Exemplary Bilingual Teachers in Puerto Rico: a Multiple-Case Study

Aurea Laracuente Araújo
Andrews University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations

Recommended Citation
Araújo, Aurea Laracuente, "Exemplary Bilingual Teachers in Puerto Rico: a Multiple-Case Study" (2002). Dissertations. 195.
https://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/dissertations/195

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Research at Digital Commons @ Andrews University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Andrews University. For more information, please contact repository@andrews.edu.
Thank you for your interest in the Andrews University Digital Library of Dissertations and Theses.

Please honor the copyright of this document by not duplicating or distributing additional copies in any form without the author’s express written permission. Thanks for your cooperation.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

ProQuest Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600

UMI®
EXEMPLARY BILINGUAL TEACHERS IN PUERTO RICO:
A MULTIPLE-CASE STUDY

A Dissertation
Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by

Aurea Laracuente Araújo

June 2002
EXEMPLARY BILINGUAL TEACHERS IN PUERTO RICO:
A MULTIPLE CASE STUDY

A Dissertation
presented in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

by

Aurea Laracuente Araújo

APPROVAL BY THE COMMITTEE:

Chair: Judy Anderson
Co-chair: Shirley Freed
Member: Louise Moon
External: Robert Moon

Interim Dean, School of Education

Date Approved: July 25, 2002
ABSTRACT

EXEMPLARY BILINGUAL TEACHERS IN PUERTO RICO:
A MULTIPLE-CASE STUDY

by

Aurea Laracuente Araújo

Co-chair: Judy Anderson
Co-chair: Shirley Freed
ABSTRACT OF GRADUATE STUDENT RESEARCH

Dissertation

Andrews University

School of Education

Title: EXEMPLARY BILINGUAL TEACHERS IN PUERTO RICO:
A MULTIPLE-CASE STUDY

Name of researcher: Aurea Laracuente Araújo

Name and degree of faculty co-chairs: Judy Anderson, Ph.D., Shirley Freed, Ph.D.

Date completed: June 2002

Problem

Within a context of inadequate pre-service training, insufficient administrative support, and an ambivalent social environment regarding the teaching of ESL in Puerto Rico, a number of conscientious bilingual teachers try to overcome the odds of the system and have an impact on students’ ability to speak English. Some even become exemplary teachers. How do they learn to meet so many expectations successfully in spite of real shortcomings found in their job, and how do they acquire the skills and competencies necessary to be exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico?
Method

A qualitative multiple-case study design was used for this research. Two elementary and two intermediate bilingual teachers were observed and interviewed during the course of one school year. Their training, classroom practices, and life experiences are described in narrative form.

Results

All four teachers were found to have exemplary practice, according to NABE (1992) and the Puerto Rican Teachers Association (1976) standards, in spite of insufficient pre-service training in their area of specialization and inadequate administrative support. Further analysis of similarities and differences in the teachers' experiences led to the emergence of themes such as their moral sensibility and sense of calling to the teaching vocation that made them search for ways to make up for their limitations in terms of training and administrative support. Each of the four had substantiated learning experiences in the United States. While the local communities appeared to support bilingual education, the larger context of bilingual education in Puerto Rico is not supported by a unified national agenda.

Conclusions

The teachers in this study continue their personal and professional growth because they embrace it as a personal mission and as a moral act. Their life experiences strongly influence their ability to provide exemplary education to Puerto Ricans.
DEDICATION

To my husband Ramón, and my children—Myrna, Sandra, Marisol, and Ramón Alberto whose love and support made my journey endurable

To my Master Methodologist—Jesus Christ—who permanently and lovingly stayed by my side, shedding light, providing strength, ideas, and direction. To Him be the glory!
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The completion of this endeavor was a reality thanks to people who unselfishly devoted their time to help me achieve my goal. I express my gratitude

To Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene, whose willingness to share their stories made this research possible

To Dr. Shirley Freed, Dr. Judy Anderson, Dr. Judy Barceló, and Dr. Louise Moon, who guided and supported my study with patience, corrections, and more patience

To Sandra and Jaime for their technical support in the preparation of this document and also in the visual aids for the oral defense of my dissertation.

To the Antillean University and Montemorelos University Cohort, who throughout our journey together provided the encouragement, companionship, and friendship so essential in this kind of venture

Thanks to all.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ................................................... viii

Chapter
1. INTRODUCTION ........................................... 1
   Background to the Problem ............................................. 1
   Pre-Service Training .................................................... 4
   Administrative Support ................................................ 7
   Community Support ..................................................... 7
   Personal Attributes and Life Experiences ....................... 9
   Statement of the Problem ............................................. 10
   Purpose of the Study .................................................. 10
   Research Questions ................................................... 11
   Significance of the Study ............................................. 11
   Definitions of Terms .................................................. 12
   General Methodology ................................................ 14
   Limitations of the Study ............................................. 14
   Summary ................................................................. 14
   Overview of the Study ................................................. 15

2. LITERATURE REVIEW ........................................ 17
   Introduction .......................................................... 17
   Social Environment .................................................. 17
   Bilingualism in Puerto Rico: Historical and Political Perspective ..................................................... 18
   New Bilingual Programs ............................................. 20
   Pre-Service Bilingual Teacher Education ...................... 22
   Standards for bilingual Education ................................. 25
   Institutional Resources, Coordination, and Commitment .......................................................... 27
   Recruitment, Advisement, and Retention of Potential Teachers ..................................................... 27
   Bilingual/Multicultural Coursework and Curriculum .......................................................... 28

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Language Proficiency in Both Languages and Ability to Teach in Those Languages .......... 31
Fieldwork and Practicum Experiences in Bilingual and Multicultural Classrooms .......... 32
Life-long Learning and Commitment to Professional Development ..................... 33
Bilingual Teacher Education in Puerto Rico .................................................. 35
Administrative Support .................................................................................. 36
Personal Characteristics and Life Experiences ............................................. 40
Moral Sensibility .......................................................................................... 41
Vocation ......................................................................................................... 43
Sources of Vocation ....................................................................................... 44
Professional Growth and Satisfaction .......................................................... 45
Public Obligation ............................................................................................ 46
Service ............................................................................................................ 48
Implications for Teacher Education ............................................................ 49
Life Experiences ............................................................................................ 52
Summary .......................................................................................................... 54

3. METHODOLOGY ......................................................................................... 55

Introduction ...................................................................................................... 55
Research Questions .......................................................................................... 55
Study Design ..................................................................................................... 56
Participants ......................................................................................................... 57
Data Collection Techniques ........................................................................... 59
  Self as Research Instrument ........................................................................ 59
  Procedure for Data Collection .................................................................... 61
  Gregorc’s Style Delineator ........................................................................ 62
  Interviews ....................................................................................................... 63
  Questionnaire ................................................................................................. 65
  Observations .................................................................................................. 65
  Data Files ......................................................................................................... 67
Data Analysis ...................................................................................................... 67
Credibility and Trustworthiness ....................................................................... 68
Generalization ................................................................................................... 70
Human Subjects Considerations ...................................................................... 71

4. CASE STUDIES .......................................................................................... 73

Introduction ...................................................................................................... 73
Going Public With an Extraordinary Team .................................................... 74
  The School ...................................................................................................... 75
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language Proficiency in Spanish and English</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of Different Methods to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach in Both Languages</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of Developmental and Growth Patterns of Children</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding and Acceptance of All Cultures Represented</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question #2</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Service Training</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Support</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Environment</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question #3</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Experiences</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Characteristics</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Educators</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Administrators</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual Teachers</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggestions for Further Research</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. LETTERS</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. INFORMED CONSENT FORM MEMBER CHECK</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. QUESTIONNAIRE</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. TEMPLATES</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. ADDITIONAL INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCE LIST</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
LIST OF TABLES

1. Bilingual/Multicultural Coursework and Curriculum ........................................ 29
2. Willingness to Participate in Innovative Programs ............................................. 147
3. Knowledge and Use of Both Languages ............................................................. 150
4. Knowledge of Different Methods to Teach Second and Native Languages .... 153
5. Knowledge of Developmental and Growth Patterns of Children ..................... 156
6. Understanding and Acceptance of All Cultures Represented in the Community .......................................................... 158
7. Language-Related Issues Included in Pre-Service Training ............................. 161
8. Instructional Issues Included in Pre-Service Training ..................................... 163
9. Multicultural Issues Included in Pre-Service Training .................................... 165
10. Handling Limited Training and Staff Development ....................................... 169
11. Alternate Ways for Procuring Resources ....................................................... 171
12. Gregorc's Style Delineator ............................................................................ 177
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background to the Problem

Puerto Rico, a territory of the United States, has experienced conflict over the use of the English language since 1898. The “movement against the teaching of English” has influenced the education system and bilingual education policymakers with policies changing as readily as the government in power (Gutiérrez, 1987).

Alicia Pousada (1993) describes what she sees as contributing factors to this language conflict:

A number of factors have contributed to the long-standing conflict between Spanish and English in Puerto Rico. Among them are: the historical imposition of English as part of a heavy-handed Americanization plan, the critical role of party politics in the consideration of linguistic and cultural questions, the socioeconomic schisms in Puerto Rican society and their linguistic and educational ramifications, and a host of pedagogical problems that stem from an overly centralized and politicized school system in economic crisis. (p. 500)

However, Melvin Resnick (1993) says that the language conflict is not a conflict of politics or education, although these are the battlegrounds of the conflict. “It is the conflict of a people—a nation—that defends its existence against the real and perceived political and economic pressures that would force all U. S. citizens to learn English” (p. 271).

Resnick (1993) asks and tries to answer the questions that are in everybody’s minds: “Why have successive school language policies all met with failure? Why, after
nearly a century of intensive government planning for bilingualism, can no more than some 20% of the Island’s population function effectively in English?" (p. 265).

According to Resnick, the many studies that were commissioned to investigate and bring light to this issue all came to the same general conclusion: “deficiencies in textbooks, methods, and teacher preparation,” although he goes on to explain that in reality “the textbooks, methods, and teacher preparation have not been so different from what has been available in the U.S. and in other countries; they have been, at least, the best available for their time” (p. 265).

When we read the early reports and publications of numerous Puerto Rican and Mainland educators who worked in the island’s school system, we discover a surprisingly high level of linguistic and pedagogical sophistication, with insights that are now important principles of language planning, contrastive analysis, error analysis, and communicative methodology. (p. 265)

Contrary to this statement about the quality of methods and textbooks, the Puerto Rican Department of Education (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997) acknowledges that there is a problem in this area. Based on several studies cited in the Government’s document, the reasons claimed to explain the “alarming reality” were: obsolete methodology, teaching materials, school organization, teacher preparation, and lack of staff development programs, among others (p. 7). In other words, the reasons for having negative statistics about the learning of English in Puerto Rico pointed at teacher preparation (methodology, teaching materials) and administrative support (school organization, teaching materials, staff development), besides the sociological factors mentioned by Resnick (1993).

On the other hand, very few universities in Puerto Rico offer a Bachelor’s Degree in English for the elementary level (Departamento de Educación, 1997a). Such a degree
requires prospective teachers to take—among other courses—only a three-credit course in the Teaching of English as a Second Language. These attempts do not seem enough as stated by the Education Department in Puerto Rico in the document “Project for the Development of a Bilingual Citizen” (Departamento de Educación, 1997).

“Approximately 10,000 teachers teach English in Puerto Rico. However, only a little over 50% are certified. The case is more critical in the elementary schools where most teachers are certified only as elementary teachers” (p. 3). The same proportion remained true at the end of the 1999-2000 school year (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 2000a). This situation is used to explain why the results of the 1990 census demonstrated that only about 20% of the Island’s population had mastered the basics skills for communicating in English (Pousada, 1993).

Yet, conscientious bilingual teachers continue to try to overcome the odds of the system and have an impact on students’ ability to speak English. Some even become exemplary teachers. How does that happen?

As indicated by the Department of Education of Puerto Rico (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997) and others, (Gutiérrez, 1987; Pousada, 1993; Resnick, 1993) there are several major aspects that influence the development of an effective bilingual teacher in Puerto Rico: pre-service training, administration support, and community support. P. J. Palmer (1998) points at a different angle and says, “Good teaching cannot be reduced to technique; good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher” (p. 10), thus including the life experiences of the teacher as one element of effective practice. In the following section, I discuss several aspects that influence teacher effectiveness in general, and in particular, for bilingual teachers,
including training, administrative support, community support, personal attributes, and life experiences.

Pre-service Training

Pre-service teacher training is one of the components for teacher proficiency, as has been proposed by authorities in the field (Darling-Hammond, 1996, 1997, 2000; Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997; Goodlad, 1992, 1999, 2000). In *What Matters Most*, the National Commission on Teaching and America’s Future (NCTAF, 1996) reported, “Teacher expertise is the single most important determinant of student achievement. Recruiting, preparing, and retaining good teachers is the central strategy for improving our schools” (p. 5).


On the other hand, a recent study, sponsored by the U. S. Department of Education, shows that there are serious disagreements about what it means for teachers to be well qualified and about what it takes to prepare teachers well (Wilson, Floden & Ferrini-Mundy, 2002). In their review of research about teacher education, Wilson et al. stated,

> We found no reports meeting our selection criteria that directly assessed prospective teachers’ subject matter knowledge and evaluated the relationship between teacher subject matter preparation and student learning. To date,
researchers... have relied on proxies for subject matter knowledge, such as majors or coursework. The conclusions of the few studies in this area are especially provocative because they undermine the certainty often expressed about the strong link between college study of a subject matter and teacher quality. (p. 191)

Besides the knowledge of subject matter, Wilson et al. (2001) also included the area of pedagogical knowledge in their research. In response to their question, "What are the effects of pedagogical preparation?" they said,

We found no research that directly assesses what teachers learn in their pedagogical preparation and then evaluates the relationship of that pedagogical knowledge to student learning or teacher behavior. Research on pedagogical preparation has remained at a high level of aggregation, giving little information about possible differences across grade level or subject area. At this level, the research suggests some benefit of pedagogical preparation, but the measurements used make it difficult to see clear associations. (p. 193)

Several authors agree that schools of education are somewhat behind in the development of effective programs for teachers in general (Finn, 2001; Fullan, 1996; Stotsky, 2001). Finn (2001), president of the Thomas B. Fordham Foundation makes the case that education schools themselves are the major barrier to improving the quality of our teaching force. He says, "Ed schools typically do not teach teachers (or administrators) the things those people need to know to be effective in their jobs" (p. 64).

Previously the NCTAF (1996) reported, "The profession has worked to redesign teacher preparation programs over the last decade, and many colleges of education are integrating new standards for students and teachers into the curriculum, incorporating new knowledge, and creating extended internships" (p. 52). Conversely, Linda Darling-Hammond (1997). Executive Director of the National Commission on Teaching and America's Future (NCTAF), declared 1 year later:

Thus far, these new programs are available to only about 25% of entering teachers. Another 50% are in colleges that have not yet made major changes in their preparation programs, and a shocking 25% are entering teaching with little
Bilingual education programs are even more limited than regular teacher education programs. According to Macias (1989), the training of bilingual teachers has received less attention than others, in spite of many reform movements.

The national movement to reform education has paid much attention to teacher preparation and development in general, and to science and mathematics teacher shortages in particular. Little attention, however, has been paid to the preparation and development of bilingual teachers. (p. 1)

Clark-Riojas (1990) described some factors that are needed for a bilingual program to be effective.

Numerous factors contribute to the successful implementation of bilingual education programs, and experience has shown that the quality of the teaching staff is particularly important. Well prepared bilingual teachers and staff who speak the native language and understand the home culture appear to have the most direct influence on the cognitive and affective growth of students whose primary language is other than English. (p. 367)

To meet the need for well-structured bilingual education programs, the National Association for Bilingual Education (NABE) published its professional standards in 1992. These guidelines are expected to orient schools of education regarding the elements needed for an adequate preparation of bilingual teachers.

In general terms, teacher education programs can be a significant part of the preparation needed for effective teaching when schools of education teach what is most needed. According to Finn, that is “deep knowledge of the content of the subjects they are responsible for imparting to their pupils, plus practical ways of delivering that knowledge in classroom settings and practical techniques of classroom management” (p. 63)
Administrative Support

Another component of bilingual teacher proficiency may be found in the support received for in-service development from administrators, mentors, and peers. "Ultimately, the quality of teaching depends not only on the qualities of those who enter and stay, but also on workplace factors" (Darling-Hammond, 1997, p. 9).

In the case of bilingual education, Macias (1989) thinks that a paradigm shift could occur with the "training for administrators and school site staff for support and collaboration, within a context of school change" (p. 3). Accordingly, "this paradigm shift is especially critical in in-service training of currently employed teachers" (p. 3).

The resources that are made available and the plans for continuous education may also be part of the support system of the bilingual teacher in order to maintain—or acquire—the desired level of proficiency. When this essential is not present, teachers and students alike suffer for it. "The lack of structured professional assistance to beginning teachers in most school systems causes untold amounts of misery for these teachers and their students" (Chase, 1998, p. 18). Darling-Hammond (1997) expounds, "Teachers who have access to teacher networks, enriched professional roles, and collegial work feel more positive about staying in the profession" (p. 9).

Community Support

As important as school support for the teacher, is the support received from the community. What is the attitude towards bilingualism/multiculturalism? What are the expectations from parents, and from the community in general? Pousada (1996) says that as a result of the language controversy existing in Puerto Rico, bilingual teachers are seen both as "purveyors of U.S. colonialism and agents of cultural destruction and as liberators..."
and providers of marketable skills” (p. 500). She goes on to explain how teachers are also bombarded and blamed for the “poor showing of Puerto Rican students in English” (p. 500). Resnick (1993) is more explicit and states that the greatest impediment faced by the ESL teacher in Puerto Rico has been the public’s resistance to learning English.

Another aspect is the students themselves. Their response towards the learning of a second language has been found to influence the bilingual teacher’s proficiency (Raymond, 2000). In many cases, their age and their grade may determine the level of acceptance of the teacher and the subject, thus sometimes deterring the teacher from using methods and approaches estimated to be successful (pp. 23-24).

Several studies were conducted in New York University and The Pennsylvania State University about the perceptions and attitudes of Puerto Rican students towards English (Caratini-Soto, 1997; Meléndez, 1997; Rodriguez-Galarza, 1997; and Rosa, 1997). The results of such studies confirmed Epstein’s (1963) seminal survey about the teaching of English in Puerto Rico. To synthesize,

Language attitudes in the learner, the peer group, the school, and society at large can have an enormous effect on the second language learning process, both positive and negative. It is vital that teachers and students examine and understand these attitudes. In particular, they need to understand that learning a second language does not mean giving up one’s first language or dialect. Rather, it involves adding a new language or dialect to one’s repertoire. (Walqui, 2000, p. 2)

On the positive side, there are many parents who see learning English as a means for upward mobility, according to Pousada (1993). These parents not only support the teaching of English, but also are willing to pay the high cost of private education when the public system does not provide for their needs.
Even when diverse perceptions may be present in different communities, it is thought that community attitudes and expectations may be a strong factor in determining the level of effectiveness achieved by a teacher.

Personal Attributes and Life Experiences

Personal characteristics and values of the teacher may well play a role in the achievement of proficiency on the job. Bilingual teachers as well as regular teachers need to face their limitations as well as their capabilities (Palmer, 1998). They are expected to face their own attitudes and feelings about their job (Cochrane, 1988). They are also expected to feel capable of teaching and be skilled in maintaining good interpersonal relationships with good communication skills. In addition to that, good teachers are aware of their own attitude toward diverse learners. In this regard, Cummins (1997) says:

Educators’ interactions with pupils reflect the ways they have defined their own roles or identities as educators. Role definitions refer to the mindset of expectations, assumptions and goals that educators bring to the task of educating culturally diverse students. These role definitions determine the way educators view pupils’ possibilities and the messages they communicate to pupils with regard to the contributions they can make to their societies. (p. 110)

Previous experiences in life and learning affect a teacher’s present performance. It would be wise to assume that teachers’ approaches to teaching have been influenced by the way they were taught. According to Raymond (2000), pre-service language teachers do not come to their training programs as “blank slates,” and explains:

Pre-service teachers have expectations and beliefs about what it means to be a foreign language teacher and a foreign language learner, based on their own experiences as language learners in formal and informal language learning situations. These language-learning experiences, which may have been positive or negative, influence the pre-service teachers’ images of the teachers they want to be or do not want to be. (p. 4)
In summary, many elements can affect the proficiency level achieved by a bilingual teacher. Among them are: the training received before entering the practice, the support they receive once on the job in terms of continuous education services and the provision of resources, the social context that surrounds the teaching of a second language, and last, but not least, the personal attributes the teacher brings in the way of characteristics, disposition, and capabilities together with previous life experiences.

**Statement of the Problem**

Within a context of inadequate pre-service training, insufficient administrative support, and an ambivalent social environment regarding the teaching of English as a second language in Puerto Rico, a number of conscientious bilingual teachers continue to try to overcome the odds of the system and have an impact on students’ ability to speak English. Some even become exemplary teachers. How does that happen? How do teachers learn to meet so many expectations successfully in spite of real shortcomings found in their job? How do they acquire the skills and competencies necessary to be exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico?

**Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of this study was to seek to understand how exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico develop their high level of competency in spite of existing limitations such as insufficient training, inadequate administrative support, and ambivalent social environment.
Research Questions

The following questions were formulated to guide my study about exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico:

1. What evidence is there of bilingual education standards in classrooms that have been identified as exemplary?
2. In what ways do teacher training, administrative support, and community response contribute to exemplary practice?
3. How do life experiences and personal characteristics contribute to exemplary teaching?

Significance

Schools of education in the United States and in Puerto Rico are working towards strengthening their bilingual teacher education programs to meet the call for educational reform. Thus, understanding the elements that have enhanced or deterred a teacher from achieving excellence is a priority for teacher educators. The results of this study may help explore more possibilities for teacher training, and the following actions could be expected:

1. Bilingual teachers may achieve a better understanding of the experiences that contribute to their level of proficiency and will act accordingly to enhance their practice.
2. Schools of education will receive feedback as to what makes an exemplary bilingual teacher, and might find ways to incorporate this understanding into their pre-service training programs.
3. More resources could be allocated in order to provide for the professional development of already employed bilingual teachers, aiming at promoting excellence in teacher performance.

**Definitions of Terms**


**Biculturalism:** A functioning awareness and participation in two contrasting socio-cultures, values, and statuses. A person can attain biculturalism without being bilingual.

**Bilingual education:** Several modalities exist under the umbrella of bilingual education, each one being used in Puerto Rico in different schools:

1. **English as a second language only:** with the regular treatment of non-language subjects, which would be taught in Spanish. ESL is taught during one period of 45-50 minutes daily.

2. **Two-way bilingual:** English is used as vehicle of instruction in several subjects, usually fine arts, science, and mathematics, while language arts, social studies, and any other subjects are taught in Spanish.

3. **Immersion:** Instruction is entirely in English. Teachers strive to deliver lessons in simplified English so that students learn English and academic subjects. In some schools, the level of teaching is that of native English. All subjects are taught in English, except for the Spanish language and in some cases, the History of Puerto Rico.
**Bilingualism:** Facility in the use of two languages, ranging from a minimal knowledge of either language to a high level of proficiency in both.

**Communicative competence:** Ability to recognize and to produce authentic and appropriate language correctly and fluently in any situation; use of language in realistic, everyday settings (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 2000b).

**Content standards:** Statements that define what one is expected to know and be able to do in a given content area (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 2000b).

**ESL:** English as a second language.

**EFL:** English as a foreign language taught where it is not the native tongue.

**EAL:** English as an additional language. This term has basically the same meaning of the previous two. It has been adopted as a more politically correct term with the intention of not offending by assigning any specific order to the language being learned.

**Language Proficiency:** The level of competence at which an individual is able to use language for both basic and communicative tasks and academic purposes (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 2000b).

**Natural Approach:** Proposes instructional techniques that facilitate the natural acquisition of language and is based on two basic principles: Speech is not taught directly, but rather acquired by understanding what is being communicated (comprehensive input) in low anxiety environments; speech emerges in natural stages focusing on successful expression of meaning rather than correctness of form (Krashen & Terrell, 1994).
Second language context: Where the target language is spoken in the surrounding milieu.

TESOL: A professional organization for Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages.

General Methodology

This study is qualitative in nature and follows a multi-case study design with the purpose of finding out how exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico develop a high level of competency. The data collection techniques include interviews, observations, documents, and a questionnaire.

Limitations of the Study

I limited my study to four bilingual teachers in one of the Educational Regions of Puerto Rico because of the intensity of the case study design. There was also a clear limitation in choosing a sample by recommendation. Even when I used some indicators of teacher excellence, there was always a possibility that recommendations of exemplary teachers could be based on wrong assumptions about what exemplary teaching is. However, with the varied techniques for data collection, I verified the themes found in the study.

Summary

Many issues interact in the development of excellent teachers, but we do not know how they take shape in each individual case. Teacher educators may be interested in extending their understanding of this problem. This is a qualitative research inquiry following a case study design to find out how four bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico
became exemplary in their profession in spite of the limitations they face in terms of training, administrative support, and ambivalent social context.

Overview of the Study

Chapter 1 is a brief introduction to the study which focuses on elements that contribute to excellent performance by bilingual teachers. The statement of the problem, purpose of the study, research questions, and a statement about its significance are included in this chapter, as well as a brief description of the general methodology.

The review of literature pertaining to the basic components for effective bilingual teacher education is the core of chapter 2. It includes a section on bilingualism in Puerto Rico explaining issues of history and politics. Theories, key concepts, and current ideas on bilingual education are also addressed to give the reader a clearer picture of what it means to become a bilingual teacher in Puerto Rico. A section on administrative support and personal characteristics as components to be considered is also included.

Chapter 3 is a comprehensive description of the methodology applied in this qualitative study. It includes participants, sampling procedures, data collection techniques, and a discussion of the data analysis procedures that were followed.

Chapter 4 presents the stories of the teachers who participated in the study. It includes their personal profile, professional training, evidences of the application of standards in their classroom, and other data collected from interviews, observations, and documents.

Chapter 5 is the cross-case analysis. The themes that emerged from the teachers' stories are analyzed and categorized.
Chapter 6 brings in a summary of the study together with the implications of the findings. It also includes recommendations for bilingual teachers, teacher educators, and school administrators, and recommendations for further research. The last section is presents the conclusions of the study.
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

Achieving excellence in teaching is of most importance for an educational system to reach its goals. In this chapter, I review the literature concerning four of the basic issues in the formation of a bilingual teacher of excellence, according to what has been proposed by teacher educators (Darling-Hammond, 1996; Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997; Fullan, 2002; Hargreaves, 1999; Palmer, 1999, 2000). They are: social environment, pre-service training, administrative support, and personal characteristics.

Social Environment

Teachers do not work in a social vacuum. Even when they close their doors to the noise outside, the influences of society find their way into their classrooms. Bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico are not an exception. Their teaching is heavily impacted by the way the community perceives the job being done in the school. Pousada (1993) states that ESL teachers in Puerto Rico must face the issue of students’ negativity before they “can even contemplate teaching structures and norms of appropriateness” (p. 500). She continues to emphasize that “without appropriate motivation, little learning can take place, regardless of methods or materials” (p. 500).
Following is a review of the literature about the social forces that interact in
Puerto Rico regarding the teaching of a second language.

Bilingualism in Puerto Rico: Historical
and Political Perspective

Bilingual education in Puerto Rico is not new. Since the United States’ military
occupation in 1898, the teaching of English has become an important goal in government
planning. The lack of success in this regard is seen by some as a political problem, as is
expressed by Alvin Rubinstein, a professor of political science.

As American citizens since 1917, Puerto Ricans have political and civic
advantages not available to foreign immigrants. Nonetheless, they have been
slower to assimilate into American society than any other Spanish-speaking
immigrant group, and their ambivalence toward full ‘Americanization’ sets Puerto
Rico apart as a unique domestic and foreign policy problem. (2001, p. 415)

During the first 50 years of American government on the Island, education was
visibly a plan for acculturation, and the schools were of necessity the best means of
introducing and spreading English. Numerous replacements of education officials and
disruptive shifts between English and Spanish were the norm (Gutiérrez, 1987). The
Government thought that using English for instruction would speed up the acquisition of
the language and due assimilation of the American culture, but the Puerto Ricans resented
it (Resnick, 1993). During those years, none of the commissioners of education, directly
appointed by the President of the United States, succeeded in the bilingualization of
Puerto Rico. This period was, in the words of John Fisher (1971), “a history of
frustration” (p. 19).

In 1947, Puerto Ricans elected their first governor of the Island, who by right
would appoint the commissioners of education. Spanish became immediately the medium of instruction in all grades, and English was taught as any other subject for one period a day. Until today, "English is a mandatory subject in schools and colleges and increasingly a requirement for work in commerce, technology, and the professions" (Pousada, 1993, p. 499).

Resnick (1993) maintains his theory of "motivated failure" to explain the resistance of many Puerto Ricans to learn English. This theory implies that the majority of people in Puerto Rico have purposefully denied themselves the opportunity of learning English as a second language because of their fear of losing their national identity (p. 271).

The issue of national identity is a strong one and needs to be taken into consideration, because the status of Puerto Rico has inhibited or facilitated (depending on one's political preferences) the development of the identity of the Puerto Rican, according to Vancelette El-Koury (1997), and this factor has been found to be a deterrent in the people's willingness to learn English.

In essence, although they agree that English is important, "many covertly resist learning it out of nationalistic loyalty to Spanish" (Pousada, 1993, p. 500). More so, "a recent poll showed that 91 percent of the people think of themselves as Puerto Ricans first and Americans second," declared Rafael Hernández Colon in 1990, who was the governor at the time (as cited in Rubinstein, 2001, p. 418). In 1991, the legislature led by the Governor overwhelmingly approved "a bill that made Spanish the island's single official language, thereby revoking the Official Languages Act of 1902, which designated both English and Spanish as the languages of government" (Rubinstein, 2001, p. 417). It
was a short-lived legislation that was revoked 2 years later, in 1993, by the new governor, Dr. Pedro Roselló, from the pro-statehood party. Both Spanish and English again became the official languages in Puerto Rico.

New Bilingual Programs

Notwithstanding politics, for many Puerto Ricans learning English is a need regardless of the ties with the United States, as a means for success in our modern society. For a number of decades, affluent parents have sought to enroll their children in private bilingual schools so they would be prepared for a more demanding future (Andreu-Iglesias, 1962; Epstein, 1970; Pousada, 1993; Rodriguez-Morales, 1963). Nonetheless, for the rest of the population acquiring a bilingual education is still an uphill endeavor, and public schools continue to teach English and to try different plans in order to provide the language tools that everyone needs in this new century.

Recent efforts have been doubled to provide equal advantages to all Puerto Ricans, and more bilingual teachers are being recruited to meet the demand. The Project to Develop the Bilingual Citizen, a program implanted by the pro-statehood Secretary of Education—Dr. Victor Fajardo—in 1997, was the newest way to establish model bilingual schools where all children could have access to a two-language education.

According to the official document:

The Department of Education proposes to initiate a multidisciplinary, integrated plan that includes several instructional alternatives conducive to the development of bilingual citizens. . . . Students will be able to develop thinking and communication skills in Spanish and English, and will also develop their sensibility. (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997)

The document describes the need for educational reform in Puerto Rico, which is directly focused on bilingual education. Results of fairly recent statistics (1995-1996)
show that 90% of the students in the public school system have not developed the basic English language skills to be able to use English effectively in oral or written discourse. "The reality is that the Puerto Rican children are not learning enough English in our public school system" (p. 6). This statement makes a difference between the quality of teaching in the public and the private systems, and it is one of the reasons why many parents choose to pay the high educational costs charged by a number of private schools to provide a bilingual education for their children (Pousada, 1993).

The Bilingual Citizen Project (1997) proposed several stages to accomplish its goal. The priority for the first stage was the primary level (K-3) with a dual-language modality. Other aspects that characterized the new policy were: (a) strong emphasis in reading in Spanish and in English, (b) study block schedules, (c) integration of science and mathematics, (d) laboratory immersion periods for intermediate and high-school students, (e) teachers' professional enhancement, (f) teacher-exchange programs, and (g) the review and enrichment of the relationship between instruction and supervision (p. 2).

Two years later (1999-2000), there were 17 bilingual schools and 130 schools with the prescribed dual-language instruction program, which teaches mathematics and science in English (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 2000a, pp. 35, 36).

Presently, it is impossible to say whether the Bilingual Citizen Project will continue since it is seen as a political maneuver of the last government, which represented the opposite political party of the current government of Puerto Rico. In the meantime, there are a growing number of private schools offering a bilingual program, while most public schools still maintain the ESL approach.
Pre-Service Bilingual Teacher Education

Education in general has been the target of many calls for reform, and the government, as well as public and academic organizations, is interested in establishing standards of excellence as one of the ways in which those calls for reform can be met. Teacher education is one of the pillars of educational reform. If students are expected to excel and meet new goals for the 21st century—like learning a second language—then teacher expertise must extend beyond knowledge of subject matter and even the skills to teach it, and teachers must be educated accordingly (Darling-Hammond, 1997).

Several years ago, the National Commission on Teaching and America’s Future (NCTAF, 1996) presented its report showing that school reform cannot succeed unless it focuses on “creating the conditions in which teachers can teach, and teach well” (p. 9). Although this statement seems obvious to the eyes of those interested in education, actually it is very far from reality in many schools both in the United States and Puerto Rico.

The report goes on to say that, in spite of everyone’s agreement on the need of teachers who know their subjects, understand their students and what they need, and have developed the skills required to make learning come alive, a number of barriers have impeded the achievement of this goal. Among these barriers, major flaws in teacher preparation contribute to teacher ineffectiveness (Darling-Hammond, 2000).

