

[This paper has been reformulated from old, unformatted electronic files and may not be identical to the edited version that appeared in print. The original pagination has been maintained, despite the resulting odd page breaks, for ease of scholarly citation. However, scholars quoting this article should use the print version or give the URL.]
Journal of the Adventist Theological Society, 7/1 (Spring 1996): 141-158.
Article copyright © 1996 by Gerhard Pfandl.

Daniel's "Time of the End"

Gerhard Pfandl
Field Secretary, South Pacific Division
Wahroonga, NSW, Australia

Introduction

After the portrayal of the ram, the goat, and the activities of the little horn power in the vision of Daniel 8, the angel Gabriel says to Daniel, "Understand, O Son of man, that the vision extends to the time of the end" (vs. 17).

This is the first of five occurrences of the phrase "time of the end" (*ʿēṭ qēṣ*), in the book of Daniel, the other four being 11:35, 40; 12:4, 9. Research has shown that there is no cognate equivalent to *ʿēṭ qēṣ* in any of the other Semitic languages. It is not found in any of the other OT books nor in any extrabiblical Hebrew source.¹ Thus, we have to conclude that the expression, "the time of the end," is a purely Danielic phrase and as such must be evaluated within the context of the prophetic chapters of Daniel.

Scholarly Opinions

Scholarly opinion in regard to the meaning of "the time of the end" in Daniel is divided. One view among scholars considers it to be an eschatological term to be applied to the time of Antiochus IV Epiphanes (2nd century B.C.). According to this position, the author of Daniel 8 expected the Messianic age to appear immediately after the demise of Antiochus IV Epiphanes.² Thus, "the time of the end" (*ʿēṭ qēṣ*) is equated with "the latter days" (*b^eʿah^arîṭ hayyāmîm*) "the latter indignation" (*ʿah^arîṭ hazzāʿam*), and "the appointed time of the end" (*mōʿed qes*).³

A variation of this interpretation is E. J. Young's view who equates "the time of the end" (*ʿēṭ qēṣ*) with "the latter indignation"

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

(*ʔah^a rîṭ hazza^cam*) and applies both to “the end of time when afflictions of indignation are to be permitted upon Israel. It is the end of the Old Testament period and the ushering in of the New.”⁴

A second view takes Daniel 8 as having a dual fulfillment, which means “that a prophecy fulfilled in part in the past is a foreshadowing of a future event which will completely fulfill the passage.”⁵ Some take the entire chapter 8 as having a dual fulfillment;⁶ John F. Walvoord, for example, sees the whole chapter historically fulfilled in Antiochus, but foreshadowing typically the future world ruler.⁷ Others take the vision proper (vss. 1-14) as historically fulfilled but see in the interpretation of the vision a dual fulfillment.⁸ Expositors of this view generally apply “the time of the end” (*ʕēṭ qēṣ*) to the time before Christ's second advent.⁹

A similar view is taken by Joyce Baldwin who, in accordance with the idealistic method of interpretation, sees Daniel 8 portraying “a recurring historical phenomenon: the clever but ruthless world dictator, who stops at nothing in order to achieve his ambitions.”¹⁰

A third view rejects the Antiochus IV Epiphanes interpretation and applies the Little Horn in Daniel 8 either to the Roman Empire,¹¹ its successor—papal Rome,¹² the Mohammedans,¹³ or a future Antichrist.¹⁴ All expositors of this view see “the time of the end” as the time preceding and culminating in the second advent of Christ, that is, the end of world history.¹⁵

Finding a Starting Point

Daniel 11:35. A specific historical event in any of the five passages where the expression, “the time of the end” occurs would provide a starting point in the search for its meaning. I believe such an historical event is found in the passage of Daniel 11:35-12:4 where the phrase is used three times (11:35,40; 12:4).

Daniel 11 is part of the second “commentary vision” which begins in Daniel 10:1 and ends in Daniel 12:4. As in Daniel 9, there are no striking symbols in this vision, only explanations. The symbolic visions of Daniel end in 8:14, what follows are explanations and enlargements of the symbolic visions.

The angelic commentary in Daniel 11 begins with the kings of Medo-Persia (vss. 1-2), followed by the Alexandrian empire and its

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

break up into four parts (vss. 3-4). The next 40 verses are taken up with the struggle between two opposing forces, designated as kings of the North and the South (5-45).

In Daniel 11:35 the phrase, "time of the end" (*'ēṭ qēṣ*) makes its second appearance in the book. Daniel 11:35 is part of a series of verses describing the activities of "those who are wise," the *maškilîm* (vss. 32-35), in the face of the invasion of the King of the North. These wise persons "shall fall to refine and to purge them, and to make them white, until the time of the end, for it is yet for the appointed time" (vs. 35). Who is to be purged through the fall of the "wise"? They themselves, the people of verse 33, or the "many" in verse 34? The text unfortunately is ambiguous. However, whichever group is referred to, the thought is clear that this falling will go on until the time of the end which will come at the appointed time.

The passage following Daniel 11:35 describes the activities of the willful king in verses 36-39, and in verse 40 "the time of the end" (*'ēṭ qēṣ*) is mentioned again. In verse 40 "the time of the end," which was seen as future in verse 35, has now arrived. In the concluding part of the vision a resurrection of the dead takes place (12:2). It is this event which, I believe, holds the key to the proper understanding of the expression, "the time of the end" (*'ēṭ qēṣ*).

