50.

²³⁶Again this provides a point of similarity with the Hindu setting. Menon wrote: "A song becomes an apparatus of worship not because of the text, like in a psalm or a hymn in which the words make up a prayer. The music itself, the sound, nada is the

in traditional African music tends to be relatively simple²⁵⁷ or even obscure,²⁵⁸ Maultsby's suggestion that "the presentation of several thoughts would require more concentration and, as a result, interfere with the listeners' active participation"²⁵⁹ appears to be a significant consideration. In order to achieve maximum individual and collective participation in the experiential (rather than intellectual) event, rhythm has been made the substantive focus of musical content.

Rhythm

The outstanding and essential feature of African music is rhythm.²⁶⁰ Commenting on this, Nketia wrote:

African traditions are more uniform in their choice and use of rhythms and rhythmic structures than they are in their selection and use of pitch systems. Since African music is predisposed towards percussion and percussive textures, there is an understandable emphasis on rhythm, for rhythmic interest often compensates for the absence of melody or the lack of melodic sophistication.²⁶¹

apparatus of worship" (Menon, "Interdisciplinary Research," 68).

²⁵⁷Many lyrics merely repeat ideas in original or elaborated forms (Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music," 47).

²⁵⁸Chernoff noted that "particularly in African religious cults, where the power of music is very vividly manifested, the language of songs and drums is often obscure" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 124). He continued by quoting other scholars who demonstrated that languages of religious songs are often in forgotten dialects and therefore, mere gibberish to both performers and hearers. Phrases are often foolish, meaningless, even absurd or made up (ibid.). See also Welch, "A Yoruba/Nagô 'Melotype' for Religious Songs in the African Diaspora," 152.

²⁵⁹Maultsby, "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music," 47.

²⁶⁰Waterman, "African Influence on the Music of the Americas," 233. Other writers have called the rhythmic complexity of African music "the cardinal principle of African music." See Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 47.

²⁶¹Nketia, The Music of Africa, 125. Additionally, Nketia noted: "The music of an instrument with a range of only two or three tones may be effective or aesthetically satisfying to its performers and their audience if it has sufficient rhythmic interest" (ibid.).

Emphasis of rhythm over melody²⁶² has been noted in the music of African diaspora also.²⁶³ This is not meant to imply that there is no melody or harmony.²⁶⁴ Chernoff described the orientation by suggesting that rhythmic complexity is "the African alternative to harmonic complexity" and "the repetition of responsive rhythms is the African alternative to the development of a melodic line."²⁶⁵

The complexity and power of African rhythm rests not in the individual patterns utilized, but in the combination of patterns into a simultaneously performed polymetric scheme. This rhythmic superstructure is gradually built up around what Waterman termed a "metronome sense"²⁶⁶--a subjective, unperformed beat in terms of which all performed rhythmic patterns, whether sounded, vocalized, or danced, are executed. The performed patterns serve "as a

²⁶²See also Chernoff's discussion of this in African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 42.

²⁶³For example, see Dick Hebdige's comments regarding the Caribbean in Cut 'N' Mix: Culture, Identity and Caribbean Music (New York: Methuen and Company, 1987), 34.

²⁶⁴Though closely related and largely subservient to rhythm, the elements of melodic and harmonic content are clearly present in traditional African music (Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 265). Melodies are often short and repetitive, particularly in the chorus/response in the call-response pattern. The leader's melody line (the call) may be longer (Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 10; Berliner, "Music and Spirit Possession at a Shona Bira," 132; and Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 265). The call portion of a call-response pattern may have a medium- to wide-pitch range (Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 11; and Welch, "A Yoruba/Nagô 'Melotype' for Religious Songs in the African Diaspora," 156).

Harmonies reveal a well-defined tonality permitting a harmonically enriched emotional communication. However, because of the absence of semitones in many African scale systems, it cannot be judged in terms of Western harmonic norms (Welch, "A Yoruba/Nagô 'Melotype' for Religious Songs in the African Diaspora," 156).

²⁶⁵Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 55.

²⁶⁶Waterman, "African Influence on the Music of the Americas," 233. Waterman went on to note that a variety of this metronome sense is also found in Hindu music (*ibid.*, 234).

confirmation of this subjective beat."²⁶⁷ As Chernoff noted, "musicians must keep their time steady by perceiving rhythmic relationships rather than by following a stressed beat,"²⁶⁸ otherwise they would become hopelessly confused by "the multiplicity of conflicting rhythms and accents."²⁶⁹ This is because most notes fall on the offbeat,²⁷⁰ creating a sense of prevalent syncopation.²⁷¹

Such rhythmic intricacy highlights the need for and demands the ability to actively mediate the rhythms,²⁷² rather than merely follow them intellectually. The importance of this is clear when it is considered that dancers, voices, and instruments are essentially all used as distinct parts in a "polymetric choir,"²⁷³ and that it is the precisely performed, contrasting rhythms that provide the

²⁶⁷Ibid., 233. Chernoff called this metronome sense an "additional rhythm" that gives coherence to the ensemble. He noted that: "In an African musical event one participates by integrating the various rhythms to perceive the 'beat,' and the 'beat' of the music comes from the whole relationship of the rhythms rather than from any particular part" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 95).

²⁶⁸Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 51.

²⁶⁹Ibid., 95. Foot tapping is disparaged, and learning to listen to "at least two rhythms at once" is encouraged (ibid., 51).

²⁷⁰Ibid., 48.

²⁷¹Waterman, "African Influence on the Music of the Americas," 237. Because of their significance in the African context, many rhythmic patterns and their internal variations have been given specific names (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 95).

²⁷²Chernoff, African Rhythms and African Sensibility, 95.

²⁷³See Thompson, "As Aesthetic of the Cool," 98; and Merriam, "Music--Bridge to the Supernatural," 62. Thompson provided an evocative delineation of the manifestation of multiple meter as "a communal examination of percussive individuality" (Thompson, "An Aesthetic of the Cool," 91).

vitality that moves participants and spectators⁷⁴ as the musical/ritual event advances toward its climax.

Rouget observed that the progression toward that climax in "possession music" is marked by "two frequently occurring characteristics: on the one hand breaks or abrupt changes of rhythm, on the other an accelerando crescendo, which recurs so frequently one might view it as a universal of possession music."⁷⁵ The increase in tempo and intensity (accelerando and crescendo) reveals the overall developmental aspect in ritual music style. What Rouget termed "breaks or abrupt changes of rhythm"⁷⁶ highlight the crucial role of musical rhythm in heralding the onset of possession at the ritual's climax. Describing this significant phenomenon and its impact, Evan M. Zuesse wrote:

Invariably at the ceremonies there is a bass drum. . . . Its heavy beat often coincides with the deeper rhythms of the brain, and comes to "capture" them. The smaller drums embroider the beat. The dancer's concentration on these rhythms soon crowds out all other sensations. . . . The beat becomes a focus, and then finally a replacement, for the ego's will. As the rhythm is internalized it becomes the coordinating center--and when . . . this is taken away in the "break," nothing is left. One becomes the plaything of the drummer, entirely submitted to the arbitrary, external order he creates, tossing about under his

⁷⁴Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 169. Carl E. Seashore's comment regarding rhythm is significant in this context: "Rhythm finds resonance in the whole organism. . . . And, therefore indirectly it affects the circulation, respiration, and all the secretions of the body in such a way as to arouse agreeable feeling. Herein we find the groundwork of emotion; for rhythm, whether in perception or in action, is emotional when highly developed and results in response of the whole organism to its pulsations" (Carl E. Seashore, Psychology of Music [New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1938], 143).

⁷⁵Rouget, Music and Trance, 91. For references to increases in intensity and tempo, see Berliner, "Music and Spirit Possession in a Shona Bira," 131, 133; Kauffman, "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society," 12; and Gertrude Prokosch Kurath, "Universals in Dance," The World of Music 19 (1977): 48. Compare also Daniélou, "Religious Music in the Countries of the Orient," 28; and Cáceres, "In Xochitl, In Cuicatl," 131-133.

⁷⁶Evan M. Zuesse called it "sudden 'breaks,' or syncopated pauses, or changes in beat" (Evan M. Zuesse, Ritual Cosmos: The Sanctification of Life in African Religions [Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1979], 195).

beat. The center is now psychically entirely outside the self.²⁷⁷

Once a unique, psychological environment is created under the control of the metronomic "beat" to which the dancer has added his movement, the dancer's control of his own behavior is gradually taken over by another.²⁷⁸ The decision when the precipitating changes in rhythm are made rests entirely with the drummers.²⁷⁹ Hence, it is no wonder that these players are highly esteemed.²⁸⁰

Characteristic of Form: Insistent Repetition

Repetition is the organizational force for the presentation of music's rhythmic content. As Chernoff indicated, it brings out "the rhythmic tension that characterizes a particular 'beat,'" and "continually reaffirms the power of the music by locking that rhythm, and the people listening or dancing to it, into a dynamic and open structure. . . . The power of the music is not only captured by repetition, it is magnified."²⁸¹ This type of repetition is not intended merely to intuit a sense of the infinite as is the case in Islamic music, but to facilitate participatory action.

A deliberately slow rate of change in the music's progression is necessary if a possession experience is to be

²⁷⁷Ibid., 195-196. See also Daniélou's discussion of a similar phenomenon in the Hindu context in "Religious Music in the Countries of the Orient," 28.

²⁷⁸Ibid., 195.

²⁷⁹In summing up the work of the drummer, Chernoff wrote: "By choosing rhythms which will relate clearly to the other rhythms, by controlling the duration of a rhythm, and by timing the introduction of discontinuity to his beating, he creates with a mind to generating and coordinating an expression of maximum power and vitality" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 117).

²⁸⁰See Séhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 14.

²⁸¹Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 111-112.

effective. Only when certain expectations regarding the "beat" have been built up can the maximum impact of the changes in intensity, tempo, or pattern (as in the "breaks") be brought to bear.

Aside from the psycho-physiological impact of repetitive sound and movement in the possession ritual, repetition is also an aspect of beauty and excellence in traditional African aesthetic.³² Chernoff's description of Takai drumming in northern Ghana illustrates this:

One might imagine that the lead drummer would proceed directly through many styles in order to display his skill and make the music interesting with accentuation. They take their time. Once into a style . . . the lead drummer will continue to play that style for a long time. It is the duration of time that a drummer plays a particular rhythm, the amount of repetition and the way the rhythms change, to which the drummers pay attention, and not so much any particular rhythmic invention. The aesthetic decision which constitutes excellence will be the timing of the change and the choice of a new pattern.³³

Another function of rhythmic repetition in traditional African music is that it helps to clarify musical meaning, for, "when rhythms change too abruptly the music can lose some of its meaning."³⁴ It may also serve to accentuate the African concept of time³⁵ by minimizing the perception of directionality³⁶ and stressing immediacy and its relationship to the past.

Repetition is evident not only in instrumental patterns,³⁷

³²Ibid., 55, 126.

³³Ibid., 100. This deliberate "taking time" is another aspect of the philosophy of the cool (ibid., 105-106).

³⁴Ibid., 80-81.

³⁵See Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 17; and Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 95.

³⁶See Cohen, "On Comparing Musical Styles," 86.

³⁷For example, this is evident in typical drumming patterns and mbira playing (Berliner, "Music and Spirit Possession at a Shona Bira," 132).

but also in the widely used vocal call-response technique.³⁸ Apart from melodic and rhythmic repetition, textual repetition helps to emphasize the overall impact. Improvisation is also "a deeply rooted device of African singing";³⁹ however, it is usually practiced within the framework of rhythmic repetition.

Summary

Traditional African ritual music displays a distinctive combination of stylistic features evident both in continental Africa and areas of the African dispersion across the Atlantic. Despite considerable diversity in details (such as scale systems, chant melodies, and specific instruments and rhythmic patterns), the broad coalescence of certain features of style is unmistakable. The relationship of those characteristics to religious and cosmological understandings of the immanent deities appears indisputable.

The stylistic features of traditional African immanence-inspired ritual music accentuate the practical corporeality of the natural realm. The general rejection of the abstract, the contemplative, and the philosophic in favor of concretized realism and instinctive action evidences itself in a participatory, multi-dimensional, psycho-physiological impacting art form in which sound and motion are one; loud, complex, and repetitive rhythm is emphasized over diverse melody and harmony; the dramatic, the symbolic, and climax-oriented progression are commonplace; and percussive instrumental, vocal, and dance performance directly address the sensual and kinesthetic impulses, eliciting emotionally motivated motor response. The appeal is largely to experience, to

³⁸As Chernoff indicated, "the rhythms of a lead singer or musician vary and are cast against the steady repetition of the response" (Chernoff, African Rhythm and African Sensibility, 55). See also Béhague, "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia," 10.

³⁹Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 265.

an intuitive involvement with both the present and the primordial past.

The Confrontation of Traditional African Religion and Islām

It is well known that in areas of Islamic influence in Africa, the general music style changes conspicuously in conformance with Islamic ideals.³⁰ In the worship context, those changes are most marked. Apart from the possible occurrence of a few minor residual elements of traditional African performance style, basic monophonic vocal cantillation is clearly evident in an African Islamic worship setting.³¹ In some communities the relationship between African heritage and Islamic religious persuasion is starkly dichotomized by implementing a dualistic approach--"orthodox" Islamic sacred sound art for worship, and predominantly traditional African music for social and festal occasions.³² There does not appear to be a full-scale mixture of stylistic features in an African-Islamic worship setting.

Concluding Observations

Religious conceptions of deity have had a significant determinative impact on the ritual music expression of Islamic and traditional African cultures. Understanding of divine transcendence/immanence in these settings has deeply influenced the aesthetic consciousness of the peoples concerned to the extent that

³⁰See Malm, Music Cultures of the Pacific, the Near East, and Asia, 37-38; Nketia, The Music of Africa, 9-13; and Nettl, Music in Primitive Culture, 122.

³¹If syncretism occurs, it may involve African vocal style coloration or the Qur'ānic cantillation (Lois Anderson, "The Interrelationship of African and Arab Music: Some Preliminary Considerations," in Essays on Music and History in Africa, ed. K. P. Wachsmann [Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1971], 143-169).

³²Nketia, The Music of Africa, 13; and Malm, Music Cultures of the Pacific, the Near East and Asia, 38.

certain values and expectations have become entrenched over generations regarding what is the genuine transformation of worship into music.

Because the respective communities highly esteem sacred sound expressions, and because these provide what is perceived as the embodiment of the ideal characteristics of the community's aesthetic consciousness, sacred music characteristics frequently have permeated the culture's entire musical output. In other words, a religiously inspired musical style has ultimately affected the whole culture.³³

It is clear that a culture's aesthetic stance is deliberate. Rarely, if ever, is it arrived at by default. Characteristics that are unique features of music style are "chosen" largely on the basis of the beliefs of collective consciousness that nurtured them.³⁴ Evidence for such belief-oriented choices contradicts notions of primitivism, lack of cultural sophistication, or even environmental imperatives as the explanation of the characteristics of sacred music style.

As shown in table 2, the comparison of the two traditions outlined above is mainly one of contrasts. As transcendence and immanence are opposite polar points in conceptions of deity, so also the music styles engendered in directionally oriented worship settings reveal conflicting characteristics. This does not mean that all elements are totally reversed, but it does mean that the

³³It must be recognized that as the world becomes a "global village" and Western mass media traverses all cultural boundaries, musical cultures change. Distinctions between cultures blur, especially in the popular music genres, and this may encroach on sacred music genres. See Terry Bech, "Nepal: The Gaine Caste of Beggar-Musicians," The World of Music 17 (1975): 32-35; Nketia, "Music and Religion in Sub-Saharan Africa," 174; and Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 154.

³⁴This was true particularly before a foreign mass media imposed itself upon that consciousness.

Table 2.-- Polarity Contrasted: A Summary of the Two Stylistic Traditions

Islamic Sacred Sound Art	Traditional African Ritual Music
<u>Approach</u>	<u>Approach</u>
textual emphasis	musical emphasis
content motivated	performance driven
<u>Content</u>	<u>Content</u>
abstract	concrete correspondence with beings, events, objects, or ideas within nature
non-developmental, non-dramatic	developmental, dramatic, climax-oriented
no literal or explicit symbolism	literal or explicit symbolism
melodic emphasis	rhythmic emphasis
meditative/contemplative	interactive/physical involvement
no mood change	considerable mood change
<u>Form</u>	<u>Form</u>
non-developmental repetition to achieve segmentation and infinite pattern	developmental repetition to clarify rhythms and engender psycho-physiological experience
short motifs and patterns	short patterns and phrases
intricacy: dense detailed patterning	intricacy: polymetric patterning for movement
improvisational	improvisational
<u>Performance Practice</u>	<u>Performance Practice</u>
monophonic, melodic texture	percussive, polyphonic, polymetric, polytimbric texture
vocal medium--non-movement oriented	multi-dimensional media (voices, instruments, dance) --movement oriented
generally soloistic	generally participatory
instruments never used alone; when used, their parts are vocally determined	instruments used independently
melodic, definite pitch	indefinite pitch, percussive

instruments emphasized; idiophones are rare	instruments emphasized; idiophones and membranophones common
limited variation in pitch, intensity, and tempo	considerable variation in pitch, intensity, and tempo
essentially non-professional	some use of "professional" performers (both drummers and vocalists, especially for leadership)

overall impact is unmistakably antithetical.

There appears to be considerable similarity in the characteristics of form. Improvisation is a highlight in both traditions. Repetition of short phrases or motifs is also common. However, in the Islamic context it is intended (and executed) to intuit to the mind a sense of infinite pattern. In the African setting, repetition is designed to clarify and magnify a progressive physical and emotional experience. Both traditions display the aspect of intricacy, but again, in the Islamic setting its intention is to inspire an intuition of infinite detail and pattern, whereas in the African setting it contributes to the pluralistic, polymetric action drama. In other words, similar elements of form were chosen for reasons dependent upon the desired impact of content and performance practice which, without question, are markedly different.

The contrasts evident in these religiously inspired contexts are reminiscent of similar (not identical) contrasts that have been documented and philosophically developed in other cultural settings. For example, the Apollonian/Dionysian contrast evident in the Greek context embodies some of the same features,³⁵ as does the

³⁵See Keen's delineation of "the Apollonian way" and "the Dionysian way" in "Manifesto for a Dionysian Theology," 82-87. See also the descriptions of the Dionysian characteristics in van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 59-66; and Nathaniel Kaplan and Thomas Katsaros Origins of American Transcendentalism: In Philosophy and Mysticism (New Haven Conn.: College and University Press, 1975),

Ideational/Sensate contrast developed by Sorokin in the Western cultural setting.²⁸

This seems to indicate that, rather than being merely a product of isolated, cultural contexts, the stylistic characteristics being dealt with here are archetypical and recognizable as part of the totality of human life and experience. It may also suggest that certain intercultural religious conceptions and impulses have had, and still have, certain meeting points manifest in the utilization of generally similar sacred music styles, as will be further evident in the next chapter. Whatever the case, evidence that sacred music style is not religiously neutral is persuasive.

Having traced the connection between two contrasting conceptions of deity and their respective worship music styles by means of the relationship between the understanding of the divine and aesthetic consciousness in two distinctive cultures, the transcultural validity of that connection is now tested in the Christian setting.

62-67. Compare also Nadel's transcultural and transhistorical statement about musical ecstasy in "The Origins of Music," 542-543. In that Apollonian characteristics were perceived in human terms their correspondence with the characteristics of transcendence orientation is understandably more strained.

²⁸It could also be argued that Danckert's transcendental type II music corresponds to the transcendence-oriented features delineated above, however, types I and III do not correspond so readily.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE CONCEPT OF GOD AND SACRED MUSIC STYLE

THE WESTERN CHRISTIAN CONTEXT

Introduction

Having traced sacred music style and its relationship to the concept of deity in a transcendence-oriented religion (Islām) and a predominantly immanence-oriented religion (African traditional religion), this chapter examines sacred music style in the Western Christian context. Because change in Christian liturgical music style seems to be a peculiar feature of Western culture,¹ Christian sacred music today incorporates a plethora of styles that have given rise to persistent conflict in the worship life of Christian communities.

In a dictionary article on Christian church music, William T. Flynn wrote:

Any music in or associated with Christian worship can be considered church music. Both presently and historically, there is a great variety of music forms, styles and performance practices in the various Christian churches. Such differences in musical practice may indicate underlying differences in theological emphasis, since the music used in Christian worship reflects a church's interpretation of its liturgy. (Likewise, similarities may indicate ecumenical agreement or convergence on theological issues.)²

Flynn's suggestion that theology explains the similarities and differences in the use of worship music in Christian communities is significant. This chapter argues that theology is a key factor in

¹See Perris, Music as Propaganda, 151; and Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations," 79.

²Flynn, "Church Music," 182.

understanding both diversity and conflict in Christian sacred music style. It also suggests that this factor is the basis for stylistic comparisons with the sacred music of the two religious settings described in the previous chapter.

The Christian Conception of Divinity

In contrast to the obvious emphasis on deital transcendence or immanence in Islamic worship and African possession ritual respectively, Christian belief incorporates an inherent paradox. On the one hand, it espouses a pre-existent Creator God who is "distinct from the universe which he brought into existence out of nothing,"¹ and thus is commonly classified along with Judaism and Islām as a transcendent-oriented religion. The fundamental discontinuity between Creator and creation, affirming two distinct but related spheres of reality (the created realm being totally dependent on the transcendent Creator), clearly places Christianity in Clouser's biblical category of dependency arrangements.⁴

On the other hand, as foreshadowed in its Jewish heritage⁵ and explicit in its own tradition, there is an unmistakable emphasis on divine immanence (albeit of a different order from pagan and pantheistic conceptions) in Christianity's belief about the work of

¹Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 43.

⁴Ibid., 43-46. Writing about Western Christianity, Joseph Campbell validated this categorization when he ruefully noted that: "According to our Good Book, God made the world, God made man, and God and his creatures are not to be conceived of as in any sense identical. Indeed, the preaching of identity is in our best-known view the prime heresy" (Joseph Campbell, Myths to Live By [New York: Bantam Books, 1972], 97).

⁵See Parrinder's discussion of the "nearness of God" in Judaistic conceptions (Parrinder, Worship in the World's Religions, 172-173).

the Holy Spirit and the doctrine of the Incarnation.⁶ In reality, the Incarnation, the divine/human person of Jesus Christ, is the crux of the Christian paradox. As Schuon stated:

For a Christian, all depends on the Incarnation and the Redemption; Christ absorbs everything. . . . The idea of God made Man is at the center of Christian Doctrine; the Son, second person of the Trinity, is man universalized; Jesus Christ is God individualized.⁷

The ultimate nature of reality for Christians is summed up in a Person who is "the Way, the Truth, and the Life."⁸

Paul W. Hoon starkly delineated the impact of this apparently contradictory transcendent/immanent view of the divine on Christian worship when he wrote:

Christian worship rests on a paradox, that God is both like and unlike man; he is personal, but he is more than personal. When the former aspect is exaggerated . . . God becomes a kind of divine pal, worship becomes chatty intimacy, devoid of reverence

⁶Despite his disparaging viewpoint, Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī was correct when he observed: "Although Christians never ceased to claim that God is transcendent, they spoke of Him as a real man who walked on earth and did all things men do including the suffering of the agonies of death. . . . When pinned down, every Christian will have to admit that his God is both transcendent and immanent" (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Divine Transcendence and Its Expression," 290).

⁷Schuon, The Transcendent Unity of Religions, 128. Schuon's comment was made as part of a comparison of Christianity with its companion religion in transcendence orientation, Islām. Of course, the Christian understanding of Jesus Christ with its implication of divine immanence forms the major barrier between Christianity and Islām. This difference has also been perceptively argued as the reason for aesthetic differences in the two cultures. For example, Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī asserted that the Christian dogma of "divine incarnation into the natural, and divine drama of salvation through natural death and resurrection" is what made Byzantine art "recourse to figures and hence to some qualified naturalism" (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 85). Islām rejects both "divine incarnation" and the "divine drama of salvation" because they compromise the belief in Divine Unity and Transcendence. "Islām has no soteriology. The Fall of Man, for Islām, as a simple breach of contract of obedience, concluded between Adam and his Lord. It has not corrupted his nature to the point of requiring a divine sacrifice for its restoration. . . . Man is not corrupted, but misguided. He stands in no need to be redeemed, but to be saved from the painful consequences of his blinding. . . . God merely grants to men the chance of salvation; He does not love them to the degree of suffering in case they perish" (Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Misconceptions of the Nature of Islamic Art," 37).

⁸John 14:6.

and evoking the more infantile elements in human personality. When the latter aspect is exaggerated worship loses its concreteness and reality, and tends to evaporate into vague states of mystical piety.'

As Hoon intimated, the paradox inherent in the Christian understanding of God furnishes potential for a wide range of worship styles as well as the possibility of swings between polar points in emphasis. If church music consists of "the transformation of worship into music,"¹⁰ diversity in Christian sacred music style seems inevitable.

The Christian Concept of God and Aesthetic Consciousness

Undoubtedly, it is the transcendent/immanent paradox in the Christian concept of God that has generated unique challenges in Christian aesthetic sensibility. In the visual arts, where that impact has been scrutinized more closely than in other arts, certain developments have been directly attributed to there being "nothing quite like the Christian analysis of the divine-human situation."¹¹ The centuries-old dilemma of how to represent Christ as both human and divine has been labelled the Christian's artistic problem.¹² The potential for oscillation between polar points in emphasis has been realized as "throughout the centuries artists sometimes emphasized the human aspect, at other times the divine."¹³

This vacillation is evident not only in the representation of the person of Christ, but in artistic style as a whole. As Burckhardt noted: "Christian thought with its emphasis on the person

⁹Paul W. Hoon, "The Relation of Theology and Music in Worship," Union Seminary Quarterly Review 11 (January 1956): 36.

¹⁰Söhngen, "Music and Theology," 8.

¹¹Dixon, Art and the Theological Imagination, 96.

¹²See Eliade, Symbolism, the Sacred, and the Arts, 63; and Jane Dillenberger, Style and Content in Christian Art (New York and Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1965), 51.

¹³Dillenberger, Style and Content in Christian Art, 51.

of the Savior, demanded a figurative art, so that Christianity was unable to set aside the artistic heritage of antiquity."¹⁴ As a result, even Byzantine art reflected an "ideational symbiosis"¹⁵ between Greek naturalism and Semitic anti-naturalism. Consciousness of divine transcendence prevented the Byzantine artist "from lapsing into any simple identification of transcendent reality with nature."¹⁶ However, as Burckhardt observed, by assimilating some aspects of Greco-Roman naturalism, Christian art found that this "latent naturalism never failed to break through everytime there was a weakening of spiritual consciousness, even well before the Renaissance when the definite break with tradition took place."¹⁷

When that "definite break" came during the fifteenth century, "it was not Byzantium, but ancient Greek art which . . . rekneaded Western aesthetic consciousness in its image."¹⁸ As Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī pointed out,

although the authorities of Christianity first condemned this naturalism as a return to paganism, they were finally reconciled to it by virtue of the connection of divinity with nature implicit in the Incarnation. Since then, Christendom's art has been in the main figurative and idealizational.¹⁹

¹⁴Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 44. In this regard, Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī's comment about Greco-Roman antiquity is illuminating. He wrote: "Greco-Roman antiquity maintained that God is any aspect of human nature or personality magnified to a degree that places it above nature in one sense but keeps it immanent in nature in another. In either case, the Creator is confused with His creation" (Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 90).

¹⁵Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "On the Nature of the Work of Art in Islām," 70.

¹⁶Ibid., 71.

¹⁷Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 44. It would appear that when Burckhardt wrote of "spiritual consciousness" he implied transcendent orientation.

¹⁸Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Art," 85.

¹⁹Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "Divine Transcendence and Its Expression," 300. See also Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 15-16. As Kauffmann pointed out, pagan influence was not confined to style, but was also manifested in the presentation of content

Only in the twentieth century has this been significantly challenged with certain abstract art forms.²⁰

This short sketch of developments in the visual arts highlights four points: the significance of the transcendent/immanent concept of divinity to the artistic arena; the complexity of realizing a unique, Christian aesthetic in the arts; the dynamic connection between shifts in theological understanding and historical fluctuations in artistic style; and an overall direction of the shift in both theological emphasis and aesthetic ideals.

The last two of these points merit some amplification. While acknowledging fluctuations along the way, the history of Western Christian culture reveals a major swing from a predominantly transcendence-oriented artistic expression to an unmistakably immanence-oriented artistic expression.²¹ The overall change from a more abstract and other-worldly artistic style to a naturalistic, thoroughly this-worldly artistic style centered on human perceptions and responses is reflected both in specific arts as well as in the wider cultural involvement. For example, the development of a general Christian worship culture evidences a shift from an almost exclusive concern with literature and logogenic²² music (an abstract, ideas-centered, predominantly audio orientation) to a

like the Madonna and Child, as well as in works such as Michelangelo's Pieta (Kauffmann, Religion in Four Dimensions, 370).

²⁰Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, Islām and Art, 16. Even so, as Sorokin pointed out, although twentieth-century arts have rebelled against the sensate orientation of the nineteenth century, their "content still remains thoroughly sensate." Rather than depicting anything supersensory or idealistic, the world they deal with is still fundamentally naturalistic and they seek to portray it simply on a deeper than superficial level (Sorokin, The Crisis of Our Age, 78).

²¹This is not to deny that strands of all shades along the continuum may have continued to manifest themselves.

²²"Logogenic" is a term used by Sachs to denote "word-born" (Sachs, The Rise of Music in the Ancient World East and West, 41).

gradual concern with and inclusion of painting,²³ sculpture,²⁴ drama,²⁵ autonomous instrumental music,²⁶ and dance²⁷ (a more

²³André Grabar noted that Christian art began about three centuries after the founding of Christianity, possibly originating "in a para-Christian milieu, presumably Judeo-Christian or Gnostic, before being taken up by the church" (André Grabar, Early Christian Art: From the Rise of Christianity to the Death of Theodosius, trans. Stuart Gilbert and James Emmons [New York: Odyssey Press, 1968], 110). See also *ibid.*, 2. He also mentioned that the originality of the Christian sensibility emerged only gradually (*ibid.*, 2).

²⁴Although sculpture appeared among Christians during the third and fourth centuries, the issue of its acceptance in worship was not resolved until after a series of iconoclast controversies ending in the middle of the ninth century (Cyril Alexander Mango, "Iconoclastic Controversy," Encyclopedia Britannica [1971] 11:1056).

²⁵Mystery, miracle, and morality plays entered Christian liturgical settings during the ninth, eleventh, and fourteenth centuries respectively (Hardin Craig, "Medieval Drama," Encyclopedia Britannica, [1971], 7:634-638). From the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, liturgical drama "was increasingly characterized by the interpenetration of sacred and secular elements. Gradually, the performance of these dramas moved from the sanctuary to outside the church, into the market place, and ultimately into the theater" (Carl Schalk, "Liturgical Drama," in Key Words in Church Music: Definition Essays on Concepts, Practices, and Movements of Thought in Church Music, ed. Carl Schalk [St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1978], 235). In the latter half of the twentieth century it is making a strong bid for reentry to the liturgical setting (Kallestad, "Entertainment Evangelism," 17).

²⁶This did not become common until the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries (Lang, Music in Western Civilization, 306 and 370-371).

²⁷In the history of Western Christianity there are references to the use of dance at certain locations and for festival occasions (see Curt Sachs, World History of the Dance, trans. Bessie Schönberg [New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1937], 251-252, 263-264 and 334-337). However, regular use of dance in worship was resisted until relatively recent times when groups like the Shakers (late eighteenth century) and certain branches of the American Revivalist Movement and the Holiness and Pentecostal churches (nineteenth and twentieth centuries) incorporated it more fully into their services (see Edward Deming Andrews, The Gift to Be Simple: Songs, Dances and Rituals of the American Shakers [New York: Dover Publications, 1940], 143-157; Stephen A. Marini, "Rehearsal for Revival: Sacred Singing and the Great Awakening in America," in Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies, vol. 50 [Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983], 83; and Larry T. Duncan, "Music Among Early Pentecostals," The Hymn 38 [January 1987]: 13, 14). For a discussion of attempts to introduce dance into Christian worship, see Kurath, "Universals in Dance," 46, 51. See also Ted Shawn's impassioned plea for the wider religious use of dance in Christian worship in "Religious Use of the Dance," in Religious Symbolism, ed.

naturalistic, audio-visual-tactile approach).

The historical development of this theological/aesthetic shift offers some significant illumination. At the risk of oversimplification, the progressive emphasis in the Western Christian concept of God could be characterized under three headings: (1) God beyond us; (2) God for us, and (3) God beside us/within us. In each of these broad categories the dependence between the divine and the non-divine remains the same with God as the initiator and supporter of His creation. However, the focal point of action and encounter in the relationship changes and this affects the aesthetic consciousness.