Over the past decade, public dissatisfaction with schools has included dissatisfaction with teacher education. Education schools have been variously criticized as ineffective in preparing teachers for their work, unresponsive to new demands, remote from practice, and barriers to the recruitment of bright college students into teaching. (p. 166)
Notwithstanding, one of the provisions of the recently reauthorized Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA; January 2002) is that every state ensures that all teachers are highly qualified and are receiving high-quality professional development. Moreover, all new teachers entering the profession must take a written test. And every state must develop a plan to ensure that all teachers (not just those supported by Title I) teaching "core academic subjects" are highly qualified no later than the end of the 2005-06 school year ("ESEA’s Student Testing and Teacher Quality Provisions," 2002, p. 15).

In trying to face what they perceive as a lack of effectiveness in teacher training curricula, many policy makers have gone so far as to suggest alternate routes other than the traditional 4-year undergraduate teacher education programs (Darling-Hammond, 2000). Many people believe that anyone can teach, or, at least, that knowing a subject is enough to allow one to teach it well. Others believe that teaching is best learned by trial and error on the job. Nobody would dream of this happening in other professions (Goodlad, 1992). However, not only do some people believe it, but they also actively promote the hiring of teachers from people who have failed to meet the requirements in other professions (Darling-Hammond, 2000).

These "alternate routes" have brought about an interesting result: too few entering teachers have adequate preparation. Statistics show that more than 12% of all newly hired "teachers" enter the workforce without any training at all, and another 15% enter without having fully met state standards (NCTAF, 1996, p. 15).

Commenting on the Elementary and Secondary Education Act, Cochran-Smith (2002) says,
It is worth noting that this provision of the bill implies that college—and university—based teacher education is neither the sole nor required mode of preparation for teaching, cementing into this new federal legislation the legitimacy of current alternate routes that bypass traditional preparation. (p. 188)

Unfortunately, there is not much research in the area of training for the teaching of a foreign language (Raymond, 2000). As an example of the situation, she cites Bernhardt and Hammadou (1987) who found in their review that out of 78 articles searched, only 8 were reports of research on foreign language teacher education. Because most guidelines for competency development or training occurred before research or evaluation of bilingual programs was performed, there are several problems in traditional teacher education programs. The two that follow are just a few examples.

1. There is failure to see the interconnectedness between first and second languages and cultures. The idea of pushing students to work rapidly and unrealistically to become fluent in a second language minimizes the connections between first and second language development and reduces the potential for advancement in both languages. When development of the first language has been neglected, the students' academic achievement has been found to be less than acceptable (González & Darling-Hammond, 2000). Teacher education programs should help future teachers to integrate second language development with first language development and to recognize the uniqueness and value of specific languages and cultures.

2. Teacher education programs traditionally give more emphasis to the components of language, such as phonology, morphology, syntax, and lexicon. This approach is short-changing the teaching of a second language since it "overlooks the social nature of language as a tool for communication and a mechanism through which content can be explored and examined" (González & Darling-Hammond, 2000). Thus,
the target language is placed out of context and generally becomes irrelevant to the everyday lives of the students.

This description seems to agree with Stephen Krashen's (1981) theory of second language acquisition. According to it, "language acquisition does not require extensive use of conscious grammatical rules, and does not require tedious drill" (p. 6). He goes on to say that real language acquisition is not a quick process, but "develops slowly, and speaking skills emerge significantly later than listening skills, even when conditions are perfect" (p. 6).

As defined by Wing (1993), pedagogical content knowledge for bilingual education is an understanding of what it means to know a foreign language, how learners learn a foreign language, what should be taught in a foreign language class, how the foreign language should be taught, and how classroom context affects language instruction.

Bilingual teachers need to be aware of different approaches to teach second languages in order to decide how to develop language teaching methods and materials. These approaches can be a second language acquisition theory, like Krashen's, or applied linguistic research, or even the use of ideas and intuition from experience (Gelmi, 1994).

Standards for Bilingual Education

The U.S. Office of Bilingual Education published a first list of Competencies for University Programs in Bilingual Education in 1978 (Clark-Riojas, 1990). These competencies included language proficiency, a course of study in bilingual education (use of materials and instructional practices for bilingual education), and school/community
practices. Clark-Riojas (1990) talks further about one of the subsequent lists done in 1980. According to it, an effective bilingual teacher should have: (a) positive regard, (b) a non-authoritarian attitude, (c) self-confidence, (d) communication skills, (e) varied methodology, and (f) cultural knowledge. It can be said that this list was no different from what was expected from a monolingual teacher at the time. Further guidelines stressed that bilingual teachers must be competent in: (a) language proficiency, (b) the field of bilingual education, (c) linguistic theory, (d) culture, (e) pedagogy with emphasis on bilingual education and assessment, and (f) school and community relations in addition to having knowledge of bilingual research.

The education of a bilingual teacher usually involves developing proficiency in a foreign language along with the native one, knowledge and demonstration of bilingual and second language instructional methods, and knowledge of the history and culture of the students they are teaching. Macias (1989) considers that the preparation of a bilingual teacher goes further than acquiring pedagogical content knowledge, and that a paradigm shift in teaching is needed in order to attain bilingual competencies; even more so in the case of currently-employed teachers.

In 1992, the National Association for Bilingual Education (NABE) published a document identifying six professional standards that should be considered by schools of education in order to prepare bilingual teachers. As Frank González (1993) states, “these standards are measurements by which bilingual/multicultural teacher preparation programs can assess their readiness to meet the needs of a rapidly changing, diverse student population” (p. 1). Following is an explanation of each standard.
Institutional Resources, Coordination, and Commitment

This standard addresses the institution of higher education's rationale, sequence of coursework, field experience, faculty, administrative structure, and assessment of the process as factors that contribute to the production of competent bilingual/multicultural teachers. Cohesive programs are characterized by: (a) an administrative and governance structure that enables the program to resolve administrative needs promptly; (b) adequate resources, both human and material, to ensure that the bilingual/multicultural teacher preparation program is equivalent in stature to other teacher preparation programs; (c) qualified persons to teach all courses and supervise all field experiences in each program of professional preparation; and (d) an assessment system that regularly evaluates the effectiveness of the program and its faculty and staff (NABE, 1992, p. 5).

Recruitment, Advisement, and Retention of Potential Teachers

“This standard addresses the support services available to potential teachers who have the academic, linguistic, cultural and personal qualifications to become bilingual and multicultural educators” (Gonzalez, 1993, p. 5).

The institutions are expected, among other things, to “define academic preparation and achievement” for prospective teachers,” and also to determine “an applicant’s personal qualities and pre-professional qualifications,” besides having an “admission panel which reflects the diversity of the institutional area and adheres to the principles of equal educational opportunity in the admissions processes” (NABE, 1992, p. 9).
It is clear that this standard emphasizes the selection and screening of candidates who plan to enter the teaching profession. The implementation of these guidelines would attract the participation of higher achievement students and in some ways would guarantee a better quality for teacher education programs. Once the students have been recruited, they should receive advice and orientation so as to retain them as potential teachers.

**Bilingual/Multicultural Coursework and Curriculum**

The pre-professional academic preparation process required to develop professional competence in bilingual/multicultural teachers is addressed in this standard. Each institution is expected to design a program of teacher preparation resting on the published standards, since it is not NABE’s (1992) intention to work out a set curriculum with a specific series of course titles, or suggested numbers or required course hours.

According to this standard, “potential bilingual/multicultural teachers must have opportunities to acquire knowledge and skills that are necessary to serve their students responsibly” (p. 12). Emphasis is given to the need of providing “guidance and supervision of qualified mentors and master teachers” (p. 12).

Table 1 is a summary of salient features of coursework in each area of the curriculum suggested as necessary in order to achieve desired levels of professional competence. They include coursework in: (a) linguistic and cultural issues, (b) curriculum development and adaptation, (c) foundation in liberal arts, including history and theory of education, (d) assessment, and (e) instructional methods for first and second languages.
Table 1

*Bilingual/Multicultural Coursework and Curriculum as Suggested by NABE*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coursework in linguistic and cultural issues should enable bilingual</td>
<td>1. Recognize and accept the language variety of the home as valid systems of communication with legitimate functions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teachers to do the following:</td>
<td>2. Understand basic concepts regarding the nature of language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Understand the nature of bilingualism and the process of becoming bilingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Identify and understand structural differences between the child's first and second languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Respond positively to the diversity of behavior involved in cross-cultural environments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Develop awareness in the learner of the value of cultural diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Prepare and assist children to interact successfully in a cross-cultural setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Recognize and accept different patterns of child development within and between cultures in order to formulate realistic objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Assist children to maintain and extend identification with and probe in the mother culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. Understand, appreciate and incorporate into activities, materials and others aspects of the instructional environment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. the culture and history of the group's ancestry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. contributions of the group to history and culture of the U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. contemporary life styles of the group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum development and adaptation courses which include:</td>
<td>1. Strategies for organizing the curriculum into meaningful and relevant units.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Knowledge of state and local curriculum requirements and guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Developing literacy across the curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Major philosophies of curriculum development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Developing a curriculum that fosters critical thinking skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Procedures for identifying biases and deficiencies in existing curricula and strategies to modify it to better address student linguistic,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cultural and developmental needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Strategies to develop, acquire, adapt and evaluate materials appropriate to the bilingual multicultural classroom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1—Continued.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foundation in Liberal Arts</td>
<td>1. philosophy, theory, and history of bilingual education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coursework in history and foundations of education including:</td>
<td>2. history and philosophy of education in America and its effects on the general population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. legal issues in the education of children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. legal issues in bilingual education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coursework in assessment which includes:</td>
<td>1. recognizing potential linguistic and cultural biases in assessment instruments including standardized tests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. developing an ability to utilize alternative assessment measures including portfolio and other means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. developing an ability to assess student language proficiency in both native and second language, including oral and written language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. developing an in-class management system to assess student achievement in relation to objectives of instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. promoting and encouraging student self-assessment of their skills and abilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. developing an ability to do self-assessment and self reflection of teaching strategies and value systems and beliefs as they relate to the students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional methods courses which include teaching in English and non-English languages and developing a large repertoire of active teaching/learning strategies such as:</td>
<td>1. teaching strategies appropriate to distinct learning styles and developmental levels of students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. culture’s effects on student’s learning style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. abilities to organize, plan and teach specific lessons in required curriculum areas using the appropriate terminology in English and the target non-English language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. knowledge base and teaching strategies related to the basic elements and methodologies best suited to the development of literacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Innovative teaching techniques in two languages such as:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. inquiry/discovery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. individualized, small group and large group instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. learning centers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. uses of media and audiovisual materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. uses of computer technology to assist instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f. instructional analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g. team teaching and cross-age grouping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Awareness of the way in which a learner’s culture should permeate all areas of the curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Knowledge of effective classroom managements strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Ability to identify and utilize available community resources in and outside the classroom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language Proficiency in English/non-English Languages and Ability to Teach in Those Languages

This standard addresses (a) the recruitment of students who have proficiency in both English and at least one non-English language; (b) the further development of bilingual competency—including fluency in speaking—through course work, fieldwork and travel opportunities; and (c) the development of English proficiency for those who have completed education programs in other countries and wish to teach in the United States (González, 1993, p. 5).

Their command of English and Spanish—in the case of Puerto Rico—will allow bilingual teachers to conduct classes in either language with ease and confidence, regardless of level of instruction. This includes using appropriate and varied language at high levels of accuracy and fluency. According to NABE (1992), teachers’ competence in both languages should “include all language modalities (listening, speaking, reading, and writing) and may be demonstrated by having lived and worked in areas where the languages are commonly spoken” (p. 19). Language competency implies having formal study of the language. Experiences leading to or indicating pedagogical competence in teaching in English and Spanish can be demonstrated through coursework and field experiences that include the following:

1. Courses in second language acquisition theory and second language pedagogy that focus on second language teaching and on the integration of language and content

2. Curriculum development and experiences in teaching that link language learning and content development
3. Classroom experiences in teaching English as a Second Language and Sheltered English

4. Courses in teaching literacy in the native language

5. Courses in content areas taught in the native language and


Fieldwork and Practicum Experiences in Bilingual/Multicultural Classrooms

This standard addresses the "great disparity between theory presented in the college environment and the practical teaching realities in the bilingual/multicultural classroom" (González, 1993, p. 5). Indicators of this standard are:

1. The field experience includes structured observation by both school site and university staff.

2. The field experience occurs in multiple settings that provide an opportunity for interaction and work with children from a variety of ages and developmental levels, and who reflect social, cultural, and linguistic diversity.

3. Classroom teacher and university supervisors who supervise candidates’ field experiences are themselves bilingual/multicultural teachers and have had academic preparation and successful experience in teaching children from diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds.

4. Supervisors from both university and the school district have skills in observation and coaching techniques and can successfully foster learning in adults.
5. The college or university recognizes and rewards district-level supervisors for their services through incentives.

6. The support and assessment of each candidate are coordinated regularly and effectively between the candidate's supervising teachers and university or college supervisors.

7. Candidates in field experiences are given result feedback in writing regarding their performance including their strengths and weaknesses and constructive specific suggestions for improvement.

8. Each candidate effectively fulfills the typical responsibilities of teaching which include preparation of lesson plans, instruction and organization, classroom management, meeting school deadlines, keeping accurate records of student work, and parent/family contacts.

9. Each candidate completes a graduated series of field experiences that conclude with full-day teaching responsibilities.

10. Candidates for advanced degrees have practicum experiences built into their degree programs (NABE, 1992, pp. 21-22)

Life-long Learning and Commitment to Professional Development

Teacher preparation programs can provide information to motivate and guide potential educators while extending opportunities and support for continued professional growth. It is suggested that institutions of higher education establish partnerships with candidates and schools after initial preparation, so as to nurture and continue to develop individual interests. Its indicators are:
1. Opportunities for teachers to pursue graduate or advanced degrees after initial certification

2. Opportunities to be involved in on-going research projects in the area of bilingual/multicultural education

3. Opportunities to participate in bilingual/multicultural teacher support groups

4. Opportunities to publish their ideas or insights in professional journals

5. Information about how to join and be an active member in a professional organization

6. Participating and/or presenting at professional conferences

7. Serving as a cooperating teacher, mentor, or master teacher to students in initial preparation programs (NABE, 1992, p. 23).

Institutions of Higher Education are expected to adhere to these standards so that bilingual teacher education programs can better serve the attaining of proficiency in teaching foreign languages and meeting the needs of the students.

In a recent study by Pufahl, Rhodes, and Christian (2000), the researchers intended to find out what the United States could learn from other countries that are successful in their teaching of foreign languages. They found that their rigorous teacher education programs usually begin with a careful screening of the candidates, and that “the most successful programs integrate academic subject studies with pedagogical studies and teaching practice” (p. 10).

On the other hand, the program per se does not necessarily make good teachers. As Joiner (1993) noted, “while program is important, a good design in and of itself, does not automatically guarantee the goals the designers wish it to achieve” (p. 200).
Nevertheless, the program needs to have a sound foundation if it is to accomplish the objectives that were the basis for its creation.

Bilingual Teacher Education in Puerto Rico

In 1976, the Puerto Rican Teachers Association published an editorial statement that appeared in the November-December issue of the Puerto Rican edition of Today's Education. In this four-page insert, they discussed the importance of bilingual education and methods for ensuring its success. Among them was the selection and training of teachers that should meet the following requirements:

1. disposition to participate in an innovative program
2. knowledge of the structures of both languages
3. general knowledge of the nature of language
4. knowledge of the different methodologies for teaching both the native and the second language
5. understanding and acceptance of all the cultures represented in the community
6. knowledge of the development and growth patterns of children
7. competency in providing an adequate linguistic model in both languages.

The suggested training program would include the following areas:
(a) linguistics, (b) methodology in the native and second languages, (c) curriculum design, (d) revision and adaptation of existing teaching materials, (e) creation of new materials, and (f) study of the cultures represented in the community, including values, beliefs, and family structures (Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico, 1976).

In some ways, the criteria established by the Puerto Rican Teachers Association...
for the selection and training of bilingual teachers resembles the NABE standards, but there is no evidence that schools of education incorporate them.

According to Darling-Hammond (2000), there is substantial confirmation that teachers who have had more preparation for teaching are more confident and successful with students than those who have little or none. Even with the shortcomings of present programs, there is greater probability that the teacher is going to be more successful with them than without them—in other words, some is better than nothing.

**Administrative Support**

Administrative support can make the difference between teacher retention or teacher attrition. According to a study about the reasons teachers have for leaving the profession (Marlow & Inman, 1997), beginning teachers leave more for a lack of professionalism, collegiality, and administrative support (p. 211). This support may come in two main aspects: provision of continuous training, mentoring, and monitoring of the teacher’s work, and provision of resources and materials needed in order to effectively apply whatever has been learned by the teacher (Darling-Hammond, 1996). Michael Fullan (2002) adds:

At the heart of school capacity [the crucial variable affecting instructional quality and corresponding student achievement] are principals focused on the development of teachers’ knowledge and skills, professional community, program coherence, and technical resources. (p. 16)

Beginning teachers need adequate support to be able to handle the reality shock they go through when they enter the classroom (Halford, 1998; Rowley, 1999). When they face the difference between the theory they learned and the reality of the students,
they are more prone to leave the profession if they do not receive the needed support from colleagues and administrators, as Marlow & Inman (1997) report.

Administrators, colleagues, and the community make up the interpersonal aspect of the beginning teacher support system. The degree to which they perceive that these three groups are supportive of their efforts, can be directly related to their comfort level and their desire to remain in the profession. (p. 212)

Veteran teachers also need administrative support. School administrators can demonstrate that they are behind the teachers’ efforts to do their job well. Encouraging the creativity and the implementation of new ideas can do this. It is also shown by the provision of in-service sessions in which teachers share their ideas (Caccia, 1996; Darling-Hammond, 2000; Marlow & Inman, 1997; Showers & Joyce, 1996).

Other suggestions given by Marlow & Inman (1997) are: to create teaching teams made up of beginning and veteran teachers, matching the teachers based on information gleaned during classroom visits; and for administrators to continue to promote teacher accomplishments to one another and to the educational community, and encourage the public to see teaching as a true profession (p. 215). In other words, the community also needs to support the teachers in their job.

The beginning teacher needs to be given the opportunities to interact with colleagues (Caccia, 1996; Showers & Joyce, 1996) who have similar ideas about teaching and working cooperatively, and also with a community that feels positively about the educational system and the people in it.

To Marlow & Inman (1997), when these interactions are supported and promoted by the administration, the benefits will reach further than they think in terms of increased feelings of self-worth, contributions to the curriculum, a support network, and feelings of
good will between teachers and parents. The students will be the ultimate beneficiaries of this type of effort.

According to Dennis Sparks (1998), Executive Director of the National Staff Development Council, “there is a big misconception about staff development because people think that once you have a college degree and even some graduate work, then you don’t need to learn more” (p. 19). The truth is that teachers—beginners and veterans alike—are facing new challenges. The varied approaches and expectations that pertain to school reform may overwhelm them if they are not well trained. Among them, there are standards, diverse learners, inclusion, alternate assessment, technology, cooperative learning, whole-language programs, and so forth. All this is happening under challenging classrooms conditions like large classes and lack of resources (Darling-Hammond, 1997).

As stated by the NCTAF (1996), one of the big challenges for school reform is that many teachers lack the “know-how and the resources” to bring successful programs to life,” and that “even the best of policies cannot improve the education of our children if those in charge are not provided with the knowledge, skills, and supports they need to do a good job” (p. 5).

On the whole, the school reform movement has ignored the obvious: What teachers know and can do makes the crucial difference in what children learn. And the ways school systems organize their work makes a big difference in what teachers can accomplish. New courses, tests, and curriculum reforms can be important starting points, but they are meaningless if teachers cannot use them productively. (p. 5)

The third premise on which the NCTAF (1996) based its report was: “School reform cannot succeed unless it focuses on creating the conditions in which teachers can teach, and teach well” (pp. 6, 9). This is part of the administration’s duty if any positive change is expected. Instead, “working in isolation with few chances to update their
skills, teachers are deprived of knowledge that would allow them to succeed at much higher levels” (p. 14).

"U. S. teachers get a few brief workshops offering packaged prescriptions from outside consultants on ‘in-service days’ that contribute little to deepening their subject knowledge or teaching skills” (NCTAF, 1996, p. 41). Many schools administrators depend on large-group seminars and teacher conventions to provide professional development to their staff.

Sparks (1998), in describing the changes brought to staff development, declares that the “new form of staff development is going to be smaller groups of teachers working together to make things better” (p. 19). This is not to say that teachers should not attend district meetings and national conferences or teacher conventions. On the contrary, according to Sparks, “that’s how you raise awareness and build a network you can use when you need to get help” (p. 19). However, the old models of staff development have proved to be inefficient in training our teachers for their job (Showers & Joyce, 1996; Sparks, 1998).

According to Clair (2000), professional development must be long term, and it must incorporate opportunities for learning that center on teachers and students if it is to be successful. She cites Hawley and Valli (1999) who suggest eight principles of effective professional development: (a) it should be driven by analysis of teachers’ goals and student performance; (b) it should involve teachers in the identification of what they need to learn; (c) it should be school-based; (d) it should be organized around collaborative problem solving; (e) it should be continuous and adequately supported; (f) it should be information rich; (g) it should include opportunities for the development of
theoretical understanding; and h) it should be part of a comprehensive change process (pp. 127-150).

The NCTAF (1996) report stated that by providing ongoing learning for teachers and staff, schools have found ways to educate all students well.

The bottom line is that there is just no way to create good schools without good teachers. Those who have worked to improve education over the last decade have learned that school reform cannot be "teacher-proofed." Success in any aspect of reform—whether creating standards, developing more challenging curriculum and assessments, implementing school-based management, or inventing new model schools and programs—depends on highly skilled teachers working in supportive schools that engender collaboration with families and communities. (p. 10)

In summary, "reforms that invest time in teacher learning and give teachers greater autonomy are our best hope for improving America’s schools" (Darling-Hammond, 1996, p. 4). That is the kind of administrative support that teachers need in order to perform with effectiveness.

**Personal Characteristics and Life Experiences**

Discussing personal characteristics and life experiences of teachers can be a delicate issue, not only because of the broadness of the topic, but also for its subjectivity. It cannot be said with certainty which personal characteristics teachers should possess; but it is possible to recognize some attributes that, when lived to their potential, can make a difference in their job. "We must acknowledge the contributions of a teacher’s personality, humor, dedication, passion, and ability to compromise within the classroom, and assert that such contributions be recognized in the teaching profession" (Poon Teng Fatt, 1998, p. 616).

Many years before, Ellen G. White (1903) said this about the characteristics of good teachers, "Experience in practical life is indispensable. Order, thoroughness,
punctuality, self-control, a sunny temper, evenness of disposition, self-sacrifice, integrity, and courtesy are essential qualifications" (p. 277).

Moreover, there are some specific virtues without which real-life teachers would not be able to maintain their effectiveness in the classroom. In other words, what are the characteristics that help teachers overcome the shortcomings inherent or acquired in their profession?

Teachers are needed who are quick to discern and improve every opportunity for doing good: those who with enthusiasm combine true dignity, who are able to control, and "apt to teach," who can inspire thought, arouse energy, and impart courage and life. (White, 1903, p. 279)

This capacity to "combine true dignity" and "inspire thought," together with the ability to "impart courage and life," form part of a higher level of characteristics or attributes. These attributes are sometimes developed as a result of critical life experiences. Brookfield (1995) says, "The influences that shape teachers' lives and move teachers' actions . . . are more likely to be found in a complex web of formative memories and experience constituting their life histories" (p. 49).

In the next sections, I consider moral sensibility and vocation as two attributes that bring together many of these higher level characteristics, and also the influence of life experiences in developing teacher effectiveness.

Moral Sensibility

Virtues—merits, qualities, and intrinsic worth—of teachers are being strongly emphasized with the new "teaching for morality" approach to education (Beyer, 1997; Campbell, 1997; Goodlad, 1999). Teaching is now seen not so much a matter of professional skill as of certain attitudinal qualities, which are based on moral values.
To fulfill their mission, educators need to rediscover the moral base of teaching and learning (Beyer, 1997; Campbell, 1997; Goodlad, 1999). "Moral purpose is social responsibility to others and the environment. School leaders with moral purpose seek to make a difference in the lives of students. . . . They act with the intention of making a positive difference in their own schools" (Fullan, 2002, p. 17).

The idea is not so new, though. In 1903, Ellen G. White wrote:

The necessity of preparatory training for the teacher is universally admitted; but few recognize the character of the preparation most essential. He who appreciates the responsibility involved in the training of the youth, will realize that instruction in scientific and literary lines alone cannot suffice. The teacher should have a more comprehensive education than can be gained by the study of books. He should possess not only strength but breadth of mind; should be not only whole-souled but large-hearted. (p. 276)

In his book Exploring the Moral Heart of Teaching, David Hansen (2001) conceptualizes why teaching is a moral and intellectual practice. He uses the term "moral sensibility" to describe the quality that embodies the highest virtues.

A moral sensibility embodies a person’s disposition toward life and the people and events he or she encounters. It describes how a person fuses humanness and thought in the way he or she regards and treats others. A moral sensibility features a critical orientation. It is neither blind nor sentimental. It includes a reflective capacity: the ability to stand back from the scene at certain moments in order to discern the issues at stake, to appreciate differences in point of view that may be involved, and more. (p. 32)

Beyer (1997) follows the same train of thought when he says,

When we take a moral stand, we believe that some actions, some decisions, are more justifiable than others and that we can use arguments, appropriate evidence, and particular reasons to support that belief. We adopt a moral point of view when we believe that we can give reasons for the choices we make concerning our actions. (p. 245)

Hansen (2001) goes on to explain that a moral sensibility is to be cultivated,
deepened, and refined over a lifetime. In other words, it is not a quality that can be shown upon demand.

A moral sensibility takes form slowly and unpredictably. Most of the time it is not a direct object of the person's attention or perception. Rather, it is funded, indirectly, by attending to people and to the situations in which they dwell. (p. 39)

Although this may be the case regarding the development of moral sensibility—or moral reasoning—it is "clear that moral questions are part of day-to-day human life, based on the need to make choices about matters requiring action" (Beyer, 1997, p. 246). He goes on to explain,

Moral deliberation is central to daily lives as well as to decisions about social justice; for instance, in issues ranging from how I treat others on a day-to-day basis, to what my obligations are to members of my community, to what public policies will most help the least advantaged members of society. (p. 246)

Vocation

David Hansen (1995) wrote a book on the morality of teaching, with the title The Call to Teach, based on his study of four teachers. Hansen's argument is that vocation—the call to teach—finds its expression as a mix of public obligation and personal fulfillment. That is, for an activity to be a vocation, "it must yield social value to others. It must be educative, edifying, helpful to others in some characteristic way" (p. 3). A note should be made about Hansen's emphasis on vocation including work that is "fulfilling and meaning to the individual" (p. 3). He sees it is a healthy combination of service to others and personal satisfaction. For Hansen, "the idea of vocation denotes more than an inner or psychological state. It does presume on the part of the individual a hopeful, outward-looking sentiment, a feeling of wanting to engage the world in some substantive way" (p. 5).
Sources of Vocation

It should be important to know how teachers get to develop this sense of motivation and vocation—this moral sensibility. Again, Hansen (1995) expounds,

The inner motivation to serve that a person may feel is socially rooted. It is not manufactured by the person out of thin air. A person could hardly develop the desire to engage the world and to serve others without having been exposed, for a substantial period of time, to that world itself. (p. 6)

On the contrary, Parker Palmer (2000), in his book Let Your Life Speak, describes his own journey searching for his true vocation and acknowledges a different source.

Today I understand vocation quite differently—not as a goal to be achieved but as a gift to be received. Discovering vocation does not mean scrambling toward some prize just beyond my reach but accepting the treasure of true self I already possess. Vocation does not come from a voice “out there” calling me to become something I am not. It comes from a voice “in here” calling me to be the person I was born to be, to fulfill the original selfhood given me at birth by God. (p. 10)

But Hansen (1995) insists,

A person cannot “will” a sense of service into existence, nor wake up one day and “decide” to be of service. Those dispositions grow and take shape over time, through interaction with people and through the attempt to perform the work well. (p. 4)

As Palmer (2000) said, “vocation does not come from willfulness” (p. 4). In this statement, he is almost repeating Hansen. However, whereas the latter declares interaction with people and their needs as the promoter of vocation, the former portrays a different vision. To him, vocation comes to us only if we listen, not to the world out there calling us to serve, not to what we think we would like our life to be, but to our own self which was endowed with certain gifts. It might take us some time to understand our own vocation, but it is a worthwhile endeavor, because “the clues are there” (p. 15)

Vocation does not mean a goal that I pursue. It means a calling that I hear. Before I can tell my life what I want to do with it, I must listen to my life telling me who I am. I must listen for the truths and values at the heart of my own identity, not the standards by which I must live—but the standards by which I
cannot help but live if I am living my own life. (Palmer, 2000, p. 4)

Both for Palmer and for Hansen, life experiences can help us mold our value system, and more specifically, the way we teach. “Many are drawn to teaching because of teachers they have had, because of subjects they have studied and enjoyed, and because of young people they have known or with whom they have worked” (Hansen, 1995, p. 6).

The power of our mentors is not necessarily in the models of good teaching they gave us, models that may turn out to have little to do with who we are as teachers. Their power is in their capacity to awaken a truth within us, a truth we can reclaim years later by recalling their impact on our lives. If we discovered a teacher’s heart in ourselves by meeting a great teacher, recalling that meeting may help us take heart in teaching once more. (Palmer, 2000, p. 21)

**Professional Growth and Satisfaction**

In *Let Your Life Speak*, Palmer (2000) quotes religious author Frederick Buechner in defining vocation as “the place where your deep gladness meets the world’s deep need” (p. 16). Hansen (1995) said something similar when he placed vocation “at the crossroads of public obligation and personal fulfillment” (p. 3). In other words, it is a fact that vocation implies not only service, but also happiness in doing it.

Buechner’s definition starts with the self and moves toward the needs of the world: it begins, wisely, where vocation begins—not in what the world needs (which is everything), but in the nature of the human self, in what brings the self joy, the deep joy of knowing that we are here on earth to be the gifts that God created. (Palmer, 2000, p. 16)

Other ways in which a teacher shows moral sensibility and vocation are “the ability to foster and maintain a self-critical stance and willingness to grow” and also “self-confidence” as described by Poon Teng Fatt (1998, p. 617). He goes on to express the need for teachers to “set their sights on excellence, struggling vociferously against
that stultifying level of sameness and striving to push students past their own all-too-often low level of expectation” (p. 617).

Vocation for teaching must not be seen as a guarantee that a person engaging in this activity will be able to overcome and solve all the difficulties inherent in the profession. In fact, according to Palmer (2000),

The human self also has a nature, limits as well as potentials. If you seek vocation without understanding the material you are working with, what you build with your life will be ungainly and may well put lives in peril, your own and some of those around you. “Faking it” in the service of high values is no virtue, and has nothing to do with vocation. It is an ignorant, sometimes arrogant, attempt to override one’s nature, and it will always fail. (p. 16)

Nevertheless, the teacher will have a clear understanding of the limitations imposed by forces beyond his or her control, and still find satisfaction on the job.

However, even a charismatic and effective teacher who is caught within an educational system which does not offer conducive conditions where he or she can teach most effectively is forced to make compromise. . . . This is one socially conditioned limitation no teacher likes to experience. (Poon Teng Fatt, 1998, p. 617)

McEwan (1996) sees moral sensibility in a teacher’s desire to develop positive relationships and ongoing professional enhancement. She says, “Teachers talk about and understand the moral aspects of teaching in terms of caring relationships” (p. 452), and “teachers view continual professional growth and collaboration with other professionals as part of their commitment to teach in a moral way” (p. 454).

Public Obligation

Receiving the call to teach is not enough, though. The person must act on it. Teaching becomes a way of serving and achieving not only personal, but also social goals.

Still, the fact remains that now one has taken on that interest oneself. The idea of
teaching "occupies" the person's thoughts and imagination. Again, this suggests that one conceives of teaching as more than a job, as more than a way to earn an income, although this consideration is obviously relevant. Rather, one believes teaching to be potentially meaningful, as the way to instantiate one's desire to contribute to and engage with the world. (Hansen, 1995, p. 10)

A teacher's sense of vocation will provide him or her with the correct lenses with which to see the world and fulfill his or her public obligations. "The idea of vocation turns the focus of perception in such a way that the challenges and the complexity in teaching become sources of interest in the work, rather than barriers or frustrating obstacles to be overcome" (Hansen, 1995, p. 144).

One of the challenges faced by a teacher is how to best teach his or her students in the classroom. According to Wynne (1993),

A contemporary teacher's first moral obligation is to provide his or her students with the best possible instruction in the subject matter assigned. The unique morality of contemporary teaching consists of the teacher's deep obligation to help the student learn. Whether the teacher is teaching about morals, archery or a foreign language, the principle is like that which applies to all persons who sell goods or services; give the customer his moneys' worth. But the matter of money's worth has a special meaning for teachers and students. (p. 6)

In other words, teaching effectively is a moral act (Goodlad, 1992; McEwan, 1996). Providing the students with the best possible instruction, environment, and relationships is acting with moral sensibility. This is not to say that teachers will necessarily accomplish all their goals, but being a moral teacher entails continuous searching for the best ways to accomplish the job's obligations together with a personal sense of satisfaction for the task being done (Hansen, 1995).

Paradoxically, the best and worst of teaching skills are integrally related to the gifts and flaws embedded in a teacher's personality. Teachers often have to struggle to overcome their anger, prejudice, sloth, and despair. However, if teachers have an abiding concern for their students' total welfare and a worried concern for some of their ailing, troubled students, they will not just leave their students in the classroom, but continually labor to understand how familiar and
societal influences have shaped them and ultimately develop the synergy between
them. (Poon Teng Fatt, 1998, p. 616)

Jaime Escalante, the math professor who was portrayed in the movie *Stand and
Deliver* (Menéndez, 1988), is a classic example of a teacher having moral sensibility and
vocation. He was convinced of something that needed to be done, and he did it in spite of
the circumstances that surrounded him. "After all, it was the same passion for doing
things 'right'—to serve others—that drove Escalante into teaching instead of working
with computers, and which stimulated him to create and operate his successful program"
(Wynne, 1993, p. 9).