Daniel 12:1, 2. And at that time Michael shall stand up, the great prince who has charge of your people. And there shall be a time of trouble, such as never was since there was a nation until that time. But at that time your people shall be delivered, everyone who is found written in the book.

And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake, some to everlasting life, and some to shame and everlasting contempt.

"At that time" refers us back to "the time of the end" in 11:40.¹⁶ During this "time of the end" Michael will stand up, because there will be such a "time of trouble" within "the time of the end" the like of it the world has never experienced. Yet "at that time," still referring to the "time of the end," God's people will be delivered.

As we have seen above, the phrase "at that time" (*ûbâ'ēṭ hahî'*) which appears at the beginning and the end of Daniel 12:1 refers

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

back to Daniel 11:40-45. The subject in Daniel 12:1c is “your people” qualified by the appositional phrase “everyone who is found written in the book.” Thus the “people” not only belong to God, but they are also recorded in God’s book. Many books are mentioned in the OT,¹⁷ but this one seems to be the “book of life” (Ps 69:28), also called “God’s book” (Exod 32:33).¹⁸ Only those whose names are written in this book will be delivered.

In Daniel 12:1 there are three different themes (Michael stands up, a time of trouble, and the deliverance of God’s people). These themes are welded together by the temporal phrase, “that time.” The immediate context in Daniel 12:2 deals with the resurrection of the dead which I believe holds the key to the meaning of “the time of the end” (*‘ēṭ qēṣ*).

There is a sizeable body of literature on the topic of the resurrection in the OT.¹⁹ According to the scholarly consensus, the physical resurrection of the dead is part of the OT apocalyptic matrix.²⁰ The two passages which most clearly enunciate it are Isaiah 26:19 and Daniel 12:1-4. Although Hans Wildberger and other scholars see the resurrection in Isaiah 26 as only a metaphor for the restoration of Israel,²¹ the majority of scholars hold that Isaiah 26:19 expresses the notion of a physical resurrection.²²

In regard to Daniel 12:2, some see the resurrection mentioned there simply as a figure of the moral and national revival of Israel in “the time of the end,”²³ but again the majority of interpreters agree that a physical resurrection is in view here as well.²⁴

Many scholars see Daniel 12:1-4 as part of the prophecy in Daniel 11:40-45, which the writer envisaged but which never came to pass. According to their understanding, the resurrection was to come after Antiochus IV Epiphanes had died.²⁵

In Daniel 12:2a we read: “And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake.” The word “many” (*rabbîm*) indicates that this is not the general resurrection at the end of time, but a resurrection which is limited to “many of them that sleep.” The preposition *min* being used in the partitive sense. Gerhard Hasel points out²⁶ that in Esther 8:17, the only other OT passage where we find exactly the same sentence construction,²⁷ *min* has the partitive sense. “Furthermore, the partitive usage is the more common one for *rabbîm* followed by *min*. One would have to have

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

compelling reasons,” says Hasel, “for departing from normal usage before one could be reasonably sure that a meaning other than the common one should be chosen.”²⁸ There does not seem to be any compelling reason in this text.

“Sleeping” (*yāšēn*) is used here of death as in Job 3:13, Psalm 13:3 and Jeremiah 51:39 of death. This is parallel to John 11:11 where Jesus says “Lazarus is sleeping” and three verses further on he explains that Lazarus is in fact dead.

“Dusty earth” or “land of dust” (*ʿadmat ʿaphār*) occurring only here, refers back to Genesis 3:19 “In the sweat of your face you shall eat bread, till you return to the ground (*ʿdamah*), for out of it you were taken; For dust (*ʿaphār*) you are, and to dust you shall return.” Dust is frequently used as a symbol for the grave (cf. Job 7:21; Ps 22:29). The reference here is to those who are dead and buried.

“Shall awake” (*yāqîyû*). This verb appears 22 times in the OT and can refer to waking up from sleep (1 Sam 26:12; Ps 3:5) or from inactivity (Ps 35:23; 59:5). It is used for the resurrection in 2 Kings 4:31; Job 14:12; Psalms 17:15; Isaiah 26:19; Jeremiah 51:39,57 and here in Daniel 12:2. Nowhere does it refer to a moral or national awakening.

Thus, using normal Hebrew grammar and syntax for a reading of Daniel 12:2, I find that what is spoken of here is a partial resurrection when some will receive eternal life and others everlasting contempt.

Since in the time of Jesus the great tribulation and the resurrection were still future (Matt 24:21; John 5:28, 29), Daniel 11:35-12:4 cannot refer to the time of Antiochus IV Epiphanes in the second century B.C. Daniel's time of trouble and the partial resurrection must come in “the time of the end” as this aeon comes to a close prior to the establishment of the kingdom of God.

Parallels in Daniel

This view is supported by the comparison of Daniel 2, 7, and 8 on chart A and Daniel 8, 9, and 10-12 on chart B.²⁹

In both charts the pivot is chapter 8. In these charts chapter 8 alone follows the chronological order of the text. One must also bear in mind that chapters 2, 7, and 8 consist of vision and explanation; this means that details appear in the vision and again in the

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

explanation. Therefore, the corresponding texts, particularly in chapters 9 and 10-12, are not in the chronological order as they appear in their respective chapters. Furthermore, the descriptions in the chapters do not follow a common sequence.