God Beyond Us

The "God beyond us" characterization depicts the transcendence orientation apparent in Christian artistic expression at the beginning of the Christian era. This emphasis derived from several factors:

1. Against the backdrop of post-exilic Judaism and in the midst of the powerful Greco-Roman culture, Christians were strongly motivated to reject the overwhelmingly immanent orientation of their pagan surroundings.³ Evidence exists that even the Roman

F. Ernest Johnson (Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1969), 145-157.

³Grout saw this as germane to understanding early Christian music preference (Grout, A History of Western Music, 11-12, 25, 27). Post-exilic Judaism took a similar stance. After the Babylonian exile, conservative Judaism resisted identification with the idolatry of neighboring nations (a problem which had continually plagued the nation's existence in Old Testament times) and emphasized strict obedience to God as the secret of personal and national prosperity. What was conceived as God's perspective--the "transcendent" point of view--appears to have played a major role in the Judaism pictured in the New Testament. Orthodox Jewish resistance to identification with paganism is aesthetically evident in the enmity shown toward instrumental music even in temple worship before 70 C.E. Eric Werner called this enmity "a defence against the musical and orgiastic mystery cults in which Syrian and Mesopotamian Jews not infrequently participated" (Eric Werner, "The Music of Post-Biblical Judaism," in New Oxford History of Music,

senate and some emperors (such as Augustus and Tiberius) sought "to restrain the penetration and spread of the numerous mystery-cults, but in vain. For the great masses of the population, especially for those of the cities, the orgiastic rites and the music belonging to them exerted an irresistible attraction."²⁹ Among the philosophers also, "many voices were raised in pagan circles against the growing musical extravagance in secular life."³⁰ It is not surprising, therefore, that religions like orthodox Judaism and Christianity that worshipped the biblical, transcendent Creator were among the dissenting voices. As Hanoch Avenary observed:

Jingling, banging, and rattling accompanied heathen cults, and the frenzied shawms of a dozen ecstatic rites intoxicated the masses. Amid this euphoric farewell feast of a dying civilization, the voices of non-conformists were emerging from places of Jewish and early Christian worship."³¹

2. Persecuted by Jews and pagans alike, the cultivation of artistic expression was not a priority, and frequently not even

vol. 1, ed. Egon Wellesz [London: Oxford University Press, 1957], 315). See also Honigsheim, Music and Society, 118.

²⁹Sendrey, Music in the Social and Religious Life of Antiquity, 383. Sendrey continued by noting that "with these cults a great number of foreign musicians and dancers came to Rome. Their instruments and concert music gained little by little a firm foothold in the theater, and were later copiously employed in the entertainment music of the Romans" (ibid.).

³⁰Quasten, Music and Worship in Pagan and Christian Antiquity, 125. With the conviction that developed in Greek philosophy "that reason must be above and in control of the passions," a more "philosophical, less ecstatic type of religion emerged under the impact of Pythagorean, Platonic, Aristotelian, and Stoic philosophies. Connection with ethical principles characterized this conception of religion" (see Gardner's Art Through the Ages, 7th ed., revised by Horst de la Croix and Richard G. Tansey [San Diego and New York: Harcourt Brace Javonovich, 1980], 128; and Eric Werner, "Music and Religion in Greece, Rome, and Byzantium," The Encyclopedia of Religion, [1987], 10:204). Significantly, for this class of thinkers "the experience of emotional warmth and reassurance and a sense of unity with surrounding nature were not the hallmarks of an encounter with a present divinity. . . . The gods had become a convention to sophisticated minds" (Robin Lane Fox, Pagans and Christians [San Francisco: Harper and Row Publishers, 1988], 113).

³¹Hanoch Avenary, "The Emergence of Synagogue Song," Encyclopaedia Judaica, (1971), 12:566-571.

possible for the early Christians. Neither was the present life the focus of their attention. In their immediate vale of tears, they survived by clinging to the promises of the hereafter. While not ignoring the present, early Christian thought was anchored in the transcendent realm--God's ultimate control, power, and the eternal reality.

3. When Christianity was legitimized in the fourth century, the arts were patronized on a large scale by wealthy dignitaries of state and church. These individuals commissioned artistic expressions that carried the stamp of their tastes and ideas, which, in turn, had a major impact on the fledgling Christian artistic culture. As Grabar noted regarding the visual arts, it was their conceptions "of the glory and grandeur of God and the splendour of his epiphanies, of his relations with man, of the saints, his servants, and the church, the House of God"²² that found their way into the concretized artistic expressions. These realizations "took over the formulas used to extol the glory of the monarch and adapted them to Christian uses."²³ Thus, for the common people, a remote conception of God was nurtured by the thematic content of early Christian visual art. When the seat of the empire moved to Byzantium, a near-eastern influence with its stylistic bent towards anti-naturalism further fostered an other-worldly form of expression.

4. As sacerdotalism and sacramentalism²⁴ developed and congregational participation in worship was minimized, God was distanced even further from the worshippers' direct experience.

²²Grabar, Early Christian Art, 20.

²³Ibid., 34. See also Scranton, Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 318.

²⁴The elevation of the mediatorial role of the priesthood and the understanding of the sacraments as means of attaining grace.

5. The rise of monasticism, with its predilection for ascetic rejection of the physical world, firmly entrenched the transcendent orientation in Christian thinking until asceticism "became the ideal of Christian life."³⁵ As monastic communities emerged as the centers of learning and purveyors of Christian culture, their conception of the holy came to be equated with the beautiful and the good.³⁶

The aesthetic embodiment of what became the "God beyond us" conception of reality was captured in the musical context by Lang when he noted that "the subject and aim of Christian cult music was and remained . . . the glorification of God and the edification of man."³⁷ Its focus was the transcendent God, and humankind was to be taught about Him and raised into His realm. Contemplation, rather than involvement was the emphasis; idealism, not realism; instruction, not pleasure; spiritual meaning, not psycho-physiological power were the objectives.³⁸ These ideals can be traced in most Christian artistic expression over a period of a thousand years.

³⁵Lang, Music in Western Civilization, 58.

³⁶The widely acknowledged principle that "the genuinely Holy is also the Beautiful and the Good" was also a nurtured ideal in Judaism (see Werner, The Sacred Bridge, 314). See also Pss 29:2 and 96:9 where the phrase "beauty of holiness" evidences the same connection. There is no doubt that the conception of the Holy is the key element in the principle.

³⁷Werner, The Sacred Bridge, 41.

³⁸That these ideals were officially upheld by the Church, despite lapses in practice, is evident in the record of papal legislation on sacred music (Hayburn, Papal Legislation on Sacred Music, 11-30). The same ideals also undergirded the influential sacred music reforms of Pius X at the turn of the twentieth century (ibid., 205-231). Statements issued from the Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, however, evidenced a shift in emphasis. Regarding the aftermath of this document, see Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966 (Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967).

Commenting on Gothic architecture, Clark captured the ethos of that period when he wrote:

It is true that people entering the Gothic cathedrals left behind their life of material cares and seemed to pass into a different world. But it was a mysterious, awe-inspiring world in which hope of salvation was mixed with fear of death and judgment, and in simple communities the chief accent was on fear.³⁹

The "God beyond us" emphasis concentrated on God as authority figure--ruler, law giver, and judge. Its aesthetic creations certainly inspired mystery, awe, and reverence; and sometimes intimidation. Because of the Roman church's pervasive influence in Western culture, the ideals themselves persisted as the major cultural directive through the Middle Ages and were still evident beyond the sixteenth century, albeit with diminished adherence.

God For Us

The "God for us" characterization depicts the sixteenth-century Protestant Reformation's⁴⁰ retreat from the medieval transcendence orientation.⁴¹ Through a fresh understanding of the doctrine of salvation, the "distance" between the remote Deity and humanity was reduced and a new appreciation engendered for the more humanly accessible aspects of the Christian understanding of God.

As the mediatorial role of priests and saints was stripped away by the doctrine of the priesthood of all believers,⁴² and as access to God and His grace was proclaimed to be immediate upon the request of faith, unrelated to any meritorious action on the part of

³⁹Clark, Civilization, 238.

⁴⁰It should be noted that evidence of Reformation thinking had appeared before the sixteenth century in the work of John Wycliffe, the Brethren of the Common Life, John Huss, and others.

⁴¹Because of the intensity of emphasis on transcendence in the "God beyond us" concept of the divine, virtually every departure from this position meant an advance in the opposite direction.

⁴²See Martin Luther's treatise, "To the Christian Nobility of the German Nation" (1520) in Three Treatises, 2d rev. ed. by Martin Luther (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1970), 7-112.

the believer,⁴ fear of an exacting Judge was replaced by emphasis on a loving God who desired freely to save all through the gift of reconciliation provided in His Son. The person and work of Jesus Christ assumed a higher profile in the relationship of God to His creation. As Redeemer and Mediator, Christ became the One with whom believers identified.

The awesome mystery of the Divine engendered by minimal participation in worship was partially dissipated by increased involvement in the eucharist⁴ and congregational singing.⁴ God came to be seen more as "for us" than "over us." Though still recognized as above us, the shift in focus to His "kind face" and His reconciliatory activity for humankind undoubtedly realigned the emphasis along the transcendent/immanent continuum.

Aesthetically, this translated into the adoption of ideals that were closer to the common man and the natural reality of everyday experience. Although some Protestant groups never totally repudiated the "other-worldly" aspects of aesthetic sensibility, the move away from its domination was evident. For example, congregational music necessitated a music style appropriate for untrained voices and vernacular languages. Even so, the Calvinist ideals for congregational singing, as expressed in the Foreword to the Genevan Psalter (1543), tended toward a transcendence

⁴See Martin Luther, "The Freedom of a Christian" (1520), in *ibid.*, 277-316.

⁴This was strongly advocated by Martin Luther in "The Babylonian Captivity of the Church" (1520), in *ibid.*, 123-260.

⁴Luther began to champion the cause of congregational singing from 1523 onwards. Beginning 1537, John Calvin promoted congregational psalmody. Congregational singing had been practiced in previous reformatory movements, but the events of the sixteenth century provided an unquenchable impetus for its development.

orientation.⁴⁶ By contrast, Lutheran willingness to employ contrafacta (popular, even secular melodies adapted to liturgical use by changes in the associated text⁴⁷) clearly leaned in the other direction.

Significant as it was, the magnitude of the aesthetic shift toward natural, everyday reality during the period of the Protestant Reformation was comparatively limited. Because medieval music was generally homogeneous and "differences between plainsong, troubadour and folk styles were less important than their melodic interpenetration and their common relationship to a timeless universal deity,"⁴⁸ injection of secular forms into the liturgy at this time was a comparatively restricted shift in style. Recognition of a God-ward concern in artistic thought was still generally evident. However, perhaps the tempering of God as authority toward His reconciling attitude to humankind was encapsulated in the formula J. S. Bach used as a signature to his musical compositions up to the middle of the eighteenth century: "To the glory of God and recreation of my neighbor."⁴⁹ The greater warmth of the "recreation of my neighbor" replaced the more stark

⁴⁶See John Calvin, "Epistle to the Reader," trans. Charles Garside, Jr. in The Origins of Calvin's Theology of Music: 1536-1543 (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1979), 32. See also *ibid.*, 33.

⁴⁷See Friedrich Blume, "The Period of the Reformation," rev. by Ludwig Finscher and trans. R. Ellsworth Peterson in Protestant Church Music: A History, by Friedrich Blume with a foreword by Paul Henry Lang (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1974), 29-30.

⁴⁸Ballantine, Music and Its Social Meanings, 92. Similarly, F. Joseph Smith noted: "In a real sense, there is no distinction between the sacred and profane until the beginnings of the Baroque Era" (F. Joseph Smith, "Church Music and Tradition," in Cantors at the Crossroads: Essays on Church Music in Honor of Walter Buszin, ed. Johannes Riedel [St. Louis, Mo: Concordia Publishing House, 1967], 9-10).

⁴⁹Mark Bangert, "Church Music History, Classic and Romantic," in Key Words in Church Music: Definition Essays on Concepts, Practices and Movements of Thought in Church Music, ed. Carl Schalk (St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1978), 129.

domination of "the edification of man" in the perceived purpose of the musical expression.

God Beside Us/Within Us

From the seventeenth century to the present there has been a progressive move toward subjectivity in Christian thought. As the inner experience of God's transforming grace became more significant in Christian thought, and a personal relationship with the divine the dominant thrust of Christian proclamation, the immanental aspect of the divine nature and revelation was increasingly emphasized.³⁰ With the development of Pietism, Methodism, Evangelicalism, Revivalism, the Holiness movement, and Pentecostalism, as well as the trend toward existentialism, human experience of the divine became one of Christianity's marks of religious authenticity.³¹

Focus on human experience of the divine evidenced itself in an increased preoccupation with the conversion experience, "the betterment of the individual's heart and the increase of his

³⁰Horton and Hugh Davies wrote: "If the leading characteristics of the Christian-dominated medieval landscape was the Gothic cathedral with its powerful vertical thrust as if to prove the spirit was more powerful than the downdrag of stone and flesh, the typical direction of the modern religious spirit is horizontal. It moves away from the transcendental to the immanental, to perceiving God in humanity" (Horton Davies and Hugh Davies, Sacred Art in a Secular Century [Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1978], 81). In his discussion of Enthusiasm, Ronald A. Knox suggested two different types or manifestations of immanental emphasis which have "occasional similarities, but are . . . curiously different in their inspiration." He continued: "I would suggest a distinction between 'mystical' and 'evangelical' enthusiasm. One, taking its point of departure from the Incarnation, rather than the Atonement, by-passes the theology of grace and concentrates on the God within. . . . The other, more acutely conscious of man's fallen state, thinks always in terms of redemption; to know, somehow that your sins are forgiven, that you are a new creature in God's sight, is all that matters" (Ronald A. Knox, Enthusiasm: A Chapter in the History of Religion [Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1983], 581).

³¹See William C. Shepherd's discussion of the importance of religious experience in contemporary Christianity in "Religion and the Counter Culture--A New Religiosity," Sociological Inquiry 42 (1972): 5.

devotion and piety,"⁵² holy living, the work of the Holy Spirit in believers, and human psychology. Individualism also became paramount as "the real meaning of the [worship] service was considered to be what happened within the individual without reference to the body as a whole."⁵³

A major corollary of this shift to immanentalism was that a sense of divine presence came to be associated with "an 'affective state' altering the subject's emotional mood into joy, or warm elation, fear, too, or inner contentment."⁵⁴ In fact, the "inward experience of peace and joy is both the assurance which the soul craves for and its characteristic prayer-attitude."⁵⁵ The aesthetic implications of this are significant, for as the affective dimension was emphasized as imperative to a relationship with God, the dilemma regarding the equating of human emotional experience with spiritual experience surfaced.⁵⁶ Significantly, to paraphrase Jaroslav Pelikan, a mind conditioned to demand emotional satisfaction and exhilaration from religion can come to identify that emotional satisfaction and exhilaration with the holy.⁵⁷

Before pursuing these implications further, it should be noted that the immanental characterization seems to be comprised of

⁵²Schalk, Key Words in Church Music, 129.

⁵³This comment was originally made by Franklin M. Segler about Puritan worship in Christian Worship: Its Theology and Practice (Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1967), 48. Its relevance has become increasingly widespread in Western Christianity.

⁵⁴Fox, Pagans and Christians, 112.

⁵⁵Knox, Enthusiasm, 2.

⁵⁶See Knox's discussion of Wesley's vacillation in this regard (Knox, Enthusiasm, 537-540). See also Marini, "Rehearsal for Revival," 74; and J. W. Nevin, "The Anxious Bench," in American Religious Thought of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries, ed. Bruce Kuklick (New York and London: Garland Publishing, 1987), 3-56).

⁵⁷See Jaroslav Pelikan, Human Culture and the Holy: Essays on the True, the Good and the Beautiful (London: SCM Press, 1959), 123.

two closely related streams--a more conservative outlook that could be designated "God beside us" and a more unrestricted, immanental perspective that could be termed "God within us." Both streams have an immanental focus, and, particularly in the late twentieth century, they have tended to merge into one another rather than maintain clear distinctions. The first category--"God beside us"--included Pietism (in its initial seventeenth- and eighteenth-century phase), Methodism, and Evangelicalism. The second category--"God within us"--included nineteenth-century American Revivalism, the Holiness Movement, and Pentecostalism. The first stream stressed a daily, cooperative relationship with the Holy Spirit, while the second placed emphasis on abandonment to the Spirit's control. While both highlighted the closeness of the Divine, the former adopted a more reasoned posture, whereas the latter favored a more unrestrained, intuitive approach.

The "God Beside Us" Emphasis

In 1746 Jonathan Edwards addressed this issue in A Treatise Concerning Religious Affections. Seeking to clarify the ambiguity of the relationship between emotional and spiritual experience that had arisen during the First Great Awakening (beginning around 1735) in northeastern America, Edwards sought to strike a balance between heart experience and rational understanding in genuine Christian religion. Rejecting enthusiasm and "much of the popular piety resulting from the high tide of revivalistic preaching,"³⁸ he contended that

the heart . . . must be affected, for genuine religion is power and more than the verbal acceptance of doctrines. But the change of heart is not in the convulsion or the shout, the flowing tears or the inner voices. These external signs, the sensational marks

³⁸John E. Smith, ed., "Editor's Introduction" in Religious Affections, by Jonathan Edwards (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959), 49.

of revivalism in every age, are no guarantee of genuine faith; there are other tests to be met."⁵⁹

Edwards enumerated twelve tests that he felt needed to be applied to ascertain genuine spiritual emotional experience, as well as describing in detail what they were not.

Samuel Blair (1789) outlined an aesthetic extrapolation of this basic outlook in a speech entitled "A Discourse on Psalmody" that he delivered at a sacred concert at a Presbyterian Church in Neshaminy, Pennsylvania. Espousing the view that there is "an intimate connection between sounds . . . and the sentiments of the heart,"⁶⁰ he suggested that in this lay the foundation for the moral operation of sacred music on human nature.⁶¹ Speaking of sacred music, he wrote:

External harmony prepares the mind . . . for the admission of the moral objects, and for due attention to them when admitted. For it forms us into the same kind of inward frame, and places us . . . in that same kind of posture, into which we should have been brought by the moral affection itself, had it previously arisen. It first removes the impediment, which . . . might have operated against the admission; and then by direct influence disposeth the mind to advert to such objects as are most consonant with the present impression. . . . The consequence is that, that feeling, which, in its first appearance was merely the result of the musical impulses, hath now become a real, effective, and profitable sentiment.⁶²

Although Blair maintained that there was a similarity between a musically induced experience and a spiritual sentiment of the heart, he stopped short of asserting their equality. Rather, he emphasized that the association of "the impulses of harmony" and "those of the word" should "stamp an impression, marked at once with the perceptions and feelings of piety," in which the word took "a deeper hold of the heart, and assumed a more uniform sway in the character

⁵⁹Ibid.

⁶⁰Samuel Blair, A Discourse on Psalmody (Philadelphia: John McCulloch, 1789), 11. Microcard Evans 21695.

⁶¹Ibid., 12.

⁶²Ibid.

and practice."⁴³ In other words, music could be a catalyst for genuine spiritual experience.

The "God Within Us" Emphasis

As Revivalist enthusiasm⁴⁴ and popular piety were rekindled in early nineteenth-century America, the relationship between emotional and spiritual experience was no longer so discreetly distinguished. Accounts of early nineteenth-century American Revivalism bear this out. For example, Jerald C. Brauer wrote:

It was highly emotional, almost anti-intellectual. What was of most importance for the revivalist was a gripping emotional experience. If one deeply felt his conversion, if one shed tears, or one had been stricken down, or if one had been possessed by the jerks, then chances were that one was converted.⁴⁵

Brauer noted that the greater emotional emphasis of these American frontier revivals resulted in "the emergence of one of the most distinctive features of American Protestantism,"⁴⁶ although he acknowledged a difference of degree (not kind) in emphasis among denominations in different regions of the country.⁴⁷

⁴³Ibid., 20-21.

⁴⁴Quasten indicated that the term "enthusiast" was initially connected with the pagan mystery cults in which a heightened state of consciousness prepared the individual to be "receptive to the god who came to be united with him. Such a person was then an ἐν θεός, an enthusiast" (Quasten, Music and Worship in Pagan and Christian Antiquity, 36).

⁴⁵Jerald C. Brauer, Protestantism in America: A Narrative History, rev. ed. (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1965), 112.

⁴⁶Ibid. See also Jens Lund, "Fundamentalism, Racism, and Political Reaction in Country Music," in The Sounds of Social Change: Studies in Popular Culture, ed. Serge R. Denisoff and Richard A. Peterson (Chicago: Rand McNally and Company, 1972), 79; and Scholes, The Puritans and Music, 359.

⁴⁷Brauer, Protestantism in America, 113. Because nineteenth-century religious developments in the United States have significantly influenced Western Christianity as a whole, this emotional emphasis has had a wide-ranging impact. For example, the United States became the adopted home of Pietism and Evangelicalism. It has nurtured Revivalism, the Holiness Movement and Pentecostalism, and encouraged and supported Protestant Liberalism and existentialism. Intense missionary activity has rendered the

Like the Holiness groups that developed later in nineteenth-century America, twentieth-century Pentecostalism largely embodied nineteenth-century frontier Revivalist attitudes. Pentecostalism's emphasis on a total experience that appeals to all the senses;⁶⁶ emotional and kinesthetic involvement rather than contemplation⁶⁷ with a consequent downplay of the philosophical and the abstract;⁶⁸ functional realism rather than idealism;⁶⁹ music's ability to attract potential worshippers;⁷⁰ and the coincidence of pleasure and effect of the first five of these movements worldwide.

⁶⁶Donald P. Hustad, Jubilate! Church Music in the Evangelical Tradition (Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1981), 163; and Delton L. Alford, "Pentecostal and Charismatic Music," Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements (1988): 693.

⁶⁷See Paul W. Wohlgemuth, "Praise Singing," The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 20; Duncan, "Music Among Early Pentecostals," 11; and Alford, "Pentecostal and Charismatic Music," 690.

⁶⁸This is evident in the fact that the power of music rather than verbal meanings are considered paramount (see Duncan's descriptions in "Music Among Early Pentecostals," 14). As Lawrence B. Larsen observed: "Pentecostals do not seem to need to sing their unique doctrinal beliefs" (Lawrence B. Larsen, "We Have Come a Long Way . . ." The Hymn 38 [January 1987]: 16). In the context of Charismatic praise singing, Wohlgemuth noted: "The expectation of the worshipper . . . tends to tilt toward a more emotional response rather than intellectual comprehension" (Wohlgemuth, "Praise Singing," 22).

⁶⁹Hustad noted that from the mid-nineteenth century "a 'popular' approach to music had taken over. . . . Church music was now expected to be functional in the evangelical sense that everybody should share it. Consequently it moved to the level of the worshipper who rarely frequented the concert hall.

"The situation has not changed drastically up to the present time. . . . What is performed in ninety-nine percent of American churches today is functional church music that should not be confused with great art" (Hustad, Jubilate! 30).

⁷⁰Duncan observed that "scores of individuals who eventually became Pentecostal leaders testified that they were attracted at first to this strange new religion by the music" (Duncan, "Music Among Early Pentecostals," 11). Despite the use of dismal places of worship, "converts were constantly attracted, often by the rhythmic joyous music" (ibid., 12).

worship⁷³ clearly demonstrate its immanentist and anthropocentric orientation. In light of the Charismatic movement's sensational growth across denominational and international boundaries in the second half of this century,⁷⁴ and Pentecostalism's leadership in the contemporary Christian music field,⁷⁵ this strong immanentist orientation with its concomitant aesthetic is having a wide influence on twentieth-century Christendom.⁷⁶

⁷³In summing up the new Pietism of the twentieth century, including Pentecostalism, Hustad warned that the "new enjoyment" evident in contemporary expressions of worship "may lead to a worship hedonism which is another form of idolatry--worshipping the experience instead of God" (Hustad, Jubilate! 165).

⁷⁴In his "Annual Statistical Table on Global Mission: 1993," David B. Barrett recorded a growth from 74,366,000 Pentecostals/Charismatics in 1970 to 429,523,000 in 1993. Taken as percentages of the total number of practicing Christians worldwide, these figures reveal a comparative growth from 8% to 34%. By the year 2000 it is estimated that Pentecostals and Charismatics will comprise over 40% of practicing Christendom (David B. Barrett, "Annual Statistical Table on Global Mission: 1993," International Bulletin of Missionary Research 17 [January 1993]: 22-23).

⁷⁵See Alford, "Pentecostal and Charismatic Music," 693. Significantly, Samuel Laeuchli noted that "new forms of art" are usually close "to the charismatic trends, the Dionysian in religion" (Samuel Laeuchli, Religion and Art in Conflict: Introduction to a Cross-Disciplinary Task [Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1980], 80).

⁷⁶See Wohlgemuth, "Praise Singing," 23; and Donald Hustad, "The Historical Roots of Music in the Pentecostal and Neo-Pentecostal Movements," The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 10.

While American-based Pentecostalism has been used as a prime example in the above discussion, immanentism was also strongly evident in early twentieth-century Europe's more liberal theological climate. Commenting on the situation in England, for example, Horton Davies observed: "Immanentism was given impetus from both theological and sociological pressures at the very beginning of the century" (Horton Davies, Worship and Theology in England: The Ecumenical Century 1900-1965, 124). (This immanentism was also evident later in the century [see *ibid.*, 208].) Among some, the deity of Christ was repudiated, social duty became paramount, and the other-worldly considered irrelevant (*ibid.*, 128). There was an "utter dominance of the immanentist over the transcendental concept of God, so that the mystery, the majesty, and the judgment of God were dissipated," and the secular Utopianism of the day was confused with the historical hope of Kingdom (*ibid.*, 133). Among others, there was renewed interest in mysticism, and the heart experience of religion that "unites both Catholic and Protestant" became a focus for ecumenism. Predictably, aesthetic expectations in worship mirrored the more subjective focus (*ibid.*, 135). (See also Davies' description of hymnody in the first half of the twentieth century, and the introduction of "church light music" in the latter half of

The essence of much late twentieth-century Western Christianity was encapsulated by Shepherd in his assessment of the religiosity of 1960s and 1970s Western youth culture. He wrote: "What counts . . . is the integrity of the experience, the depth with which it is felt, the needs it fulfills, the unifying or patterning function it provides. That one does have such experiences is the important thing."⁷ Consequently, what aesthetically stimulated the experience was incorporated, and evaluation was based on how effectively the experience was generated or enhanced.⁸

The predominantly this-worldly aesthetic sensibility that manifested itself among "God within us"-oriented Christians was little removed from that espoused by an increasingly non-theistically-oriented secular society (particularly from the eighteenth century onwards). As the divine realm was denied, natural reality automatically came to dominate life's perspective.⁹ Martin Cooper insightfully pinpointed the aesthetic consequences of this in his analysis of nineteenth-century Romanticism when he wrote:

this century [ibid., 115 and 108-109].)

⁷Shepherd, "Religion and the Counter Culture," 7.

⁸It is not surprising that the increasing attention afforded personal experience of the divine in the "God beside us"/"God within us" orientation led to rejection of what is perceived as aesthetically abstract. This is evident, for example, in the negative attitude shown toward Roman Catholic liturgical music and many art music forms among Pietists, Evangelicals, Revivalists, and Pentecostals. Their general rejection of this type of music may be, first and foremost, a function of their "God beside us/within us" orientation.

⁹See Eric Mascall's statement: "We live in a thoroughly secularized age; that is to say, in an age in which most men and women simply take it for granted that 'this world'--the world which we see and hear and smell and touch and taste during the brief span of time that stretches for each one of us from the cradle to the grave--is the only reality of which we need seriously to take account" (Eric Mascall, "Faith and Fashion," The Listener 74 [December 23, 1965]: 1019).

Man, no longer able to think of himself as his Creator's darling, has been left with a sense of diminished importance, of inferior status. Everyday life, no longer shared with his Creator or illuminated by the supernatural, has come to seem colorless and uninteresting, only worth living in moments of unusual excess, tragic or sensual. . . .

In fact, man's progressive deprivation of the supernatural, the progressive starving of an innate appetite, led to a gradual depraving of that appetite, to cravings for strange foods and to attempts to satisfy by other means an instinct which finds itself denied natural satisfaction. In place of food and drink for his spirit, man has looked in the arts for spices, stimulants or narcotics. Taught to expect neither help nor sympathy from outside or above himself, he takes to worshipping his own image and investing his own emotions with an absolute value, rating them simply by their intensity and no longer referring them to absolute standards of good or evil.¹⁰

Cooper's provocative insights are corroborated by at least two other developments. First, Western aesthetic theories of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries¹¹ clearly reflect the ultimate this-worldly, humanistic focus, in which human passions and perceptions are idealized.¹² Second, the rise of the arts to fulfill a quasi-religious function vacated by traditional religion has been regularly noted. In fact, Romanticism's equating of music and the divine "was characteristic for much of the musical sensibility of the nineteenth and even twentieth centuries."¹³

¹⁰Martin Cooper, Ideas and Music (New York: Chilton Books, 1965), 5. See also Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 156, 157.

¹¹See the writings of Theodor Lipps, Herbert Spencer, Heinrich Schenker, and Wilhelm Dilthey in Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988).

¹²Compare the Al Fārūqī's statement: "Modern Western man has little tolerance for any deity as far as metaphysics is concerned. But as far as ethics and conduct are concerned, the 'gods' that he creates out of his idealizations of human passions and tendencies are the real determinants of his action" (Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 86).

¹³H. G. Koenigsberger, Politicians and Virtuosi (London: Hambleton Press, 1986), 200. The foundations for this had been laid in the twelfth century by Suger who had argued "that we could only come to understand absolute beauty, which is God, through the affect of precious and beautiful things on our senses" (Suger; quoted in Clark, Civilization, 50). See also *ibid.*, 60. For Goethe's benefit, Beethoven stated: "Music is the only incorporeal entrance into a higher world of knowledge. . . . Thus art always represents the deity, and man's relation to art is religion" (Beethoven; quoted

Convergence between the anthropocentric aesthetic ideals of religious immanent orientation⁴⁴ and the secular orientation seems to explain why Christian groups disposed toward the "God within us" orientation felt comfortable incorporating into their sacred music secularly developed music styles such as opera and theater music, as well as other popular vocal and dance music. The same source--the natural realm with an anthropocentric focus--had inspired the music desired and utilized in both settings.⁴⁵

in Koenigsberger, Politicians and Virtuosi, 199). Koenigsberger further observed that in the nineteenth century "music and its emotional appeal, even the persons of the composers of music, had become identified with religion and were held to speak the language of religion, thus providing an emotional satisfaction which the traditional church service could no longer provide" (ibid., 202). He continued by attributing the extraordinary development of music in nineteenth-century Western culture to "the decline of conventional religious beliefs" and to the "psychological inadequacy of the Churches in fulfilling the religious longings of large sections of the educated European public; for music was able to provide precisely these emotional satisfactions and, by a process of rationalization and justification also, apparently, those eternal truths which the Churches used to provide" (ibid., 206). See also ibid., 209-210; and Patrick Collinson, The Birthpangs of Protestant England: Religious and Cultural Change in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1988), 112.

Franz Liszt's 1835 discussion of the "regeneration of religious music" strongly reinforces Koenigsberger's observation by calling for art to "leave the temple," and "stretch itself and seek to accomplish its major developments in the outside world." He called for a "humanistic music" that would "sum up both the THEATER and the CHURCH on a colossal scale," and he foresaw a time when "ultimately all classes of people will be joined together in a common, religious, grand and sublime feeling." He continued: "That will be the FIAT LUX of Art. Come, come then, oh age of glory, when art in all its forms will complete and fulfill itself, when it will raise itself to its ultimate heights by fraternally uniting all mankind in rapturous wonder" (Franz Liszt, "Religious Music of the Future," in An Artist's Journey: Lettres d'un bachelier ès musique 1835-1841, by Franz Liszt, trans. and annotated by Charles Suttoni [Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1989], 236-237). See also Bangert, "Church Music History: Classic and Romantic," 132-133. Bolam and Henderson in Art and Belief, 119 and 120, suggested that in the wake of the assertion that God is dead, the artist's own imagination and creativity is worshipped as an end in itself.

⁴⁴Since Vatican II, this is also evident in the traditionally transcendence-oriented Roman Catholic Church (Winter, Why Sing? 228, 240-241).

⁴⁵Interestingly, when art music styles began to focus on expression of the human subconscious thus employing a more abstract bent, religious sacred styles drew almost exclusively from the

The Christian Concept of God and the Characteristics
of Sacred Music Style

The array of aesthetic sensibilities generated by a spectrum of Christian beliefs regarding God's transcendence/immanence is manifested in the range of stylistic features in Western Christian sacred music over the last two millennia.

The "God Beyond Us" Orientation

In a direct comparison with Islamic sacred sound art, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī observed that for both Islām and early Christianity the supersensory, non-phenomenal nature of ultimate reality was perceived as ideally "divorced from everyday existence" and that it was inexpressible in "musical terms which were imitative or suggestive of the physical world, with its extremes of joy, of pain and sorrow, and of swift changes between the two."⁶⁶ She further contended that "kinesthetic impulses, whether psychologically felt or physically expressed, which reminded of the rough and tumble of everyday life,"⁶⁷ were considered improper to early Christian and Islamic worship. Portraying sacred music style under this orientation, Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī continued:

Religious music . . . avoided the emotive, the frivolous, the unfettered responses either to great joy or great sorrow. The limited range and contiguity of notes in Gregorian and Qur'ānic chant, the prevalence of stepwise progression, the avoidance of large melodic leaps--all these contributed to this demand. The relaxed tempos, the calm and continuous movement, the rejection of strong accents and changes of intensity or volume were likewise conducive to an attitude of contemplation and departure from worldly involvement. The use of regularly repeated metric units would have tended to arouse associations, kinesthetic movements and emotions incompatible with the notion of religiosity among Muslims and early Christians. These were therefore avoided.

popular vocal and dance music genres that were strongly anchored in the realm of the natural human consciousness.

⁶⁶Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 28.

⁶⁷Ibid.