Service

Another way in which teachers show their vocation and moral sensibility is by
engaging in service to others, as mentioned by Hansen in his two books:

A social practice is the other part, making it possible to bring these motivations to
life, in the literal sense of those terms. Vocation cannot exist as a state of mind
alone, disembodied or removed from a practice. . . . Rather it is a set
of impulses that are outward-looking and outward moving, focused on what is
calling one to act. The idea of vocation presupposes a social practice in which to
enact one's inner urge to contribute to the world. (1995, p. 5)

Wynne (1993) argues that teachers who involve themselves in this kind of activity
are "prophetic teachers":

The prophetic teacher does not stress the direct, immediate obligations of pupils
and teachers. Instead, he is more concerned with provoking pupils to act against
perceived general injustices in the external world, e.g., pollution, war, racism, and
sexism. The emphasis is not so much on the teacher as a diligent craftsman;
instead, the approach focuses on teaching students to strive for a notably better
world. (p. 7)

In her book *Education*, Ellen White (1903) emphasizes the need to educate the
youth for "the joy of service" (p. 13). According to her, it is the teacher’s duty to develop
in his students this desire above any other goal in their life.
The true teacher is not satisfied with second-rate work. He is not satisfied with directing his students to a standard lower than the highest that is possible for them to attain. He cannot be content with imparting to them only technical knowledge, with making them merely clever accountants, skillful artisans, successful tradesmen. It is his ambition to inspire them with principles of truth, obedience, honor, integrity, and purity—principles that will make them a positive force for the stability and uplifting of society. He desires them, above all else, to learn life's great lesson of unselfish service. (1903, p. 29)

**Implications for Teacher Education**

One question remains, "If moral reasoning is an inevitable part of human life, why has not it always been central to the professional preparation of teachers?" (Beyer, 1997, p. 246). For Beyer, "moral reasoning is an inevitable part of human life, and teaching is a field of reflective moral action" (p. 248) while Campbell (1997), stresses the significance of pre-service teacher education in acquainting teachers with the values and complexities of their practice (p. 256).

Beyer (1997) states, "When teacher educators refrain from helping prospective teachers think through the moral dimensions of classroom practice, they countenance the moral perspectives of others and deny teachers' moral responsibility and agency" (p. 247). Campbell (1997) corroborates the need for teacher educators to take an active part on the development of moral reasoning in teaching.

Teacher education programs must develop alternative ways to enable student teachers to understand their future role and anticipate the moral and ethical significance of their practice. Moral agency is not simply an inevitable state resulting from being a teacher, but instead a professional quality exemplifying ethically good practice. (p. 257)

Equally, Palmer (1999) sees "good practice" as a result of personal attributes of the teacher. "Good teaching cannot be reduced to technique; good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher" (p. 10). Therefore, "as we learn more about who
we are, we can learn techniques that reveal rather than conceal the personhood from which good teaching comes" (p. 24).

In planning for the development of moral reasoning in schools of education, Goodlad (1992) described what he thought to be a four-part mission for teacher education programs.

First, programs for the education of teachers are morally obligated to provide for their students intellectual encounters with concepts of individual and group rights and responsibilities in a self-governing society, issues pertaining to the compulsory schooling, and the role of schools and teachers in a social and political democracy.

Second, programs for the education of teachers carry with them moral imperatives regarding the provision of access to humankind’s domains of knowledge and knowing sufficient for broad participation in the human conversation.

Third, programs for the education of teachers carry with them moral responsibility for coupling with this knowledge access to the pedagogy necessary to introducing their future teachers to this conversation.

Fourth, programs for the education of teachers are morally obliged to provide curricula that put teachers firmly on the road of career-long moral stewardship of the schools in which they will work. (1992, p. 89)

Conversely, Beyer (1997) states that there are some "long-standing and often deep-seated differences" (p. 248) regarding the issue of teacher education. As he sees them, they relate to central moral and political issues concerning the purposes and meaning of schooling, the nature and politics of school knowledge, the types of character development necessary and appropriate, and the purposes of teacher education. These issues, like other moral questions, are ultimately connected to the kind of world we want to construct with students. (p. 248)

White (1923) also saw the need for an education geared towards the development of the "moral powers."

Although the study of the sciences may carry the students to high literary attainments, it does not give a full, perfect education. When special attention is
given to the thorough development of every physical and moral power which God has given, then students will not leave our colleges calling themselves educated while they are ignorant of that knowledge which they must have for practical life and for the fullest development of character. (p. 523)

Equally, Yost (1997) states that if teachers are to fulfill their mission, they need not only the knowledge base, but also the belief systems that will enable them to do it. Therefore, “teacher education programs must help pre-service teachers learn to reflect critically on student, school, and community issues and make ethical decisions” (Yost, 1997, p. 281). This guided reflection, serious study, and search for truth will help new and veteran teachers to develop a high level of moral sensibility, and will help them to live up to their vocation to teach.

The greatest want of the world is the want of men—men who will not be bought or sold, men who in their inmost souls are true and honest, men who do not fear to call sin by its right name, men whose conscience is as true to duty as the needle to the pole, men who will stand for the right though the heavens fall. But such a character is not the result of accident; it is not due to special favors or endowments of Providence. A noble character is the result of self-discipline, of the subjection of the lower to the higher nature—the surrender of self for the service of love to God and man. (White, 1903, p. 57)

In summary, two attributes have been considered in this review about teacher characteristics, namely, moral sensibility and vocation. They both go beyond personal characteristics in the sense that they connote a collective nature. In broad terms, it can be said that teachers who develop moral sensibility will see their profession as an opportunity to enrich, expand, and deepen the students’ understanding of self, others, and the world. Moral sensibility implies moral and intellectual attention to students and the curriculum.

Vocation implies the idea of a call to the profession, which involves not only
personal satisfaction on the job well done, but also a special interest in service to others.

In reviewing several films about great teachers, McCormick (1996) summarized three lessons in pedagogy that he took from them.

First, good teachers have a passion in their lives and a deep regard for other persons. That is they love. Second, they lead challenging and demanding lives that set high standards and inspire their charges. They are prophetic. Third, they are always fully engaged in the mystery of life, with hearts and minds full of wonder and awe, open to learn new things and understand new realities. (1996, p. 49)

Life Experiences

According to Convery (1999), narratives of teachers’ life experiences are beneficial in two ways. First, they constitute a primary source of privileged information that will undoubtedly improve our knowledge of education in general, and of teachers in particular. Second, they give teachers the opportunity to engage in reflective activities that, in turn, may lead to personal and professional development (p. 131).

Connelly and Clandinin (1994) also emphasize that stories are central to teacher education because the telling and writing of stories leads to awakening and to transformations in the practice of teachers. They stated:

The narrative study of experience brings body to mind and mind to body; it connects autobiography to action and an intentional future; it connects these to social history and direction; and it links the pluralistic extremes of formalism to the concreteness of specific actions. (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990, p. 246)

Teachers might not be aware of how certain experiences have influenced their lives. Nevertheless, when they have the opportunity to recall and go back in time and space to those events, they find answers to many lingering questions about themselves. It is at this time that a person is led to see explanations for specific behaviors. Convery (1999) says.
Such arguments for using teachers' narratives claim that through self-accounts, teachers can provide information that contributes to a more complete understanding of the educational process. This is complemented by the therapy, which narrators undergo in rediscovering themselves; teachers become enlightened by self-realization, and experience personal and professional growth. (p. 131)

These previous experiences in life can trigger choices and decision-making by giving people certain direction. Whether the experiences were positive or negative does not affect their decisive importance in a person's life. They may still be turning points and explanations for later changes in perspectives. Connelly and Clandinin (1990) agree that teachers' images of teaching, their strategies for representing subject matter, their knowledge of students and curriculum issues, their beliefs and values, can provide an important source of information to help stimulate other teachers' reflection about their own concerns and perceptions of teaching.

In a study by Bustos-Flores (2001), it was found that "personal experiences do assist in the initial formation of teacher beliefs" (p. 275). For example, some bilingual teachers have had experiences in negative language environments as young learners. These prior experiences may motivate them into demanding an equal educational opportunity in the form of bilingual education for their bilingual students. In other cases, positive experiences as learners within a nurturing bilingual education classroom setting convinced them that bilingual education was an effective methodology.

Apparently, early schooling experiences impact these bilingual teachers' beliefs about how bilingual children learn and how these children should be taught. For some bilingual education teachers, these shared experiences within similar contexts allowed them to intuitively understand the needs of bilingual learners. Having a "conscious" shared ethnic identity also modulated these bilingual teachers' beliefs about learning. (Bustos-Flores, 2001, p. 275)
Convery (1999) stated before, "It is claimed that in the process of retrieving and disclosing these 'rich seams of data' for educational research, teachers develop new understandings of their behavior which improves their confidence and, implicitly, their practice" (p. 132). Therefore, when teachers reflect on their life experiences and try to learn from them, they enrich their own practice in the process. When teachers tell their stories, others too may find attuned elements that can be transferred to their own context, thus achieving higher levels in their teaching experience.

Summary

In reviewing the literature regarding the aspects that influence effective bilingual education in Puerto Rico, I tried to synthesize the many issues that surround the topic. In summary, some of the elements that impact effective bilingual teaching are: social and political considerations; attempts to go forward to meet goals that have been established out of pure necessity, but without first establishing the needed infrastructure; the need for more rigorous teacher training, and the need to facilitate teacher development and support, to name a few. Moral sensibility and a sense of vocation are attributes that help teachers perform with effectiveness in spite of the limitations that might be present in their profession. Life experiences may also help teachers find direction for the job they have to do.
CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

Introduction
This qualitative study with a multiple-case study design sought to find out how exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico develop their level of proficiency. In the following sections, I present a detailed description of the design including the research questions, the participants, the methods for collecting data, and the procedures that were followed in collecting and analyzing the pertinent data.

Research Questions
The following questions were formulated to guide my study about exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico:

1. What evidence is there of bilingual education standards in classrooms that have been identified as exemplary?

2. In what ways do teacher training, administrative support, and community response contribute to exemplary practice?

3. How do life experiences and personal characteristics contribute to exemplary teaching?
Study Design

Enter into the world. Observe and wonder, experience, and reflect. To understand a world you must become part of that world while at the same time remaining separate, a part of and apart from. Go, then, and return to tell me what you see and hear, what you learn, and what you come to understand. (Patton, 1980, p. 121)

Patton (1980) describes in the previous quote what qualitative research is: a search for understanding through becoming part of what one wants to understand, while being able to observe from a separate stand. “Research studies that are qualitative are designed to discover what can be learned about some phenomenon of interest, particularly social phenomena where people are the participants” (Maykut and Morehouse, 1994, p. 43). They also suggest that “the results of a qualitative research study are most effectively presented within a rich narrative, sometimes referred to as a case study” (p. 47). Merriam (1988) considers a case study to be appropriate when information gleaned from participants is not subject to truth or falsity, and its aim is not to find the correct or true interpretation of the facts . . . but rather to eliminate erroneous conclusions so that one is left with the best possible, the most compelling interpretation. (p. 30)

In this study, a multiple-case study design was appropriate since I wanted to understand a particular event in depth by careful observation and relationship with the participants. In trying to understand how bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico become exemplary in their practice, it was important to verify their performance by comparing it to professional standards—National Association for Bilingual Education (1992). However it was also crucial to gain access to bilingual teachers’ perceptions and feelings about becoming an exemplary teacher because, as Featherstone (1995) said, often stories contain our best wisdom in its most complex yet most accessible form. When we distill that wisdom into maxims or propositions, we lose much of the richness of what he have learned, and often tell readers less than they already
know. Our story embeds what we have learned in all its rich complexity; the story changes as our understanding of it changes. (p. 93)

Seidman (1991) also sees stories as an epistemological source. "Stories are a way of knowing. Telling stories is essentially a meaning-making process. When people tell stories, they select details of their experiences from their stream of consciousness" (p. 1). Because I wanted to make meaning of these teachers' stories, I needed to go through "the process of selecting constitutive details of experience, reflecting on them, giving them order, and thereby making sense of them" (Seidman, p. 1). In choosing the qualitative case study design, I gave the participants the freedom to express and describe their experiences and feelings, and, at the same time, I was able to answer my research questions.

**Participants**

In order to learn from bilingual teachers about how they become exemplary in their practice, I needed a purposive sample, since "purposive sampling is based on the assumption that one wants to discover, understand, gain insight; therefore one needs to select a sample from which one can learn the most (Merriam, 1988, p. 48).

The participants in this study were a selected group of certified teachers teaching English in Puerto Rico (two-way bilingual or immersion), who were perceived by their administrators as being exemplary in their job. I developed indicators of that success based on the National Association for Bilingual Education (NABE. 1992) standards and indicators published by the Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico (1976), which very much resemble NABE's (1992). In abbreviated form, they are:

1. Requirements for bilingual teachers
a. Willingness to participate in an innovative program

b. Language proficiency in English and Spanish

c. Knowledge of different methods to teach second and first languages

d. Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children

e. Understanding and acceptance of all the cultures represented in the community

2. Pre-service and in-service training that include: (a) linguistics, (b) methods in teaching native and second languages, (c) curriculum design, (d) evaluating and adapting available educational materials, (e) creation of new materials, (f) development of language fluency, and (g) study of cultures represented in the community, including values, beliefs, and family structures.

The purposive sample consisted of 4 teachers presently employed in one of two modalities of bilingual education in one of the educational regions in Puerto Rico (immersion, two-way bilingual). The teachers were chosen based on the following criteria:

1. Two schools must belong to the public system, and two to the private system, but all must be accredited by either the Department of Education or a private accrediting organization.

2. Schools must be recognized by the Department of Education for its excellent English program.

3. Teachers must be recommended by the school administration as being successful in their bilingual teaching, according to the NABE standards.

7. Teachers must be certified by the Department of Education.
8. Teachers must have a minimum of 4 years of experience in the teaching of English in any of the modalities of bilingual education.

After the study had begun with the teachers recommended by the school principals, several other teachers from a public school, who also seemed to meet the established criteria for sample selection, asked to participate. Only the first 4 were included in the study due to the need for more time and effort in an in-depth inquiry of these teachers’ experiences, and also because I wanted to keep a balance with the number of private and public schools.

Data Collection Techniques

In this section I discuss myself as the research instrument, procedures for data collection, Gregorc’s Style Delineator, interviews, observations, and the data filing system.

Self as the Research Instrument

In a qualitative study, the main instrument to collect data is the researcher as a careful observer of the varied phenomena to be analyzed. Merriam (1988) stated, “the investigator is the primary instrument for gathering and analyzing data” (p. 36). She also added, “All observations and analyses are filtered through one’s worldview, one’s values, and one’s perspectives” (p. 39). Lincoln and Guba (1985) first advocated the merits of a human instrument since a person is the only instrument flexible enough to capture the complexity, subtlety, and constantly changing situations, which is the human experience.
Maykut and Morehouse (1994) further expound the concept of the researcher as the main instrument in a qualitative study. As they said,

Humans as instrument simply means that it is the person, with all of her or his skills, experience, background, and knowledge, as well as biases, which is the primary, if not the exclusive source of all data collection and analysis. (p. 26)

My interest in bilingual education began some years ago while working in a Chicago church school. After having taught ESL and Spanish for more than 20 years, and having taught teacher education courses both in Spanish and Portuguese, this was my first experience in teaching in the United States. The first year I was in charge of a K-4-multigrade class. While it was not officially a bilingual program, we acted as if it were since all the students were Hispanic and we felt at home speaking both languages, although the classes were conducted in English. My most thrilling experience was to be able to teach reading in English to the one first-grade student.

The next year, my nine-student second-grade class consisted of six different nationalities, and all the children spoke a different language at home. One of my concerns was how to tend to the needs of these students, which in some ways were similar, and in others very different from the students I had taught before. Being a second-language speaker myself, I found the situation somewhat intimidating and challenging, in spite of my Master's degree in Curriculum and Instruction. All the training I had had in bilingual education was a three-credit course in teaching English as a second language, taken about 20 years before. The rest was associations of formerly learned practices and pure instinct. I was always afraid of missing something.

Nevertheless, we had fun and learned a lot in our multicultural/multi-language classroom. The children met the objectives that had been established for them, and I learned that I
needed to develop a greater competence in multi-language education.

My next encounter with bilingual education occurred in Puerto Rico, where I taught Spanish in a bilingual academy, and later became its principal. There I was able to experience firsthand the impact of the social and political forces that surround the teaching of English as second language.

In summary, my experience in bilingual education intermingled with my 7-year experience as a teacher educator has shaped my interest in researching about bilingual teacher effectiveness and has helped me “see” issues in bilingual education.

Procedure for Data Collection

The following procedure was followed to collect the data needed to fulfill the purpose of the study:

1. I visited the office of the Director of the Regional District, which was the first step in procuring authorization for the study. He approved the idea and signed my request, but referred me to the District Superintendents, who are responsible for authorizing such research, according to the Carta Circular (Memorandum) from the Department of Education.

2. The superintendents suggested a number of schools that could be included in the study, and gave authorization to contact the school principals, who in turn would give permission to conduct the study on their premises.

3. I visited the school principals and presented my proposal to them. In all the cases, they showed interest and recommended some of their teachers whom they felt met the criteria to participate in the study. In one of the schools, four teachers wanted to
be included, which was not possible since I wanted to have more variety regarding the modality of bilingual teaching that was being used.

4. After the principals signed the authorization form, I met with the teachers and explained the purpose of the research and the procedure to be followed. They signed the Informed Consent Form and then we scheduled the interviews and the observations. In some cases, this was difficult because I had to plan around my own classes and supervision duties, and all my visits had to fit within the teachers’ schedules.

5. I also met with the principals for an interview during this time. The transcription was done and a member check was conducted in which the principals reviewed the transcription. In all cases they agreed with what was written.

9. Before I began my formal observations, I visited the classrooms just to get to know the environment and interview the teachers. The participants were very gracious, and at this time they also received a copy of the questionnaire to be handed back on my next visit. A member check was also conducted with these interviews.

10. The observations were done according to schedule in most cases, although we had to make some adjustments due to unexpected meetings or school activities. The post conferences were held immediately after the observation during the participants’ professional hour.

**Gregorc’s Style Delineator**

This is a self-analysis inventory developed by Anthony Gregorc in 1985. The results provide information about how people think and learn. According to the author, The *Style Delineator* is a research-based self-analysis instrument. It is designed to help reveal a special set of mental qualities and mediation channels available to you for handling the immediate demand of life. The in-depth study of style can
aid you to understand aspects of your Self and the environment. Serious study will reduce naivete, increase personal responsibility for thoughts and actions, and improve your relationships. (Gregorc, 1985, Descriptive Brochure)

Identifying the mind-styles of the participants was thought to provide a broader profile of the bilingual teacher, and was a relevant source of information for this study. I administered the inventory to each individual teacher during one of the post-conferences. The results were recorded, and the original document was returned to the teachers to be kept in their portfolios.

Interviews

Go forth now. Go forth and question. Ask and listen. The world is just beginning to open up to you. Each person you question can take you into a new part of the world. For the person who is willing to ask and listen, the world will always be new. (Patton, 1990, p. 278)

As a way of entering this part of the world of bilingual teaching, I conducted a semi-structured interview with the schools’ administrator after the teachers had been selected. The nature of the interview gave them some freedom to include related topics of interest while, at the same time, provided enough data for the research focus, based on my own interest as researcher. What follows was the proposed protocol:

1. Description of the school bilingual program
2. Reasons for choosing this teacher as exemplary
3. Teacher’s strengths and weaknesses
4. Awareness of bilingual teaching standards and competencies
5. Perceptions of students’ attitudes towards the learning of English
6. Perceptions of community support towards the learning of English
7. Main facilitators/hindrances to the program
8. Opportunities for professional development of bilingual teachers

9. Recommendations for training programs

The next step of my data collection was to conduct 2 semi-structured interviews with each selected teacher at the beginning and during the study, based on this proposed protocol:

1. Reasons for becoming a bilingual teacher
2. Awareness of bilingual teaching standards and competencies
3. Own strengths and weaknesses
4. Most helpful experiences from teacher training
5. Least helpful experiences from teacher training
6. Other life experiences in their teacher formation
7. Perceptions of students’ attitudes towards the teaching of English
8. Perceptions of community support towards the teaching of English
11. Main facilitators/hindrances in bilingual teaching.

Additional questions posed to the participants during informal conversations had to do with their perception of the bilingual education program in Puerto Rico.

1. Do you think the English teachers receive an adequate pre-service preparation?
2. What do you think are the main needs in the training of English teachers in Puerto Rico?
3. How do you see the future of the bilingual programs in Puerto Rico?
4. After the English teachers are employed, what is the support system available to them in the schools and in other organizations?
5. What factors do you think are most related to teacher excellence in bilingual education?

Since I was not allowed to use tape recorders in the public system, I decided not to use them in any of the cases. There is a precedent for this in Silverman's decision (1993) when he faced a similar situation. "Given the presumed sensitivity of the occasion, tape-recording was not attempted. Instead, detailed handwritten notes were kept, using a separate sheet for each consultation" (p. 11). I used my research log and field notes which were transcribed immediately after the meetings, and then brought back to the teachers for a member check.

Questionnaire

A written questionnaire, adapted from one used by Frank González (1993), was administered to collect information about the training received by the teachers, including aspects such as coursework, student teaching experience, and instructors. It also included demographic data and some open questions about the participants' education as bilingual teachers. The information in the questionnaire was directly transcribed to a template to develop the teachers' profile, and the answers to open questions were coded to look for common themes.

Observations

"Qualitative researchers are interested in understanding people's experience in context. The natural setting is the place where the researcher is most likely to discover, or uncover, what is to be known about the phenomenon of interest" (Maykut and Morehouse, 1994, p. 45).
Following this guideline, I decided to observe the four bilingual teachers in their classrooms. One observation with a post conference was to be conducted every 2 weeks (3 in total) for each selected teacher. It was not possible to follow the original plan of one observation every 2 weeks in all the cases due to teaching schedules and schools’ activities; therefore, the observations were spread out during a period of 5 months. The observations were focused mainly on the application of teaching competencies as described on the standards for bilingual education. The following indicators guided them:

1. Classroom environment—conducive to learning?
2. Teaching methods—Innovative? Appropriate?
3. Content—Relevant to students? Appropriate?
4. Incorporation of native culture
5. Students’ response
6. Dealing with students’ attitudes
7. Application of language-related theories
8. Students’ performance
9. Teachers’ proficiency in both languages.

During the post-conference, I tried to obtain information such as: The reasons for using different methods and strategies? Where were these learned? Had they been easy to apply? Why or why not? Also, I asked about the rationale for decisions made regarding students’ response as observed during the class, level of satisfaction in the job, etc. I was able to look at students’ work that could be an indicator of the way they were being taught. The teachers were very willing to show me the results of their work as
indicated by their students’ performance, especially when there were special projects like Expeditionary Learning and contests or any other learning experience that was beyond what is traditional.

Data Files

The data collected from the participants through interviews, observations, and Gregorc’s *Style Delineator* were organized in several volumes, one for each teacher. These volumes contain transcripts of the interviews and field notes, together with some copies of documents provided by the participants. They also contain the analysis done in order to identify the themes in the stories. The volume number and page are used as citations when referring to in-text quotations by the teacher.

Data Analysis

The qualitative data were analyzed by searching for patterns and categories in the answers to open-ended questions, and also in field notes about observations and reading of documents. This analysis, as Maykut and Morehouse (1994) define it, was “an ongoing research activity” (p. 46). To look for categories, I set up the transcriptions of data in 2 columns. One column was for the text and the other one was for the categories it represented. The categories were based on the standards for bilingual education and on the elements that influence teacher effectiveness. As I read carefully each line in the first column, I color coded and underlined words that illustrated those concepts.

The initial leads provided by the accumulation of data were followed with more observations, reading of documents, and more questions about the reasons they had for maintaining their commitment to excellent teaching. Additional themes that emerged
were some common personal characteristics such as responsibility, creativity, punctuality, and a tendency to work hard which pointed at their high degree of vocation to teaching, and moral sensibility, as demonstrated through the accounts of their life experiences.

I summarized the major themes, and integrated all results to describe the main characteristics of the elements that play a part in the achievement of effectiveness by the four bilingual teachers.

**Credibility and Trustworthiness**

Triangulation—the use of multiple sources of data for checking out results—has been suggested by researchers (Maykut & Morehouse, 1994; Merriam, 1988) to ensure consistency and credibility in a qualitative study. They propose that a “combination of interviews and observations from the field, along with reviews of relevant documents increases the likelihood that the phenomenon of interest is being understood from various points of view and ways of knowing” (Maykut & Morehouse, 1994, p. 146).

Denzin (1970) justified the use of triangulation by stating, “The rationale for this strategy is that the flaws of one method are often the strengths of another, and by combining methods, observers can achieve the best of each, while overcoming their unique deficiencies” (p. 308). Even though Silverman (1993) regards Denzin’s advocacy of triangulation as a mere “aggregation of data,” (p. 157) he proposes several ground rules for its use. “Begin from a theoretical perspective and choose methods and data which will give you an account of structure and meaning from within that perspective” (p. 157).
Following Silverman's (1993) suggestion, I began the collection of data aiming at evidences of exemplary performance of bilingual teachers according to standards published by professional organizations as my theoretical perspective (National Association for Bilingual Education, 1992; Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico, 1976). From there, I proceeded to ask and observe how the participants achieved that level of performance based on the contribution of elements such as pre-service training, administrative support, community support, and personal attributes, as defined by the Department of Education of Puerto Rico (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997). Multiple techniques were used as described in the section of data collection. Member checks made sure that reports of interviews agreed with what the participants intended to convey. I checked and discussed with the participants the field notes on classroom observations, and in addition, I kept a journal throughout the entire process to be able to reflect upon possible explanations of the data.

According to Elliot Mischler (1990), "the ultimate test of the trustworthiness of a qualitative study is whether we believe the findings strongly enough to act on them” (p. 147). My work as researcher has been motivated by my job as a teacher educator, for whom the findings of the present study have obvious significance, and for whom the recommendations in the final chapter establish a clear path for action. I have been able to see clearly and from a different perspective how important it is to listen to the stories of those teachers who labor within a different context from the one taught in college. I have learned that, as a teacher educator, I cannot isolate myself from the realities of the practice of teaching, and that these realities must provide the guidelines for planning and
implementing sound training and to make decisions about what should be emphasized in teacher education programs.

The present quest for ways to make bilingual teacher education more attuned to its original intention is not unique. In one way or the other, several areas in the field of education are researched every year. Results might have had an impact on the way the system works. However, as researcher, I have to be aware that reported results do not always prompt action from those in charge of implementing them. Notwithstanding, the following standards were followed in conducting the study:

1. Adherence to the highest appropriate technical standards
2. Practice within the limits of my professional training and competence
3. Guarantee of the honesty and integrity of the entire research process
4. Respect for the security, dignity, and self-worth of the respondents, program participants, and other stakeholders
5. Observance of Christian and current professional ethics and standards.

Generalization

According to Merriam (1988), generalization is not a goal of qualitative research. Nonetheless, to Eisner (1991), "one of the most useful of human abilities is the ability to learn from the experience of others" (p. 202). He calls this kind of learning "to generalize;" therefore, "generalizing can be regarded not only as going beyond the information given, but also as transferring what has been learned from one situation to another" (Eisner, 1991, p. 198). In a qualitative study, this is most likely to happen. Readers will learn according to their own background and experiences and will grab those concepts and ideas that best fit their own need.
In *The Enlightened Eye*, Eisner (1991) goes on to explain that we generalize skills, images, and ideas.

It is the generalizing capacity of the image that leads us to look for certain qualities of classroom life, features in teaching, or aspects of discussion, rather than others. Once we secure images of excellence in these realms, we apply them to other aspects of the world to which we believe them to be relevant. (1991, p. 199)

Based on this concept, I looked for certain qualities of an exemplary bilingual teacher in Puerto Rico and their classroom lives, for features in their teaching and in the environment they work in, with the purpose of securing an image of an effective teacher that will help teacher educators and teachers interested in this field to learn from the experience of others.

**Human Subjects Considerations**

The study was conducted after receiving clearance from the Andrews University Human Subjects Review Board. The main discomforts for the participants in the present study were the time needed for interviews, and also the self-consciousness caused by being observed in a job setting. As was expected, the last one became minimal once I was able to develop a trusting relationship with the participants. As for the time invested, they saw it as a means for professional growth.

Informed consent, anonymity, and confidentiality statements were visibly included in the survey document to ensure the ethical aspects of the procedures followed in this study. For the written report of the study, pseudonyms were used to describe the participants and schools involved. Permission letters were procured from school superintendents and principals before approaching the participants. The Department of Education of Puerto Rico has a well-defined protocol for validation of instruments and
investigations conducted in the public school system. In this study, the interviews were not recorded due to the established protocol, but extensive hand written notes were kept and transcribed, and later verified by the participants for consistency with what they had intended to convey.
CHAPTER 4

CASE STUDIES

Introduction

This chapter is about the strivings, satisfactions, hopes, and heartaches that compose the bilingual teacher’s life and work in Puerto Rico. It deals with the aspirations and struggles common to a large number of teachers, as described by only a few of those who have managed to stay ahead. It tries to go deep in the search for meanings that we all seek to embrace.

This is a documentation of the personal journey of those who participated in the present study. Their voices are heard throughout the document. Some of them were glad to be able to voice their triumphs and victories, but they were also sad to acknowledge their lost battles. The unveiling of intimate feelings was a mixture of pride and humility as these brave teachers reflected on their performance. All glowed with the dedication of their calling and fiercely defended their mission, while resolutely voicing hopeful expectations of the future.

Getting to know this small sample of excellent bilingual teachers has inspired me, while at the same time, has brought humbleness to my heart. To be able to witness their everyday struggles against their own reality in the form of sometimes-reluctant students, or disengaged community, or lack of resources or even limited professional training, was an eye-opener. But it was more so to be able to see and feel their determination to
accomplish their mission, to be able to see and feel their love and devotion for the task that was bestowed upon them. I can honestly say that I admire them and that they rightly deserve the coveted words of acceptance: "Well done, good and faithful servant! You have been faithful with a few things; I will put you in charge of many things. Come and share your master's happiness!" (Matt 25:21 NIV).

**Going Public With an Extraordinary Team**

PBS 17 was an obligated target for my study because it is the only public intermediate school with a bilingual program in the area. Due to the established procedure to allow research in the public system, it took me longer than I expected to go through the whole process. A first visit, which had been arranged by the District Superintendent, had the purpose of presenting my proposal to the principals of both the elementary and the intermediate schools. My plan was to include one teacher from each level. The two women showed great interest and promised to talk to the teachers and let me know if anyone was interested in participating in the study.

A few days later I learned from the elementary-school principal that none of the teachers was interested so far, but that she would keep trying. However, when I called the intermediate school, the principal informed me that the two English teachers were interested and wanted to know more about the study. She arranged for an interview and introduced me to them. I was immediately attracted to this dynamic duo. Their happy disposition and willingness to explore new adventures were evident from the first moment. I was more than happy to find this twosome who represented a real promise of fruitful work. I could see that they worked well together, and that they shared many of the experiences I wanted to portray in my study. Therefore, I decided to include Teresa
and Alex as a team, instead of searching for another participant. Although their stories take different paths, they converge in many situations.

The School

My first impression when I visited PBS 17 was of surprise. I expected to see a new building with all imaginable facilities to house this new project sponsored by the Government. The contrast between reality and my imagination was extraordinary. What I found was a very old facility right in the heart of town, next to the church square. The building had been abandoned when the new high school was built a few years before, and since then, it had served many purposes, including refuge for hurricane victims.

When education state officers tried to locate a host community for the regional bilingual school, they did not find many willing to face the challenge. It appeared that people were afraid of the implications of the new project. However, as often happens, there was one small rural community that rose up to the challenge. Riverside Town decided that they wanted to host the bilingual school. Since the new school had to be separate from any other program, it had to have its own building. Not having any other option, the town officers decided to make the necessary repairs and “recover” the abandoned facilities for the new bilingual school.

Today there are about 250 students coming from different communities. It is a regional school that offers its services to students mainly coming from the United States with low proficiency in Spanish. The group is complete with native students who want to participate in the bilingual program. To be able to enter, native students must apply well ahead, have a GPA of at least 3.50, and present a personal portfolio as evidence of their previous achievements. The waiting list is very long. There are three classes in each
grade from seventh to ninth, and a 10th-grade class, which was added later to continue to serve the students who had begun the program.

Although the school building is old, the students and parents seem to be satisfied so far. There is a library with a full-time librarian, but the equipment and resources are very limited.

Most teachers in this school, as well as the principal, came from other cities and have relocated themselves in the area. To be accepted, they had to undergo rigorous scrutiny, since the Superintendent wanted to have the best teachers available. They are all bilingual and most of them have double majors.

Alex's Story

Alex is a very active, fast-paced young man. He was born in Puerto Rico 25 years ago from a North American mother and a Puerto Rican father. His family moved to Germany when he was a little boy, and spent several years there while his father was in the military service. He went to an English-only school at the military base until sixth grade. The family later moved to Puerto Rico where Alex continued his studies in Spanish.

As a boy Alex learned English and Spanish at home, from his mother and father, respectively. He constantly visited the United States where he continued to learn English. While in college, he also took advanced courses in English, but in his everyday living he spoke Spanish. "I have always been good at languages, and I can speak some French also" (Vol. 3, p. 2). His proficiency in English and Spanish is excellent in speaking, reading, and writing within an academic context. Going back to his own childhood and family memories, Alex confided:
My mother and I would speak English at home and we would use it as a secret language when we did not want my younger brother to understand. However, even when he never lived in the United States, he learned at home. He once surprised us by speaking in English about what we were trying to hide from him. Mom always speaks English at home, so my brother learned, as I did. (Vol. 3, p. 4)

All categories in the Gregorc’s Style Delineator (Gregorc, 1985) point at Alex as a person with a well-balanced mind-style. The results of his inventory were all in the intermediate range (CS=26, AS=22, AR=26, CR=26), which helps to understand his broad-mindedness. “Broad-minded individuals acknowledge and honor their strengths and weaknesses. They develop and use all the channels within their proper limits. They also live and let live” (Gregorc, 1985, Descriptive Brochure).