From Chart A we may draw the following conclusions:

1. The first three empires are clearly defined as Babylon, Medo-Persia, and Greece by direct citations from the text.

2. The Little Horn of chap. 7 is basically the same as the Little Horn of chap. 8, even though the Aramaic expression, "another little horn" in Daniel 7:8 is not the exact equivalent of the Hebrew, "a little horn," Daniel 8:9.³⁰ The activities of the Little Horn in Daniel 7 overlap to a large extent the activities of the Little Horn of Daniel 8. The identification of the two horns, says H. H. Rowley, "does not rest on the similarity of the terms, but on the indications of the character and deeds of the person each stands for."³¹ W. H. Shea, after listing eleven similarities between the two "little horns" observes, "If the prophet had desired to represent different powers in this final position, he could easily have used different symbols to do so."³²

3. In both chapters the activities of the Little Horn extend through the time of the end (Dan 7:26; 8:17), and in both chapters it is supernaturally destroyed (Dan 7:26; 8:25).

4. The visions in Daniel 2 and 7 end with the kingdom of heaven. In Daniel 7 the destruction of the Little Horn is connected with the establishment of Christ's kingdom.³³ Thus, we conclude that the Little Horn in Daniel 8, since it is parallel to the Little Horn in Daniel 7, also perishes (Dan 8:25) at the coming of the everlasting kingdom. Although Daniel 8 does not expressly mention this kingdom, nevertheless, the parallelism between Daniel 7 and 8 clearly indicates this.

From Chart B we can draw the following conclusions:

1. The striking linguistic parallels show that the same subject matter is treated in all three passages.

2. The "prince" or "anointed one" is Christ³⁴ in all three passages. He is Lord of the covenant (Deut 4:23), and He is also the "Prince of the covenant" (Dan 11:22).

3. The abomination that makes desolate (Dan 9:27; 11:31)³⁵ was cited by Christ (Matt 24:15) as still lying in the future.³⁶ A

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

fulfillment in the second century B.C., therefore, does not seem possible.

4. The visions of Daniel 8 and 11 both reach to "the time of the end," at which, according to Daniel 12:2, a resurrection takes place.

5. The "indignation" (*za'am*) in Daniel 8:19 and 11:36 refers to the judgment of God (Isa 10:25; 26:20-21). The context of both texts is "the time of the end" (Dan 8:17; 11:35). Historical-critical scholars have correctly seen that Daniel 8 and 11 parallel each other, but for them the historical events center around Antiochus IV Epiphanes. They see the "time of indignation" as the time in which God used Antiochus as the "rod of wrath" (Isa 5:24-30) for the Jews.³⁷

Summarizing both charts, we may say that Daniel 2, 7, 8, and 10-12 are parallel prophecies which cover roughly the same period. They begin either in the time of the Babylonians or the Persians and reach to the time of the end when the everlasting kingdom breaks into history. The stone in Daniel 2, the judgment in Daniel 7, and the resurrection in Daniel 12, clearly point to the apocalyptic end of history. Hence, we can assume that Daniel 8 also reaches that far since there are in it many parallels to the other chapters. The inner unity of the book, which I have attempted to illustrate, makes it difficult to accept any interpretation which restricts all or some of Daniel's prophecies to the period of Antiochus IV Epiphanes.

The structure of Daniel 11, as well as the links and similarities with other chapters of the book of Daniel, gives us ample ground to conclude that it does indeed span the time from the Persian kings to the resurrection and the final judgment at the end of earth's history.

The Input of Daniel 12:4, 9

Daniel 12:4. But you Daniel shut up³⁸ these words and seal³⁹ the book until the time of the end. Many shall (then) go back and forth⁴⁰ and knowledge shall increase.

At the end of the section of Daniel 11:2-12:4 there is again the direct address of the angel as we found at the beginning (Dan 11:2), thus the angel's direct words serve as markers for the introduction and conclusion of this segment of the vision.

The expression "time of the end" (*'ēṭ qēṣ*) in Daniel 12:4 again

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

refers back to “the time of the end” in Daniel 11:35, 40. We have seen that in view of the larger context “the time of the end” in these texts refers to *the time preceding the resurrection of the dead* in Daniel 12:2 which will happen at the end of all things.⁴¹ This seems also to be the meaning here in Daniel 12:4. Just prior to the end of history, people will study and search out the Danielic visions just as Daniel himself searched out the seventy-year prophecy of Jeremiah (Dan 9:2).

Daniel 12:9. And he said: Go Daniel for the words are shut up and sealed until the time of the end.⁴²

In this epilogue (Dan 12:5-13) a new scene is introduced. Two other beings appear and converse with the man clothed in linen whom Daniel had seen at the beginning of the vision (Dan 10:4-5). He hears what they say but does not understand it and so he asks, in verse 8, “My Lord, what shall be the outcome⁴³ of these things?”

The response refers to “the time of the end” (vs. 9b), which is the time when these things will be understood (vs. 10). It is the same time referred to in vs. 4 when knowledge about the Danielic visions would increase. The unsealing of the vision and the increase of knowledge will come when the power of the willful king is broken (Dan 11:45). And this will happen just prior to the resurrection of the dead (Dan 12:1-2).

Conclusion

In conclusion we can say that interpreters by and large consider “the time of the end” (*ʿēṭ qēṣ*) to be an eschatological term, some applying it to the time of Antiochus IV Epiphanes, others to the time immediately prior to the second advent.