. . . [The music] contributed little or nothing to dramatic/ programmatic content or tone painting imitating the objects, events, ideas, or feelings of this world. Hence abstract quality has been a marked feature in both chant traditions. Formal characteristics accorded with this tendency, making elements of unity and change dependent upon correspondence with poetic units rather than with narrative or descriptive factors. Performance practice, relying on the human voice, has avoided the secular associations which instruments might bring, as well as the chordal harmonies which could be suggestive of emotional or dramatic effects. Even the use of the human voice or voices in these genres of religious music has avoided the sensual and imitative in order to enhance the spiritual effect on the listener.⁸

The coupling of the characteristics of early Christian and Islamic sacred music styles in this description⁹ is significant, for although Christian and Muslim cultures were clearly disparate, even antagonistic at times, an underlying religious factor guided both to a similar sacred sound art style.

Initially inherited from the Jewish synagogue,¹⁰ early Christian church music style was consciously nurtured¹¹ over

⁸Ibid. For similar descriptions see Archibald T. Davison, Church Music: Illusion and Reality (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1952), 37-38; Wilfrid Mellers, Music and Society (New York: Roy Publishers, 1950), 36; Grout, A History of Western Music, 36, 45; Rowell, Thinking About Music, 94-97; Dunwell, Music and the European Mind, 22, 36; Sorokin, The Crisis of Our Age, 31-32, 40-41; and Blacking, How Musical Is Man? 74.

⁹This is supported by Nettl's observation that medieval Christian liturgical chant "sounded not too different from the singing style of Persian art music or from the chanting of the Koran and the call to prayer." He also affirmed "that the structure of a great deal of liturgical music from the Middle Ages, especially the way the words are set to music, appears similar to the structure of the non-metrical improvised classical music or religious chanting of Iran and other Islamic countries" (Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 97).

¹⁰See Werner, The Sacred Bridge, xiii, 2-3, 26; Werner, "The Music of Post-Biblical Judaism," 316; Hanoch Avenary, "The Roots of Synagogue Song in the Near Eastern Communities (c. 70-950 C.E)," Encyclopaedia Judaica (1971), 12:571-590; and Johanna Spector, "Chanting," The Encyclopedia of Religion, (1987), 3:204-213.

¹¹Although folk styles of music existed, they were bypassed or outrightly rejected by the church (Wilfrid Dunwell, Music and the European Mind [New York: Thomas Yoseloff, 1962], 37; Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 96; Glickman, "Tonality and Gravity," 120; and Grout, A History of Western Music, 23). The intentional contrast between the music style of the surrounding culture and that of Christian worship and everyday life is a consistent theme in

succeeding centuries to refine those features befitting the prevailing transcendence orientation."⁷² Both early Jewish synagogue music and early Christian music exhibit the same intentionally restricted type of biblical chant,⁷³ but certain minor points of difference existed, particularly regarding the expression of human feeling. Avenary noted that Christian music "endeavored by imitation to approach the heavenly model [the perfect beauty of angelic song]." Striving "increasingly for superhuman transcendental beauty," it created "a perfect but cold product of art."⁷⁴ By contrast, in Jewish chant the "human song of praise is given preference over the pure and flawless beauty [presumably] heard from the heavenly hosts, and the standards of sacred song are set by the warmth of devotion resounding from earthly voices, imperfect and human as they may be."⁷⁵ In other words, in the Jewish context, beauty for its own sake was not the ultimate aim, although there was a tendency in this direction in the Christian setting.

early church writings. See Clement of Alexandria's exhortations in Paedagogus II, iv (excerpts 51 and 55); Novation's De spectaculis III, 2-3 (excerpt 90); Arnobius' Adversus nationes II, 42 (excerpt 95); Gregory of Nazianzus' Oration v, Contra Julianum II, 35 (excerpt 145); John Chrysostom's In psalmum xli I, (excerpt 165); and In Acta Apostolorum, Hom. XLII, 3 (excerpt 182) in Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987).

⁷²It is interesting to note that music in Ethiopia tended to follow the same vocal, melodic, text-oriented, model under Jewish and Christian influence (see Kebede, "The Music of Ethiopia," 32-37). When instruments are used, they tend to duplicate the vocal melody and singing style (ibid., 134). In the culture as a whole, chordophones play the most important musical role; then aerophones, membranophones, and idiophones respectively (ibid., 136). "Pulsation is inherent in the metric pattern of the verses, otherwise percussive sounds and instruments of rhythm are generally avoided" (ibid., 170).

⁷³See Avenary, "The Roots of Synagogue Song in the Near Eastern Communities (c. 70-950 C.E.)."

⁷⁴Ibid.

⁷⁵Ibid.

The significance of Christian liturgical music as the stylistic standard bearer for musical culture during the medieval period has already been alluded to above. Antagonism to instruments, because of their ubiquitous association with the noise and clamor of pagan worship,* along with a strong emphasis on word-oriented music, initially channeled development of Western music culture into a strong vocal orientation. The restraint born of a transcendental view of reality also evidenced itself in the general ethos of medieval music." Church music clearly headed the hierarchy of music acceptable in society. It was also the site of significant innovation,* and thus, it determined the direction of artistic development as a whole.

Alternative "climates of opinion" did exist. One such was the Arian heresy that--significant for this study--denied the divinity of Christ, emphasizing His humanity and "nearness" to humankind. As might be expected, the followers of Arius were associated with a more "this-worldly" worship music style. As Fleming noted:

*See Quasten, Music and Worship in Pagan and Christian Antiquity, 61. This caused some consternation regarding Old Testament temple worship accounts and led to spiritualized and allegoric explanations (ibid., 62-65). See also Grout, A History of Western Music, 25.

"See Honigsheim's observation that until recently "most 'classical' (fine art) music of Europe is differentiated from the music of other cultures by a lessened emphasis on rhythm; greater importance is given to other aspects of music production, especially melody" (Music and Society, 205). Davison indicated that up to the early sixteenth century "the musical language employed for madrigals and masses was strikingly similar. Allowing for certain refinements which set one apart from the other, a composer undertaking to write a love song was, in general, limited to the musical vocabulary and technical method of church music (Church Music, 27). Writing of Gregorian chant, Grout observed that it was "the source and inspiration of a large proportion of all Western music up to the sixteenth century" (Grout, A History of Western Music, 22, 36). See also Reese, Music in the Middle Ages, 218.

*Nettl, "The Role of Music in Culture," 96.

Arius . . . was accused of insinuating his religious ideas into the minds of his followers by means of hymns that were sung to melodies derived from drinking songs and theatrical tunes. Such hymns were frowned upon in orthodox circles because they were too closely allied with popular music. Furthermore, the Arian way of singing them was described as loud and raucous.⁹⁹

Predictably, this type of music, along with its heretical theology, was repudiated.¹⁰⁰

Some concepts from "foreign" pagan sources were embraced, however. The powerful influence of worldview considerations is evident in the church's adoption of Neoplatonic views as the basis of music theory throughout the Middle Ages. Plato's idealism (the closest pagan, philosophical equivalent of a transcendent emphasis) upheld the chaste restraint, peace, and order of the Apollonian style and, therefore, was seen as favorable support for similar church-espoused ideals. Consequently, despite its differing presuppositions, aspects of Greek music theory and ideals were closely intertwined with Christian thought through the writings of Boethius and Cassiodorus.¹⁰¹

⁹⁹Fleming, Arts and Ideas, 112.

¹⁰⁰At first, there was some reciprocation by Hilary, Bishop of Poitiers and Ambrose, from within orthodox circles, but their efforts were not perpetuated.

¹⁰¹See Werner, The Sacred Bridge, 337. See also Alexander L. Ringer's assertion that: "The unyielding conservatism of the Roman Catholic church in matters musical was in effect an integral function of the platonic teachings pervading all early Christian thought and behavior. If at first instrumental music was rejected because of its close association with certain abhorrent pagan rites, later on objections even to vocal music other than the sacred monophony propagated in the name of Gregory I were often raised in terms of the moral dangers inherent in the very idea of musical novelty for its own sake" (Alexander L. Ringer, "Religious Music in the West," The Encyclopedia of Religion, [1987], 10:209-216). See also Rowell, Thinking about Music, 101.

The "God For Us" Orientation

The prevailing "God beyond us" style of church music manifested in Gregorian chant and polyphony¹⁰² did not disappear with the onset of the Protestant Reformation.¹⁰³ Rather, through the new understanding of God's reconciling attitude to humankind, music more expressive of everyday life was no longer shunned.

In response to Luther's theologically motivated call for congregational, vernacular worship songs in 1523,¹⁰⁴ a new style of sacred music (the chorale) was intentionally forged. It incorporated the secular barform structure (AAB) of the German Meistersinger tradition. Melodic contour often reflected the secular Lied tradition¹⁰⁵ or developed independently, as Blume suggested, in response to the heightened impulse toward a more dramatic form of proclamation and confession.¹⁰⁶ The melody was eventually placed in the top voice, instead of in the tenor line where musically untrained congregations found it difficult to

¹⁰²Polyphony could be defined as music consisting of several simultaneously sounding melodies. During the Middle Ages it was basically a complex extension of the chant style.

¹⁰³In fact, Palestrina brought it to a climax in the mid- to late-sixteenth-century Roman Catholic setting. Luther also did not reject contrapuntal music. In fact, by manifesting some ambiguity toward the acceptance of churchly ceremonies and traditional art and secular life, Luther left the door open for later divisions in Lutheranism regarding the choice of worship experience as "aesthetic contemplation and the longing for beautiful form as fulfillment of religious need" (Blume, "The Period of the Reformation," 122). See also Irwin, "Shifting Alliances," 56, 57.

¹⁰⁴Martin Luther, "An Order of Mass and Communion for the Church at Wittenberg," in Ulrich S. Leupold, ed. Liturgy and Hymns, vol. 53 of Luther's Works, ed. Helmut T. Lehmann (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1965), 36.

¹⁰⁵William J. Reynolds and Milburn Price, A Survey of Christian Hymnody (Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1987), 17.

¹⁰⁶Blume, "The Period of the Reformation," 38.

follow.¹⁰⁷ This spurred the use of chordal harmony and a predilection to move beyond the church modes to major tonality.¹⁰⁸ The use of the "flexible mensural rhythm and the durational accent" of popular Renaissance song¹⁰⁹ also provided a rhythmic vitality lacking in the calmer ebb and flow of chant and related contrapuntal church music. Additionally, the conviction that the original meaning of some secular music--with its authentic expression of acceptable human feelings and experiences, irrespective of original texts--could be legitimately recaptured for worship by fusing it with a new sacred text led to the judicious reclamation of secular music for the church during the Reformation.¹¹⁰

Although begotten of a generally more conservative approach, Genevan metrical psalm melodies also evidenced the presence of harmonic implications in melodic lines,¹¹¹ and partook of the new rhythmic verve. However, in light of Calvin's theological stress on

¹⁰⁷This step was taken by Lucas Osiander in his 1586 collection of homophonically arranged chorales (see Paul Nettl, Luther and Music, trans. Frida Best and Ralph Wood [Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1948], 89; and Friedrich Blume, "The Age of Confessionalism," trans. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel in Protestant Church Music: A History, by Friedrich Blume with a foreword by Paul Henry Lang [New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1974], 136).

¹⁰⁸Reynolds and Price, A Survey of Christian Hymnody, 17.

¹⁰⁹Bukofzer, Music in the Baroque Era, 81.

¹¹⁰See Clytus Gottwald's insightful explanation of the use of contrafacta: "Contrafacta does not consist in accompanying any text with any beautiful music, but rather in matching the meaning that is embedded in the music irrespective of the original text." ("Kontrafaktur besteht also nicht darin, irgendeiner schönen Musik irgendeinen Text zu unterlegen, sondern darin, durch die Unterlegung den Gehalt der Musik zu treffen, der in diese unabhängig von dem ursprünglichen Text eingesenkt ist.") Clytus Gottwald, "Von der Babylonischen Gefangenschaft der Musik. Josquin und Luther's Encomion" in Ursprung der Biblia Deutsch von Martin Luther, ed. Stefan Strohm and Eberhard Zwink (Stuttgart: Württembergischen Landesbibliothek; Quell-Verlag, 1983), 105. It should be kept in mind that the extent of such "borrowing" was ultimately stylistically contained by the church's restraining influence on the culture as a whole.

¹¹¹Reynolds and Price, A Survey of Christian Hymnody, 31.

God's sovereignty, it is not surprising that he wrote:

There must always be concern that the song be neither light nor frivolous, but have gravity and majesty. . . . There is a great difference between the music which one makes to entertain men at table and in their homes, and the psalms which are sung in the church in the presence of God and His angels.¹¹²

Rejecting the use of contrafacta,¹¹³ he developed a new strophic (each stanza using the same melody) and syllabic (predominantly one note for each syllable) sacred song style based entirely on versifications of Scripture. Typical of a more transcendent orientation, the meter, stanza, and line length were all determined by the text. As Waldo Seldon Pratt observed:

The prevailing aim seems to have been to make each Psalm individual in text and tune, something to be treasured in the memory and consciousness by itself. This aim at individuality is certainly achieved in both words and music, but the process is usually dictated by the verse.¹¹⁴

The tight integration of music and text, melodically as well as rhythmically, meshed with the humanistic ideals of the time, although done by the young Calvinist church for theological reasons.¹¹⁵ Interestingly, Calvin envisaged that this newly created sacred music would become the model for all musical activity, "even in the homes and fields."¹¹⁶

Dunwell's description and explanation of the developmental thrust of general Western art music style in the sixteenth century provides contextual perspective on early Protestant church music developments. He wrote that there was a

¹¹²Calvin, "Epistle to the Reader," 32. See also *ibid.*, 33.

¹¹³Charles Garside, Jr., The Origins of Calvin's Theology of Music: 1536-1543 (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1979), 19.

¹¹⁴Pratt, The Music of the French Psalter of 1562, 26.

¹¹⁵Blankenburg, "Church Music in Reformed Europe," 532.

¹¹⁶John Calvin; quoted in Charles Garside, Jr., "Calvin's Preface to the Psalter: A Re-appraisal," The Musical Quarterly 37 (October 1951): 571.

growing use of chordal harmony with appreciation of its expressive effect in alliance with discord and chromaticism; a natural tendency for a single melodic line to become prominent (either as the highest voice or against an instrumental background), so facilitating individual instead of corporate expression; an increasing adoption of secular rhythms from popular music into cultivated art; and an organization of the miscellaneous legacy of medieval instruments in groups and families, which provided the foundation for a well-defined instrumental art."¹¹⁷

Dunwell went on to explain that "these developments, which are essential for the expression of human experience," were "clearly a reinforcement of tendencies which had been present in secular music for centuries" and in "opposition to a prevailing ecclesiastical art based on oriental melody and on polyphony which excludes all worldly elements."¹¹⁸ Similarly, Davison noted that sixteenth-century secular music brought "music close to reality" so that "both words and music could combine in a joint, vivid portrayal of secular experience."¹¹⁹ It is this proximity to reality and expression of human experience that Protestant church music captured at this time.

Alluding to the same development as Dunwell and Davison, Pratt¹²⁰ added that coming in the early part of this process of Western music transformation, Protestant church song, albeit with "no conscious motive of artistic reconstruction," had a considerable impact on that process. He wrote: "The ardor that went into it and the immense range of circulation that it attained doubtless made it more of positive and determinative factor than is usually conceded for it by historians."¹²¹ Thus, again it would appear that religious presuppositions, in this case those that inspired the

¹¹⁷Dunwell, Music and the European Mind, 102-103. See also Rowell, Thinking about Music, 99-100.

¹¹⁸Dunwell, Music and the European Mind, 103.

¹¹⁹Davison, Church Music, 28.

¹²⁰Pratt, The Music of the French Psalter of 1562, 6-7.

¹²¹Ibid., 7.

early Protestant church song, influenced the general developmental direction of music style in Western culture.

The "God Beside Us/Within Us" Orientation

The "God Beside Us" Emphasis

With the trend toward religious subjectivity in seventeenth-century Pietism and subsequent eighteenth-century evangelical movements, sacred music style increasingly migrated in the direction of the theater, as developed in opera and its derivatives. Writing about seventeenth-century developments, Bukofzer indicated that "while Crüger's chorales still breathed the collective, congregational spirit of the liturgical chorale, later compositions approached in their individual devotional spirit the sacred aria or song."¹² He noted that "the innumerable contrafacta of operatic arias in the late chorale books marked the end of chorale composition."¹³ The development of oratorios and cantatas with the concerted style incorporating choir, soloists, and instruments confirmed this trend which merely escalated in the eighteenth century. Even in Catholic countries, "the dominant trend was to introduce into the church the musical idioms and forms of opera, with orchestral accompaniment, da capo arias and accompanied recitatives."¹⁴ The move toward a more this-worldly oriented music style was in full swing.

While the tendency in folk music is to express the emotions linked to everyday human existence, theater music tends to amplify them in order to enhance audience perception. Stylistic features are developed to comprise a more evocative language. The development of tonal harmony, regular accentual rhythm, tone

¹²Bukofzer, Music in the Baroque Era, 80.

¹³Ibid., 81.

¹⁴Grout, A History of Western Music, 474.

painting, independent instrumental writing, increased pitch range, more disjunct melodies, and dynamic contrast increasingly contributed to a communication more capable of the vivid portrayal of experience. Naturally, once secular music style was released from church domination it rapidly developed its own potent this-worldly communicative style.¹²⁵ Then, as the Christian concept of God became more immanent, the church appropriated this music style for its own use.

Describing the development of musical Methodism in eighteenth-century England, Routley remarked that "the music which came naturally to the composers who furnished the tunes for the early evangelical hymn books was the music of the opera house and concert room, the music of solo and chorus, melody and bass, aria and continuo."¹²⁶ The influence of this style contributed to "the complete ascendancy of music over verbal rhythm." The music was "wedded to dance rhythms in square and symmetrical units, cast in monodic form and impregnated with the atmosphere of virtuosity."¹²⁷

Noting that John Wesley consciously rejected polyphony as the music of his movement,¹²⁸ Routley poignantly suggested that

we really cannot say that it just happened coincidentally, that the Handelian style (a translation of the Italian style) in music was available for assimilation into Christian worship. We can only say that the individualism of Charles Wesley's religious approach and that of Handel's music flow from a common cultural source.¹²⁹

¹²⁵Davison, Church Music, 27, 28.

¹²⁶Eric Routley, The Musical Wesleys (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1968), 34.

¹²⁷Eric Routley, The Music of Christian Hymnody (London: Independent Press, 1957), 92.

¹²⁸Routley, The Musical Wesleys, 34.

¹²⁹Ibid.

Clearly, that "common cultural source" included a greater immanental focus in the understanding of ultimate reality.¹³⁰

It is generally acknowledged that toward the late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century, Methodist music went into decline. Trivial tunes that were harmonically barren, repetitious, and overly florid¹³¹ took over as an impoverished, amateur imitation of operatic style emerged. Church music in general became bogged down in high emotion, even sentimentality,¹³² while the initiative for development in Western music style was taken over by secular music. From the seventeenth century, church music forfeited its role as a stylistic standard bearer for Western musical culture, at

¹³⁰At this point, perhaps something should be said regarding the Roman Catholic context during the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries. Although its official pronouncements maintained the ideal of chant and a non-theatrical vocal style for worship music, (see, for example, Pope Benedict XIV's encyclical Annus qui of February 19, 1749; quoted in Hayburn, Papal Legislation on Sacred Music, 92-108), its practice did not always concur (Ringer, "Religious Music in the West," 213). The music of the theater invaded both Catholic and Protestant churches and it occasioned criticism for theological inconsistency. Perhaps explanations for this general drift in the Roman Catholic context can be found in societal pressure, a pervasive secularism that had dampened genuine spirituality, natural reaction to a previously over-emphasized "God beyond us" orientation, and the lack of a convincing, theologically founded aesthetic stance (see Winter, Why Sing? 195-244). Whatever the reason, it should be noted that in the mid-nineteenth century there was a resurgence of interest in chant and a reappraisal of its nature and liturgical role which led to its restoration (ibid., 214). Since Vatican II there has been a surge in the other direction again, occasioning descriptions and critiques such as that found in Day, Why Catholics Can't Sing.

¹³¹See Reynolds and Price, A Survey of Christian Hymnody, 50-51; and Routley, Music Leadership in the Church, 36, 37.

¹³²Frequently, splits and sectarian groups developed because of their more pronounced emotional characteristics. Honigsheim cites the Salvation Army (which split from Methodism) as a prominent example (Honigsheim, Music and Society, 121). See also Horton Davies, Worship and Theology in England: From Newman to Martineau 1850-1900 (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1962), 167-169).

best, affirming; at worst, becoming a cipher of secularly created music styles.¹³³

The "God Within Us" Emphasis

With the rise of the Christian immanentist orientation over the last two centuries, the polar opposite music style to that associated with the "God beyond us" orientation emerged. Descriptions of the music of nineteenth-century Revivalism and the rapidly developing Charismatic movement indicate that "kinesthetic impulses, whether psychologically felt or physically expressed"¹³⁴ were promoted, not repressed. Emotive, "unfettered responses either to great joy or great sorrow"¹³⁵ were no longer shunned, but prized. Departure from worldly involvement was replaced with active participation in the existential moment. The dramatic and sensual were deliberately utilized to engender an experience of involvement.

Marini indicated that some of the earliest North American revivals were "a potent stimulus to include popular and folk tunes with faster tempos and dance rhythms into the rather staid repertory

¹³³Even the church concerts set up by Lutherans in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries gradually drifted from their religious moorings, and "performances became primarily aesthetic in nature. As a consequence, persons uninvolved with the religious content and intention of the music increasingly enjoyed such church concerts. By the later nineteenth century it often became difficult to classify such musical performances as religious; they were intended for a public that was supposed to buy tickets" (Honigsheim, Music and Society, 122). The nineteenth-century world of art music did generate some "religious music" described as "unprecedentedly theatrical works for special quasi-religious occasions, in particular commemorations of the dead" (Ringer, "Religious Music in the West," 214). However, they were much more suited for the stage than church worship. In the twentieth century, it could be said that "market place has replaced church as artistic unifier" (Wolterstorff, Art in Action, 23). See also van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 223.

¹³⁴Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" 28.

¹³⁵Ibid.

of traditional psalmody."¹³⁶ Often these were accompanied by dancing.¹³⁷

Writing about early Pentecostal music, Duncan indicated that "artlessness, rhythmic monotony, simple melodic formulae, fast tempi, and uninhibited performance were the unlikely stylistic traits that were combined to provide the powerful impact of Pentecostal music."¹³⁸ Given a prominent role to play--up to two thirds of the worship service¹³⁹--the music was often associated with hand clapping, foot stomping, and dancing in the spirit.¹⁴⁰ "The intense singing was commonly accompanied by the strum of guitars, the rhythmic beat of tambourines and drums, and blare of brass as new converts brought their instruments from now-forsaken dance bands into the house of worship."¹⁴¹ Repetitious choruses with tunes of secular origin or style led by praise leaders rather than choirs, together with drama, mime, and hand signing,¹⁴² all helped to facilitate spontaneity, participation, and emotional excitement. More than intellectual comprehension, these were the desired characteristics of the service.¹⁴³

George Pullen Jackson, an authority on North American folk hymnody, recorded a colorful eyewitness account of a 1929 assembly

¹³⁶Marini, "Rehearsal for Revival," 83.

¹³⁷Ibid., 83, 85.

¹³⁸Duncan, "Music Among Early Pentecostals," 14. See also Ellen J. Lorenz's description of the development of the campmeeting spirituals in Glory, Hallelujah! The Story of the Campmeeting Spiritual (Nashville: Abingdon, 1980), 40-70.

¹³⁹Alford, "Pentecostal and Charismatic Music," 692.

¹⁴⁰Duncan, "Music Among Early Pentecostals," 14.

¹⁴¹Ibid. Instrumental accompaniment became more pervasive in the twentieth century.

¹⁴²Alford, "Pentecostal and Charismatic Music," 693-694.

¹⁴³Ibid., 11; and Wohlgemuth, "Praise Singing," 22.

of the Church of God in Cleveland, Tennessee, that indicated how the music functioned in the service. As the worshippers came to the high point of the service--the "altar service"--the music began. He reported:

Then the songs' function, as a rhythmic, tom-tom-like noise for inducing the desired ecstasy became apparent. For from that time on there was no let-up. The spirit moved some to dance, others to speak in the unknown tongue, to shout, to jerk, or to fall in a dead trance. Mourners in ever-increasing numbers fell on their knees, elbows in a folding chair, at the altar, while the exhorters clapped hands to the time of the music. . . .

After half an hour of this, the singing came to an end. Also the instrument strummers, worn out, dropped out one by one, leaving only the piano player and a tambourine whacker whom I could not see, to carry on the steady, and almost terrifying rhythmic noise. . . .

The din, or, as they would call it "the joyful noise," rose till I could discern only the heavy bass tones of the piano and the rattle of the tambourine. And after a time even the piano man gave out, leaving only that still unseen thumper of the tambourine to the regularity of the noise. . . . As I watched, even the tambourine became silent, and the human noise went on, a capella, so to speak.¹⁴⁴

Believing that "God will reach man's will only if human emotions are properly moved," music was used as a "persuader."¹⁴⁵ Clarke Garrett maintained that the spectacular behavior seen in spirit possession in various pockets of Christianity down through the centuries from the Camisards to the Shakers "is typical of spirit possession worldwide."¹⁴⁶ Twentieth-century Pentecostalism seems to be but a modern manifestation of the strongly immanent focus.

Commenting on the pervasive utilization of secular music forms in this orientation, Hustad (1980) noted that in the previous

¹⁴⁴George Pullen Jackson, White Spirituals in the Southern Uplands: The Story of the Fiddle Folk, Their Songs, Singings, and "Buckwheat Notes," (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1933), 406-407. Compare a similar description in Paul Hamel, Ellen White and Music: Background and Principles (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1976), 41-47.

¹⁴⁵Hustad, Jubilate! 142.

¹⁴⁶Clarke Garrett, Spirit Possession and Popular Religion: From the Camisards to the Shakers (Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1987), 26. For a detailed description of its manifestation among the Shakers, see Andrews, The Gift to Be Simple, 143.

decade, "it is already apparent that we may have seen the most complete invasion of the religious expression by secular forms in history, with the connoisseurs changing church styles almost monthly to keep up with the latest trends in secular popular music."¹⁴⁷ Undoubtedly, twentieth-century rock music, for example, has widely affected Western culture. It has influenced

the music we hear on television, in films and in commercials. It has influenced jazz, church music, classical music, and even its own ancestors, rhythm and blues, and country and western. . . . Any historian of the last half of our century must devote significant consideration to rock and roll as one of the primary forces in our society as a whole.¹⁴⁸

Although a secular music form, it has often been compared with a "new kind of religious experience for young people."¹⁴⁹ Davies described that experience thus:

The mania behaviors manifest entrancement in the technical sense of being entirely possessed by the experience. . . . The regularity of rhythm is enhanced by the over-balance of the bass and percussion. The output of excessively high volume creates a physiological sensory response which floods one's sensory modality. Reiteration of thematic and verbal material . . . also creates a hypnotic effect.¹⁵⁰

There is little to distinguish this experience from spirit possession in the religious context.

The fact that Christians have appropriated this music, producing it as an expression of their religious experience,¹⁵¹ is

¹⁴⁷Hustad, Jubilate! 141.

¹⁴⁸Joe Stuessy, Rock and Roll: Its History and Stylistic Development (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1990), 1-2.

¹⁴⁹Edward F. Heenan and H. Rosanne Falkenstein, "Religious Rock: What It Is Saying," Popular Music and Society 2 (Summer 1973): 311; and Shepherd, "Religion and the Counterculture," 6-8.

¹⁵⁰Evan Davies, "Psychological Characteristics of Beatle Mania," Journal of the History of Ideas 30 (January-March 1969): 279.

¹⁵¹See Styll, "Mylon Lefevre," 18-19; Brian Quincy Newcomb, "Bloodgood: Rockin' a Hard Place," Contemporary Christian Music 11 (September 1988): 8; Doug Van Pelt, "Why Are All the Children Headbanging?" Contemporary Christian Music 12 (August 1989): 14, 15, 32; and Moira McCormick, "Risky Business," Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (April 1986): 22-25.

perhaps less significant than probing the reason why this has happened. Robert Pattison, in his thought-provoking discussion of Western popular music, observed that rock music turned to Africa and India rather than Islām and Confucianism for its inspiration.¹⁵² The immanental focus evident in African and Indian music is clearly more in tune with both the Western secular, this-worldly orientation and the Christian "God within us" orientation.¹⁵³

Further affirmation of the commonality between Africa and the "God within us" orientation is found in recent scholarly discussion of Christianity and the African-American experience. It is evident that prior to 1740 relatively few African-Americans converted to Christianity in North America;¹⁵⁴ however, with the advent of revivals and camp meetings in the latter half of the eighteenth century and into the nineteenth century, conversions among African-Americans, particularly to Methodist, Baptist, and independent denominations, increased markedly.¹⁵⁵ Olly Wilson

¹⁵²Robert Pattison, The Triumph of Vulgarly: Rock Music in the Mirror of Romanticism (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 70. See also Kebede, Roots of Black Music, 152; Sedeka Wadinasi and Alhamisi Wadinasi, "Black Music: A Degenerating Art Form," Ufahamu 7 (1977): 160-161.

¹⁵³Pattison's allusion to de Tocqueville's critique of American democracy, and the characteristics of style of the pantheist culture it would produce, seems significant in the present context for the same immanental ethos it pictures: "'The style will often be strange, incorrect, overburdened and loose, and almost always strong and bold.' Contemplation would give way to noise. . . . [It] is sunk in the here and now. . . . The one subject available for its art is the individual. . . . [The] artist cannot, with a straight face write about gods, myths, or traditions. . . . 'All these resources fail him, but the man remains, and the poet needs no more.' . . . He [the artist] will be loud and common. He will 'depict passions and ideas rather than men and deeds.' . . . [He] will write a hymn to God called Song of Myself" (Pattison, The Triumph of Vulgarly, 55).

¹⁵⁴Wilson, "The Association of Movement and Music as a Manifestation of a Black Conceptual Approach to Music-Making," 13.

¹⁵⁵This is not meant to suggest that traditional churches such as the Episcopalian, Presbyterian, and Roman Catholic made no acquisitions among African-Americans (regarding the Episcopalian context, see Irene V. Jackson, "Music among Blacks in the Episcopal

maintained that a frequently overlooked factor is "that several aspects of the common form of worship used by the Protestant revivalist movement in the United States at that time were consonant with several traditional West African practices."¹⁵⁶ As Herskovits suggested, African-Americans were attracted to this type of Christianity because "its ritualism most resembled the types of worship known to them."¹⁵⁷ Maultsby enumerated common characteristics as including loud emotional cries and groans throughout the service, worshippers leaping out of their seats, screaming, jerking, shouting, falling into convulsions, speaking in tongues, and engaging in holy dance; the use of music in creating an emotional atmosphere; the performance of hymns and spiritual songs in call-response format or verse-chorus structure where congregations joined in on familiar choruses or repetitive lines; and the accepted exuberant and excited participation.¹⁵⁸ The patterns of behavior evident in performance practices carried particularly significant commonality. Although the rhythm of drums

Church: Some Preliminary Considerations," in More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 107-125), but rather, that there was a special affinity for the more revivalistically oriented denominations.

¹⁵⁶Wilson, "The Association of Movement and Music as a Manifestation of a Black Conceptual Approach to Music-Making," 13.

¹⁵⁷Herskovits, The Myth of the Negro Past, 233. See also Portia Katrenia Maultsby, "Afro-American Religious Music: 1619-1861. Part I--Historical Development. Part II--Computer Analysis of One Hundred Spirituals" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Wisconsin [Madison]), 1974, 124-130; idem, "The Use and Performance of Hymnody, Spirituals, and Gospels in the Black Church," The Western Journal of Black Studies 7 (1983): 162, 163; Morton Marks, "'You Can't Sing Unless You're Saved': Reliving the Call in Gospel Music," in African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg (Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982), 305-306, 308; and Raboteau, Slave Religion, 149. Compare also Hebdige, Cut 'N' Mix, 50, for similar connections evident in the Caribbean.

¹⁵⁸Maultsby, "The Use and Performance of Hymnody, Spirituals, and Gospels in the Black Church," 163.

was largely forbidden in the North American context, "hand clapping, foot tapping, rhythmic preaching, hyperventilation, antiphonal (call and response) singing, and dancing" were styles of behavior associated with ecstatic experience both in Africa and North American revivals.¹⁵⁹

The transplanting of African sacred music style into a receptive Christian setting is particularly evident in the development of Gospel music, forged in the African-American Pentecostal church at the turn of the twentieth century and subsequently widely embraced.¹⁶⁰ As Morton Marks maintained: "By examining the structure of Gospel music it may be shown that the ritual forms of Black Protestantism in the United States are the result of compression and recombination of the structural features of . . . [the West African possession-trance] paradigm."¹⁶¹

The responsive environment provided for the African worship style and approach to music making in Christian revivalism and Pentecostal movements seems to cement the commonality in immanental emphasis highlighted in spirit possession, though minor differences may exist in the manifestation of such experiences in the Western

¹⁵⁹Raboteau, Slave Religion, 65.

¹⁶⁰Louis-Charles Harvey, "Black Gospel Music and Black Theology," The Journal of Religious Thought 43 (Fall-Winter 1986-87): 22-23; and Maultsby, "The Use and Performance of Hymnody, Spirituals, and Gospels in the Black Church," 168.

¹⁶¹Marks, "'You Can't Sing Unless You're Saved,'" 307. See also *ibid.*, 305, 306, 316 and 329-330; and Mellonee V. Burnim, "The Performance of Black Gospel Music as Transformation," in Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989), 54-60. Williams-Jones similarly affirmed that Gospel music is the crystallization of African aesthetic in "Afro-American Gospel Music," 373-378. See also Maultsby, "Afro-American Religious Music," 10-13. Another comprehensive list of Gospel music characteristics can be found in *idem*, "The Use and Performance of Hymnody, Spirituals, and Gospels in the Black Church," 168-169.