Alex gives high priority to friendship. According to him, the things he likes best in life are “my friends, a smile, honesty, and love” (Vol. 3, p. 32). On the other hand, he does not tolerate unfriendliness, hate, or betrayal.

Professional Training

Alex went to a private college in Puerto Rico to major in Biology. Instead, he became an English teacher. What made him forfeit his primary goal when he was already on his way to attain it? As he said, he was “always good at languages” (Vol. 3, p. 2), and he worked in college as an English tutor. This led him to make an incursion into the Department of Education to take a few credits there. He did so well—“even better than a lot of the education majors,” as he expounded happily—that friends and teachers recommended him to switch to teaching. “So, I took a few more courses, and then ended up completing my B.A. as an ESL teacher” (Vol. 3, p. 2). This decision made his mother very happy because she was one of his supporters. “My mother would always suggest
that I become a teacher. Even when she is not a teacher herself, she would tell me what she would do if she were a teacher. My great-grandmother was also a teacher” (Vol. 3, p. 2).

While in college, Alex had instructors who were fluent English speakers. This, added to his home environment, and helped him develop excellent language skills. His ESL program included issues like: (a) assessment of student’s language proficiency in Spanish and English, (b) understanding the nature of language, and (c) how to identify and understand structural differences between the child’s first and second languages.

Even when his college education was geared towards teaching English as a second language, it did not include any of the following instructional issues: (a) linguistics, (b) methodology in the native and second languages, (c) curriculum design, (d) revision and adaptation of existing teaching materials, (e) creation of new materials, and (f) study of the cultures represented in the community, including values, beliefs, and family structures. As Alex explains it, most of his courses consisted in advanced literature and grammar, but little methodology (Vol. 3, p. 4).

Alex sees himself as a successful bilingual teacher mostly “due to my motivation, creativity, and will to learn” (Vol. 3, p. 5). According to him, he has had to read, study, and work really hard in order to manage the shortcomings present in his training (Vol. 3, p. 32). The most helpful experience in his preparation as a bilingual teacher has been working as one. “Studying at a university is very different from working at a school or university. Working and learning from your own mistakes will give you the tools that you need in order to be successful” (Vol. 3, p. 5). He now plans to be certified as a
bilingual teacher and is working on his M.A. during the summers. Because he is a restless learner, Alex would like to have some teaching experiences in the United States.

I asked Alex what he would do if he could do whatever he wanted as a teacher. His answer was, "Travel, do talent shows, special projects, and buy more materials" (Vol. 3, p. 32).

**Professional Life**

Today Alex teaches English to five groups in seventh through ninth grades. He has 4 years of experience and has been working in his present position for 3 years as a certified teacher. Teacher Alex considers himself to have very definite strengths as a bilingual teacher. This is how he describes them:

I can be very creative in teaching English. I sing, I use drama, dance, and writing; and I also integrate other subjects like math and social studies. I see learning English as a way of living, because we are using language to do many things.

I think I am a "workaholic," since I work a lot. I am very persistent, and try to impress the kids and make them like the subject. I try to appeal to their emotions. I focus more in oral communication, so I teach them techniques to do well in oral presentations. I tell the girls that even if they compete for Miss Universe for their beauty, if they cannot talk properly, it is not going to help. (Vol. 3, p. 2)

Agreeing with his students, Alex considers one of his weaknesses to "give a lot of work to the students and to expect a lot from them" (Vol. 3, p. 2). "I am a perfectionist," he goes on to explain, "which could be bad sometimes" (Vol. 3, p. 2). In a more serious vein, Alex thinks that he should help the students more with their writing skills, although they are asked to write journals, poems, stories, etc.

Nevertheless, Alex is happy with what he is doing. He perceives the support from the parents of his students in a positive way. "Parents want their children to learn..."
English. They even fight to get a place at the school. They reinforce their children’s learning” (Vol. 3, p 3).

Alex is satisfied with how the bilingual program is handled in the administrative level. He goes on to express,

I do not see any hindrance, but a lot of support. We have good administrative support from the Superintendent and the Principal. . . . We have excellent teachers. Most have double majors. We go through a lot of staff development. (Vol. 3, p. 3)

Classroom Environment

Like the rest of the classrooms in PBS 17, Alex’s room is small and old, and in need of paint. The huge iron door needs to be locked at all times, and it is the only one in the room. This makes it hard for the teacher, who has to keep the keys at hand to open every time someone knocks at the door.

The difference is on what is inside the room. It is surprising to see how this young man has gone out to get what he needs to teach effectively. His classroom even has air conditioning, which is not very common in Puerto Rico. What stands out, though, is that this room is well equipped with modern technology. There are two computer islands (10 in all) for the students and a printer, plus the teacher’s own computer, all set up in a network. There is a digital projector and TV/VCR set, a radio/tape recorder, and several headphones. There are a few tables around the room for group work. When asked how he got the computers, Alex said matter-of-factly. “I wrote a proposal and got the funds” (Vol. 3, p. 3).

There are different reading series to match students’ levels. According to the teacher, he switches every year and he does not have a specific textbook. He does not like to repeat the same books all over. So, he collects books from different sources and

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
keeps them in boxes under the tables, since there is no storage space in the classroom, ready to be used when they need them. There are also dictionaries and other reference books, computer guides, etc. Alex has prepared his own collection of "Literature for Young Adults" with favorite pieces of literature, which he uses with the students.

One side of the room is equipped with tables and chairs for small and whole group activities. When the students are not using the computers, they work at the tables. There is space for about 25 students.

In a setting like this, one would like to know what the students' attitudes about the English program are. According to Alex,

Basically they like it. They don't like to study grammar, or to write a lot. But they enjoy reading and doing oral reports. Most kids have lived in or traveled to other countries, so they don't have negative attitudes towards learning English. They have encountered other students with the same experiences and are accepted, not rejected by them. Students want to be in this school to learn English. (Vol. 3, p. 3)

A Typical Day

The school day begins for Alex at 8:00 in the morning, when he greets his homeroom group, 8-2. During the next 10 minutes or so, they will deal with class issues before the lesson begins formally at 8:10. At 9:00, there is one preparation time for the teacher. This time is used to plan, grade papers, prepare lessons in the computer, etc. Sometimes teachers with the same schedule get together to work on some proposal or to plan special activities for the whole school.

During the next two periods Alex teaches two groups of eighth-graders, before lunchtime at 11:30. Most of the time the teachers go out to eat together, since everything is close by, and they can be back for the next class on time. In Alex's case, he comes
back for his second preparation time from 12:30 to 1:20. Next are his two last classes, comprised by the seventh-graders. The school day is over at 3:00 in the afternoon.

This routine is repeated every day except on Wednesdays. On that day, the teachers have a 45-minute period to work with their homeroom groups. Different activities are planned, like orientation, evaluation, and so forth. They also have special presentations according to the needs of the students. All the periods are shortened to give way to the extra time for homerooms. During the second semester, Wednesdays were also the days when Alex took his homeroom group to the Expeditionary Learning trips.

**Evidence of Application of Standards**

One of the elements I was looking for while observing Alex and the other teachers was evidence of the application of the standards that had been published by the National Association for Bilingual Education in 1992, or any variation of them as had been published before by the Association of Teachers of Puerto Rico (1976). In a condensed form, this is an account of such evidence.

Willingness to participate in innovative programs

If there is anyone willing to participate in innovative programs, that is Alex. He is forever searching for something new with which he can motivate his students and teach them effectively. First of all, his participation in the development of the bilingual school is paramount, since he has been there from the beginning. Once it was established and running, there were other areas to be explored.

One of the programs going on in PBS 17 is Expeditionary Learning. This is a federally funded program that intends to develop interactive learning with a constructivist
flavor. There is a poster in Alex's room that defines Expeditionary Learning, and that is exactly what he wants for his students. "Learning is an expedition into the unknown. Expeditions draw together personal experience and intellectual growth to promote self-discovery and the construction of knowledge" (Vol. 3, p. 11).

The principles of Expeditionary Learning are exposed in a poem in two more posters that say,

The primacy of self-discovery,
The having of wonderful ideas,
The responsibility for learning,
Intimacy and caring,
Success and failure.

Collaboration and competition,
Diversity and inclusivity,
The natural world,
Solitude and Reflection
Service and Compassion.
(Vol. 3, p. 11)

All the teachers are involved in Expeditionary Learning, but Alex was the one who wrote the proposal. He received some orientation about proposal writing, but mostly he learned on his own. The school was awarded some Federal funds and the program was begun. Although they have received guidelines and even visited schools in the United States, the curriculum is to be developed by the teachers themselves. As Teresa said, "We are playing by ear" (Vol. 4, p. 6). Each teacher works with his/her own homeroom class, but Teresa and Alex work together planning and executing their plans. They have received orientation and are being monitored by specialists in this program, and at the end of the year, there will be an evaluation of their performance.

Both Alex's and Teresa's group are working around the theme "What's up, Community?" The teachers began a series of workshops in which the students
researched and learned about the community's resources from past, present, and future. Other workshops dealt with leadership and research skills. During the leadership workshop, Alex's students chose and drew their group's seal, and then wrote in their journals why they chose the leader of the group. Different teachers serve as resources for the workshops. Next they will begin with their expeditions to the community. Every Wednesday they will visit a different site. Activities include mainly service projects in the community and keeping a journal about their participation.

An example of the activities for 1 week was written on Alex's board: (a) cleaning the school, (b) presenting an oral report with the topic *Problems in the Community*, (c) tutoring and helping at another school in town, and (d) field trip to Castillo Serralles in Ponce. I asked Alex about the kind of tutoring the students would offer in the school they were planning to visit. He said that it would be mostly reading, but also whatever the teachers indicate.

The next week, the announcements included a test, an oral report on the topic of *Careers*, which should deal with where to study, what to do, where to work, and general information about the topic. It also included a report concerning the field trip to Ponce based on a few guide questions provided by the teacher.

A propos the results of Expeditionary Learning, Alex said they have achieved a lot considering that it is a new program. Most students are motivated, although there are always a small number who do not care and just take advantage of the flexibility of the activities. He thinks that these students might work better in a traditional setting, but being in a more flexible one, they tend to lay back and not work as they are expected.
However, this is not stopping him. Alex is already planning on how things are going to be different for next year. He plans to use portfolios and other means of assessment. He smiles as he says, "This is new, and therefore we are learning" (Vol. 3, p. 11).

Another activity going on in this class is a Pen Pal project. This one is conducted only with the 8-1 group because Alex thinks they are more motivated for this kind of experience. During one of my visits, some students were complaining about not receiving any answers to their letters.

Language proficiency in Spanish and English

The upbringing and training Alex had helped him acquire fluency in both Spanish and English. Like him, all the other teachers at PBS 17 are fully bilingual. He thinks that having a bilingual teacher is such an advantage for the students. The history teacher, for example, teaches his class in Spanish because of the content. But there are some students who do not speak Spanish at all. Therefore the teacher helps by translating or assigning articles in English. This is an advantage for the whole class, because they can study in any language and they can develop both. They watch videos in English or Spanish, and read in English or Spanish. In the English class, however, everything is taught in English, although sometimes the teacher might explain a difficult term or answer a student by speaking in Spanish.

I was able to verify that Alex can speak both languages without an accent and expresses himself freely and naturally. He constitutes a correct model for his students, although he speaks only English to them, both inside and outside the classroom.
Knowledge of different methods to teach second and native languages

Alex has learned on his own many of the teaching strategies he uses in his classes. His forte is the use of technology, which he applies effectively, although he was not taught to do it in college. He explained its use as follows:

I use them [computers] a lot in my teaching. I teach grammar with lessons I prepare myself. In other cases, we use the software provided by the textbook publishers. We make Power Point presentations, and we do research and write reports, and story writing. (Vol. 3, p. 3)

In one eighth-grade class I observed, the theme for the day was non-fiction literature, which had been going on for several days. The objective for the day was to compare the attack on Pearl Harbor and the attack on New York City on September 11. The teacher briefly introduced the class and explained what was going to be done during the period. The students were required to copy several questions in their journals, which they would answer during the class. The questions were projected on the white board from the computer. “What do you think is the message of that terrorist attack to the rest of the world? If you were to educate children about terrorism, what would you tell them?” (Vol. 3, p. 6). One more question asked them to compare and contrast events that occurred during both attacks.

Next the students watched a Power Point presentation about the terrorist attack on September 11. Students commented aloud (some in Spanish) as they watched the infamous pictures of the planes and the buildings bursting into flames. They seemed struck, but some managed to comment about the background music. Someone said that it was “depressing” (Vol. 3, p. 6). There was no follow-up on this comment.
After the slide presentation, the students watched a documentary video about the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbor. The video was presented with closed caption so all students could understand better. Alex explained that having the audio and the reading at the same time improved the students' comprehension. After the students had watched the video in English, the teacher asked some questions about the content and some students answered in Spanish. The teacher did not seem to mind, but the majority of the students answered in English. Last, students were required to write in their journals and answer the questions that had been copied earlier.

For this unit, the students have studied newspaper articles, biographies, and have researched information about the historical events of Pearl Harbor. They have been asked to write a report on the movie including: events, characters, setting, themes involved, plot, conflicts, elements of non-fiction, etc. I was able to read one of these reports brought by "an early bird." I was very impressed with the quality of the work.

Not all classes run smoothly, though. Even with many resources and possibilities open before them, sometimes motivation runs low, both for students and teachers alike. This was evident in another class when the teacher followed more or less the same procedure to present another topic. Alex began with a short review about the concept of Capitalism. He then projected on the board, from the computer, the questions that the students were expected to answer at the end of the class. The last question was: "Do you think Capitalism is positive or negative? Why?" (Vol. 3, p. 8).

He continued with a computer presentation about several concepts related to Capitalism. One student asked about the meaning of the word in Spanish. Alex explained it briefly and then continued in English. Later, the students were asked to
watch a video about Capitalism. This time they talked aloud about other things, and asked personal questions to the teacher instead of watching the video. One boy was really loud, commenting and shouting regarding what he was watching.

Alex tried to refocus their attention by asking some questions in reference to the content of the video. “What was the importance of the train?” “What was the Industrial Revolution?” (Vol. 3, p. 8). The students’ answers were not very convincing. All along, there were several interruptions to the class. Some students knocked at the door and two other teachers came in asking for some information.

Later Alex explained to me that the principal and two other teachers were not at the school for the week and, even when they left work for the students, the remaining teachers had extra work. Apparently the students were somewhat restless. That is why they were not very interested in the class, and why they had so many interruptions since other teachers came to ask for information. Alex was not in charge of the school, but apparently his colleagues see him as a source of information.

Fortunately, these incidents are not common. For the next period, Alex had invited Teresa, the other English teacher, to present a lesson on fiction literature. She used a Power Point presentation with definitions and other basic information that caught everyone’s attention. The students remained quiet and took notes. Meanwhile, the teacher asked questions about fairy tales. Her voice was clear and she showed enthusiasm. Some students gave answers in Spanish, but the teacher listened to and acknowledged them, and then went on with her class in English.

Next, Teresa read Cinderella’s story illustrated in Power Point, while Alex handled the computer. There was an interruption when a student screamed. Although the
presenter stopped, Alex went over and quietly took care of the situation, which had to do with a screen saver in another computer. Teresa continued her story. She provided students with copies of two different versions of the Cinderella story. Several girls were asked to read out loud in front of the class. Boys were asked to read the second story. The teacher asked about similarities and differences in both stories and the students responded to them with gusto. The class period seemed very short.

Although Alex is not formally using portfolio assessment with his students, written tests are not the only means he uses for their evaluation. The students are asked to write journals, make oral and written reports, do different kinds of research, make posters, etc.

As I was going over some journals, I read one that seemed to be written by a very slow student. This surprised me somewhat, since these students are supposed to be good achievers. Alex explained that it belonged to a special education student. Even when he does not perform at the level of his peers, this student is expected and prompted to participate equally. Thus, he writes his journal as everybody else. The teacher evaluates him on his own merits.

I asked Alex if he thinks cable TV can be of help for his students.

Yes. I sometimes suggest specific programs or movies that I have watched and I think will be good for them. Students are very involved with Play Station and entertainment centers. They have to read the instructions in magazines, so they keep learning English. (Vol. 3, p. 13)

How does Alex manage his grammar lessons? I was very interested in observing how he teaches grammar with the computer. One day's lesson was Finding Verbs (action verbs, linking verbs, helping verbs). Alex used the computer and projector to present definitions that the students copied in their notebook. Then there were some practice
exercises. The students complained about having to copy too much, but they had to do it anyway. At the end of the class Alex signed the notebooks before the students left.

Even when the lesson was taught in a traditional way, the use of the computer to present the information made it more attractive.

Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children

Alex sees middle school as a hard time for the students. "They have growth problems because of their hormones and everything, so they ask questions about life" (Vol. 3, p. 12). What Alex means is that these students are in need of someone they can trust and from whom they can receive honest answers to their questions. "At first, I felt somewhat awkward, but then thought, 'I'm the teacher, I might as well face it'" (Vol. 3, p. 12). So there are times when he sits on top of his desk and responds to their questions with straight facts. Other times he brings guests to talk about special topics such as HIV and drugs.

The students were so concerned with the things they learned about HIV! They often bring questions in regards of things they've heard or read about. Maybe because I'm young, they think I can relate to them. They hear things on TV or at home and they don't ask their parents, but ask me. They ask, 'If you were a father, would you do this or that?' I'm very honest with them. (Vol. 3, p. 12)

Understanding and acceptance of all cultures represented in the community

Although most students in Alex's class are Puerto Rican, they represent different communities and even different cultures. Students coming from the United States behave and think differently from the native students. Moreover, coming from a rural town or from the big city makes a difference in these students' lives. Alex has to deal with their
slang, different accents and other things that might create discord if not approached with empathy and understanding. When interviewed, he said that to understand and accept all cultures represented in the community “is a must” in his school (Vol. 3, p. 33).

Students’ Performance

One factor that helps one to conclude whether a teacher is effective or not is how the students perform. Are they really learning, or are they being entertained? Teacher Alex provided me with a copy of the results of the 2001 Puerto Rican Test (*Prueba Puertorriqueña*), which is the only standardized test they get besides the College Entrance Examination. This test, which is administered to third-, sixth-, and ninth-graders, is written in Spanish and covers several competencies like knowledge of Spanish, math, social studies, science, and English. The ninth-grade students in PBS 17 did extremely well in English, as could be expected (93% passed in opposition to 25% in another school). Only 64% passed the Spanish test, while other monolingual schools in the area obtained up to 83% of passing students. In math, science, and social studies all the schools scored very low (Vol. 3, pp. 9, 42). Even so, PBS 17 was ahead by a couple of percentage points. Although it was not a high performance for any of the schools, Alex was satisfied to show that at least they are not doing poorer than the others.

At the end of the third marking period, I asked Alex to describe the results he had with his students. Students are grouped homogeneously for the main part. Groups 7-1, 8-1, and 9-1 are the top students. They study advanced mathematics and although the other classes are not necessarily advanced, Alex and the other teachers feel that they can demand more from these groups. They often have special projects, and they are all straight-A students. Another good group is 8-2, for example. Most of them get A’s, but
there are a few B's in there, whereas 8-3 (Alex's homeroom) is mainly a B group; 7-2 is a mixed group, and 10\textsuperscript{th} grade is "catch-it-all" because it is the only group. In all the groups, except in the top ones, there are occasionally a couple of D's and F's.

**Summary**

To say that everything is smooth and shining in Alex's professional life would be incongruent with real life. However, he is very persistent and very intent in learning and practicing what he learns. No obstacle seems to be big enough to stop him. He is sure that there is always a way around a problem. And most important, he is determined to get to and stay at the top of his profession.

**Teresa's Story**

Teresa was born in New York and came to live in Puerto Rico when she was in 10\textsuperscript{th} grade. Her coming to the Island was a challenge from the beginning because of her lack of proficiency in Spanish and the adjustments she had to make in order not only to study, but also to be integrated into the new environment. As she went through a total immersion program, she was able to learn perfect Spanish.

Teresa describes herself as "responsible, hard working, caring and understanding, self-improving, tolerant, and giving" (Vol. 4, p. 29). When asked about things she does not tolerate, she mentioned "being late or not being prepared" (Vol. 4, p. 29). On the other hand, she loves "meeting new people, learning new things, sharing with my family, and being in control of things" (Vol. 4, p. 29). Teresa keeps very busy also as a dedicated baker, something that runs in her family, since her mother and her daughter also compete for the pleasure of making delicious desserts. Her life is sweet and satisfactory.
**Professional training**

When I interviewed Teresa, my first question was: "Why did you become a bilingual teacher?" Her answer came matter-of-factly. "Teaching was one of my career goals. I first wanted to be a veterinarian and teaching was second. But to be a veterinarian I had to leave Puerto Rico, and I just decided to stick to my second choice" (Vol. 4, p. 2).

Actually, her motivation was deeper than that. Teresa’s becoming an English teacher had to do with a very personal experience. As explained above, she came to Puerto Rico as a teenager full of expectations and desires to excel in school. However, it was not to be, at least for some time.

The school lowered me one grade because all the classes were in Spanish and my Spanish was very poor. They said there was no place in English 10, so I was left out of the only subject in which I could do well. I had a hard time in Spanish. But I also saw the rest of the students not being able to speak English. The ones who knew a little would not talk in English for fear. This experience made me think of ways to make students like English. They are afraid of speaking it because people might laugh at them. Also, the books are outdated. The one I used when I was in school was very bad and dry. We didn’t like it. It was not attractive. (Vol. 4, p. 2)

Teresa studied at a private college in Puerto Rico, where she obtained her B.A. in education with a major in English. She is a certified teacher who considers her proficiency in English as excellent in the academic context (oral, reading, writing).

Her pre-service preparation was a very positive experience. In college she had instructors who were fluent speakers of English in her English courses. "I had wonderful teachers and good concentration courses," she emphasized (Vol. 4, p. 4). This experience provided her with excellent models that helped develop further her knowledge of English.

Because her major was in English, her program covered issues like philosophy,
theory, and history of bilingual education, and also included language-related issues such as: (a) assessing student's language proficiency in English, (b) theories and application of second language teaching, (c) understanding the nature of language, and (d) how to identify and understand structural differences between the child's first and second languages. She became able to organize and teach reading/language lessons in English and to organize and teach content area lessons in English.

In general, she also learned instructional skills like the ones expected from teachers in any other subject, like to teach literacy across the curriculum, to direct students in inquiry/discovery learning, to set up small group instruction, to manage individualized instruction, to use alternative assessment, and to use media and audiovisual materials as well as computer technology to assist instruction. This last skill is one in which she excels a lot. She has been able to integrate technology in her teaching and it comes as second nature to her.

One issue that was not covered in Teresa's college preparation was how to approach multiculturalism in the classroom. Because the emphasis was not on bilingual teaching, she was neither taught how to evaluate and adapt materials for the bilingual classroom, nor how to deal with the cultures represented in the community, including values, beliefs, and family structures. She has had to learn about these issues as she faces different situations with her students. In a candid way she concedes:

The University prepares you academically. Once you get to the practice, that’s when you start learning. I had a problem with the methods class. There was no teacher and a group of students got together and we were assigned to one teacher who was working in three different places besides belonging to the National Guard. We met only once a week for one hour, that is, when he didn’t have to attend camp or something else. We didn’t learn much. I didn’t know how to plan, how to write objectives, nothing. I felt “cheated out of it.” (Vol. 4, p. 4)
With a dominant concrete-random mind-style like hers (CR=34, Gregorc’s, 1985), Teresa independently sought and found the help she needed. This is the way she explains it: “One of my friends who was a teacher was the one who taught me how to write plans and other things. My teacher training was terrible in that aspect” (Vol. 4, p. 4).

Since she is working in a bilingual setting, Teresa is not satisfied with what she knows, and is planning future adventures in learning. “I plan to go back to get some short courses, since I don’t have time for a Master’s program right now, as I have my family and my work” (Vol. 4, p. 4).

In the meantime, she attends seminars and workshops, and also keeps current through the Internet. With this resource, she has to be careful, she says. “I look for educational sites where I can choose the right information. However, I always look the material over before giving it to the kids” (Vol. 4, p. 4). As a mother and teacher, she is also concerned about what the students are exposed to in this age of information.

**Professional Life**

Teresa has been working at PBS 17 for 3 years, although she had begun teaching 2 years before. I asked her about her strengths as a bilingual teacher, and she did not hesitate to answer.

I consider my ability to pronounce well as one of my strengths as an English teacher. I think this is very important because there are some teachers who cannot pronounce well and the students don’t learn the right way. I also love reading literature, and try to get the students into it, to live what we are reading. I like poetry. I work with all of its elements. I really enjoy it. (Vol. 4, p. 2)

As I observed her classes, I could see what Teresa meant. Literature is used as a springboard to the rest of the curriculum. Of course, she always considers the students’
interests when she chooses the stories and poems she brings to class, because she “wants to make it attractive” (Vol. 4, p. 2).

On the contrary, grammar seems to be her weak point. “I have to practice and study a lot before I present it to the students,” she says. “Anyway, I try to integrate it with the rest of the content. I prepare units only for the study of grammar. I get exercises from different books with nice stories that the students like” (Vol. 4, p. 2).

How do students react to Teresa’s teaching? She sounded somewhat apologetic when she explained about the differences she finds in her students’ responses.

There are different kinds of students in this school. There are those who come from the U.S. understanding English, and they enjoy the classes here. There are students who want to learn and are eager to learn. Those also enjoy the program.

There are some students whose parents make them come to this school to learn English. They think this school is to learn English, but it is not so. They need a base and the program is hard for them.

There is also the student who is lazy. He comes because he has to. That one does not enjoy the program. He is here because probably he entered directly from the elementary bilingual school. Some students learn to read and write, but won’t speak. Maybe they had negative experiences in childhood and people laughed at them or criticized them. (Vol. 4, p. 3)

Here Teresa is touching a sensitive area. Many students learning a second language can learn to read and write, but do not want to expose themselves to criticism and ridicule from their peers. The literature makes broad reference to the issue as is shown in chapter 2. The fact that Teresa is aware of it is very important because it makes her reach out to those students, remembering her own experience when she came to Puerto Rico without knowing enough Spanish to be able to perform as she wanted.

This situation is closely related to the way the parents and the community respond to the schools’ efforts in providing a bilingual program. Teresa does not seem very happy with it since she feels some kind of prejudice.
The community sponsors our activities, but some people think our kids are too rowdy. Because many come from the U.S. and speak English all the time, and they are young, you know, people sometimes don’t want them around. But they help us and support us as a school. Once we had a very embarrassing situation in the public library. The kids were somewhat active, and the attendants kept asking us to keep them quiet, and to watch them. Students from other schools often reject our students. They see them as from a different class. They call them “the bilingual kids.”

There are some parents who might have problems here or who won’t favor the school and look for other alternatives, especially when their children are bringing home low grades, and can’t keep up with the program. However, we have lots of students in the waiting list, and our classrooms are full to capacity. (Vol. 4, p. 3)

One could expect the bilingual school to run smoothly without any material limitations, since this a government project. It appears, however, that far from having an easy path, the bilingual school faces the same shortcomings as most public schools in the Island.

We don’t have enough textbooks and we don’t have materials. We just got a copying machine and we depend a lot on it. But sometimes it breaks down and I have to ask the students to pay for the copies. Many times the students supply their own materials and we teachers have to supply our own. The problem is that the school does not have a buyer and a payer at this time, and teachers are not allowed to deal with money matters. So we are without materials until they have these employees, even if the money was budgeted. That is the way the system works. So, I have to buy my own decorations, bookshelves, etc. However, we can make proposals to get funds for special projects. That is how the school was able to provide the TV and the overhead projector, and the printers for the classrooms. But writing proposals take a lot of time, and we don’t have it.

Another obstacle is the lack of supervisors in the English area. There are several supervisors in Spanish and Math, but not in English. We have only one English supervisor for the whole area. That means that she has many districts under her supervision, and she cannot give us the help we need. (Vol. 4, p. 4)

These problems can be solved as some changes are being implemented in the public system. Notwithstanding, in the meantime, Teresa keeps working. She has not stopped teaching for a lack of resources. She looks for them, makes proposals to get...
Federal funds, and maintains a positive attitude that transcends to her students. She is even able to count her blessings.

I have a laptop that was provided by the Government. All teachers got one. I use mine a lot. We sometimes have very good staff development meetings. This semester there has been none, but at the beginning of the school year, we had very good seminars. (Vol. 4, p. 4)

Her always-searching-for-new-ideas attitude was evident when I returned her copy of the Gregorc's Style Delineator. She had already filled it out, but did not have the time to plot the results. As I explained how it works and how it can be used, Teresa showed interest in her own results. I gave her the chart and she asked if there were other kinds of tests like this. She would like to use it with her students. If Teresa could do whatever she wanted as a teacher, she would like to “involve my students with more community work, so they can view the problems of our society” (Vol. 4, p. 29).

Classroom Environment

One good application of teaching standards in Teresa's classroom is her relationship and interactions with her students that provide a sound classroom environment. Her enthusiasm for the content she teaches conveys its importance, which helps establish a culture for learning. She establishes high expectations for her students, demonstrated in her own high quality standards.

During one class observation, Teresa was reading a story with a clear voice. At a certain point some students began talking among themselves and she had to call their attention several times. Nevertheless, the teacher seemed relaxed, but busy, and the students worked and completed on time what was expected from them on time. There
was no shouting or running around, although some students went to consult their peers for the written work.

One way in which Teresa shows an efficient system for performing professional duties is by writing all announcements on the board so all the students will have access to the information during the day. Announcements include regular class activities, reminders about materials that need to be brought, meetings, tests, and special activities like the trips for Expeditionary Learning.

Since PBS 17 is housed in an old building, the classrooms do not have many comforts that would make the environment more attractive. However, Teresa keeps trying to make her working conditions better. "The environment affects directly my teaching. If there are irregularities in our surroundings, the students will not concentrate on learning. My teaching will not be effective, and this will lead to gaps in the learning process" (Vol. 4, p. 30). She was able to procure some funds to install air conditioning, and is also planning to get some computers from donations so she will have more opportunities to enrich her students' learning. There is no storage place in this room, thus several boxes along the wall serve the purpose.

The seating arrangement is traditional. Students are organized in five rows, although they sometimes move their desks to do group work. The biggest group has 25 students. Occasionally Teresa changes to a different seating arrangement. Once she had two big groups facing each other, with ample space in the middle for her to walk around.

The only two tables are placed at the back of the room where the teacher works with a few students at a time. Teresa's computer and printer are also set up on one of
these tables close to her desk. Sometimes she allows students to work on her computer. There are two small bookshelves holding different series of textbooks and dictionaries.

The decorations on the walls are related to the subject and topic being studied. This month she has some posters emphasizing different aspects of English grammar. Other motivational posters on the wall read: *Positive thoughts are seeds; negative thoughts are weeds. Read and Grow: Knowledge is power.*

There is a display of students’ work on the wall. A big mural says: *Welcome to the Land of Literature.* It is shaped as a castle and painted and decorated with medieval drawings. The castle is used as a theme for different genres of literature. Several labels identify them: folk, myths, poetry, non-fiction, and fiction. Two white boards are placed in the front of the room, but Teresa uses them infrequently.

The TV with VCR, and the overhead projector complete her equipment in the room, together with a scanner. Evidently Teresa is set on getting the things she needs and looks for them everywhere. This is an indication of her ability to identify and utilize available community resources in and outside the classroom. The English classroom looks like a workshop. There are all kinds of materials around brought by the students to be used in their projects. Students know where they are, and get them with little loss of instructional time.

**A Typical Day**

What does a typical day in Teresa’s teaching look like? Like all the other teachers at PBS17, she begins her classes at 8:00 in the morning, with her homeroom group. This first period lasts 60 minutes and she takes the first 10 minutes for town hall meetings with this eighth-grade class. From 9:00 to 9:50 she has her first preparation
time. This time is precious, since she has so much planning to do with the school's new program of Expeditionary Learning. Since they do not have a written curriculum, Teresa and the other teachers are preparing it themselves. There are community sites that must be checked over for their field trips, phone calls to be made, money to be collected for the trips, and many other details that take her time. She also has to plan different workshops within this program, for which she asks help from other school personnel.

I visited Teresa once during her "professional hour," as it is called in this school, and she was really busy. She had been invited by Alex to present her workshop on fairy tales and she was giving last-minute touches to the Power Point presentation. She had not used it with her students because her room does not have the equipment she needs.

During the next two 50-minute periods, Teresa teaches ninth- and 10th-grade classes before having a lunch recess from 11:30 to 12:30. Right after lunch she has her second preparation time. After this, it is two more ninth-grade classes. This routine goes on all week except Wednesdays. On that day, the students go for their Expeditionary Learning activities. The program began in the month of March and they have scheduled field activities for the rest of the semester. There are also other trips occasionally taken on other days, according to the circumstances.

Evidence of Application of Standards

Even when Teresa did not receive training as a bilingual teacher, her teaching evidences the application of many of the standards required in a bilingual program. What follows is a description of how the standards established many years ago by the Association of Teachers of Puerto Rico are being implemented in Teresa's classes.
Willingness to participate in
innovative programs

The bilingual school is in itself an innovative program in Puerto Rico. The fact
that Teresa, as well as most of the teachers, was willing to relocate to be able to teach in
this school is a good sign. However, it has not stopped there. Her search for new ideas
for teaching strategies and for curricular decisions is a demonstration of that willingness.

“I am always looking for new stories in books, and I make copies for my students” (Vol.
4, p. 2).

Teresa describes her interest in innovations as part of the culture of the school.