The linguistic and thematic parallels in chapters 2, 7, 8, and 10-12 support the second view. They indicate that all these visions reach to the time of the second advent. I agree therefore with J. R. Wilch who, in his study on “time” (*ʿēṭ*), pointed out that the five instances of “the time of the end” (*ʿēṭ qēṣ*) in Daniel 8-12 all refer to the “absolute eschatological end.”⁴⁴ Yet this end is not a point in time, but the final period of history. Wilch calls it the “final ‘act’: the ‘situation of the end’.”⁴⁵

The vision in Daniel 8, therefore, cannot terminate in the time of Antiochus IV Epiphanes. It too must reach to the absolute end

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

of the course of history. For contextual reasons the expression “the time of the end” (*‘ēṭ qēṣ*) in the book of Daniel seems to be a technical term standing for the final period of human history leading up to the eschaton, Christ's return, when the old aeon will give way to the new one and God's kingdom will be established “without human hands” (Dan 2:34).

EXCURSUS: “THE LATTER DAYS”

In Daniel 2:28 the prophet tells King Nebuchadnezzar that “there is a God in heaven who reveals secrets, and He has made known to King Nebuchadnezzar what will be in the latter days.” The phrase “latter days” appears again in Daniel 10:14 where an angel tells Daniel that he has come to make Daniel understand what will happen to his people in the latter days. What is meant by the phrase “latter days?” To what time period does it refer?

In chapter 8:17 Daniel is told that the vision of the ram and the goat extends to “the time of the end.” This is the first of five occurrences of this phrase in the book of Daniel, the other four being Daniel 11:35, 40; 12:4, 9. These passages we have discussed above. Our question here is, How does the expression, “the latter days” relate to the phrase, “the time of the end”? Do these expressions refer to the same time period or not?

Adventist interpreters have frequently equated these temporal expressions in the book of Daniel. Both have been seen as referring to the time just prior to the second advent of Christ. Uriah Smith in the last century saw “the time of the end” beginning in 1798 and “the latter days” as following the 2300 prophetic days in Daniel 8:14,⁴⁶ and Taylor Bunch in this century wrote, “All four of the great visions of Daniel's book focus upon the ‘time of the end’ or ‘latter days,’ when they would be studied and understood.”⁴⁷ But are they in fact referring to the same time period?

The Latter Days

The Hebrew phrase for the expression, “the latter days” (*b^e‘ah^arîṭ hayyāmîm*) appears 14 times in the OT including the two occurrences in the book of Daniel (Gen 49:1; Num 24:14; Deut 4:30; 31:29; Isa 2:2; Jer 23:20; 30:24; 48:47; 49:39; Ezek 38:16; Dan 2:28; 10:14; Hos 3:5; Mic 4:1).

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

A study of the twelve references outside of the book of Daniel shows that the “latter days” can refer to various time periods in history. In Genesis 49:1, where the phrase appears for the first time, Jacob says to his sons: “Gather together and I will tell you what will happen to you in the latter days.”

At the end of his life Jacob looks into the future, and under prophetic inspiration he predicts major developments in the history of his sons and their descendants. He sees them settled in Canaan, notices the two leading and prominent figures in their history—Judah, on the one hand (vs. 8) and Joseph or Ephraim on the other (vs. 22), and predicts that the Messiah will come from the tribe of Judah (vs. 10). Since Jacob is primarily describing the future history of his descendants, that is, Israel, “the latter days” (*b^eʿah^arîṭ hayyāmîm*) is best translated and construed to mean “in the future” or “in the days to come” as the RSV, NEB, and NIV have done. This future began to be realized with the conquest of Canaan and continued until the first advent of Christ. “The latter days” in this text, therefore, refer to the whole time span extending from the Israel's entrance into Canaan to the appearance of the Messiah.

In Deuteronomy 31:29 Moses predicts that after his death the children of Israel would become utterly corrupt, and that evil would befall them in “the latter days.” This prophecy was fulfilled in the time of the judges (Judges 2:11-16) and kings (Jer 7:28-34) when Israel repeatedly apostatized on a large scale. Hence “the latter days” in this text were the times of the judges and kings. In Jeremiah 23:20 and 30:24 the phrase refers to the time of the fall of Jerusalem in 586 B.C. Then, Jeremiah says, the Jews would clearly understand that the calamities which had come upon them were the divine judgment upon their sins.

In Jeremiah 48:47; and 49:39 the time of the Persian restoration is in view. In other texts notably Isaiah 2:2; Micah 4:1; and Hosea 3:5 the time of the Messianic kingdom is referred to as “the latter days.”

Thus, we see that the context must decide in each case what specific era is intended. Most modern versions, therefore, translate the Hebrew phrase *b^eʿah^arîṭ hayyāmîm* as “in the days to come” (NASB in Gen 49:1); “in time to come” (NRSV in Deut 31:29); or “in later days” (NIV in Deut 4:30).

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

In summary, then, we can say that “the latter days” in the OT outside of the book of Daniel may refer to: (a) a specific future period in the history of Israel (Deut 4:30; 31:29; Jer 23:20; 30:24; 48:47; 49:39); (b) the future history of Israel beginning with the conquest (Gen 49:1) or the monarchy (Num 24:14) and reaching down to the time of the Messiah; and (c) the Messianic age (Isa 2:2; Mic 4:1; Hos 3:5) or the time immediately preceding it (Ezek 38:16).