Christian and African contexts.¹⁶² Syncretisms of belief and worship practices in harmony with the "God within us" orientation are also evident in African-based Christian sects such as the Apostles.¹⁶³

Two Prevalent Christian Rationalizations Regarding Sacred Music Styles

The array of Christian artistic styles resulting from the intersection of the historic shift from a transcendent to an immanent emphasis has spawned two theoretical rationalizations in Christian aesthetic thought.

¹⁶²See Raboteau, Slave Religion, 64. Whereas the immanental experience of conversion formed a common link with revivalist Protestantism and the African setting, it was aspects of belief and organization that lent themselves to reinterpretation as the bridge between Roman Catholicism and African understanding. Devotion to saints, the use of sacramentals or blessed objects (statues, pictures, candles, incense, holy water, rosaries, vestments, and relics) and holy days, processions, saints' feast, days of fast and abstinence all had recognizable parallels within traditional African religions, as did the organization of religious fraternities (ibid., 87). This offered a supportive context for syncretism and essentially allowed for the "continuity of African religious elements in recognizable form" (ibid., 88). Although its musical worship ideals were considerably removed from African traditions, Roman Catholicism accommodated African musical traditions in South and Inter-America, especially on festival occasions, and increasingly so since Vatican II (see, for example, Lekis, "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music," 12, 57, 58 and 71). See also Schuler, "Native Music for the Missions," 27-30. Where such accommodation has not occurred, believers have sought satisfaction of the desire for more "inspiring" worship experiences elsewhere while maintaining nominal commitment to the more orthodox Catholicism (see George P. Hagan, "Divinity and Experience: The Trance and Christianity in Southern Ghana," in Vernacular Christianity: Essays in the Social Anthropology of Religion, ed. Wendy James and Douglas H. Johnson [New York: Lilian Barber Press, 1988], 152-156).

¹⁶³See Bennetta Jules-Rosette, "Song and Spirit: The Use of Songs in the Management of Ritual Contexts," Africa 45 (1975): 150-165; and idem, "Ecstatic Singing: Music and Social Integration in an African Church," in More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985), 119-137. Oyer mentioned "6,700 distinct, indigenous or independent churches" that have sprung up across Africa adopting "African modes of expression, which include traditional instruments and dance" (Oyer, "Hymnody in the Context of World Mission," 72).

The Sacred/Secular Dichotomy

Routley contended that "nobody can talk about 'standards' in church music without involving himself in . . . [the] debate" about the sacred and the secular.¹⁶⁴ While the sacred/secular distinction is characteristic for Word-oriented religions such as Judaism, Christianity, and Islām,¹⁶⁵ Christianity's transcendent/immanent paradox has engendered a measure of perplexity in this regard. As Burckhardt noted:

Whereas the art of the traditional civilizations of the East cannot properly be said to be split into sacred art and profane art, since sacred models inspire even its popular expressions, the Christian world has always known, side by side with an art that is sacred in the strict sense of the word, a religious art using more or less "worldly" forms.¹⁶⁶

What Burckhardt called sacred art "in the strict sense of the word" has essentially been embedded in Christian aesthetic consciousness as the style of the "God beyond us" emphasis--the transcendence orientation of the first millennium of Christian artistic history. Because this view pervaded Western culture for so long it took on all the authority of an established tradition. Even secular artistic endeavor was affected by its more other-worldly approach.¹⁶⁷

Close identification of the sacred with the other-worldly, transcendence orientation resulted in the non-sacred being equated with the this-worldly elements of style--those tied to the present,

¹⁶⁴Routley, Music Leadership in the Church, 51.

¹⁶⁵See Collins, "Editorial," 4.

¹⁶⁶Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 44.

¹⁶⁷In practice, during the time of the church's domination of Western culture its sacred models inspired even its popular expressions, and "there was no sharp line of demarcation between sacred and secular music" (Reese, Music in the Middle Ages, 218). In the same context Reese noted that "the music of the church was doubtless enriched by the music of the people; but it was very likely more influential than influenced" (ibid.). Compare Ballantine, Music and Its Social Meanings, 92.

the natural physical and emotional reality which also happened to be associated with the immanent "God within us" orientation. Thus, the sacred/secular dichotomy was initially defined dualistically in terms of the two realities recognized by Christians--the transcendent realm (identified as the spiritual) and the natural realm (often identified with the flesh).¹⁶⁸

As the theological shift in the conception of the divine occurred, the aesthetic definition of the sacred also realigned itself and began to include elements of a more immanent orientation.¹⁶⁹ Once these were appropriated for sacred use,¹⁷⁰ the

¹⁶⁸However, in line with Eliade's observation that divine remoteness is often linked with a yearning for more concrete religious experiences, the church of the Middle Ages tolerated the "more or less 'worldly' forms" on special feast days and for celebrations during the church year when processions and other non-liturgical activities facilitated participation by the people (see Eliade, The Sacred and the Profane, 125-126). Carols and laudi spirituali, as well as pseudo-religious events such as the Festival of the Sub-deacon, the Feast of Fools, and the Feast of the Ass were also developed (Robert Henri Cousineau S. J., "Fools, Feast of," Encyclopedia Britannica [1971], 9:565). Even secular tunes found their way into Parody Masses and were utilized in the liturgy of the sacred art music of the late Middle Ages (Karl Gustav Fellerer, "Church Music and the Council of Trent," The Musical Quarterly 39 [October 1953]: 577-582).

¹⁶⁹See for example, the inclusion of imitative, dramatic stylistic elements in passions, cantatas, and oratorios. Features that were developed in secular opera began to appear in sacred music. Note also the developments in Methodist hymn tunes described by Routley in Music Leadership in the Church, 35-37. Walter Buszin captured the essence of this shift in his description of what happened when musicians detached their work from the church and a more transcendent-oriented worship style. He noted that "people required them to be virtuosos and to please the public. Music became divorced from theology and was associated with entertainment instead. These developments brought about changes in criteria, in standards, and in the skills required of musicians" (Walter Buszin, "Criteria of Church Music in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries," in Festschrift: Theodore Hoelty-Nickel: A Collection of Essays on Church Music, ed. Newman W. Powell [Valparaiso, Ind.: Valparaiso University Press, 1967], 20).

¹⁷⁰Hustad provided a good description of the process of such appropriation when he wrote: "[Evangelicals] have tended to take evangelism's pattern and style, the preaching and the music, and canonize them as the norm for regular church worship. . . . Invariably, when a new secular-sacred music style appears in outreach activity, it will be argued 'We don't intend this music for the worship of the church. It is just to reach the unchurched.'

secular came to denote the extreme elements of the immanent style. As the conception of God became strongly immanent, stylistic features associated with the transcendent realm became increasingly irrelevant, and transcendence/immanence stylistic definitions of the dichotomy between the sacred and secular were rendered meaningless.¹⁷¹ Ultimately, non-stylistic factors such as sociological associations assumed importance in definitions of the distinction.¹⁷²

The Form/Content Dichotomy

Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī noted two conceptions that first attended Byzantine art and that have been part of Christian thought about the aesthetic realm ever since.

1. That a work of art is Christian when writing, symbol, or illustrated action associates it with the Christian faith;
2. That a work of art is Christian when the use made of it (as in the sacrament, a cultic service, or merely the decoration of a church) associates it with the Christian faith.¹⁷³

He went on to explain that both these ideas "assert that the Christianness of a work of art is external to its aesthetic content; that Christianness is a concept perceived by the understanding not a

But it never works out that way. We tend to sanctify and canonize the new evangelistic form and it makes its way into the regular worship experiences of the church community" (Jubilate! 143-144).

¹⁷¹Many of the sacred works of nineteenth-century composers were identical to their secular counterparts. Consequently, they were often performed in concert halls. In this regard, Routley's comments about hymn tunes are insightful (Routley, Music Leadership in the Church, 39-45). In the late twentieth century, inclusion of contemporary rock music in contemporary Christian music is an overt example of this point.

¹⁷²It should be noted that this situation arises at both ends of the spectrum--when the secular is considered congruent with the transcendent realm and when the sacred is identified with the immanent realm.

¹⁷³Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, "On the Nature of the Work of Art in Islām," 72.

percept which is the object of an immediate aesthetic (i.e. sensory) intuition."¹⁷⁴

Emphasis on content as the point of Christian association in Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī's first concept was an important component of Augustine's philosophy of art (expounded in De Musica) which suggested a distinction between two discreet aspects of art-- structure and content.¹⁷⁵ Augustine argued that while structure was to be judged aesthetically, its beauty merely made "the communication more attractive and more persuasive."¹⁷⁶ Content must be assessed for its truth and/or morality.¹⁷⁷ Thus, the suggestion was that as long as artistic content is in right relation to Christian faith, the style of presentation is of secondary importance.

This position still has strong adherence in Christian circles. Writing in 1983, Gene Edward Veith, Jr., stated: "To be sure, any thematic content must be scrutinized very critically through the lens of Scripture, but art as art is essentially neutral."¹⁷⁸ He went on to submit that "Christians need not be overly scrupulous in regard to types of art,"¹⁷⁹ and suggested that

¹⁷⁴Ibid.

¹⁷⁵Augustine was "the first philosopher to separate art structure from art content" (Patricia K. Ellsmere and Richard R. La Croix, "Augustine on Art as Imitation," in Augustine on Music: An Interdisciplinary Collection of Essays, ed. Richard R. La Croix [Lewiston, N. Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1988], 13).

¹⁷⁶Patricia K. Ellsmere, "Augustine on Beauty, Art, and God," in Augustine on Music: An Interdisciplinary Collection of Essays, ed. Richard R. La Croix (Lewiston, N. Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1988), 103.

¹⁷⁷Ellsmere and La Croix, "Augustine on Art as Imitation," 11.

¹⁷⁸Veith, The Gift of Art, 58. See also Hannum, The Christian Search for Beauty, 24, 35, 47, 50, and 51.

¹⁷⁹Veith, The Gift of Art, 59.

Christians are free to pursue whatever they find congenial.¹⁸⁰ In fact, he advocated that "for aesthetics, although not for theology, a Christian may 'go to the Sidonians'."¹⁸¹ The Christianness of the art work is thus clearly focused on the didactic function of content rather than on a wholistic, aesthetic re-presentation of the faith. The content is for instruction; the structure simply for delight.

While an integrated Christian sensibility operated in the culture from Augustine's time through the Middle Ages, the overall communication of art under this philosophy was still consistent because the pleasure furnished by structure was not at odds with the content's instruction. However, during the Renaissance when the integration of values was broken up, this philosophy became increasingly tenuous.¹⁸² In the contemporary Christian music context, it is employed to validate any music style for the sacred setting, providing the associated text is theologically sound.¹⁸³

¹⁸⁰Ibid.

¹⁸¹Ibid., 58. This is a reference to Solomon's hiring of Phoenician craftsmen to assist in the building of the temple (see 2 Chron 2:17, 18).

¹⁸²Concerning this, Burckhardt insightfully commented: "Every traditional art is obedient to a particular spiritual economy that sets limits to its themes and to the means used for their expression, so that an abandonment of that economy almost immediately releases new and apparently boundless artistic possibilities. None the less, such new possibilities can never thereafter be co-ordinated with respect to a single center; they will never again reflect the amplitude of the soul at rest within itself, in its 'state of grace'; their tendency being centrifugal, their various modalities of vision and expression will be mutually exclusive and will succeed one another with evergrowing rapidity. Such, in fact, are the 'stylistic periods,' the dizzy succession of which is so characteristic of the European art of the last five centuries" (Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 144).

¹⁸³See Key, Don't Stop the Music, 69. In defense of his blues-style Christian music, Thomas A. Dorsey stated: "The message is not in the music but in the words of the song. It matters not what kind of movement it has, if the words are Jesus, Heaven, Faith and Life then you have a song with which God is pleased regardless of what critics and some church folk say" (Thomas A. Dorsey; quoted in Oral L. Moses, "The Nineteenth-Century Spiritual Text: A Source for Modern Gospel," in Feel the Spirit: Studies in Nineteenth-Century Afro-American Music, ed. George R. Keck and Sherrill V. Martin [New

This philosophy conveniently sidesteps the need for Christian judgment of worship music, but it fails to come to grips with the complexity of the relationship of worldview to artistic expression.

Summary Observations

The nature of a paradox demands that polarities be kept in tension. The history of Western Christianity reveals that it has been difficult to hold in tension the transcendent/immanent paradox inherent in its understanding of the Divine. This has affected aesthetic expectations and brought concomitant fluctuations in sacred music style.

Although it could be argued that at any point in Christian history a wide spectrum of belief was manifest, there is a perceptible pendulum swing from a transcendence orientation to an immanence orientation. The categories that have served to highlight this shift in emphasis--God beyond us, God for us, God beside us/within us--also indicate shifts in sacred music style. These could be summarized as shown in table 3.

Scholars have readily acknowledged that the sacred music of the "God beyond us" and the "God within us" orientations are stylistically related to the respective polar opposites of Islamic sacred sound art style and traditional African ritual music style, thus supporting a trans-cultural stylistic commonality based on the concept of divinity.

It is evident that during the period when the "God beyond us" orientation dominated Western culture, sacred music fulfilled the role of stylistic standard bearer and was the determiner of

York: Greenwood Press, 1988], 50).

Table 3.--A Summary of Stylistic Orientations in the History of Western Christian Sacred Music

God Beyond Us	God For Us	God Beside Us/Within Us	
Other-worldly, contemplative, abstract focus	Proclamative and confessional; less abstract	Proclamative, more this-worldly; subjective orientation	→ This-worldly, participatory, experiential focus
Not kinesthetically oriented	Not kinesthetically oriented	Some kinesthetic awareness	→ Kinesthetically oriented
Avoids the emotive	Restricted use of the emotive	Use of the emotive	→ Values the emotive
Limited range and contiguity of pitches; avoids large melodic leaps	Some extension of range; some larger melodic leaps	Extended range; use of more lyrically expressive melodies with conjunct and disjunct motion	→ Extended range; more subjective, individually interpreted melodic lines
Relaxed tempi	More bold tempi	More variation in tempi	→ Faster, virile tempi with some variation
Calm, continuous movement	More intense movement	Varied movement	→ Large, developmental variation in movement
Rejects strong accents and changes of intensity or volume	Use of durational accents and some changes of intensity	Use of regular accents and changes of intensity	→ Strong accents; louder intensity
Avoids regularly repeated metric units	Limited use of regularly repeated metric units	Use of regular rhythms	→ Emphasized use of repetitive rhythms
Little or no dramatic/programmatic content, tone-painting and imitation of worldly feelings and ideas	Some dramatic content; limited tone-painting	Some dramatic portrayal of feelings and ideas	→ Dramatic portrayal of mood change and ideas; often combined with other expressive modalities
Logogenic	Logogenic	Musogenic	→ Musogenic
Vocally centered; no instruments	Mainly vocal; limited instrumental use	Vocal and instrumental	→ Vocal and prevalent instrumental involvement
No choral harmonies	Use of simple chordal harmonies	Use of tonal harmonies	→ Use of complex harmonies

general music development.¹⁴ The more the subjective, immanent orientation took over Christian belief, the more secular culture became the determiner of sacred music style.

Perhaps this indicates that it is only as the church holds on to certain aspects of the transcendence orientation that it has anything unique to offer to artistic culture in the way of stylistic leadership because significant contributions usually arise out of uniqueness. Undoubtedly, in the contemporary world where traditional pagan and pantheistic worldviews are synchronizing with this-worldly secularism and increasingly immanently oriented Christianity, the immanent orientation in Christian sacred music style offers much greater potential for bridge-building and ecumenism,¹⁵ especially in an increasingly small "global village." However, the question stands: Is an immanent focus (or transcendent focus, for that matter) truly representative of Christianity and its inherent paradox? And further, is Christianity condemned to musical eclecticism with no distinctive contribution to make in the realm of sacred music style?

¹⁴It is acknowledged that the church's stylistic leadership in music during the Middle Ages could be seen as largely the product of its control of education--a function of its institutional and sociological power. Additionally, much of Western musical history during the Middle Ages was documented from the church's perspective. However, it is also true that the church's prevailing influence provided a climate of belief and frame of reference for daily life, and the strength of such a worldview and its hold over conscience and behavior should not be underestimated.

¹⁵Note the comments made relative to this point in van der Leeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty, 216; Os Guinness, The Dust of Death: A Critique of the Counter Culture (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1973), 324-325; Bill Faris, "21st Century Praise," Contemporary Christian Music 11 (June 1989): 21; Seshagiri Rao, "Overcoming Religious Conflict--A Hindu Approach," in The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson (New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982), 193; and Norman R. Gulley, "New Age Series--VIII: The New Age Movement and Eschatology: Exploring Its World-View Shift, Global Consciousness, and Role in End Events," Adventist Perspectives 5 (1991): 26.

Christian sacred music style cannot and should not be expected to "preach" Christianity, but it will automatically reflect its nurturing soil. Is it too much to expect Christian sacred music style to aesthetically embody and witness to Christianness in such a way that the paradoxical polarities of transcendence and immanence are held in tension rather than destabilized? The quest to shape such a paradigm is the subject of the final chapter.

CHAPTER FIVE

RECAPITULATION, PARADIGMATIC CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

Recapitulation

The close relationship between religion and music is acknowledged worldwide. However, the conscious conservation of religious music style in most cultures contrasts with the increasingly complex stylistic pluralism in Christian worship music. This study addressed the problem of decision making in the diversity of music available for Christian worship. The need to confront this problem is rendered urgent by the inadequacy of approaches presently illuminating the decision-making process among Christians, the drive to contextualize gospel presentations in contemporary Christian mission outreach, and the necessity of reappraising what constitutes relevant church music education.

Added impetus to the study included related concerns evident in the search for a common body of theory in the exploration of music as a religious phenomenon; the debate concerning determinants of music style in ethnomusicology; and the need for a more wholistic, integrated perspective in the study of Western musicology.

The purpose of this study was to explore a core aspect of worldview that concerns the nature of ultimate reality--the concept of divine transcendence/immanence--as a trans-cultural determinant of sacred music style. A philosophical approach was employed to develop a theoretical paradigm.

Chapter 2 began by delineating the understanding of worldview and artistic style and noting the scholarly consensus regarding a relationship between worldview and artistic style. Three general categories of theories about the determinants of music style were surveyed. Each category was founded on an ultimate concern indicative of worldview: (1) Humanistic theories, in which the human being or human society is viewed as the ultimate concern; (2) Naturalistic theories, in which either the cosmos or the natural world order are perceived as the ultimate concern; and (3) Philosophic/Religious theories, in which philosophical or divine realities are held as the ultimate concern.

Each of these categories, as well as combinations of them, was found to manifest plausible and significant contributions to the understanding of musical style. The impact of their various concerns was traced throughout the gamut of music structure, content, and performance practice. However, it was noted that the metaphysical assumptions inherent in the first two categories were not always acknowledged. A cloak of empiricism often obscured the recognition that humanity, society, the cosmos, or the natural world order were being treated as ultimate concerns, thus facilitating distorted conclusions.

Philosophic/religious theories which are less able to conceal the metaphysical nature of their presuppositions were shown to be largely shunned or undervalued in Western thinking, though widely accepted in non-Western cultures. The West's proclivity for humanistic and naturalistic explanations of music style appeared to stem from a prejudicial reluctance to explore religio-philosophic considerations, despite acknowledgement of their existence and importance as cultural unifiers, and the recognition that humanistic and naturalistic explanations are incomplete in themselves. It seemed evident that religious theories deserved wider

acknowledgement and investigation (though not to the exclusion of other concerns), especially if meaningful conclusions are to be reached regarding the determinants of sacred music style.

At the end of chapter 2, the process of worldview embodiment in music style was traced through the conscious and sub-conscious search for "fittingness" between a form of experience and a corresponding musical form. This was suggested as a driving force behind the predisposition to use characteristic features that contribute to the formation of a unique style. Further, it was found that an institutionally created ideological climate may stimulate the employment of artistic forms, thus fostering predictable stylistic expressions.

Chapter 3 focused on the connection between belief concerning divine transcendence/immanence and sacred music style. Based on Clouser's identification of three major views regarding the divine that are accepted by the vast majority of the world's population, it was possible to highlight the transcendent/immanent polarity in the understanding of deity by world religions. Building on the truisms that the quality of every religion's worship is determined by the worshippers' conception of the nature of their deity and that sacred music is essentially the transformation of worship into music, it was shown through two non-Western case studies that theological perceptions of divine transcendence or immanence were translated into aesthetic sensibilities that determined stylistic features of musical form, content, and performance practice.

Using commentary and analysis provided from within the two religio-cultural settings, it was established that the stylistic features of Islamic transcendence-inspired sound art accentuate the "other-worldly" rather than the phenomenal and the naturalistic. Islām's rejection of the dramatic in favor of the abstract; its

restricted use of pitch and volume and non-use of metrical rhythm; its reliance on the human voice to the virtual exclusion of instruments, and emphasis on horizontal, solo, or unison melodic structures rather than vertical, polyphonic, or chordal structures all contribute to the avoidance of sensual associations with kinesthetic impulses and emotional states. The appeal is largely to the mind, to an attitude of contemplation and departure from worldly involvement.

The stylistic features of traditional African immanence-inspired ritual possession music accentuate the corporeality of the natural realm. Its general rejection of the abstract, philosophic, and contemplative in favor of concretized realism and instinctive action evidences itself in a participatory, multi-dimensional, psycho-physiologically powerful art form in which sound and motion are one. Loud, complex, and repetitive rhythm is emphasized over melody and harmony; the dramatic, the symbolic, and climax-oriented progressions are common place; and percussive instrumental, vocal, and dance performance directly address the sensual and kinesthetic impulses eliciting emotional and affective-motivated motor response. The appeal is largely to experience, to an intuitive involvement with both the present and the primordial past.

In light of the unifying status of religion in these two cultures, the influence of such religiously inspired aesthetic sensibilities and resultant music styles frequently carries over into non-sacred artistic expressions. The fact that a culture's aesthetic stance evidences deliberate choice on the basis of belief contradicts notions of primitivism, lack of cultural sophistication, or even environmental imperatives as explanations of the characteristics of sacred music style. It makes plain that sacred music style is not religiously neutral. On the contrary, religious presuppositions mold its development.

Chapter 4 addressed the issue of Western Christianity's complex and bewildering pluralism concerning sacred music style. Focusing on the Christian paradox of divine transcendence/immanence embodied in the incarnate Christ, it was demonstrated that the tension between the transcendence and immanence polarities has been singularly difficult to maintain in Western artistic culture. The historical development of theological understanding regarding divine transcendence/immanence in the Western Christian setting was traced under the headings: (1) God beyond us; (2) God for us; and (3) God beside us/within us. It was submitted that there has been an overriding swing from a predominantly transcendence orientation to a strong immanence orientation. As theological emphasis shifted, so did aesthetic sensibility with its concomitant changes in sacred music style.

Scholars have related the polar points of Western Christian music style to the respective Islamic and African contexts described above, thus supporting a trans-cultural, stylistic commonality based on the concept of deity. The merging intermediary categories along the stylistic spectrum representing the "God for us" and "God beside us" orientations in the Christian tradition have provided musical complexity commensurate with the shades of difference in theological emphasis. The parallel between the music style of the Christian immanence orientation and that of the secular, non-theistic emphasis, based on their mutual "this-worldly" view of ultimate reality, was also found to be significant.

It was noted that the spectrum of music styles evident in the Western Christian context has provoked certain rationalizations in debates over conflicting practices. The sacred/secular dichotomy has loomed large in such discussions. Because of the Roman Catholic Church's long period of domination, traditionally sacred music came to be associated with a transcendence-oriented style and secular

music with an immanence-oriented style. As the emphasis in theological understanding realigned, the sacred category expanded to include "this-worldly" elements and the whole dichotomy was redefined. At both extremes it was noted that when a culture's sacred and secular styles correspond, external factors such as societal associations assume more importance in the definitions of sacred/secular distinctions.

The form/content dichotomy has also been utilized to elucidate discussions. Evaluation of the Christianness of an art work focused on the didactic function of cognitive content rather than on a wholistic, aesthetic re-presentation of the Faith. While this approach conveniently sidestepped the need for Christian aesthetic judgment of music styles, it failed to come to grips with the pervasive relationship of worldview to artistic expression.

Finally, it was noted in chapter 4 that during the "God beyond us" period, Christian sacred music fulfilled the role of stylistic standard bearer and was the determiner of general music development. However, as the subjective, immanental orientation took over, secular nontheistically oriented culture increasingly became the determiner of sacred music style. This raised the issue as to whether or not it was possible for the Christian church to provide stylistic leadership in music if the transcendent component of its understanding of the divine is de-emphasized. Of course, neither extreme is truly reflective of the Christian paradox.

Paradigmatic Conclusions and Implications

In recognition of the purpose of this study not to attempt final answers, but rather to strive toward a meaningful contribution to the ongoing investigation of music in Christian worship, the following conclusions and implications are submitted.

Regarding the Religious Determinants of
Sacred Music Style

Christians must recognize the significance of religious-philosophic theories of music style development in the discussion of church music. To approach church music by simply following the typical Western scholarly line of acknowledging mainly humanistic and naturalistic music style determinants (as is prevalent in sociological and anthropological disciplines) is unwittingly to confirm and be controlled by metaphysical presuppositions about ultimate concerns that could be incompatible with biblical faith.¹ As Clouser noted, in other fields "a great deal of theorizing--even by Jews or Christians--has been done under the undetected control of some nonbiblical religious belief."² It would appear that much contemporary theorizing about Christian worship music has treated humanistic and naturalistic factors (e.g., human response, personality and generational factors, cultural factors, sociological structures, and economic realities) as ultimate concerns, rather than seeing them as contributory factors unified by religious ultimate concern/s.³

¹See Clouser, The Myth of Religious Neutrality, 5.

²Ibid.

³Although the chief concern of this study has been with worldview components in relation to music style, it does not seek to denigrate humanistic and naturalistic factors. Rather, they are seen in conjunction with and possibly unified by religious ultimate concerns. For example, the transcendence/immanence orientation shift traced in this study is clearly parallel to Sorokin's description of the shift from the ideational to sensate mentality in Western culture. Further, it has been noted that music tastes and preferences often vary according to socio-economic status (see Gardner, "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics," 4-26; and Maultsby, "Afro-American Religious Music," 68-79). It could be argued that it is generally easier for the financially secure and therefore self-reliant members of society to contemplate the transcendent aspects of deity and appreciate related types of sacred music. However, lower socio-economic classes seek not so much a God out there, but One Who will be close to them in their everyday battle to survive. Hence, immanence-related music styles are generally more popular among this group.

Regarding the Evaluation of Sacred Music Style

Music styles are spiritually bound. Despite repeated claims that they are not at issue in Christian worship music decision making,⁴ this study has provided evidence that music styles are religious-value laden--they are veritable embodiments of beliefs about reality. Evidence of the close relationship between music and religion in all cultures; the determinative influence of sacred music styles on total cultural artistic expression documented in specific settings; and the direct line of impact traceable from the concept of divinity to aesthetic consciousness to artistic expression demonstrates that religious decision making regarding worship music styles is unavoidable.

If worldview factors can predispose the arts to certain stylistic features and to the emphasis of certain arts over others, then decisions of appropriateness are mandatory, not merely from the standpoint of cultural aesthetic taste and preference, but inherent religious suitability. As Burckhardt maintained: "Granted that spirituality in itself is independent of forms, this in no way implies that it can be expressed and transmitted by any and every sort of form."⁵ In the same context, he also noted that

a spiritual vision necessarily finds its expression in a particular formal language; if that language is lacking, with the result that a so-called sacred art borrows its form from some kind of profane art, then it can only be because a spiritual vision of things is also lacking.⁶

⁴See Westermeyer, "The Bottom Line," 131; and Steve Miller, The Contemporary Christian Music Debate (Wheaton, Ill.: Tyndale House Publishers, 1993), 142-147, 205-207.

⁵Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 7.

⁶Ibid. Interestingly, when McLuhan was challenged about his emphasis of medium over content, he responded thus: "By stressing that the medium is the message rather than the content, I am not suggesting that content plays no role--merely that it plays a distinctly subordinate role. . . . By placing all the stress on content and practically none on the medium we lose all chance of perceiving and influencing the impact of new technologies on man, and thus we are always dumbfounded by--and unprepared for--the

Perhaps the last part of this statement could be expanded to include the suggestion that borrowing also occurs when the religious assumptions or spiritual vision of the borrower converges with that which is being borrowed.

Ultimately it is that spiritual vision--the worldview that spawned the artistic expression and which is embodied in its characteristic features--that must be religiously evaluated, not only the quality of the aesthetic product itself. Christian worship music must be assessed on the level of the worldview it embodies, not simply on the basis of an imposed extraneous, perhaps even foreign, aesthetic code.

Making such evaluations, however, is no easy matter. There needs to be awareness that prior to any worldview evaluation, the evaluator must have made his/her own personal worldview commitment⁷ which, in turn, forms the basis of assessment. Herein may lie the reason why discussions about church music have invariably evoked such intense passions, for perhaps it has been sensed (if not openly recognized) that the issues surrounding sacred music style discussions extend far deeper than petty likes and dislikes. At the bottom line, the clash over sacred music styles may well be a clash of underlying beliefs about the nature of ultimate reality, not of inconsequential aesthetic preferences.⁸

If underlying spiritual values have sometimes gone undetected in the Western Christian setting, it is because the

revolutionary environmental transformations induced by new media" (Marshall McLuhan; quoted in Comstock, "The Achievement of Marshall McLuhan," 144).

⁷See Ryken, Culture in Christian Perspective, 181.

⁸Perhaps this is why Wolterstorff, writing about the process of effecting church music changes, indicated that: "Unless the religious self-understanding of the people is also reformed, their taste will alter less rapidly than their resentments build up" (Wolterstorff, Art in Action, 188).

musical art has been set adrift from its spiritual moorings in Western thinking.⁹ Perhaps Christians need to take seriously a reproof of such negligence leveled from a non-Western viewpoint. Decrying Western unawareness of the implications of treating the arts as autonomous entities, Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī wrote:

It falls to Islām and the Muslims . . . to teach contemporary man about the dangers inherent in the doctrine of art for art's sake. It is naive to think that art is a free agent, acting purely and exclusively for the production of "beauty" divorced from any ideological message. On the contrary, art is always the expression of some meaning inherent in the culture or the period. What is considered beautiful is in fact determined by that message. To shut one's eyes to this fact is to invite disaster, for it opens the flood-gates to dominance by any mean and despicable force or idea, which can operate completely uncontrolled and undirected in such a situation.¹⁰

Even if Western culture as a whole considers it inconsequential, this admonition deserves careful attention in Christian circles.¹¹

Regarding Christian Worship Music Style and "Christianness"

The central conclusion of this study derives its impetus from Routley's assertion, initially noted in the "Purpose of the Study," that any criticism of church music practice "should be constructive enough to encourage the good before being repressive enough to ensure the avoidance of error."¹² Given that sacred music

⁹See Daniélou, "Ethical and Spiritual Values in Music," 8; Wulff, "On Practicing Religiously," 158; and Vigo A. Demant, Our Culture--Its Christian Roots and Present Crisis (London: S.P.C.K., 1947), 35.

¹⁰Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Aesthetic Expression," 207-208. In context, she indicated that commercialism and sensationalism (ibid., 207) (and perhaps also other worldview orientations such as the New Age movement) are thus given free reign.

¹¹She went on to note: "How is it possible to adhere to a religion [in context referring to Islām, but equally applicable to Christianity] which describes itself as a complete way of life and have no concern for the art that surrounds us and influences us in our daily life? We must ask ourselves what effect on our souls does the separation of ideology and the means of joy, relaxation, beautification and entertainment have?" (ibid., 208).

¹²Routley, Church Music and Theology, 108.

style reflects presuppositions about divine transcendence or immanence, it is submitted that the Christian belief-paradox in this regard is expressed best by a musical style that embodies and maintains that tension.

There is no intention to promote an eclectic or smorgasbord approach in which both transcendence-oriented and immanence-oriented music are utilized in an attempt to satisfy everybody's taste and achieve musical balance in worship. What is being envisioned is an integrated style reflective of the integrated nature of the divine/human revelation in Christ. This is a call to revisit and wrestle again with the enigmatic difficulty that has confronted Christian artistic expression for centuries.¹³ To fail to respond to this challenge is to admit that Christianity has nothing to say to artistic expression, or that this aspect of human creativity falls beyond its influence and that therefore, as a religion, Christianity does not touch life in its entirety. From a biblical viewpoint, this is untenable.¹⁴

Those who have thought seriously about this challenge recognize that in the incarnation and redemption--"this consummate action of the God-creation relationship"--lies "the watershed between Christian and non-Christian worldviews."¹⁵ It seems requisite that in the pursuit of artistic integrity this area of Christian belief should become an intense focus of study.¹⁶ Understanding the interaction between Christ's divine and human

¹³See Eliade, Symbolism, the Sacred and the Arts, 63; and Wilder, Theology and Modern Literature, 85.

¹⁴See 1 Cor 10:31 and Phil 4:8.

¹⁵Holmes, "Toward a Christian View of Things," 18.

¹⁶Johansson gave some excellent philosophic direction concerning the implications of the Incarnation for church music in Music and Ministry, 30-41.

natures, and how their integration was manifest in everyday life, must be the core reality in this complex issue.