Our staff is very involved with innovative programs. At this moment we are
working with Expeditionary Learning outward bound. We just concluded an
after-school program that focuses on sports, baking, and self-improvement. We
also have English Discoveries and Kid’s PAL. It’s wonderful to see that the hard
work we have done has paid off. If I had not been part of these projects, I would
have missed out on the satisfaction that our accomplishments have given us.
(Vol. 4, p. 30)

The development of the Expeditionary Learning Curriculum has taken much of
Teresa’s time this year, but she is happy. “I want my students to know that there is a
world out there that they must know” (Vol. 4, p. 9). Every Wednesday she takes the
students to different places in the community where they are exposed to the social
problems and needs that surround them. Of course, mere exposure is not the end of this
program. The students are motivated to help and participate in the solution of the social
problems they face. Back at the school, they talk, share, and reflect on what they have
seen and done.

One day Teresa took her homeroom class for the Expeditionary Learning field
trip. She was very excited as she saw the students feeling motivated by this kind of
experience. She took lots of pictures for the class album. That night she cried in frustration as she saw her little son open the film and ruin all the pictures.

What could I do? There was my son with all the film around him and I only thought of the pictures lost forever! They were the only ones we had because I was the only one with a camera! I didn’t spank him or anything, but I felt very sad! (Vol. 4, p. 9)

During one of my visits to Teresa, the school was expecting visitors from Alaska. The guests are students in the Expeditionary Program and wanted to pay a visit to their counterparts in Puerto Rico. The teachers and students had to help clean the school, since they do not have a janitor yet. There were several groups of students on the outside square, anxious for the visitors to arrive, while band members were getting their music equipment ready to play for them. Of course, the expectation made it difficult for the teachers to keep their classes as usual, but it was all part of the interesting things going on at the school.

Language proficiency in Spanish and English

During my first class observation, the group was studying the topic of fiction literature. I noticed that the subject was being taught at a level of first language; therefore, the students are expected to perform at a higher level than if they were being taught English as a second language. Teresa says, “They need to have a base when they come here [to PS 17] because the program is hard. But when they get stuck, I help them in Spanish. However, I teach in English” (Vol. 4, p. 3). According to her, “it is very important that the teacher have knowledge of the structures of both languages. It aids the communication between student and teacher. Our school is bilingual, and it is necessary to be able to understand our students” (Vol. 4, p. 30).
To be born and raised in the United States, within a Puerto Rican family, was a good beginning for Teresa. As she attended school in New York, she was able to learn English, but her Spanish suffered somewhat. When she moved to Puerto Rico she continued to be an excellent student while she finished her high school in Spanish, and went on to college to become an English teacher. All the years she has been living in Puerto Rico have given her mastery of both English and Spanish as is evident when she speaks.

One thing she is interested in is that her students have a correct language model. “If the teacher is not a correct model, students will not learn the correct pronunciation, leaving a noticeable accent” (Vol. 4, p. 30). To accomplish this, Teresa likes to read aloud to them in order to provide the right sounds and intonation they should acquire.

Knowledge of different methods to teach second and native language

As Teresa described before, her “methods class was terrible” (Vol. 4, p. 2). She did not receive all the orientation she needed in her pre-service education. However, Teresa has worked on her own to acquire the teaching skills she needs. In her classes she uses dynamic strategies and involves the students in their own learning. The thematic units she has prepared, such as Chinese New Year, Career Week, and Fairy Tales, give the students opportunities to do group work, searches in the library and electronic means, work with their hands, and express themselves publicly and in their private journals. The students are able to integrate this knowledge with other subjects, like when they apply techniques learned in the Industrial Arts class to make some of the projects. She also uses large group instruction with ease and effectiveness. As she says, “by knowing
different methods, the teacher can be able to select the method that is more effective for his/her student" (Vol. 4, p. 30)

In a very conscious way, Teresa tries to construct meaning for her students to learn. She goes over vocabulary before introducing a story, and she reads to the students and lets them read aloud to her. She asks high quality questions like “Why do you think she said that?” and “What’s the meaning of?” (Vol. 4, p. 7). Teresa asks students to compare stories and to use graphic organizers (like the chart to compare five different versions of Cinderella). And all the time she is available to help individual students with specific needs.

Even when the students sometimes speak in Spanish among themselves, the class is conducted in English. The students respond to Teresa’s instructions or questions also in correct English. During one class observation, the students were asked to read a story and define words based on the context. Apparently, this technique had not been used before, since the students were not sure of what to do. One girl complained that they “had not study” (Vol. 4, p.11) for this. After the teacher explained that they would find the definitions in the story, they worked silently and were able to finish their task.

For my third visit, it was finally presentation time for the 10th grade. Each group was to dramatize the different Cinderella versions that they had read. Since this group was considered by the teacher as “her most difficult group” (Vol. 4, p.12), Teresa visited every team, making sure that last-minute arrangements were properly taken care of. She also checked if the students had their dialogs and were able to read them. The order of the presentations was decided by a drawing.
There were some problems to solve before the students were ready. Some complained that the principal threw out their “crowns,” so they did not have them for the presentation. Apparently they had been playing around with them on the yard, against the teacher’s advice. It took the students some time to gather their props and costumes, which had been made in previous classes. Others complained in regard to team members not being ready and causing the rest to have a lower grade. The teacher explained that everyone would get credit for what each one did.

The first group went to the front and began dramatizing their story. They were reading the script and some students began to act up and make comments in Spanish. Not everybody was paying attention, since the rest were trying to get ready for their own presentation. Other students talked and seemed not to care about what was going on. Teresa warned them about taking points off for interrupting the class.

The second group seemed to be better prepared and did their presentation, even when most of the class was not paying attention. The teacher interrupted several times to talk to the students. She even announced a quiz to those who were interrupting. The preparation of costumes and props had been very interesting and fun for the students, but now they were not very enthusiastic about a public presentation.

What called my attention to these incidents was Teresa’s equanimity. She remained calm and never raised her voice. Knowing that this was a difficult group to deal with, she could have asked them simply to read and write from the board. Instead, she dared to try different methods in teaching her students, even when she knew it was going to be hard. With her other groups, the tasks are done easily because the students seem more interested and respond more positively.
Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children

Teresa is very concerned with her high-school students. This concern supersedes her natural preoccupation about the performance of unmotivated students. She is worried about their growing into adulthood without the tools they need. That is why she tries very hard—together with other teachers—to provide the students with information they can use as they make the natural decisions of their age. Some of the workshops presented to the students this year were: Drugs Free Zone and Sex Education.

Her knowledge of developmental growth patterns is also manifested in the way Teresa teaches the class and the kind of activities she designs. “It is important to know and understand their needs as students to be able to adjust my teaching methods” (Vol. 4, p. 30). For example, for Career Week the students dressed up as the professional they would like to be and made oral presentations preceded by research done about the topic. In another instance they visited a foster home, so students would see “how’s life out there” (Vol. 4, p. 9).

Understanding and acceptance of all the cultures represented in the community

In Puerto Rico, there are not great distinctions among the communities. Because the majority of students in PBS 17 are Puerto Rican, it is easier for teachers to accept and understand where they are coming from. It is possible, however, that even within similar communities, their members have unique traits and customs that must be acknowledged and respected. Teresa not only shows this in her relationship with her students, but also tries to teach them about their responsibility to the community. An example is the
community outreach projects that they participate in through the Expeditionary Learning Program.

Teresa thinks that her understanding of the different cultural backgrounds of her students enables her to accept them as they are. “A bonding will occur between teacher and student. This bonding will produce a better learning process” (Vol. 4, p. 30).

One aspect of cultural awareness that is not well developed in the English classes is the emphasis on Puerto Rican celebrations. According to Teresa,

These are included in the Spanish and Social Studies classes. They are the ones who plan activities and teach the students about Puerto Rican festivities and important people. We emphasize more the North American celebrations because those are the ones included in the textbooks we use. (Vol. 4, p. 10)

It should be noted that in other bilingual schools, due emphasis is given to Puerto Rican culture. Teresa acknowledges that she had not thought of that, and it might be a good idea to enforce next year. This could be the result of a lack in her training, since she was not taught about the importance of maintaining and fostering students’ knowledge about their mother culture.

**Students’ Performance**

For the third marking period, Teresa proceeded to have individual conferences with the students to show them their grades and give related information. She keeps a folder with each student’s work. When some students showed dissatisfaction with their grades, they were asked to get their folders to check their work. One particular student got F’s on several tests. When I asked him, he said he was not concerned because he got an A in Spanish. He said the overall average is what counts. Teresa commented that the
students get enough time from their teacher to complete their assignments and projects, but some are not very responsible and do not do their work.

The whole school is organized in homogeneous groups, therefore, most high achievers belong in the same group. Because of the selection process, native students are almost always in the A groups. The students who come from the United States do not necessarily excel in English and much less in Spanish. These students are one of the main reasons for the establishment of the bilingual schools, since it is considered as an obligation to provide them with language support. However, many of them are low-achievement students who have acquired the language, but have not performed very well academically.

Summary

Working in PBS 17 represents struggles for Teresa, but she is very happy with what she does. “I like challenges. I see teaching here as a challenge. When we don’t have what we need, then we plan on how to get it and everyone pitches in. We work as a team” (Vol. 4, p. 9). I asked Teresa how her teaching has changed during these years. She said that as she grows professionally, and as she matures, her teaching also changes. From my point of view, that is one of the trademarks of an effective teacher.

Going Private: A Life-long Love Affair

Private education is very strong and well supported in Puerto Rico. For many years both parochial and secular schools have provided a high quality education that many parents seek and are willing to provide for their children. The two stories in this chapter are developed within the environment of 2 private schools: Highlands Academy and Progressive School.
Highlands Academy

Highlands Academy is a private, parochial school located in the rural area in Western Puerto Rico. It has a population of about 300 students and 17 teachers in a K-12 system. There is also a school counselor, a chaplain, and the administrative staff. The school is housed in three separate buildings. The newest one holds intermediate and high-school classes, with six classrooms, a science laboratory, and a computer laboratory. The other two buildings hold the elementary grades, the library, and the auditorium.

This school began many years ago as an English-only school for American students. Presently, English is still taught by immersion, although Spanish language arts are taught, and History of Puerto Rico has been added to the curriculum and is taught in Spanish. Today, the clientele is mostly Puerto Rican, with a small number of students who have come from the United States. Most students come to Kindergarten without knowing any English. However, their language curriculum is strong and they are so immersed, that when they get to first grade, the majority of the students speak English and have the vocabulary and the skills needed to begin reading formally in English.

New students who are transferred from other schools might have a hard time having most of their classes in English; therefore they are recommended to take on some kind of tutoring. Textbooks are completely in English at a level used for native English speakers.

The principal describes the school as having a good curriculum with strong academic emphasis, good bilingual teachers, good textbooks, and good support from the parents. One problem the school faces every year is to find good bilingual teachers for all the subjects, but she considers staff development to be strong.
There are some intensive seminars being offered by the office of the Superintendent by areas of specialization. In July we had a weeklong institute for all the teachers, and there are also the teachers' conventions and other programs like Title II that offer workshops and seminars to our teachers. Besides, we [the school] subsidize graduate studies to some teachers. (Vol. 1, p. 7)

Tina's Story

Teacher Tina was born in Puerto Rico about 50 years ago. During her childhood she moved several times from Puerto Rico to New York, and back, attending school in both places. She graduated from high school in Puerto Rico, and has remained in the Island, with frequent trips to the mainland to visit her relatives. Tina has worked for 15 years in bilingual education, mostly in the second grade. Two years ago she was transferred from one bilingual school to another in the same geographical area. In this school she also teaches second grade. Her mind-style profile reflects a dominant concrete sequential mediation channel (CS=36), according to the Gregorc's Style Delineator (1985).

Professional Training

Tina studied at a private college in Puerto Rico, where she obtained an Associate Degree in elementary education. She is a certified teacher. She considers her proficiency in English as excellent in the academic context (oral, reading, writing), which she learned both while attending school in Puerto Rico and while living in the United States.

Presently she works towards finishing her B.A. in elementary education.

In college, Tina has had instructors who were fluent speakers of English in her English courses. Because her program is geared to general elementary teaching in Spanish, it does not cover in-depth issues regarding bilingual education. It has included theories and applications of second language teaching, and to some degree, understanding the nature
of language and how to identify and understand structural differences between the child’s first and second language. Multiculturalism approaches have been taught to some degree also. (Vol. 1, p. 46). Tina sees herself as a successful bilingual teacher because of the input she receives from parents, students, and colleague teachers. She is very happy with her work.

**Professional Life**

The reason Tina decided to become a bilingual teacher was very personal. She describes it with conviction, while she laughs in a mischievous way.

I became a bilingual teacher because I did not like the way my children were being taught. My daughter was in second grade and was frustrated with the English teacher. I was working at a pharmacy at the time, and when I heard that the teacher had left and they needed a replacement, I volunteered; and since then I became a bilingual teacher. (Vol. 1, p. 2)

For this person who went ahead energetically to change something that was in her hands to do, teaching has to be very special. Her enthusiasm is evident while she talks.

I like to give the students a lot of different experiences on different things. I like them to write their own poems, I like them to be able to read, by helping them to be creative not only in spoken and written language, but in everything they do.

I also enjoy seeing them when they learn to read. Some of them come reading, others don’t, but I love to see how they grow in their reading during the year and notice how much they have accomplished. So those are the things that really count. Another thing that I like is teaching them to love “the second coming” [of Jesus] because I love the “second coming.” So, that’s one thing I find as one of my strengths. We talk about it all the time and they love it. A former student, who is now in college, wrote a poem about the second coming of Jesus. So those are things that are wonderful. I love to see their written work, even though it may not be perfect in spelling, I love to see their creativity because it’s wonderful just to see them trying to write. I love to give them stickers and . . . (Vol. 1, p. 2)

The unfinished sentence tells a story of devotion and love for her profession. Her Principal also describes Tina as a very competent teacher. “They [the students] have
a very good perception of her. They respect her and have learned how to follow orders; she has good group control” (Vol. 1, p. 6). The school principal chose her as an exemplary teacher because of “her years of teaching English.” She went on to explain, “Her former students are well prepared (including my two daughters). She covers all the content and even additional material. Her classes are very practical and she uses a lot of audiovisuals” (Vol. 1, p. 6).

Of course, Tina is aware also of some weaknesses in her own performance.

“Well, there are some words that I do not pronounce that well. Even when you try to do something that you like, you are not perfect” (Vol. 1, p. 3).

Tina’s principal tells a different story. According to her, one of Tina’s strengths is her good pronunciation, that is, good use of the language. In reality, it can be said that she speaks naturally and with ease, but Tina knows of the need for a perfect model for her students. Joking about her weaknesses, she goes on.

And I don’t ever remember the parents’ names, and that is terrible, but I really never remember. I don’t like Social Studies ... that’s why most of the time I have newspapers to work on, and to make myself like it and make myself feel interested; but I don’t like Social Studies. I think that’s one of my weaknesses. I enjoy all of my other classes, though. (Vol. 1, p. 3)

Tina agrees to the fact that students’ attitudes make a great difference when learning a second language. About her own students’ attitudes toward the English program, she says

I’ve seen both positive and negative attitudes, like once I had a child who just couldn’t understand why he had to be in the English program. He said, “my father speaks Spanish, my mother speaks Spanish, everybody speaks Spanish, I go out and speak Spanish, why do I have to learn English?” But most of the time kids like to learn English. they are proud to be in the English program, and they feel that they are very smart to know English. So, most of the time these kids feel that they have an advantage over the other students. And I think that helps them in a way. (Vol. 1, p. 3)
One factor thought to go against the development of complete fluency in English is that students tend to speak their native language when they are out of school or when they talk among themselves. Even when this could be considered as a natural and desirable action, English teachers think that it limits the students' acquisition of second-language skills. Tina sees it as a hindrance to the bilingual program.

Sometimes they don't have the opportunity to speak that much English out of school, and we have to motivate them to speak English in and out the school, and that is an obstacle. They know they can speak Spanish better, so they speak Spanish, even though they might speak English in the classroom. (Vol. 1, p. 4)

Gone are the days when students were fined for speaking Spanish in this school. That was a policy that forced the students to learn by immersion. Although some things have changed, Tina and other teachers still try to do their part in encouraging students to develop their proficiency in a second language. It is a delicate task, since it must be done without divesting them of their native language.

Most of my kids already know English when they come to me. I try to build on what they know, on the foundation some other teacher laid, and I try to encourage them to speak English, but when they want to speak Spanish, I let them speak Spanish, and then ask them to translate themselves. And most of them do it very well. It is strange, because here they speak more Spanish than down there [referring to her former school]. I was shocked, like I expected them to be more fluent, and they are fluent, but they have a desire to speak in Spanish and I have to keep on encouraging them: “Come on, English.” And they know it, it's just like they are lazy. But I try to encourage them to speak English, without stopping learning Spanish. (Vol. 1, p. 3)

According to Tina, although in some instances, negative community attitudes could turn to be a hindrance, in Highland Academy it is a positive factor for the bilingual program. She acknowledges this kind of community conflict while describing the relationship of the community in general with the bilingual school.

If the community accepts them [students speaking English], they will feel happy to speak English. At least in this school, students have a community that accepts
them. Also the parents are so proud that their kids know English. So, for most of them it is something that they really enjoy. The community that surrounds the school is positive about the teaching of English. Their support is very good and they are very happy, and many of them are proud to have that program. But if you go to other communities not close to the school, you will find people that don’t want, and they think it is not good. But once again, I would say that those are the least, because most people would love to have their kids in a program like that. And sometimes schools limit the number of kids that can be in the English program, but if you notice, most of them want to be in it, but there is no space, and they have to go to the Spanish program; but that is not something they would choose, because the people want the best for their children.

(Vol. 1, p. 4)

The school principal agrees with Tina’s perception about community pride towards the teaching of English. She says,

Some find that the program is hard, strong. But most are satisfied and support our program. Some parents even complain about the teaching of Spanish and English at the same level. They think it is confusing for the students, and some would like us to teach Spanish as a second language, and to let English be taught as the primary one. (Vol. 1, p. 6)

To my question on the subject of her perception of the socio-political situation in Puerto Rico regarding learning a second language, Tina answered categorically:

My idea is that being American citizens, everybody should know English just as well as we know Spanish. And I think everybody should have the opportunity to learn, it shouldn’t be something only for a few. And I think that if all the kids know Spanish that they learn at home, there shouldn’t be any problem for them to learn English. Learn English for three years or four, up to third grade. And after that, they can learn all the Spanish they want because they will learn it easily, and all the English they can.

I think that everybody should be given the opportunity to learn the basics of English for at least four years and they would be completely bilingual. After that they can continue in Spanish and they would never forget the English. They might not practice, or like it, but they would never forget it. And that’s what I think, everybody should be given the opportunity, not just a few, but everybody. And forget about the politics. Everybody should be bilingual. And not only that, why should we have only English and Spanish? Why can’t we be like the Europeans? They know two and three languages. And we are not less intelligent than they are. I think everybody should learn two languages, and if they are good
in those two languages, then give them the opportunity to learn some more. Whatever they want!!! (Vol. 1, pp. 4, 5)

Tina knows that the teaching venture needs to be shared with the parents. She has been able to work out a good relationship with her classroom parents and have found them to be a good source of support. Thus, in order to keep her teaching methods alive, she resorts to the help of willing parents.

Yes, they help a lot. Right now they were preparing some notebooks so the children can begin writing stories. This is a very nice crowd. I want the kids to write their stories. And since I don’t have much time to prepare materials, a group of mothers come to help. They do a great job. (Vol. 1, p. 17)

Classroom Environment

The second-grade classroom is very bright and colorful. There are several windows on the back wall that let fresh air come in. It is well illuminated and has several ceiling fans running most of the time. The classroom setup is traditional: five rows with five or six desks in each for a total of 27 students. There is barely space for the teacher at the front of the room. The room used to have individual tables for the students, but since the tables use more space and the enrollment is bigger this year, they had to change them for the desks. The walls display bulletin boards for every subject, including a few drawings by the students. Decorations change according to seasons and themes, but they are always cheerful and carefully done.

There is a radio/cassette player that Tina uses very often. She loves to play songs and also poems for the Language Arts class. Sometimes parents also loan her compact discs with songs. A refrigerator and a drinking fountain also form part of the equipment. Several shelves and cabinets hold teaching materials, students’ supplies, and books.
Although the room is crowded, it looks neat and organized. It is a happy place where the children like to be.

Tina follows a very structured system of discipline in her classroom. When asked about it, she confided, “Yes, I am very structured myself. I try to apply the Behavior Modification model, although I sometimes combine with other ideas. I need to have order in my classroom” (Vol. 1, p. 16).

She constantly praises those students who behave well and do their work. “I like that, , you are doing very well.” Or she will say, “Look at the smile on my face” (Vol. 1, p. 9). Evidently, her students are happy to make their teacher happy. During one of my observation sessions, Tina needed to go to the office and instructed the students to “put their heads down” (Vol. 1, p. 9) until she returned. Most did not do it, but remained quiet. Two student helpers were at the front to check behavior (smiley and sad faces on the board). Some students raised their hands to ask permission from the helpers to get something. The students showed respect for the class monitors. Only one name was written on the board. When the teacher came in, she congratulated the group with a big smile. She said: “Look at my big smile” (Vol. 1, p. 9).

The group also has very specific class procedures for each activity that goes on. From passing out materials, or getting books out or back to their place, Tina expects her students to comply. Once the students have finished their task, they are asked to put their heads down until the rest finish. The teacher is constantly emphasizing that students should keep a “nice, pretty notebook” and also to keep the classroom “clean and pretty” (Vol. 1, p. 10).
Sometimes there are special circumstances that can try Tina's creativity to keep her students on task. Several times during the year, the school is out of water. Even when the school has contingent plans in place, things do not run normally when something like this happens. It might mean that the cleaning services will be precarious, or that the cafeteria will have to change the menu, or even worse, that there will be no lunch and the students will have to be dismissed earlier. Another circumstance might be the rain, which in this area happens very often. On such days, class schedules become mixed up since the students have to move to other places like the computer classroom, the library, or the physical education court, and sometimes the rain stops them from doing so. Then, it is Tina's duty to provide substitute activities that are accepted and from which the students can profit.

That Tina's model of classroom management is eclectic was evidenced in this instance of democracy-on-the-making during one class observation. It was recess time but it was raining, and the teacher faced a difficult situation. The students were supposed to go to the library during the Language Arts period, which was next. Tina gave them options and emphasized the concept of choosing. She talked about voting to solve problems in a Democracy. She took a vote on going to the library in the afternoon or having a party in the classroom (the majority voted for the party) (Vol. 1, p. 14).

When asked her opinion about the second-graders, Tina said with a broad smile, "They are wonderful" (Vol. 1, p. 9). She is very happy with this group.

A Typical Day

Tina's day begins at 7:30 when teachers meet in the library for a short worship
time. There they share and bond together for a few minutes as they get ready for the day ahead. At 7:55 the bell rings for the first class. As she opens the door for her students, Tina instructs them to put their belongings in place and quietly sit down. Some parents step in to give last-minute instructions to their children or to ask Tina to clarify some information. The group has worship for 10 minutes and then Bible class begins. Usually Tina tells a story and holds a discussion about the theme; then the students work on the activity book. They might also do some oral exercises before ending the class with songs and prayer. The students are encouraged to pray in English, but sometimes a student might ask to be allowed to pray in Spanish.

Next period is Math time. Between periods, Tina allows the students to have a short recess, used by the children to drink water or go to the bathroom across the hall. As she says, “they need to move around and I give them several short recesses” (Vol. 1. p. 9). She appoints several student helpers who monitor the key areas like refrigerator, water fountain, doors, etc. These students make sure that their classmates carry out stipulated procedures.

Before the next class, which is English Language Arts, the group has another small devotional time. In fact, they have short devotional readings, singing, and praying before each class. During the transition time, Tina usually conducts an active exercise. She does not just announce the new class, but leads the students to it. She might talk and ask about activities done during the weekend, while waiting for the students to put their books away. One day, one of the students was asked to go to the front and be “the teacher.” Tina would give a command to point to or touch different parts of the body and
the "teacher" modeled the actions, which were imitated by the rest of the class. The students enjoyed the exercise.

Lunchtime is at 11:10 a.m. The second-graders form a line to go to the cafeteria where the teacher eats with them. A short recess follows lunch. Then the students have either Physical Education or Music, or Spanish. Different teachers teach all three subjects, and in the meantime, Tina has her preparation time. This period is used to get materials ready for her classes, make copies, or grade papers.

Next, Tina teaches science or social studies. Sometimes she has older students who come to offer tutoring in reading and math to those who need extra help. Classes end at 3:15. At that time, Tina dismisses her students at the door, while trying to pay attention to the parents who come to get their children. They always have questions about reviews, tests, and assignments.

After all is said and done with her group, Tina still has a long stretch before her. It is time to attend her evening classes at a nearby university, where she works towards her B.A. in elementary education. Her class time might extend till 8:00 when she finally goes home.

Evidence of Application of Standards

Tina is certified as an elementary teacher in the Spanish program. Her becoming a bilingual teacher was based primarily on her proficiency in the English language. Therefore, I was very apprehensive regarding the evidence I was looking for regarding the application of standards for bilingual education. This is what I found.
Willingness to participate in innovative programs

English has been taught in Puerto Rico for over 100 years, and it can hardly be called an innovation. However, the field of teaching strategies and methods keeps growing and bringing in new ideas that can be implemented for effective teaching. Although Tina has been teaching for many years, she is still interested in her professional and personal growth. She likes to try new things with her students and is always searching for ideas.

I am studying to complete my B.A. (I have an Associate Degree in Education), so I am learning a lot of things. I try to introduce innovations, like this whole-language approach. I like it because students can understand better when they study certain content with different emphasis. There are more opportunities for enrichment. (Vol. 1, p. 16)

Another innovation that has found its way into Tina’s classrooms is the use of learning centers. About these, she says:

I have used learning centers before, but sometimes it is hard when you have more than 30 students in the classroom. With this group I began setting up those centers, but I had to postpone that strategy because it demands a lot of time and I am studying full time. Besides, I don’t have the space I need. We sometimes have to work on the floor. But next year everything is going to be different. I have already asked for a bigger room and I plan to set up active learning centers. (Vol. 1, p. 16)

When talking about teaching innovations, one cannot miss calling attention to cooperative learning strategies. In this area, Tina recognizes that she needs more training in order to make it work in her classroom. She has not closed the doors, and is ready for the challenge ahead.

I don’t think I am well prepared to do cooperative learning yet. Sometimes we do group work, but I need more skills. I need also different equipment, like tables and chairs, not desks as we have now, because sometimes we try, but the things slip from the top of the desk because they are somewhat slanted. (Vol. 1, p. 16)
Language proficiency in Spanish and English

Tina's native language is Spanish; therefore she knows it very well. However, she also knows the structure of English that she learned while attending school in the United States.

Tina's classes are conducted in English all the time. The students seemed at ease listening and answering in English. Tina's reading to them is an added asset in providing her students a correct model. However, even when she encourages her students to speak English in the classroom, she can speak Spanish when needed, and also correct any slip of the tongue in either language. She allows students to speak Spanish, and then asks them to translate into English. Other times, she explains difficult English words in Spanish.

Knowledge of different methods to teach second and native languages

Tina likes to read to her students. This is done several times during the day as evidenced in her devotional readings, and in the other classes when she reads poems and stories. She sees this as a must because she wants her students to listen and be able to imitate what she is modeling.

New methods in the teaching of language arts include integration of all the areas and also the use of audiovisuals and technological means. Tina follows a simple routine in her Language Arts classes, but she makes sure that all of these ingredients are present.

As a bilingual teacher, Tina knows that her students need to learn the right sounds not only by listening, but also by practicing in active ways. That is what she tries to do every day when teaching phonics. An example of active learning is when the students do
different activities like clapping once or twice for different sounds, and when Tina has
them repeat sounds in different pitches and volumes of voice. This makes learning fun
for her students.

Another part of the routine is to listen to a poem in which the sounds being
studied are emphasized. The new poem is usually presented from a chart. The class
studies the picture quietly while guided by the teacher's questions. Tina then reads the
poem and also has the students listen to the poem from an audio-tape twice before they
circle the words on the chart that contain the sounds they are learning. After this, the
students read the poem silently by themselves. The next activity is more fun, as they
listen to the poem put to music in the cassette player and try to sing the poem.

The next section is for spelling. Tina might alter the activities, but in general
terms, she follows a clear routine. The words are taken from the story they are reading.
She has the students copy those words for Friday's test after analyzing the spelling and
defining each one. The teacher uses flash cards in print form and cursive form since the
students are beginning to learn cursive writing. On other occasions, she might still use
the flash cards and ask the students to show objects named on the cards. Then they build
sentences using those words while Tina calls attention to grammar accidents like verb
tenses, parts of the speech, and so forth. The words are written on the notebook and on
the board. The flash cards are always put in order on the chart.

After the spelling exercises, the students read a story from their textbook. All the
students are given a chance to read at least one sentence. For the second semester, a new
girl joined the class. This girl's proficiency in English was very limited; therefore Tina
has to offer extra help to her. During reading time, she calls the new girl to her desk so
she can follow the reading. To the rest of the class, Tina asks questions and, when needed, she might ask the students to translate a specific concept into Spanish. In other instances, the students are asked to predict different endings to the story. Tina is using what she considers “a very good reading series.” The content is interesting to the students and challenges them with well-designed activities.

I like them [the books] a lot because they follow a whole-language approach. Besides, there are lots of resources for the teacher. I was able to use the series even when it is new because it is the same thing I learned in my education courses. The teacher’s guide is very helpful. (Vol. 1, p. 17)

During one of the classes, the students were asked to take out their books. One student called out the number of the page. (This is done to practice the numbers.) The story’s title was “A Good Laugh for Cookie.” The teacher commented about her liking the story and invited the students to look at the picture. She then asked questions about the picture. “I think this is going to be fun” (Vol. 1, p. 12), she said with enthusiasm. Some students told anecdotes about fun experiences they have had. They kept leafing through while the teacher asked: “I wonder what will happen here” and the students gave predictions of future events. Next the teacher called on individual readers and everyone got to read a few lines. The teacher asked what part the students liked the most. Not once did students show lack of enthusiasm for reading. They were well behaved and participated in an active way.

Tina has a great ability to integrate several subjects when she is teaching. In spelling, I watched her draw students’ attention to the parts of speech. During reading time, she was able to integrate math; and during a transition time, she was able to integrate social studies by using a voting strategy.
She is able to plan her lessons by following an approach called ECA (Spanish acronym for Exploration, Conceptualization, and Application.). What follows is an account of the observations done during math class.

They began a new unit on Geometry. For exploration of the concepts, the teacher drew a set of figures on the board and announced what was to be taught. She promised it was going to be fun.

The teacher used 3-D shapes and asked for the difference between drawings and 3-D's. Students answered: "3-D's are real." The teacher showed different sizes of geometric shapes.

Next was a hands-on activity where the students built 3-D shapes using dough and ice cream sticks. They were grouped for the activity. The teacher went from group to group giving instructions and helping the students. There was a bit of noise as the students worked. Teacher explained some variations and difficulties of working with the play-dough. The teacher distributed and collected materials. Books were brought out during the conceptualization stage. A student read the instructions aloud. The teacher asked the students to categorize some shapes. Although the students were not able to discriminate among categories, Tina led them through questions and illustrations.

Next was work in the notebooks. Teacher dictated some word problems from her head, and then asked for the answer. While working on these problems, the teacher used technical words like "regrading." (Vol. 1, p. 13)

Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children

The fact that Tina has been teaching second-graders for many years helps her gain knowledge of how children grow and develop. That is why she always includes several short periods of recess, and lots of action-filled activities. Sometimes they have breathing exercises. In one instance, students were asked to use different volume levels and voice pitches to say the spelling words while screaming, whispering, fast-talking, slow-talking, only boys, only girls, etc. This activity was expected to let the students vent their emotions and let the stress out.
Tina shows a lot of enthusiasm in her teaching. She is constantly motivating her students with phrases like: “This is going to be fun,” or “I like this story.” Her voice also tells the students that she is a friend and she is happy to be there with them. These actions help her students to build confidence and trust in their teacher, which are needed at all ages.

Understanding and acceptance of all cultures represented in the community

One day in December, while I was observing the class, a Parranda (Christmas sing-along) broke in, singing Puerto Rican songs in Spanish. This is a fun Christmas tradition in Puerto Rico and the children joined in happily. Tina smiled approvingly and did not mind the interruption.

During the Christmas season there was also a school-wide contest that encouraged the students to participate in decorating their classrooms and other assigned areas. Tina’s class won high recognition as one of the best.

Early in November, the students had celebrated the Puerto Rican Week (*Semana Puertorriqueña*). In Highland Academy, this activity is highly emphasized. Every day they have different events in which students and parents participate. Tina’s class sang Puerto Rican folk songs in the program presented to the parents.

A very important curricular emphasis is on Puerto Rican communities. Since Tina’s class is using an American textbook, the study of communities can be a delicate issue. Therefore, along with the information in the book, Tina teaches her students about their local communities, type of government, and officers.
Students' Performance

Effective teaching takes into account evaluation of students' performance. Tina has her own system, which has proven to be right for her and her students.

For example, in Reading I test them with new stories every week. They are different from the ones in the teacher's guide. I don't like to give them the same stories because they memorize them, and the parents are anxious for them to memorize everything. So they already know that it is going to be different. They have to learn how to answer those questions, but in a different story. (Vol. 1, p. 17)

The only standardized tests applied in Highland Academy begin in third grade; consequently Tina's students are tested only with regular classroom tests on every subject. Although she does not use portfolios officially, she does use alternate assessment for her students, including projects, story writing, drawings, and so forth. Most of the students are on the Honor Roll.

Summary

Tina comes from a family of teachers. As she says, "I guess it just runs in the family." Her uncle and her aunt are teachers; her son also is a teacher, and there are about six or seven more teachers in the family. "I really don't remember someone who had an impact on my teaching formation, except that it runs in the family" (Vol. 1, p. 4).

This might be a reason for her dedication to the teaching profession. Even when Tina is so busy with her job, her studies, and her family life, she is always smiling and ready to help any of her students. It is a fact that she enjoys teaching.