Daniel 2:28. The context of “the latter day” passage in Daniel 2 is the dream of King Nebuchadnezzar. Daniel comes before the king and says in vs. 28, “There is a God in heaven who reveals mysteries and he has made known to king Nebuchadnezzar what will be in the latter days.” The mystery, which the king wanted to know, related to the future of his kingdom. He had just begun a brilliant reign. How would it end, and what would follow? The king hoped for some information concerning the future of Babylon. But what God showed him took in not only the future of the Babylonian realm but also the future of world history down to the end of time.

Thus “the latter days” in Daniel 2 refer to the future which began in the time of Daniel and reaches down to the time of the second advent of Christ, symbolized by the stone kingdom. The “latter days” cannot be confined to the final part of the vision as some have done; they refer to the whole time span referred to in the vision.

This is confirmed by the parallelism between verses 28 and 29.

vs. 28 God reveals secrets and makes known to the king.

vs. 29 The revealer of secrets makes known to you

vs. 28 what shall be in the latter days (*b^eʿaḥ^a rîṭ yômayyāʾ*)

vs. 29 what shall be after this (*ʔḥ^a rê d^e nāh*)

vs. 28 the visions of your head upon your bed

vs. 29 your thoughts on your bed

To insist that what God makes known to the king in vs. 28, that is, “what shall be in the latter days,” is something different from what God makes known to him in vs. 29, that is, “what shall be after this,” is against the parallelism and flow of thought in this whole passage. The subject matter of the story is the king's dream, the whole dream, not only the final part of it. Therefore, if “after

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

this” refers to the whole vision, as is generally acknowledged, then “the latter days” must also refer to the whole vision.

Daniel 10:14. The same is true for the meaning of “the latter days” in Daniel 10:14, where the angel informs the prophet that he has come to give him understanding of what will happen to his people in “the latter days.” The prophecy, in the form of an audition in Daniel 11 and 12, runs from the days of the prophet, that is, from the days of the Persian kings (Dan 11:2) down to the very climax of human history, the resurrection (Dan 12:2).

The phrase “your people” in Daniel 10:14 clearly refers to the Jews, the people of whom Daniel was one. Any other meaning would have had to be explained to Daniel in order to be comprehensible to him. Again in Daniel 11:14, God, referring to the Jews, calls them “your people,” that is, Daniel's people. And when we look at Daniel 11 as a whole, we find that more than half the verses in this chapter actually deal with historical events prior to A.D. 70 and the final destruction of the Jewish state. Thus, when the angel says, “What will happen to your people in ‘the latter days’ . . .” these “latter days” must include the events of the first half of Daniel 11. They refer to the whole sweep of history which is outlined in Daniel 11 and 12, that is, the future which began in the time of Daniel and ends with the second coming of Christ.

Concluding our study of the phrase “the latter days,” we can say that the context remains decisive in each case for the meaning of “the latter days.” It is an idiomatic expression for “future” or “in days to come.” It is therefore in itself not a technical eschatological term, because its contextual settings and varieties of usages allow it to be employed in different ways. Only the context of a given passage can determine if the expression is being used with an eschatological nuance.

The two expressions, “the latter days” and “the time of the end,” are not equivalent and they bear no direct relationship to each other. Both are eschatological expressions, but only “the time of the end” refers to the final eschatological or apocalyptic event.

Endnotes

1 Gerhard Pfandl, *The Time of the End in the Book of Daniel*, Adventist Theological Society Dissertation Series, vol. 1 (Berrien Springs, MI: Adventist Theological Society Publications, 1992), p. 256.

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

2 J. Dyneley Prince, *A Critical Commentary on the Book of Daniel* (Leipzig: J. C. Hinrich'sche Buchhandlung, 1899), pp. 149, 187; K. Marti, *Das Buch Daniel*, Kurzer Hand-Commentar zum Alten Testament (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1901), pp. 61, 88; S. R. Driver, *The Book of Daniel*, Cambridge Bible for Schools and Colleges (Cambridge: University Press, 1901), p. 121; R. H. Charles, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Book of Daniel* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1929), p. 215; Arthur Jeffery, "The Book of Daniel," *Interpreter's Bible* (New York: Abingdon, 1956), p. 478; John E. Goldingay, *Daniel*, Word Biblical Commentary (Dallas, TX: Word Books, 1989), p. 216. B. Jones, "Ideas of History in the Book of Daniel" (Ph.D. diss., Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, 1972), p. 274, says it was impossible for him to determine whether the time would continue after the *qes* of 8:17, 19; 11:27, 35, 40; 12:4, 9. He refers it to the end of the persecution under Antiochus IV Epiphanes, but admits that the end of the persecution could also be the end of history.

3 Marti, p. 76; Charles, p. 394; Jeffery, p. 479.

4 E. J. Young, *The Prophecy of Daniel* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1949), p. 176.

5 John F. Walvoord, *Daniel* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1979), p. 194.

6 J. Dwight Pentecost, *Prophecy for Today* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1961), pp. 82-83; Walvoord, p. 196; Gerhard Maier, *Der Prophet Daniel*, Wuppertaler Studienbibel (Wuppertal: R. Brockhaus, 1982), p. 307; Desmond Ford, *Daniel* (Nashville, TN: Southern Pub. Assn., 1978), p. 172, 191; H. C. Leupold, *Exposition of Daniel* (Wartburg Press, 1949; reprint, Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1969), p. 361.