Burckhardt tendered one artistic translation of the paradox when he suggested that "if Christian art were entirely abstract it could not bear witness to the Incarnation of the Word; if it were naturalistic, it would belie the Divine nature of that Incarnation."¹⁷ Writing in the context of sacred music, a similar idea was expressed in Music in Church (1957):

It is because the tunes of songs have the power to conjure an image and an ideal, that it is necessary to be sure that the music of hymns does not insinuate a conception of Christ markedly weaker and more limited than the picture of the Incarnate Son of God revealed in the Bible.¹⁸

Recognition of the need to encapsulate Christian belief and experience in a unique music style is apparent even among more liberal contemporary Christian perspectives.¹⁹ But, is this ideal only a figment of philosophic imagination? Is it really a legitimate stylistic viability?

Grabar noted that the Greek divine/human synthesis was deemed an adequate model for early Christian art. He wrote:

Everywhere Christ is given the features of a classical ephebus; which shows that in Christian ideology God incarnate was envisaged as an "ideal man" and that these artists, trained on classical lines, pictured the "ideal man" as a youth of perfect beauty.²⁰

More recently this model has been overtly upheld again as a helpful directive for Christians. Karl Schefold contended that Greek art "in its original character stands closer to the Gospel than any

¹⁷Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 150.

¹⁸Music in Church, 39.

¹⁹See Graham Cray, "Justice, Rock and the Renewal of Worship," in In Spirit and in Truth: Exploring Directions in Music and Worship Today, ed. Robin Sheldon (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1989), 14.

²⁰Grabar, Early Christian Art, 274.

other period of art."²¹ Certainly, here was an artistic style with integrity--its musical expression being the Apollonian style.

Over the centuries this suggestion has merited considerable attention in Christian circles, and one must admit that the results of its implementation are not totally inimical to Christian thought. However, it incorporates certain non-Christian presuppositions. From the outset, in the Greek conception the gods were conceived in human terms. Divinity was encapsulated in the idealization of human nature--an idealization derived from human conceptualization of human nature. In other words, understanding of the divine was wholly rooted in the humanistic realm. The gods were superhumans.

The Christian understanding of Christ has always rested in the fact that before Christ became human, He was divine. He exhibited an ideal humanity in His earthly sojourn, but He was not merely human, or even superhuman. He was still fully divine, and fully human.²² Representation of such a mystery is never reflected or even attempted in Greek artistic expression. In this respect it falls short as a model for the Christian view, and could be seen as moving dangerously close to creating God in man's image.²³

Another prototypical suggestion that could serve as a model can be deduced from history. If there has been an overall swing from a transcendence-oriented sacred music style to an immanence-oriented style, then there must have been a point along the continuum at which the polarities were more or less blended and

²¹In context, Karl Schefold wrote: "Wir wollen die griechische Kunst zu Hilfe nehmen, weil sie . . . in ihrem ursprünglichen Charakter dem Evangelium so nahe steht wie keine andere Periode der Kunst" (Die Bedeutung der Griechischen Kunst für das Verständnis des Evangeliums [Mainz am Rhein: Verlag Philipp von Zabern, 1983], 22).

²²See, for example, Phil 2:5-11.

²³Compare biblical passages like Ps 50:21 and Isa 55:8, 9 that warn about this.

integrated in a legitimate style. Affirming that possibility, Burckhardt wrote:

There are those for whom Baroque art represents the last great manifestation of the Christian vision of the world. This is no doubt because the Baroque is still aspiring towards a synthesis; it is even the last attempt at a synthesis of Western life on a foundation of any breadth.²⁴

Koenigsberger's comment about the astonishing popularity of the Baroque style lends support to this suggestion.

It caught on in most of Europe and Latin America; it was favored by Protestant, as well as Catholic, courts. . . . The Baroque style provided exactly what courts, churches and the general public wanted at the time, an artistic and emotional bridging of the gulf between monarchies and their subjects, between the Church hierarchy and the Christian congregation, between court and bourgeois society.²⁵

Although Koenigsberger's focus was not exactly the same as that of this study, the connections he drew seem related. Here is a musical style that blended "a strongly personal type of religious emotion with which ordinary people could identify" with a sense of awe, "grandeur and magnificence"²⁶ combining affective communication with some more abstract features. It provided an adept aesthetic intuition of the integration of divine immanence/transcendence as was evident at the end of the "God for us" and in the initial "God beside us" periods.

It is not the purpose of this study to uphold Western Baroque style music as the ideal church music choice. The intention is merely to submit an example of a legitimate style that had integrity and approached the aesthetic representation of the Christian paradox regarding ultimate reality. It is not meant to suggest that the Baroque style embodied it perfectly, nor is it proposed that ideally this style should be imitated today.

²⁴Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 152-153.

²⁵Koenigsberger, Politicians and Virtuosi, 245.

²⁶Ibid.

Perhaps, however, reflection on this style would provide insights for contemporary directions, though it must be kept in mind that historically the entire dynamic has changed. During the Baroque period (1600-1750), following a long tradition of transcendence orientation, the perspective in musical development was focused on incorporating a greater immanence orientation in order to realize the balance. By contrast, the current prevailing orientation is strongly immanent, and therefore, in order to achieve the same balance developments must be focused in the opposite direction.²⁷ During the Baroque period, movement was with the tide of general cultural change. Today, however, similar movement would be counter-cultural with all its attendant difficulties.

Dean's appeal "that we might intensify our efforts to create new and honest musical expressions of our own living faith as members of 'one body in Christ'"²⁸ is worthy of serious consideration. To forge a sacred music style that is true to the Christian paradox is a challenge to the best thought, creativity, and commitment for contemporary Christian musicians.

Simply relying on contemporary popular music styles, or this century's more abstract art music styles, betrays Christian distinctiveness and undercuts its aesthetic witness.²⁹ In this

²⁷This, in fact, was Johansson's recommendation in Disciplining Music Ministry, 84-85.

²⁸Dean, Preface to A Survey of Twentieth Century Protestant Church Music in America.

²⁹See, for example, Pattison's critique of the use of popular rock music in the Christian context. He wrote: "Some dreamers have hoped to harness rock to propagate the values of transcendent ideologies. . . . But rock is useless to teach any transcendent value. . . . Rock's electricity as much as its pantheist heritage gives the lie to whatever enlightened propaganda may be foisted on it" (The Triumph of Vulgarity, 137). Later he continued: "Rock knocks the props out from under religion, first, by shifting the locus of faith from God to self, and secondly, by depriving sects and churches of their claim to exclusive revelation. By forcing churches to compete on the basis of their ability to titillate the instincts of their worshippers, vulgar pantheism compels the

context, Frondizi's observation on the reformation of moral and artistic values is highly relevant. He wrote: "The essence of the moral reformer and of the creator in the field of art lies in not adjusting to the predominant norms or tastes, but unfurling the flag of what 'ought to be' over and above people's preferences."¹⁰ Such idealism may be tempered, but certainly not destroyed by Rookmaaker's realistic reminder that

although there is no promise that Christianity will again be acknowledged as influential in our society, our task is not to shy away from our responsibilities. We are called to be the salt of the earth, working against corruption. We are admonished to be humble, not to dream of doing God's work in our own strength. At the same time we are commanded to be righteous, to do our task, to walk in God's ways. . . . Artists are not excluded. In fact, I think they have an important part to play."¹¹

However, while looking towards reformation, it should be remembered that current artistic styles already both create and reflect the communities that spawn and use them. The music style regularly espoused in a Christian church's worship unwittingly reveals its real rather than its ideal conception of divinity.¹²

champions of organized religions to abandon their pretention to superior truth and turns them into entrepreneurs of emotional stimulation. Once God becomes a commodity used for self-gratification, his fortunes depend on the vagaries of the emotional market place, and his claims to command allegiance on the basis of omnipotence of omniscience vanishes in a blaze of solipsism as his priests and shamans pander to the feeling, not the faith, of their customers. . . .

"But, pantheism's real threat to religion only materializes gradually. In the short run, rock and religion are complementary and will remain so until pantheism shall have made the traditional denominations as precarious as the passing California cults" (ibid., 186-187).

¹⁰Frondizi, What Is Value? 29.

¹¹Rookmaaker, Art Needs No Justification, 22.

¹²Erik Routley cryptically observed: "A church produces the music it wants and deserves. You can tell much about the ethos of a church . . . from the quality of the music it most freely accepts and approves" (Church Music and the Christian Faith [Carol Stream, Ill.: AGAPE, 1978], 92-93).

Regarding the Definition of the Sacred

Given the need for Christian sacred music style to reflect Christianity's conception of the divine, the sacred cannot be defined in terms of the transcendence orientation as has traditionally been the case. It is not legitimate for Gregorian chant and related styles to be eulogized and upheld as the ideal in sacred music," despite their obvious beauty and spiritual orientation. If it is true that music style embodies worldview presuppositions, then the models of Christian sacred music must be consciously worldview derived. When this occurs, delineations of sacred style cannot be denounced as aesthetic prejudice.³³ Sacred music needs to be redefined as an integrated blend of the transcendent and immanent stylistic characteristics. In the Christian context both of the extreme points of the spectrum are inappropriate as genuinely sacred. If music manifesting an "integrated blend" is used in both worship and non-worship settings, then cultural associations rather than stylistic factors could become a legitimate means of judging appropriateness.

Regarding Sacred Music as Wholistic Communication

Although a useful tool in aesthetic criticism, the form/content dichotomy (where only content is considered religiously significant) cannot be a legitimate approach to the evaluation of Christian worship music. As demonstrated in this study, form in sacred art is not religiously neutral. Further, as Burckhardt observed "the thing that makes the 'desecration' of art final and in a sense irreversible is not so much the choice of themes of subjects

³³See Hannum, Music and Worship, 56, 57; Davison, Church Music, 26-38; and Benson, The Hymnody of the Christian Church, 237.

³⁴This essentially echoes Winter's argument regarding the Roman Catholic situation in Why Sing? 242-244.

as the choice of formal language or 'style.'³⁵ Indeed, the themes and subjects of sacred music have changed with shifting emphases in Christian thought, but nothing has fueled the fires of controversy over sacred music as much as the changes in the formal language or style of Christian artistic expression.

The idea that Christianness in artistic expression is merely a function of content being in harmony with faith, or even that it is simply the result of association by virtue of its use in a church building, does violence to the concept of a wholistically unified sacred art form, ultimately shortchanging its authority. In fact, it deprives the arts of realizing one of its potential strengths. When rooted in the same presuppositions and ideas as the religious precepts of a people, artistic expression can open doors "to depths of meanings, to intuitions, which are difficult to achieve through discursive explanation."³⁶ As chapter 3 of this study indicated, it seems inescapable that any genuinely viable sacred art is an integrity--the result of content, formal language, and performance practice being imbued with the same spirit, obedient to the same spiritual economy. Christian sacred music can be no exception.

Regarding Church Music and Mission

In highlighting the close relationship between conceptions of divinity and sacred music style, this study has shown that a culture's sacred music (as well as its general music style) is neither primitive nor inartistic, but a chosen and fostered artistic presentation of perceptions of ultimate reality. As such, it must be respected.

³⁵Burckhardt, Sacred Art in East and West, 146.

³⁶Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "Islām and Aesthetic Expression," 209.

It has also been shown that there are transcultural similarities regarding transcendence and immanence orientations that suggest the possibility of certain commonalities amidst world-music complexity. It would appear that there are some mutual elements in intercultural religiosity and the strivings of the human spirit to express them. For these reasons, the indiscriminate use of any music style for Christian worship is questionable, despite its presence or popularity in a particular culture or subculture.

There are cultural differences in the use of particular tonal systems, harmonic schemes, language stresses, and word/tone relationships in which the type of worldview factors focused on in this study are not so significant. These elements must be duly recognized and sensitively handled in all cultures to which Christianity is introduced.¹⁷ Rather, it is the promiscuous accommodation of any cultural musical expressions to the Christian message that calls for Christian discrimination.

In this context, John Senior made a point worthy of consideration when he wrote: "It is said that Christianity, if it is to survive, must face the modern world, must come to terms with the way things are in the sense of the current drift of things. It is just the other way around: if we are to survive, we must face Christianity."¹⁸ If Christianity's witness is wholistic (including an aesthetic component), it cannot simply imitate or echo the music

¹⁷See some of the suggestions in Oyer, "Hymnody in the Context of World Mission," 58; and Hunt, Music in Missions, 132-151.

¹⁸John Senior, The Death of Christian Culture (New York: Arlington House, 1978), 128. See also Martin E. Marty's comment that "to match what this year's market says the unchurched want is to have the people who know least about faith determine most about its expression" (Martin E. Marty; quoted in Kenneth L. Woodward, "Dead End for the Mainline?" Newsweek, August 9, 1993, 45).

of the cultures or subcultures it encounters. To do such, as Walter J. Hollenweger declared, "would be a betrayal of the gospel."³

The Al Fārūqīs made a point that is significant for Christian culture development and the relationship of the arts to Christian mission. They wrote:

There is no civilization that has not adopted some elements foreign to it. What is important is that the civilization digest those elements, that is, recast their forms and relations and thus integrate them into its own system. To "in-form" them with its own form is in fact to transform them into a new reality where they exist no more in themselves or in their former dependency, but as integral components of the new civilization in which they have been integrated. It is not an argument against any civilization that it contains such elements; but is a devastating argument against any civilization when it has merely added foreign elements; when it has done so in disjointed manner, without re-formation, in-formation, or integration. As such, the elements merely co-exist with the civilization. They do not belong organically to it. But if the civilization has succeeded in transforming them and integrating them into its system, the integrating process becomes its index of vitality, of its dynamism and creativity.⁴

It is unavoidable that Christianity will adopt some foreign artistic elements in the process of its missionary witness. However, failure to transform and integrate them into a unified whole discloses a lack of dynamic creativity.⁵

It has been stated that "successful mission insists that people may experience and express their faith in forms and patterns most familiar to their own cultural ways and values and traditions."⁶ This is true, particularly when it comes to the

³Walter J. Hollenweger, "Music in the Service of Reconciliation," in The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991), 156.

⁴Al Fārūqī and Al Fārūqī, The Cultural Atlas of Islām, 76.

⁵In the aftermath of the Protestant Reformation, when the dynamism and creativity of the Protestant movement was still strong, an example of such transfiguration of musical elements can be found in J. S. Bach's transformation for his Passion chorale of Hassler's tune for "Mein Gemüth is mir verwirret" (see Grout, A History of Western Music, 255).

⁶Gottfried Oosterwal, "Mission and Culture," Adventist Review, October 19, 1989, 21.

less-worldview-oriented cultural differences indicated above. But, if taken as a blanket statement, Christian distinctiveness would rapidly be lost in cultural relativism. Further, as ethnomusicologists have indicated, substantial pre-Christian cultural survivals frequently are associated with syncretisms in belief.⁴³ This is not to imply one necessarily caused the other, though they probably aided and abetted one another. Because cultural artistic expressions initially grew out of belief, they continue to support and affirm those beliefs whenever they are utilized. Perhaps herein is a case for the application of Christ's admonition about putting new wine into new wine skins.⁴⁴

Mbiti observed that for Africans a one-day-a-week religion lacks meaning. Traditional African religions have always absorbed the whole person, and the entire environment and all time was perceived as having religious meaning. Mbiti went on to add:

Conversion to new religions like Christianity and Islām must embrace his language, thought pattern, fears, social relationships, attitudes and philosophical disposition, if that conversion is to make a lasting impact upon the individual and his community.⁴⁵

To some extent, this is true in all cultures. It is interesting that in the major proselytizing success that Islām has enjoyed in some Western cultures in the late twentieth century, its distinctive sacred sound art language (foreign to most Westerners) has not been modified to suit Western tastes. Rather, it is presented as part of the total religious package with obvious success. This wholistic approach is clearly perceived as having integrity rather than being culturally foreign.

⁴³For example, among the African diaspora in the Americas, West African religious and musical survivals were best preserved in areas under Roman Catholic rather than Protestant influence (see Nettl, Music in Primitive Culture, 127).

⁴⁴See Matt 9:17.

⁴⁵Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy, 3.

In his study of the Venda people in southern Africa, Blacking concluded that

creativity in Venda music depends on the use and transformation of the basic conceptual models that generate its surface structures; and because these models are acquired unconsciously as part of the maturation process, I do not think that they can be used really creatively by someone who is not deeply involved in Venda society.

In other words, the rules of Venda music are not arbitrary, like the rules of a game. In order to create new Venda music, you must be a Venda, sharing Venda social and cultural life from early childhood.⁴⁶

Although Christianity is not limited to a tribal culture, certain basic principles still apply. This study posits that basic Christian conceptual models should generate its artistic structures. Also, it is probably true that to create new Christian music, one must be a Christian, and have participated in Christian social and cultural values sufficiently that understandings about the essence of Christianity have become embedded in one's outlook. Only when this has happened can the creative impulses be channeled into a new mold in any host culture.

However, cultural seclusion must be avoided. Historically, Christian ghettos have exhibited a degenerative rather than a regenerative vitality; thus, isolationism is not the answer. Instead, without selling out to an alien culture or burying their heads in the sands of conservatism and stagnation,⁴⁷ Christians need to study how to be relevant and innovative while remaining true to their heritage. Only thus will they furnish a wholistic witness.⁴⁸ This noble goal will take time, prayerful effort, and education.

⁴⁶Blacking, How Musical Is Man? 98.

⁴⁷See Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī's suggestion of this in the Islamic context (Islām and Art, 5).

⁴⁸For some insights regarding the process of providing such a witness, see Loh, "Toward Contextualization of Church Music in Asia," 92-99.

Regarding Church Music Education

If sacred music is the embodiment of conceptions of the nature of divinity, then church music education belongs under the purview of religious education rather than merely being considered a subset of musicological education. Further, church music education cannot afford to focus exclusively on questions relating to the functional performance of liturgy to the neglect of questions about worship music style choice. The aim of church music education cannot be simply to provide graduates of wide taste and appreciation with commensurate performance skills to suit varied contexts.

Both religion and church music students must be brought to recognize that the arts are important purveyors and reinforcers of worldview presuppositions. Lois Ibsen Al Fārūqī explained the far-reaching significance of educating for such awareness when she wrote:

An aesthetic awareness would thus be created which would obviate such statements as--"I don't know why I like (or dislike) this art." "I don't know what I like in art." "Art appreciation is all a matter of individual taste." A realization would result of the important changes in ideology that have spawned innovations in artistic style and content in the past, and that are just as surely occurring in our contemporary world. It is only with such awareness that an aesthetically conscious audience can evolve. Only then can our societies, or religious communities, our nations, our fellow humans effect a beneficial influence on the future direction of the arts. Given the educative and value-imparting functions of art, this cannot fail to be an important mission for the religiously, the socially, and the politically conscious citizen of any part of our globe--in our time, as well as in any future age."

Indeed, church music education should be at the forefront of instruction about the influence of beliefs on artistic styles. Secularly oriented disciplines have little motivation to explore this avenue of thought. In an article entitled "Islamization through Art," Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī spelled out the implications she saw for arts education in Islām. Several of her points provide

^aLois Ibsen Al Fārūqī, "God in Visual Aesthetic Expression," 263.

provocative food for thought when translated into the Christian setting:³⁰

1. Christians cannot avoid the difficult task of discerning which art forms are suitable for and which are incompatible with Christian thought and worship culture. Failure to guide the propensity for human artistic expression in Christian worship will, by default, result in it being stimulated by other agencies, people, or ideologies that have far less noble aims.

2. Christian education institutions and/or their supporters need to initiate research programs that would characterize artistic products suitable to the Christian message. Such study should not be merely concerned with discovering authoritative prohibitions and prescriptions, but with defining how the incarnation illuminates the aesthetic realization of the Christian paradox. Research of this calibre demands Christian sensitivity and insight motivated by the desire to do God's will.

3. Textbooks and other materials that explain Christian artistic endeavor in terms of Christian belief need to be prepared for students of various age levels. It is axiomatic that non-Christian scholars can never fulfill this necessity.

4. Elementary, secondary, and tertiary instructors need to understand how music and the other arts relate to the beliefs that spawned them. Because secular education institutions tend to approach information with their own worldview biases, unless Christians achieve success in teacher training, they can never hope to cultivate an appreciation of "Christian artistic expression."

5. It is a Christian duty to stimulate the creation of Christian church music. However, this may be problematic if

³⁰The following points are liberally paraphrased and translated into the Christian context from Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī, "Islamization Through Art: Implications for Education," Islamic Culture 56 (1982): 27-29.

professional Christian musicians are mostly trained in secular institutions (imbibing philosophies like "art for its own sake"), for it is very difficult to digest a non-Christian-worldview-oriented training and go on to produce artistic works that are Christian in content and form. For this reason, it is crucial that an atmosphere of open community and camaraderie be fostered among Christian musicians and that individualism and personal acclaim be less highly valued than doing all to God's glory.

6. Establishing quality professional training based directly on a Christian belief-oriented aesthetic may mean building programs in a few selected institutions. However, international symposia and seminars could be held to nurture artists and others in principles of truly Christian art. There could be no more convincing proof that Christianity operates in all arenas of Christian life.

Recommendations for Further Study

1. The specific relationship of the pantheistic conception of divinity (as highlighted in Eastern religions) and its concomitant sacred music style needs to be investigated in relation to the paradigm suggested in this study.

2. The theory that there is a transcultural relationship between conceptions of the divine and sacred music styles suggests the need for further investigation in the field of the phenomenology of religion. The wider applicability of the theory needs to be tested.

3. Evidence provided in this study that sacred music style (and by extension, more general features of a culture's music style) is influenced by prevailing conceptions of divinity implies that religiously oriented determinants of music style must be explored as determinants of music style in the field of ethnomusicology.

4. The relationship of other worldview factors--such as the belief about beginnings, the belief about the future, the nature of humanity, and the concept of sin and salvation--should also be explored in relation to sacred music styles.

5. The significance of the shift in the Christian belief about divine transcendence/immanence as an explanation for the changes in Western music style suggests the need for further investigation of such religiously oriented conceptions in the historical development of Western art music.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ackerman, James S. "Style." In Art and Archeology, ed. James S. Ackerman and Rhys Carpenter, 164-186. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1963.
- Adler, Mortimer J. Six Great Ideas. New York: Macmillan, 1981.
- Adorno, Theodor W. Philosophy of Modern Music. Translated by Anne G. Mitchell and Wesley V. Blomster. New York: Continuum Publishing Corporation, 1985.
- Adorno, Theodor W., and George Simpson. "On Popular Music." Studies in Philosophy and Social Science 9 (1941): 17-48.
- Al Fārūqī, Isma'īl R. "Misconceptions of the Nature of Islamic Art." Islām and the Modern Age 1 (1970): 29-49.
- _____. "On the Nature of the Work of Art in Islām." Islām and the Modern Age 1 (1970): 68-81.
- _____. "Islām and Art." Studia Islamica 37 (1973): 81-109.
- _____. "Foreword: Islām, Development and the A.M.S.S." In Islām and Development: Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Convention of the Association of Muslim Social Scientists, vii-x. Plainfield, Ind.: The Association of Muslim Social Scientists, 1977.
- _____. "Divine Transcendence and Its Expression." In The Global Congress of the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson, 267-316. New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982.
- _____. "Islām as Culture and Civilization." In Islām and Contemporary Society, ed. Salem Azzam, 140-176. London: Longman and the Islamic Council of Europe, 1982.
- Al Fārūqī, Isma'īl R., and Lois Lamyā' Al Fārūqī. The Cultural Atlas of Islām. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1986.
- Al Fārūqī, Lois Ibsen (Lamyā'). "Muwashshah: A Vocal Form in Islamic Culture." Ethnomusicology 19 (January 1975): 1-29.
- _____. "The Nature of the Musical Art of Islamic Culture: A Theoretical and Empirical Study of Arabian Music." Ph.D. dissertation, Syracuse University, 1975.
- _____. "Development and the Islamic Arts." In Islām and Development: Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Convention of the Association of Muslim Social Scientists, 27-35. Plainfield, Ind.: The Association of Muslim Social Scientists, 1977.

- Al Fārūqī, Lois Ibsen (Lamyā'). "Accentuation in Qur'ānic Chant: A Study in Musical Tawāzun." Yearbook of the International Folk Music Council 10 (1978): 53-68.
- _____. "Dance as an Expression of Islamic Culture." Dance Research Journal 10 (Spring-Summer 1978): 6-13.
- _____. "Ornamentation in Arabian Improvisational Music: A Study of Interrelatedness in the Arts." The World of Music 20 (1978): 17-28.
- _____. "The Status of Music in Muslim Nations: Evidence from the Arab World." Asian Music: A Journal of the Society for Asian Music 12 (1981): 56-84.
- _____. "God in Visual Aesthetic Expression--A Comparative Study in Transcendence Symbolization." In The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson, 234-266. New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982.
- _____. "Islām and Aesthetic Expression." In Islām and Contemporary Society, ed. Salem Azzam, 191-212. London and New York: Longman and the Islamic Council of Europe, 1982.
- _____. "Islamization Through Art: Implications for Education." Islamic Culture 56 (1982): 21-35.
- _____. "The Shari'ah on Music and Musicians." In Islamic Thought and Culture: Papers Presented to the Islamic Studies Group of American Academy of Religion, ed. Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, 27-51. Washington, D.C.: International Institute of Islamic Thought, 1982.
- _____. "What Makes 'Religious Music' Religious?" In Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, 21-34. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies. Vol. 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- _____. "Factors of Continuity in the Musical Cultures of the Muslim World." Progress Reports in Ethnomusicology 1 (1983-1984): 1-18.
- _____. "Unity and Variety in the Music of Islamic Culture." In The Islamic Impact, ed. Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, Byron Haines and Ellison Findly, 175-194. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1984.
- _____. "An Islamic Perspective on Symbolism in the Arts: New Thoughts on Figural Representation." In Art, Creativity, and the Sacred: An Anthology in Religion and Art, ed. Diane Apostolos-Cappadona, 164-178. New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1985.
- _____. Islām and Art. Islamabad, Pakistan: National Hijra Council, 1985.
- _____. "Music, Musicians and Muslim Law." Asian Music: A Journal of the Society for Asian Music 17 (Fall-Winter, 1985): 3-36.

- Al Fārūqī, Lois Ibsen (Lamyā'). "Structural Segments in the Islamic Arts: The Musical 'Translation' of a Characteristic of the Literary and Visual Arts." Asian Music: A Journal of the Society for Asian Music 16 (1985): 59-82.
- _____. "The Suite in Islamic History and Culture." The World of Music 27 (1985): 46-64.
- _____. "Aesthetic Characteristics of the Traditional Music of the Arabian Gulf and the Peninsula." Al Ma'thurāt Al Sha'biyyah 1 (April 1986): 18-25.
- Alford, Delton L. "Pentecostal and Charismatic Music." Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements. Edited by Stanley M. Burgess and Gary B. McGee. Regency Reference Library. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan Publishing House, 1988. 688-695.
- Allen, Warren Dwight. Philosophies of Music History: A Study of General Histories of Music, 1600-1960. New York: Dover Publications, 1962.
- Ames, David W. "Contexts of Dance in Zazzau and the Impact of Islamic Reform." In African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg, 134-147. Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982.
- Amoaku, W. Komla. "Toward a Definition of Traditional African Music: A Look at the Ewe of Ghana." In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 31-40. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Anand, Mulk Raj. Preface to The Hindu View of Art. 2d ed. Bombay: Asia Publishing House, 1957.
- Anders, Charles R. "Church Music and the Ecumenical Scene." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 35-40. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- _____. "Luther and the Composers of His Time." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 41-50. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Anderson, Lois. "The Interrelationship of African and Arab Music: Some Preliminary Considerations." In Essays on Music and History in Africa, ed. K. P. Wachsmann, 143-169. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1971.
- Andrews, Edward Deming. The Gift to Be Simple: Songs, Dances and Rituals of the American Shakers. New York: Dover Publications, 1940.
- Apel, Willi. "Tonality." Harvard Dictionary of Music. Edited by Willi Apel. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1972. 855-856.
- _____. "Transformation of Themes." Harvard Dictionary of Music. Edited by Willi Apel. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1972. 859.

- Apel, Willi. "Ostinato." Harvard Dictionary of Music. Edited by Willi Apel. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1972, 634-635.
- Arndal, Steffen. "Awakening and Singing in German Pietism and Moravianism." The Hymn 36 (July 1985): 11-14.
- Arnobius. Aduersus nationes II, 42. In Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon, excerpt 95. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Askew, Thomas A., and Peter W. Spellman. The Churches and the American Experience: Ideals and Institutions. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1984.
- Atheneus. "Sophists at Dinner." In Source Readings in Music History: Antiquity and the Middle Ages, ed. Oliver Strunk, 47-56. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1965.
- Auden, W. H. "Postscript: Christianity and Art." In The New Orpheus: Essays toward a Christian Poetic, ed. Nathan A. Scott, Jr., 74-79. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1964.
- Avenary, Hanoch. "The Emergence of Synagogue Song." Encyclopaedia Judaica. 1971. 12:566-571.
- . "The Roots of Synagogue Song in the Near Eastern Communities (c. 70-950 C.E.)." Encyclopaedia Judaica. 1971. 12:571-590.
- Bacon, Sir Francis. "Novum Organum, Book I, 95." In Advancement of Learning, Novum Organum, New Atlantis by Sir Francis Bacon. Great Books of the Western World, vol. 30, ed. Robert Maynard Hutchins. Chicago: William Benton Publisher, 1952.
- Baker, Paul. Why Should the Devil Have all the Good Music: Jesus Music--Where It Began, Where It Is, and Where It Is Going. Waco, Tex.: Word Books, 1979.
- Baker, Thomas. "New Hymns for New Liturgies." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 161-168. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Ballantine, Christopher. Music and Its Social Meanings. New York: Gordon and Breach Science Publishers, 1984.
- Banfield, Ann. "The Nature of Evidence in a Falsifiable Literary Theory." In The Concept of Style, ed. Berel Lang, 183-211. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979.
- Bangert, Mark. "Church Music History, Classic and Romantic." In Key Words in Church Music: Definition Essays on Concepts, Practices and Movements of Thought in Church Music, ed. Carl Schalk, 127-138. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1978.
- Bangert, Martin J. "The Musical Heritage in the Life of the Congregation." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 4, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 118-122. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1954.

- Barnes, Ken. "A Fragment of the Imagination." In Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith, 8-50. New York: Pantheon Books, 1988.
- Barrett, David B. "Annual Statistical Table on Global Mission: 1993." International Bulletin of Missionary Research 17 (January 1993): 22-23.
- Barrett, Leonard E., Sr. The Rastafarians: Sounds of Cultural Dissonance. Revised and updated edition. Boston: Beacon Press, 1988.
- Bassc, Ellen B. A Musical View of the Universe. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1985.
- Bauer, Glen Alan. "A Contextual Approach to Schoenberg's Atonal Works: Self-Expression, Religion, and Music Theory." Ph.D. dissertation, Washington University, 1986.
- Baumeister, Roy F. "Acid Rock: A Critical Reappraisal and Psychological Commentary." Journal of Psychoactive Drugs 16 (October-December 1984): 339-345.
- Bech, Terry. "Nepal: The Gaine Caste of Beggar-Musicians." The World of Music 17 (1975): 28-35.
- Beeman, Bob. "Why Heavy Metal Is a Ministry." Contemporary Christian Music 12 (August 1989): 19.
- Béhague, Gerad. "Some Liturgical Functions of Afro-Brazilian Religious Music in Salvador, Bahia." The World of Music 19 (1977): 4-14.
- _____. Review of La Musique et la Transe: Esquisse d'une Théorie Générale des Relations de la Musique et de la Possession by Gilbert Rouget, Ethnomusicology 29 (Fall 1985): 495-504.
- _____. "Percussion and Noise." The Encyclopedia of Religion. 1987. 11:235-239.
- Benson, Louis F. The Hymnody of the Christian Church. Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1956.
- Berglund, Robert D. A Philosophy of Church Music. Chicago: Moody Press, 1985.
- Berleant, Arnold. "The Sensuous and the Sensual in Aesthetics." Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 23 (1964): 185-192.
- Berliner, Paul. "Music and Spirit Possession at a Shona Bira." African Music: Journal of the African Music Society 5 (1975-6): 130-139.
- Best, Harold M. "Christian Responsibility in Music." In The Christian Imagination: Essays on Literature and the Arts, ed. Leland Ryken, 401-414. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker Book House, 1981.
- Bettelheim, Bruno. Quoted in Robert L. Scranton. Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art, 2. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964.

- Beyer, Huntley, and Rebecca Parker Beyer. "Music Informing Spirit: A Commentary on the Theological Implications of Contemporary Music." Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies 49 (1983): 7-17.
- Bichsel, M. Alfred. "Music of the Liturgy." In Essays Presented at the First Liturgical Institute, 95-103. Valparaíso, Ind.: Valparaíso University Press, 1950.
- _____. "Music in the Church--Whose Responsibility?" In Festschrift: Theodore Hoelty-Nickel: A Collection of Essays on Church Music, ed. Newman W. Powell, 36-42. Valparaíso, Ind.: Valparaíso University Press, 1967.
- Bingham, James Thomas. "Liturgy and Ritual as Religious Education: Implications for the Seventh-day Adventist Church." Ph.D. dissertation, Andrews University, 1984.
- Blacking, John. How Musical Is Man? Seattle, Wash.: University of Washington Press, 1973.
- Blair, Samuel. A Discourse on Psalmody. Philadelphia: John McCulloch, 1789. Microcard Evans 21695.
- Blanchard, John. Pop Goes the Gospel. Rev. ed. Durham, England: Evangelical Press, 1989.
- Blanchard, Robert I. "Church Music Today--The Center Position." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 65-73. Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Blankenburg, Walter. "Church Music in Reformed Europe." Translated by Hans Heinsheimer. In Protestant Church Music: A History, by Friedrich Blume, 518-519. New York: W. W. Norton, 1974.
- Bloom, Allan. "Our Listless Universities." Change 15 (April, 1983): 29-35.
- _____. The Closing of the American Mind. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1987.
- Blume, Friedrich, ed. Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart: Allgemeine Enzyklopädie der Musik. Kassel: Im Bärenreiter-Verlag, 1949-1951.
- _____. Renaissance and Baroque Music: A Comprehensive Survey. Translated by M. D. Herter Norton. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1967.
- _____. "The Period of the Reformation." Revised by Ludwig Finscher and translated R. Ellsworth Peterson. In Protestant Church Music: A History, by Friedrich Blume with a foreword by Paul Henry Lang, 3-123. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1974.
- _____. "The Age of Confessionalism." Translated by Theodore Hoelty-Nickel. In Protestant Church Music: A History, by Friedrich Blume with a foreword by Paul Henry Lang, 125-315. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1974.