Progressive School

Progressive School is a private, parochial elementary school in Western Puerto Rico. It has an enrollment of over 400 students and 18 teachers besides a chaplain, a
counselor, and a host of other support personnel. The school offers two different curricular tracks: the English program and the Spanish program. Parents and students are more interested in applying for the English program since they are after a bilingual education. Most of the students in the Spanish program are there because they could not get in the English one. Only a reduced number actually chose to be educated in Spanish, with English as a regular subject.

Students in the English program receive their classes in English except for Music, Physical Education, and History of Puerto Rico. Of course, Spanish is also taught as a regular subject. The bilingual program is very competitive. Some students find it hard and think it demands a lot of work.

The school has very impressive facilities. The two-story building is well kept, and includes about 12 classrooms, offices for the supporting staff, teachers’ lounge, and cafeteria. The library and the new gym are shared with the high school in the same campus. The principal of the school is positive concerning the way the community perceives bilingual education. When interviewed, she said, “The community is happy with the program. They even want the school to have only the English program, so there would be more space for their children. They see the learning of English as a social need” (Vol. 2, p. 5).

There are a huge number of people trying to get the best for their children’s education, even if it means forcing them to it.

Parental support is very high. They work hard to get their children in the English program, no matter what. Parents are more involved in their children’s education. They don’t want them to suffer as they have for the lack of English. (Vol. 2, p. 3)

In spite of the great support from the community and the administration—“they
provide the resources we need”—there are some issues that are necessary to be solved if the English program is to continue its growth. Among several mentioned, two deserve a special mention.

[There is a] lack of placement and standardized tests to find out if children are able or ready for the English program. I think we should be more selective because not all the children are ready. We also need more staff development. There is a lack of teachers who are fluent in English. We need more good teachers who can speak correct English. (Vol. 2, p. 3)

On the other hand, the principal is appreciative of the good teaching staff they have. She sees it as one of the strengths of the program, but recognizes that they need more of the kind. “The things that make the program work are the good teachers we have, community support, and administrative support. The main obstacle is the lack of [denominational] bilingual teachers” (Vol. 2, p. 5).

One factor that helps teachers grow professionally is the staff development program supported by the school administration. In Progressive School they conduct seminars several times a year, according to the principal. Teachers attend the annual convention, and workshops are sponsored by the Superintendent’s office as well.

Darlene’s Story

Darlene was born in New Jersey and is between of 30-40 years of age. She has been a teacher for 17 years in bilingual schools. Presently she works in a private bilingual school in Western Puerto Rico where she has remained for 14 years. The things that Darlene likes best in life are “computers, movies, arts and crafts, music, traveling, and decorating” (Vol. 2, p. 35). However, she does not tolerate “hypocrisy and dishonesty” (Vol. 2, p. 35). She is a happy, sincere person who enjoys the comradeship of her colleagues. Her mind style delineator yielded a profile of dominant in the concrete sequential (27), intermediate in abstract sequential (26), slightly dominant abstract
random (28), and intermediate concrete random (19) mediation channels (Gregorc's *Style Delineator*, 1985).

**Professional Training**

Even though she was born in the United States and graduated from high school there, Darlene studied in a private college in Puerto Rico. She earned a B.A. in elementary education with a specialization in the teaching of English. Today she is a certified teacher in English, Mathematics, Bible, and Spanish.

Darlene learned English while living in the United States, and she considers her proficiency to be excellent in reading, writing, and conversation in an academic context. During her time in college, Darlene had instructors who were fluent speakers of English, who were a good model for her.

No kind of bilingual education training was imparted in Darlene’s courses, and even the instructional methods for the teaching of English were somewhat limited. “In my career, I have not been given the privilege to have specific training. I have investigated and provided myself with all the resources needed to teach English or any other material” (Vol. 2, p. 35). In spite of the limitations of her pre-service training, Darlene sees herself as a successful bilingual teacher. She finds the evidence in the progress of her students, whom she sees performing very well in speaking English.

As an example, she tells the story of one of her students who came to her classroom in third grade. The boy did not know any English and had been transferred from a public school where the teacher mistreated him. Patiently, Darlene began to work with the boy who was scared and “hated school” (Vol. 1, p. 14), and in a few months he was able to speak some English. His interest rose to the point where he would look up
words in the dictionary. With time, the child became very fluent in English. Several
years later, Darlene found him about to graduate from college. He was studying to be an
English teacher.

Understandingly, Darlene is very proud to be a bilingual teacher and of her
students who have achieved well beyond expectations. Some have moved to the United
States and become Student-of-the Month, some have been able to skip a grade because of
their extraordinary performance, and most have continued to do excellent academic work.

The most helpful experience of Darlene’s training is her upbringing in the United
States, where she was born and raised, attending school during her elementary and
secondary years. She is still very interested in continuing her professional growth and
would like to have more workshops in the field of bilingual education. She would also
like to expand her vocabulary and writing skills because even when she is teaching Math
and Science, she loves to teach Language Arts.

Her recommendation for a bilingual teacher education program is: “I think
teachers should be taught how to teach reading skills, and how to manage a language arts
program” (Vol. 2, p. 5).

**Professional Life**

What reasons made you become a bilingual teacher? This is a question that made
Darlene smile, since teaching was not a first choice for her. As she explains,

Actually, I didn’t want to become a teacher, but a secretary. When I was in high
school, I came to Puerto Rico and while I was here, my aunt (who is a teacher)
asked me to help her with grading students’ workbooks. I saw her way of
teaching and thought she was good at it. It was time for me to go to college, and
my aunt—who is a very good teacher—talked me into giving a try to teaching. I
thought I would never be able to do something like that, to be like her. As a last
resource, she talked about the benefits: steady salary, paid holidays, time to be
with my kids, etc.
As I was growing up, I would baby sit in church, and found out that I was good with kids. While in grade school, I was always grading papers and helping the teachers. I had very good teacher models, and I also had very good mentors.

When I took my Introduction to Teaching course, I found it interesting. During my student teaching, I had the opportunity to observe great teachers who motivated me and made my practice satisfactory.

Another reason was an experience I had while teaching ESL in the U.S., and I saw how Hispanics were being marginalized because of their low proficiency in English. Sometimes, even when they knew the language, they were kept behind just because they were not expected to perform appropriately. (Vol. 2, p. 1)

Therefore, Darlene decided to become a bilingual teacher in order to help those students who were having a hard time because of a lack of proficiency in English. This was going to be her own crusade and a strong motivation during her career even when she was not teaching English as a subject.

Darlene taught third grade for 3 years in another bilingual school, before coming to Progressive School also as a third-grade teacher. Two years later she moved to the United States and taught math and science from second- to fifth-grades during 1 year, but she had to return to Puerto Rico due to her daughter's illness. After that, she has taught consecutively for 14 years at Progressive School. Her main subjects have remained as English, math, and science. One task she does during the summers is to evaluate Kindergarteners for their readiness for the English program. She has also taught seventh- to 10th-grande English during the summer.

When asked about her strengths as a bilingual teacher, she answered boldly, "I think that one of my strengths is my level of proficiency in English. I also like to motivate students to speak English, even when my class is science or math. I can also communicate easily with parents (Vol. 2, p. 2).

Her principal follows the same train of thought as she explained why she had
chosen Darlene as an exemplary teacher. She emphasized as one of Darlene’s strengths her ability to manage her classroom in a positive way. As she said,

> It was her experience as a bilingual teacher, her knowledge and proficiency in speaking English. She has a B.A. in Elementary Education. I have seen her progress as a teacher. Her students learn, she has high expectations for them and is always looking for new ways to teach. She also has good interrelations with students, parents, and colleagues and she has very good discipline in the classroom. (Vol. 2, p. 4)

Because of this strong motivation to get students speaking English fluently so they can avoid the misfortunes she saw while in the United States, Darlene sometimes gets “desperate, frustrated” (Vol. 2, p. 2) when she cannot get through to new students, especially at the beginning of the program. She considers this to be one of her weaknesses (Vol. 2, p. 2). However, the principal was very clear when she stated, “Students like her, they see her as a good teacher. They learn from her, even when they know that she is strict” (Vol. 2, p. 4).

When asked what she would do if she could do whatever she wanted as a teacher, Darlene immediately pointed to her students. “I would try all my best so my students could learn correct English” (Vol. 2, p. 35).

**Classroom Environment**

Darlene’s room is decorated simply with subject matter charts and posters (science and math). There are six rows with individual desks (about 35). A couple of cabinets hold teaching materials. The room is well ventilated and illuminated. The classroom is somewhat small for the group, and there is no storage space. The students keep their backpacks with them and this makes the room crowded.
The students own their books and all school supplies, although they are allowed to leave the books in the classroom. A wall cabinet with cubicles holds the books for the six groups that meet in the classroom every day—fourth, fifth, and sixth science and math classes. The room is cheerful, and there are both an American and a Puerto Rican flag on the front. Students seem to follow routines very easily. Immediately after they get in, student helpers distribute the books and everyone gets ready to work.

The setting is completely traditional, teacher-centered. Students wear uniforms and they look clean and sharp. On the shelves, there are several plaques received by the teacher: “Teacher of the Year,” “Graduating Class Advisor,” “Dedicated Teacher,” etc.

Part of the classroom environment is the discipline system. Darlene explained that discipline is primordial for her. “Without discipline, there is no learning.” She explained how the fourth-graders get to learn the routines. It takes them at least a month to learn classroom rules and procedures. These students enter the elementary grades (4-6) and need some time to adjust to the new system, more so if they come from other schools. Having many teachers and moving from one room to another might get them confused. Thus, when they get to Darlene’s classroom, she sometimes has a hard time trying to instill in them a new set of rules and procedures. She constantly reminds students that they come to school to learn. They have to be prepared for intermediate school.

There was not a single disturbance during the class while I was conducting observations. The students talk in low tones and stay on task. They seem very intent on finishing their work. When it is time to leave, they put their books away and then line up to go out through one door, while the next group enters through the other door.
According to Darlene, "classroom environment is very important to develop a good learning center" (Vol. 2, p. 34).

"I was raised being very respectful of teachers," she added, "and I expect the same from my students" (Vol. 2, p. 9). While I was visiting 1 day, a student-teacher came in to observe the class. At the end, she asked Darlene regarding her philosophy of discipline. Darlene answered that she believes in firm discipline in order to have an environment conducive to learning. But this discipline must be accompanied by love and respect for the students. It also needs patient teaching from the very beginning (Vol. 2, p. 15).

As I observed Darlene’s classes, I saw one clear example of her interest for the students’ welfare. One boy was not feeling well and asked for permission to self-check his blood sugar. Evidently he is used to this because he carries the necessary equipment with him. The results indicated that his blood sugar was very low. The teacher sent another student to get some juice, but she came back empty-handed. So Darlene assigned a student to copy the rest of the information on the board, and another student to be room monitor while she went to get something for the sick boy. (She asked me to check them out.) When she came back, she told me about the lengths she had to go to procure the remedy for the student.

A Typical Day

Darlene’s day begins at 7:30 in the morning when all teachers at Progressive School have a short devotional meeting and announcements by the principal or other administrators. Classes begin at 8:00 and each one lasts 50 minutes. Darlene uses the first minutes for worship and civic exercises. During this time, the students sing religious
songs, listen to some inspirational reading, and have prayer before singing the national anthems and pledging allegiance to both the Puerto Rican and the United States flags.

Darlene's schedule is pretty structured. She teaches three math classes during the morning before her preparation time at 10:40, and then teaches fourth-grade science from 11:30 to 12:20. Her lunchtime is 1 hour until 1:20 p.m., although she usually spends most of it at the office doing some work for the school. Her last two classes are fifth- and sixth-grade science, which end at 3:00. In all, Darlene teaches six classes daily with one preparation time. On Fridays, the periods are shortened and the students are dismissed at 2:00.

Evidence of Application of Standards

Darlene is certified as an English teacher. She has endorsements also to teach Math, Science, and Bible. Even though she had not heard of any standards for bilingual education, she has learned to apply some of them through self-teaching and common sense.

Willingness to participate in innovative programs

When she began teaching 17 years ago, Darlene entered the world of bilingual schools in Puerto Rico. Few schools in the Western region offered a complete bilingual program, thus education officers knew that it was going to be an adventure to establish a new parochial school with both a monolingual and a bilingual track.

The innovators approached Darlene, who accepted the challenge as a bilingual teacher, and has worked along with the administration for the betterment of the program.
Language proficiency in Spanish and English

Darlene is fluent both in English and Spanish. Although she speaks only English in her classroom, she speaks Spanish when she needs to in or out of the room. She is certified to teach both Spanish and English, for which she had to pass the basic competencies test and one specialized test on each subject.

When she receives students in fourth grade, Darlene evaluates their writing skills. She expects them to master basic skills, and if they do not, she plans how to help them. Those who spend the 3 years with her show more mastery of these skills because she is not happy to teach them only science and math. She thinks that they also need language skills to be able to achieve higher in life, and that is what she teaches.

Mathematics and science are both taught in English. Even when math language is so abstract, Darlene explains her classes in English and students are expected to respond also in English. She provides a correct model because she wants the students to learn no only math or science, but English as well. I was amazed at how naturally she integrates Language Arts with her math classes, since she is so interested in her students acquiring high proficiency as they communicate in English or Spanish.

I referred to Darlene the case of a girl appointed to copy information on the board while she was out taking care of a sick boy. The girl asked another friend to dictate to her, so she could write faster. This called my attention to the fact that the girl spelled all the words correctly without looking at the book. Darlene said that this girl has been her student since third grade and has learned a lot of English through her classes.
Knowledge of different methods to teach second and native languages

It is a challenge for teachers to teach content subjects in English within a Spanish-speaking environment. The students need to learn the content and skills at the same time that they struggle to learn a different language. Specifically in Mathematics, Darlene applies the methods she has learned to teach the subject. She does it as if she were teaching to native English-speaking students. She goes through a lot of practice exercises and demonstrations so the students are able to grasp the meaning of the concepts. The students know that they are expected to speak English and they comply. It is evident that they are able to transfer the information from one language to the other.

What follows is a transcription of my notes about Darlene’s teaching. The intention is to portray the intensity of her style and her interest in her students’ learning.

Teacher Darlene was showing how to do a frequency table. She spoke only English in a very natural way, like in a first language. The students answered and participated in English also.

After the demonstration of the process, the students worked on their notebooks. Darlene kept emphasizing, “Why to we need to learn this (to do surveys)?”

The teacher kept busy organizing things around the room while the students kept on task during the amount of time that was assigned.

When the teacher took up the class again, she showed the difference of a grid with asymmetric lines, which could not be used because measurements would not be correct. She emphasized the need to do straight lines, and encouraged neat work.

The teacher used the think-aloud technique while demonstrating the process. None of the students complained about not understanding English, although some made comments in Spanish.

Darlene used phrases like: “You have to start inventing ways of doing things,” and “See how you can do this.” She kept on checking students’ work, and insisted: “Check to see if both rows have the same measure.”
As she was teaching the process of tallying and charting the information, she reviewed things like: "Titles are written with capital letters, underline this," etc.

The teacher asked questions like: "What kind of interval do we need for this information?" When students made their suggestions, the teacher "tried" their alternatives until they came to the correct answer.

When a problem arose with leftover data, students were oriented towards a solution: "add more rows." (Vol. 2, p. 7)

During the observation of this class, it was evident that Darlene knows her subject well and knows how to teach it, be it in English or Spanish. She was able to follow the techniques for procedural knowledge out of pure instinct and self-teaching since she did not learn that in college. She was happy to know that it could be identified in her teaching.

In another class, it was review time. The students were getting ready for a math test and Darlene planned to make sure that they would make it through. She provided guided practice, went through problems analyzing each step for difficulties, and then provided new situations in which the students could apply their learning. She encouraged questions from the students. Her favorite statement seems to be: "Let's do it together." With it she tries to restore confidence in those students who still had difficulties with problem solving. She went back to facts that had been taught before to help the students make connections. Darlene also helped students identify what they were doing wrong, and guided their practice.

One thing is constant in Darlene's teaching, and that is encouragement. She keeps telling her students:

Everyone can do Math. You just have to practice. The more you practice, the better you get. Don't let your GPA go down. If you want to be somebody, you must study. When you go to 7th grade, you are going to face a lot of things. (Vol. 2, p. 10)
In teaching science, Darlene applies some interactive approaches combined with her more traditional teaching. The topic for one class observed was *Dominant and Recessive Personal Traits*. As an exploratory activity, the teacher went around the room choosing some students without explaining the reason, and asking them to go to the front of the room. She had chosen pairs who exemplified the presence or absence of a particular trait. When everybody was up front, Darlene illustrated the concept of different traits by using these “live” samples. It was a fun activity that the students enjoyed.

The teacher had written the main traits on the board and instructed the students to copy them in their notebook. Then it was time for the next activity in which the students were to circulate in order to find classmates who either possessed or did not possess each trait. Students got excited and began talking and planning. Darlene reminded them that they were supposed to be quiet while she was talking. Students then walked around while collecting information about their classmates. It was a little noisy, but they were on task. The teacher had indicated the time allotted for the activity. When time was up, Darlene counted from 1 to 10 until the students sat down calmly.

With her fifth-graders, the teacher worked from the book as she guided the students through the correction of the work done in the previous class. They were supposed to write sentences using some science words. One word was completely unknown to the students. She explained it in Spanish and then gave several examples of how to use the word. One boy told an anecdote in Spanish about some animals; nevertheless, most of them seem very comfortable speaking about science topics in English.
I asked if she ever had cooperative learning activities. Darlene confirmed what was obvious from the appearance of the room: They do not have the facilities and equipment needed for that strategy, even when she would like to use it. She attended some seminars and workshops on the topic, and is planning to raise some funds to get equipment for her classroom, mainly tables and chairs.

Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children

During her training, Darlene took courses on human development and growth. However, her many years of teaching and of observing her students have given her a first-hand experience so she can be alert to the needs of her students. She has been able to notice the differences in learning patterns and language development patterns. Regarding this, she says, “As a bilingual teacher I have noticed that there are students who are capable of handling two languages, while there are others who are not” (Vol. 2, p. 34). Of course, this is something that orients her in setting up expectations for her students.

Understanding and acceptance of all cultures represented in the community

Darlene is the only teacher in Progressive School who conducts civic exercises before classes. There are both an American and a Puerto Rican flag at the front, and the students pledge their allegiance to both and sing the national anthems of Puerto Rico and the United States.
When asked about these civic exercises, Darlene commented that for her it is a tradition. She recently added the flags, since she used to have pictures instead. According to her, there have been no problems with parents or students so far.

Progressive School is a denominational institution. Therefore, religious exercises are part of the daily program. Students have Bible classes, and in most other classes they have short devotionals with character stories, singing, and praying. Darlene maintains these efforts to transmit the religious values of the system. However, she is also respectful of the beliefs of students who do not profess the same faith. At the same time, all students are taught and expected to be respectful of the school’s beliefs.

Teacher Darlene is a very busy person. She gets involved with several cultural activities and when she is not leading them, she is helping her colleagues. This year, the school celebrated Planet Week on April 15-19. Darlene announced this to her students, and said there would be several activities. Among them, she mentioned a poster contest. Students who wanted to participate were to create a poster with a message about the conservation of Earth. Topics could be: conservation, recycling, or save the planet. Another contest had to do with mottos about the topic. Those chosen by the committee would be used to form a mural.

Students’ Performance

Darlene’s students attend Progressive School mostly because of the English program that is offered there. The fact that it receives the full support of the community is indicative of the positive outcomes in terms of students’ performance. This school does not administer standardized tests except the Puerto Rican Test, which is a general achievement test applied only in third and sixth grades. The core of students’ assessment
is based on classroom tests, projects, homework, and other traditional measures. Darlene feels satisfied with her students’ outcomes in Math and Science and with the mastery of the English language acquired through the study of subject matter.

**Summary**

Darlene gives great importance to setting a good example for her students. She is very proud of her performance as a bilingual teacher because she has seen her students grow academically and personally. She is very emphatic about the need for excellent English teachers and recommends schools of education to be more selective of their students. She sees the acquisition of English as a needed tool for success in life.
CHAPTER 5

CROSS-CASE ANALYSIS

Introduction

Chapter 4 portrayed the life experiences of 4 exemplary bilingual teachers. I observed them as they put into practice what they understand as good bilingual teaching. I also saw how they overcome the obstacles in their career, how they prevail in the search for excellence in a profession that is plagued with problems, but at the same time, yields high satisfaction when done well. In this chapter I look for themes, that is, the common elements that will help me to draw conclusions and answer the research questions about aspects that contribute to excellent bilingual teaching in Puerto Rico.

The purpose of this study was to seek to understand how exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico become what they are by identifying some elements that contribute to their professional development. Although many elements may interact in the formation of a teacher, four basic ones were considered: pre-service training, administrative support, community support, personal characteristics and life experiences of the teachers. Three research questions guided my study and are summarized to permit the reader to determine the applicability of this study to their own context and situation. There are also some recommendations for bilingual teachers, school administrators, and teacher educators.
Cross-Case Analysis

In this section, I answer the three research questions that guided my study. The data collected is analyzed and the results compared with the theoretical framework developed through the review of literature.

Research Question # 1

Research question #1 asked: What evidence is there of exemplary standards in bilingual classrooms that have been identified as exemplary? The purpose of this study was to learn how some bilingual teachers develop their high level of effectiveness according to criteria synthesized from professional organizations such as the National Association of Bilingual Education (NABE) and the Puerto Rican Association of Teachers. As established from the literature review, there are some basic requirements that a bilingual teacher must meet in order to be considered able to meet this responsibility. Following is a synthesis and analysis across the four cases of their performance as bilingual teachers.

Willingness to Participate in Innovative Programs

Although willingness to participate in innovative programs does not seem, at first glance, like an important requirement for a bilingual teacher, it was the first one stated by the Puerto Rican Teachers Association (Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico, 1976). The organization was trying to implement a reform movement regarding the teaching of English as a second language. Because previous attempts had not produced the expected results, it was thought that new approaches should be tried; therefore, teachers should be willing to work within new paradigms.
In 1997 the Department of Education presented a new program, whose innovative nature was described as follows:

The intended new policy, “The Development of Bilingual Citizens,” is different. It is different because it will strengthen communication skills in both Spanish and English languages. This new emphasis will enable students to benefit from the teaching of syntactic and semantic relations simultaneously. It is expected that prospective graduates will be able to develop their capacity to communicate properly in both languages. In other words, this dual language policy should lead to enhancing the possibility of reaching the goal of becoming bilingual citizens. This is an innovative and far-reaching plan that integrates three academic disciplines: English, Spanish, and the Fine Arts. (Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997, p. 1)

Such an enterprise demanded teachers who were bold and willing to change their learned ways, to leave their comfort zone in order to provide a better future for their students. Teaching innovations are not exclusive to bilingual education; however, due to the reformative approach, they are considered a must in the teaching of a second language. James Poon Teng Fatt (1998) says, “Innovative teaching methods challenge students to do more and to do it differently” (p. 618). Nevertheless, in the present circumstances, the challenge extends to students and teachers alike.

Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene met the challenge by their innovative teaching. Alex and Teresa relocated just to participate in the bilingual project. They implemented new curricula, learned to write proposals for Federal funds, and also participated in the planning and implementing of several new programs in their school.

Tina is also participating in the bilingual program, but her sense of innovation is more geared to improving her own teaching. She continues to take courses and attempts to apply the new theories in her classroom. Darlene is also a person willing to enter into new enterprises if they contain a promise of professional satisfaction and fulfillment. She
was willing to switch schools just to participate in the new bilingual project. Table 2 shows some indicators of this willingness.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;I was working</td>
<td>&quot;Our staff is very</td>
<td>&quot;It is very important to</td>
<td>&quot;Then, the Conference officers asked me to come to Progressive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>somewhere else, and</td>
<td>involved with innovative programs.</td>
<td>participate in innovative programs because you</td>
<td>School because they wanted to begin this new bilingual program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Superintendent</td>
<td>At this moment we are working with</td>
<td>always learn new things or remember the ones you</td>
<td>I liked the idea of expanding bilingual education to other students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>though I was the</td>
<td>Expeditionary Learning</td>
<td>don't use often. It also gives you a sense of</td>
<td>So I switched schools and taught 3rd grade for 2 more years here at</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>So I decided to</td>
<td>concluded an after school program that focuses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>relocate because I</td>
<td>on sports, baking, and self-improvement. We also</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>was interested in the</td>
<td>have English Discoveries and Kid's PAL&quot; (Vol. 4,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>project. I've been</td>
<td>p. 30).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>here from the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>beginning&quot; (Vol. 3,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p. 9).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Learning is an</td>
<td>&quot;It's wonderful to see that the hard work we</td>
<td>I am studying to complete my B.A. (I have an Associate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expedition into the</td>
<td>have done has paid off. If I had not been part of</td>
<td>Degree in Education), so I am learning a lot of things.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unknown. Expeditions</td>
<td>these projects, I would have missed out on the</td>
<td>I try to introduce innovations, like this whole-language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>draw together personal</td>
<td>satisfaction that our accomplishments have given</td>
<td>approach. I like it because students can understand</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>experience and</td>
<td>us&quot; (Vol. 4, p. 30).</td>
<td>better when they study certain content with different</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>intellectual growth</td>
<td></td>
<td>emphasis. There are more opportunities for enrichment&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to promote self-</td>
<td></td>
<td>(Vol. 1, p. 16).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discovery and the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>construction of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge&quot; (Vol. 3,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p. 11).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;With Expeditionary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning we don't</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>have a set curriculum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We've to write it as</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a new program&quot; (Vol. 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p. 11).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;I have learned to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>write proposals to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>get funds for new</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>programs&quot; (Vol. 3, p.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Language Proficiency in Spanish and English

“A bilingual teacher must be capable of delivering instruction and managing classroom activities in at least two languages, the native language of the students, as well as their second language” (Riegelhaupt, 1994, p. 78). Although the preceding statement might seem obvious, the truth is that it is not always part of reality. In some cases, due to the shortage of bilingual teachers, many have been hired who do not possess mastery of both languages. In this regard, Cummins, (1980, as cited in Clark-Riojas, 1990) insists: “The language proficiency issue for both students and teachers must be carefully understood” (p. 368). What he supports is the idea that students must be taught first in their native language and then a second language may be added, building on the language skills already acquired. To be able to do this, “teachers must understand the role of the native language and the impact of its use in helping... students meet the goal of learning the second language” (p. 368).

Understanding the role of the native language is not enough for effective bilingual teachers. According to Cummins (1980, as cited in Clark-Riojas, 1990), and Riegelhaupt (1994), proficiency in the students’ home language is not only an essential competency for the bilingual education teacher, but also a basic one. Within the teaching profession, to be bilingual is more than just having acquired another language at home or by traveling. The teacher must have had extensive formal training in the four basic language skills and in the technical vocabulary of the different subject areas.

Riegelhaupt (1994), commenting on Carrasco’s study (1982) about characteristics of bilingual classrooms, points out:

Knowledge of the characteristics of language related to classroom interaction is key. Bilingual teachers must be knowledgeable about the languages in question, and their complex rules for interaction, so that they are better able to provide a
linguistically and culturally relevant and effective educational environment, which takes into account the complex nature of bilingualism as a linguistic phenomenon. (p. 81)

Riegelhaupt goes on to emphasize exposure to an adequate linguistic model, both in the language of the home and in the second language as “one clear prerequisite to linguistic and cognitive development” (p. 81). According to her, it is necessary to identify the characteristics of each linguistic model so that teachers can be trained to use successful and appropriate linguistic strategies in their classroom discourse.

Alex and Tina were born in Puerto Rico and studied part of their time in Puerto Rican schools in Spanish programs. Alex attended an English-only military-base school and Tina went to school in New York. Teresa was born and raised in New York, where she attended school until her 10th grade. She later came to Puerto Rico and finished her studies there. Darlene was also born in New York where she studied until she graduated from high school. The four participants belong to Puerto Rican families (Alex’s mother is North American and his father is Puerto Rican), and attended private colleges in Puerto Rico.

Table 3 illustrates how the four participants in my study use their knowledge of Spanish and English to teach their students in an effective way. They employ strategies that encourage the transfer of academic skills from one language to the other, and also can be a correct linguistic model to their students. They teach their classes completely in English, although they provide help in Spanish to those students who need it. They encourage their students to be competent in both languages. The four teachers talk English inside and outside the classroom, but communicate in Spanish with most of the parents.
Table 3

*Knowledge and Use of Both Languages*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>He can speak both without an accent and expresses himself freely and naturally. He constitutes a correct model for his students, although he speaks only English to his students, both inside and outside the classroom. (Vol. 3, p. 4)</td>
<td>“If the teacher is not a correct model, students will not learn the correct pronunciation, leaving a noticeable accent” (Vol. 2, p. 30).</td>
<td>“It is very important because we are models to our students” (Vol. 1, p. 39).</td>
<td>“I think that the students should be competent in both languages: read, write, and speak them well” (Vol. 2, p. 34).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“They watch videos in English or Spanish, and read in English or Spanish. In the English class, however, everything is taught in English although sometimes the teacher might explain a difficult term or listen to a student speaking in Spanish” (Vol. 3, p. 12).</td>
<td>“But when they get stuck, I help them in English. However, I teach in English” (Vol. 4, p. 3).</td>
<td>“Well, most of the time I speak both [languages]. Most of my kids already know English. I try to encourage them to speak English, but when they want to speak Spanish, I let them speak Spanish, and then ask them to translate themselves” (Vol. 1, p. 3).</td>
<td>“I think that one of my strengths is my level of proficiency in English. I also like to motivate students to speak English, even when my class is science or math. I can also communicate easily with parents” (Vol. 2, p. 2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One student asked about the meaning of the word <em>Capitalism</em> in Spanish. The teacher explained briefly and continued in English. (Vol. 3, p. 8)</td>
<td>“It is very important that the teacher have knowledge of the structures of both languages. It aids the communication between student and teacher. Our school is bilingual, and it is necessary to be able to understand our students” (Vol. 4, p. 30).</td>
<td>“It is very important to know the structure of both languages to be able to teach correctly” (Vol. 1, p. 39).</td>
<td>“I am certified to teach both Spanish and English” (Vol. 2, p. 6).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“I am interested in my students acquiring high proficiency as they communicate in English or Spanish because they will need those skills in life” (Vol. 2, p. 14).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Knowledge of Different Methods to Teach Second and Native Languages*

Bilingual teachers struggle daily to find the best ways to teach their students. As they reflect on their practice and try to form their own theories, they must depend on what they have learned and fit it into their repertoire of educational strategies. According
to accepted criteria, one requisite of a bilingual teacher is to be able to teach second and native languages with different methods. That includes teaching subject content in both languages.

Transference of general teaching methods to the bilingual setting is possible, but it is not enough. Carrasco and Riegelhaupt (1984) note that while all teachers “have similar goals for their students, whether bilingual or not, the bilingual teacher uses different means to accomplish these goals” (p. 82). According to Gelmi (1994),

Teaching a second language raises two questions: first, selecting the vernacular to which the pupils are to be exposed and, second, finding the most effective and most motivating means to convey that language in conformity with the age of the pupils. (p. 87)

Choosing those effective and motivating means implies decisions about “the linguistic objectives and content of teaching, and the procedures, the teaching techniques—i.e. the method whereby such contents are conveyed” (p. 87).

Traditional teaching of second languages emphasized grammar and translation (Gelmi, 1994), which implied that the students were expected to study the language before acquiring it. Because of recent studies on phenomena influencing the development of language and on the processes of language teaching and language learning, new approaches have been proposed that yield better results. We have gone from analytic, synthetic, and structured approaches to the more innovative, communicative approach. “The methodology of language teaching offers various suggestions on how to perform this activity practically in the classroom” (Gelmi, 1994, p. 88).

Alex and Teresa teach intermediate students in a public school. Their needs are somewhat different from Tina’s, a second grade teacher in a private school, and from

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Darlene's, an elementary math and science teacher, also in a private school. Nevertheless, they have something in common. Because they are sure of the importance of knowing different methods to teach a second language, they have tried to overcome their own shortcomings through different paths.

Alex, for example, emphasizes technology and uses computers, projectors, TV/VCR, and other means to teach his classes. He integrates English and Social Studies while doing so, and encourages students to develop their oral skills with dramas, contests, and so forth.

Teresa's methodology is more interactive, according to the resources she has. She prepares her own thematic units, and has her students participate in dramas, oral presentations, research, and projects while at the same time keeping a traditional flavor in some of her classes. She works with large and small groups and involves her students in service to the community.

Tina’s emphasis on whole-language is commendable. She also uses some audio-visual tools and keeps her students active with hand-on experiences in most of her classes, English, math, science or social studies. Darlene is a master of procedural knowledge in math. She integrates English skills in all her classes and she likes to work with projects. Table 4 is illustrative of this search.