7 Walvoord, p. 196.

8 H. A. Ironside, *Lectures on Daniel the Prophet* 2nd ed. (Neptune, NJ: Loizeaux Brothers, 1920), pp. 147-149; Louis T. Talbot, *The Prophecies of Daniel* (Wheaton, IL: Van Kampen Press, 1940), p. 143; New Scofield Reference Bible, p. 911.

9 Frederick A. Tatford, *Daniel and His Prophecy* (London: Oliphants, 1953; reprint, Minneapolis, MN: Klock and Klock, 1980), p. 133; Ironside, p. 149. Leupold (p. 361) says: "... aside from the obvious relation that the vision has to the events that lie in the near future, namely, in the time of the Persian and the Greek Empires, this whole vision also serves as a type of what shall transpire at the time of the end of the present world order. So the 'end' referred to the absolute end."

10 J. C. Baldwin, *Daniel*, Tyndale Old Testament Commentaries (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1978), p. 162.

11 For example, W. R. A. Boyle, *The Inspiration of the Book of Daniel* (London: Rivingtons, 1863), p. 300; A. Clarke, *The Holy Bible*, 6 vols. (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, n.d.), 4:597.

12 For example, Robert Reid, *The Seven Last Plagues; or Vials of the Wrath of God* (Pittsburgh: D. and M. Mclean, 1828), p. 48; David N. Lord, *The Coming and Reign of Christ* (New York: Franklin Night, 1858), p. 390; Uriah Smith, *The Prophecies of Daniel and Revelation*, rev. ed. (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press, 1944), p. 144; F. D. Nichol, ed. *The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary*, 7 vols. (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald 1953-57), 4:841; George McCready Price, *The Greatest of the Prophets* (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press, 1955), p. 169; C. Mervyn Maxwell, *God Cares*, vol. 1 (Boise, ID: Pacific Press, 1981), p. 160; Gerhard F. Hasel, "The 'Little Horn,' the Saints and the Sanctuary in Daniel 8," *The Sanctuary and the Atonement*, eds. A. V. Wallenkampf and W. R. Leshner

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

(Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald, 1981), p. 190; W. H. Shea, "Unity of Daniel," in *Symposium on Daniel*, Daniel and Revelation Committee Series, vol. 2, ed. F. Holbrook (Washington, D.C.: Biblical Research Institute, 1986), pp. 189-190.

13 For example, Robert Nevin, *Studies in Prophecy* (Londonderry: James Montgomery, 1890), p. 82; H. N. Sargent, *The Marvels of Bible Prophecy* (London: Covenant Publishing, 1938), p. 167; E. Filmer, *Daniel's Predictions* (London: Regency Press, 1979), p. 92.

14 G. H. Pember, *The Great Prophecies of the Centuries Concerning Israel and the Gentiles* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1895), pp. 289-290; C. Larkin, *The Book of Daniel* (Philadelphia: C. Larkin, 1929), p. 140; A. E. Bloomfield, *The End of the Days* (Minneapolis, MN: Bethany Fellowship, 1981), p. 164.

15 Nevin, p. 79; Joseph Tanner, *Daniel and the Revelation* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1898), p. 524; U. Smith, p. 171; Price, 206; Nichol, 4:845; Bloomfield, p. 171; William H. Shea, *Selected Studies on Prophetic Interpretation*, Daniel and Revelation Committee Series, vol. 1 (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald, 1982), p. 60; G. F. Hasel, "The 'Little Horn,' the Heavenly Sanctuary, and the Time of the End," A Study of Daniel 8:9-14," *Symposium on Daniel*, DARCOM, vol. 2, ed. F. Holbrook (Washington, D.C.: Biblical Research Institute, 1986), p. 457.

16 The article and demonstrative pronoun indicate that there is a preceding point of reference. In this case the time of the events in 11:40-45, 45.

17 Apart from early books like the "book of Moses" (Mark 12:26), we find several heavenly books mentioned: (1) the book of life (Ps 69:28); (2) the book of remembrance (Mal 3:16); (3) the book of lamentation, mourning, and woe (Ezek 2:9, 10); (4) the flying scroll (Zech 5:1,2).

18 J. A. Montgomery, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Book of Daniel*, International Critical Commentary of the Holy Scriptures (Edinburgh: T. and T. Clark, 1927), p. 472. There is a possible link to the books (*siprin*) in Dan 7:10. In Rev 20:12-19 the book of life is used in the last judgment. In the judgment in Dan 7 books (plural) are opened which most likely include "the book of life," "the book of remembrance," and any other records required for this judgment.

19 See Friedrich Nötscher, *Altorientalischer und alttestamentlicher Auferstehungsglauben* (Würzburg, 1926; reprint, Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1970); Charles V. Pilcher, *The Hereafter in Jewish and Christian Thought* (New York: Macmillan, 1940); Edmund F. Sutcliffe, *The Old Testament and the Future Life* (London: Burnes Oates and Washbourne, 1946); H. Birkeland, "The Belief in the Resurrection of the Dead in the OT," *Studia Theologica* 3 (1950): pp. 60-78; Charles R. Smith, *The Bible Doctrine of the Hereafter* (London: Epworth, 1958); Robert Martin-Achard, *From Life to Death: A Study of the Development of the Doctrine of the Resurrection in the Old Testament*, trans. J. P. Smith (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1960); K. Schubert, "Die Entwicklung der Auferstehungslehre von der nachexilischen bis zur frührabbinischen Zeit," *Biblisches Zeitschrift* 6 (1962): 177-214; Nicholas J. Tromp, *Primitive Conceptions of Death and the Nether World in the Old Testament* (Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1969); George W. E. Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism*, Harvard Theological Studies 26 (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1972); Gerhard Hasel, "Resurrection in the Theology of OT Apocalyptic," *Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft* 92 (1980): 267-284; L. J. Greenspoon, "The Origin of the Idea of

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

Resurrection," *Traditions in Transformation*, ed. Baruch Halpern and Jon D. Levenson (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1981), pp. 247-321; M. S. Moore, "Resurrection and Immortality: Two Motifs Navigating Confluent Theological Streams in the Old Testament (Dan 12, 1-4)," *Theologische Zeitschrift* 39 (1983): 17-34. See further, Pfandl, 285, note 150.