- Bohannon, Paul. "Artist and Critic in an African Society." In The Many Faces of Primitive Art, ed. Douglas Fraser, 246-254. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1966.
- Bolam, David W., and James L. Henderson. Art and Belief. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1967.
- Bontinck, Irmgard, and Kurt Blaukopf. "New Patterns of Musical Behaviour." In Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, 53-56. Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974. Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976.
- Bourguignon, Erika. "Ritual and Myth in Haitian Vodoun." In African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg, 290-304. Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982.
- Boyer, Horace Clarence. "A Comparative Analysis of Traditional and Contemporary Gospel Music." In More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 127-146. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Brauer, Jerald C. Protestantism in America: A Narrative History. Rev. ed. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1965.
- Brooks, Cleanth. The Hidden God: Studies in Hemingway, Faulkner, Yeats, Eliot, and Warren. London and New Haven: Yale University Press, 1963.
- Broudy, Harry S. "A Philosophy of the Arts in an Emerging Society." Music Educators Journal 56 (September 1969): 43-46, 109, 111, 112-118.
- Brunner, Adolf. Musik im Gottesdienst: Wesen, Funktion und Ort der Musik im Gottesdienst. Zurich: Zwingli Verlag, 1968.
- Bücher, Karl. "Arbeit und Rhythmus." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 327-333. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Budge, Sir E. A. Wallis. A History of Ethiopia: Nubia and Abyssinia. Vol. 1. London: Methuen and Company, 1928.
- Bujić, Bojan, ed. Music in European Thought: 1851-1912. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Bukofzer, Manfred E. Music in the Baroque Era: From Monteverdi to Bach. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1947.
- Burckhardt, Titus. Sacred Art in East and West: Its Principles and Methods. Translated by Lord Northbourne. London: Perennial Books, 1967.
- Burnim, Mellonee V. "The Black Gospel Music Tradition: A Complex of Ideology, Aesthetic, and Behavior." In More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 147-167. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.

- Burnim, Mellonee V. "The Performance of Black Gospel Music as Transformation." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 52-61. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Busby, Thomas. A General History of Music: From Earliest Times. Vol. 1. New York, Da Capo Press, 1968.
- Buszin, Walter E. "Luther on Music." The Musical Quarterly 32 (January 1946): 80-97.
- _____. "Lutheran Theology as Reflected in the Life and Works of J.S. Bach." Concordia Theological Monthly 21 (December 1950): 896-923.
- _____. "Cultural Values of Church Music and Liturgical Worship." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, Vol. 4, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 64-76. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1954.
- _____. "Music in the Life of the Church." Journal of Church Music 3 (June 1961): 2-5.
- _____. "Theology and Church Music as Bearers and Interpreters of the Verbum Dei." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 4, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 17-31. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1963.
- _____. "Criteria of Church Music in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries." In Festschrift: Theodore Hoelty-Nickel: A Collection of Essays on Church Music, ed. Newman W. Powell, 14-21. Valparaiso, Ind.: Valparaiso University Press, 1967.
- _____. "Christian Culture and the Cultured Christian Leader." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 88-100. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Byers, Paul. "Toward a Cultural Epidemiology of Emotion." In Emotions and Psychopathology, ed. Manfred Clynes and Jaak Panksepp, 249-278. New York: Plenum Press, 1988.
- Byrnside, Ronald. "The Formation of a Musical Style: Early Rock." In Contemporary Music and Music Cultures, by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl and Ronald Byrnside, 159-192. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975.
- Cáceres, Abraham D. "In Xochitl, In Cuicatl: Hallucinogens and Music in Mesoamerican Amerindian Thought." Ph.D. dissertation, Indiana University, 1984.
- Calkins, Jack. "You Call That Music?" Celebration 5 (November 1989): 3-5.
- Calvin, John. Institutes of the Christian Religion. Vols. 1 and 2. Edited by John T. McNeill. Translated by Ford Lewis Battles. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1960.
- _____. "Epistle to the Reader." Translated by Charles Garside, Jr. In The Origins of Calvin's Theology of Music: 1536-1543, by Charles Garside, Jr., 31-33. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1979.

- Campbell, Joseph. Myths to Live By. New York: Bantam Books, 1972.
- Carpenter, Nan Cooke. Music in the Medieval and Renaissance Universities. Norman, Okla.: University Oklahoma Press, 1958.
- Carter, John Ross. "Music in the Theravāda Buddhist Heritage: In Chant, in Song, in Sri Lanka." In Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, 127-147. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies. Vol. 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- Cartford, Gerhard M. "Words and Music in Cross-Cultural Hymnody, an Aspect and a New Song." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 77-82. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- _____. "Report from Latin America." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 83-88. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Cassirer, Ernst. The Philosophy of the Enlightenment. Translated by Fritz C. A. Koelln and James P. Pettegrove. Boston: Beacon Press, 1955.
- Chambers, Iain. "British Pop: Some Tracks from the Other Side of the Record." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 231-244. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- Chase, Gilbert. "Musicology, History, and Anthropology." In Current Thought in Musicology, ed. John W. Grubbs, Rebecca A. Baltzer, Gilbert L. Slount, and Leeman Perkins, 231-246. Austin, Tex.: University of Texas Press, 1976.
- Chernoff, John Miller. African Rhythm and African Sensibility: Aesthetics and Social Action in African Musical Idioms. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1979.
- Choate, R. A., ed. Documentary Report of the Tanglewood Symposium. Washington, D.C.: Music Educators National Conference, 1968.
- Chrysostum, John. In psalmum xli I. In Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon, excerpt 165. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- _____. In Acta Apostolorum, Hom. XLII, 3. In Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon, excerpt 182. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Clark, Kenneth. Civilization: A Personal View. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1969.
- _____. The Romantic Rebellion: Romantic Versus Classical Art. New York and Evanston: Harper and Row Publishers, 1973.
- Clark, Linda. "Ministry and the Arts: Music in the Community of Faith." Nexus 60 24 (Summer and Winter 1981-82): 13-22.
- _____. "Toward A New Working Philosophy of Music in Worship." Reformed Liturgy and Music 17 (Summer 1983): 105-111.

- Clement of Alexandria. Paedagogus II, iv. In Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon, excerpts 51 and 55. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Clive, H. P. "The Calvinist Attitude to Music, and Its Literary Aspects and Sources." Bibliothèque D'Humanisme et Renaissance 19 (1957): 80-102.
- _____. "The Calvinist Attitude to Music, and Its Literary Aspects and Sources." Bibliothèque D'Humanisme et Renaissance 19 (1957): 294-319.
- _____. "The Calvinist Attitude to Music, and Its Literary Aspects and Sources." Bibliothèque D'Humanisme et Renaissance 20 (1958): 79-107.
- Clouser, Roy A. The Myth of Religious Neutrality: An Essay on the Hidden Role of Religious Belief in Theories. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991.
- Clynes, Manfred. Sentics: The Touch of the Emotions. Garden City, New York: Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1978.
- _____. "Music Beyond the Score." Somatics 5 (Autumn-Winter 1984-1985): 4-14.
- _____. "On Music and Healing." In Music in Medicine: Proceedings, Second International Symposium on Music in Medicine, Ludenscheid, West Germany, October 1984, ed. J. Steffens, 3-21. N.p.: R. Spintge and R. Droh, 1985.
- _____. "Generative Principles of Musical Thought: Integration of Micro-structure with Structure." The Journal for the Integrated Study of Artificial Intelligence, Cognitive Science and Applied Epistemology 3 (1986): 185-223.
- _____. "When Time Is Music." In Rhythm in Psychological, Linguistic, and Musical Processes, ed. James R. Evans and Manfred Clynes, 169-224. Springfield, Ill.: Charles C. Thomas, 1986.
- _____. "What Can a Musician Learn About Music Performance from Newly Discovered Microstructure Principles (PM and PAS)?" In Action and Perception in Rhythm and Music, ed. A. Gabrielsson, 201-233. Stockholm: Royal Swedish Academy of Music, No. 55, 1987.
- _____. "Generalized Emotion, How It Is Produced and Sentic Cycle Therapy." In Emotions and Psychopathology, ed. Manfred Clynes and J. Panksepp, 107-170. New York: Plenum Press, 1988.
- Clynes, Manfred, and Janet Walker. "Neurobiologic Functions of Rhythm, Time and Pulse in Music." In Music, Mind and Brain: The Neurophysiology of Music, ed. Manfred Clynes, 171-216. New York and London: Plenum Press, 1982.
- Cohen, Dalia. "On Comparing Musical Styles: East and West." Israel Studies in Musicology 4 (1987): 73-92.

- Cohen, Dalia. "'Separation' and 'Directivity' as Guiding Principles in the Comparison Between Eastern and Western Music." Israel Studies in Musicology 4 (1987): 127-147.
- Collins, Mary. Editorial. Music and the Experience of God. Edited by Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 3-8. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Collinson, Patrick. The Birthpangs of Protestant England: Religious and Cultural Change in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1988.
- Comotti, Giovanni. Music in Greek and Roman Culture. Translated by Rosaria V. Munson. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989.
- Comstock, W. Richard. "The Achievement of Marshall McLuhan: Formalist of Technological Culture." In Art and Religion as Communication, ed. James Waddell and F. W. Dillistone, 137-174. Atlanta, Ga.: John Knox Press, 1974.
- Concise Theological Dictionary. 2d ed. By Karl Rahner and Herbert Vorgrimler. London: Burns and Oates, 1983. S.v. "Polarity."
- Cone, James H. "Sanctification, Liberation and Black Worship." Nexus 60 24 (Summer and Winter 1981-82): 2-12.
- Coomaraswamy, Ananda K. The Transformation of Nature in Art. New York: Dover Publications, 1956.
- . "The Philosophy of Ancient Asiatic Art." In The Hindu View of Art, by Mulk Raj Anand, 93-110. Bombay: Asia Publishing House, 1957.
- Cooper, Martin. Ideas and Music. New York: Chilton Books, 1967.
- Courlander, Harold. Negro Folk Music, USA. New York and London: Columbia University Press, 1963.
- Cousineau, Robert Henri, S. J. "Fools, Feast of." Encyclopedia Britannica. 1971. 9:565.
- Coyle, Mike. "Music: Is There an Absolute?" Baptist Bulletin, April 1983, 10-11, 32.
- Craig, Hardin. "Medieval Drama." Encyclopedia Britannica. 1971. 7:634-638.
- Cray, Graham. "Justice, Rock and the Renewal of Worship." In In Spirit and in Truth: Exploring Directions in Music and Worship Today, ed. Robin Sheldon, 1-27. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1989.
- Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966. Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Crossley-Holland, Peter. "Music in Ancient Civilizations." Encyclopedia Britannica. 14th ed., 1971. 15:1091-1092.

- Dampier, Sir William Cecil. A History of Science and Its Relations with Philosophy and Religion. 4th ed. With a postscript by I. Bernard Cohen. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1961.
- Danckert, Werner. Musik und Weltbild: Morphologie der Abendländischen Musik. ed. Marianne Bröcker. Bad Godesberg: Verlag für Systematische Musikwissenschaft, 1979.
- Daniélou, Alain. "Religious Music in the Countries of the Orient." The World of Music 16 (1974): 20-35.
- . "Ethical and Spiritual Values in Music." The World of Music 22 (1980): 3-10.
- Danner, Victor. "The Pilgrimage to Makkah." In Islamic Thought and Culture: Papers Presented to the Islamic Studies Group of American Academy of Religion, ed. Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, 19-25. Washington, D.C.: International Institute of Islamic Thought, 1982.
- D'Arcy, M. C. "St. Thomas Aquinas." In Some Makers of the Modern Spirit: A Symposium, ed. John Macmurray, 45-62. London: Methuen and Company, 1933.
- Dargie, David. "Xhosa Church Music." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 62-69. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Dasilva, Fabio, Anthony Blasi, and David Dees. The Sociology of Music. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1984.
- Davies, Evan. "Psychological Characteristics of Beatle Mania." Journal of the History of Ideas 30 (January-March 1969): 273-280.
- Davies, Horton. Worship and Theology in England: From Watts and Wesley to Maurice 1690-1850. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1961.
- . Worship and Theology in England: From Newman to Martineau 1850-1900. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1962.
- . Worship and Theology in England: The Ecumenical Century 1900-1965. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1965.
- . Worship and Theology in England: From Cranmer to Hooker 1534-1603. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1970.
- . Worship and Theology in England: From Andrewes to Baxter and Fox 1603-1690. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1975.
- Davies, Horton, and Hugh Davies. Sacred Art in a Secular Century. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1978.
- Davison, Archibald T. Protestant Church Music in America. Boston: E. C. Schirmer Music Company, 1948.

- Davison, Archibald T. Church Music: Illusion and Reality. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1952.
- Day, Thomas. Why Catholics Can't Sing: The Culture of Catholicism and the Triumph of Bad Taste. New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1990.
- Dean, Talmage W. A Survey of Twentieth Century Protestant Church Music in America. Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1988.
- Demant, Vigo A. Our Culture--Its Christian Roots and Present Crisis. London: S. P. C. K., 1947.
- Denny, Walter. "Contradiction and Consistency in Islamic Art." In The Islamic Impact, ed. Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, Byron Haines, and Ellison Findly, 137-173. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1984.
- Deren, Maya. Divine Horsemen: Voodoo Gods of Haiti. New York: Chelsea House Publishers, 1970.
- Descartes, René. Meditations. Translated with an introduction by Laurence J. Lafleur. New York: Liberal Arts Press, 1951.
- Dessoir, Max. "Ästhetik und Allgemeine Kunstwissenschaft." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 379-387. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- DeVale, Sue Carole. "Power and Meaning in Musical Instruments." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 94-110. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Dewey, John. Quoted in David W. Bolam and James L. Henderson. Art and Belief, 192. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1967.
- Dhavamony, Mariasusai. Phenomenology of Religion. Rome: Gregorian University Press, 1973.
- Dickinson, Edward. Music in the History of the Western Church. New York: Greenwood Press, 1969.
- Dillenberger, Jane. Style and Content in Christian Art. New York and Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1965.
- Dillistone, F. W. "The Relationship Between Form and Content/Medium and Message in Christian Communication." In Art and Religion as Communication, ed. James Waddell and F. W. Dillistone, 117-136. Atlanta, Ga.: John Knox Press, 1974.
- Dilthey, Wilhelm. "Das Musikalische Verstehen." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 370-374. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- _____. "Mozart." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 375-378. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Dinwiddie, Richard. "J.S. Bach: God's Master Musician." Christianity Today, March 15, 1985, 16-21.

- Dixon, John W., Jr. Art and the Theological Imagination. New York: Seabury Press, 1978.
- _____. Nature and Grace in Art. Quoted in Leland Ryken. Culture in Christian Perspective : A Door to Understanding and Enjoying the Arts, 23. Portland, Oreg.: Multnomah Press, 1986.
- Doppelbauer, Josef Friedrich. "Musik und Kirche." Singende Kirche 30 (1983): 10-11.
- Douglas, Charles Winfred. Church Music in History and Practice: Studies in the Praise of God. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1962.
- Douglas, Mary. Natural Symbols: Explorations in Cosmology. New York: Pantheon Books, 1970.
- Douglis, Carole. "The Beat Goes On." Psychology Today 21 (November 1987): 36-43.
- Duncan, Larry T. "Music Among Early Pentecostals." The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 11-15.
- Dunwell, Wilfrid. Music and the European Mind. New York: Thomas Yoseloff, 1962.
- Dupré, Louis. Marx's Social Critique of Culture. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1983.
- Durand, Eugene F. "Contemporary Christian Music." Adventist Review, December 6, 1990, 5.
- Egge, Mandus A. "The Hymnody of the Reformation--Then." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 22-28. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- _____. "The Hymnody of the Reformation--Now." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, Vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 29-34. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Ehrenforth, Karl Heinrich. "Befreit von Traurigkeit: Luther's Glaube im Spiegel seiner Musikanschauung." Musik und Bildung 15 (1983): 4-10.
- Eischer, Mark. "Music Column." Quest 1 (January/February 1988): 6-8.
- Eliade, Mircea. "Methodological Remarks on the Study of Religious Symbolism." In The History of Religions: Essays in Methodology, ed. Mircea Eliade and Joseph M. Kitagawa with a preface by Jerald C. Brauer, 86-107. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1959.
- _____. The Sacred and the Profane: The Nature of Religion. Translated by Willard R. Trask. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1959.
- _____. Shamanism: Archaic Techniques of Ecstasy. Translated by Willard R. Trask. New York: Pantheon Books, 1964.

- Eliade, Mircea. Symbolism, the Sacred and the Arts. Edited by Diane Apostolos-Cappadona. New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1985.
- Ellingson, Ter. "Drums." The New Encyclopedia of Religion. 1987. 4:494-503.
- _____. "Music and Religion." The New Encyclopedia of Religion. 1987. 10:163-172.
- Elliott, David J. "The Role of Music and Musical Experience in Modern Society: Toward a Global Philosophy of Music Education." ISME Yearbook 11 (1984): 74-82.
- Ellsmere, Patricia K. "Augustine on Beauty, Art, and God." In Augustine on Music: An Interdisciplinary Collection of Essays, ed. Richard R. La Croix, 97-113. Lewiston, N. Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1988.
- Ellsmere, Patricia K., and Richard R. La Croix. "Augustine on Art as Imitation." In Augustine on Music: An Interdisciplinary Collection of Essays, ed. Richard R. La Croix, 1-15. Lewiston, N. Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1988.
- Eppelsheimer, H. W. "Das Renaissanceproblem." Deutsche Vierteljahrsschrift für Literaturwissenschaft und Geistesgeschichte (1933): 477-500.
- Epperson, Gordon. "Music, Art of." The New Encyclopedia Britannica. 15th ed., 1984. 12:662-669.
- _____. The Musical Symbol: An Exploration in Aesthetics. New York: Da Capo Press, 1990.
- Erlmann, Veit. "Trance and Music in the Hausa Bôorii Spirit Possession Cult in Niger." Ethnomusicology 26 (January 1982): 49-58.
- Faulkner, Quentin. "The Organ as a Profession: Facing the Future." The American Organist 25 (April 1991): 69-71.
- Faris, Bill. "21st Century Praise." Contemporary Christian Music 11 (June 1989): 20-21.
- Farmer, Henry George. "The Music of Islām." In New Oxford History of Music, vol. 1, ed. Egon Wellesz, 421-477. London: Oxford University Press, 1957.
- Farnsworth, Paul R. The Social Psychology of Music. 2d ed. Ames, Iowa: The Iowa State University Press, 1968.
- Fechner, Gustav Theodor. "Vorschule der Aesthetik." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 284-291. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Fellerer, Karl Gustav. "Church Music and the Council of Trent." The Musical Quarterly 39 (October 1953): 576-594.
- _____. Geschichte der Katholischen Kirchenmusik. Düsseldorf: Musikverlag Schwann, 1949.

- Ferguson, Donald N. A History of Musical Thought. New York: F. S. Crofts and Company, 1935.
- _____. "The Rise and Decline of English Church Music." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 4, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 93-110. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1954.
- _____. Music as Metaphor: The Elements of Expression. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1960.
- _____. The Why of Music: Dialogues in an Unexplored Region of Appreciation. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1969.
- _____. "The Problem of Expression in Music." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 140-169. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Ferguson, George. Signs and Symbols in Christian Art. New York: Oxford University Press, 1959.
- Ferguson, Marilyn. The Brain Revolution. New York: Taplinger Publishing Company, 1973.
- _____. The Aquarian Conspiracy: Personal and Social Transformation in the 1980s. Los Angeles: J. P. Tarcher, 1980.
- Fiagbedzi, N. S. Quoted in Daphne D. Harrison. "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings," 61. In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 49-65. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Finkelstein, Sidney Walter. "What Jazz Means to Me." In Studies in Ethnomusicology, ed. Mieczyslaw Kolinski, 23-28. New York: Folkways Records and Service, 1961.
- _____. How Music Expresses Ideas. New York: International Publishers, 1970.
- Fischer, J. L. "Art Styles as Cultural Cognitive Maps." American Anthropologist 63 (February 1961): 79-93.
- Fisher, Miles Mark. Negro Slave Songs in the United States. New York: Citadel Press, 1963.
- Fitzpatrick, Dennis. "A View from the Far Left." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 81-89. Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Fleming, Daniel, and Alan Muir. "Notes from Practice". The Media Education Journal 3 (1985): 50-61.
- Fleming, William. Arts and Ideas. 7th ed. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1986.

- Flynn, William T. "Church Music." Dictionary of the Ecumenical Movement. Edited by Nicolas Lossky et al. Geneva: WCC Publications and Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1991. 182-184.
- Focillon, Henri. The Life of Forms in Art. Translated by Charles Beecher Hogan and George Kubler. New York: George Wittenborn, 1948.
- Foley, Edward. Music in Ritual: A Pre-Theological Investigation. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral Press, 1984.
- Ford, Desmond. Answers on the Way: Scriptural Answers to Your Questions. Mountain View, Calif.: Pacific Press, 1977.
- Foss, Martin. Symbol and Metaphor in Human Experience. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1949.
- Fox, Robin Lane. Pagans and Christians. San Francisco: Harper and Row Publishers, 1988.
- Franklin, Marion Joseph. "The Relationship of Black Preaching to Black Gospel Music." Ph.D. dissertation, Drew University, 1982.
- Frazer, James George. The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion. Vol. 1. 3d ed. New York: Macmillan Company, 1935.
- Frith, Simon. "Picking up the Pieces." In Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith, 88-130. New York: Pantheon Books, 1988.
- Fronzizi, Risieri. What Is Value? An Introduction to Axiology. 2d ed. La Salle, Ill.: Open Court Publishing Company, 1971.
- Fukushima, Kazuo Ishibashi. "Tradition in den Musikkulturen." In Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer, 102-105. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987.
- Gabrieli, Francesco. "Literary Tendencies." In Unity and Variety in Muslim Civilization, ed. Gustave E. von Grunebaum, 87-106. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1955.
- Gaebelein, Frank E. "Toward a Biblical View of Aesthetics." Christianity Today 12 (August 30, 1968): 4-6.
- _____. The Christian, the Arts and Truth: Regaining the Vision of Greatness. Edited by D. Bruce Lockerbie. Portland, Oreg.: Multnomah Press, 1985.
- Gangoly, O. C. Indian Art and Heritage. Edited and compiled by A. Goswami. Calcutta: Oxford Book and Stationery Company, 1957.
- Gardner, James Earl. "An Examination of Selected Aspects of Marxist and Christian Musical Aesthetics." DMA dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1982.
- Gardner's Art Through the Ages. 7th ed. Revised by Horst de la Croix and Richard G. Tansey. San Diego and New York: Harcourt Brace Javonovich, 1980.

- Garlock, Donald A. "Fundamentalism and the Fine Arts." Fundamentalist Journal 1 (December 1982): 36-37.
- Garrett, Allen M. An Introduction to Research in Music. Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 1958.
- Garrett, Clarke. Spirit Possession and Popular Religion: From the Camisards to the Shakers. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1987.
- Garside, Charles, Jr. "Calvin's Preface to the Psalter: A Re-appraisal." The Musical Quarterly 37 (October 1951): 566-577.
- _____. Zwingli and the Arts. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1966.
- _____. The Origins of Calvin's Theology of Music: 1536-1543. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1979.
- Gauhar, Altaf. "Islām and the Secular Thrust of Western Imperialism." In Islam and Contemporary Society, ed. Salem Azzam, 213-230. London and New York: Longman and the Islamic Council of Europe, 1982.
- Geertz, Clifford. Islām Observed: Religious Development in Morocco and Indonesia. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968.
- Gelineau, Joseph. "The Path of Music." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 135-147. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Gentry, Linnell. A History and Encyclopedia of Country, Western, and Gospel Music. n.p., 1961.
- Germain, Elizabeth. "Image de Dieu, Image L'Homme dans les Cantiques Populaires de la Première Moitié du XIX^e Siècle." In Romantisme et Religion: Théologie des Théologiens et Théologie des Écrivains, ed. Michael Baude and Marc-Mathieu Münch, 21-33. Metz: Presses Universitaires de France, 1980.
- Gill, Eric. "Christianity and Art." In Art-Nonsense and Other Essays, by Eric Gill, 216-249. London: Cassell and Company and Francis Walterston, 1929.
- _____. "Art and Reality." In The Hindu View of Art, by Mulk Raj Anand, xi-xix. Bombay: Asia Publishing House, 1957.
- Glickman, Eugene. "Tonality and Gravity." Current Musicology 36 (1983): 113-124.
- Godwin, Joscelyn. Harmonies of Heaven and Earth. Rochester, Vt.: Inner Traditions International, 1987.
- Gombrich, Ernst H. "Style." International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences. 1968. 15:352-361.
- Goodman, Nelson. "The Status of Style." Critical Inquiry 1 (June 1975): 799-811.

- Gottwald, Clytus. "Von der Babylonischen Gefangenschaft der Musik. Josquin und Luther's Encomion." In Ursprung der Biblia Deutsch von Martin Luther, ed. Stefan Strohm and Eberhard Zwink, 101-108. Stuttgart: Württembergischen Landesbibliothek; Quell-Verlag, 1983.
- Gough, Michael. The Origins of Christian Art. New York: Praeger Publishers, 1973.
- Grabar, André. The Great Centuries of Painting: Byzantine Painting. Translated by Stuart Gilbert. Geneva: Editions Albert Skira, 1953.
- _____. Christian Iconography: A Study of Its Origins. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1968.
- _____. Early Christian Art: From the Rise of Christianity to the Death of Theodosius. Translated by Stuart Gilbert and James Emmons. New York: Odyssey Press, 1968.
- Graber, Rudlof. "Musica sacra-Musica Aeterna Festpredigt am 25 Mai 1975 im Dom." In Kirchenmusik im Gespräch, 74-82. Regensburg: Franz Fleckenstein, 1976.
- Gray, John. African Music. New York: Greenwood Press, 1991.
- Graybill, Ronald D. "Enthusiasm in Early Adventist Worship." Ministry, October 1991, 10-12.
- Gregory of Nazianzus. Oration v, Contra Julianum II, 35. In Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon, excerpt 145. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Grieger, M. J. "Musical Communication of the Churches." The Christian News, July 29, 1982, 14-16.
- Grindal, Gracia. "Luther and the Arts: A Study in Convention." Word and World 3 (Fall 1983): 373-381.
- Grossberg, Lawrence. "Rock and Roll in Search of an Audience." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 175-197. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- Grout, Donald Jay. A History of Western Music. Rev. ed. London: J. M. Dent and Sons, 1973.
- Groves, Richard. "The Message of Modern Pop Music." Christianity Today, June 23, 1967, 5-6.
- Guinness, Os. The Dust of Death: A Critique of the Counter Culture. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1973.
- "Guidelines Toward a Seventh-day Adventist Philosophy of Music." Review and Herald, November 30, 1972, 16, 17, 19.
- Gulley, Norman R. "New Age Series--VIII: The New Age Movement and Eschatology: Exploring Its World-View Shift, Global Consciousness, and Role in End Events." Adventist Perspectives 5 (1991): 24-31.

- Haddad, Yvonne Y. "Introduction." In The Islamic Impact, ed. Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, Byron Haines, and Ellison Findly, 1-6. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1984.
- Haeussler, Armin. "The Struggle for Better Hymnody." In Cantors at the Crossroads: Essays on Church Music in Honor of Walter Buszin, ed. Johannes Riedel, 163-183. St. Louis, Mo: Concordia Publishing House, 1967.
- Hagan, George P. "Divinity and Experience: The Trance and Christianity in Southern Ghana." In Vernacular Christianity: Essays in the Social Anthropology of Religion, ed. Wendy James and Douglas H. Johnson, 146-156. New York: Lilian Barber Press, 1988.
- Hahn, Man-young. "Religious Origins of Korean Music." Korea Journal 15 (July 1975): 17-22.
- Hahn, Volkmar. "Gedanken über die Beziehungen zwischen Gottesdienst und Musik." Musik und Kirche 42 (July-August 1972): 167-76.
- Halter, Carl. "Toward the Future." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 4, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 123-129. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1954.
- _____. The Practice of Sacred Music. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1955.
- Halter, Carl, and Carl Schalk, eds. A Handbook of Church Music. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1978.
- Hamdūn, Muhammad A. "What Is 'Islāmic' in Islāmic Literature?" In Islamic Thought and Culture: Papers Presented to the Islamic Studies Group of the American Academy of Religion, ed. Isma'il R. Al Fārūqī, 65-71. Washington, D.C.: International Institute of Islamic Thought, 1982.
- Hamel, Paul. The Christian and His Music. Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1973.
- _____. Ellen White and Music: Background and Principles. Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1976.
- Hamilton, Edith. The Greek Way to Western Civilization. New York: New American Library, A Mentor Book, 1942.
- Hamm, Charles. "Changing Patterns in Society and Music: The U.S. Since World War II." In Contemporary Music and Music Cultures, by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside, 35-70. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975.
- _____. "The Acculturation of Musical Styles." In Contemporary Music and Music Cultures, by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside, 125-158. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975.
- _____. "The Ecstatic and the Didactic: A Pattern in American Music." In Current Thought in Musicology, ed. John W. Grubbs, Rebecca A. Baltzer, Gilbert L. Blount, and Leeman Perkins, 41-62. Austin, Tex.: University of Texas Press, 1976.

- Hannum, Harold Byron. Music and Worship. Nashville, Tenn.: Southern Publishing Association, 1969.
- _____. Christian Search for Beauty. Nashville, Tenn.: Southern Publishing Association, 1975.
- Harned, David Baily. Theology and the Arts. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1966.
- Harnish, David. "Music and Religion: Syncretism, Orthodox Islām and Musical Change in Lombok." Selected Reports in Ethnomusicology 7 (1988): 123-137.
- Harrell, Robert Lomas. "A Comparison of Secular Elements in the Chorales of Martin Luther with Rock Elements in Church Music of the 1960s and 1970s." Master's thesis, Bob Jones University, 1975.
- Harrison, Daphne D. "Aesthetic and Social Aspects of Music in African Ritual Settings." In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 49-65. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Harrison, Frank. "Universals in Music: Towards a Methodology of Comparative Research." The World of Music 19 (1977): 30-42.
- Harrison, Jane Ellen. Ancient Art and Ritual. New York: Greenwood Press, 1969.
- Harron, Mary. "Pop as a Commodity." In Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith, 173-220. New York: Pantheon Books, 1988.
- Hart, Dave. "Focus on Music." Youthworker 5 (Summer 1989): 14-15.
- Hart, Lowell. Satan's Music Exposed. Rossville, Ga.: Grapevine Book Distributors, 1981.
- Hartmann, Andreas. "Affektdarstellung und Naturbeherrschung in der Musik des Barock." International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music 11 (June 1980): 24-44.
- Hartshorne, Charles, and William L. Reese. Philosophers Speak of God. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1953.
- Harvey, Louis-Charles. "Black Gospel Music and Black Theology." The Journal of Religious Thought 43 (Fall-Winter 1986-87): 19-37.
- Harwood, Dane L. "Universals in Music: A Perspective from Cognitive Psychology." Ethnomusicology 20 (1976): 521-533.
- Hawkes, Terence. Structuralism and Semiotics. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1977.
- Hayburn, Robert F. Papal Legislation on Sacred Music: 95 A.D. to 1977 A.D. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1979.
- Hazelton, Roger. A Theological Approach to Art. Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon Press, 1967.