**Knowledge of Developmental and Growth Patterns of Children**

Child psychologist J. O. Comer (1992) depicts a dark picture about the knowledge of child development in our schools and the damage it brings to those we intend to help. This knowledge should be pivotal in organizing a school or program because
Table 4

**Knowledge of Different Methods to Teach Second and Native Languages**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Every teacher should master different methods” (Vol. 3, p. 32).</td>
<td>“By knowing different methods the teacher can be able to select the method that is more effective for his/her student” (Vol. 4, p. 30).</td>
<td>“We need to know different methods to teach second and native languages so that our teaching is interesting and proper. It is also important to know the current issues in education in Puerto Rico and the United States and how they affect our students and us” (Vol. 1, p. 39).</td>
<td>“Yes, I have taken different methods to teach ESL and as a native language, but also methods to teach content subjects like math and science” (Vol. 2, p. 34).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I use them [computers] a lot in my teaching. We make Power Point presentations, and we do research and write reports, and storytelling” (Vol. 3, p. 6).</td>
<td>The teacher announced that they are getting ready for the unit project. This time they will dramatize different versions of the story of Cinderella and must bring materials for the props and customs. (Vol. 4, p. 7)</td>
<td>“Well... I like to give the students a lot of different experiences on different things, like I like them to write their own poems. I like them to be able to read, by helping them to be creative not only in spoken and written language, but in everything they do” (Vol. 1, p. 2).</td>
<td>She follows procedural knowledge techniques, interactive learning, demonstrations, projects, and integration of subjects. (Vol. 2, p. 9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“For this unit, the students have studied newspaper articles, biographies, and have researched information about the historical events of Pearl Harbor. They have been asked to write a report on the movie including: events, characters, setting, themes involved, plot, conflicts, elements of non-fiction, etc.” (Vol. 3, p. 6).</td>
<td>... going over some vocabulary, which she writes on the board. Then reading the story, while the students read along silently (Vol. 4, p. 7)</td>
<td>Use of quality questions like “Why do you think she said that?” and “What’s the meaning of . . . ?” Students read aloud. Next... compare the stories read so far by using a graphic organizer with several aspects of the story. Use of technology to teach. Students worked alone and in groups. (Vol. 4, p. 11)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can be very creative in teaching English. I sing, I use drama, dance, writing, and I also integrate other subjects like math and social studies. I see learning English as a way of living, because we are using language to do many things” (Vol. 3, p. 2).</td>
<td>Use of technology to teach. Students worked alone and in groups. (Vol. 4, p. 11)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
there is an obvious point of focus for any organizing theme—students—how they grow and learn and, in turn, how policies must be established and resources deployed to promote development and learning. There is abundant evidence that young people learn at an adequate to optimal level when they are able to meet their developmental needs—with support for growth in social-interactive, psycho-emotional, moral, linguistic, and intellectual-cognitive areas. But neither our traditional educational approaches nor our school reform efforts of the past decade have focused adequately on child development. (p. 28)

According to Comer (1992), the blame is shared by schools of education’s faulty courses, Schools’ administrative decisions that do not facilitate child development, uninformed curricula about child development, and an education policy foreign to the topic. His harsh criticism seeks to awaken the community to the need for a people-centered approach to school reform.

Many teachers know very little about child development and even less about how to promote it. Until very recently, the pre-and in-service education of teachers largely ignored development; even now, the subject is not taught in a way that prepares teachers to support the development of students in school. Most schools are not organized and managed in a way that facilitates child development. . . . Most curricula are not informed by an understanding of child development, and education policy often is not made by people with expertise in child development. (p. 28)

In spite of Comer’s arguments, knowledge of child development and growth is one of the requisites in most teacher education programs. In the case of bilingual teachers, knowledge of child development and growth patterns is even more critical as they change significantly among cultures.

The four participants in my study are aware of the need to know how children grow and the developmental stages they go through, and how that development impacts their learning. For Alex and Teresa, the needs are different because they are dealing with teenagers. They have had to give orientation on such topics as drugs, sex, and careers. Alex’s students like to relate to him as a big brother and like to ask him questions they do
not dare ask their parents. Teresa shows her concern in trying to get her students to know “the real world out there,” and in trying to build positive relationships with them.

Tina demonstrates her knowledge of child development by providing a healthy environment for her students and by providing a variety of activities that meet their need not only for exercise, but also for rest. She is also very patient, and a happy person the students like to be with. Tina implements her curriculum based on her students’ needs.

Darlene tries to help her students in the transition from the primary (K-3) to the elementary (4-6) grades. Also, she is always emphasizing the “jump” to the intermediate grades. She is firm and loving with them.

The four teachers try to adapt their methods to the age level of their students. Besides listening to their self-reflection, I was able to observe several ways in which the teachers try to apply this knowledge, as presented in Table 5.

**Understanding and Acceptance of all the Cultures Represented in the Community**

“Puerto Ricans, including those advocating statehood, consider themselves a people with a strong national identity” (Rubinstein, 2001, p. 420). It is defended and kept alive in spite of the political overtures throughout the years (Pousada, 1993, Resnick, 1993). Schools are expected to maintain and transmit the cultural heritage, and often they do a good job at it. There are several ethnic groups represented in Puerto Rico, but in broad strokes, it can be said that cultural distinctions are subtle. Nevertheless, Clark et al. (1992) ponder the concept of cultural diversity and offer some poignant thoughts about multiculturalism.

Although cultural diversity is increasing in American society, many people lack the skills to cope with or feel at home in a diverse society. We don’t learn this
brand of coping and understanding skills at home because they are not necessary at home. We don’t learn them in the classroom or childcare setting because current practices tend to reinforce stereotypes and hinder understanding instead of fostering trust and familiarity. (p. 40)

Table 5

Knowledge of Developmental and Growth Patterns of Children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Middle school is a hard time for the students. They have growth</td>
<td>“It is important to know and understand their needs as students to be</td>
<td>“It is important [knowing developmental and growth patterns] so I can</td>
<td>“As a bilingual teacher, I have noticed that there are students that are</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>problems because of their hormones and everything, so they ask</td>
<td>able to adjust my teaching methods” (Vol. 4, p. 30).</td>
<td>evaluate the methods and strategies I use to teach. I also need</td>
<td>capable of handling two languages. But there are others that can’t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>questions about life” (Vol. 3, p. 12).</td>
<td>She is worried about their growing into adulthood without the tools</td>
<td>to know if they [the students] have problems and to find ways to help</td>
<td>manage to deal [with] both languages and they end up not knowing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>they need. “That is why I try very hard—together with other teachers—to</td>
<td>them. It is a knowledge that is used almost every day as I try to</td>
<td>English nor Spanish” (Vol. 2, p. 34).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>provide the students with information they can use as they make the</td>
<td>make learning meaningful to the students” (Vol. 1, p. 39).</td>
<td>“My philosophy is to be firm but with love and respect. Fourth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>natural decisions of their age. Some of the workshops presented to the</td>
<td></td>
<td>graders need more time to adjust because it is a different system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>students this year were: Drugs Free Zone and Sex Education”</td>
<td></td>
<td>they come to. They have many teachers and not everybody have the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Vol. 4, p. 9).</td>
<td></td>
<td>same rules and procedures. But once they have been taught, they don’t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>have further problems in my classroom” (Vol. 2, p. 15).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the ideas of these educators, a classroom might become culturally assaultive if proper care is not taken to sensitize and train the teachers on the correct ways to model and teach coping and understanding skills. This is so because different children cope in different ways with being culturally different from the majority. Some show anger and defiance; others withdraw, becoming passive.
and compliant, or even depressed and non communicative. Any of these behaviors may further reinforce a teacher’s own stereotypical views. Children from the predominant culture also suffer. Without early positive exposure to other cultures and peoples, these insulated children often become ethnocentric adults who feel discomfort and fear when dealing with other people. (Clark et al., p. 41)

Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Teresa are aware of this need and are working to deal effectively with the cultural differences within their groups of students. As expressed by Teresa (Vol. 4, p. 9), there are Puerto Rican students who have lived in the United States and return to the Island without the mastery of Spanish and with a sense of not belonging in the community. They are sometimes the object of biased decisions or prejudice, as illustrated in one of Teresa’s accounts (Vol. 4, p. 9). Therefore, these students need the understanding and acceptance not only of their teachers, but also of their peers.

In Teresa and Alex’s school, they do not deal a lot with transmission of Puerto Rican culture, at least, not overtly in the English classes. However, they do have a clear cultural problem with the students who migrate back to the Island after having lived all their lives in the United States. In these cases, both Teresa and Alex show empathy and understanding by establishing good relationships with the students and accepting them so as to model their behavior to the other students. They try to teach their students also about the responsibility each one has towards the community in general.

Tina and Darlene have more opportunities to participate in cultural activities that foster the native culture in their own schools. Most of these activities are conducted in Spanish; also in some instances the programs may include some parts in English. They do not have clear cultural group differences in their schools, but always try to involve all the students in their festivities. They also promote Christian beliefs in their classrooms,
but show and teach respect for religious differences. How they feel about this issue and some things they have been able to achieve are illustrated in Table 6.

Table 6

_Understanding and Acceptance of All the Cultures Represented in the Community_

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;It is a must,&quot; says Alex who has to deal with their slang, different accents and other things that might spark fire if not approached with empathy and understanding. (Vol. 3, p. 32)</td>
<td>&quot;I receive many students that come from different cultures and environments. By understanding their background and being able to accept them as they are, a bonding will occur between teacher and student. This bonding will produce a better learning process&quot; (Vol. 4, p. 30).</td>
<td>&quot;It's also important that I understand and accept all cultures represented in the community so I can be of help to my students and help them understand and accept themselves also&quot; (Vol. 1, p. 39).</td>
<td>&quot;As a teacher, I have accepted different cultures represented in my classroom and understood their backgrounds&quot; (Vol. 2, p. 34).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;For Christmas, we participate in Parrandas in Spanish [This is a fun Christmas tradition in Puerto Rico]&quot; (Vol. 1, p. 11).</td>
<td>&quot;We celebrate the Puerto Rican Week with pageants, contests, exhibits, etc.&quot; (Vol. 1, p. 11).</td>
<td>&quot;As a teacher, I have accepted different cultures represented in my classroom and understood their backgrounds&quot; (Vol. 2, p. 34).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;I am the only teacher in Progressive School who conducts civic exercises before classes&quot; (Vol. 2, p. 9).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Summary

The portrayal of the four teachers participating in my study—Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene—shows exemplary teaching in action, according to professional guidelines. The standards for bilingual teachers include several dimensions found to be important in bilingual education, such as: innovative disposition, knowledge of both languages, knowledge of language-related theories and applications, use of diversified methodology,
cultural awareness, and knowledge of child development and growth theories. All the participants met the expectation of a high level of teaching effectiveness in their classrooms.

Research Question # 2

In what ways do teacher training, administrative support, and community response contribute to exemplary practice? If we lived in an ideal world, teachers would receive adequate pre-service training in their intended area of specialization; they would work in positive, nurturing, supporting environments, and would have all imaginable resources available to meet their needs and those of their students. However, as was discussed in the review of literature in chapter 2, the basic components that contribute to effective teaching are sometimes beyond the reach of many teachers.

Although a good number of teacher candidates are able to go through a proper process of preparation and work in a sound, enhancing environment with adequate resources (Darling-Hammond, 1996, p. 7), many do not. Ironically, job expectations are the same, no matter what circumstances surround the world of the teacher. As a result, many leave the profession early. As Chase (1998) said:

Is it any wonder that more than 30 percent of all new K-12 teachers quit their jobs in the first five years? Twenty percent leave after their first year. What an appalling waste of human and monetary resources this is—and what an indictment of current teacher preparation and mentoring practices. (p. 18)

In the following pages, I try to compare the extent to which these basic components—training, administrative support, social environment, and personal attributes—contributed to the exemplary practice of the 4 case study teachers.
Pre-service Training

Three of the four participants in this study (Alex, Teresa, and Darlene) are certified English teachers—that is, ESL teachers. They received their training in local universities. The fourth participant (Tina) is certified as an elementary teacher in Spanish, although she has always taught in a bilingual program. In this section, I cross analyze the preparation they had in their pre-service program. The analysis is limited to the coursework in the main areas germane to bilingual education: language, instruction, and culture, as suggested in NABE Professional Standards.

Language

González and Darling-Hammond (2000) see several problems in the second language teacher education programs. Among them is an incorrect view of language, which focuses mainly on the components of language such as phonology, morphology, syntax, and lexicon.

This narrow view overlooks the social nature of language as a tool for communication and a mechanism through which content can be explored and examined. Language study is generally decontextualized and unrelated to the lives of students, their school, or the community, and much of language instruction is grammar driven. (p. 2)

Another problem plaguing second language teacher education programs, according to González and Darling-Hammond (2000), is that they fail to see the interconnectedness between first and second languages and cultures.

Schools and teacher education programs often focus on pushing students to work rapidly and unrealistically to acquire fluent English without attention to continued first language development. This approach minimizes the connections between first and second language development and reduces the potential for advancement in both languages. Inattention to the first language development of non-English speakers is also detrimental to their academic achievement. (p. 2)
The following information was drawn from a participant questionnaire about the content included in pre-service programs as recommended by the National Association for Bilingual Education (1992). Each table shows the presence or absence of the suggested issues in the pre-service training received by Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene. Table 7 presents data about the courses related to language that were included in their college program.

Table 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Alex*</th>
<th>Teresa*</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessing student's language proficiency in Spanish and English</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theories and application of second language teaching</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the nature of language</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the nature of bilingualism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structural differences between the child's first and second language</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language variety of the home and the standard variety as valid systems of communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Certified ESL.

Alex and Teresa seem to have coverage of more language-related issues, and would be, therefore, in an advantageous position. Nonetheless, Alex missed theories and application of second language teaching, while both he and Teresa missed understanding the nature of bilingualism and the language variety of the home and the standard variety as valid systems of communication. Tina received instruction in assessing students' language proficiency and also theories and application of second language teaching. Surprisingly, even though she is certified as an English teacher, Darlene did not receive
any instruction in the language area, whereas Tina received some instruction in understanding the nature of language. In synthesis, the coursework in the area of language-related issues was insufficient as measured by NABE Standard #3, at least for Alex and Tina, while it was completely absent for Darlene.

Instruction

The National Association for Bilingual Education (1992) recommends the training in instruction; however, not all educators agree with a strong focus on methodology. González and Darling-Hammond (2000), in their evaluation of traditional teacher education programs, see such a focus as “paralyzing” (p. 2). According to them, “preparation programs for foreign language and ESL teachers have placed emphasis on instructional methods rather than on the what, why, and who of second language instruction” (p. 2). Moreover, Tedick and Walker (1994) argue, “This concentration on methodology has made second language instruction teacher-centered because it focuses on the ways in which the teacher best organizes, presents, and assesses success with lessons” (p. 306). What they suggest, instead, is that language development should be seen as an “integrated, generative process in which the learner is an active agent” (p. 306).

The problem faced by Alex and Darlene, as can be seen in Table 8, is that they did not receive any emphasis on methodology for ESL teaching, nor were they taught the more integrated, generative view of language development. Teresa and Tina have received more instruction on methodology. Tina’s instructional emphasis is more congruent with the integrative model suggested by Tedick and Walker (1994) because of
her studies about whole-language. Darlene's courses did not include training in any of
the instructional skills suggested by NABE, except for the use of audiovisual materials.

Table 8

*Instructional Issues Included in Pre-Service Training*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Alex*</th>
<th>Teresa*</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to organize and teach reading/language lessons in English</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to organize and teach content area lessons in English</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to teach literacy across the curriculum</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to set up small group instruction</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to direct students in inquiry/discovery learning</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to manage individualized instruction</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to set up learning centers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to use alternative assessment</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to use media and audiovisual materials</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to use computer technology to assist instruction</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Certified ESL.

Culture

González and Darling-Hammond (2000), in their evaluation of second language
teacher education programs, point to another problem regarding the relationship—or lack
of it—between language and culture. They have found complete disjuncture. Tedick and
Walker (1994) define what good practice would be in this regard.

Prospective second language teachers need to have knowledge about language
development, but they also need a clear understanding of themselves and their
students as cultural beings. They should be aware of the variety of worldviews espoused by participants in the target culture and the native culture, and of the
need to view both cultures from a number of perspectives. (p. 309)
How can prospective teachers in any school of education obtain such broad perspective? Is it safe to say that by including such issues in the curriculum the students will be able to grasp the idea of a deep relationship between language and culture?

Such insights cannot be achieved by simply adding more culture courses to the teacher education curriculum. Instead, just as culture must be an integral part of second language pedagogy, it must also be an integral part of teacher education programs, including attention to school culture and classroom ecology. (Tedick & Walker, 1994, p. 309)

Table 9 shows the kind of culture-related issues included in the pre-service training received by Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene.

None of the participants in the present study received training as a bilingual teacher; therefore, some of the skills recommended by NABE (1992) could be expected to be missing from their pre-service education. However, three of them were “trained” to be ESL teachers, which does not justify the lack of exposure to such issues as nature of language, multiculturalism, and interactive instruction of a second language.

Nancy Clair (2000) talks about the teaching of multiculturalism in the United States in a way that can be extrapolated to what is happening in Puerto Rico. She says,

In general, the U. S. teaching force is not well prepared to help culturally diverse children succeed academically and socially, because pre-service teacher preparation programs have not offered sufficient opportunities for learning how to teach culturally diverse students. As a result, many teachers have been learning on the job. (p. 1)

It is evident by looking at the table that the preparation that the four participants had was insufficient. In other words, multiculturalism is not being addressed properly in pre-service education programs. In the case of the participants in this study, only one had coursework that “to some degree” included the skill of teaching culturally diverse children.
Table 9

**Multicultural Issues Included in Pre-Service Training**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene^*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to respond positively to the diversity of behavior in a cross-cultural environment</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to develop students' awareness of the value of cultural diversity</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to prepare and assist children to interact successfully in a cross-cultural setting</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to recognize and accept different patterns of child development within and between cultures in order to formulate realistic lesson objectives</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to assist children in maintaining identification with their native culture</td>
<td>Some</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

^*Certified ESL.

Summary

I have presented my findings regarding the course work received by the participants in this study during their pre-service education in the areas of language, instruction, and multiculturalism. In the case of Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene, I found that pre-service training did not provide for adequate development of their teaching skills as bilingual teachers. Notwithstanding, they acquired some kind of basic knowledge that gave them a starting point. Therefore, the only option they had was to continue to build on a meager foundation, and through their own efforts—further studies, research, peers, and workshops—extend the development of those skills and competencies that make a teacher exemplary. They have also counted on supportive mentors and colleagues.

**Administrative Support**

The support of school administrators is vital for a teacher to grow into an exemplary one as found in the literature review (Caccia, 1996; Darling-Hammond, 1997; Showers & Joyce, 1996). This support includes not only the provision for in-service...
continuous education, but also the provision of such resources as time and materials for teaching, among other things. In this section, I analyze the level of administrative support received by each of the four teachers participating in this study.

Staff development

Even for teachers who have had an adequate pre-service preparation, staff development or in-service programs are necessary. Teachers must continue to grow and learn the skills of their trade, and although they do much on their own, it is the administrators' duty to provide opportunities for continued professional education. As Chase (1998) commented, "Veteran teachers, too, face a status quo of gross professional neglect. In most districts, management's idea of professional development—the in-service workshop tacked on the end of a long teaching day—is a disservice" (p. 18).

As I observed and talked with the participants in this study, I was able to get a clear picture of the kind of staff development they get. It was interesting to hear opposite views on the matter. For example, Alex commented: "We go through a lot of staff development" (Vol. 3, p. 3), while Teresa—who works in the same school—said, "We sometimes have very good staff development meetings. This year there has been none" (Vol. 4, p. 4). When I probed deeper into this issue, I discovered that they indeed have professional meetings and seminars, but not the kind that is needed to learn what they would like to learn. In other words, staff development does not always meet the needs of the teachers.

While talking with Alex and Teresa, an interesting difference was found regarding the Expeditionary Learning Program. Since this is a national endeavor, the program is more structured than local ones. After their proposal was accepted and funds were
granted, the teachers at PBS 17 have been able to receive special training. They have visited schools in the United States, and they have been visited by specialists who not only provide orientation, but also evaluate the teachers' performance. It could be said that for this program, Alex and Teresa have received a more effective model of staff development.

In my interview with Tina’s Principal, I asked about the kind of staff development programs that the school has. She stated,

There are some intensive seminars being offered by area of specialization by the Office of the Superintendent. In July we had a week-long institute for all the teachers, and there are also the teachers conventions and other programs like Title II that offer workshops and seminars to our teachers. (Vol. 1, p. 7)

Maybe because Tina is still taking regular education courses, she has not felt a need for extra staff development; however, just by looking at the description above, it is safe to say that the kind of staff development offered is not effective to satisfy the teachers’ needs, even when the quantity of events might satisfy the administration.

Darlene, from another private school, said, “I don’t think I am up-to-date in new strategies, what’s new out in the field” (Vol. 2, p. 2). Later on she added, “We need more staff development” (Vol. 2, p. 3). “I have not been given the privilege to have specific training or workshops” (Vol. 2, p. 35). This is so, even when both teachers belong to the same school system; therefore, the same staff development described by Tina’s principal is available in Darlene’s school.

Obviously, it is a challenge for school administrators to provide staff development that includes what Clair (2000) calls “essential elements”. Those are: principles of effective professional development, appropriate content, and skilled professional developers.
Integrating these elements presents significant challenges. First, understanding of effective professional development have changed much faster than practice. Many professional development experiences continue to be short term and disconnected from the reality of teachers' work. Second, under pressure to rise test scores, administrators and other educators may have trouble understanding how knowledge about language will help students succeed in school. Finally, identifying qualified professional developers with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes necessary to provide effective professional development on educational linguistics is daunting. (p. 4)

When we consider the wants of bilingual teachers, specialized staff development becomes still a greater need, since they have to address a different angle of language learning. As described by Rueda (1998), this is a complex process.

What kinds of professional development experiences can help practicing teachers learn more about language and apply that knowledge to improving classroom practice? Clearly, short-term professional development experiences are inadequate: Teaching and learning are complex, and teachers need time to learn and experiment with new concepts in the classroom, just as their students do. (Rueda, 1998, cited in Clair, 2000, p. 2)

Thus, how have our participants managed this big obstacle of insufficient training and staff development in their teaching career? Mostly, they have relied on their own sources and efforts. Alex and Teresa use the Internet to search for information and ideas, and they do attend the workshops or seminars offered in their school district. They even sometimes plan their own workshops and ask the principal to schedule them. In their own words, they get through “by reading, studying, and working real hard,” “by teaching myself,” “by asking,” “by learning from your own mistakes.”

Their experience might also be an example of “craft knowledge”, or the personal practical knowledge developed by teachers as they carry out the demands of their jobs as defined by Brown and McIntyre (1993, as cited in Rigano & Ritchie, 1999). These are shown in Table 10.
Table 10

Handling Limited Training and Staff Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;By reading, studying, and working real hard&quot; (Vol. 3, p. 32).</td>
<td>&quot;It has been possible through workshops, reading about the subject, searching through the Internet, and asking&quot; (Vol. 4, p. 29).</td>
<td>&quot;I try to teach myself&quot; (Vol. 1, p. 40).</td>
<td>&quot;I have investigated and provided myself all the resources needed to teach English or any other materials&quot; (Vol. 2, p. 35).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These experiences are consonant with what Featherstone (1995) found in a study of how teachers learn.

In the vignettes I have quoted here, Tierney describes four avenues of learning: She learned by osmosis; she learned by glimpsing her own behavior through the eyes of a colleague; she learned by juxtaposing old advice and new experience; she learned by struggling with teaching problems. (p. 93)

Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene expressed that they often fought feelings of frustration and inadequacy. But they did something about the situation, and walked against the wind of circumstances and prevailed in their search for ideal teaching.

Featherstone (1995) sums it up,

For the most part, working teachers agree with them: They say they learned to teach through teaching and that day-to-day encounters with students—rather than in-service workshops or university courses—continue to provide them with the best opportunities to grow and to improve their skills. (p. 93)

According to Hansen (1995), a teacher keeps growing with the practice. Soon he or she will learn what the work entails. Thus, engaging oneself in the task of teaching
can lead to a better perception and appreciation of one’s obligations as a teacher “in a way that no amount of prior exhortation from others can do” (p. 37).

Resources

Having the knowledge to do things is not enough. Adequate resources are needed, as well as conditions conducive to implementing them. Private and public schools in Puerto Rico have very limited monetary resources with which to provide adequately for effective teaching. In the case of the public system, there is always the possibility of procuring funds through federal grants. That option is limited when dealing with private schools. Thus, teachers have to rely on other alternatives to procure the needed resources if they want to keep their teaching alive and well. The most frequent one is to use their own personal funds for their teaching materials. In other instances, they ask the parents or sponsor fund-raising activities. What do the participants in my study do to procure the needed resources?

Alex writes proposals for grants to get computers and other technology for his classroom, as well as to fund special programs like the Expeditionary Learning. Teresa relies on proposals, but she also pays for most of her teaching and decorating materials. Tina turns to parents when she has depleted her own money allowance, whereas Darlene has decided to do fund raising activities.

Although these measures worked for Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene, they deprive teachers of the energy and time needed to do their job. They also portray a lack of support and professionalism towards the field of education. On the other hand, the way these teachers face their limitations shows a decided effort to achieve their goals in spite of circumstances.
Table 11

Alternative Ways for Procuring Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alex</th>
<th>Teresa</th>
<th>Tina</th>
<th>Darlene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I wrote a proposal and got the funds” (Vol. 3, p. 3).</td>
<td>“Many times the students supply their own materials, and we teachers have to supply our own” (Vol. 4, p. 16).</td>
<td>“I buy things with my own money, or I ask the parents to help me” (Vol. 1, p. 40).</td>
<td>“Provided myself all the resources needed” (Vol. 2, p. 35).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I ask for unwanted textbooks everywhere and then I keep them to be used as needed” (Vol. 3, p. 9).</td>
<td>“We make proposals for special projects, but we don’t have a lot of time for that” (Vol. 4, p. 16).</td>
<td></td>
<td>“We had to do some fund raising to get equipment for the science classes” (Vol. 2, p. 9).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Social Environment

How the community in general, and the students in particular, respond to the work done by the teachers is important for their effectiveness. In her study regarding students’ reflections about learning English, Arlene Clachar (1997) found that

English-language instruction in Puerto Rico is much more than the acquisition of the skills needed to communicate in English. It represents the existence of real and perceived social, political, and ideological pressures against which Puerto Ricans are challenged to defend their cultural heritage and vernacular. (p. 478)

According to Resnick (1993), however, the learning of English is also held as an ideal by Puerto Ricans, because it is the means not only to attain social status, but also to communicate with the world in general.

Clachar (1997) concluded:

Therefore, the apparent difficulty in addressing the English-language situation on the island lies in the ability to compromise two forces: the need to protect the indigenous vernacular and culture and the need to learn English for upward social mobility. (p. 478)

Many private schools in Puerto Rico have good English programs, strongly supported by the community. Some parents feel they owe it to their children to equip
them with the second language skills they themselves do not have. This is seen as important even in families with less financial means. Therefore, many parents are willing to sacrifice and give their children the chance they did not have, while others, being bilingual themselves, want to continue a tradition of cultural growth for their children.

I found that Alex sees this support in his community. "Parents want their children to learn English. They even fight to get a place at the school" (Vol. 3, p. 3). The students are also responsive to the learning of English. "Most kids have lived or traveled to other countries, so they don't have negative attitudes towards learning English. The other students who have had the same experience accept them. Students like it" (Vol. 3, p. 3).

Teresa, on the other hand, has mixed feelings about the way the community responds to the English program. "They support the activities." "They welcomed the program." "The classrooms are full and the waiting list is long" (Vol. 4, p. 3). In this sense, it is a positive attitude towards the benefits of the program in general. But it appears to change when the students get close to them. "Because they are young and speak English all the time, sometimes people don't want them around." "Other students [from other schools] often reject them and call our students 'the bilingual kids'" (Vol. 4, p. 3).

The students themselves have different responses. "Some students come from the U.S. understanding English and enjoy the classes here." "Some students want to learn and are eager to learn [English]." "Some students are lazy and don't enjoy it here." "Some students are forced to come by their parents" (Vol. 4, p. 3).
Both Alex and Teresa work in a public school with a special bilingual program. Students attend there on a voluntary basis and need to be put on a waiting list to get in. Nevertheless, Teresa, more than Alex, faces the social ambivalence in the response of both the students and the community in general. How do they react to this situation? Alex is happy and satisfied, "I don't see any problems" (Vol. 3, p. 3). When Teresa talked about the way the community behaves regarding the "bilingual kids," she sounded sad, "Some are prejudiced" (Vol. 4, p. 3). Nevertheless, she tries to relate the students to the community by taking them to do social work through the Expeditionary Learning Program.

Tina and Darlene work in private schools, which may account for the positive response of the community towards the learning of English in Puerto Rico, as described by Clachar (1997) in her study. According to Tina, "Most kids like to learn English, and are proud to be in the English program." "They feel they are very smart." "They feel that they have an advantage" (Vol. 1, p. 3). What makes these comments interesting is the fact that Tina's students are only in second grade. This means that they are portraying what their parents feel. "Parents are proud." "The community supports the program" (Vol. 1, p. 3).

Darlene also has a positive environment in which to teach, for the most part. According to her, there are always "some students who don't like to be in the English program, but are forced by their parents" (Vol. 2, p. 3). On the other hand, "some love to speak English and get to be very good" (Vol. 2, p. 3). Regarding the students, they might be just afraid of the "hard work" that entitles the learning of a second language, but the parents are pressing for their children to learn. "Parents are more involved in their
children's education,” said Darlene, and they “don’t want their children to suffer as they have for the lack of English” (Vol. 2, p. 3). The school principal added, “Parents see the learning of English as a social need” (Vol. 2, p. 5). In other words, they support the learning of English as a tool for social mobility.

It would be safe to say that, because each of the participants works in a school where students attend by choice and are encouraged by their parents, especially at the elementary level, the social environment is positive for teacher effectiveness. Most parents feel very strongly about the need to learn English, and they support the teachers by providing materials and time to help in the classrooms, and getting involved with their children’s learning in general.

Research Question #3

How do life experiences and personal characteristics contribute to exemplary teaching? The four participants in my study have been willing to reflect on their own practice and on the events that have helped mold their professional decisions. In some cases, they described what they saw in themselves; in others, I was able to infer the characteristics that shape their personality from their words and also from the observations made in their classrooms. In this section, I analyze both their personal attributes and some examples of formative life experiences they had.

Life Experiences

Life experiences can shape the perspectives of individuals towards different phenomena. In the case of teachers, if we examine some of the life experiences that shaped their perspectives towards teaching, we may begin to understand the motivation
that inspires them to commit to excellence in their career. Helen Featherstone (1995), in her study of how teachers learn, talks about their stories,

In telling stories we create a space outside of the relentless stream of experience and demands. We represent both our understandings and the contexts that created them, streamlining a series of lived events, selecting salient details to highlight. Sometimes our "understandings" are no more than our confusions. Sometimes they represent emerging insights, conjectures, propositions. Because a story launches a dialogue with the listener or reader—as a host of teacher groups and networks are now showing—stories may be our best path to cumulative collective insight into the vicissitudes of teaching practice. (p. 93)

Each of the four participants in the present study had “life-changing” experiences that helped them set their goals in life. All of them lived and studied both in Puerto Rico and the United States, thus learning first-hand what it is to become a bilingual person. More than that, however, there were significant events in their lives that gave direction to their performance as teachers.

Teresa’s view of teaching and learning was shaped by her experience as a high school student who moved from New York to Puerto Rico without knowing enough Spanish to function in a Spanish-only environment. She suffered more because she was used to obtaining good grades. However, even when she was lowered one grade to help her fit into a more manageable program, she was able to succeed in school. She was left with one impression, though, as she thought of better ways that could help her classmates to learn English. As a teacher, she is very intent in helping her students who do not master either Spanish or English because she does not want them to go through the experience she had. Because she did not like the “unattractive” textbook used by her teachers, she also searches for resources to provide better tools for her own students. These were to be her guiding principles as a teacher.
Alex’s mother is not a teacher, but she saw in her son the possibility of becoming an excellent educator. Because she knew him so well, when Alex decided to study Biology, she suggested that he study to be a teacher, instead. She then would tell him what she would do if she were a teacher. Her insights were based on what she was seeing happening in the schools in the country, and her desire to see things changed. Many of the suggestions made such sense that Alex has utilized them in his classroom. To him, his mother’s orientation and mentoring have been pivotal in his decision to excel in his chosen profession.

Tina’s life experience is almost fictional. She was not satisfied with her daughter’s English teacher in second grade. Because Tina knew English, she thought she could do a better job, and when the teacher resigned, she volunteered for the position. She was hired because there was no one else for the job at the moment. So, she became a bilingual teacher. Of course, she studied and is now a certified teacher. Her drive to do something about things that need to be corrected is still there, shaping her perspective about excellent teaching.

Darlene’s aunt convinced her that she should become a teacher. Even when she was not sure of her vocation, she accepted the challenge. Her mission became clear, though, while teaching temporarily in the United States. There she saw first-hand the troubles that Hispanic students go through in school when they don’t know English. She witnessed incidents of discrimination, and she promised herself that she would help stop that. She is determined to teach her students correct English so they will not have to face the same situations she saw in the beginning of her career, and so they can succeed in life.
At first glance, these stories may well seem simple, and indeed they are. What is not simple is the implication of each one in the life of a receptive person. Teresa, Alex, Tina, and Darlene found in these events the turning point in their lives. As Featherstone (1995) said, through these stories "They learn about themselves, especially about themselves as teachers" (p. 93). Their life experiences have acted as motivators to continue to work in spite of trying circumstances.

**Personal Characteristics**

Each of the four participants in my study has a strong character. They are all innovators, they are active, and love their profession. The Gregorc's Style Delineator (1985) scores showed that the teachers do not hold a common pattern of style characteristics, as shown in Table 12.

Table 12

*Gregorc's Style Delineator Results*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Concrete Sequential</th>
<th>Abstract Sequential</th>
<th>Abstract Random</th>
<th>Concrete Random</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alex</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teresa</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>34*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tina</td>
<td>36*</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darlene</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28*</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Dominant mind-style.

Instead, Tina shows a dominant concrete-sequential style, Teresa shows a dominant concrete-random style, and Darlene shows only a slight gain towards abstract random, whereas Alex shows intermediate scores in all the four channels of mediation.
Nevertheless, these teachers have shown other traits that also deserve special consideration. They are doing an excellent job as teachers, according to established professional standards. They are continually facing opposing circumstances as a result of insufficient training and limited administrative support, as described in previous sections. Still, they are dedicated to a search for excellence in their respective practice that is beyond expectations. What is it that they have that keeps them going and growing as teachers while, at the same time, enjoying it? In Alex's classroom, there is a poster that, in some ways, reflects each of the participants' position towards life.

Attitude

The longer I live, the more I realize the impact of attitude on life. Attitude, to me, is more important than facts. It is more important than the past, than education, than money, than circumstances, than failures, than success, than what other people think, or say, or do. It is more important than appearance, giftedness or skill. It will make or break a company . . . a church . . . a home. The remarkable thing is we have a choice every day regarding the attitude we will embrace for that day. We cannot change our past . . . we cannot change the fact that people will act in certain way. We cannot change the inevitable. The only thing we can do is play the one string we have, and that is our attitude. I am convinced that life is 10% what happens to me, and 90% how I react to it. And so it is with you . . . We are in charge of our attitudes.