20 Hasel, "Resurrection," p. 267; see also M. S. Moore, p. 18; James M. Lindenberger, "Dan 12:1-4" *Interpretation* 39 (1985): 186.

21 Hans Wildberger, *Jesaja*, 3 vols. Biblischer Kommentar Altes Testament (Neukirchen: Neukirchener Verlag, 1972-1982), 2:995; Joseph Jensen, *Isaiah 1-39*, Old Testament Message (Wilmington, DE: Michael Glazier, 1984), p. 207; Theodor H. Gaster, "Resurrection," *Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible*, 4 vols. (New York: Abingdon Press, 1962), 4:40.

22 A. S. Herbert, *Isaiah 1-39*, The Cambridge Bible Commentary (Cambridge: University Press, 1973), p. 156; J. Ridderbos, *Isaiah*, Bible Students Commentary, trans. J. Vriend (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1985), p. 213.

23 Ironside, 231; M. R. De Haan, *Daniel the Prophet* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1947), p. 307; Keith L. Brooks, *The Certain End* (Los Angeles: American Prophetic League, 1942), p. 56; Talbot, p. 215.

24 Young, p. 256; Leupold, p. 529; Walvoord, p. 284; Gleason L. Archer, "Daniel," *The Expositor's Bible Commentary*, vol. 7 (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1985), p. 152; Ford, *Daniel*, p. 281; Price, p. 328; Driver, p. 201; Charles, p. 327; Montgomery, p. 471; Norman Porteous, *Daniel*, 2nd ed., Old Testament Library (London: SCM Press, 1979), p. 170; Marti, p. 90; Aage Bentzen, *Daniel*, 2nd ed., Handbuch zum Alten Testament (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1952), p. 85; J. J. Collins, *The Apocalyptic Vision of the Book of Daniel*, Harvard Semitic Monographs 16 (Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1977), p. 172.

25 Thomas S. Kepler, *Dreams of the Future*, Bible Guides 22 (London: Lutterworth Press, 1963), p. 45. See also Louis F. Hartman and Alexander A. Di Lella, *The Book of Daniel*, Anchor Bible (New York: Doubleday and Co., 1978), p. 306; Jeffery, p. 544; J. R. Dummelow, ed., *A Commentary on the Holy Bible* (New York: McMillan Co., 1940), p. 544.

26 Hasel, "Resurrection," p. 279.

27 *Min* joined to a *nomen regens* which designates a human entity and is in construct with a spatial term: *w' rabbim mē'ammē ha'āreṣ*.

28 Hasel, "Resurrection," p. 279. On pp. 277-278 Hasel has an extended discussion on the various uses of *min* which have been proposed for Dan 12:2.

29 See charts at the end of this paper.

30 The Aramaic means literally, "another small horn," whereas the Hebrew says, "one horn from smallness."

31 H. H. Rowley, *Darius the Mede and the Four World Empires in the Book of Daniel* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press Board, 1959), p. 127. He applies both horns to Antiochus IV Epiphanes. See also André Lacocque, *The Book of Daniel* (Atlanta: John Knox Press, 1979), pp. 141, 161; Porteous, pp. 106, 124; Marti, pp. 51, 57; Montgomery, pp. 292, 333.

32 Shea, "Unity of Daniel," p. 187.

33 This is the interpretation of most Historicists and Futurists. See Young, p. 162; Leupold, p. 327; Maier, p. 297; Walvoord, p. 166; Price, pp. 147-148; Archer, p. 94; Ford, *Daniel*, p. 140.

34 Even the "prince who comes" (Dan 9:26) may be taken to be Christ and not Titus, since it is the people of the prince (the Jews) who caused the downfall

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

of Jerusalem through their rebellion against Rome. (See W. H. Shea, "The Prophecy of Daniel 9:24-27," in *The Seventy Weeks, Leviticus, and the Nature of Prophecy*, DARCOM, vol. 3, ed. Frank B. Holbrook [Washington, D.C.: Biblical Research Institute, 1986], p. 93, and others before him.)

35 In Dan 9:27, 11:31, and 12:11, the Hebrew reads *šiqqûš m'šomēm*, in Dan 8:13 *happeša' šomēm* is used. On the grammatical anomalies, see the discussion in Desmond Ford, *The Abomination of Desolation in Biblical Eschatology* (Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1979), pp. 149-150.