- Heartz, Daniel. "The Chanson in the Humanist Era." In Current Thought in Musicology, ed. John W. Grubbs, Rebecca A. Baltzer, Gilbert L. Blount, and Leeman Perkins, 193-230. Austin, Tex.: University of Texas Press, 1976.
- Hebdige, Dick. Subculture: The Meaning of Style. London and New York: Methuen and Company, 1979.
- _____. Cut 'N' Mix: Culture, Identity and Caribbean Music. New York: Methuen and Company, 1987.
- Heenan, Edward F., and H. Rosanne Falkenstein. "Religious Rock: What It Is Saying." Popular Music and Society 2 (Summer 1973): 311-320.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. The Introduction to Hegel's Philosophy of Fine Art. Translated with notes and prefatory essay by Bernard Bosanquet. London: Kegan Paul, Trench and Company, 1886.
- _____. "Vorlesungen über die Ästhetik." In Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader, vol. 2, "The Nineteenth Century", ed. Edward A. Lippman, 85-161. Stuyvesant, N.Y.: Pendragon Press, 1986.
- Heilbut, Anthony. "The Secularization of Black Gospel Music." In Folk Music and Modern Sound, ed. William Ferris and Mary L. Hart, 101-115. Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1982.
- Heise, Lyell V. "Music and Worship." Ministry, October 1991, 20-24.
- Helm, Everett. "Reports: IMC Congress." The World of Music 10 (1968): 44-47.
- Henry, Carl F. H. Twilight of a Great Civilization: The Drift Towards Neo-Paganism. Westchester, Ill.: Crossway Books, 1988.
- Henry, Edward O. "The Variety of Music in a North Indian village: Reassessing Cantometrics." Ethnomusicology 20 (January 1976): 49-66.
- _____. Chant the Names of God: Musical Culture in Bhojpuri-Speaking India. San Diego: San Diego State University Press, 1988.
- Herberg, Will. Quoted in David W. Bolam and James L. Henderson, Art and Belief, 137. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1967.
- _____. "The Fundamental Outlook of Hebraic Religion." In The Ways of Religion, ed. Roger Eastman, 282-290. San Francisco: Canfield Press, 1975.
- Herndon, Marcia. "The Cherokee Ballgame Cycle: An Ethnomusicologist's View." Ethnomusicology 15 (September 1971): 339-352.
- Herskovits, Melville J. The Myth of the Negro Past. Boston: Beacon Press, 1958.
- Hetzer, Theodor. Aufsätze und Vorträge. Vol. 2. Leipzig: VEB E. A. Seemann Verlag, 1957.

- Hillert, Richard. "The Church Composer and the Contemporary Musical Scene." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 6, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 85-91. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1963.
- Hoelty-Nickel, Theodore. "Church Music Reform." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, Vol. 4, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 8-11. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1954.
- _____. "Luther and Music." In Luther and Culture by George Forrell, Harold J. Grimm, and Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 145-211. Decorah, Iowa: Luther College Press, 1960.
- _____. "A Philosophy of Lutheran Church Music." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 6, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 113-122. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1963.
- Hoffman, Lawrence A. "Musical Traditions and Tensions in the American Synagogue." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 30-38. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Hofmann, Friedrich. "Has the Lutheran Hymn Run Its Course?" In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 101-108. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Hofstadter, Albert. Truth and Art. New York: Columbia University Press, 1965.
- Hollenweger, Walter J. "Music in the Service of Reconciliation." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 149-160. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Holmes, Arthur F. "Toward a Christian View of Things." In The Making of a Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur F. Holmes, 11-28. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1985.
- _____. "Afterword." In The Making of a Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur F. Holmes, 133-136. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1985.
- Honigsheim, Paul. Music and Society: The Later Writings of Paul Honigsheim, introduced and edited by K. Peter Etzkorn. Huntington, N.Y.: Robert E. Krieger Publishing Company, 1979.
- Hoon, Paul W. "The Relation of Theology and Music in Worship." Union Seminary Quarterly Review 11 (January 1956): 33-43.
- Hopper, Stanley Romaine. ed. Spiritual Problems in Contemporary Literature. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1957.
- Hough, Robin. "Choirs of Angels Armed for War: Reverend Marshal W. Taylor's 'A Collection of Revival Hymns and Plantation Melodies.'" In Feel the Spirit: Studies in Nineteenth-Century Afro-American Music, ed. George R. Keck and Sherrill V. Martin, 15-33. New York: Greenwood Press, 1988.

- Houston, James M. I Believe in the Creator. Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1980.
- Howes, Frank. Man, Mind and Music. Quoted in Terence McLaughlin, Music and Communication, 78. New York: St. Martins Press, 1971.
- Hunt, T. W. Music in Missions: Discipling Through Music. Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1987.
- Husch, Jerri Ann. "Music of the Workplace: A Study of Muzak Culture." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Massachusetts, 1984.
- Hustad, Donald P. Jubilate! Church Music in the Evangelical Tradition. Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1981.
- _____. "The Historical Roots of Music in the Pentecostal and Neo-Pentecostal Movements." The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 7-11.
- Irwin, Joyce. Preface to Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice. Edited by Joyce Irwin. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies, vol 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- _____. "Shifting Alliances: The Struggle for a Lutheran Theology of Music." In Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, 55-69. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies, Vol 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- Jackson, George Pullen. White Spirituals in the Southern Uplands: The Story of the Fasola Folk, Their Songs, Singings, and "Buckwheat Notes". Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1933.
- Jackson, Irene V. Introduction to More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians. Edited by Irene V. Jackson. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- _____. "Music among Blacks in the Episcopal Church: Some Preliminary Considerations." In More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 107-125. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Jaeger, Werner. Theology of the Early Greek Philosophers: The Gifford Lectures 1936. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1947.
- _____. Paideia: The Ideals of Greek Culture. Translated from the 2d German edition by Gilbert Highet. Vol. 1. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1954.
- Jarrett, James L. The Quest for Beauty. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1957.
- Jeffery, Peter. "Chant East and West: Toward a Renewal of the Tradition." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 20-29. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Jenne, Michael. Music, Communication, Ideology. Translated by Michael Fleming. Princeton, N.J.: Birch Tree Group, 1984.

- Johansson, Calvin M. "Some Theological Considerations Foundational to a Philosophy of Church Music." DMA dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, Fort Worth, Texas, 1974.
- _____. Music and Ministry: A Biblical Counterpoint. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1984.
- _____. "Singing in the Spirit: The Music of Pentecostals." The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 25-29.
- _____. Discipling Music Ministry: Twenty-First Century Directions. Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1992.
- Johnson, F. Ernest. Foreword In Religious Symbolism, ed. F. Ernest Johnson, vii-ix. Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1969.
- Jones, Leroi. "The Changing Same (R & B and New Black Music)." In The Black Aesthetic, ed. Addison Gayle, Jr., 118-131. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1971.
- _____. Quoted in Steve Perry. "Ain't No Mountain High Enough: The Politics of Crossover," 74. In Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith, 51-87. New York: Pantheon Books, 1988.
- Jones, Nita. "Korean Baptist Music Before 1970." Missionary Notes (July 1977): 1. Quoted in T. W. Hunt, Music in Missions: Discipling Through Music, 84. Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1987.
- Jones, Orea. "The Theology of 'Sexual Healing': Marvin Gaye." The Journal of Black Sacred Music: A Journal of Theomusicology 3 (Fall 1989): 68-74.
- Jowett, B., trans. The Dialogues of Plato. 2 vols. New York: Random House, 1937.
- Jules-Rosette, Bennetta. "Song and Spirit: The Use of Songs in the Management of Ritual Contexts." Africa 45 (1975): 150-165.
- _____. "Ecstatic Singing: Music and Social Integration in an African Church." In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 119-137. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Kallestad, Walther P. "Entertainment Evangelism." The Lutheran, May 23, 1990, 17.
- Kalupahana, David J. "Buddhist Humanism as a Means to Religious Harmony." In The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson, 211-222. New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982.
- Kaplan, Max. The Arts: A Social Perspective. London and Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1990.
- Kaplan, Nathaniel, and Thomas Katsaros. Origins of American Transcendentalism: In Philosophy and Mysticism. New Haven, Conn.: College and University Press, 1975.

- Kauffman, Robert. "The Psychology of Music Making in an African Society: The Shona." The World of Music 18 (1976): 9-14.
- Kaufmann, Walter Arnold. Religions in Four Dimensions: Existential and Aesthetic, Historical and Comparative. New York: Readers Digest Press, 1976.
- Kebede, Ashenafi. "The Music of Ethiopia: Its Development and Cultural Setting." Ph.D. dissertation, Wesleyan University, 1971.
- _____. "The Sacred Chant of Ethiopian Monotheistic Churches: Music in Black Jewish and Christian Communities." The Black Perspective in Music 8 (Spring 1980): 21-34.
- _____. Roots of Black Music: The Vocal, Instrumental, and Dance Heritage of Africa and Black America. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1982.
- Keen, Sam. "Manifesto for a Dionysian Theology." In New Theology No. 7, ed. Martin E. Marty and Dean G. Peerman, 79-103. New York: Macmillan Company, 1970.
- Keil, Charles, and Angelika Keil. "Musical Meaning: A Preliminary Report." Ethnomusicology 10 (1966): 153-173.
- Kelley, Larry D. "Christians in 'Secular' Music: Is Nothing Sacred Anymore?" Contemporary Christian Music 14 (November 1991): 34-35.
- Key, Dana, with Steve Rabey. Don't Stop the Music. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan Publishing House, 1989.
- Khê, Trần Van. "Buddhist Music in Eastern Asia." The World of Music 26 (1984): 22-32.
- Kilby, Clyde S. Christianity and Aesthetics. Chicago: InterVarsity Press, 1961.
- Kivy, Peter. Sound and Semblance: Reflections on Musical Representation. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- Klibansky, Raymond, and H. J. Paton, ed. Philosophy and History: Essays Presented to Ernst Cassirer. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1936.
- Knappert, Jan. "The Religions of Africa." In The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson, 223-233. New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982.
- Knepler, Georg. "Traditionen in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen." In Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer, 15-23. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987.
- Knight, W. F. Jackson, ed. De Musica: A Synopsis. Westport, Conn.: Hyperion Press, 1979.
- Knox, Ronald A. Enthusiasm: A Chapter in the History of Religion. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1983.

- Kock, Gerard. "Between the Altar and the Choir-loft: Church Music--Liturgy or Art?" In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 11-19. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Koenigsberger, H. G. Politicians and Virtuosi. London: Hambledon Press, 1986.
- Kojima, Akira. "Music Education in the New Age: The Multimedia Approach." In Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, 56-60. Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974. Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976.
- Kolata, Gina Bari. "Singing Styles and Human Cultures: How Are They Related?" Science 200 (April 21, 1978): 287-288.
- Kolinski, Mieczyslaw. "The Origin of the Indian 22-tone System." In Studies in Ethnomusicology, ed. Mieczyslaw Kolinski, 3-18. New York: Folkways Records and Service, 1961.
- _____. "Recent Trends in Ethnomusicology." Ethnomusicology 11 (1967): 1-24.
- Kosman, Joshua. Review of Music as Propaganda: Art to Persuade, Art to Control by Arnold Perris, Notes 43 (March 1987): 562-564.
- Kroeber, Alfred L. Style and Civilizations. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1957.
- Kuhn, Thomas S. The Structure of Scientific Revolutions. 2d ed. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970.
- Kurath, Gertrude Prokosch. "Universals in Dance." The World of Music 19 (1977): 43-52.
- Kurzschinkel, Winfried. Die Theologische Bestimmung der Musik: Neuere Beiträge zur Deutung und Wertung des Musizierens im Christlichen Leben. Trier, Germany: Paulinus-Verlag, 1971.
- Laeuchli, Samuel. Religion and Art in Conflict: Introduction to a Cross-Disciplinary Task. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1980.
- Lang, Berel, ed. The Concept of Style. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979.
- Lang, Paul Henry. Music in Western Civilization. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1969.
- Langer, Susanne K. Philosophy in a New Key: A Study of the Symbolism of Reason, Rite, and Art. New York and Toronto: New American Library, 1951.
- _____. Feeling and Form: A Theory of Art. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1953.
- _____. Problems of Art: Ten Philosophical Lectures. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1957.
- Larsen, Lawrence B. "We Have Come a Long Way . . ." The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 16-17.

- Larson, Bob. The Day Music Died. Carol Stream, Ill.: Creation House, 1972.
- Lauritzen, Jeffrey K. "Music in Worship--Are We Really Worshiping Him?" Adventist Perspectives 5 (1991): 31-35.
- Leaver, Robin A. "The Theological Character of Music in Worship." In Duty and Delight: Routley Remembered, ed. Robin A. Leaver and James H. Litton, 47-64. Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1985.
- _____. "Theological Dimensions of Mission Hymnody: The Counterpoint of Cult and Culture." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 37-50. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Leichtentritt, Hugo. Music, History, and Ideas. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1940.
- _____. "The Reform of Trent and Its Effect on Music." The Musical Quarterly 30 (July 1944): 319-328.
- Lekis, Lisa. "The Origin and Development of Ethnic Caribbean Dance and Music." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Florida, 1956.
- Leming, James S. "Rock Music and the Socialization of Moral Values in Early Adolescence." Youth and Society 18 (June 1987): 363-383.
- Levi-Strauss, Claude. Structural Anthropology. Vol. 1. Translated by Claire Jacobson and Brooke Grundfest Schoepf. New York: Basic Books Publishers, 1963.
- _____. Structural Anthropology. Vol. 2. Translated by Monique Layton. New York: Basic Books Publishers, 1976.
- Levy, H. "Newton." In Some Makers of the Modern Spirit: A Symposium, ed. John Macmurray, 76-89. London: Methuen and Company, 1933.
- Lewis, Alan. "The Social Interpretation of Modern Jazz." In Lost in Music: Culture, Style and the Musical Event, ed. Avron Levine White, 33-55. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987.
- Lewis, George H. "Patterns of Meaning and Choice: Taste Cultures in Popular Music." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 198-211. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- Lewis, I. M. Ecstatic Religion: An Anthropological Study of Spirit Possession and Shamanism. Baltimore, Md.: Penguin Books, 1971.
- Lillie, William. Studies in New Testament Ethics. Edinburgh and London: Oliver and Boyd, 1961.

- Lindusky, Eugene. "Music for the Vernacular Liturgy--Some Observations on Principles of Repertoire." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 107-117. Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Lipps, Theodor. "Ästhetik, Psychologie des Schönen und der Kunst." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 299-304. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- List, George. "On the Non-Universality of Musical Perspectives." Ethnomusicology 15 (September 1971): 399-402.
- Liszt, Franz. "Religious Music of the Future." In An Artist's Journey: Lettres d'un bachelier ès musique 1835-1841, by Franz Liszt. Translated and annotated by Charles Suttoni, 236-237. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1989.
- Loft, Abram. "Musicians Guild and Union: A Consideration of the Evolution of Protective Organization Among Musicians." Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1950.
- Loh, I-to. "Toward Contextualization of Church Music in Asia." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 89-113. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Lomax, Alan. "Folk Song Style." American Anthropologist 61 (December 1959): 927-954.
- . Folk Song Style and Culture. Washington, D.C.: American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1968.
- Lorenz, Ellen Jane. Glory, Hallelujah! The Story of the Campmeeting Spiritual. Nashville: Abingdon, 1980.
- Lovelace, Austin C., and William C. Rice. Music and Worship in the Church. Revised and enlarged edition. Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon, 1976.
- Lull, James. "Popular Music and Communication: An Introduction." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 10-35. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- . "Listeners' Communicative Uses of Popular Music." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 140-147. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- Lund, Jens. "Fundamentalism, Racism, and Political Reaction in Country Music." In The Sounds of Social Change: Studies in Popular Culture, ed. Serge R. Denisoff and Richard A. Peterson, 79-91. Chicago: Rand McNally and Company, 1972.
- Luther, Martin. "An Order of Mass and Communion for the Church at Wittenberg." In Ulrich S. Leupold, ed. Liturgy and Hymns, vol. 53 of Luther's Works, ed. Helmut T. Lehmann, 19-40. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1965.

- Luther, Martin. "To the Christian Nobility of the German Nation." In Three Treatises, 2d. rev. ed. by Martin Luther, 7-112. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1970.
- _____. "The Freedom of the Christian." In Three Treatises, 2d. rev. ed. by Martin Luther, 277-316. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1970.
- _____. "The Babylonian Captivity of the Church." In Three Treatises, 2d. rev. ed. by Martin Luther, 123-260. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1970.
- Lutz, Maija M. "Music as a Reflection of Culture: The Case of the Cumberland Sound Eskimos." Liberal Arts Review 7 (Spring 1979): 25-31.
- Macdonald, Duncan B. "Emotional Religion in Islām as Affected by Music and Singing." Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland (1901): 195-252, 707-748 and (1902): 1-28.
- Macmurray, John. "The Modern Spirit." In Some Makers of the Modern Spirit: A Symposium, ed. John Macmurray, 1-36. London: Methuen and Company, 1933.
- _____. "From Aquinas to Newton." In Some Makers of the Modern Spirit: A Symposium, ed. John Macmurray, 90-97. London: Methuen and Company, 1933.
- Macville, Merryn. "Open Air Festival 1989." Light 39 (September 1989): 4.
- Malm, William P. Music Cultures of the Pacific, the Near East and Asia. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1967.
- Mango, Cyril Alexander. "Iconoclastic Controversy." Encyclopedia Britannica. 1971. 11:1056.
- Maniates, Maria Rika. "Musical Symbolism." The World of Music 20 (1978): 38-55.
- Mapson, J. Wendell, Jr. The Ministry of Music in the Black Church. Valley Forge, Penn.: Judson Press, 1984.
- Mardirosian, Haig. Review of Why Catholics Can't Sing by Thomas Day, The American Organist 25 (January 1991): 79-80.
- Marini, Stephen A. "Rehearsal for Revival: Sacred Singing and the Great Awakening in America." In Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, 71-91. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies. Vol. 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- Maritain, Jacques. Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry. Bolligen Series XXXVI. New York: Pantheon Books, 1953.
- _____. The Responsibility of the Artist. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1960.
- _____. Art and Scholasticism and the Frontiers of Poetry. Translated by Joseph W. Evans. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1962.

- Maritain, Jacques. Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry. New York: Meridian Books, World Publishing Company, 1970.
- Mark, Michael L. Source Readings in Music Education History. New York: Schirmer Books, 1982.
- _____. "The Evolution of Music Education Philosophy from Utilitarian to Aesthetic." Journal of Research in Music Education 30 (Spring 1982): 15-21.
- Marks, Morton. "'You Can't Sing Unless You're Saved': Reliving the Call in Gospel Music." In African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg, 305-331. Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982.
- Marti, Andreas. "Kunst und Kitsch als Problem der Hymnologie." Jahrbuch für Liturgik und Hymnologie 36 (1982): 175-183.
- _____. "Elite--Thoughts to a Trendy, Abusive Word." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 197-199. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Martin, Linda, and Kerry Segrave. Anti-Rock: The Opposition to Rock 'n' Roll. Hamden, Conn.: Archon Books, 1988.
- Martland, Thomas R. Religion as Art: An Interpretation. Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press, 1981.
- Mascall, Eric. "Faith and Fashion." The Listener 74 (December 23, 1965): 1019-1021.
- Mathison, Jane. "The Idea of Evolution." Biology and Human Affairs 42 (1976): 26-37.
- Maultsby, Portia Katrenia. "Afro-American Religious Music: 1619-1861. Part I - Historical Development. Part II - Computer Analysis of One Hundred Spirituals." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Wisconsin (Madison), 1974.
- _____. "The Use and Performance of Hymnody, Spirituals, and Gospels in the Black Church." The Western Journal of Black Studies 7 (1983): 161-171.
- _____. "West African Influences and Retentions in U.S. Black Music: A Sociocultural Study." In More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 25-57. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- _____. "Afro-American Religious Music: A Study in Musical Diversity." In The Papers of the Hymn Society of America, XXXV, 2-19. Springfield, Ohio: The Hymn Society of America, Wittenberg University, n.d.
- Mayer, Günter. Weltbild - Notenbild: Zur Dialektik des Musikalischen Materials. N.p.: Röderberg-Verlag GmbH, 1978.
- Mbiti, John S. African Religions and Philosophy. London: Heinemann, 1969.

- McAllester, David P. Enemy Way Music: A Study of Social and Esthetic Values as Seen in Navaho Music. Cambridge, Mass.: Peabody Museum of American Archeology and Ethnology, 1954.
- _____. "Some Thoughts on 'Universals' in World Music." Ethnomusicology 15 (September 1971): 379-380.
- _____. "Music as Ecumenical Force." Australian Journal of Music Education 27 (October 1980): 8-12.
- McBain, Robert Mark. "The Choral Music of John Rutter: Analysis and Performance Practices." DMA dissertation, Arizona State University, 1981.
- McCormick, Moira. "Risky Business." Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (April 1986): 22-25.
- McKeon, Richard, ed. and trans. The Basic Works of Aristotle. New York: Random House, 1941.
- McKinnon, James, ed. Music in Early Christian Literature. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- McLaughlin, Terence. Music and Communication. New York: St. Martins Press, 1971.
- McLean, Mervyn. "Towards a Typology of Musical Change: Missionaries and Adjustive Response in Oceania." The World of Music 28 (1986): 29-43.
- McManus, Frederick R. "Sacred Music in the Teaching of the Church." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 14-26. Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- McNaspy, C. J. "Meaning in Music." Thought 57 (March 1982): 84-93.
- Mellers, Wilfrid. Music and Society. New York: Roy Publishers, 1950.
- Menon, Narayana. "Interdisciplinary Research: Its Contribution to the Understanding of the Music Cultures of Our Time." In Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, 66-75. Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974. Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976.
- Merriam, Alan P. "Music--Bridge to the Supernatural." Tomorrow 5 (1957): 61-67.
- _____. The Anthropology of Music. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1964.
- _____. "The Arts and Anthropology." In Anthropology and Art: Readings in Cross-Cultural Aesthetics, ed. Charlotte M. Otten, 93-105. Garden City, N.Y.: Natural History Press, 1971.
- Messiaen, Von Olivier. "Was Ist Sakrale Musik?" Internationale Katholische Zeitschrift 7 (November/December 1978): 520-527.

- Meyer, Leonard B. Emotion and Meaning in Music. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961.
- _____. Music, the Arts, and Ideas: Patterns and Predictions in Twentieth-Century Culture. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1967.
- _____. "Toward a Theory of Style." In The Concept of Style, ed. Berel Lang, 3-44. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979.
- Michaels, Arthur J. "Ground Rules for Aesthetic Education." New Jersey Education Association Review 53 (September 1979): 18-19.
- Micklem, Nathaniel. Religion. London: Oxford University Press, 1948.
- Mill, Rodney H. "Needed, A Theology of Music," Review and Herald, May 14, 1970, 10.
- Miller, Steve. The Contemporary Christian Music Debate. Wheaton, Ill.: Tyndale House Publishers, 1993.
- Minsky, M. "Music, Mind and Meaning." Computer Music Journal 5 (1981): 28-44.
- Mittermeier, Otto. "Wir Haben Einen Traum . . ." In Liturgie und Dichtung: Ein Interdisziplinäres Kompendium I, ed. Hansjakob Becker and R. Kaczynski. St. Ottilien, Germany: Eos Verlag Erzabtei, 1983.
- Moore, Joseph G. "Music and Dance as Expressions of Religious Worship in Jamaica." In African Religious Groups and Beliefs: Papers in Honor of William R. Bascom, ed. Simon Ottenberg, 264-289. Sador, India: Archana Publications, 1982.
- Morris, Thomas V., ed. The Concept of God. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Moses, Oral L. "The Nineteenth-Century Spiritual Text: A Source for Modern Gospel." In Feel the Spirit: Studies in Nineteenth-Century Afro-American Music, ed. George R. Keck and Sherrill V. Martin, 49-59. New York: Greenwood Press, 1988.
- Mthethwa, Bongani. "Music and Dance in Zulu Christian Worship: Meaning of Religious Dances in the Shembe Church." International Council for Traditional Music, UK Chapter Bulletin 9 (January 1985): 4-11.
- Mueller, John H. "Is Art the Product of Its Age?" Social Forces 13 (1935): 367-375.
- Muggeridge, Malcolm. "The Fourth Temptation." In Christ in the Media by Malcolm Muggeridge, 23-42 and 81-88. Grand Rapids, Mich., William B. Eerdmans, 1977.
- Müller, Karl Ferdinand. "Church Music Instruction in the Church Music Schools of Germany." In Cantors at the Crossroads: Essays on Church Music in Honor of Walter Buszin, ed. Johannes Riedel, 185-192. St. Louis, Mo: Concordia Publishing House, 1967.

- Nadel, Siegfried. "The Origins of Music." The Musical Quarterly 16 (1930): 531-546.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein. "Sūfism and the Integration of Man." In The Ways of Religion, ed. Roger Eastman, 476-483. San Francisco, Canfield Press, 1975.
- Naumann, Martin J. "The Divine Pattern for Art." In Festschrift: Theodore Hoelty-Nickel: A Collection of Essays on Church Music, ed. Newman W. Powell, 8-11. Valparaiso, Ind.: Valparaiso University Press, 1967.
- Nettl, Bruno. Music in Primitive Culture. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1956.
- _____. Theory and Method in Ethnomusicology. London: Free Press of Glencoe, Collier-Macmillan, 1964.
- _____. "The Role of Music in Culture: Iran, A Recently Developed Nation." In Contemporary Music and Music Cultures by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside, 71-100. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975.
- _____. "The Western Impact on World Music: Africa and the American Indians." In Contemporary Music and Music Cultures by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside, 101-124. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975.
- _____. "Words and Music: English Folksong in the United States." In Contemporary Music and Music Cultures by Charles Hamm, Bruno Nettl, and Ronald Byrnside, 193-221. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1975.
- _____. "On the Question of Universals." The World of Music 19 (1977): 2-7.
- _____. The Study of Ethnomusicology: Twenty-Nine Issues and Concepts. Urbana Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1983.
- _____. Folk and Traditional Music of the Western Continents. 3d ed. Revised and edited by Valerie Woodring Goertzen. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1990.
- Nettl, Paul. Luther and Music. Translated by Frida Best and Ralph Wood. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1948.
- Neumann, Erich. Art and the Creative Unconscious: Four Essays. Translated by Ralph Manheim. New York: Pantheon Books, 1959.
- Neureiter, Paul R. "Schopenhauer's Will as Aesthetic Criterion." The Journal of Value Inquiry 20 (1986): 41-50.
- Nevin, J. W. "The Anxious Bench." In American Religious Thought of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries, ed. Bruce Kuklick, 3-56. New York and London: Garland Publishing, 1987.
- Newcomb, Brian Quincy. "When Christians Rock: Answering the Critics." Contemporary Christian Music 11 (July 1988): 26.
- _____. "Bloodgood: Rockin' a Hard Place." Contemporary Christian Music 11 (September 1988): 8.

- Newman, J. David. "The Cross, The Center of Worship." Ministry, October 1991, 4.
- Newport, John P. Theology and Contemporary Art Forms. Waco, Tex.: Word Books, 1971.
- Nicholi, Armand M., Jr. "How Does the World View of the Scientist and the Clinician Influence Their Work?" Perspectives on Science and Christian Faith 41 (December 1989): 214-220.
- Nicholls, Robert W. "Music and Dance Guilds in Igede." In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 91-117. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Nichols, Kathryn L. "Music and Musician in Service to the Church." Reformed Liturgy and Music 20 (Spring 1986): 72-77.
- Nietzsche, Friedrich. "The Birth of Tragedy from the Spirit of Music." Translated by Clifton P. Fadiman. In The Philosophy of Nietzsche by Friedrich Nietzsche, 167-340. New York: Random House, The Modern Library, 193-.
- Nketia, J. H. Kwabena. "Traditional Music of the Ga People." African Music 2 (1958): 21-27.
- _____. Drumming: In Akan Communities of Ghana. London: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1963.
- _____. Our Drums and Drummers. Accra, Ghana: Ghana Publishing House, 1968.
- _____. African Gods and Music. Legon, Ghana: Institute of African Studies, University of Ghana, 1970.
- _____. The Music of Africa. London: Victor Gollancz, 1975.
- _____. "Universal Perspectives in Ethnomusicology." The World of Music 26 (1984): 3-21.
- _____. "Music and Religion in Sub-Saharan Africa." The Encyclopedia of Religion. 1987. 10:172-176.
- _____. "Musical Interaction in Ritual Events." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 111-124. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Nocent, Adrien. "Word and Music in the Liturgy." In Music and the Experience of God, ed. Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, 127-134. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989.
- Nodelman, Sheldon. "Structural Analysis in Art and Anthropology." In Structuralism, ed. Jacques Ehrmann, 79-93. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1970.
- Novation. De spectaculis III, 2-3. In Music in Early Christian Literature, ed. James McKinnon, excerpt 90. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Nozick, Robert. The Examined Life: Philosophical Meditations. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1989.

- Nuttall, Geoffrey F. Studies in Christian Enthusiasm: Illustrated from Early Quakerism. Wallingford, Penn.: Pendle Hill, 1948.
- Nutting, Geoffrey Howard. "Towards a Theology of Music." Interchange 2 (September 1970): 146-157.
- O'Grady, Terence J. "Aesthetic Value in Indeterminate Music." The Musical Quarterly 67 (July 1981): 366-381.
- Oldham, Larry E. "Biblical Foundations for Ministry Through Music." DMA dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1983.
- Omdal, Arnulf. "Tidsånden og Musikkhistorisk Periodisering." Studia Musicologica Norvegica 6 (1980): 81-95. Translated for the researcher by E. Lundstrom.
- Ong, Walter J. "World as View and World as Event." American Anthropologist 71 (1969): 634-647.
- Oosterwal, Gottfried. "Gospel, Culture, and Mission." Ministry, October 1989, 22-25.
- _____. "Mission and Culture." Adventist Review, October 19, 1989, 18-23.
- Opper, Jacob. "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900: Concomitants of the Natural Sciences in the Musical, Literary, and Graphic Arts." Ph.D. dissertation, Florida State University, 1970.
- Ortega y Gasset, José. "History as a System." Translated by William C. Atkinson. In Philosophy and History: Essays Presented to Ernst Cassirer, ed. Raymond Klibansky and H. J. Paton, 283-322. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1936.
- Ostling, Richard N. "No Sympathy for the Devil." Time, March 19, 1990, 55-56.
- Ottenberg, Simon. "Two New Religions, One Analytic Frame." Cahiers d'Études Africaines 24 (1984): 437-454.
- Otto, Rudolf. The Idea of the Holy. Translated by John W. Harvey. New York: Oxford University Press, 1958.
- Overrath, Johannes. "Musik im Dienste des Heiligen." In Kirchenmusik im Gespräch, 93-113. Regensburg: F. Fleckenstein, 1976.
- Oyer, Mary K. "Hymnody in the Context of World Mission." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 51-75. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Pace, David. "An Exercise in Structural History: An Analysis of the Social Criticism of Claude Levi-Strauss." In Structuralism: An Interdisciplinary Study, ed. Susan Wittig, 38-55. Pittsburg, Penn.: The Pickwick Press, 1975.
- Palisca, Claude V., ed. "John On Music (De Musica)." In Hucbald, Guido and John on Music, ed. Claude V. Palisca and trans. Warren Babb, 87-190. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1978.

- Pankratz, Herbert R. "Luther's Utilization of Music in School and Town in the Early Reformation." Andrews University Seminary Studies 22 (Spring 1984): 99-112.
- Panzarella, Robert. "The Phenomenology of Aesthetic Peak Experiences." The Journal of Humanistic Psychology 20 (1980): 69-85.
- Parrinder, Geoffrey. Worship in the World's Religions. London: Faber and Faber, 1961.
- _____. "The Nature of God in African Belief." In The Ways of Religion, ed. Roger Eastman, 493-499. San Francisco: Canfield Press, 1975.
- Pascall, R. J. "Style." The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. London: Macmillan Publishers, 1980. 18:316-321.
- Pascoe, Clive B. "Motivational Pacing in Musical Design: An Active Force in Music Education." In Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, 71-75. Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974. Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976.
- Pattison, Robert. The Triumph of Vulgarly: Rock Music in the Mirror of Romanticism. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Peck, Richard. Rock: Making Musical Choices. Greenville, S.C.: Bob Jones University Press, 1985.
- Pelikan, Jaroslav. "Form and Tradition in Worship." In Essays Presented at the First Liturgical Institute, 9-27. Valparaíso, Ind.: Valparaíso University Press, 1950.
- _____. Human Culture and the Holy: Essays on the True, the Good and the Beautiful. London: SCM Press, 1959.
- Peperzak, Adriaan. "Values: Subjective--Objective." The Journal of Value Inquiry 20 (1986): 71-80.
- Pernot, Louis. "La Musique Comme Symbole Religieux." Foi et Vie 87 (January 1988): 17-20.
- Perris, Arnold. Music as Propaganda: Art to Persuade, Art to Control. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Perry, Steve. "Ain't No Mountain High Enough: The Politics of Crossover." In Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith, 51-87. New York: Pantheon Books, 1988.
- Pickering, Michael, and Tony Green. "Towards a Cartography of the Vernacular Milieu." In Everyday Culture: Popular Song and Vernacular Milieu, ed. Michael Pickering and Tony Green, 1-38. Milton Keynes, England: Open University Press, 1987.
- _____. "Conclusion: Studying the Everyday Arts." In Everyday Culture: Popular Song and Vernacular Milieu, ed. Michael Pickering and Tony Green, 173-178. Milton Keynes, England: Open University Press, 1987.