--Charles Swindoll

Alex is very creative ("I use drama, music, dance in my teaching") (Vol. 3, p. 2) and is also a resourceful person ("I wrote a proposal and got the funds," Vol. 3, p. 2), which is helpful in teaching. More than that, he is a positive person ("I don't see any hindrances or obstacles in the program," Vol. 3, p. 3). As a young person, he is full of energy and enthusiasm ("I'm a workaholic," "I give lots of work"), and an avid learner.
(already doing graduate work, learned to write proposals by trial and error). For him, "attitude is your will for doing things. Attitude is everything; it could build or destroy. Most of the time I have a positive attitude. Without a positive attitude, I would be nowhere" (Vol. 3, p. 34). He is a broad-minded teacher who not only acknowledges, but also honors his strengths and his weaknesses as a professional. His scores on the Gregorc's Style Delineator (1985) were all in the intermediate range (CS=26, AS=22, AR=26, CR=26).

Teresa is a young mother who is very serious about her job. She is persistent (didn't give up in her high-school experience), and likes challenges ("I like challenges, and I see teaching here as a challenge" (Vol. 3, p. 9). She is also creative and has lots of initiative in developing new curricula for her students. Regarding attitude, she says, "If you have a negative attitude, you will not be able to succeed. Having a positive attitude will lead to success and accomplishments in life" (Vol. 4, p. 31). In addition, she has the characteristics of an independent person (CR=34), as defined by Gregorc's Style Delineator (1985).

One of Tina's outstanding traits is her desire to learn, which is demonstrated by her constant interest in taking courses about everything that calls her attention. She is very friendly with her students and she maintains order and organization in her classroom. Tina is also very persistent and hardworking, and shows a high level of maturity in her approach to teaching. When I asked her, "What is attitude to you?" she responded, "Attitude is the way I see and react to a problem. I try to keep positive so life can go easier. I have been able to cope with problems because of a positive attitude" (Vol. 1, p. 41). Tina shows a dominant concrete-sequential style (CS=36) in the
Gregorc’s *Style Delineator* (1985), which may account for her thriving in order, quietness, and stability.

High expectations for herself and for her students are two of Darlene’s characteristics. This drives her teaching daily. She loves to motivate those around her, especially her students, to achieve better. Darlene is an active person. She participates in all kinds of extracurricular activities besides her six daily periods of teaching. She is very conscientious about her Christian and civic beliefs. She describes her attitude in life as the result of what she learned from her teachers. “It is the way I think or feel towards someone or something. My teachers from the States have given me an attitude in life, that when you want to be ‘somebody’, you have to work for it and reach your goals. I have been able to reach my goals and I’m proud of what I have achieved in life. We all must have a positive attitude” (Vol. 2, p. 36). Although Darlene’s scores in the Gregorc’s *Style Delineator* (1985) were mostly in the intermediate range (CS=27, AS=26, AR=28, CR=19), there is a slight inclination towards the abstract-random style.

My relationship with these four teachers helped me to know them fairly well and to witness the demonstration and application of many of their fine characteristics. However, these are personal traits that do not—necessarily—transform them into exceptional teachers. Through my observations and conversations with Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene, I was able to see more in terms of what Hansen (1995, 2001) described as moral sensibility and sense of vocation. These more complex virtues were tacit in the participants’ behavior as teachers and also in the explanation and rationale for their own performance as shown below:
1. Darlene has an almost obsessive desire to teach correct English to her students so they will not experience discrimination in the future for a lack of this skill. She wants to get more knowledge on the how-to of teaching to be able to continue her own social crusade. “If I could do whatever I wanted as a teacher, I would try my best so that my students learn correct English” (Vol. 2, p. 35).

2. Tina made a risky and life-changing decision to become a teacher just to be able to do a better job than others who did not have her vision of teaching. She is always willing to keep growing professionally. She dreams big when she says, “If I could do whatever I wanted as a teacher, I’d like to have a laptop for each student, a big classroom with desks like tables, and lots of activity centers” (Vol. 1, p. 40).

3. Alex was willing to follow his mother’s advice to become a teacher so he would be able to change teaching for good. His ever-present disposition to accept challenges and to face the unknown is applied to his teaching as he overcomes his own limitations and those of his students. To him, having his way as a teacher would include “traveling, doing talent shows, special projects—such as TV—and buying more materials” (Vol. 3, p. 32). The implication is of professional growth.

4. Teresa decided to become a teacher so she would be able to use better methods to teach a second language, contrary to her own experience. Her constant search for new ways to teach and to make learning attractive to her students is outstanding. However, more impacting is her insistence on helping her students see the endless possibilities in social involvement within their own communities not only as a learning experience, but also as a way of growing as a complete person. “I would like to involve my students with more community work, so they can view the problems of our society” (Vol. 4, p. 29).
Alex, Teresa, Tina, and Darlene have demonstrated that they possess a high
degree of moral sensibility and vocation for teaching, besides a positive attitude in life.
They have taken on a responsibility that could well be beyond their means. They have
succeeded in performing with excellence because they are convinced of the seriousness
and the importance of their profession. For them, it is a mission. Their moral sensibility
and their vocation for teaching have helped them overcome what otherwise would be
stumbling stones in achieving their goals in life. In these four teachers, I see the
fulfillment of excellent teaching. They have found the way to their own hearts, as well as
to their students.

A teacher's advantages may have been limited, so that he may not possess as high
literary qualifications as might be desirable; yet if he has true insight into human
nature; if he has a genuine love for his work, an appreciation of its magnitude, and
a determination to improve; if he is willing to labor earnestly and perseveringly,
he will comprehend the needs of his pupils, and, by his sympathetic, progressive
spirit, will inspire them to follow as he seeks to lead them onward and upward.
(White, 1903, p. 279)
CHAPTER 6

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary

This qualitative research, based on a multiple-case study design, sought to understand how bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico become exemplary in their performance. Two of the participants teach intermediate and high school English, one teaches all subjects in a self-contained second grade, and one teaches elementary math and science in a bilingual school. Their effectiveness was verified according to professional standards published by the National Association for Bilingual Education (NABE, 1992) and the Puerto Rican Association of Teachers (Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico, 1976). Based on the review of literature, I was able to identify some elements that must be present in order for a teacher to do an effective job. Among them, an adequate, relevant pre-service program, continuous, strong support from administrators and colleagues, and positive community support were mentioned (Darling-Hammond, 1996, Departamento de Educación de Puerto Rico, 1997). Life experiences and personal characteristics add coherence to these elements (Goodlad, 1992; Palmer, 1998; White, 1903, 1923).

Three research questions guided my study. Research question #1 asked: What evidence is there bilingual education standards in classrooms that have been identified as exemplary? Each of the four participants showed exemplary teaching in action as
indicated by standards synthesized from NABE (1992) and Puerto Rican Teachers Association (Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico, 1976). The indicators of these standards included: innovative disposition, language proficiency in Spanish and English, knowledge of diversified methodology to teach in both languages, cultural awareness, and knowledge and application of child development and growth theories.

Research question #2 asked about the contribution of teacher training, administrative support, and community response to the participants’ effectiveness as bilingual teachers. The findings showed that the pre-service education received by the teachers was insufficient for their present job in a bilingual setting. Even though 3 of them are certified ESL teachers, their training included little of the coursework suggested by NABE (1992) or the Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico (1976). In addition, I found that the administrative support was limited. The in-service development received by the participants was inadequate and in most cases, the participants felt it did not address their needs as bilingual teachers. The participants relied more on their own means—attending workshops, other college courses, reading, searching the Internet, asking colleagues, etc.—to get the training they needed.

I also found that the provision for teaching resources was precarious. In most instances, the participants have to provide their own materials, rely on fund-raising activities, or take time to write grant proposals in order to acquire what they need for effective teaching.

As for the contribution of community response to the participants’ exemplary performance, I found that it is indeed positive in most cases. Except for a few instances in one of the teacher’s stories, each of the schools involved in the study have strong local
community support for the teaching of English, compared to the overall generally unsupportive response in Puerto Rico, as described by Epstein (1970), Resnick (1993), and Pousada (1993). This finding is explained by the fact that two of the teachers work in private schools, which are supported by parents who see learning English as a means for upward mobility. The other two teachers work in a specialized school with a bilingual program within the public system. Most students who attend this school come from the United States and are not proficient in Spanish; therefore, they choose to study in the bilingual school and support the English program. What is not clear from this study is the influence of the national context on the local education system.

Research question #3 asked about the contribution of personal attributes and life experiences. The findings demonstrated that each teacher had "life-changing" experiences that became motivators for their performance. The four participants learned English in English-speaking schools and settings. Their cultural experiences related to English combined with the strong community support may be seen as important contributions to their success as bilingual teachers.

Several personal attributes emerged in these participants: creativity, enthusiasm, good sense of humor, responsibility, independence, and positive interrelationship with students and colleagues. The scores in the Gregorc's *Style Delineator* did not show a common pattern in the teachers' dominant style characteristics. One of them has a dominant concrete-random style (CR=34), another has a dominant concrete-sequential style (CS=36), another one has a slightly dominant abstract random (AR=28) and the other has intermediate scores in the four mediation channels (CS=26, AS=22, AR=26, CR=26).
Each teacher demonstrated a high degree of moral sensibility and vocation for teaching as seen in their description and explanation of reasons for decision-making and performance in their job setting. They are willing to pursue excellence in their teaching because they have a mission and because they perceive morality as integral to the teaching enterprise.

In summary, it was found that the context within which the 4 bilingual teachers work is inadequate regarding pre-service education and administrative support. On the other hand, they have strong support from the community. A number of personal attributes, including a high sense of moral sensibility, give direction to their excellent performance as bilingual teachers. They also had life-changing experiences that inspire their continuous search for excellence in their teaching.

Recommendations

The importance of this study is based on the great demand for effective bilingual teachers both in the United States and in Puerto Rico. The need to train teachers to meet the challenge that will turn school reform into a reality has been bestowed on schools of education. In addition, school administrators also have a responsibility, not only to maintain, but also to foster personal and professional growth among the people who shoulder the great task of educating the youth. The recommendations that emerge from the present study are geared towards teacher educators, school administrators, and also towards the teachers themselves, as builders of their own destiny.
Teacher Educators

The findings in this study point towards schools of education’s lack in planning and implementing a bilingual education training program that can meet the needs of students and teachers. Being an effective teacher demands quality training. If schools of education intent to be significant in the preparation and training of teachers, they must teach what teachers need to know to be effective in their jobs (Finn, 2001). Therefore, it is recommended that they consider incorporating the following suggestions in their pre-service training programs:

1. Inclusion of the socio-political perspective of teaching English as a second language and skills development in changing/influencing the social/political culture for the benefit of bilingual education.

2. Inclusion of topics on how to deal with different cultural approaches that enhance the native culture even in a different language.

3. More attention not only to the development of pedagogical content, but also to the development of moral sensibility and a high sense of vocation.

4. Awareness of the role played by personal characteristics in the development of an effective teacher.

5. Awaken in prospective teachers the need of seeing teaching more as a moral act than as an occupation.

6. Practical emphasis on relating the philosophical foundation of the institution to all the program components—i.e., curriculum, methods courses, and fieldwork.

7. Help prospective students understand the moral and ethical complexities of the value dimensions of teaching.

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
As Campbell (1997) said, “This should not be left to chance, but developed in a deliberate way through the teaching of ethics to pre-service teachers” (p. 257). These foundation components “should provide the how-to-interpret-what-it-is-and-should-be-done focus to help student teachers make informed professional decisions about what is good practice and ethical behavior and enable them to anticipate the value-laden dilemmas that they will inevitably confront in schools” (p. 257).

School Administrators

It is necessary for school administrators at all levels to realize the importance of administrative support for a teacher to achieve excellence in her or his profession. The job done by schools of education is not enough—even in the best of circumstances. “The conditions of teacher work must be conducive to continual development and proud accomplishment” (Fullan, 2002, p. 20). There must be continuous support in terms of staff development through adequate models, but there should be also a reasonable provision of resources and materials that will enable the teachers to put into practice what they continually learn. Consequently, it is recommended that

1. Schools provide continued education in how to effectively teach a second language by experts in the field of staff development.

2. Schools provide opportunities for the teachers to develop cultural awareness and to understand the socio-political implications of teaching a second language.

3. Schools become a learning community where teachers share and learn from each other.

Principals and other administrative staff should be aware of their own needs as leaders of school reform and change. School administrators need to model the vision of
educating as a moral act, thus giving an example to those who labor with them. When this becomes a reality, the teachers will not feel isolated, diminished, or abandoned in the task. They will be empowered to do what they have been called to do, and they will do it effectively.

**Bilingual Teachers**

Good teaching comes in many forms, but good teachers share one characteristic: they have passion for their profession. In Palmer's words,

> Teachers choose their vocation for reasons of the heart, because they care deeply about their students and about their subject. But the demands of teaching cause too many educators to lose heart. But it is possible to take heart in teaching once more so that we can continue to do what good teachers always do. (1998, p. ix).

To be an effective bilingual teacher in Puerto Rico is not an easy task because of the many limitations that surround the educational system. In view of their circumstances, it is recommended that

1. Teachers try to develop a reflective self, in order to understand their own needs and limitations, but most of all, their own potentials.
2. Teachers do not feel overwhelmed by limiting circumstances, but go ahead and find ways to overcome them.
3. Teachers form a community of learners where they can share and learn from each other.
4. Teachers give importance to the mother culture no matter which language they teach in, and that they try to understand their students’ perspectives on learning a second language.
5. Teachers try to seek and maintain the support of the community as a strong contributor to their own effectiveness.
6. Teachers endeavor to develop clear perspectives on the morality of teaching, aided by serious consideration to their own philosophy of life and professional ethics.

Let it never be forgotten that the teacher must be what he desires his pupils to become. Hence, his principles and habits should be considered as of greater importance than even his literary qualifications. He should be a man who fears God, and feels the responsibility of His work. He should understand the importance of physical, mental, and moral training, and should give due attention to each. He who would control his pupils must first control himself. To gain their love, he must show by look and word and act that his heart is filled with love for them. At the same time, firmness and decision are indispensable in the work of forming right habits, and developing noble characters. (White, 1923, p. 58)

**Suggestions for Further Research**

In conducting this study, I was aware of the ramifications that could present themselves as different themes emerged from the data. Several questions remain unanswered that could be seeds for thought about further research. Among them are:

1. Would the teachers in my study have succeeded and be considered exemplary teachers of English as a second language in a non-supportive community?

2. Would the same findings emerge had the schools been regular public schools instead of specialized bilingual schools?

3. What are the benefits to students for bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico to be proficient in both English and Spanish?

4. In what ways does the learning of English in a country other than Puerto Rico influence skills and attitudes about teaching ESL in Puerto Rico?

5. What influences schools of education to incorporate training in bilingual education. What impediments exist?

6. How do teachers and teacher educators develop reflective thinking process
that support continuous growth in bilingual education? What are the impediments to such growth?

7. What leadership skills and attitudes are needed to support strong community involvement in bilingual education in Puerto Rico?

8. What cultural metanarratives in Puerto Rico mitigate against bilingual education?

9. How might administrators in Puerto Rico be sensitized to the holistic needs of bilingual teachers—education, resources, community support and moral commitment?

**Conclusions**

Teaching is a profession that demands highly developed skills and competencies. Students under the charge of competent teachers will perform accordingly and yield positive outcomes in their education. Bilingual teaching is not an exception. Standards for bilingual education have been developed by professional organizations such as the Asociación de Maestros de Puerto Rico (1976) and the National Association of Bilingual Education (1992), so there is some clarity about the skills and competencies needed by a bilingual teacher.

For an effective practice, they must acquire and apply pedagogical content knowledge, as defined by Wing (1993), and also understand the dominant language acquisition theory (Curtain & Dahlberg, 2000; Hakuta, 1986). They should be able to effectively address the socio-political implications of teaching a second language (Epstein, 1970). Effective bilingual teachers must learn to keep a cultural balance in their teaching (Clark, DeWolf, & Clark, 1992), and must do everything possible to motivate students to keep growing in all aspects of their lives (Darling-Hammond, 2000). Their
performance should be clad with the personal characteristics of a "nice person" (Futernick, 1992).

It has also been shown that the conditions to meet these expectations are not always present—relevant pre-service training (Darling-Hammond, 1996, 1997, 2000; Departamento de Educación de P.R., 1997; Finn, 2001; Goodlad, 1992, 1999), administrative support (Darling-Hammond, 1996, 1997, 2000; Fullan, 1996; Showers & Joyce, 1980, 1995, 1996), positive social environment (Pousada, 1993; Resnick, 1993), and personal attributes (Court, 1991; Cummins, 1997; White, 1903, 1923).

"Motivation transcends methodology" (Resnick, 1993, p. 265). The motivation to teach well in spite of present shortcomings is fueled by a high degree of morality. It is the moral sensibility, positive attitude, and sense of vocation that give teachers a real view of their profession (Hansen, 1995, 2001; White, 1903, 1923). When they perceive teaching as a moral act, when they keep a positive attitude in life, and when they develop a high sense of vocation, they are able to excel, because then they will be fulfilling their mission in life. These attributes enable them to face challenges, to find ways to solve problems, to continue growing personally and professionally, and, more than anything, to find that point in life where their "deep gladness meets the world's deep need" (Buechner, 1993, p. 119).
APPENDIX A

LETTERS
ANDREWS UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
Curriculum and Instruction Department

PERMISSION REQUEST

To: Superintendent, _____________ Regional District
From: Aurea L. Araújo

I am a doctoral student in the School of Education at Andrews University. Presently I am working on my dissertation about bilingual teaching in Puerto Rico. The study I am proposing to do is qualitative in nature and follows a multi-case study design. My purpose is to seek to understand how exemplary bilingual teachers in Puerto Rico become what they are, by identifying the experiences that contribute to their professional development. The data collection techniques will include interviews, observations and a focus group with the participants.

As a teacher educator, I am convinced of the role that teacher training plays in teacher effectiveness. Thus, understanding the factors that have enhanced or deterred a teacher from achieving excellence is of first class priority for all those interested in development of the educational system in Puerto Rico. The results of this study may help explore more possibilities for teacher training, and the following actions could be expected:

- Bilingual teachers may achieve a better understanding of the experiences that contribute to their level of proficiency and will act accordingly to enhance their practice.
- Schools of Education will receive some feedback as to what makes an exemplary bilingual teacher, and might find ways to incorporate this understanding into their pre-service training programs.
- More resources could be allocated in order to provide for the professional development of already employed bilingual teachers, aiming at promoting excellence in teacher performance.

Hereby I am requesting your authorization to conduct the study in the Regional District of Mayaguez, as it is described in the adjunct document. For further information, you may contact me at 831-8497 or at Antillean Adventist University (834-9595).

Your permission will be a great contribution to the education of teachers in Puerto Rico. Thank you for taking some of your time to help in this project.

Yours truly,

Aurea L. Araújo
P. O. Box 118
Mayagüez, P. R. 00681
Dear Bilingual Teacher:

I am a doctoral student in the School of Education at Andrews University. Presently I am working on my dissertation about the effectiveness of bilingual teaching in Puerto Rico. Because teacher training is an important factor in developing such effectiveness, I will use the accompanying questionnaire to collect data about the significance of the training offered in the Schools of Education. How you perceive that preparation is an important piece of information in designing new teacher-training programs and modifying existing ones.

I want to know from you if present training programs are doing what is expected of them, and if they have contributed to your success as a bilingual teacher. On the other hand, I also want to know your opinion on what is missing from those programs. Of course, it is possible that you have not been trained as a bilingual teacher, although you are currently employed as one. How do you consider your general training as a teacher to be of help in your present position?

For most of your answers on Part I and Part II, you will have only to select the appropriate choice. Part III is your opportunity to express your opinion in your own words, so don't miss it. This information is completely confidential and no names will be attached to it.

Your answers to this survey will be a great contribution to the education of teachers in Puerto Rico. Thank you for taking some of your time to help in this project. Should you need more information, or if you just want to contact me, you may do so at 831-8497, or at the following address:

Aurea Araújo
P. O. Box 118
Mayagüez, P. R. 00681

Yours truly,

Aurea L. Araújo
Doctoral student at Andrews University

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
APPENDIX B

INFORMED CONSENT

MEMBER CHECK
INFORMED CONSENT FORM

1. ______________________________________________________________________________________, an English teacher at the ______________________________________________________________________________________ school in the ______________________ Educational Region in Puerto Rico, hereby declare:

1. That I have chosen to participate voluntarily in a qualitative study to be conducted by Aurea L. Araújo, an Andrews University doctoral student, regarding the elements that contribute to the effectiveness of bilingual teachers;

2. That I have been informed about the following conditions under which the said study will be conducted:
   a. that this study is authorized by the school administration;
   b. that complete anonymity and confidentiality will be insured by using number codes and applying other safety measures to the information thus gathered;
   c. that the methods for data collection will consist of two interviews and three observations spaced through a period of approximately six weeks;
   d. that the collection of data will not interfere with my teaching;
   e. that there are no risks involved in the present investigation towards my personal or professional integrity;
   f. that there will be no payment for my participation; and
   g. that my participation can be terminated at any time if I choose to do so, without any further explanations.

2. That I voluntarily release Andrews University, the investigator, the Puerto Rican Department of Education, and any other official agency of any responsibility having to do with this study, as long as the above conditions are met.

_____________________________  ______________________
Participating teacher                  Date
MEMBER CHECK

To the Participant:

We have been working together for some time now. In fact, you are the center of this study. As I come to the conclusion of my data collection, it is imperative that you take a look at your story as seen through the eyes of someone who is trying to portray your performance as an excellent teacher in the most accurate way possible. Your response to the following questions will still be used as part of my dissertation.

1. How accurate is this chapter in reflecting you and your life as a bilingual teacher?

2. Is there something else that you would like to add to it for a better portrayal?

3. Is there something that you would like to have omitted from it?

4. What corrections should be made?

5. Has this study been of some benefit for your professional life? What did you learn about yourself?
Instructions: This is confidential information. Do not write your name on this survey. It will be color coded to link it to the rest of the data in your file. Participation in this survey is voluntary. You may stop at any time.

Birthplace ____________________ Sex ___ F ___ M

Age ___ 20-25 ___ 26-40 ___ over 40

Work place ___ public system ___ private system

Teaching experience: _____ 1-3 years ___ 4-10 years ______ more than 10 years

Years in bilingual education __________ Present position _______________

Type of bilingual school
_____ All subjects in English except Spanish Language - Immersion
_____ Some subjects in English and some in Spanish – Two-way bilingual
_____ English as a second language only

Teacher training done at ______ Private College in P.R. ______ P.R. State University
_________________________ Other (Explain) ________________________________

Teacher training area
_____ secondary - Specialization: ________________
_____ elementary - Specialization ______________
_____ primary (k-3) - Specialization ______________
_____ pre-school - Specialization __________________

English learned at: (Check all that apply)
________________ Home in P.R.
________________ School in P.R.
________________ While living in an English-speaking country
________________ College
________________ Other (explain) ________________________________

Proficiency in the English language:
________________ Excellent (oral, reading, writing in academic context)
________________ Average (more speaking than writing - social context)
________________ Little (only what I teach at school)

Teaching Certification ________ Provisional ________ Regular

Endorsements ___________________________
PART II – Based on NABE Standards

Instructions: This is confidential information. Do not write your name on this survey. It will be color coded to link it to the rest of the data in your file. Participation in this survey is voluntary. You may stop at any time.

Circle the response that better identifies your experience during your teacher-training program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic/Questions</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Did your college program include the following:</td>
<td>YES   NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Instructors who were fluent speakers of English?</td>
<td>___    ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. English-fluent instructors teaching courses in English?</td>
<td>___    ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. English-fluent Puerto Rican instructors?</td>
<td>___    ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Did your college program cover the following background issues?</td>
<td>YES   NO SOME DEGREE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Philosophy, theory and history of bilingual education</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Legal issues in bilingual education</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Did your college program cover the following language-related issues?</td>
<td>YES   NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Assessing student’s language proficiency in Spanish and English</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Theories and applications of second language teaching</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Understanding the nature of language</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Understanding the nature of bilingualism</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. The language variety of the home and the standard variety as valid systems of communication</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. How to identify and understand structural differences between the child’s first and second languages</td>
<td>___    ___ ___</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Remember that participation in this survey is strictly voluntary and confidential. You may stop at any time. Circle the response that better identifies your experience during your teacher training program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic/Questions</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Did your college program cover the following instructional issues?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. How to organize and teach reading/language lessons in English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. How to organize and teach content area lessons in English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. How to teach literacy across the curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. How to direct students in inquiry/discovery learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. How to set up small group instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. How to manage individualized instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. How to set up learning centers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. How to use alternative assessment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. How to use media and audiovisual materials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j. How to use computer technology to assist instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>k. How to develop an in-class management system</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Did your college program cover the following classroom issues?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Evaluating and adapting materials for the bilingual classroom</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Team teaching and cross-age grouping</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Effective classroom management strategies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Remember that participation in this survey is strictly voluntary and confidential. You may stop at any time. Circle the response that better identifies your experience during your teacher-training program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic/Questions</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 6. Did your college program cover the following multicultural issues?            | YES NO SOME
| a. How to respond positively to the diversity of behavior in a cross-cultural environment |    |    |
| b. How to develop students' awareness of the value of cultural diversity        |    |    |
| c. How to prepare and assist children to interact successfully in a cross-cultural setting |    |    |
| d. How to recognize and accept different patterns of child development within and between cultures in order to formulate realistic lesson objectives |    |    |
| e. How to assist children in maintaining identification with their native culture |    |    |
| f. How to incorporate the culture and history of Hispanics into your instruction |    |    |
| g. How to incorporate Hispanic lifestyles into your instruction                 |    |    |
| h. Hispanic value systems and beliefs                                          |    |    |
| h. The contributions Hispanics have made to U.S. history and culture           |    |    |
| i. How culture affects learning styles                                          |    |    |
| j. The developmental levels of children across cultures                        |    |    |
PART III

Answer the following open-end questions as best as you can. There are no specific answers to them. The information you provide in this space is confidential and voluntary. You may stop at any time.

1. I see (don’t see) myself as a successful bilingual teacher because

2. The most helpful experiences of my training as a bilingual teacher were

2. What would you add to your training as a bilingual teacher?

4. Additional comments/observations
APPENDIX D

TEMPLATES
# BILINGUAL TEACHERS OBSERVATION GUIDELINES

Based on Standards Published by the
Association of Teachers of Puerto Rico, 1976

**Teacher:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirements for bilingual teachers</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Observation</th>
<th>Interview</th>
<th>Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Willingness to participate in an innovative program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Knowledge of the structures of both languages</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. General knowledge regarding the nature of language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Knowledge of the specific language used in the region of work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Knowledge of different methods to teach second and native language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Understanding and acceptance of the cultures represented in the community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Competence in providing a correct linguistic model in both languages</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# BILINGUAL TEACHERS OBSERVATION GUIDELINES

**Teacher** ______________________  **Date** _________________________  **Time** ______
**Grade** ____________  **Subject** ___________________

## CLASSROOM ENVIRONMENT

### A. Creating an environment of respect and rapport

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Expectation</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher interactions with</td>
<td>Demonstrates respect and an awareness of cultural norms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student interaction</td>
<td>Student-to-student interactions are polite and respectful.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### B. Establishing a culture for learning

| Importance of the content      | Shows enthusiasm for the content and conveys its importance.                |          |
| Student pride in work          | Encourages students to demonstrate pride and quality in their work.         |          |
| Expectations for learning and  | Instructional goals and activities, interactions, and environment convey   |          |
| achievement                    | high expectations for achievement.                                         |          |
| Means for success              | Provides a means for individual students to meet with success.              |          |
| Self-expression                | Encourages students to express themselves.                                  |          |
| Respects opinions              | Listens to students and respects their opinion.                             |          |

### C. Managing classroom procedures

| Management of instructional    | Is organized so students are productively engaged at all times.             |          |
| groups                         |                                                                            |          |
| Management of transitions      | Transitions occur smoothly, with little loss of instructional time.        |          |
| Management of materials and    | Routines for handling materials and supplies occur smoothly, with very     |          |
| supplies                       | little loss of instructional time.                                         |          |
| Performance of professional    | Efficient systems for performing professional duties are in place, limiting |          |
| duties                         | the loss of instructional time.                                            |          |

### D. Managing student behavior

| Expectations for student behavior | Rules and expectations are clear, fair and conducive to learning. |          |
| Monitoring of student behavior   | Alert to student behavior at all times.                              |          |
| Response to student misbehavior  | Response to misbehavior is appropriate and respects students' dignity;   |          |
|                                 | communicates discipline procedures and misbehaviors with parents and     |          |
|                                 | administrators.                                                        |          |

### E. Organizing physical space

| Safety                          | Classroom is safe and conducive to learning.                             |          |
| Accessibility to learning and   | Uses physical resources optimally, and all learning is equally accessible |          |
| use of physical resources       | for all students.                                                        |          |

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching strategies appropriate to distinct learning styles and developmental levels of students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to organize, plan and teach specific lessons in required curriculum areas using the appropriate terminology in English and Spanish</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge base and teaching strategies related to the basic elements and methodologies best suited to the development of literacy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovative teaching techniques in two languages, such as:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Inquiry/discovery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Individualized small group and large group instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Learning centers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Uses of media and audiovisual materials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Uses of computer technology to assist instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Instructional analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Team teaching and cross-age grouping</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Workshops</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Cooperative learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of the way in which a learner's culture should permeate all areas of the curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to identify and utilize available community resources in and outside the classroom</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spoken-written language and vocabulary are clear and age appropriate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representation of content is appropriate and links well with students' prior knowledge and experience.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities and assignments are appropriate and are designed to engage students in constructing meaning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions are of high quality, with adequate response time and contain a variety of thinking levels.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lessons have a clearly defined pace and structure around which the activities are organized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback is consistently high quality and specific to each student.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrates flexibility and responsiveness by adjusting the lesson when appropriate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successfully accommodates students' questions, comments or interests.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persists in seeking strategies that may help students who have difficulty in learning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## ASSESSMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recognize potential linguistic and cultural biases in assessment instruments including standardized tests</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to utilize alternative assessment measures including portfolio and other means</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to assess student language proficiency in both native and second language, including oral and written language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop an in-class management system to assess student achievement in relation to objectives of instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote and encourage student self-assessment of their skills and abilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to do self-assessment and self-reflection of teaching strategies and value system and beliefs as they relate to the students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CONTENT/CURRICULUM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organizes curriculum into meaningful and relevant units:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of state and local curriculum requirements and guidelines</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develops literacy across the curriculum.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develops a curriculum that fosters critical thinking skills.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifies biases and deficiencies in existing curricula and has strategies to modify it to better address student linguistic, cultural and developmental needs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develops, acquires, adapts, and evaluates materials appropriate to the bilingual classroom.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## LINGUISTIC AND CULTURAL ISSUES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recognizes and accepts the language variety of the home as valid systems of communication with legitimate functions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands the nature of bilingualism and the process of becoming bilingual.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands basic concepts regarding the nature of language.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identify and understand structural differences between the child’s first and second languages.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop awareness in the learner of the value of cultural diversity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepares and assists children to interact successfully in a cross-cultural setting.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognizes and accepts different patterns of child development within and between cultures in order to formulate realistic objectives.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assist children to maintain and extend identification with and probe in the mother culture.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands, appreciates and incorporates into the instructional environment: The culture and history of the Puerto Ricans’ ancestry. Contributions of Puerto Ricans to history and culture of the U.S. Contemporary life styles of Puerto Ricans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### STUDENTS' RESPONSE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participate actively in instructional activities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Show satisfaction in speaking English as a second language.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speak English at least in the classroom.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### STUDENTS' PERFORMANCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Results in standardized tests</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results in criterion-referenced tests</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative assessment tools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX E

ADDITIONAL INTERVIEW QUESTIONS
More questions!!!!

1. Who is this person behind the desk? (YOU)

2. What are the things you like best in life?

3. What are the things you absolutely do not tolerate?

4. How have you been able to manage the shortcomings in your career (lack of specific training, lack of resources, lack of support, etc.) and still be an effective teacher?

5. If you could do whatever you wanted as a teacher, you would . . .
Summary Questions

As a bilingual teacher, what is your opinion about the following issues?

1. Willingness to participate in innovative programs

2. Knowledge of the structures of both languages

3. Knowledge of different methods to teach second and native languages

4. Understanding and acceptance of all the cultures represented in the community

5. Knowledge of developmental and growth patterns of children

6. Competence in providing a correct linguistic model in both languages

7. Classroom environment
REFERENCE LIST


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


VITA

Name: Aurea Laracuente de Araújo
PhD Candidate
Curriculum and Instruction

Undergraduate and Graduate Schools Attended:
Antillian College
Universidad Adventista Dominicana
Loyola University in Chicago
Andrews University

Degrees Awarded:
1984 Master of Arts (Curriculum and Instruction)
Andrews University
1979 Bachelor of Arts (Spanish)
Antillian College, Puerto Rico

Professional Experiences:
2001-Pres Associate Professor, Education Department, Antillean Adventist University, Mayagüez, Puerto Rico
1998-2001 Principal, Bella Vista Adventist Academy, Mayagüez, Puerto Rico
1996-1998 Spanish Teacher, Bella Vista Adventist Academy, Mayagüez, PR
1993-1996 Multi-grade Teacher, Illinois Conference of SDA
1988-1992 Assistant Professor, Seminario Adventista Latinoamericano de Teología, Cachoeira, Brazil
1985-1987 Director Department of Education, Dominican Adventist University, Dominican Republic
1980-1983 Elementary Teacher, Metropolitan Academy, Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic
1975-1979 English Teacher, Dominican Adventist University, Dominican Republic