36 Since, in my view, Dan 12:11 uses Dan 11:31, the two must mean the same. Therefore, when Christ quoted Daniel 11:31 and referred it to the future, he clearly looked upon it as not yet fulfilled. (See Hasel, "The 'Little Horn', the Heavenly Sanctuary and the 'Time of the End': A Study of Daniel 8:9-14," p. 442; F. W. Burnett, *The Testament of Jesus-Sophia* [Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1981], p. 303, n. 1; J. C. Fenton, *The Gospel of Matthew* [Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1963], p. 387); Ford (*The Abomination of Desolation in Biblical Eschatology*, p. 164) believes that Christ viewed the times of Antiochus as prefigurative of what lay ahead.

37 Prince, pp. 149, 184; D. S. Russell, *Daniel*, Daily Study Bible Series (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1981), pp. 158, 209; Hartman, and Di Lella, pp. 237, 301.

38 Imp. of *sātam* "shut up" "hide" (Francis Brown, Samuel R. Driver; and Charles A. Briggs, *A Hebrew and English Lexicon of the Old Testament* [Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1907], p. 711; Water holes are "blocked" (2 Kgs 3:19, 25) and gaps in walls are "filled" (Neh 4:1). Figuratively the words of prophecy are "shut up" (Dan 8:26; 12:4, 9).

39 Imp. of *hātam* "seal," "seal up" (Brown, Driver, Briggs, p. 367). The word is used for the sealing of letters (1 Kgs 21:8) and documents (Jer 32:10). Isaiah 8:16 uses it metaphorically, "seal the instruction in the heart of my disciples." In our text it is probably used in the literal sense.

40 The term *šūt*, literally "rove about" (Brown, Driver, Briggs, p. 1002; Ludwig Koehler and Walter Baumgartner, *Lexicon in Veteris Testamenti Libros* [Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1958], p. 955), is used thirteen times in the OT (Abraham Even-Shoshan, *A New Concordance of the Bible* [Jerusalem: Kiryat Sefer, 1983], p. 1124) and describes Satan "roaming" the earth (Job 1:7; 2:2), the children of Israel "going round" gathering manna (Num 11:8), and the Lord's eyes "going to and fro" through all the land (Zech 4:10). Theodotion reads *heōs didachthōsin polloi* (until many are taught).

41 John R. Wilch, *Time and Event* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1969), p. 111.

42 This verse is largely parallel to Daniel 12:4. For individual word studies see above.

The word *ʾahʾrīt* here refers to the end or outcome of things as in Isaiah 46:10; 47:7; etc.

44 Wilch, p. 111.

45 Ibid.

46 Uriah Smith, *Daniel and Revelation*, rev. (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press, 1944), pp. 208-209, 256.

47 Taylor G. Bunch, *The Book of Daniel* (reprint, Payson, AZ: Leaves-of-Autumn Books, 1991), p. 21.

PFANDL: DANIEL'S "TIME OF THE END"

Chart A
Daniel 2, 7 and 8

| Dan 2 | Dan 7 | Dan 8 | Explanation |
|-----------------------------------|--|---|------------------------|
| 32. head of gold | 4. lion | | 2:38 Babylon |
| 32. breast of silver | 5. bear | 3. ram-one horn | 8:20 Medo-Persia |
| 32. thighs of bronze | 6. leopard | 5. he-goat | 8:21 Greece |
| | -dominion given | 7. he smote | |
| | -four heads | 8. four horns | |
| 33. legs of iron | 7. a terrible beast | 9. (little horn) | |
| 40. strong as iron | -iron teeth | | |
| -breaks and crushes | -devoured and broke in pieces | | |
| 33. feet of iron and clay | 7. ten horns | | 2:41 divided kingdom |
| | 8. little horn | 9. little horn | |
| | 21. persecutes saints | 10. stamps on the host of heaven | |
| | 25. speaks against the most high | 11. magnified itself even to the prince of the host | |
| | 25. three and a half times | 14. two thousand three hundred days | |
| 34. stone cut without hands | 26. he shall be consumed | 25. he shall be broken without hands | |
| 35. stone became a great mountain | 27. kingdom given to the saints = an everlasting kingdom | | 2:44 kingdom of heaven |

JOURNAL OF THE ADVENTIST THEOLOGICAL SOCIETY

Chart B

Daniel 8, 9 and 10-12

Dan 8

2. at the river Ulai
3. I raised my eyes and saw,
and behold
8. the great horn was broken –
four horns toward four winds
of heaven
9. the little horn which grew
exceedingly great – toward the
glorious land
11. the daily sacrifice was
taken away – place of his
sanctuary was overthrown –
prince of the host

13. the transgression that
makes desolate

16. Gabriel makes this man
understand the vision
17. the vision is for the time of
the end
19. the latter end of the indig-
nation
24. he shall even rise up
against the Prince of princes
25. by no human hand, he shall
be broken
26. the vision is true

Dan 9

27. sacrifice and offering to
cease
26. shall destroy . . . the sanc-
tuary
25. an anointed one, a prince
27. upon the wings of abomi-
nation shall come one who
makes desolate
21-23 Gabriel . . . I have come
to give you understanding
26. unto the end

26. an anointed one shall be
cut off

Dan 10-12

10:4 at the great river
10:5 I lifted up my eyes and
looked and behold
11:4 his kingdom shall be
broken – divided toward the
four winds of heaven
11:23 he shall become strong
with a small people
11:16 the glorious land
11:31 shall take away the daily
offering

11:22 the prince of the cove-
nant
11:31 the abomination that
makes desolate

11:35 till the time of the end

11:36 until the indignation is
accomplished
11:22 the prince of the cove-
nant shall be broken
11:45 he shall come to his end

10:1 the word is true