- Plato. Laws 653-650. In Source Book of the History of Education for the Greek and Roman Period, ed. Paul Monroe, 224-225. New York: Macmillan Company, 1913.
- _____. Laws 700a-701c. In Music in the Western World: A History in Documents. Compiled by Piero Weiss and Richard Taruskin, 7-8. New York: Schirmer Books, 1984.
- Pont, K. G. "A Philosophy of Music Education." In Challenges in Music Education, ed. Frank Callaway, 290-294. Proceedings of the XI International Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Perth, Australia, August 5-12, 1974. Perth: University of Western Australia, 1976.
- Porter, Ellen Jane. "The Devil's Good Tunes: A Study of the Secular in Protestant Hymnody." The Diapason No. 746, January 1972, 18-20.
- Porter, James, et al. "Trance, Music, and Music/Trance Relations: A Symposium." Pacific Review of Ethnomusicology 4 (1987): 1:38.
- Portnoy, Julius. The Philosopher and Music: A Historical Outline. New York: Humanities Press, 1954.
- _____. Music in the Life of Man. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963.
- Pottie, Charles S. A More Profound Alleluia! Gelineau and Routley on Music in Christian Worship. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral Press, 1984.
- Prajñānānanda, Swāmī. Historical Development of Indian Music. Calcutta: Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyah, 1960.
- _____. A Historical Study of Indian Music. Calcutta: Anandadhara, Prakashan, 1965.
- Pratt, Carroll C. The Meaning of Music: A Study in Psychological Aesthetics. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1931.
- _____. "Structural versus Expressive Form in Music." The Journal of Psychology 5 (January 1938): 149-156.
- Pratt, Waldo Seldon. The Music of the French Psalter of 1562: A Historical Survey and Analysis with the Music in Modern Notation. New York: Columbia University Press, 1939.
- Proust, Marcel. Maxims. Quoted in H. R. Rookmaaker. Modern Art and the Death of a Culture, 11. London: InterVarsity Press, 1973.
- Purcell, William L. An Introduction to Asian Music. New York: Asian Society, 1966.
- Quasten, Johannes. Music and Worship in Pagan and Christian Antiquity. Translated by Boniface Ramsey, O.P. Washington, D.C.: National Association of Pastoral Musicians, 1983.
- Qureshi, Regula Burckhardt. "In Memoriam: Lois Lamyā' Ibsen Al Fārūqī (1927-1986)." Ethnomusicology 32 (Spring/Summer 1988): 93-96.

- Rabey, Steve. "A Noebel Cause." Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (May 1986): 23-25.
- Raboteau, Albert J. Slave Religion: The "Invisible Institution" in the Antebellum South. New York: Oxford University Press, 1978.
- Ranade, Ashok D. "Devotional Music in India." Sangeet Natak 85-86 (July-December 1987): 40-48.
- Rao, Seshagiri. "Overcoming Religious Conflict--A Hindu Approach." In The Global Congress on the World's Religions Proceedings 1980-1982, ed. Henry O. Thompson, 192-198. New York: Rose of Sharon Press, 1982.
- Ratzinger, Cardinal Joseph. "Zur Theologischen Grundlegung Der Kirchenmusik." In Gloria Deo Pax Hominibus: Festschrift zum 100-jährigen Bestehen der Kirchenmusikschule Regensburg Affiliert der Papstlichen Hochschule für Kirchenmusik Rom, ed. Franz Fleckenstein, 39-62. Regensburg: Fachakademie für Katholische Kirchenmusik und Musikerziehung, 1974.
- _____. "Theological Problems of Church Music". In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 169-182. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Read, Herbert. Art and Society. London: Faber and Faber, 1956.
- Reardon, Thomas J. "The Leader of Liturgical Song." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 120-125. Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Reese, Gustave. Music in the Middle Ages: With an Introduction on the Music of Ancient Times. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1940.
- _____. Music in the Renaissance. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1954.
- Reese, Sam. "Forms of Feeling: The Aesthetic Theory of Susanne K. Langer." Music Educators Journal 63 (April 1977): 45-49.
- Reid, J. P. "Deism." Encyclopedic Dictionary of Religion. 1979. 1:1014.
- Reimer, Bennett. A Philosophy of Music Education. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1970.
- "Religious Music in the Schools." Music Educators Journal 71 (November 1984): 29-30.
- The Report of the Committee Appointed in 1948 by the Archbishops of Canterbury and York. Music in Church. Westminster: Church Information Office, 1957.
- Reynolds, William J., and Milburn Price. A Survey of Christian Hymnody. Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1987.

- Richards, Sam. "Westcountry Gypsies: Key Songs and Community Identity." In Everyday Culture: Popular Song and Vernacular Milieu, ed. Michael Pickering and Tony Green, 125-149. Milton Keynes, England: Open University Press, 1987.
- Rieger, Jon H. "The Coming Crisis in the Youth Music Market." Popular Music and Society 4 (1974): 19-35.
- Riehm, Heinrich. "Criteria for the Usability of New Hymns in Hymnals." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 115-128. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Ringer, Alexander, L. "Religious Music in the West." The Encyclopedia of Religion. (1987). 10:209-216.
- Roberts, John Peter Lee. "Cultural Sovereignty and Music Policy in the Electronic Media." In Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer, 171-177. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987.
- Robinson, Deanna Campbell, Elizabeth R. Buck, and Marlene Cuthbert. Music at the Margins: Popular Music and Global Cultural Diversity. London: Sage Publications, 1991.
- Rochberg, George. String Quartet, No. 3. Nonesuch Records, H-71283. Jacket notes by George Rochberg. Quoted in Huntley Beyer and Rebecca Parker Beyer. "Music Informing Spirit: A Commentary on the Theological Implications of Contemporary Music." Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies 49 (1983): 8.
- Rodríguez, Olavo Alén. "Some Aspects of the Present Situation of the Different Musics of the World and Their Future." In Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer, 38-56. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987.
- Roe, Keith. "The School and Music in Adolescent Socialization." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 212-230. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- Rogers, J. A. "Jazz at Home." In The Black Aesthetic, ed. Addison Gayle, Jr., 110-117. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1971.
- Rookmaaker, H. R. Modern Art and the Death of a Culture. London: InterVarsity Press, 1973.
- _____. Art Needs No Justification. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1978.
- _____. The Creative Gift: The Arts and the Christian Life. Leicester, England: InterVarsity Press, 1981.
- Rothenhuhler, Eric W. "Commercial Radio and Popular Music: Processes of Selection and Factors of Influence." In Popular Music and Communication, ed. James Lull, 78-95. London: Sage Publications, 1987.
- Rouget, Gilbert. Music and Trance: A Theory of the Relations Between Music and Possession. Translated and revised by Brunhilde Biebuyck. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985.

- Routley, Erik. The Church and Music: An Enquiry into the History, the Nature, and the Scope of Christian Judgment on Music. Rev. ed. London: Gerald Duckworth and Company, 1950.
- _____. The Music of Christian Hymnody. London: Independent Press, 1957.
- _____. Church Music and Theology. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1959.
- _____. Into a Far Country. London: Independent Press, 1962.
- _____. Music Leadership in the Church: A Conversation Chiefly with My American Friends. Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon Press, 1967.
- _____. The Musical Wesleys. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1968.
- _____. Church Music and the Christian Faith. Carol Stream, Ill.: AGAPE, 1978.
- _____. A Panorama of Christian Hymnody. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1979.
- _____. The Music of Christian Hymns. Chicago: G.I.A. Publications, 1981.
- Rowell, Lewis. Thinking About Music: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Music. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1983.
- Rupprecht, Oliver C. "The Modern Struggle for Standards in Religious Music: A Theological-Musical Appraisal Viewing the Work of Luther, Bach, and Mendelssohn." Concordia Journal 9 (July 1983): 124-139.
- Ruskin, John. Quoted in Kenneth Clark Civilization: A Personal View, 1. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1969.
- Rutter, John. Interview with Robert Mark McBain, January 7, 1981. In Robert Mark McBain, "The Choral Music of John Rutter: Analysis and Performance Practices," 255-269. DMA dissertation, Arizona State University, 1981.
- Ryken, Leland. "The Creative Arts." In The Making of a Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur Holmes, 105-131. Downers Grove, Ill: InterVarsity Press, 1985.
- _____. Culture in Christian Perspective: A Door to Understanding and Enjoying the Arts. Portland, Oreg.: Multnomah Press, 1986.
- Rylaarsdam, J. Coert. "The Matrix of Worship in the Old Testament." In Worship in Scripture and Tradition, ed. Massey H. Shepherd, Jr., 44-76. New York: Oxford University Press, 1963.

- Ryle, John. "Miracles of the People: Attitudes to Catholicism in an Afro-Brazilian Religious Center in Salvador da Bahia." In Vernacular Christianity: Essays in the Social Anthropology of Religion Presented to Godfrey Leinhardt, ed. Wendy James and Douglas H. Johnson, 40-50. New York: Lilian Barber Press, 1988.
- Sachs, Curt. World History of the Dance. Translated by Bessie Schönberg. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1937.
- _____. The Rise of Music in the Ancient World East and West. New York: W. W. Norton, 1943.
- _____. The Commonwealth of Art: Style in the Fine Arts, Music, and the Dance. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1946.
- _____. The Wellsprings of Music. Edited by Jaap Kunst. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1965.
- Sahlin, Monte. Sharing Our Faith with Friends: Without Losing Either. Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1990.
- Saliers, Don E. "The Nature of Worship: Community Lived in Praise of God." In Duty and Delight: Routley Remembered, ed. Robin A. Leaver and James H. Litton, 35-45. Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1985.
- Sand, George. Letter to Gustave Flaubert. Quoted in Leland Ryken. Culture in Christian Perspective: A Door to Understanding and Enjoying the Arts, 164. Portland, Oreg.: Multnomah Press, 1986.
- Sanjek, Russell. American Popular Music and Its Business: The First Four Hundred Years. Vol. 2. New York: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Sanyal, Ritwik. Philosophy of Music. Bombay: Somaiya Publications, 1987.
- Savage, Jon. "Sex, Rock, and Identity." In Facing the Music, ed. Simon Frith, 131-172. New York: Pantheon Books, 1988.
- Sayers, Dorothy L. The Mind of the Maker. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1941.
- _____. "Towards a Christian Aesthetic." In Christian Letters to a Post-Christian World: A Selection of Essays. Selected and introduced by Roderick Jellema. 69-83. Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1969.
- Schaeffer, Franky. Addicted to Mediocrity: 20th Century Christians and the Arts. Westchester, Ill.: Crossway Books, 1981.
- Schacht, Richard. Nietzsche. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983.
- Schalk, Carl F. "Music in Lutheran Worship." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 40-51. Washington D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.

- Schalk, Carl F. "The Shape of Church Music in the 70s." Christian Century 87 (December 2, 1970): 1445-1449.
- _____. "Liturgical Drama." In Key Words in Church Music: Definition Essays on Concepts, Practices, and Movements of Thought in Church Music, ed. Carl Schalk, 233-236. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1978.
- _____. "The Seduction of Church Music: Perspectives on the American Scene." Church Music 79 (1979): 2-10.
- _____. "Thoughts on Smashing Idols: Church Music in the 80s." The Christian Century 98 (September 30, 1981): 960-963.
- _____. "What Did Luther Say About Music?" Pastoral Music 8 (June-July 1984): 6-30.
- Schefold, Karl. Die Bedeutung der Griechischen Kunst für das Verständnis des Evangeliums. Mainz am Rhein: Verlag Philipp von Zabern, 1983.
- Schenker, Heinrich. "Harmonielehre." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 359-362. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Schiller, Friedrich. On the Aesthetic Education of Man: A Series of Letters. Translated with an introduction by Reginald Snell. New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Company, 1965.
- Schimmel, Annemarie. "Aspects of Mystical Thought in Islām." In The Islamic Impact, ed. Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, Byron Haines, and Ellison Findly, 113-136. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1984.
- Schlink, Edmund. Zum Theologischen Problem der Musik. Tübingen: Verlag von J. C. B. Mohr, 1950.
- Schmitt, Francis P. "Leaning Right?" In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 52-64. Washington D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Schneider, Frank. "Tradition im Zeitgenössischen Schaffen." In Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer, 57-65. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987.
- Schneider, Marius. "The Birth of the Symbol in Music." The World of Music 26 (1984): 3-20.
- Scholes, Percy A. The Puritans and Music in England and New England: A Contribution to the Cultural History of the Two Nations. London: Oxford University Press, 1934.
- Schuette, Evelyn Christa. "The Reformation and Musical Influences on Martin Luther's Early Protestant Hymnody." Reformed Liturgy and Music 16 (Summer 1982): 99-106.
- Schuler, Richard J. "Native Music for the Missions." Sacred Music 102 (Winter 1975): 27-30.

- Schuon, Frithjof. The Transcendent Unity of Religions. Translated by Peter Townsend. London: Faber and Faber, 1953.
- Scott, Nathan A., Jr. "Prolegomenon to a Christian Poetic." Journal of Religion 35 (October 1955): 191-206.
- . "The Modern Experiment in Criticism: A Theological Appraisal." In The New Orpheus: Essays Toward a Christian Poetic, ed. Nathan A. Scott Jr., 141-171. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1964.
- Scranton, Robert L. Aesthetic Aspects of Ancient Art. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964.
- Seashore, Carl E. Psychology of Music. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1938.
- Sedlmayr, Hans. "Zu Einen Strengen Kunstwissenschaft." Kunstwissenschaftliche Forschungen 1 (1931): 7-32.
- . Art in Crisis: The Lost Center. Chicago: Henry Regnery Company, 1958.
- Seeger, Charles. "Reflections Upon a Given Topic: Music in Universal Perspective." Ethnomusicology 15 (September 1971): 385-398.
- Seerveld, Calvin. Rainbows for the Fallen World: Aesthetic Life and Artistic Task. Toronto: Tuppence Press, 1980.
- Segler, Franklin M. Christian Worship: Its Theology and Practice. Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman Press, 1967.
- Seidel, Leonard J. God's New Song: A Biblical Perspective of Music. Springfield, Va.: Grace Unlimited Publications, 1980.
- . Face the Music: Contemporary Church Music on Trial. Springfield, Va.: Grace Unlimited Publications, 1988.
- Sendrey, Alfred. Music in the Social and Religious Life of Antiquity. Rutherford: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1974.
- Senior, John. The Death of Christian Culture. New York: Arlington House, 1978.
- Sessions, Roger. Questions About Music. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1971.
- Shankar, Ravi. My Music, My Life. With an introduction by Yehudi Menuhin. New Dehli: Vikas Publishing House, 1969.
- Sharvit, Uri. "Stylistic Change and Ethnic Continuity in Israeli Religious Music." Asian Music: A Journal of the Society for Asian Music 17 (Spring/Summer 1986): 126-146.
- Shawn, Ted. "Religious Use of the Dance." In Religious Symbolism, ed. F. Ernest Johnson, 145-157. Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1969.
- Sheldon, Robin. Preface to In Spirit and in Truth: Exploring Directions in Music in Worship Today. Edited by Robin Sheldon, vii-x. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1989.

- Shelemay, Kay Kaufman. "Zēmə: A Concept of Sacred Music in Ethiopia." The World of Music 24 (1982): 52-67.
- _____. Review of Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin. Ethnomusicology 30 (Winter 1986): 176-178.
- Shepherd, John. "Towards a Sociology of Musical Styles." In Lost in Music: Culture, Style and the Musical Event, ed. Avron Levine White, 56-76. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987.
- Shepherd, John, Phil Virden, Graham Vulliamy, and Revor Wishart. Whose Music? A Sociology of Musical Languages. London: Transaction Books, 1977.
- Shepherd, William C. "Religion and the Counter Culture--A New Religiosity." Sociological Inquiry 42 (1972): 3-9.
- Shiloah, A. "The Dimension of Sound." In Islām and the Arab World: Faith, People, Culture, ed. Bernard Lewis, 161-180. New York: Alfred A. Knopf in association with American Heritage Publishing Company, 1976.
- Simms, Bryan R. Music of the Twentieth Century: Style and Structure. New York: Schirmer Books, 1986.
- Simonton, Dean Keith. "Does Sorokin's Data Support His Theory? A Study of Generational Fluctuations in Philosophical Beliefs." Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion 15 (June 1976): 187-198.
- Sims, W. Hines. "What Is Good Church Music?" Church Musician 2 (November 1951): 12.
- Sire, James W. Foreword to The Making of the Christian Mind: A Christian World View and the Academic Enterprise, ed. Arthur F. Holmes. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1985.
- _____. The Universe Next Door: A Basic World View Catalog. 2d ed. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1988.
- Skubik, Bernadette, and Daniel Skubik. "The Neurophysiology of Rhythm." Unpublished MS. Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University, 1987.
- Slobin, Mark. Music in the Culture of Northern Afghanistan. Tucson, Ariz.: University of Arizona Press, 1976.
- Sloboda, John A. The Musical Mind: The Cognitive Psychology of Music. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985.
- Smith, Charles T. Music and Reason: The Art of Listening, Appreciating and Composing. New York: Social Sciences Publishers, 1948.
- Smith, John E., ed. "Editor's Introduction." In Religious Affections, by Jonathan Edwards, 1-83. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959.

- Smith, F. Joseph. "Church Music and Tradition." In Cantors at the Crossroads: Essays on Church Music in Honor of Walter Buszin, ed. Johannes Riedel, 3-14. St. Louis, Mo: Concordia Publishing House, 1967.
- Smith, Ronald R. "They Sing with the Voice of the Drum: Afro-Panamanian Musical Traditions." In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 163-198. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Smith, Theresa. "Moving in the Spirit: Music of Worship in Clear Creek, Mississippi, as an Expression of Worldview." Ph.D. dissertation, Brown University, 1988.
- Söhngen, Oskar. "Zur Theologie der Musik." Theologische Literaturzeitung 75 (1950): 15-24.
- _____. "Theologische Grundlagen der Kirchenmusik." In Leiturgia IV, 2-267. Kassel: Stauda-Verlag, 1961.
- _____. "Fundamental Considerations for a Theology of Church Music." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 6, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 7-16. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1963.
- _____. Theologie der Musik. Kassel: Stauda, 1967.
- _____. "Church Music as Art." In Festschrift: Theodore Hoelty-Nickel: A Collection of Essays on Church Music, ed. Newman W. Powell, 24-33. Valparaiso, Ind.: Valparaiso University Press, 1967.
- _____. "What Is the Position of Church Music in Germany Today?" In Cantors at the Crossroads: Essays on Church Music in Honor of Walter Buszin, ed. Johannes Riedel, 201-218. St. Louis, Mo: Concordia Publishing House, 1967.
- _____. "Music and Theology: A Systematic Approach." In Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, 1-19. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies. Vol. 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- _____. "Do We Need a New Concept for Church Music Today? Current Considerations." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 183-195. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Sorokin, Pitirim A. The Crisis of Our Age: The Social and Cultural Outlook. New York: E. P. Dutton, 1944.
- _____. Social and Cultural Dynamics: A Study of Change in Major Systems of Art, Truth, Ethics, Law, and Social Relationships. Revised and abridged edition. Boston: Porter Sargent Publisher, 1957.
- Sowande, Fela. The Role of Music in African Society. Washington, D.C.: African Studies and Research Program, Howard University, 1969.

- Spector, Johanna. "Chanting." The Encyclopedia of Religion. 1987. 3:204-213.
- Spencer, Herbert. "The Origin and Function of Music." In Music In European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 309-314. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Spencer, Jon Michael. "A Theology for the Blues." The Journal of Black Sacred Music 2 (Spring 1988): 1-20.
- _____. . Introduction to "The Theology of American Popular Music." The Journal of Black Sacred Music: A Journal of Theomusicology 3 (Fall 1989): 1-9.
- _____. . Conclusion to "The Theology of American Popular Music." The Journal of Black Sacred Music: A Journal of Theomusicology 3 (Fall 1989): 142-158.
- _____. . Protest and Praise: Sacred Music of Black Religion. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1990.
- Spengler, Oswald. The Decline of the West: Form and Actuality. Translated with notes by Charles Francis Atkinson. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926.
- _____. . The Decline of the West. Abridged edition by Helmut Werner. English abridged edition prepared by Arthur Helps from the translation by Charles Francis Atkinson. New York: Modern Library, 1965.
- Spratt, John F. "Philosophical Implications of Modern Science as Reflected in the History of Music." Paper presented at Hiram College, Hiram, Ohio, November 1969, 8. Quoted in Jacob Oppen. "The Cosmological Basis of Western Culture, 1600-1900: Concomitants of the Natural Sciences in the Musical, Literary, and Graphic Arts." Ph.D. dissertation, Florida State University, 1970, 262-263.
- Springett, Ronald M. "World Views." Adventist Perspectives 1 (November 1987): 24-31.
- Starks, George L., Jr. "Afro-American Song Tradition on the Sea Islands." In More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 59-80. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Stevenson, Robert. "Reformed Church Music: The Basic Implications of Calvin's Philosophy of Church Music." Croser Quarterly 26 (January 1949): 41-47.
- _____. . "Luther's Musical Achievement." The Lutheran Quarterly 3 (August 1951): 255-262.
- _____. . Protestant Church Music in America: A Short Survey of Men and Movements from 1564 to the Present. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1966.
- Stewart, Jimmy. "Introduction to Black Aesthetics in Music." In The Black Aesthetic, ed. Addison Gayle, Jr., 81-96. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1971.

- Stiller, Andrew. "Toward a Biology of Music." Opus (August 1987): 12-15.
- Stolnitz, Jerome. "On the Origins of 'Aesthetic Disinterestedness'." Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 20 (Winter 1961): 131-143.
- Strunk, Oliver, comp. Source Readings in Music History: Antiquity and the Middle Ages. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1965.
- Stuessy, Joe. Rock and Roll: Its History and Stylistic Development. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1990.
- Stumpf, Carl. "Die Anfänge der Musik." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 334-337. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Sturm, Douglas. "Naturalism, Historicism, and Christian Ethics: Toward a Christian Doctrine of Natural Law." In New Theology No. 2, ed. Martin E. Marty and Dean G. Peerman, 77-96. New York: Macmillan Company, 1965.
- Styll, John W. "Mylon Lefevre: The Solid Rocker." Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (March 1986): 19.
- _____. "Are We the World?" Contemporary Christian Magazine 8 (April 1986): 4.
- _____. "What Makes Music Christian?" Insight, August 29, 1987, 4-5.
- Sudhi, Padma. "The Spiritual Influence of Yoga-Activity on Indian Music." Indian Musicological Society 18 (December 1987): 84-89.
- Supičić, Ivo. "Music With or Without a Public." The World of Music 10 (1968): 13-21.
- _____. "Science on Music and Values in Music." The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism 28 (Fall 1969): 71-77.
- _____. Music in Society: A Guide to the Sociology of Music. New York: Pendragon Press, 1987.
- Susan, David J. "Some Parallel Emphases Between Luther's Theology and His Thought About Music, and Their Contemporary Significance." Concordia Journal 11 (January 1985): 10-14.
- Sweet, Jill. "Puritan and Enlightenment Attitudes Towards Dance: The Effects of Two Belief Systems on the Development of American Dance." UCLA Journal of Dance Ethnology 1 (Fall-Winter 1977-78): 1-10.
- Tagg, Philip D. Kojak--50 Seconds of Television Music: Towards the Analysis of Affect in Popular Music. Göteborg: Musikvetenskapliga Institutionen, 1979.
- Tamba, Akira. "Confluence of Spiritual and Aesthetic Research in Traditional Japanese Music." The World of Music 25 (1983): 30-43.

- Tarasti, Eero. "Music as Sign and Process." In Analytica: Studies in the Description and Analysis of Music in Honour of Ingmar Bengtsson, 2 March 1985. Stockholm: Royal Swedish Academy of Music, 1985.
- Taylor, Clifford. Musical Idea and the Design Aesthetic in Contemporary Music. Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1990.
- Temperley, Nicholas. The Music of the English Parish Church. 2 vols. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Terry, Lindsay. "The Role of Evangelistic Music." Fundamentalist Journal 1 (December 1982): 30-40.
- Thompson, Robert Farris. "An Aesthetic of the Cool: West African Dance." African Forum 2 (Fall 1966): 85-102.
- Tillich, Paul. The Protestant Era. Translated by James Luther Adams. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1948.
- _____. Systematic Theology. Vol. 1. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951.
- _____. Theology of Culture. ed. Robert C. Kimball. New York: Oxford University Press, 1959.
- Trimillos, Ricardo D. "Tradition and Colonialism in the Philippines--a Diachronic Phenomenon." In Tradition in den Musikkulturen--Heute und Morgen, ed. Günter Mayer, 108-114. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1987.
- Trotter, F. Thomas. "A Theology of Church Music." The Choral Journal 14 (March 1974): 15-16.
- Trulear, Harold Dean. "The Prophetic Character of Black Secular Music: Stevie Wonder." The Journal of Black Sacred Music: A Journal of Theomusicology 3 (Fall 1989): 135-141.
- Tuckman, Barbara. "The Missing Element." Unpublished paper presented at the 22nd National Conference on Higher Education, Chicago, May 7, 1967.
- Urang, Gunnar C. Church Music--For the Glory of God. Molien, Ill.: Christian Service Foundation, 1956.
- van der Leeuw, Gerardus. Sacred and Profane Beauty: The Holy in Art. Translated by David E. Green. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963.
- Vandor, Ivan. "The Role of Music in the Education of Man: Orient and Occident." The World of Music 22 (1980): 11-19.
- Van Pelt, Doug. "Moshing for the Master." Contemporary Christian Music 11 (February 1989): 20-21.
- _____. "Why Are All the Children Headbanging?" Contemporary Christian Music 12 (August 1989): 14, 15, 32.
- Veith, Gene Edward, Jr. The Gift of Art: The Place of the Arts in Scripture. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1983.

- Viladesau, Richard. "Music as an Approach to God: A Theology of Aesthetic Experience." The Catholic World 232 (January-February 1989): 4-9.
- von Fischer, Kurt. "Das Wertproblem in der Musik." Reformatio 30 (May 1981): 287-297.
- Wach, Joachim. The Comparative Study of Religions. Edited with an introduction by Joseph M. Kitagawa. New York: Columbia University Press, 1958.
- Wachsmann, Klaus P. "Universal Perspectives in Music." Ethnomusicology 15 (September 1971): 381-384.
- Wadinasi, Sedeka, and Alhamisi Wadinasi. "Black Music: A Degenerating Art Form." Ufahamu 7 (1977): 158-174.
- Waite, Gloria. "Spirit Possession Dance in Eastcentral Africa." UCLA Journal of Dance Ethnology 4 (Spring 1980): 31-38.
- Walker, Alan. "Music and the Unconscious." British Medical Journal 2 (December 22-29, 1979): 1641-1643.
- Walker, John. "Task Force on the New Organist." The American Organist 21 (April 1987): 5.
- Wallaschek, Richard. "Primitive Music." In Music in European Thought: 1851-1912, ed. Bojan Bujić, 322-326. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Walton, Kendall L. "Style and the Products and Processes of Art." In The Concept of Style, ed. Berel Lang, 45-66. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979.
- Walton, Ortiz M. "A Comparative Analysis of the African and the Western Aesthetics." In The Black Aesthetic, ed. Addison Gayle, Jr., 161-172. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1971.
- Waterman, Richard Alan. "African Influence on the Music of the Americas." In Anthropology and Art: Readings in Cross-Cultural Aesthetics, ed. Charlotte M. Otten, 227-244. Garden City, N.Y.: Natural History Press, 1971.
- Weakland, Rembert. "Music and Liturgy in Evolution." In Crisis in Church Music: Proceedings of a Meeting on Church Music Conducted by the Liturgical Conference and the Church Music Association of America, Kansas City, Missouri, November 29-December 1, 1966, 3-13. Washington, D.C.: Liturgical Conference, 1967.
- Weber, Max. The Rational and Social Foundations of Music. Translated and edited by Don Martindale, Johannes Riedel, and Gertrude Neuirth. Chicago: Southern Illinois University Press, 1958.
- Weinman, Janice. "The Influence of Pueblo Worldview on the Construction of Its Vocal Music." Ethnomusicology 14 (September 1970): 313-315.
- Weiss, Piero, and Richard Taruskin, comps. Music in the Western World: A History in Documents. New York: Schirmer Books, 1984.

- Welch, David B. "A Yoruba/Nagô 'Melotype' for Religious Songs in the African Diaspora: Continuity of West African Praise Song in the New World." In More Than Drumming: Essays on African and Afro-Latin American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 145-162. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Wellburn, Ron. "The Black Aesthetic Imperative." In The Black Aesthetic, ed. Addison Gayle, Jr., 132-149. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1971.
- Wellesz, Egon. A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography. London: Oxford University Press, 1949.
- Werner, Eric. "The Music of Post-Biblical Judaism." In New Oxford History of Music, vol. 1, ed. Egon Wellesz, 313-335. London: Oxford University Press, 1957.
- _____. The Sacred Bridge: The Interdependence of Liturgy and Music in Synagogue and Church During the First Millennium. London: Dennis Dobson, 1959.
- _____. "Music and Religion in Greece, Rome, and Byzantium." The Encyclopedia of Religion. 1987. 10:204-209.
- Westermeyer, Paul. "The Bottom Line: What Provides the Chief Influence in the Direction of Church Music in the Late Twentieth Century?" Choristers Guild Letters (December 1990): 129-131.
- Westrap, Sir Jack Allen. "Music--Part III: The Rise of Music in the Western World." Encyclopedia Britannica. 14th ed., 1971. 15:1065-1068.
- White, James F. New Forms of Worship. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1971.
- _____. Christian Worship in Transition. Nashville, Tenn.: Abingdon, 1976.
- Whitehead, Alfred North. Religion in the Making. New York: Macmillan Company, 1926.
- Whittle, Donald. Christianity and the Arts. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1967.
- Wicker, Vernon. "Church Music in the USA: Steps Toward Renewal of the Worship Service." In The Hymnology Annual: An International Forum on the Hymn and Worship, ed. Vernon Wicker, 201-212. Berrien Springs, Mich.: Vande Vere Publishing, 1991.
- Widman, Joachim. "Aesthetics of Music." Translated by John Nicholas. In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 122-131. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Wienandt, Elwyn A., ed. Opinions on Church Music. Waco, Tex.: Markham Press Fund of Baylor University Press, 1974.
- Wilder, Amos N. Theology and Modern Literature. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1958.

- Williams-Jones, Pearl. "Afro-American Gospel Music: A Crystallization of the Black Aesthetic." Ethnomusicology 19 (September 1975): 373-385.
- Wilson, Olly. "The Association of Movement and Music as a Manifestation of a Black Conceptual Approach to Music-Making." In More Than Dancing: Essays on Afro-American Music and Musicians, ed. Irene V. Jackson, 9-23. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Winter, Miriam T. Why Sing? Toward a Theology of Catholic Church Music. Washington, D.C.: Pastoral Press, 1984.
- Wohlgemuth, Paul W. "Church-Music Education in American Protestant Seminaries." In Duty and Delight: Routley Remembered, ed. Robin A. Leaver and James H. Litton, 89-95. Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1985.
- _____. "Praise Singing." The Hymn 38 (January 1987): 218-23.
- Wolfe, Charles K. "Gospel Goes Uptown: White Gospel Music, 1945-1955." Folk Music and Modern Sound, ed. William Ferris and Mary L. Hart, 80-100. Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1982.
- Wolterstorff, Nicholas. Art in Action: Toward a Christian Aesthetic. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Williams B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1980.
- _____. Reason Within the Bounds of Religion. 2d ed. Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans, 1984.
- Woodward, Kenneth L. "Dead End for the Mainline?" Newsweek, August 9, 1993, 46-48.
- Woodward, Kenneth L., et al. "A Time to Seek: With Babes in Arms and Doubts in Mind, A Generation Looks to Religion." Newsweek, December 17, 1990, 50-56.
- Wright, Jeremiah A., Jr. "Music as Cultural Expression in Black Church Theology and Worship." Journal of Black Sacred Music 3 (Spring 1989): 1-5.
- Wulff, Donna Marie. "On Practicing Religiously: Music as Sacred in India." In Sacred Sound: Music in Religious Thought and Practice, ed. Joyce Irwin, 149-172. Journal of the American Academy of Religion Thematic Studies. Vol. 50. Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1983.
- Wundt, Wilhelm. Völkerpsychologie: Eine Untersuchung der Entwicklungsgesetze von Sprache, Mythos und Sitte. Book 3. Leipzig: Alfred Kröner Verlag, 1923.
- Yorks, Cindy Lafavre. "McChurch." USA Weekend, April 13-15, 1990, 4-7.
- Young, Carlton R. "An Alternative Model for the Education of the Church Musician." In Duty and Delight: Routley Remembered, ed. Robin A. Leaver and James H. Litton, 97-100. Carol Stream, Ill.: Hope Publishing Company, 1985.

- Yutang, Lin, ed. and trans. The Wisdom of Confucius. New York: Random House, 1938.
- Zimmerman, Heinz Werner. "New Concepts of Hymnody and Polyphony." In The Musical Heritage of the Church, vol. 7, ed. Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, 51-87. St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia Publishing House, 1970.
- Zuckermandl, Victor. Sound and Symbol: Music and the External World. Translated by Willard R. Trask. New York: Pantheon Books, 1956.
- Zuesse, Evan M. Ritual Cosmos: The Sanctification of Life in African Religions. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1979.
- Zuhlsdorf, John T. Review of Why Catholics Can't Sing by Thomas Day, Sacred Music 117 (Summer 1990): 22-24.

VITA

Name: Wolfgang Hans Martin Stefani
Birth: August 13, 1953
Citizenship: Australian
Family Status: Wife Julie and one son; Kristian

Education:

L.Mus.A. (Piano Performance), Elder Conservatorium,
Adelaide, Australia, 1972
B.A. (Theology), Avondale College, Australia, 1976
M.A. (Fine Arts), Andrews University, Michigan, USA, 1981
Ph.D. (Religious Education), Andrews University, Michigan,
USA, 1993

Experience:

1977-mid 1978	Assistant Pastor, North New South Wales Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, NSW, Australia
mid 1978-1980	Church Organist, Niles, Eau Claire and St. Joseph, Michigan, USA
1980-mid 1986	Pastor and Youth Pastor, South England Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, England
mid 1986-1992	Instructor, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary and Department of Music, Andrews University, Michigan, USA
mid 1990-1992	Beltz Chair of Church Music, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, Andrews University
1987-mid 1993	Vesper Series Coordinator, Andrews University
mid 1986-1990	Organist, Zion Evangelical United Church of Christ, St Joseph, Michigan
1990-1993	Minister of Music, Zion Evangelical UCC, St. Joseph, Michigan

Current Memberships:

Phi Kappa Phi and Pi Lambda Theta